IEEE P802.3bq D3.0 25G/40GBASE-T Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 113 SC 113.8.1 P 192 L 8	# i-132		113.7.2	P 178	L 39	# i-110
Schicketanz, Dieter Reutlingen University		Rossbach, Marti	n	Nexans Canad	da Inc.	
Comment Type TR Comment Status R	Cabling	Comment Type	TR	Comment Status R		Cabling
in Kanata 2014 when deciding on the MDI connector the moti	on for an "RJ45" failed.It	Add Table 1	13-22 for 2	25GBASE-T Cabling Types in	cluding Class F	A
passed later by saing it woud not preclude other options. This implemented just old wording used. In the Berlin meeting this	SuggestedRemedy					
said it would be a technical change. To my knowlege impleme and not a technical change. I personally was very disapointed	enting a motion is editorial	A link segme	ent consist	ssion parameters ting of up to 30 m of cabling th		
SuggestedRemedy				ides a reliable medium. The tra tion loss, delay parameters, no		
Change the sentence to reflect the outcome of the motion tha connector is not the only one possible.e.g:Start at linee 8: On 81replace "shall" with "to" My english is not sufficient to proport satisfy all.	e option is anAfter-7-	and return lo segments is Table 113-2 113-22 lists	oss. In add specified. 1 lists the the suppo	lition, the requirements for the supported cabling types and c rted cabling types and distanc	alien crosstalk distances for 40 es for 25GBAS	coupled "between" link GBASE-T and Table
Response Response Status U		Table 113-2 Cabling Sur	1 40GBAS	E-T Cabling types and distand k segment distances Cabling	ces references	
REJECT.		ISO/IEC Cla	ss I / Clas	s II 30 m ISO/IEC 11801-1 Ec		
No consensus to change the draft for this comment.		Category 8 30 m ANSI/TIA-568-C.2-1 Table 113-22 25GBASE-T Cabling types and distances				
Commenter clarifies suggested remedy as:				k segment distances Cabling		
Change P192 Line 8 to read: "One option is using eight-pin connectors meeting the require	monte of IEC 60603 7 51 with	ISO/IEC Cla	ss I / Clas	s II 30 m ISO/IEC 11801-1 Ec		
the improved characteristics and frequency extensions specif	Category 8 30 m ANSI/TIA-568-C.2-1 CLASS FA 30 m ISO/IEC 11801-1 Edition 3 up to 30m / ISO/IEC TR 11801-9905					
mechanical interface to the balanced cabling."		Response		Response Status U		
Straw poll:		REJECT.				
I support the clarified suggested remedy for this comment i-1 Y:9	32.	No consense	us to make	e this change to the draft. See	ecomment i-10	and i-11
N:12				fter comment resolution was c	omplete:	
A:6		the resolutio		nent i-10 was: ge the draft		
Straw poll:				go the drait		
I support rejecting this comment: Y:12		Straw Poll:	common	ter's proposed resolution (inclu	iding both page	as 2.8.4 of the
N: 8				ditorial license to align with mo		
A: 7		(e.g., 'star to Y:8				<u>j</u>
From the September 2014 Task Force meeting, Ottawa, ON,		N:10				
(http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/public/sep14/unconfirmed_minu	ites_3bq_0914.pdf)	A: 9				
The secretary & Editor noted that they understood the langua		Straw Poll:				
preclude additional MDI's should they be offered in the future		I support rej	ecting this	comment		
Commenter clarifies that he is requesting that the draft to be	modified to include an	Y: 14 N: 9				
alternative MDI.		A: 3				
				her there were any additional editor then asked whether the		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Topic

Topic Cabling

Page 1 of 4 2/8/2016 8:16:04 AM

Cl 113 SC 113.7.1 P 178 L 25 # i-109 Rossbach, Martin Nexans Canada Inc. Inc. Comment Type TR Comment Status R Cabling Add Class FA for 25GBASE-T Cabling Types Add Class FA for 25GBASE-T Cabling Types The second
 SuggestedRemedy use the following text for 113.7.1 "The cabling system used to support 40GBASE-T requires 4-pair balanced cabling with a nominal impedance of 100 Ohm listed in Table 113-21. The cabling system used to support 25GBASE-T requires 4-pair balanced cabling with a nominal impedance of 100 Ohm listed in Table 113-22. Operation on other classes of cabling may be supported if the link segment meets the requirements of 113.7. Additionally: a) 40GBASE-T uses balanced cabling listed in Table 113-21 in a star topology to connect PHY entities. b) 40GBASE-T is an application of the balanced cabling listed in Table 113-21 with the additional transmission requirements specified in Table 113-22 in a star topology to connect PHY entities. d) 25GBASE-T is an application of the balanced cabling listed in Table 113-21 with the additional transmission requirements specified in this subclause. d) 25GBASE-T is an application of the balanced cabling listed in Table 113-21 with the additional transmission requirements specified in this subclause.
Response Response Status U REJECT. No consensus to make this change to the draft. (see comments i-10 and i-11) [Editor's note added after comment resolution was complete: the resolution to comment i-10 was: No consensus to change the draft. Straw Poll: I support the commenter's proposed resolution (including both pages 3 & 4 of the referenced file) with editorial license to align with more recent parallel changes to the draft (e.g., 'star topology' language). Y:8 N:10 A: 9 Straw Poll: I support rejecting this comment Y: 14 N: 9 A: 3 The editor asked whether there were any additional proposals to resolve the comment - there were none. The editor then asked whether there were any who believed there would be proposals after the lunch break or at this meeting - there were none. the resolution to comment i-11 was:

