Unconfirmed Meeting Minutes: Joint meeting of IEEE P802.3bq 25/40GBASE-T Task Force and IEEE P802.3bz 2.5G/5GBASE-T Task Force

January 20-21, 2016
Atlanta, GA, USA
Prepared by Jon Lewis

The joint meeting of IEEE P802.3bq 25/40GBASE-T Task Force and IEEE P802.3bz 2.5G/5GBASE-T Task Force meeting convened at 9:07 AM, Wednesday, January 20, 2016 by David Chalupsky, P802.3bq and P802.3bz Task Force Chair.

Attendance is listed in Appendix A

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS
Presentation: agenda_3bq-n-bz_01_0116.pdf
Presenter: Dave Chalupsky, Chair.

The Chair called for introductions and affiliations, the participants introduced themselves, and the Chair then proceeded with the agenda.

The Chair reviewed the agenda. Mr. Chalupsky turned to presentation agenda_3bq-n-bz_01_0116.pdf and reviewed the schedule of presentations for the meeting.

Motion #1: Approve the agenda from agenda_3bq-n-bz_01_0116.pdf

M: Pete Cibula   S: Jon Lewis
Approved by voice vote without objection (Procedural > 50%)

Motion #2:   Approve the minutes from the November, 2015 IEEE P802.3bq and P802.3bz meetings.

M: Pete Cibula   S: Peter Jones
Approved by voice vote without objection (Procedural > 50%)

The Chair then resumed the review of the agenda presentation:

- Mr. Chalupsky asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting – Mr. Chalupsky, Intel, and Peter Jones, Cisco, indicated that occasionally they communicate publically available information.

- Mr. Chalupsky noted that there should be no recording or photography without permission.

Mr. Chalupsky reviewed the goals for the meeting, access to the reflector and website for both P802.3bq and P802.3bz, and ground rules.
Mr. Chalupsky then continued review of the presentation, including the objectives for the projects and Big Ticket items for this meeting including recirculation for P802.3bq and potentially request working group ballot for P802.3bz.

Attendance, Mr. Chalupsky advised the group of the IEEE meeting attendance tool and procedures, including both the attendance book and the web attendance tracking tool.

IEEE Patent Policy, at **9:50 AM**, Mr. Chalupsky read slides 1 through 3 on the patent policy from agenda_3bq-n-bz_01_0116.pdf . Mr. Chalupsky made the call for potentially essential patents at **9:52 AM**, and none responded. Mr. Chalupsky then completed the reading of slide #4.

Mr. Chalupsky then continued review of the presentation, discussing that P802.3bz is in task force review and P802.3bq is in Sponsor ballot phase and that both task force groups would be primarily comment driven.

LIAISONS

The Chair moved to liaisons, and noted the Task Force had not received any liaisons for P802.3bq or P802.3bz for this meeting but that there were 3 proposed outgoing liaisons for ISO/IEC JTC1/SC25 WG3 and presented the liaisons for review for approval prior to the close of the joint meeting.

- P802.3bq: Reply to Incoming Liaison 25N2461 on 40GBASE-T Return Loss Requirements
- P802.3bq: Reply to Incoming Liaison 25N2460, Cabling to Support 25GBASE-T
- P802.3bz: Reply to Incoming Liaison 25N2459 on ISO/IEC TR 11801-9904, guidelines on installed cabling to support 2.5GBASE-T and 5GBASE-T

The Chair completed review of the presentation.

PRESENTATIONS

The Chair then moved to the presentations for the meeting. (Secretary's note – where significant group discussion occurred, particularly involving future actions, a summary of any follow-on points is provided. Abstracts are given as a guide to the presentation material, where possible, these are as provided by the authors.)

Title: 802.3bz Editor's Report (zimmerman_3bz_01_0116.pdf)
Abstract: The editor reported on the status and comments received of the D1.2, along with a proposed agenda for comment resolution.
Presenter: George Zimmerman, CME Consulting / Aquantia & Commscope, Chief Editor IEEE 802.3bz
Discussion:
The Chief Editor presented his report, including the present status of the draft, a summary of comments received against D1.2.

