C/FM SC FM	P 19	L 2	# r02-24	C/ 1		1.4.338	P 24	L 40	# r02-10
rseboodt, Lennart	Philips Lighting	9		Jones, Ch	ad		Cisco System	ms, Inc.	
Comment Type E OOS	Comment Status A		Editorial	Comment here i	s this de	ER efinition wi	Comment Status A thout the editing instruction	s (so, as it will be	Definitions e published):
Missing space in TO SuggestedRemedy Add space Response	C: 145.2.10 PSE Maintain Response Status C			power twiste IEEE single	r to a sir d-pair F Std 802 10BAS	ngle link so PHYs. Whe 2.3, Clause E-T, 100E	g Equipment (PSE): A DTE ection. PSEs are defined fo en used with 2 or 4 pair bala 33 and Clause 145, Powe BASE-TX, 1000BASE-T, 2.5 erface for both the data it re	r use with two dif anced twisted-pai r over Ethernet is GBASE-T, 5GB/	ferent types of balanced ir (BASE-T) PHYs, see s intended to provide a ASE-T, or 10GBASE-T
ACCEPT.				Claus	e 104),	Power over	single balanced twisted-pair er Data Lines is intended to	provide a single	100BASE- T1 or
C/ 1 SC 1.4.289 Thompson, Geoffrey	P24 Individual	L 29	# r02-85	proce		e data. A F	vith a unified interface for bo PSE used with balanced sin		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status A		Definitions	Not si	ure whv	we chose	to use a different sentence	construct for Po	E than used for PoDI
	k section" has been updated in t v) therefore the change to the ba ot needed.			The F sente	PoE sen nce. WI	tence read thout the p	ls poorly. Restore the PoDL parenthesis around the poin g a period after 'Clause 145	sentence constr ters to the clause	ruct to the PoE
1 4 289 link section:	The point-to-point medium conn	ection betwee	en the active PSF Power	Suggeste	dRemed	dy			
Interface (PI) and the							th 2 or 4 pair balanced twis		
SuggestedRemedy							Clause 145, Power over Eth FX, 1000BASE-T, 2.5GBAS		
	to the base standard detailed or he draft for P802.3bt.	n page 24, line	es 28 through 31 (labeled				for both the data it requires		
Response	Response Status W						r 4 pair balanced twisted-pa 145), Power over Ethernet i		
ACCEPT IN PRINCI	PLE.			T, 100	BASE-	TX, 1000E	BASE-T, 2.5GBASE-T, 5GE h the data it requires and th	ASE-T, or 10GB	ASE-T device with a
Editor to update ame	endment to be based on 802.3-2	018 current re	evision.	Response			Response Status C	o ponor to proce	
Change definition of	link section to:			,		PRINCIPL	,		
link section: The por	tion of the link segment from the	PSE to the P	D.	Chan	ge defin	iton to:			
				single	link se	ction whicl	nent (PSE): A DTE or mids h may also carry data (for 2 145; for single pair systems	or 4 pair system	s, see IEEE Std 802.3,

Pa **24** Li **40**

Ciena Corpora	ation	# r02-2	C/ 30 SC 30. Anslow, Peter		P 31 ena Corpora	L 47	#	r02-3
Comment Status A	allon	Editoria						Editorial
, Power over Data Lines is of 1.4.338 as modified by IEE	E Std 802.3bu-20	de a" but this is 16 which has " ,	There are two "de encompassing en significant number	elete" editing instruction diting instruction "Chang er of additions to the tab	s related to e Table 30- e that are n	4 as follows:" S ot mentioned, it	Since there	- are also a
			SuggestedRemedy					
in strikethrough font and "Pov	wer over Data Lin [,]	es" in underline.						the "PD
Response Status W			"aPSEShortČour leaving just "Cha	nter" in Táble 30-4." nge Table 30-4 as follov	/s:"			
d P25	L 33	# r02-123	show the aPSES remove the unde	hortCounter row in strike	through for	nt		up as dots
EEE		levels, short MPS,		Response Stat	ıs C			
			C/ 30 SC 30. Anslow, Peter	-		L 25 tion	#	r02-4
r. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 14 PSE: A PSE that supports Cla	45)." ass 8 power levels	s in addition to lower	Cross-references to locations in 33	s in 30.9.1.1.2 through 3	0.9.1.1.5, 30			
Response Status C		,	,	and External to these as	on orono ro	foronooo		
_E.			,	0		ierences.		
ged as we lowered Ptype for ⁻	Type 4 to 75W.		ACCEPT.	Response Stat	ls C			
Change definiton to: "Type 4 PSE: A PSE that supports at least Class 7 power levels, in addition to lower PD classes, short MPS, and 4-pair power. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 145)."		0/ 00 00 00		₽ 42	L 47	-		
			C/ 30 SC 30 . Anslow, Peter		ena Corpora		#	r02-5
				Cie Comment Stat	ena Corpora		#	r02-5 Editorial
			Anslow, Peter Comment Type E	Cie Comment Star n "s ubclause"	ena Corpora		#	
	in strikethrough font and "Por <i>Response Status</i> W nd <i>P25</i> <i>Comment Status</i> A ype 4 PSE: A PSE that suppo e IEEE s not accurate. Type 4 is a PS backwards compatibility. ad Type 4 PSE: A PSE that s rr. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 1: PSE: A PSE that supports Cla S, and 4-pair power. (See IEE <i>Response Status</i> C LE.	in strikethrough font and "Power over Data Line Response Status W d P25 L33 Comment Status A ype 4 PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 power e IEEE s not accurate. Type 4 is a PSE that supports C backwards compatibility. ad Type 4 PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 p yr. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 145)." PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 power levels S, and 4-pair power. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 1 Response Status C LE.	Ind P25 L33 # r02-123 Comment Status A Definitions ype 4 PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 power levels, short MPS, e IEEE s not accurate. Type 4 is a PSE that supports Class 8 power levels ackwards compatibility. ad Type 4 PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 power levels, short er. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 145)." PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 power levels, short er. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 145)." PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 power levels in addition to lower s, and 4-pair power. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 145)." Response Status C LE.	have a simple "C SuggestedRemedy Remove "Delete Basic Package (i "aPSEShortCour leaving just "Chas show the "PD Bas show the "PD Bas show the "PD Bas show the aPSES remove the under in the pdf. Response ACCEPT. C/ 30 SC 30. Anslow, Peter Comment Type 4 presences to locations in 33 SuggestedRemedy Remove "Delete Basic Package (i "aPSEShortCour leaving just "Chas show the aPSES remove the under in the pdf. Response ACCEPT. C/ 30 SC 30. Anslow, Peter Comment Type E Cross-references to locations in 33 SuggestedRemedy Apply character to Response	have a simple "Change Table 30-4 as for <i>Response Status</i> W <i>Response Status</i> W <i>Remove</i> "Delete the "oPD managed obje Basic Package (mandatory)" column from "aPSEShortCounter" in Table 30-4." <i>Lass mole</i> "Change Table 30-4 as follow show the "DD Basic Package (mandatory)" column from "aPSEShortCounter" in Table 30-4." <i>Leaving just</i> "Change Table 30-4 as follow show the "DD Basic Package (mandatory)" column from "aPSEShortCounter" in Table 30-4." <i>Leaving just</i> "Change Table 30-4 as follow show the "DD Basic Package (mandatory)" <i>Comment Status</i> A <i>Definitions</i> prove 4 PSE: A PSE that supports Class 8 power levels, short rr. (See IEEE 802.3, Clause 145)." <i>Response Status</i> C <i>Le.</i> <i>Response Status</i> C <i>Le.</i> <i>Response Status</i> C <i>Response Status</i> C	have a simple "Change Table 30-4 as follows:" editions have a simple "Change Table 30-4 as follows:" edition to the seven cross-references in 30.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 20.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 20.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 20.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 20.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 20.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 20.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 20.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 30.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 30.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30 to to coations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but shou suggested Remedy apply character tag External to these seven cross-references in 30.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5 to the seven cross-references in 30.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5 to the seven cross-references in 30.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5 to the seven cross-reference	have a simple "Change Table 30-4 as follows:" editing instruction SuggestedRemedy Remove "Delete the "oPD managed object class" and "aPDID" rows Basic Package (mandatory)" column from Table 30-4. Delete the ro "aPSEShortCounter" in Table 30-4. Delete the ro "aPSEShortCounter" in Table 30-4. " leaving just "Change Table 30-4 as follows:" show the "PD managed object class" and "aPDID" rows Basic Package (mandatory)" heading in strikethrough show the "PD Basic Package (mandatory)" heading in strikethrough show the "PD Basic Package (mandatory)" heading in strikethrough show the aPSEShortCounter row in strikethrough font remove the underline attribute from empty cells in inserted rows as t in the pdf. Response Status C ACCEPT. C/ 30 SC 30.9.1.1.2 P38 L25 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation Comment Type E Comment Status A Cross-references in 30.9.1.1.2 through 30.9.1.1.5, 30.9.1.1.8, 30.9.1 to locations in 33.5 are shown in black text, but should have charact SuggestedRemedy Apply character tag External to these seven cross-references. Response Status C	have a simple "Change Table 30-4 as follows:" editing instruction SuggestedRemedy Remove "Delete the "oPD managed object class" and "aPDID" rows as well as Basic Package (mandatory)" column from Table 30-4. Delete the row for "aPSEShortCounter" in Table 30-4. as follows:" show the "PD Basic Package (mandatory)" heading in strikethrough font. show the aPSEShortCounter row in strikethrough font show the aPSEShortCounter row in strikethrough font

<i>CI</i> 30 Darshan,	SC 30.12.2.1. Yair	18h	P 49	L 54	# r02-127	<i>Cl</i> 30 Darshan, `		30.12.3.1.1	18h	P 60	L 49	# r02-128
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Sta	tus R		Management	Comment	Туре	т	Comment Sta	atus R		Manageme
	3 and 4 PSE when 0 is ignored in the				ell. Currently,						need to support i class 0 and class	t as well. Currently,
Suggeste	dRemedy					Suggested	dRemed	'y				
	ge 50 line 2 chang lass3 Class 0, or		lass 3"					e 52 chang ass 0, or C	ge from: "class3 Class 3"	Class 3"		
Response	9	Response Stat	us C			Response	1		Response Sta	tus C		
REJE	CT.					REJE	CT.					
	is no requested (ield is the Extende				t assign Class 0.				lass 0 for Type d field only used			do not assign Class 0.
C/ 30	SC 30.12.2.1.	18p	P 52	L 2	# r02-105	C/ 33	SC 3	33.4.9.1b		P 76	L18	# r02-7
Darshan,	Yair					Anslow, P	eter		С	iena Corpo	oration	
Suggeste	text "A SET attrib				Editorial	amen under	0.1b, 33.4 dment. line font.	Conseque		are new su		Editori nserted by the P802.3bt e strikethrough and
Response		Response Stat	us C				e the stri	kethrough	subclause num			the base document) and
	e the spurious f					Response ACCE			Response Sta	tus W		
Cl 30 Anslow, P		Ci	P 52 ena Corporatio	L 2 n	# <u>r02-6</u>	<i>Cl</i> 33 Mcclellan,		33.4.9.1b	M	P 76 larvell Sem	L24 hiconductor	# r02-142
Comment typo "	fthat"	Comment Sta	tus A		Editorial	Comment LATE		E ENT is lir	Comment Sta mited is unnece		makes the sente	Editorince confusing.
Suggeste						Suggested						5
delete	the spurious f	_	_			00			s done in 145.4.	9.4		
Response	۵	Response Stat	us C			Response			Response Sta			

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	Pa 76	Page 3 of 38
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 24	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line		

