

Clause	Page	Line	Commenter	Comment	Suggested change	Proposed resolution	Resolution
1	14	20	Dieter Schicketanz	Different definitions in ISO and TIA	Change Category to Class		REJECT - Consistent with present 802.3 style. Recommend Commenter forward comment to REJECT - Consistent with present 802.3 style. Recommend
1	14	28	Dieter Schicketanz	Different definitions in ISO and TIA	Change Category to Class	REJECT - definition reflects usage in the document	Commenter forward comment to REJECT - "up to" is consistent with existing standards and may be confusing objectives with standards
98	Gene		Dieter Schicketanz	it says often up to 30 m, is that a length limitation? If the channel values are met it could be more. Should it not be at least 30m? Common Mode Noise Rejection - there is no limit as the cabling is shielded now	Discuss	REJECT	
98.5.4.3	161	13	Dieter Schicketanz	measurement set up may have to be redefined	Discuss	REJECT - need specific proposals REJECT - text is not in the spec - only there as editors note marked needed to delete or replace	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - Section marked as TBD, commenters to provide replacement for the channel and length
98.5.4.5.1	162	26	Dieter Schicketanz	Short reach test channel - category is wrong	Discuss		
98.6.1.2	164	15	Brett McClellan	Bit 16 description is incorrect, 'U16 10GBASE-T ability (1=support of 40GBASE-T and 0 = no support)'	Change to 'U16 10GBASE-T ability (1 = support of 10GBASE-T and 0= no support)', and define bit in Next Page for 40GBASE-T	Accept	ACCEPT
98.7	168	1	Dieter Schicketanz	Where is the definition of IEEE link	Discuss	REJECT - link segment is defined under definitions	REJECT - Defined under Definitions Section
98.7	168	3	Alan Flatman	States that 40GBASE-T is designed to operate over Class I cabling – but we have not made this decision in 802.3bq. We have only adopted IL and RL requirements specified by Class I cabling.	Replace "ISO/IEC 11801 Class I" with "TBD"		
98.7	168	12	Alan Flatman	Editor's note is premature.	Delete editors note		
98.7.1	168	17	Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace "ISO/IEC 11801 Class I" with "TBD"		
98.7.1	168	23	Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace "ISO/IEC 11801 Class I" with "TBD"		
98.7.1	168	24	Alan Flatman	Editor's note is premature.	Delete editor's note		2nd Ed should be 3rd Ed.
98.7.2	168	28	Chris Diminico	Set frequency range of all link segment parameters to $1 \text{ MHz} \leq f \leq 2000 \text{ MHz}$	Set frequency range of all link segment parameters to $1 \text{ MHz} \leq f$		Accept.
98.7.2	168	30	Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace "Class I" with "TBD"		
98.7.2.1	169	1	Chris Diminico	The insertion loss of each duplex channel using Equation (98–11) to Equation (98–14) unnecessarily complex. Equation can be simplified by regression. Link segment insertion need not implicitly represent cable and	Replace equations 98-11 to 98-14 with regression equation, per diminico_3bq_01_0914.pdf slide 5		Accept
98.7.2.2	170	22	Dieter Schicketanz	What is this? Could be deleted is explained better in 98.7.1	Discuss	Discuss	Reject

Clause	Page	Line	Commenter	Comment	Suggested change	Proposed resolution	Resolution
98.7.2.4.2	171	17	Wayne Larsen	MDNEXT and PSNEXT are same thing, redundant and only PSNEXT is used	a. Use the title of 98.7.2.4.3 as the title of 98.7.2.4.2. b. Change the variable in equation 98-17 to PSNEXT. c. Fill in the right side of equation 98-17 with whatever we agree on. d. Delete section 98.7.2.4.3. See proposal larsen_3bq_01a_0914.pdf		Reject - no change required.
98.7.2.4.4	172	28	Wayne Larsen	Fill in Equation 98-21 right hand side			DEFERRED
98.7.2.4.4	172	35	Alan Flatman	Equation 98-22 wrong & references 100m cable ACR-F: '100 meter reference?' Also formula 98-22, IEC draft specifies 50m, published TR11801-9901 also 50m, TIA draft 30m, should be left	correct		Accept in principle, to be corrected when proposal is made.