Mr. Zimmerman presented the Proposed Comment Resolution Agenda and asked the group if there were objections or modifications to the agenda. None heard.

The Editor outlined the comments by topic, and reminded participants that the comments had been posted by topic on the website. Given the low number of EZ bucket comments no EZ bucket motion will be requested for P802.3bz.

The Editor reviewed the late comments and asked the group if there was any objection to considering the late comment. None heard.

The Editor reviewed a summary of the remaining topics and the comment resolution agenda.

One late comment was allowed to be included in the comment resolution.

At this time, the editor's report was concluded and comment resolution began.

Break at 9:42 AM

Resumed at 10:03 AM

COMMENT RESOLUTION
Decisions during comment resolution were made by consensus, except where noted that motions were taken. For details on comment resolution see the posted comment database.

Comment resolution for P802.3bz was concluded.

Break for lunch at 12:51 PM

Resumed from lunch at 2:10 PM

Title: 802.3bq Editor's Report (zimmerman_3bq_01_0116.pdf)
Abstract: The editor reported on the status and comments received of the draft 3.0, along with a proposed agenda for comment resolution.
Presenter: George Zimmerman, CME Consulting / Aquantia & Commscope, Chief Editor IEEE P802.3bq
Discussion:
The Chief Editor presented his report, including the present status of the draft, a summary of comments received against D3.0.
The Editor outlined the comments by topic, and reminded participants that the comments had been posted by topic on the website, with the Editor reminding the group via reflector to review the EZ bucket, as this group was intended to be approved by a single motion.

The editor asked if there was any objection to hearing the 6 late comments from Benjamin Rolfe and that there would also be another call for late comments prior to the end of comment resolution. None heard.

The editor then asked the group if anyone wished to view the EZ bucket comments on the screen; no request was made and the comments were not displayed. The Editor then asked the group that if anyone wished to remove a comment from the EZ bucket, they do so now. None heard.

The Editor then presented the following motion:

Motion #3: **Approve the proposed resolution of all EZ comments, marked with the EZ Topic in**
http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/comments/EZ_8023bq_d3p0_CommentID_proposed.pdf **excepting none.**
M: George Zimmerman   S: Jon Lewis

Approved by voice vote without objection (Technical >=75%)

At this time, the editor's report was concluded and comment resolution began.

COMMENT RESOLUTION
Decisions during comment resolution were made by consensus, except where noted that motions were taken. For details on comment resolution see the posted comment database.

The meeting was recessed for a short break at 3:31 PM

The meeting resumed at 4:00 PM

The Editor asked the group if there were any objections to re-opening P802.3bz comments 175, 176 and 177 to align with maintenance. None heard.

After task force discussions, P802.3bz comments 175, 176 and 177 were withdrawn by the commenter.

Comment resolution for P802.3bq resumed.

Motion #4: Move to:

- **Generate (802.3bz) Draft 1.3 from Draft 1.2 and closed comments**
- **Direct the Task Force Chair to make the following motion to the 802.3 Working Group:**
    - **Move that the IEEE 802.3 Working Group progress the IEEE P802.3bz draft to Working Group ballot.**

M: George Zimmerman S: Jon Lewis
Y: 22 N: 0 A: 0
MOTION PASSES (Technical >= 75%)

The meeting was recessed for the day at 6:18PM to resume at 8:00AM Thursday, January 21, 2016.

The meeting was called to order at 8:00AM Thursday, January 21, 2016.

The Chair called for introductions and affiliations, the participants introduced themselves, and the Chair then reviewed the agenda for the day. George Zimmerman indicated that another meeting taking place from 8-9am may be interest to the members of the P802.3bq/bz task forces. Several members expressed interest, and the Chair asked if there was any objection to breaking until 9:00am. No objection.

Break at 8:06 AM to resume no later than 9:00 AM.

Meeting resumed at 9:00 AM.

Introductions continued after the break.

