

Clause	Page	Line	Commenter	Comment	Suggested change	Proposed resolution
			Dieter			
	1	14	20 Schicketanz	Different definitions in ISO and TIA	Change Category to Class	
	1	14	28 Schicketanz	Different definitions in ISO and TIA	Change Category to Class	REJECT - definition reflects usage in the document
	Gene		Dieter	it says often up to 30 m, is that a length limitation? If the channel values are met it could be more. Should it not be at least 30m?	Discuss	REJECT
	98.7	168	1 Schicketanz	Where is the definition of IEEE link States that 40GBASE-T is designed to operate over Class I cabling – but we have not made this decision in 802.3bq. We have only adopted IL and RL requirements specified by Class I cabling.	Discuss	REJECT - link segment is defined under definitions
	98.7	168	3 Alan Flatman	(COMMENT AF01)	Replace “ISO/IEC 11801 Class I” with “TBD”	
	98.7	168	12 Alan Flatman	Editor’s note is premature.	Delete editors note	
	98.8	176	36 Wayne Larsen	Explain why MDI-X is needed, both here and in 10GBASE-T	Discuss	
	98.8	176	Alan Flatman	802.3bq has not chosen an MDI connector as yet.	This entire subclause should be marked “TBD”	ACCEPT - Note undecided items as TBD
			Dieter	Common Mode Noise Rejection - there is no limit as the cabling is shielded now measurement set up may have to be redefined	Discuss	REJECT - need specific proposals
98.5.4.3		161	13 Schicketanz			
			Dieter	Short reach test channel - category is wrong	Discuss	REJECT - text is not in the spec - only there as editors note marked needed to delete or replace w/appropriate channel
98.5.4.5.1		162	26 Schicketanz			
			Brett	Bit 16 description is incorrect, 'U16 10GBASE-T ability (1=support of 40GBASE-T and 0 = no support)'	Change to 'U16 10GBASE-T ability (1 = support of 10GBASE-T and 0= no support)', and define bit in Next Page for 40GBASE-T	Accept
98.6.1.2	164	Table 98-15	McClellan			
98.7.1	168		17 Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace “ISO/IEC 11801 Class I” with “TBD”	
98.7.1	168		23 Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace “ISO/IEC 11801 Class I” with “TBD”	
98.7.1	168		24 Alan Flatman	Editor’s note is premature.	Delete editor’s note	
				Set frequency range of all link segment parameters to $1 \text{ MHz} \leq f \leq 2000 \text{ MHz}$	Set frequency range of all link segment parameters to $1 \text{ MHz} \leq f \leq 2000 \text{ MHz}$	
98.7.2	168		28 Chris Diminico	2000 MHz		
98.7.2	168		30 Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace “Class I” with “TBD cabling”	
				The insertion loss of each duplex channel using Equation (98–11) to Equation (98–14) unnecessarily complex. Equation can be simplified by regression. Link segment insertion need not implicitly represent cable and connector insertion losses.	Replace equations 98-11 to 98-14 with regression equation, per diminico_3bq_01_0914.pdf slide 5	
98.7.2.1	169		1 Chris Diminico			
			Dieter			
98.7.2.2	170		22 Schicketanz	What is this? Could be deleted is explained better in 98.7.1	Discuss	Discuss
				MDNEXT and PSNEXT are same thing, redundant and only PSNEXT is used	a. Use the title of 98.7.2.4.3 as the title of 98.7.2.4.2. b. Change the variable in equation 98-17 to PSNEXT. c. Fill in the right side of equation 98-17 with whatever we agree on. d. Delete section 98.7.2.4.3.	
98.7.2.4.2	171		17 Wayne Larsen			