Comment Type Editorial Comment Type Editorial The editing instruction says "Change 33.6.3 as follows:" but then not all of 33.6.3.3 is observed. The definitions is toom in the dath. The definitions is toom in the idea in support to a large number of unmodified definitions: move the editing instruction to a flart the heading instruction. Change the first nine definitions in 33.6.3.3 as follows:" Assuming that is not defined to show a large number of unmodified definitions: move the editing instruction to "Change the first nine definitions in 33.6.3.3 as follows:" Figure 73-3 says that the TLV information string length=29. Response Response Status W ACCEPT: P66 15 figure 23-5 OOS The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 73-5 and be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PO out yeah is its and the P1." Maintenance W Org The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 73-5 and be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed." Maintenance MCEPT. Comment Type T Comment Status A Camment Status A Editorial Inagine a PD connected through a Midspan (supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power. but her P1." Science Train Type I To Camment Status A Editorial Maintenance Midde and Strate PD conexet dastament, suggested fremedy would creates an are	CI 33 Anslow, Pet	SC 33.6.3.3 er	P 78 Ciena Corpora	L 2 ation	#	r02-8	<i>CI</i> 79 Yseboodt	SC 79.3.2 , Lennart	P s Philip	8 <mark>6</mark> os Lightin	L 22	#	r02-143
shown in the draft. The definitions from TempVar through to pse_power_type are missing. Suggested/Remedy Assuming that it is not desired to show a large number of unmodified definitions: change the defining instruction of Change the finit nine definitions in 33.6.3.3 as follows: Before the final paragraph of 33.6.3.3. add an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3.as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 30.6.3.as as did an edding instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 9.0.5." Yee DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79.3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD or only when it is supplying power to a PSE (not supplying power, because mission in the way). If that PSE sends out PDE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPower/value would be wrong. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. Kange beneficit in support. Suggested/Remedy Change substruction would be were quiterment on legacy devices, an RR has been lined in support. Suggested/Remedy Change substruction the des it is drawing power from the PI." Regornse Response Status C ACCEPT. AccEPT.	Comment T	ype ER				Editorial			Comment Status	A	-		LLDP
The saming that it is not desired to show a large number of unmodified definitions: more the editing instruction to be after the heading for 33.6.3.3 and the definitions in 33.6.3.3 as follows: Before the final paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction is "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction is "Change the last in the definition is and 3.6.3.3 as follows:" Response Response Status W ACCEPT: T Comment Status A T Comment Status A T Comment Status A Maintenance OOS The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure F33 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PIE (not supplying power for a PSE (not supplying pow								COMMENT					
Assuming that it is not desired to show a large number of unmodified definitions: move the editing instruction to be after the heading for 33.6.3.3 define the initial unmodified sentence change the editing instruction to 'Change the first nine definitions: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last section of the figure the last section edition of the figure the last section of the figure the last section edition of the figure the last section of the figure the last section edition the last section edition of the figure the last section edits in popend the last section edition	SuggestedF	Remedy					Figu	re 79-3 save that	the TLV information	string lor	nath-29		
change the editing instruction to 'Change the first nine definitions in 33.6.3.3 as follows: SuggestedRemedy Response Response Status W ACCEPT. Informatic String Lighting Comment Type T Comment Status A Maintenance Cos The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 73-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only statis it sdrawing power from the PI." Corment 101-103 made the change from gover class' to 'Power class'	move th	e editing instr	ruction to be after the heading		ied definitio	ons:	This i	s only true when t				ance is NI	EVER true for
Before the final paragraph of 33.6.3.3, add an editing instruction: "Change the last paragraph of 33.6.3.3 as follows:" Response Response Status W ACCEPT. Cl 79 SC 79.3.2 P86 L15 # 02:25 Cl 79 SC 79.3.2 P86 L15 # 02:25 Cl 79 Comment Status A Maintenace OOS The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79.3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PSE (not supplying power, because midspan in the way). If that PSE sends out PGE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. KaggestedRenedy Changes the aventsion fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79.3 shall not be sent by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PSE (not supplying power, because midspan in the way). If that PSE sends out PGE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. KaggestedRenedy Changes there to the say: The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79.3 shall not be sent. SuggestedRenedy Changes the word 'can' is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Because this span to be sent by the PSE only when it is explying power to a PSE (not supplying power class 'to Power class' to Power class' on line 34. Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Response Response Status C ACCEPT.				ne definitions	in 33.6.3.3	as follows:"	Suggeste	dRemedy					
Response Response Status W ACCEPT. C179 SC 73.3.2 P66 L15 # 02.25 (seboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Consent Type T Comment Status A Maintenance OOS The DLL classification extension, and Type 3 and Type 4 extension. 29 octets basic fields and DLL classification extension: 12 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 30 Type 4 extension. 29 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 40 Type 4 extension. 29 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 40 Type 4 extension. 29 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 40 Type 4 extension. 29 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 40 Type 4 extension. 29 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 40 Type 4 extension. 19 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 40 Type 4 extension. 19 octets - basic fields and DLL classification extension. 40 Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 74.3 shall not be served. - Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. However, the word can' is used, when it needs to be a 'shall'. Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to ray: - Match DL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 74.3 shall not be sent by the PSE only heps 51 ming prover to a P1 encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the P1.* Response Response Status C ACCEPT.	Before t	the final parag	raph of 33.6.3.3, add an editin					•			er to "TLV inforr	mation stri	ng length"
ACCEPT. C1 79 SC 79.3.2 P86 L15 # 102.25 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type T Comment Status A Maintenance OOS "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only when it is drawing power from the PI." Imagine a PD connected through a Midspan (supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying the vertices of the statement, saying this is not allowed. However, the word "Can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Because midspan in the way. If that PSE words were requirement on legacy devices, an RR has been flief in anticon extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sentily the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is strawing power from the PI." Response Memory Canso Status C ACCEPT. Comment 70-103 Status PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is strawing power from the PI." Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT.							"The	e TLV information	string length is:	- g			
 - basic fields, DLL classification extension, and Type 3 and Type 4 extension: 29 octets response Status C - basic fields, DLL classification extension, and Type 4 extension: 29 octets response Status C - basic fields, DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only when it is drawing power from the PI.* - If that PSE sends out POE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. - Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. - However, the word "can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Because this suggested femedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in aspont. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT. 		т.								sion: 12	octets		
Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type T Comment Type T Comment Type T Comment Status A Maintenance OOS The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PSE (not supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power (not supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power (not supplying power) to a PSE (not		00 =0 0 0	Dee									4 extensio	n: 29 octets"
Comment Type T Comment Status A Maintenance OOS "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only when it is drawing power to a PSE (not supplying power, because midspan in the way). It That PSE sends out POE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. ACCEPT. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT.	-			-	#	r02-25	Response	9	Response Status	С			
OOS "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only when it is drawing power from the PI." Cl 79 SC 79.3.2.3 P88 L34 # 102-11 Imagine a PD connected through a Midspan (supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power, because midspan in the way). E Comment 701-00 made the change from "power class" to "Power class" to "Power class" to "Power class" to apitalize the field name. but we missed one in the last sentence of this section. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. SuggestedRemedy Hence the quoted statement, saying this and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." SuggestedRemedy whole creates a new requirement on legacy devices, an RR has been filed in support. Classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT.				9		1 1 - in 1 - in - i	ACCE	EPT.					
 The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only when it is drawing power from the PI." Imagine a PD connected through a Midspan (supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power. because midspan in the way). If that PSE sends out PO TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. However, the word "can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT. 	-	ype I	Comment Status A			Maintenance	C/ 79	SC 79.3.2.3	P	88	/ 34	#	r02-11
"The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 can be used by the PSE only when it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only when it is drawing power from the PL." Imagine a PD connected through a Midspan (supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power, because midspan in the way). If that PSE sends out PoE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. However, the word "can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT.	005												
 Figure 7-9 can be used by the PD only when it is stapplying power to a PT encompassed within an MDI and by the PD only when it is stapplying power to a PSE (not supplying power, because midspan in the way). If that PSE sends out PG TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. However, the word "can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PL." Response Response Status C ACCEPT. 							Comment	Type F		-			Editorial
Imagine a PD connected through a Midspan (supplying power) to a PSE (not supplying power, because midspan in the way). SuggestedRemedy If that PSE sends out PoE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. Response Response Status C Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. ACCEPT. ACCEPT. C ACCEPT.						encompassed	comn	nent r01-103 mad	le the change from 'p	ower clas		ass' to cap	
power, because midspan in the way). If that PSE sends out PoE TLVs, whatever value it puts in the PSEAllocatedPowerValue would be wrong. change 'power class' to 'Power class' on line 34. Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. AccePT. However, the word "can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Response Status C Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. Response Status C SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power from the PI." Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT. AccePT.				ring power) to	a PSE (not	supplying							
would be wrong. Response Response Response Status C Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. ACCEPT. ACCEPT. ACCEPT. C However, the word "can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. ACCEPT. ACCEPT. C SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT. ACCEPT.				outs in the PSE	Allocated	PowerValue	00	,	o 'Power class' on lin	e 34.			
Hence the quoted statement, saying this is not allowed. ACCEPT. However, the word "can" is used, when it needs to be a "shall". ACCEPT. Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. ACCEPT. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT.	would b	e wrong.					Response	9	Response Status	С			
Because this suggested remedy would create a new requirement on legacy devices, an MR has been filed in support. SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT.	Hence t	he quoted sta	tement, saying this is not allow	/ed.			ACCE	EPT.		-			
SuggestedRemedy Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT.	Becaus	e this suggest	ed remedy would create a new		on legacy o	levices, an MR							
Change sentence to say: "The DLL classification extension fields and Type 3 and Type 4 extension fields shown in Figure 79-3 shall not be sent by the PSE unless it is supplying power to a PI encompassed within an MDI and by the PD unless it is drawing power from the PI." Response Response Status C ACCEPT.													
ACCEPT.	Change "The DL Figure 7	sentence to s L classification 79-3 shall not	on extension fields and Type 3 be sent by the PSE unless it is	supplying pov	ver to a PI								
	Response	·	Response Status C										
	ACCEP	т.											
FYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general Pa 88 Page 4 of 38					I. T /()					D		-	