IEEE Patent Policy, at **9:00 AM**, Mr. Chalupsky asked the group if there was anyone not familiar with the IEEE patent policy. None responded and Mr. Chalupsky made the call for potentially essential patents at **9:01 AM**, and none responded. Mr. Chalupsky then completed the reading of slide #4.

The Editor reviewed a summary of the remaining topics and the comment resolution agenda.

Motion with regard to P802.3bz
Motion #5: Authorize the editor to remove Editor's notes labeled as to be removed (before/prior to) working group ballot and generate draft 1.3.1.
M: Peter Jones   S: Jon Lewis

MOTION PASSES BY VOICE VOTE WITHOUT OBJECTION (Technical >= 75%)

Presentations for comment resolution for P802.3bq resumed.

Title: "Upper Frequency for Link Segments" (rossbach_3bq_01_0116.pdf)
Abstract: Current Drafts of 802.3bq and 802.3bz are not consistent in the definition of the upper frequency: a range of 0% up to 25% headroom above Nyquist frequency can be found. This presentation shall show the differences and proposes to align the specifications.
Presenter: Martin Rossbach, Nexans
Discussion: The group had a vigorous discussion on the need for excess bandwidth in conjunction with P802.3bq comment i-108, including why 2.5GBASE-T had different considerations and how similar considerations to 25GBASE-T might apply to a possible future higher-speed BASE-T.

Motions related to P802.3bq comment i-108:
"Based on IEEE P802.3by entering sponsor ballot in November 2015, IEEE P802.3bq and IEEE P802.3bp entering sponsor ballot in December 2015, the published timeline for IEEE P802.3bq showing approval in June 2016, and the published timeline for IEEE P802.3bp showing approval in August 2016, it seems likely that that IEEE P802.3by will be the second amendment and IEEE P802.3bq will be the third amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 after IEEE Std 802.3bw(TM)-2015 and IEEE Std 802.3by(TM)-201X."

Motion #6: Move to reject this comment because 25% bandwidth above Nyquist is required for BASE-T, except 2.5GBASE-T.
M: Valerie Maguire   S: Martin Rossbach
Y: 6 N: 13 A: 8
MOTION FAILS (Technical >=75%)

Motion #7: Reject the comment as there is no consensus to change the current draft based on this comment.
M: Chris DiMinico   S: Peter Jones
Y: 18 N: 6 A: 2
MOTION PASSES (Technical >=75%)

Additional comments regarding the same topic were discussed and after group discussion there was no consensus to make a change to the P802.3bq draft based on those comments. Refer to the comment database for additional details.

Break at 10:48 AM.

Meeting resumed at 11:15 AM.

Comment resolution for P802.3bq continued after the meeting resumed.

Break for lunch at 12:56 PM.

Meeting resumed at 2:03 PM.

Comment resolution concluded.

Break at 3:35 PM.

Meeting resumed at 4:08 PM.

Motion #8: The IEEE P802.3bq Task Force accept the comment resolutions (with editorial license to conform to RevCom guidelines) to D3.0 as detailed in http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/comments/8023bq_d30_approved.pdf along with the results of motions accepted at the January 2016 Task Force meeting and charter the editor to produce D3.1 for sponsor ballot 1st recirculation.

M: Pete Cibula   S: Peter Jones
Y: 20 N: 0   A: 0
Motion Passes (Technical >=75%)

The Chair then moved to the proposed liaison letters for review.
Motion #9: Direct the task force chair to make the following motion to 802.3:
**   Move that the IEEE 802.3 Working Group approve:**
**   IEEE_802d3_to_ISOIEC_SC25_WG3_40GRL_0116_draft.pdf**
**   IEEE_802d3_to_ISOIEC_SC25_WG3_9905_0116_draft.pdf**
**   with editorial license granted to the Chair (or his appointed agent) as liaison communications from the IEEE 802.3 Working Group to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC25 WG3.**

M: Jon Lewis   S: George Zimmerman
Y: 20 N: 0   A: 0
Motion Passes (Technical >=75%)

