

# 802.3bq Editors Report

George Zimmerman  
CME Consulting  
Chief Editor

# Status

---

- Draft 1.2 went out for review 10 February 2015
  - Thanks to hard work by your Editorial team:
    - Chris Diminico, Curtis Donahue, Jim Graba, Valerie Maguire, & George Zimmerman
- 99 Received Comments from 7 individuals
  - One withdrawn: 98 / 7 (up from 36 from 7)
    - 50 from the Editor, mainly typos, references, editorial coordination and cleanup of informative text to align with prior changes
  - 70 E or ER: 41 Editorial, 29 Editorial Required
  - 28 T or TR: 19 Technical, 9 Technical Required

# Progress of Comments

	<b>Draft</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1.1.1</b>	<b>1.2</b>
<b>Commenters</b>		9	7	7
<b>Total Comments</b>		129	36	98
<b>TR</b>		23	4	9
<b>T</b>		50	17	19
<b>ER</b>		27	9	29
<b>E</b>		29	6	41
<b>T+TR</b>		73	21	28
<b>E+ER</b>		56	15	70
<b>TR+ER</b>		50	13	38

# Progress on Technical Comments

	Draft/(T+TR count)	1.0 / (73)	1.1.1 / (21)	1.2 / (28)
<b>Typos &amp; Xrefs in Tech Text</b>		2	1	4
<b>Filling out technical specs</b>		21	5	3
<i>Link Segment (included in above)</i>		16	5	2
<b>Cleaning up informative text</b>		4	2	9
<b>NEW FEATURE OR CHANGE PROPOSALS</b>	46/11 areas	13/7 areas	12/4 areas	
Proposal for alternative MDI		1		5
Proposal to add Class II references		4		5
Loop timing mandatory		5	1	
40G clause references			4	
leftover 10G references		4	2	
Additional RS-FEC		4	2	
Test modes			2	
Test procedures		3	1	
Training & Autoneg		12	1	
EEE		7		1
Management bits (non editorial coord)		3		
Fast Retrain		2		1
PMA Electrical		1		

# EZ & EZ-Check Buckets

---

- As stated on the reflector:
  - Comments marked with the EZ or EZ-Check topic are expected to be approved in a single motion
  - Please review [http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/comments/p802.3bq\\_d1.2\\_proposed\\_response\\_by\\_topic.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/comments/p802.3bq_d1.2_proposed_response_by_topic.pdf)
- At this time, if you wish to remove a comment from the EZ or EZ-Check Topics, please speak up

# Comments Excluded from EZ Bucket

---

- Comment #174 – not in there to begin with

# ED-COORD Bucket

---

- As stated on the reflector:
  - ED-COORD comments reflect requests by the Chief Editor's work on coordinating multiple drafts
  - Comments marked with the ED-COORD topic are expected to be approved in a single motion
  - Please review [http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/comments/p802.3bq\\_d1.2\\_proposed\\_response\\_by\\_topic.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/bq/comments/p802.3bq_d1.2_proposed_response_by_topic.pdf)
- At this time, if you wish to remove a comment from the ED-COORD Topic, please speak up

# Summary by Topic

---

- 52 are “EZ or “EZ Check”
  - typos or cross-references or external reference issues
- 6 “ED-COORD”
  - Editorial style or coordination from Pete Anslow on where registers go
- 5 “Notes”
  - Deleting editor’s notes meant to draw attention to text in preceding drafts
- 4 “64B/65B”
  - Informational references to the block size, which used to be a straight 64/65B and is now mixed 512/513B + 64/65B
- 5 Editing errors & format in the RS-FEC
- 4 Removing informative TBDs by equations
- 5 Cabling issues not related to a technical hole
- 1 Editing error cleaning up some text left hanging from an earlier change – but too complex to be “EZ”.
- 5 filling in the remaining technical holes (see PHY ad hoc, all noncontroversial)

***THIS COVERS 87 of the 98 comments***



# Summary by Topic (cont'd)

---

- The remaining 3 areas are where there is some technical discussion:
  - 1 Addressing the “cable clamp” test language
  - 5 Making Class II references parallel to Class I references throughout the draft
  - 5 Proposing to insert the -110 (ARJ™) as an alternative MDI.

# Comment Resolution Agenda

---

- Approve EZ and EZ-Check Bucket
- Approve ED-COORD Bucket
- Resolve in order of Topic, low hanging fruit first
  - 64/65B
  - RS-FEC
  - Tech-Other
  - HOLES (see PHY ad hoc report)
  - CMR (see CMR ad hoc report)
  - TBD
  - Cabling
  - Class I/Class II
  - MDI
- Comments from the Floor

# Comments from the floor

---

- **Commenter:** George Zimmerman, CME Consulting
- **Clause 78**            **Subclause 78.1**            **Page: 747** **Line: 1**
- **Type:** ER            **Topic:** Editorial / Other
- **Comment:**
  - Editing instructions in clause 78 do not follow standard format, and, on Tables 78-1, 78-2, 78-3, edits show blank rows in tables, and are incomplete as to where to put the inserted rows, additionally, Table 78-3 in clause 78.3 in the draft should be an edit to Table 78-4, in clause 78.5 per 802.3bx.
- **Proposed remedy:**
  - Delete hanging editing instruction to insert new clauses & annexes – there are none.
  - Replace reference to Table 78-3 in Clause 78.3 with Table 78-4 in Clause 78.5
  - Delete blank rows in Tables 78-1, 78-2 and (now) 78-4.
  - Delete editor's notes in connection with Tables 78-1, 78-2, and 78-3 and replace with editing instructions below:
  - ***Insert row to Table 78-1 with 40GBASE-T and reference clause number following last 40G PHY type currently 40GBASE-ER4)***
  - ***Insert row to Table 78-2 with 40GBASE-T EEE parameters following last 40G PHY type currently 40GBASE-CR4)***
  - ***Insert row to Table 78-4 with 40GBASE-T LPI parameters following last 40G PHY type currently 40GBASE-KR4)***

# Adding in 25GBASE-T... Maybe Next Time

---

- BIG WORK: repeat much of the detail work we've just done to take clause 55 text and convert it to 40G:
  - Frequency scale PMA/PMD and rate specs
    - 15 references to Msymbol/sec + 31 references to MHz on PHY
      - 8 of which are test setups
  - Scale or clean-out fixed references to times (e.g., msec in EEE)
  - Autoneg changes
  - Management register name changes & bit allocs to include 25G
- Little stuff:
  - Every 64-bit XLGMII transfer will have parallel reference to 2 32-bit 25GMII transfers
  - Do we want to define use of the 25G-AUI? (NEW!)
  - Figures and tables for inclusion in 25G clauses
- If you want to help, contact me – needs checking for completeness
- What we don't HAVE to do:
  - New link segment, new PCS to protect unprotected bits, loop timing changes