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **88** Li **34**

CI 79 SC 79.3.2.6C.3 P92 L50	# r02-126	CI 79	SC 79.3.2.60		P 94	L 9	# r02-145
Darshan, Yair		Yseboodt, I			hilips Lighting		
Comment Type T Comment Status R	LLDP	Comment T	••	Comment Sta			LLDF
In Table 79-6e, last item Power Class Ext class 0 need to be supported and 4.	as well by Type 3		COMMENTIn ing Type 1 / Typ		ver Type ext",	the bit value 1	100 is missing (due to
Two options for solution: a) bits 0000; It should be class 0 and not Reserved/Ignored OR b) change "0011= class 3" to "0011=class 0, 3"		Suggested Change	-	such that it coun	ts up properly		
SuggestedRemedy		Response		Response Sta	tus C		
Option 1: Change bits 0000 from Reserved/Ignored to class 0		ACCEF	PT.	,	-		
Option 2 (preferred):		C/ 79	SC 79.3.2.6e	e	P 94	L 42	# r02-146
Change "0011= class 3" to "0011=class 0, 3"		Yseboodt, I	Lennart	Р	hilips Lighting		
Response Response Status C		Comment 7	Type E	Comment Sta	atus A		LLDF
REJECT. There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do no	ot assign Class 0.	maxim	um available po	ne field "PSE max ower value" in line	with PSE allo	cated power v	/alue,
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do no This field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4.C/ 79SC 79.3.2.6dP93L51Yseboodt, Lennart	# r02-26	maxim becau <i>Suggestedi</i> Chang update	um available po use the power va IRemedy	ower value" in line alue is expressed im available powe ie text.	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma	watt, not in V	/alue,
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do noThis field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4.Cl 79SC 79.3.2.6dP93L51	_	maxim becau Suggested Chango	um available po use the power va <i>IRemedy</i> le "PSE maximu e the usage in the	ower value" in line alue is expressed im available powe	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma	watt, not in V	value, Natt directly.
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do no This field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4. Cl 79 SC 79.3.2.6d P93 L51 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type TR Comment Status A OOS "The 'System setup' field shall contain the device bit-map of the Power T Load defined in Table 79-6f and is reported for the device generating the	# <u>r02-26</u> <i>LLDP</i> Type ext and PD	maximu becau Suggestedu Changu update Response	um available po use the power va <i>IRemedy</i> le "PSE maximu e the usage in the PT. SC 79.3.2.6f	ower value" in line alue is expressed im available powe ie text. <i>Response Sta</i>	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma	L24	value, Natt directly.
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do no This field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4. C/ 79 SC 79.3.2.6d P93 L51 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type TR Comment Status A OOS "The 'System setup' field shall contain the device bit-map of the Power T	# <u>r02-26</u> <i>LLDP</i> Type ext and PD	maximu becau Suggestedi Changu update Response ACCEF CI 79	um available po use the power va <i>IRemedy</i> le "PSE maximu e the usage in the PT. SC 79.3.2.6f ad	ower value" in line alue is expressed im available powe ie text. <i>Response Sta</i>	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma ntus C P 95 iisco Systems	L24	value, Vatt directly. ble power value" and
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do no This field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4. Cl 79 SC 79.3.2.6d P93 L51 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type TR Comment Status A OOS "The 'System setup' field shall contain the device bit-map of the Power T Load defined in Table 79-6f and is reported for the device generating the	# <u>r02-26</u> <i>LLDP</i> Type ext and PD	maximi becau Suggested Changu update Response ACCEF CI 79 Jones, Cha Comment T "Autocl	um available po use the power va <i>Remedy</i> le "PSE maximu e the usage in the PT. SC 79.3.2.6f ad <i>Type</i> E class request" fie	ower value" in line alue is expressed im available powe ie text. <i>Response Sta</i> f.2 <i>Comment Sta</i> eld	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma ntus C P 95 iisco Systems	L24	<i>r</i> alue, Vatt directly. ble power value" and # <u>r02-20</u>
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do not This field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4. Cl 79 SC 79.3.2.6d P93 L51 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type TR Comment Status A OOS "The 'System setup' field shall contain the device bit-map of the Power T Load defined in Table 79-6f and is reported for the device generating the the 'System setup' field transmitted by a PSE is undefined." That last sentence is utter nonsense. SuggestedRemedy	# <u>r02-26</u> <i>LLDP</i> Type ext and PD e TLV. The value of	maximu becau Suggested, Changu update Response ACCEF CI 79 Jones, Cha Comment T "Autocl conver	um available po use the power va <i>Remedy</i> le "PSE maximu e the usage in the PT. <i>SC</i> 79.3.2.6f ad <i>Type</i> E class request" fie ntion is single qu	ower value" in line alue is expressed im available powe ie text. <i>Response Sta</i> f.2 <i>Comment Sta</i> eld	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma ntus C P 95 iisco Systems	L24	<i>r</i> alue, Vatt directly. ble power value" and # <u>r02-20</u>
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do not This field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4. C/ 79 SC 79.3.2.6d P93 L51 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type TR Comment Status A OOS "The 'System setup' field shall contain the device bit-map of the Power T Load defined in Table 79-6f and is reported for the device generating the the 'System setup' field transmitted by a PSE is undefined." That last sentence is utter nonsense.	# <u>r02-26</u> <i>LLDP</i> Type ext and PD e TLV. The value of	maximu becau Suggested, Changu update Response ACCEF CI 79 Jones, Cha Comment T "Autocl conver Suggested.	um available po use the power va <i>Remedy</i> le "PSE maximu e the usage in the PT. SC 79.3.2.6f ad <i>Type</i> E class request" fie nation is single qu <i>Remedy</i>	ower value" in line alue is expressed um available powe le text. <i>Response Sta</i> f.2 <i>Comment Sta</i> eld Jotes.	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma ntus C P 95 iisco Systems	L24	<i>r</i> alue, Vatt directly. ble power value" and # <u>r02-20</u>
There is no requested Class 0 for Type 3 PDs and Type 3/4 PSEs do not This field is the Extended field only used by Type 3 and 4. Cl 79 SC 79.3.2.6d P93 L51 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type TR Comment Status A OOS "The 'System setup' field shall contain the device bit-map of the Power T Load defined in Table 79-6f and is reported for the device generating the the 'System setup' field transmitted by a PSE is undefined." That last sentence is utter nonsense. SuggestedRemedy	# <u>r02-26</u> <i>LLDP</i> Type ext and PD e TLV. The value of	maximu becau Suggested, Changu update Response ACCEF CI 79 Jones, Cha Comment T "Autocl conver Suggested.	um available po use the power va <i>Remedy</i> le "PSE maximu e the usage in the PT. <i>SC</i> 79.3.2.6f ad <i>Type</i> E class request" fie ntion is single qu	ower value" in line alue is expressed um available powe le text. <i>Response Sta</i> f.2 <i>Comment Sta</i> eld Jotes.	with PSE allo in 1/10th of a er" to "PSE ma atus C P 95 Sisco Systems atus A	L24	<i>r</i> alue, Vatt directly. ble power value" and # <u>r02-20</u>

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	Pa 95	Page 5 of 38
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 24	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line		

	79.3.2.6g	P 95	L 34	# r02-27		SC 79.3.8.1	P 96	L 20	# r02-28
Yseboodt, Lennar	rt	Philips Lighting	9		Yseboodt, Le	nnart	Philips L	ighting	
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status A		LLDP	Comment Typ	be TR	Comment Status A		LLDF
•		' field, but did not update th	e text.		current fie carries th	eld carries the e measured p	e field carries the measu e measured current value power value at the PI, ar consumption value at the	e at the PI, the meand the mean	sured power value field ergy value field carries
SuggestedRemed	•	6 H				0,	•	,	
	down' field s	as follows: shall contain the bits defined power delivery to be termina				to field name:	0	rm oti vo	
or for a certai				chinicity,			ing, making the table no	imalive.	
		2 2 4			SuggestedRe	-			
down. If powe	ower type is er is to be m	.2.69.1: PD, this field may be set to paintained, the field shall be PSE, this field shall be set to	set to 0.	te a request for power	Insert at t	hes corrected) he beginning I shall be set		b."	
And 79.3.2.6c "This field cor		nount of time in seconds the			"The 'Vol	existing text b tage measure	ment' field carries the m		lue at the PI, the 'Current
When the Pov	wer type is	PD, this field shall be set pe PSE, this field shall be set to		n in Table 79-6i.	field carri	es the measu	red power value at the F	PI, and the 'Energy	
When the Pov	wer type is			n in Table 79-6i.	field carri carries th	es the measu	red power value at the F energy consumption value	PI, and the 'Energy le at the PI, as defi	measurement' field
When the Pow When the Pow	wer type is	PSE, this field shall be set to		n in Table 79-6i.	field carri carries th <i>Response</i>	es the measu e measured e	red power value at the F	PI, and the 'Energy le at the PI, as defi	measurement' field
When the Po When the Po <i>Response</i> ACCEPT.	wer type is	PSE, this field shall be set to		n in Table 79-6i. # <u>r02-144</u>	field carri carries th <i>Response</i> ACCEPT	es the measu e measured e	red power value at the F energy consumption valu <i>Response Status</i> C	PI, and the 'Energy le at the PI, as defi	measurement' field ned in Table 79-7b."
When the Po When the Po <i>Response</i> ACCEPT.	wer type is wer type is 79.3.8	PSE, this field shall be set to Response Status C	L11		field carri carries th <i>Response</i> ACCEPT <i>Cl</i> 79	es the measu e measured e	red power value at the F energy consumption valu Response Status C P98	PI, and the 'Energy le at the PI, as defi <i>L</i> 34	measurement' field
When the Por When the Por Response ACCEPT. Cl 79 SC	wer type is wer type is 79.3.8	PSE, this field shall be set to <i>Response Status</i> C P96	L11		field carri carries th <i>Response</i> ACCEPT <i>Cl</i> 79 Jones, Chad	es the measu e measured e SC 79.3.8.2	red power value at the F energy consumption valu Response Status C P98 Cisco S	PI, and the 'Energy le at the PI, as defi	measurement' field ned in Table 79-7b." # <u>r02-21</u>
When the Por When the Por Response ACCEPT. CI 79 SC Yseboodt, Lennar Comment Type	wer type is wer type is 79.3.8 rt T IENT The	PSE, this field shall be set to Response Status C P96 Philips Lighting Comment Status A TLV information string lengt	L11	# <u>r02-144</u> LLDP	field carri carries th <i>Response</i> ACCEPT <i>CI</i> 79 Jones, Chad <i>Comment Typ</i>	es the measu e measured e SC 79.3.8.2 De E	red power value at the F energy consumption valu Response Status C P98	PI, and the 'Energy le at the PI, as defi <i>L</i> 34 vstems, Inc.	measurement' field ned in Table 79-7b." # <u>r02-21</u> <i>Editoria</i>
When the Pow When the Pow Response ACCEPT. CI 79 SC Yseboodt, Lennar Comment Type LATE COMM	wer type is wer type is 79.3.8 rt T IENT The hould be 26. dy	PSE, this field shall be set to Response Status C P96 Philips Lighting Comment Status A TLV information string lengt	L11	# <u>r02-144</u> LLDP	field carri carries th Response ACCEPT CI 79 Jones, Chad Comment Typ missing s SuggestedRe	es the measu e measured e SC 79.3.8.2 De E ingle quote a <i>medy</i>	red power value at the F energy consumption valu Response Status C P98 Cisco S Comment Status A	PI, and the 'Energy le at the PI, as defi <i>L</i> 34 vstems, Inc.	measurement' field ned in Table 79-7b." # <u>r02-21</u> <i>Editoria</i>

Pa **98** Li **34**

C/ 126	SC 126.5.1	P108	L15	# r(02-93
Maytum, Mi	ichael	RETIRED			
Comment T	vpe G	Comment Status R			Isolation

The document confuses isolation with insulation. Isolation is a function defined by the IEC as "function intended to make dead for reasons of safety all or a discrete section of the electrical installation by separating the electrical installation or section from every source of electric energy" What the cited tests do is verify the insulation, which can be a solid, a liquid or a gas (e.g. air), or any combination, voltage withstand. For impulses the IEC defines "impulse withstand voltage as the highest peak value of impulse voltage of prescribed form and polarity which does not cause breakdown of insulation under specified conditions. Thus the sentance "This electrical isolation shall withstand at least one of the following electrical strength tests:" Should be "The electrical isolation insulation shall withstand at least one of the following electrical strength tests:" This sentence also occurs in 145.4.1.

SuggestedRemedy

The electrical isolation insulation shall withstand at least one of the following electrical strength tests:

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

(1) Since a PI and BASE-T MDI are the same in the vast majority of cases it wouldn't make sense to just change the PI isolation requirements without changing the BASE-T isolation requirements at the same time, in fact not doing this at the same time could result in conflicting requirements.

(2) There is already an Isolation Ad Hoc working on this issue that is chartered to consider the isolation subclauses throughout IEEE 802.3. It is therefore better to let this conclude its work and address this issues holistically, including Clause 145.

(3) Any change to this text needs to ensure that existing implementation remain conformant.(4) This comment is out of scope as it is on unchanged text.

C/ 126	SC 126.5.1	P 108	L18	# r02-94
Maytum, N	lichael	RETIRED		

Comment Type GR Comment Status R

TC 109 publishes the horizontal standard IEC 60664 series "Insulation coordination for equipment within low-voltage systems" the preferred impulse is 1.2/50 and as a starting point for testing the peak of the AC voltage, the DC voltage and impulse peak voltage should all be the same. So 1500 V a.c. is 2121 V, close enough to the quoted 2250 V d.c and not too different to the quoted 2400 V impulse peak. In practice the AC and DC voltages are somewhat lower than the impulse peak voltage as longer term effects can come into play. In operation the insulation will be subject to impulses of voltage rather an AC or DC voltages.