Motion #10: Direct the task force chair to make the following motion to 802.3:
**   Move that the IEEE 802.3 Working Group approve:**
**   IEEE_802d3_to_ISOIEC_SC25_WG3_9904_0116_draft.pdf**
**   with editorial license granted to the Chair (or his appointed agent) as a liaison communication from the IEEE 802.3 Working Group to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC25 WG3.**

M: Clark Carty   S: Theo Brillhart

Y: 20 N: 0   A: 0
Motion Passes (Technical >=75%)

Future Ad Hoc Meetings:
Discussion about the next Enterprise Noise and Use Case ad hoc meeting and it was decided that the next meeting would be February 3, 2016.

The Chair reviewed future meetings including the potential for a contingent interim for both P802.3bq and P802.3bz in April, 2016.

Straw Poll: Future Meetings Straw Poll
       March 2016 Plenary Week of March 13
       The Venetian Macau, Macau SAR, P.R. China
       Yes: 15
       No: 1
       Maybe: 3

Having completed the presentations and comment resolution business for the meeting, the Chair reviewed future meeting plans in the agenda presentation.

No further motions of business were offered.

Adjournment

Motion #11: **To adjourn the meeting.**
M: Jon Lewis   S: Pete Cibula
MOTION PASSES by voice without opposition

The Meeting was adjourned at 4:56 PM, Thursday, January 21, 2016.

Appendix A: Attendees at IEEE P802.3bq and P802.3bz Joint Task Force Meeting, January 20-21, 2015

P802.3bq & P802.3bz January'16				1/20/16	1/21/16
Last Name	First Name	Employer	Affiliation	Wednesday	Thursday
Bains	Amrik	Cisco	Cisco	X	X
Belopolsky	Yakov	Bel Stewart	Bel Stewart	X	
Brillhart	Theo	Fluke Electronics	Fluke Electronics	X	X
Carlson	Steve	High Speed Design	Broadcom, Marvell, Huawei		X
Carty	Clark	Cisco	Cisco	X	X
Cates	Ron	Marvell	Marvell	X	
Chadha	Mandeep	Microsemi	Microsemi	X	X
Chalupsky	David	Intel	Intel	X	X
Cibula	Pete	Intel	Intel	X	X
DiMinico	Christopher	MC Communications	Panduit	X	X
Donahue	Curtis	UNH – IOL	UNH - IOL	X	X
Estes	Dave	Spirent	Spirent	X	X
Feyh	German	Broadcom	Broadcom	X	X
Flatman	Alan	LAN Technologies	LAN Technologies	X	X
Fritsche	Matthias	Harting	Harting	X	X
Hess	Dave	Cord Data	Cord Data	X	X
Jones	Peter	Cisco	Cisco	X	X
Lackner	Hans	QoSCom Gmbh	QoSCom Gmbh	X	X
Lewis	Jon	Dell	Dell	X	X
Maguire	Valerie	Siemon	Siemon	X	X
Marris	Arthur	Cadence	Cadence		X
McClellan	Brett	Marvell	Marvell	X	X
Moffitt	Bryan	Commscope	Commscope	X	X
Renteria	Victor	Belfuse Inc	Belfuse Inc	X	X
Rossbach	Martin	Nexans	Nexans	X	X
Schicketanz	Dieter	Consultant	Reutlingen University	X	X
Sedarat	Hossein	Aquantia	Aquantia	X	X
Sedio	Steve	ACON	ACON	X	X
Shariff	Masood	Commscope	Commscope	X	X
Shirani	Ramin	Aquantia	Aquantia	X	X
Souvignier	Tom	Broadcom	Broadcom	X	X
Sparrowhawk	Bryan	Leviton	Leviton	X	X
Vaden	Sterling	Surtec, Ind.	Vaden Enterprises	X	X
Vanderlaan	Paul	Berk-Tek LLC	Berk-Tek LLC	X	X
Wagner	Bob	Panduit Corp.	Panduit Corp.	X	X
Wu	Peter	Marvell	Marvell	X	X
Zimmerman	George	CME	Commscope, Aquantia	X	X