98.7.2.4.4	172	36	Dieter Schicketanz		Replace 100m with TBD Remove length scaling from connector contribution, or If we leave it in, we should compare it with the equation for length scaling of ACRF in Annex D of the latest TIA draft. This equation breaks down the contributions of connectors and cables, and length	Discuss	Accept in principle, to be corrected when proposal is made.
98.7.2.4.4	172	40	Wayne Larsen	Equation 98-22 is a length scaling equation, and it's fine to leave it in, but it's not exactly right since the connector contribution should not be length scaled based on the cable length.	6a. Use the title of 98.7.2.4. as the title of 98.7.2.4.5 b. Change the variable in equation 98-23 to PSACRF. c. Fill in the right side of equation 98-23 with whatever we agree on. d. Delete section 98.7.2.4.6 See proposal larsen_3bq_01a_0914.pdf		REJECT - equation 98-22 is only for cable, not connectors.
98.7.2.4.5	172	47	Wayne Larsen	MDACRF and PSACRF are same thing, redundant and only PSACRF is used			REJECT - see earlier comment on PSNEXT/MDNEXT. Note - check instances of ELFEXT and replace with ACRF
98.7.2.4.5	173	1	Wayne Larsen	Fill in Equation 98-23 right hand side			DEFERRED
98.7.2.5	173	26	Wayne Larsen	Delay is inconsistent with 30m cable TCL, ELTCTL not specified for channel, Balance parameters TCL and TCTL should be added to protect the PHY from harmful noise conversion from common mode	Change delay to 176 nsec	ACCEPT	ACCEPT - please note consistent with Category 8 draft 2.0c REJECT - Discussion that TCL and TCTL is generally not specified in IEEE specifications. Alien Crosstalk is a related specification, which is
98.7.5	176	1	Wayne Larsen	Link delay skew, 50/570 = ~9% does not match 4% resistance unbalance.	See proposal larsen_3bq_01a_0914.pdf		ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - Use 17nsec delay skew for 30m channel per TIA
98.7.2.6	173	33	Dieter Schicketanz		Discussion needed which one is more important Change delay skew tolerance to 3ns (from 10ns. This is the same for both TIA and ISO, and in both	Discuss	
98.7.2.6	173	33	Wayne Larsen	Delay skew is inconsistent with 30m cable		ACCEPT	ACCEPT

Clause	Page	Line	Commenter	Comment	Suggested change	Proposed resolution	Resolution
98.7.3.2.1	175	15	Chris Diminico	Remove coupling length correction from PSAACRF	Remove coupling length correction from PSAACRF		ACCEPT
98.7.4	175	50	Dieter Schicketanz	Needs update to 40G	Update to 40G	REJECT - specific updates not identified nor apparent	REJECT - Specific proposal of what to change is needed
98.8	176	36	Wayne Larsen	10GBASE-T	Discuss		REJECT - with an invitation to the commenter to come back with a
98.8	176		Alan Flatman	802.3bq has not chosen an MDI connector as yet.	This entire subclause should be marked "TBD"	ACCEPT - Note undecided items as TBD	ACCEPT - no proposals accepted as of draft 0p8
98.8.1	175	40	Dieter Schicketanz	MDI connectors should be called 'connections'	Change title to MDI connections, Fig 98-41 is a connector, OK change from "IEC 60603-7-4 (unscreened) or IEC 60603-7-5 (screened)" to "IEC 60603-7-82".	REJECT - IEEE nomenclature is consistent with other	REJECT - IEEE nomenclature is consistent with other clauses
98.8.1	176	42	Wayne Larsen	Connector references are inconsistent with bandwidth and channel	See larsen_3bq_02a_0914.pdf		DEFERRED
98.8.1	176	53	Dieter Schicketanz	Figure is called 'connector - should be called a plug	Change caption nomenclature from 'connector' to 'plug'	REJECT - IEEE nomenclature is consistent with other	REJECT - IEEE nomenclature is consistent with other clauses
98.8.2	177	30	Dieter Schicketanz	All electrical values are still Cat6a	Update to 40G values	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - Add editors note - MDI electrical characteristics to be	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - See earlier flatman comment, entire section TBD