SuggestedRemedy

Ensure that the equivalent inpulse peak volrtage for insulation withstand testing is at least equal to the peak of the AC voltage or the DC voltage

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

(1) Since a PI and BASE-T MDI are the same in the vast majority of cases it wouldn't make sense to just change the PI isolation requirements without changing the BASE-T isolation requirements at the same time, in fact not doing this at the same time could result in conflicting requirements.

(2) There is already an Isolation Ad Hoc working on this issue that is chartered to consider the isolation subclauses throughout IEEE 802.3. It is therefore better to let this conclude its work and address this issues holistically, including Clause 145.

(3) Any change to this text needs to ensure that existing implementation remain conformant.(4) This comment is out of scope as it is on unchanged text.

Pa **108** Li **18** Isolation

Cl 126 SC 126.5.1 P108 L21 # r02-96 Maytum, Michael RETIRED	C/ 145 SC 145.1 P109 L21 # r02-12 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc. Cisco Systems, Inc.
Comment Type G Comment Status R Isolation	Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
"The shape of the impulses is 1.2/50 micros (1.2 micros virtual front time, 50 micros virtual time or half value), as defined in Annex N of IEC 60950-1:2001." IEC 60950-1 will be killed off by TC 108. It is better to refer the the horizontal standard that defines the 1.2/50 impulse. That standard is IEC 60060-1:2010 High-voltage test techniques - Part 1: General definitions and test requirements from TC 42.	missing space between sentences. "or simply Midspans.The PD is an element " SuggestedRemedy add the space change to: "or simply Midspans. The PD is an element"
SuggestedRemedy	Response Response Status C
Replace " Annex N of IEC 60950-1:2001." with " IEC 60060-1"	ACCEPT.
Response Response Status C	
REJECT.	C/ 145 SC 145.1.4 P113 L3 # r02-13 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc. Cisco Systems, Inc.
 (1) Since a PI and BASE-T MDI are the same in the vast majority of cases it wouldn't make sense to just change the PI isolation requirements without changing the BASE-T isolation requirements at the same time, in fact not doing this at the same time could result in conflicting requirements. (2) There is already an Isolation Ad Hoc working on this issue that is chartered to consider the isolation subclauses throughout IEEE 802.3. It is therefore better to let this conclude its work and address this issues holistically, including Clause 145. (3) Any change to this text needs to ensure that existing implementation remain conformant. (4) This comment is out of scope as it is on unchanged text. 	Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial we reordered the elements of this sentence and now the commas are out of place. Current text: Class D, or better, cabling as specified in ISO/IEC 11801:1995 with the additional requirement that the channel DC loop resistance is 25 [Ohm] or less is required to support operation as specified in this Clause. SuggestedRemedy Change to: Class D or better cabling as specified in ISO/IEC 11801:1995, with the additional requirement that the channel DC loop resistance is 25 [Ohm] or less, is required
C/ 145 SC 145.1 P109 L21 # r02-71	to support operation as specified in this Clause.
Stover, David Analog Devices Inc.	Response Response Status C
Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial	ACCEPT.
Missing a space between sentences	C/ 145 SC 145.2.2 P114 L49 # r02-72
SuggestedRemedy	Stover, David Analog Devices Inc.
Change: "or simply Midspans.The PD is an element" To:	Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial Period placed inside quotation marks (2 locations) E
"or simply Midspans. The PD is an element"	SuggestedRemedy
Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Line 49 Change "Endpoint PSE." To "Endpoint PSE".
add the space change to: "or simply Midspans. The PD is an element"	Line 51 Change "Midspan PSE." To "Midspan PSE".
	Response Response Status C ACCEPT.
TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/g COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/wr SORT ORDER: Page, Line	0

2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

C/ 145 SC 145.2.2 Stover, David	P 115 Analog Devid	L1 ces Inc.	# r02-73	C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.1 P123 L25 # r02-106 Darshan, Yair
Comment Type E	Comment Status A		Edit	
"PSEs can be compa 2.5GBASE-T, 5GBASE-T, 10GBAS 1000BASE-T is miss SuggestedRemedy Change "1000BASET" To "1000BASE-T"		10BASE-T, 10	0BASE-TX, 1000BASE	 A 4-pair Midspan is required to block DC path. So, if it switches to 2-pairs, it still can't ged detection voltage from a switch since the DC path is blocked. As a result, no need to Enable backoff. Per the state machine in page 143 in the exit from the DETECT_EVAL is BACKOFF state, if a 4-pair midspan is set to pse_alternative = b and sig_pri = invalid, PSE will have to do backoff which in this case is not required and incorrect. Possible solution: a) to add text on page 123 after line 24 that says "supporting backoff is not required for a pair Midspan." b) make changes in the state machine by changing the exit from DETECT_EVAL to BACKOFF from: (pse_alternative = b) * (sig_pri = invalid) to: midspan*(pse_alternative = b) * (sig_pri = invalid) and to add a constant "midspan".
Response	Response Status C			SuggestedRemedy
ACCEPT.				 Add the following text on page 123 after line 24: "supporting backoff is not required fo 4-pair Midspan operating over 2-pairs or 4-pairs." change the exit from DETECT_EVAL to BACKOFF from: (pse_alternative = b) * (sig_ = invalid) To: (midspan=1)*(pse_alternative = b) * (sig_pri = invalid) Add the following constant to 145.2.5.3 midspan A constant indicating the if PSE is a 4-pair Midspan. Values: The PSE is a 4-pair Midspan. The PSE is not a 4-pair Midspan.
				Response Response Status C
				REJECT.
				Here is the beginning of the paragraph you commented on: "A PSE performing detection using only Alternative B may fail to detect a valid PD detection signature. When this occurs, the PSE shall back off for at least Tdbo as define in Table 145-16 before attempting another detection, except in the case of an open circu as defined in 145.2.6.6."
				Clearly this requirement only applies to 2-pair operation on Alternative B.
				Also, the logic you point out from DETECT_EVAL to BACKOFF: (pse_alternative = b) * (sig_pri = invalid) already makes it clear that this is 2-pair operation on alternative b (4-p operation would use pse_alternative = both).

Pa **123** Li **25**

Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.4 P127 L20 # r02-108 Darshan, Yair	Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.4 P128 L36 # r02-103 Johnson, Peter
Comment Type T Comment Status D PSE SD The text "This variable is set per this description." that we add to several variables looks that it doesn't add any value. See http://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/nov17/yseboodt_06_1117_final.pdf SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Delete the text in this variable and all others where it is used or explain why we need it. Proposed Response Response Status Z REJECT. This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.4 P127 L51 # r02-107 Darshan, Yair Comment Status A Pres: Yseboodt2	Comment Type T Comment Status PSE SE The state variable descriptions for 'option_class_probe_pri' and 'option_class_probe_sec' describe a process whereby the 3-event class probe is always followed by a Vreset for Trest, and then by a "normal classification procedure" (i.e. Class Event 1, LCE). The state diagrams on pages 149 and 153 show a second option whereby, if PSE power available is greater or equal to Class 4, the CLASS_PROBE_PRI (and SEC) return to IDLE_PRI (and SEC). So whatever is intended with this second branch out of CLASS_PROBE_PRI (SEC) is abiguous and in conflict with variable definition. SuggestedRemedy Either the state diagram needs to be altered to agree with the variable description or more clarification is required in the variable description to match the behavior in the state diagram. Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. C
The link to MirroredPDAutoclassRequest is Table 145-39 and not Table 145-38. SuggestedRemedy Change from Table 145-38 to Table 145-39	Strike ", followed by a normal classification procedure" from the description of option_class_probe_pri and option_class_probe_sec. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.4 P129 L26 # r02-89 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter
Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes in yseboodt_0118_02_dllmappings.pdf Also, on page 241, line 49 change Table 145-38 to Table 145-39. [Editor's note added after the close of comment resolution:	Comment Type T Comment Status A PSE SE The variable option_vport_lim is defined but doesn't seem to be used anywhere. SuggestedRemedy If the variable option_vport_lim isn't used delete its definition from subclause 145.2.5.4 as well as its reference in function do_initialize in subclause 145.2.5.6.
[Editor's note added after the close of comment resolution. the full file path is http://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/jan18/yseboodt_02_0118.pdf]	Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. 1) Delete option_vport_lim from variable list. 2) add "This variable is set per this description." to the end of option_vport_lim_pri (and _sec) 3) add "or the PSE does not implement this option." to the end of the FALSE description for both _pri and _sec variables. 4) remove all vport_lim entries from do_initialize

C/ 145 SC Darshan, Yair	C 145.2.5.4	P130	L 34	# r02-124	Cl 145 Johnson, l		145.2.5.4	P131	L 6	# r02-97
Comment Type	т	Comment Status D		PSE SD	Comment		Е	Comment Status A		PSE SD
In the varial addition, it o	ble pd_req_p doesn't add a	owr, the text "If pse_avail_pw any additional value by the state machine.	r is less than 4"		Variat specif	ole defii fic.	nitions for p	ower_available_pri and pow	er_available_se	
higher Clas Class 6, wh	m "The varia s than a PSI iichever is th	ble indicates the PD request E can support, the PSE assig e highest Class it can suppo	ins the PD to Cl	ass 3, Class 4, or	FALS TRUE	ge each E: PSE : PSE i	of these as is no long	er capable of sourcing powe continue to source power		
not contain To: "The va	the PD requiriable indica	ALSE, this variable may ested Class; do_class_probe tes the PD requested Class. t, the PSE assigns the PD to	When a PD req	uests a higher Class	Response ACCE			Response Status C		
		t Class it can support. do_cla			C/ 145		145.2.5.4	P 133	L14	# r02-102
Proposed Resp	onse	Response Status Z			Johnson,	Peter				
REJECT.					Comment	Туре	т	Comment Status R		PSE SD
		HDRAWN by the commente			"This	variable	e is set per	_reset', 'pse_reset_pri', and this description". However, tt any time the by the PSE.		
This comme	ent was with	drawn before the start of com	nment resolution	۱.	Suggestee	dReme	dv			
	C 145.2.5.4	P 130	L 49	# r02-101	00		•	his variable may be set by t	he PSE at any	time."
Johnson, Peter					Response)		Response Status C		
Comment Type	т	Comment Status R		PSE SD	REJE	CT.				
described a true in the s	is "This varia	ver_available', 'power_availab able may be set by the PSE a e as this variable only appea ng a PD.	at any time." Th	is does not seem to be	also T additio	RUE won, this	hen implen variable ca	s set according to the descr rentation-specific reasons re nnot be set FALSE at any ti	equire reset of I	SE functionality." In
SuggestedRem	edy				power	r supply	is not read	у.		
description.		each of these three variables expand the variable description hat effect.								
Response		Response Status C								
RE IECT										

REJECT.

The PSE can set this variable at any time, but it is only checked in the PowerON states. "this variable is set per this description" is only used for variables that must follow the definition explicitely (in other words they act like an equation).

