<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>P 13</th>
<th>L 42</th>
<th># 01-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remein, Duane</td>
<td>Futurewei Technology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amendment number has been set by Mr. Law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Remedy</td>
<td>Add &quot;Amendment 5-&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>O</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>P 27</th>
<th>L 16</th>
<th># 01-2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anslow, Peter</td>
<td>Ciena Corporation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html">http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html</a> has: Physical Layer (always capped)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Remedy</td>
<td>Change &quot;physical layer&quot; to &quot;Physical Layer&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>O</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>P 31</th>
<th>L 1</th>
<th># 01-15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remein, Duane</td>
<td>Futurewei Technology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>ER</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clauses mis-ordered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Remedy</td>
<td>Change to FM, 1, 30, 45, 56, 67, 76, 100, 101, 102, 103 Annex A, Annex 31A, Annex 100A.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>O</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl/ 1</td>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Line</td>
<td>Comment Number</td>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
<td>6</td>
<td># f01-3</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment:** Anslow, Peter
**Company:** Ciena Corporation

**Comment Type:** E
**Comment Status:** X

Unusual editing instruction

**Suggested Remedy:** Change to "Insert 1.2.7 after 1.2.6 "Accuracy and resolution of numerical quantities".

**Proposed Response:** Response Status: O

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl/ 1</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Line</th>
<th>Comment Number</th>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>Page number from CMP version</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
<td>17</td>
<td># f01-4</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment:** Anslow, Peter
**Company:** Ciena Corporation

**Comment Type:** E
**Comment Status:** X

(Page number from CMP version)

**Suggested Remedy:** Change "reference" to "references"

**Proposed Response:** Response Status: O

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl/ 1</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Line</th>
<th>Comment Number</th>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>Page number from CMP version</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>28</td>
<td>41</td>
<td># f01-10</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment:** Law, David
**Company:** Hewlett Packard Enterp

**Comment Type:** G
**Comment Status:** X

The text 'For 10BROAD36,' should not be shown in underscore as this text was added by IEEE P802.3by.

**Suggested Remedy:** See comment.

**Proposed Response:** Response Status: O

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl/ 1</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Line</th>
<th>Comment Number</th>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>Page number from CMP version</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>45</td>
<td># f01-6</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment:** Anslow, Peter
**Company:** Ciena Corporation

**Comment Type:** E
**Comment Status:** X

(Page number from CMP version)

**Suggested Remedy:** Change "definitions" to "definition"

**Proposed Response:** Response Status: O
IEEE 802.3bn EPON Protocol over Coax (EPoC) TF 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

**Cl 45 SC 45**

Grow, Robert
RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

Verify the remainder of the numbering.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Per comment

**Proposed Response** Response Status **O**

---

**Cl 45 SC 45.2.1**

Anslow, Peter
Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

(Page number from CMP version)
IEEE 802.3bw-2015 made changes to Table 45-3 which show 1.17 as Reserved.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.17 in Table 45-3 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" in the row for 1.17 add "Reserved" in strikethrough font and underline "EPoC PMA/PMD ability" in the "Register name" column, underline "45.2.1.14aa" and remove the row below.

**Proposed Response** Response Status **O**

---

**Cl 45 SC 45.2.1**

Grow, Robert
RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **X**

Incorrect base text for Table 45-3. IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015 has 1.17 listed as a single reserved row because 802.3bw defined 1.18. No need to change reserved rows except 1.17. The new reserved row in this draft also conflicts with definition of 1.19 in P802.3by.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Change the editing instruction to simply read, Change the 1.17 row of Table 45-3 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bw) as shown below. Only show 1.17 row in Table 45-3 changes with Reserved in strikethrough and new register name and subclause underscore.

**Proposed Response** Response Status **O**

---

**Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.5**

Remein, Duane
Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

extra period at end of line. "shown in Table 45-211f."

**SuggestedRemedy**

strike spare period.

**Proposed Response** Response Status **O**

---

**Cl 45 SC 45.2.1**

Anslow, Peter
Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

(Page number from CMP version)
IEEE 802.3by-201x made changes to Table 45-3 which show the appropriate reserved row as "1.1809 through 1.2099"

**SuggestedRemedy**

Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.1809 through 1.2099 in Table 45-3 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" in the first row change the strikethrough text to "2099" in the last row change "1.1959 through 1.32767" to "1.1959 through 1.2099"

**Proposed Response** Response Status **O**

---

**Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.5**

Remein, Duane
Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

extra period at end of line. "shown in Table 45-211f."

**SuggestedRemedy**

strike spare period.

**Proposed Response** Response Status **O**
IEEE 802.3bn EPON Protocol over Coax (EPoC) TF 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

**Comment Type ER** Comment Status X
Sections jump from 45.2.1.130z5 for register 1.1948 to 45.2.1.1301b6 for register 1.1949. Table numbers jump from 45-98az5 to 45-99a01.

**Suggested Remedy**
Fix to be consecutive with the required convoluted numbering.

**Comment Type ER** Comment Status X

**Proposed Response**

---

**Comment Type E** Comment Status X
The reference in the following statement should be 101.4.4.4.4. "The CNU reports supported optional modulations to the CLT via US_ModAbility variable see 101.4.3.4.5"

**Suggested Remedy**
Change to 101.4.4.4.4

**Comment Type E** Comment Status X

**Proposed Response**

---

**Comment Type TR** Comment Status X
In Table 100-11, change g.e. sign to "to" to match subclause text.

**Suggested Remedy**
As per comment

**Proposed Response**

---

**Comment Type TR** Comment Status X
Insert "up to" before "65"

**Suggested Remedy**
As per comment

**Proposed Response**

---
Draft 3.1

IEEE 802.3bn EPON Protocol over Coax (EPoC) TF 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 100 SC 100.3.5.3.1 P 113 L 33 # r01-23
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type TR Comment Status X
Change "uses" to "can use". CLT needs to ensure that it meets a desired confidence interval provided by the manufacture. For example, the statement as written would permit the CLT to use only one upstream probe symbol, which would not create confidence.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 100 SC 100.3.6.1 P 114 L 38 # r01-24
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type TR Comment Status X
Change ": <newline> For to "and for" remove newline. Add a colon to the end of the sentence. Adjust row/line alignments.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 100 SC 100.4.1 P 118 L 48 # r01-21
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type GR Comment Status X
"MD1" should be "MDI"

Suggested Remedy
As per comment

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 101 SC 101.3.2.5.4 P 151 L 13 # r01-12
Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type T Comment Status X
Step 1) Add burst start marker and Step 9) Add burst end marker do not happen in FEC encoding. They are part of PMA.

Suggested Remedy
In Step 7) change "codeword and move to step 9" to "codeword, exit."
In Step 8) change "step 9 else go to step 2." to "exit else go to step 1."
Remove these steps and renumber.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 101 SC 101.3.2.5.4 P 151 L 13 # r01-25
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type TR Comment Status X
Bin is not defined. Looping may not be correct as drafted, i.e., should continue looping until not enough for a long codeword, move to next tests, etc. The text here should not be confused with the state machine / pseudo code used in 101.3.2.5.7, and should remain in its prior descriptive format.

Suggested Remedy
Revert to previous text, lines 13 through 39.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 101 SC 101.3.2.5.4 P 151 L 13 # r01-22
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type TR Comment Status X
Layer violation. Insertion of the start/stop burst markers is performed by the symbol mapper in the PMA.

Suggested Remedy
Remove steps 1) and 12)

Proposed Response Response Status O