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Topic

Topic Cabling

Page 2 of 4 2/8/2016 8:16:04 AM

IEEE P802.3bq D3.0 25G/40GBASE-T Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot comments

No consensus to make this change to the draft

Straw Poll:

referenc	t the commenter's p ed file) with editoria ar topology' langua	I license to aligr				the draft
Straw Po I suppor Y: 10 N: 7 A: 7]	oll: t rejecting this com	ment				
C/ 113	SC 113.7.2	P 1	78	L 44	# <u>i-11</u>	
Maguire, Val	erie	The S	Siemon Co	mpany		
specifica SuggestedR	ze that up to 30m, ations described in	ISO/IEC TR 118	egory 7A cl 01-9905, v	vill support 250	GBASE-T.	
	roposed changes w					- 1 -
Response REJECT No cons		esponse Status change to the d				
referenc	oll: t the commenter's µ ed file) with editoria ar topology' langua	I license to aligr				the draft
Straw Po I suppor Y: 10 N: 7 A: 7	oll: t rejecting this com	ment				

SC	113.7.1		P 17	8	L 23	# <u>i-1(</u>)
alerie			The Si	emon	Company		
Туре	TR	Comment S	tatus	R			Cabling
							onal
Remea	ly						
					lic/nov15/maguir	e_3bq_01a_1	115.pdf
		Response St	atus	U			
Poll: Poll: ort the o loced file	commente e) with edi	er's proposed re torial license to		``	0 1 0		
	cting this o	comment					
	alerie <i>Type</i> nize tha cations <i>Remed</i> o page propos CT. sensus Poll: ort the o star top Poll:	Type TR nize that up to 30 cations described (Remedy o page 3 of http:/ proposed change CT. Issensus to chang Poll: ort the commented istar topology' lang Poll:	alerie <i>Type</i> TR <i>Comment S</i> nize that up to 30m, 2-connecto cations described in ISO/IEC TF <i>Remedy</i> to page 3 of http://www.ieee802. proposed changes with revision <i>Response St</i> CT. asensus to change the draft. Poll: port the commenter's proposed re- ficed file) with editorial license to star topology' language).	alerie The Si Type TR Comment Status nize that up to 30m, 2-connector categorations described in ISO/IEC TR 1180 Remedy o page 3 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/liproposed changes with revision marks Response Status CT. Sensus to change the draft. Poll: Poll: Poll: Poll:	alerie The Siemon Type TR Comment Status R nize that up to 30m, 2-connector category 7/ cations described in ISO/IEC TR 11801-9905 Remedy o page 3 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/pub proposed changes with revision marks. Response Status U CT. asensus to change the draft. Poll: ort the commenter's proposed resolution (inc need file) with editorial license to align with m star topology' language).	alerie The Siemon Company Type TR Comment Status R nize that up to 30m, 2-connector category 7A channels, meet cations described in ISO/IEC TR 11801-9905, will support 25 Remedy o page 3 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/public/nov15/maguin proposed changes with revision marks. Response Status U CT. asensus to change the draft. Poll: Poll: Poll:	alerie The Siemon Company Type TR Comment Status R nize that up to 30m, 2-connector category 7A channels, meeting the addition cations described in ISO/IEC TR 11801-9905, will support 25GBASE-T. Remedy o page 3 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/public/nov15/maguire_3bq_01a_1 proposed changes with revision marks. Response Status U CT. sensus to change the draft. Poll: Poll: Proll: Poll:

be proposals after the lunch break or at this meeting - there were none.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Topic

Topic Cabling

Page 3 of 4 2/8/2016 8:16:04 AM

IEEE P802.3bq D3.0 25G/40GBASE-T Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 113 SC 113.5.3.5 P 170 L 45 # i-93 RAN, ADEE Intel Corporation	C/ 113 SC 113.5.4.3 P 171 L 22 # i-94 RAN, ADEE Intel Corporation				
Comment TypeTRComment StatusREEEDoes the frequency variation requirement also apply to SLAVE PHYs?Specifically, since asymmetric LPI operation is possible, the SLAVE clock recovery function has no clock to track for extended periods when the MASTER is in LPI. The SLAVE TX has to use loop-timing clock during that time. What are the frequency/phase requirements when the MASTER is in LPI? Holding the open-loop frequency within 0.1 ppm/second of the closed-loop frequency seems challenging. I don't see another value specified for the slave.Also, there is no test mode that enables measurement of the SLAVE frequency when MASTER is going in and out of LPI.	Comment Type TR Comment Status A EMI test What does "remain over the ground reference plane" mean? does it mean component enclosures are grounded to the same connection? or should they all float to be isolated from ground connection? SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Please reword to clarify. Response Response Status U ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implemented in comment i-139 [Editor's note added after comment resolution was complete:				
SuggestedRemedy If SLAVE is subject to the specifications in the second paragraph, state it explicitly. If not, state that it only holds for MASTER, and specify separately what is required from SLAVE, especially with MASTER in LPI. If anything is required from SLAVE, please address how it can be validated.	the resolution to comment i-139 was: Change to "All components that are exposed to the induced fields should remain over th ground reference plane."]				
Response Response Status U REJECT. Commenter does not provide specific sufficient remedy. This is the exact text in clause 55 and was not misunderstood. A slave which does not keep timing would fail BER and other requirements of the clause. Experts in the BRC understood the requirement to apply to both master and slave and was correct as written.					

Topic EMI test