Pa **133** Li **14**

C/ 145 SC 14 Darshan, Yair	45.2.5.4	P133	L 39	# r02-109	Cl 145 Law, David	SC 145.2.5.4	I	P134 Hewlett Pack	L 31 ard Enter	#	r02-88
Comment Type	T Com	nent Status A		PSE SD	Comment T	vpe E	Comment S	tatus A			PSE SD
In the following t "pse_ss_mode		uld be adressed as	well:			t that ' state di to initiate the		off the' sho	uld be changed t	o read '	state
	controls whether	the PSE provides p	ower over 2 pair	or 4 pair to a single-	SuggestedF	Remedy					
signature PD assigned to	Class 1 through	Class 4. This variat	ole may be set b	y the PSE at any time.	See cor	mment.					
	ture PD is power ture PD is power		-		Response ACCEP	ΥТ.	Response St	atus C			
				upport over 2-pairs and ve variable description.	C/ 145 Stover, Davi	SC 145.2.5.4		P 134 Analog Devic	L 44	#	r02-74
,		in Table 145-11 clas			,			0	es mc.		
				curences of "class 3 = ss 0 to Class X". These	Comment T	-	Comment S		d refer to "pd_cla	ss sia se	Editorial
	seperate comme				SuggestedF		.o pu_01000_01	g_pri , onouic		00_019_00	
SuggestedRemedy	,				Change	-					
"pse_ss_mode					Second						
may be set by th 0: Single-signati		Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair.		or 4 pair to a single- lass 3 PD.This variable	Second Alternat	ole used to store lary			ariable pd_class_	_sig_sec f	or the
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu	Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power ture PD is power	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair.			To: A variab Second Alternat <i>Response</i>	ble used to store lary tive.	e the previous v Response St		ariable pd_class_	_sig_sec f	or the
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signati	Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power ture PD is power <i>Respo</i>	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair."			To: A variat Second Alternat	ble used to store lary tive.			ariable pd_class_		
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu <i>Response</i> ACCEPT IN PR	o Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE.	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair."	D is treated as C		To: A variab Second Alternat <i>Response</i>	ble used to store lary tive. PT. SC 145.2.5.6			ariable pd_class_		or the r02-110
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu Response ACCEPT IN PR Replace Table 1	o Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE.	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." inse Status C	D is treated as C		To: A variab Second Alternat Response ACCEP C/ 145	ble used to store lary tive. PT. SC 145.2.5.6 air		P137			
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu <i>Response</i> ACCEPT IN PR Replace Table 1 Cl 145 SC 14	o Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE. 145-11 on page	Class 4. Class 0 PE me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." <i>Inse Status</i> C 138, line 11 with Tab	D is treated as C ble 145-13	lass 3 PD.This variable	To: A variati Second Alternati Response ACCEP C/ 145 Darshan, Ya Comment T	ole used to store lary tive. PT. SC 145.2.5.6 air <i>T</i>	Response St	atus C P137 tatus A		#	r02-110 Editorial
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu <i>Response</i> ACCEPT IN PR Replace Table 1 C/ 145 SC 14 Johnson, Peter	o Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE. 145-11 on page 45.2.5.4	Class 4. Class 0 PE me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." <i>Inse Status</i> C 138, line 11 with Tab	D is treated as C ble 145-13	lass 3 PD.This variable	To: A variati Second Alternati Response ACCEP C/ 145 Darshan, Ya Comment T	ble used to store lary tive. PT. SC 145.2.5.6 air Sype T iction do_autocla	Response St	atus C P137 tatus A	L 22	#	r02-110 Editorial
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu Response ACCEPT IN PR Replace Table 1 C/ 145 SC 14 Johnson, Peter Comment Type The state variab applicable short	Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE. 145-11 on page 45.2.5.4 E <i>Comr</i> bles short_det_p t circuit clause m	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." <i>Inse Status</i> C 138, line 11 with Tat P134 <i>P</i> 134 ment Status A ri and short_det_second	D is treated as C ble 145-13 <i>L</i> 20 c should make re ariables ovld_det	lass 3 PD. This variable # r02-99 PSE SD eference to the t_pri and ovld_det_sec.	To: A variab Second Alternat <i>Response</i> ACCEP Cl 145 Darshan, Ya Comment T The fun SuggestedF Change	ble used to store lary tive. PT. SC 145.2.5.6 air Sype T iction do_autocla	Response St Comment S assification retu	<i>P</i> 137 <i>tatus</i> A rns only one the following	L 22 variable and not	#	r02-110 Editorial
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu <i>Response</i> ACCEPT IN PR Replace Table 1 <i>Cl</i> 145 <i>SC</i> 14 Johnson, Peter <i>Comment Type</i> The state variab applicable short This better assu	 Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power ture PD is power Response RINCIPLE. 145-11 on page 45.2.5.4 E Commutation Commutat	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." onse Status C 138, line 11 with Tat P134 ment Status A ri and short_det_sec uch like the state va e machine behavior	D is treated as C ble 145-13 L20 c should make re ariables ovld_det of these error co	lass 3 PD. This variable # r02-99 PSE SD eference to the t_pri and ovld_det_sec. conditions (bundled into	To: A variab Second Alternat <i>Response</i> ACCEP Cl 145 Darshan, Ya Comment T The fun SuggestedF Change	ble used to store lary tive. T. SC 145.2.5.6 air <i>Type</i> T action do_autocla Remedy the text 'This fu	Response St Comment S assification retu	<i>P</i> 137 <i>tatus</i> A rns only one the following variable:"	L 22 variable and not	#	r02-110 Editorial
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu Response ACCEPT IN PR Replace Table 1 C/ 145 SC 14 Johnson, Peter Comment Type The state variab applicable short This better assu error_pri and err	Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE. 145-11 on page 45.2.5.4 E Comm bles short_det_p t circuit clause m ures that the stat rror_sec) are sub	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." <i>Inse Status</i> C 138, line 11 with Tat P134 <i>P</i> 134 <i>Inent Status</i> A ri and short_det_second	D is treated as C ble 145-13 L20 c should make re ariables ovld_det of these error co	lass 3 PD. This variable # r02-99 PSE SD eference to the t_pri and ovld_det_sec. conditions (bundled into	To: A variat Second Alternat Response ACCEP C/ 145 Darshan, Ya Comment T The fun SuggestedR Change To: "Thi Response	ble used to store lary tive. T. SC 145.2.5.6 air <i>Type</i> T action do_autocla Remedy the text 'This fu	Response St Comment S assification retu inction returns t as the following Response St	<i>P</i> 137 <i>tatus</i> A rns only one the following variable:"	L 22 variable and not	#	r02-110 Editorial
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu Response ACCEPT IN PR Cl 145 SC 14 Johnson, Peter Comment Type The state variab applicable short This better assu error_pri and err SuggestedRemedy	Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE. 145-11 on page 45.2.5.4 E <i>Comr</i> bles short_det_p t circuit clause m ures that the stat rror_sec) are sub	Class 4. Class 0 PI me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." onse Status C 138, line 11 with Tat P134 ment Status A ri and short_det_sec uch like the state va e machine behavior	D is treated as C ble 145-13 L20 c should make re ariables ovld_det of these error co e rules such as	lass 3 PD. This variable # r02-99 PSE SD eference to the t_pri and ovld_det_sec. conditions (bundled into	To: A variat Second Alternat Response ACCEP C/ 145 Darshan, Ya Comment T The fun SuggestedF Change To: "Thi Response ACCEP	ble used to store lary tive. PT. SC 145.2.5.6 air <i>type</i> T action do_autocla Remedy the text 'This fu is function return T IN PRINCIPL	Response St Comment S assification returns t inction returns t s the following Response St E.	eatus C P137 tatus A rns only one the following variable:" atus C	L22 variable and not variables:"	#	r02-110 Editorial
signature PD assigned to may be set by th 0: Single-signatu 1: Single-signatu Response ACCEPT IN PR Cl 145 SC 14 Johnson, Peter Comment Type The state variab applicable short This better assu error_pri and err SuggestedRemedy	Class 1 through the PSE at any ti ture PD is power <i>Respo</i> RINCIPLE. 145-11 on page 45.2.5.4 E <i>Comr</i> bles short_det_p t circuit clause m ures that the stat rror_sec) are sub	Class 4. Class 0 PE me. ed over 2 pair. ed over 4 pair." mse Status C 138, line 11 with Tat P134 ment Status A ri and short_det_sec ouch like the state va e machine behavior ject to the approprite	D is treated as C ble 145-13 L20 c should make re ariables ovld_det of these error co e rules such as	lass 3 PD. This variable # r02-99 PSE SD eference to the t_pri and ovld_det_sec. conditions (bundled into	To: A variat Second Alternat Response ACCEP Cl 145 Darshan, Ya Comment T The fun SuggestedR Change To: "Thi Response ACCEP Change To: "Thi	ole used to store lary tive. PT. SC 145.2.5.6 air <i>Type</i> T action do_autocla Remedy the text 'This fu is function return	Response St Comment S assification returns t inction returns t Response St E. unction returns t s the following	<i>P137</i> <i>P137</i> <i>tatus</i> A rns only one the following variable:" <i>tatus</i> C the following variable:"	L22 variable and not variables:"	#	r02-110 Editorial

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn Li 22 2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM SORT ORDER: Page, Line

The Functions 'do_classification_pri' and 'do_classification_sec' seem highly unconventional as they seem to operate at two levels of the Primary and Secondary PSE state machines. On a per class event level, they (presumably) produce class signatures. But additionally, they return the variables of req_pwr_pri (sec) and pd_allocated_pwr_pri (sec) and show here the Function 'do_classification_jsimply returns the class signature from a single event as shown in the state diagrams. SuggestedRemedy If this is truly seen to be an issue, then 'do_classification_pri' (and sec) should just return class signatures per class event and the variables pd_req_pwr_pri (sec) and pd_allocated_pwr_pri (sec) should be defined along with pd_req_pwr in 145.2.5.4. Response Response Status C REJECT. While you are correct that we are inconsistent, the SD is technically correct and consensus was not reached to change it. Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L18 # [02:29] SuggestedRemedy Variables option_class_probe_pri and option_class_probe_sec are missing from returned variable of the PSE does not implement this option." to the end of option_vport_lim_pri (and sec variables. a) enove all vport_lim netties from do_initialize Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L49 # [02:9]	C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P138 L20 # r02-98 Johnson, Peter	C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L26 # r02-100 Johnson, Peter
The privations do_classification, sec' seem highly unconventions do_classification, sec' seem highly unconventional as they seem to porate at two levels of the Primary and Secondary PSE state machines. On a per class seem to prove the equiper, per (egc) per grid (egc) and grid (egc) (Comment Type T Comment Status R PSE SD	Comment Type T Comment Status A PSE SE
If this is truly seen to be an issue, then 'do_classification_pri' (and sec) should just return class signatures per class event and the variables pd_req_pwr_pri (sec) and pd_allocated_pwr_pri (sec) should be defined along with pd_req_pwr in 145.2.5.4. Response Response Status C REJECT. While you are correct that we are inconsistent, the SD is technically correct and consensus was not reached to change it. CI 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L18 # r02-29 Yseboott, Lennart Philips Lighting Philips Lighting Comment Type T Comment Status A PSE SD Variables option_class_probe_pri and option_class_probe_sec are missing from returned Add both variables. Pset SC P140 L49 # r02-9 Add both variables. Response Status C CI 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L18 # r02-29 P140 L49 # r02-9 Variables option_class_probe_pri and option_class_probe_sec are missing from returned Add both variables. CI 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L49 # r02-9 SuggestedRemedy Add both variables. CI 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L49 # r02-9 ACCEPT. On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-references. SuggestedRemedy ACCEPT. On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of references to missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameWakter (cross-references Wisearching for "145." in FrameWakter (cross-references	unconventional as they seem to operate at two levels of the Primary and Secondary PSE state machines. On a per class event level, they (presumably) produce class signatures. But additionally, they return the variables pd_req_pwr_pri (sec) and pd_allocated_pwr_pri (sec) that really should come from CLASS_EVAL_PRI and CLASS_EVAL_SEC, as seems to be the case in the top level (single signature) state machine where the Function 'do_classification' simply returns the class signature from a single event as shown in the	the Function 'do_initialize'. This does not seem to be consistent with the purpose of these variables that are defined to report an operating condition during the POWER_ON state, albeit the purpose of 'do_initialize' is not clear in the PSE state machine. First problem is that the variable 'option_vport_lim' is not used anywhere in state processing. Further, the 'pri' and 'sec' versions of these variables are processed identically to 'short_det_pri', 'short_det_sec', 'overld_det_pri' and 'overld_det_sec'. They all have meaning only during
class signafures per class event and the variables pd_red_pwr_pri (sec) and 'pd_allocated_pwr_pri (sec) should be defined along with pd_req_pwr in 145.2.5.4. Response Response Status C REJECT. While you are correct that we are inconsistent, the SD is technically correct and consensus was not reached to change it. Cl Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L18 rd2-29 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting To Comment Status A PSE SD Variables option_class_probe_pri and option_class_probe_sec are missing from returned variables. Add both variables. P140 L18 rd2-29 Suggested/Remedy Add both variables. PSE SD P140 L18 rd2-29 Variables option_class_probe_pri and option_class_probe_sec are missing from returned variables. All So SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L49 rd2-9 Suggested/Remedy Add both variables. Ci 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L49 rd2-9 ACCEPT. On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-references. Suggested/Remedy On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Status C	SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy
Response Response Status C REJECT. While you are correct that we are inconsistent, the SD is technically correct and consensus was not reached to change it. C1 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L18 # r02-29 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting 2) add "This variable is set per this description." to the end of option_vport_lim_pri (and	class signatures per class event and the variables pd_req_pwr_pri (sec) and	Specify in the definitions of 'option_vport_lim_pri' and 'option_vport_lim_sec' that "This variable is set per this description" much like the write-ups for 'overld_det_pri' and
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Response Response Status C	
While you are correct that we are inconsistent, the SD is technically correct and consensus was not reached to change it. 1) Delete option_vport_lim from variable list. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L18 # [r02-29] // seboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting 2) add "This variable is set per this description." to the end of option_vport_lim_pri (and _sec) // Comment Type T Comment Status A PSE SD Variables option_class_probe_pri and option_class_probe_sec are missing from returned variables. 4) remove all vport_lim entries from do_initialize SuggestedRemedy Add both variables. Ci 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L49 # [r02-9] ACCEPT. Response Status C Comment Type E Comment Status A Editoria Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy A Ci ena Corporation ACCEPT. On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-references. SuggestedRemedy On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Status C	REJECT.	•
variable in the do_initialize function. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.6 P140 L49 # r02-9 SuggestedRemedy Add both variables. Add both variables. Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Compage 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Status C	/seboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting	_sec) 3) add "or the PSE does not implement this option." to the end of the FALSE description for both _pri and _sec variables.
Add both variables. Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial Response Response Status C Three instances of references to 145.2.5.4 that are text rather than cross-references. SuggestedRemedy On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Response Status C		
Response Response Status C Three instances of references to 145.2.5.4 that are text rather than cross-references. ACCEPT. SuggestedRemedy On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Response Status C	SuggestedRemedy	Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
ACCEPT. SuggestedRemedy On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Status C	Add both variables.	Comment Type E Comment Status A Editoria
On page 140, lines 49 and 54, and page 141, line 5 make "145.2.5.4" a cross-reference. Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Status C	Response Response Status C	Three instances of references to 145.2.5.4 that are text rather than cross-references.
Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in FrameMaker (cross-references will not match). Response Response Status C	ACCEPT.	SuggestedRemedy
		Check and fix other instances of missing cross-references by searching for "145." in
ACCEPT.		Response Response Status C
		ACCEPT.