98.8.2	177	37	Wayne Larsen	Reference to 500MHz should be 2000MHz	Change 500 MHz to 2000 MHz	ACCEPT	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - See earlier flatman comment, entire section
98.8.2.1	177	50	Wayne Larsen	Equation 98-33, (editorial)	move the dB to the left column, and add MHz as the units in the right column. This also applies to equation 98-34 on line 10 on		ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - editorial team to ensure equation format is consistent with other clauses in 802.3
98.8.2.1	177	54	Wayne Larsen	Equation 98-33 Specification to 500MHz should go to 2000MHz	equation 98-33, add a new row to specify a plateau of 3 dB from 500		ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - See earlier flatman comment, entire section
98.8.2.2	178	12	Wayne Larsen	Equation 98-34, specifications to 500Mhz should go to 2000MHz	Extend frequency range to 2000MHz		DEFERRED TO AD HOC LOOKING AT COMMON MODE REJECTION TEST
98.8.2.2	178	16	Wayne Larsen	states that this requirement applies when the transmitter is transmitting, but the test method details state that only the part of the voltage that is due to the injected common mode	Discuss		DEFERRED TO AD HOC LOOKING AT COMMON MODE REJECTION TEST
98.8.2.2	178	41	Wayne Larsen	specifications to 500Mhz should go to 2000MHz	Extend frequency range to 2000MHz		DEFERRED TO AD HOC LOOKING AT COMMON MODE REJECTION TEST

Clause	Page	Line	Commenter	Comment	Suggested change	Proposed resolution	Resolution
98.8.2.2	179	1	Wayne Larsen	Figure 98-42 describes Ediff and points to a location, and the requirement specifies this relative to Ecm which is shown in the figure, but there is no clarity as to what point in the MDI to connect to for detection of Ediff, or what kind of interconnection network. The test on page 178 lines 48-54 describes doing this with a network analyzer and measuring Scd11, which would imply the NA becomes the common mode source (should really then be Sdc11), in which case the common-mode coupling circuit would not be needed, but again there is no clarity as to where and how to connect it. The resistors in figure 98-43 should be matched to each other within 0.1 %, otherwise an error will arise in the calibration.	Discuss and reconcile		DEFERRED TO AD HOC LOOKING AT COMMON MODE REJECTION TEST
98.8.2.2	179	25	Wayne Larsen	General wording OK but use reference to nearly finished bonding TR from ISO (ISO/IEC 30129)	Add note to this effect		DEFERRED TO AD HOC LOOKING AT COMMON MODE REJECTION TEST
98.9.2	180	7	Dieter Schicketanz	Installation and maintenance practices - delete wording, just reference ISO/IEC 14763-2, bonding here is wrong.	Consider reference to ISO/IEC 30129	Discuss	REJECT - Need input or liaison on content of ISO/IEC 30129 or other
98.9.3	180	28	Dieter Schicketanz		Delete wording, reference ISO/IEC 14763-2, delete language on bonding	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - Add ISO/IEC reference.	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE - Add ISO/IEC reference. Reference to bonding is in editors note, not text
Equation 98-15	170	37	Wayne Larsen	Combine last 2 rows of RL equation	Combine last 2 rows of RL equation		ACCEPT
Table 98-17	168	37	Alan Flatman	See comment AF01	Replace table content with "TBD"		WITHDRAWN
Table 98-17	168	38	Wayne Larsen	The cabling entry should be ISO Class 1 / ISO Class 2 / TIA Category 8. Category 8.1 is an ISO designation of components. There is no such channel designation. The TIA is strictly Category	Repace entries as described		ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: Replace with "ISO Class 1 / TIA Category 8" See straw poll 2
98.1 through 98.3			George Zimmerman	Going to 40G architecture causes extensive changes specific to the existing 40G interfaces	Revert to 10GBASE-T architecture where the XLGMII becomes the common reference point for the	ACCEPT	ACCEPT - hold as a separate technical motion since it undoes a prior technical motion