98.7.2.4.4	172	28 Wayne Larsen	Fill in Equation 98-21 right hand side	See proposal	
98.7.2.4.4	172	35 Alan Flatman	Equation 98-22 wrong & references 100m cable	correct	
		Dieter	ACR-F: '100 meter reference?' Also formula 98-22, IEC draft specifies 50m, published TR11801-9901 also 50m, TIA draft 30m, should be left TBD for the moment		
98.7.2.4.4	172	36 Schicketanz		Replace 100m with TBD	Discuss
			Equation 98-22 is a length scaling equation, and it's fine to leave it in, but it's not exactly right since the connector contribution should not be length scaled based on the cable length.	Remove length scaling from connector contribution, or If we leave it in, we should compare it with the equation for length scaling of ACRF in Annex D of the latest TIA draft. This equation breaks down the contributions of connectors and cables, and length scales only the cables, which would be correct.	
98.7.2.4.4	172	40 Wayne Larsen		6a. Use the title of 98.7.2.4. as the title of 98.7.2.4.5 b. Change the variable in equation 98-23 to PSACRF. c. Fill in the right side of equation 98-23 with whatever we agree on.	
			MDACRF and PSACRF are same thing, redundant and only PSACRF is used	d. Delete section 98.7.2.4.6	
98.7.2.4.5	172	47 Wayne Larsen			
98.7.2.5	173	26 Wayne Larsen	Delay is inconsistent with 30m cable	Change delay to 176 nsec	ACCEPT
		Dieter	Link delay skew, 50/570 = ~9% does not match 4% resistance unbalance.		
98.7.2.6	173	33 Schicketanz		Discussion needed which one is more important	Discuss
			Delay skew is inconsistent with 30m cable	Change delay skew tolerance to 3ns (from 10ns. This is the same for both TIA and ISO, and in both class 1 and class 2	ACCEPT
98.7.2.6	173	33 Wayne Larsen			
98.7.3.2.1	174	45 Chris Diminico	Remove coupling length correction from PSAACRF	Remove coupling length correction from PSAACRF	
		Dieter			
98.7.4	175	50 Schicketanz	Needs update to 40G	Update to 40G	REJECT - specific updates not identified nor apparent
		Dieter			REJECT - IEEE nomenclature is consistent with other clauses
98.8.1	175	40 Schicketanz	MDI connectors should be called 'connections'	Change title to MDI connections, Fig 98-41 is a connector, OK change from "IEC 60603-7-4 (unscreened) or IEC 60603-7-5 (screened)" to "IEC 60603-7-82".	
98.8.1	176	42 Wayne Larsen	Connector references are inconsistent with bandwidth and channel		
		Dieter			
98.8.1	176	53 Schicketanz	Figure is called 'connector - should be called a plug	Change caption nomenclature from 'connector' to 'plug'	REJECT - IEEE nomenclature is consistent with other clauses
		Dieter			ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - Add editors note - MDI electrical characteristics to be specified
98.8.2	177	30 Schicketanz	All electrical values are still Cat6a	Update to 40G values	
98.8.2	177	37 Wayne Larsen	Reference to 500MHz should be 2000MHz	Change 500 MHz to 2000 MHz move the dB to the left column, and add MHz as the units in the right column. This also applies to equation 98-34 on line 10 on page 178.	ACCEPT
				equation 98-33, add a new row to specify a plateau of 3 dB from 500 to 2000	
98.8.2.1	177	50 Wayne Larsen	Equation 98-33, (editorial)		
98.8.2.1	177	54 Wayne Larsen	Equation 98-33 Specification to 500MHz should go to 2000MHz		
98.8.2.2	178	12 Wayne Larsen	Equation 98-34, specifications to 500Mhz should go to 2000MHz	Extend frequency range to 2000MHz	

98.8.2.2	178	16 Wayne Larsen	states that this requirement applies when the transmitter is transmitting, but the test method details state that only the part of the voltage that is due to the injected common mode counts and the transmitter is to be disabled during the test.	Discuss	
98.8.2.2	178	41 Wayne Larsen	specifications to 500Mhz should go to 2000MHz	Extend frequency range to 2000MHz	
98.8.2.2	179	1 Wayne Larsen	Figure 98-42 describes Ediff and points to a location, and the requirement specifies this relative to Ecm which is shown in the figure, but there is no clarity as to what point in the MDI to connect to for detection of Ediff, or what kind of interconnection network. The test on page 178 lines 48-54 describes doing this with a network analyzer and measuring Scd11, which would imply the NA becomes the common mode source (should really then be Sdc11), in which case the common-mode coupling circuit would not be needed, but again there is no clarity as to where and how to connect it. The common mode impedances are not consistent. It is specified 75 ohms in this case, 50 Ohms in figure 98-42, and the circuit of figure 98-43 implies 24.95 Ohms.	Discuss and reconcile	
98.8.2.2	179	25 Wayne Larsen	The resistors in figure 98-43 should be matched to each other within 0.1 %, otherwise an error will arise in the calibration.	Add note to this effect	
98.9.2	180	7 Schicketanz	General wording OK but use reference to nearly finished bonding TR from ISO (ISO/IEC 30129)	Consider reference to ISO/IEC 30129	Discuss
98.9.3	180	Dieter 28 Schicketanz	Installation and maintenance practices - delete wording, just reference ISO/IEC 14763-2, bonding here is wrong.	Delete wording, reference ISO/IEC 14763-2, delete language on bonding	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - Add ISO/IEC reference. Reference to bonding is in editors note, not text
Equation 98-15	170	37 Wayne Larsen	Combine last 2 rows of RL equation	Combine last 2 rows of RL equation	
Table 98-17	168	37 Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace table content with "TBD"	
Table 98-17	168	38 Wayne Larsen	The cabling entry should be ISO Class 1 / ISO Class 2 / TIA Category 8. Category 8.1 is an ISO designation of components. There is no such channel designation. The TIA is strictly Category 8 with no dots.	Repace entries as described	