Pa **140** Li **49**

C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P142 L # r02-140 Darshan, Yair	C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P142 L6 # r02-86 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter Hewlett P
Comment Type T Comment Status D PSE SD There is a problem that tcc2det_timer is not used as a condition to the states and the flow after SISM_START in CC_DET_SEQ=0 or 3 as required by the definition of this timer. This can cause detection on primary to start after tcc2tdet timer has expried. In fact, we need to ensure that all the inputs coming to START_DET_PRI need to be conditioned by tcc2det_timer not done.	Comment Type ER Comment Status A Editoria Suggest that 'do_initialialize' should read 'do_initialize' in the IDLE state in Figure 145-13. SuggestedRemedy See comment. Response Response Status W
SuggestedRemedy Make the following changes: 1. From INIT_PRI to START_DET_PRI: change from "CC_DET_SEQ!=2" to "(CC_DET_SEQ=0)+(CC_DET_SEQ=3)*!tcc2det_timer_done+ (CC_DET_SEQ=1)" 2. Add exit from INIT_PRI to IDLE_: "(CC_DET_SEQ=0)+(CC_DET_SEQ=3)*tcc2det_timer_done	ACCEPT. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P142 L7 # r02-30 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type E Comment Status A Editoria
Proposed Response Response Status Z REJECT. This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter. This comment was withdrawn before the start of comment resolution.	Comment Type E Comment Status A Editoria do_initialialize in IDLE is misspelled. SuggestedRemedy Change to do_initialize Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Comment Status C
C/ 145 SC 145.2.7 P142 L1 # r02-141 Darshan, Yair	C/ 145 SC 145.2.7 P 142 L 7 # r02-135 Darshan, Yair
Comment Type T Comment Status A Pres: Darshan3 PSE state machine need to be updated per the updated simulation results SuggestedRemedy A A Adopt darshan_03_0118.pdf Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. C C Change transition from poweroff to nopower to Vpd < Vmark_th.	Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial Typo in "do_initialialize" in IDLE. Need to be "do_initialize" SuggestedRemedy Editorial Editorial SuggestedRemedy Change from "do_initialialize" to "do_initialize" Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Editorial Editorial Editorial Editorial

Pa **142** Li **7**

C/ 145 SC 1 Darshan, Yair	45.2.7	P142	L 9	# r02-1	38	C/ 145 Darshan, Y	SC 145.2.7 ′air	P14	2 L14	# r02-136
Comment Type	т	Comment Status R			PSE SD	Comment	Туре т	Comment Status	D	PSE SD
(page 144) we CLASSIFICAT SuggestedRemedy	have the TON whick	et to zero in the IDLE state all same initialization. The prop h is the first time we need it a pwr from IDLE.	er place is to ι	use it in	ate	is set) Later, s IF (pse alt_pri END	and also pse_al still in IDLE state _alternative != b <== pse_alterna	ternative is set (which e, we have the followir poth) THEN ative	Pinouts Alternative g IF statement:	alt_pri (in which "a" or "b" PSE uses A, B or both)))".
the PSE is in the	he IDLE s	Response Status C et to 0 in idle as there are ma state, the PSE has released a s "no power has been assign	all power alloca	ation. The definit	ton of	confus Propos 1. To c 2. To r IF (pse alt_pri	ing. sal	n the function do_initia had in D3.1: both) THEN ative		e state is redundant and ne 17.
						Suggested	Remedy			
						2. To r IF (pse alt_pri	lelete alt_pri fror estore what we e_alternative != t <== pse_alterna alt_pri <== user	ooth) THEN ative	alize on page 140 lir	ne 17.
						Proposed I REJEC	•	Response Status	z	
						This co	omment was WI	THDRAWN by the cor	nmenter.	
						C/ 145 Law, David	SC 145.2.5.7		3 <i>L</i> 17 It Packard Enter	# r02-90
						conditi	re 145-13 the tr	_done' and then the se	F to IDLE could be	PSE SD misread to require two ive = both) * ((det_temp
						Suggested				
								ontal line and arrow fro arrow box in the lower		ate be lowered so that it
						Response ACCEI	PT.	Response Status	С	

Page 15 of 38 2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

Pa **143**

Li 17

C/ 145 SC 145.2.7 Darshan, Yair	P143	L19	# r02-139	C/ 145 Darshan, Yai	SC 145.2.7 r	P146	L 9	# r02-111
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		PSE SD	Comment Ty	pe T	Comment Status D		PSE S
We got to this place a check which required Therefore the condition (sig_type = dual) *((s As a result the condition accordingly to "(sig_t	xit from CXN_CHK_DETECT_ after setting CC_DET_SEQ=2 both pairs to be with valid sigr on (sig_type = dual) *((sig_pri = g_pri = valid) * (sig_sec = valid ion from CXN_CHK_DETECT_ /pe = invalid) +(sig_type = sing ual) *((sig_pri != valid) +(sig_set	where we did de nature to continu = valid) +(sig_se d)). _EVAL to IDLE r gle) *((sig_pri !=	tection and connection e with sism=TRUE. c = valid)) need to be need to be updated	alt_pwrd The curr IF (pse_a alt_pwrd start tinru END	_sec=TRUE a ent logic is: alternative = b _sec <== TRI ush_timer_sec		e_allocated_p	wr > 4) THEN
SuggestedRemedy				pse_alte OR	rnative=BOTH	H and pse_ss_mode=1 [i.e. wo	orking over 4-pa	airs with class 1-4]
(sig_type = dual) *((s To: (sig_type = dual)	m CXN_CHK_DETECT_EVAL g_pri = valid) +(sig_sec = valic *((sig_pri = valid) * (sig_sec =	l)) valid))	T from:	Pse_alte which res	sult with:	H and pse_allocated_pwr>4 H)* ((pse_ss_mode=1)+(pse_	_allocated_pwr:	>4))
	m CXN_CHK_DETECT_EVAL (sig_type = single) *((sig_pri !=		c != valid)) +(sig_type =	SuggestedRe				
dual) *(sig_pri != valio To: "(sig_type = inval	l) *(sig_sec != valid)" d) +(sig_type = single) *((sig_t sig_pri != valid) +(sig_sec != va	ori != valid) +(sig		THEN "		_alternative = both) *(pse_ss_ e = both) *((pse_ss_mode = 1	, u	. ,
Proposed Response	Response Status Z			Proposed Re	sponse	Response Status Z	, u _	//
REJECT.				REJECT				
This comment was W	ITHDRAWN by the commenter	er.		This com	iment was WI	THDRAWN by the commente	r.	
This comment was w	thdrawn before the start of cor	nment resolutior	۱.	This com	iment was wit	hdrawn before the start of con	nment resolutio	on.
C/ 145 SC 145.2.7 Darshan, Yair	P 144	L 33	# r02-137	C/ 145 Law, David	SC 145.2.5.	7 P146 Hewlett Packa	L 37 ard Enter	# r02-87
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		PSE SD	Comment Ty	pe ER	Comment Status A		PSE S
In the exit from CLAS In the exit from CLAS	D3.1) we did some changes th S_EV2 to MARK_EV2 we add S_EV2 to MARK_EV_LAST w	the variable "*(p	ose_alternative=both)"		e equation, 'e	ne transition from POWER_ON rror sec' should read 'error_se		
	nce the argument that was use pwr is set to 4 in CLASS_EV2			SuggestedRe See com	-			
SuggestedRemedy				Response		Response Status W		
Restore to D3.1 all th	e changes done for comment i	r01-174.		ACCEPT				
Proposed Response	Response Status Z							
REJECT.								

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa 146	Page 16 of 38
Li 37	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

IEEE P802.3bt D3.2 4P PoE 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

nt Status A defined in subclause 145.2) E 4 'Variablaa' bi	PSE SD	Comment T	vpe T	Comment Status A		PSE SD
defined in subclause 145.2		ut upped in	OOS	,,			1 02 00
	2.5.4 Valiables, bu	ut used in	003				
d to subclause 145.2.5.4 '\	Variables':		is !optic	on_class_probe			
in 145.5.3.2.2.			Suggested	Remedy			
			Change	e to: !option_cla	ss_probe_pri		
-			Response		Response Status C		
	4		ACCEF	РТ.			
):	4		C/ 145 Vseboodt I			L 7	# r02-32
in 145.2.5.4.						ig .	PSE SD
P148 L1	7 # r	02-133	In state	ENTRY_SEC	he variable "alt_done_pri" is	set to False.	P3E 3D
/nov17/yseboodt_03_1117 TRUE in INIT_PRI. In cas JE after detection is done a int which is the primary tells	'_final.pdf as indica se CC_DET_SEQ= and the purpose of	ated by the =2 the f this variable	Change Response	e "alt_done_pri"	to "alt_done_sec". Response Status C		
EQ sequences, det_start_ T_PRI which is redundant		in INIT_PRI	C/ 145 Yseboodt, L			L 8 Ig	# r02-33
ch is the correct place for (Comment T OOS	Гуре Т	Comment Status A		PSE SD
			variable	e is !option_clas	s_probe.		
" from INIT_SEC to STAR	T_CXN_CHK_DE	TECT on					0
se Status C			00	2	ss_probe_sec		
			Response		Response Status C		
et of conditions under whic	h the state diagram	n does not	ACCEF	PT.	,		
	the in 145.5.3.2.2. See Status C com 145.5.3.2.2 to 145.2.5. com 145.2.5.4. P148 L1 ent Status R n D3.1 COMMENT 433 ar /nov17/yseboodt_03_1117 TRUE in INIT_PRI. In case JE after detection is done art which is the primary tell DWER_UP. SEQ sequences, det_start_ CT_PRI which is redundant _pri <== TRUE" from INIT_ ch is the correct place for 0 secondary as well. from INIT_PRI to START if from INIT_PRI to START from INIT_SEC to STAR see Status C	se Status C om 145.5.3.2.2 to 145.2.5.4 Status R P148 L17 # [P148 L	The second region of the seco	se Status C se Status C se Status C om 145.5.3.2.2 to 145.2.5.4 Status C Suggested Change Response ACCEF C/ 145 Yseboodt, I Comment 7 In state This sh Copy p n D3.1 COMMENT 433 and was not resolved fully by nov17/yseboodt_03_1117_final.pdf as indicated by the TRUE in INIT_PRI. In case CC_DET_SEQ=2 the JE after detection is done and the purpose of this variable att which is the primary tells the secondary that it is SUggested C/ 145 Suggested Comment 7 In state This sh Copy p Suggested Change Response ACCEF C/ 145 Yseboodt, I Change Response ACCEF Comment 7 Suggested Change Response ACCEF C/ 145 Yseboodt, I C/ 145 Yseboodt, I Comment 7 Suggested Change Response ACCEF C/ 145 Yseboodt, I Comment 7 Suggested Change Response ACCEF C/ 145 Yseboodt, I Comment 7 Suggested Change Response ACCEF C/ 145 Yseboodt, I Comment 7 Suggested Change Response ACCEF	in 145.5.3.2.2. SuggestedRemedy in 145.5.3.2.2. in 145.5.3.2.2. in 145.5.3.2.2. in 145.2.5.4. in 145.2.5.4. Image: the secondary of the secondary of the secondary that it is should be "alt_done_pri" in 145.2.5.4. Image: the secondary that it is should be "alt_done_pri" in 145.2.5.4. Image: the secondary that it is should be "alt_done_pri" in 145.2.5.4. Image: the secondary that it is should be "alt_done_pri" in 145.2.5.4. Image: the secondary that it is should be "alt_done_pri" in TRUE in INIT_PRI. In case CC_DET_SEQ=2 the JE after detection is done and the purpose of this variable att which is the primary tells the secondary that it is SWER_UP. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.7 SEQ sequences, det_start_pri is set to TRUE in INIT_PRI C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.7 TCPI which is redundant. Image: the secondary that it is SWER_UP. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.7 SEQ sequences, det_start_pri to ch is the correct place for CC_DET_SEQ=2. Secondary as well. C/ 145 SC 145.2.5.7 'f from INIT_PRI to START_CXN_CHK_DETECT on page From state CLAS: variable is loption_clas This should not de SuggestedRemedy 'f from INIT_SEC to START_CXN_CHK_DETECT on secondary as well. Comment Type Tool 'f from INIT_SEC to START_CXN_CHK_DETECT on secondary	SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Change to: !option_class_probe_pri Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P152 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lightin Comment Type T Comment Status A In state ENTRY_SEC the variable "alt_done_pri" is : Thus should be "alt_done_sec". Copy paste mistake versus baseline yseboodt_03_1 TRUE in INIT_PRI. In case CC_DET_SEQ=2 the JE after detection is done and the purpose of this variable TRUE in INIT_PRI. In case CC_DET_SEQ=2 the JE after detection is done and the purpose of this variable SuggestedRemedy Change "alt_done_sec". Comment Type T Comment Status C ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P152 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lightin Comment Type T Comment Status C ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P153 SuggestedRemedy Change "alt_done_sec". Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P153 SuggestedRemedy Change "alt_done_sec". Response Status C ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P153 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lightin Comment Type T Comment Status A OOS From State CLASSIFICATION_SEC to CLASS variable is loption_class_probe_sec Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.2.5.7 P153 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lightin Comment Type T Comment Status A OOS	In 145.5.3.2.2. SuggestedRemedy Status C SuggestedRemedy In 145.5.3.2.2 to 145.2.5.4 C Dr. In 145.5.3.2.2 to 145.2.5.4 Dr. In 145.2.5.4. P148 L17 # [r02-133] In 15 Accomment Type T Comment Type Comment Type Copy paste mistake versus baseline yseboodt_03_1117_final.pdf SuggestedRemedy Change 'alt_done_pri* to "alt_done_sec".

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Li **8**

2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

OCSDetection and connection check are two different things, operating at about the same level.And yet, the connection check subclause (145.2.6.1) is under the detection subclause (145.2.6.)It would make more sense to have connection check sit at the same level as detection.What do we do with the 4PID subclause, which has depencies on detection, cc, classification, and mutual ID.If we structure things roughly in the same way as they happen, we should have all of them sit at the 145.X? Hevel in this order: 145.2.6 Detection145.2.6 Detection145.2.7 a 4PID requirements 145.2.7 a 4PID requirements 145.2.8 Power supply outputSuggestedRemedy Reshuffle subclauses as follows: 145.2.6 PSE detection of PDs [NO CHANGE]SuggestedRemedyReshuffle subclauses as follows: 145.2.6 PSE detection of PDs [NO CHANGE]		
OOS Detection and connection check are two different things, operating at about the same level. And yet, the connection check subclause (145.2.6.1) is under the detection subclause (145.2.6). The response to unsatisfied comment r01-30 against D3.1 was: "REJECT. It would make more sense to have connection check sit at the same level as detection. What do we do with the 4PID subclause, which has depencies on detection, cc, classification, and mutual ID. In order to clarify the meaning of an em-dash in tables within 802.3, a comment has been submitted against the revision project with the following suggested remedy Add a new subclause 1,45.2.6 Detection 145.2.6 Detection 145.2.7 To PS classification of PDs and mutual ID 145.2.7 To PS classification of PDs and mutual ID 145.2.8 Power supply output SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Nake sure all tables have an entry of em-dash or pointer to the requirement in currently blank min or max columns in accordance with all other recent amendments to IEEE 802.3. In particular, Tables 145-7, 145-8, 145-9, 145-10, 145-11, 145-15, 145-16, 145-21, 145-25, 145-28, 145-29, 145-29, 145-29, 145-29, 145-33.		
Detection and connection check are two different things, operating at about the same level. And yet, the connection check are two different things, operating at about the same level. And yet, the connection check subclause (145.2.6.1) is under the detection subclause (145.2.6.1). The comment resolution group believes that the em-dash is technically inaccurate for these entries as it means there is "a lack of data". It would make more sense to have connection check sit at the same level as detection. The comment resolution group believes that the em-dash is technically inaccurate for these entries as it means there is "a lack of data". If we structure things roughly in the same way as they happen, we should have all of them sit at the 145.2.Y Plevel in this order: 1.2.8 Em dash () in a table cell 145.2.6 Detection Atable. cell containing an em-dash () indicates a lack of data for that cell, or: 145.2.7 SE classification of PDs and mutual ID For a miximum cell, that there is no requirement on the maximum value of that parameter 145.2.7 APID requirements For a miximum cell, that there is no requirement on the minimum value of that parameter 145.2.8 Power supply output SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Make sure all tables have an entry of em-dash or pointer to the requirement in currently blank min or max columns in accordance with all other recent amendments to IEEE 802.3. SuggestedRemedy Make sure all tables have an entry of em-dash or pointer to the requirement in currently blank min or max columns in accordance with all other rece		
145.2.7 PSE classification of PDs and mutual ID [NO CHANGE] ACCEPT.	Detection and connection check are two different things, operating at about the same level. And yet, the connection check subclause (145.2.6.1) is under the detection subclause (145.2.6). It would make more sense to have connection check sit at the same level as detection. What do we do with the 4PID subclause, which has depencies on detection, cc, classification, and mutual ID. If we structure things roughly in the same way as they happen, we should have all of them sit at the 145.X.Y level in this order: 145.2.6 Detection 145.2.6 Detection 145.2.7 PSE classification of PDs and mutual ID 145.2.7a 4PID requirements 145.2.8 Power supply output SuggestedRemedy Reshuffle subclauses as follows: 145.2.6 PSE detection of PDs [NO CHANGE] 145.2.6a Connection check [Bump up 1 level, change subclause title, move here]	 "REJECT. The comment resolution group believes that the em-dash is technically inaccurate for these entries as it means there is "a lack of data". In Clause 145 the empty cells are due to openended ranges, not a lack of data." In Clause 145 the empty cells are due to openended ranges, not a lack of data." In order to clarify the meaning of an em-dash in tables within 802.3, a comment has been submitted against the revision project with the following suggested remedy Add a new subclause 1.2.8: 1.2.8 Em dash () in a table cell A table cell containing an em-dash () indicates a lack of data for that cell, or: For a units cell, that there is no unit for that parameter For a maximum cell, that there is no requirement on the maximum value of that parameter For a minimum cell, that there is no requirement on the minimum value of that parameter SuggestedRemedy Make sure all tables have an entry of em-dash or pointer to the requirement in currently blank min or max columns in accordance with all other recent amendments to IEEE 802.3. In particular, Tables 145-7, 145-8, 145-10, 145-14, 145-15, 145-16, 145-21, 145-25, 145-28, 145-29, 145-32. <i>Response</i>

Pa **157** Li **45**

C/ 145 SC 145.2.6.5 (seboodt, Lennart	P 159 Philips Lighting	L 52	# r02-35	C/ 145 Jones, Cha		145.2.6.4	P 160 Cisco System	L 1 s. Inc.	#	r02-14
Comment Type E	Comment Status A		PSE Detection	Comment		Е	Comment Status A	-,		Editorial
OOS				any wa	ay to ke	ep Table 1	45-9 with 145.2.6.4? right n ble but not that table.	ow it's in the m	iddle of 14	
	s an invalid detection signature s as defined in Table 145-10."	e, a pairset wh	nich exhibits any of the	Suggested editor		,	to 145.2.6.4			
	refers to things by relative pos that is being referred to.	ition. Problen	n is, what follows is	Response ACCE			Response Status C			
SuggestedRemedy										
	s an invalid detection signature s:" [FRAME: keep with next]	e, a pairset wł	nich exhibits any of the	C/ 145 Yseboodt,		145.2.7 rt	P 161 Philips Lightir	L 25 g	#	r02-36
" a) Resistance less tha b) Resistance greater c) Capacitance greater	n or equal to R bad min, or than or equal to R bad max, o r than or equal to C bad min. " , and C bad min are defined in	[FRAME: kee	ep with next]	Comment OOS		E	Comment Status A			Editoria
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			of clas	s signa See T	atures. The able 145-26	ch class event with a curren class signatures generated 6 and Table 145-27 for a ma	by the PD indi	cate the P	D requested
C/ 145 SC 145.2.6.5 Darshan, Yair	P159	L 53	# <u>r02-125</u>				at defining the PD requested ype 1), this seems a good pl			ve removed
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		Ediorial	Suggested	Reme	dy				
Typo: " Reject **as** a SuggestedRemedy Remove "as".	n invalid". Remove "as".			"NOTE	∃ Fo nent Pł		agraph: Ds, a requested Class 0 is n er classification requested C			
Proposed Response	Response Status Z			Insert	the sar	ne note in ⁻	145.3.6.1, on page 201, line	4.		
REJECT.				Response			Response Status C			
This comment was WIT	HDRAWN by the commenter.			ACCE	PT IN I	PRINCIPLE	Ξ.			
This comment was with	drawn before the start of com	nent resolutio	n.	"NOTE implen	E Fo nent Ph	nysical Lay	agraph: Ds, a requested Class 0 is r er classification requested C sst Class 0 are assigned Cla	lass 0, with a p	ower leve	l equivalent to
				Insert	the sar	me note in ^r	145.3.6.1, on page 201, line	4.		

Pa **161** Li **25**

Page 19 of 38 2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

C/ 145 SC 145.2.7 Yseboodt, Lennart	P 161 Philips Lightin	L 33 g	# r02-37	C/ 145 Darshan, Yair	SC 145.2.7	P162	L19	# <u>r02-112</u>
Comment Type E	Comment Status A	•	Editorial	Comment Typ	e T	Comment Status D		Pres: Darshan
Class."	e minimum power output a P		C C	DC resista that define restored s	ance or tempe ed by Equatic	t "PSEs that have additional ir erature conditions may choose on (145-4)." and it was remove rence between worst case ma negligible.	e to use a lower d in D3.2. It is b	Autoclass margin than better if it will be
•	al-sig sentence says "minimu	im output power	•"	SuggestedRe	medy			
SuggestedRemedy Change to "The minimu Response	m output power a PSE supp <i>Response Status</i> C	orts depends or	the assigned Class."	"PSEs th	at have addit	after line 21 in page 162: ional information about the ac may choose to use a lower A		
ACCEPT.				Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status Z		
C/ 145 SC 145.2.7	P 162	L18	# r02-15	REJECT.				
Jones, Chad	Cisco System	s, Inc.		This comr	ment was WI	THDRAWN by the commente	r.	
0 1	Comment Status A	Pac_margin,as o	<i>Editorial</i> defined in". Add space.	C/ 145 Darshan, Yair	SC 145.2.7	P162	L 22	# r02-113
SuggestedRemedy	y at least Pac_margin, as de	fined in"		Comment Typ	e T	Comment Status D		Autoclass
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			informatio	on about the a	ion to remove the text from D ictual link section DC resistan Autoclass margin than that de	ce or temperatu	ire conditions may
Cl 145 SC 145.2.7 Stover, David Comment Type E	P 162 Analog Device Comment Status A	L 19 es Inc.	# [<u>r02-75</u>	actual link	ne following te section DC	ext after line 21: "PSEs that ha resistance or temperature con that defined by Equation (145	ditions may cho	
Comment Type E Missing a space betwee				Proposed Res	•	Response Status Z	.).	
SuggestedRemedy	in words			REJECT.	F			
Change: "Pac_margin,as defined To: "Pac_margin, as defined				This com	ment was WI	THDRAWN by the commente	r.	
Response	Response Status C							
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE								

Pa **162** Li **22**

C/ 145 Yseboodt,	SC 145.2.7.1 Lennart	P 165 Philips Lightin	L 2 g	# r02-	38	C/ 145 Yseboodt,	SC 145.2. Lennart	7.1		2 165 lips Lightir	L 23 ng	# r02-39
Comment OOS	Туре Е	Comment Status A			Editorial	Comment OOS	Туре Т		Comment Stat	us A		Classification
PD PI"	In the PSE se	ction, the class sig table is titl ection, the equivalent is calle	d "PD class sig		d at the	betwee any of Nothin	en the most re the power up g wrong with	ecent state this s	time V PSE was s." entence, howeve	at V Rese er it is inco	et for at least T	bable of supporting Reset and a transition to
	eader in Table 14 consistent with P	5-13 is mentioning PD in PS D table header.	E section.				is also not a quests Class		to create 'redur	ndant extra	a' class events (eg. 2 events for a PD
	e table titles to	re evaluated at the PSE PI"				a PICS	Sentry of its of		is duplicate to the	ne state di	agram, it is imp	ortant enough to warrant
		re generated at the PD PI"				Suggested	-					
Response		Response Status C			Add the following after the quoted sentence.							
ACCE	٢١.					- one c - three - four c - five c betwee any of PSEs - three - four c betwee	class event will class events class events class events we and the most of the power up connected to class events class events	hen th when th when t cecent state a dua when when t ecent	s. Il-signature PD s the PD request the PD requests time V PSE was	Class 1 thr s Class 5 o Class 7 or at V Reso shall issue, s Class 1 Class 5	ough 3 r 6 8 et for at least T for a given pair through 4	n: Reset and a transition to set, no more than: Reset and a transition to
						Response			Response Statu	is C		
						ACCE	PT IN PRINC	IPLE.				
						Replac	ce page 165,	line 2	1-23 with:			
						the Cla - one c - three - four c - five c betwee any of PSEs c	ass they are a class event will class events v class events v class events v en the most re the power up connected to	ible to nen th when t vhen t cent state a dua		more than Class 0 thr s Class 4 Class 5 o Class 7 or a at V Rese	n: ough 3 r 6 et for at least T for a given pair	Reset and a transition to set, no more

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	Pa 165	Page 21 of 38
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 23	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line		

 three class events when the PD four class events when the PD r between the most recent time V F any of the power up states." 	equests Class 5	•	eset and a transition to	Yseboodt, Lenna		P 167 Philips Ligh	L 7 nting	# <u>r02-41</u>
C/ 145 SC 145.2.7.1 Stover, David	P 165 Analog Devices In	L 33 c.	# r02-76	POWER_ON	state and	Comment Status A Autoclass it shall measur pd_autoclass is TRUE. P	Autoclass is the	power provided by the
" If the Autoclass enabled PSE in state name is missing underscore SuggestedRemedy	2S	easures"	Editorial	defined in Ta For assigned 2P mode, the Given that th	ble 145-15 I Class 1-4 e channel I e PSE doe	out the period bounded by , if the PSE measures Aut osses will roughly double. s not know what the PD p	oclass in 4P mod	de, and then switches to
Change "CLASS EV1 AUTO" to " Response Respon ACCEPT.	CLASS_EV1_AUTO" se Status C			make the Au	lution is to toclass me	require PSEs that plan to asurement in 2P mode.	transition back ir	nto 2P mode, to also
C/ 145 SC 145.2.7.2 Yseboodt, Lennart	P 167 Philips Lighting	L 7	# r02-40	SuggestedReme Append sent	-	e end of the quoted text:		
Comment Type E Comme OOS	ent Status A		Editorial			Es that have assigned Cla ode, shall not transition to		and have measured
"If the PSE implements Auto POWER_ON state and pd_autocl PSE measured throughout the pe	ass is TRUE. P Autocl	ass is the po	wer provided by the	Response ACCEPT IN	-			
defined in Table 145-15. P ac_ma of power the PSE adds to P Autor increases in the link section resist	argin , defined in Table class in order to alloca tance due to temperatu	145-15, is the enough po are increase.	e mini- mum amount wer to cope with T AUTO_PSE1 and T			dt_03_0118.pdf er the close of comment r	esolution:	
AUTO_PSE2 timing is referenced POWER_ON state."	I from the transition of	the POWER	_UP state to the	the full file pa	ath is http://	/www.ieee802.org/3/bt/pul	olic/jan18/yseboo	udt_03_0118.pdf]
3 instances of "the XXX_YY	Y state"							

SuggestedRemedy

Remove 'the' and 'state'.

Response Status C

Response	
----------	--

ACCEPT.

Pa **167** Li **7**

C/ 145 SC 145.2.7.2 Yseboodt, Lennart	P167 Philips Lighting	L 22	# r02-42	C/ 145 Darshan, Y	SC 145.2.7 ′air	P167	L 36	# r02-121
Comment Type T OOS	Comment Status A		Pres: Yseboodt1		nargin calculati	Comment Status A ons has some errors and need to	be updated.	Pres: Darshan1 See updates for
transition of POWER_UI		AUTO_PSE2 a	re referenced "from the	Suggested	0	darshan_01_0118.pdf. 118.pdf		
	s: e at the PSE PI when this ha eference points can drift apa			Response ACCEI	PT IN PRINCII	Response Status C PLE.		
While the timings d	o work out in any permutatic	on, it makes it h	ard to comprehend.	Chang	e 1.25 to 1.5 f	or class 7 and class 8 in Table 14	5-15	
SuggestedRemedy				C/ 145	SC 145.2.8	P167	L 39	# r02-43
	ew unified reference point, w	hich is always	the same for PSE and	Yseboodt,	Lennart	Philips Lighting		
PD and possible adjust t Adopt yseboodt_01_011	5 1			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status A		Editorial
Response	Response Status C			Table '	145-16 has be	en placed inside of 145.2.8.1.		
ACCEPT.				Suggested	,			
C/ 145 SC 145.2.7.2 Darshan, Yair	P167	L 32	# <u>r02-130</u>	Make Response ACCEI		AFTER Table 145-16. Response Status C		
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		Autoclass	AUGEI				
Type 3 and 4 PSE when items 4: class 1-4 need t	connected to class 0 PD ne to be Class 0 to 4	ed to support i	t as well. Table 145-15	C/ 145 Yseboodt,	SC 145.2.8 Lennart	P167 Philips Lighting	L 46	# r02-44
SuggestedRemedy				Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status A		Editorial
In Table 145-15: Change "Class 1-4" to "	Class 0 to 4"			OOS				
Proposed Response	Response Status Z			"1	145.2.8.1 Outp	ut voltage in the POWER_ON sta	ate"	
REJECT.				W	/e don't use 'th	ne XXX state' construction		
This comment was WITH	HDRAWN by the commente	r.		Suggested	Remedy			
This comment was with	Irawn before the start of con	nment resolutio	n.	Chang "145.2		Itage in POWER_ON"		
				Response		Response Status C		
				ACCEI	PT IN PRINCII	PLE.		
				Chang "145.2		Itage in a power on state"		
			d T/technical E/editorial G/g			Pa 167		Page 23 of 38

			· •.g• =• •· ••
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected	RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 46	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line			

Cl 145 SC 145.2.8.1 Darshan, Yair	P 168	L 25	# r02-129	<i>Cl</i> 145 Lukacs, Mi	SC 145.2.8.1 klos	P 169 Silicon Labor	L 32 atories	# r02-77		
Comment Type T	Comment Status A			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status A		Editorial		
	connected to class 0 PD n -4 need to be Class 0 to 4		t as well. Table 145-16			3 in the "Additional Informat as no information about Ptyp		f Table 145-16 is wrong.		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy					
In Table 145-16 items 5,				Remov	ve the reference.					
Change "Class 1-4" to "C				Response		Response Status C				
Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE	Response Status C			ACCE	PT.					
				C/ 145	SC 145.2.8.1	P169	L 45	# r02-132		
Add a note after this para				Darshan, Y		100		" I <u>UZ IUZ</u>		
implement Physical Lave	"NOTE For Type 3 PDs, a requested Class 0 is not defined. Type 1 PDs that did not implement Physical Layer classification requested Class 0, with a power level equivalent to				Түре Т	Comment Status A				
	st Class 0 are assigned Cl				51	n connected to class 0 PD n	eed to support it	t as well. Table 145-16		
Insert the same note in 1	45.3.6.1, on page 201, line	e 4.		items ?	18: Class 1-4 ne	ed to be Class 0 to 4 for 2-p	air and 4-pair ro	WS.		
			# 00.404	SuggestedRemedy						
C/ 145 SC 145.2.8.1 Darshan, Yair	P169	L14	# r02-131		e 145-16 items 1 e "Class 1-4" to	8 for 2-pair and 4-pair rows "Class 0 to 4"				
Comment Type T	Comment Status A			Response		Response Status C				
Type 3 and 4 PSE when items 11: Class 1-3 need	connected to class 0 PD n d to be Class 0 to 3	leed to support i	t as well. Table 145-16		PT IN PRINCIPL					
SuggestedRemedy					note after this pa	ragraph: 'Ds, a requested Class 0 is ı	not defined. Type	e 1 PDs that did not		
In Table 145-16 items 11				implen	nent Physical Lay	ver classification requested	Class 0, with a p	ower level equivalent to		
Change "Class 1-3" to "(Class	PDs that requ	est Class 0 are assigned Cl	ass 3 by Type 3	and Type 4 PSEs."		
Response	Response Status C			Insert	he same note in	145.3.6.1, on page 201, line	e 4.			
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE				C/ 145	SC 145.2.8.2	P170	L 43	# r02-16		
Add a note after this para		a at dafin a d. Tura	- 4 DDs that did not	Jones, Cha		Cisco System	-			
	os, a requested Class 0 is a requested (Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status R		Editorial		
	st Class 0 are assigned Cl		and Type 4 PSEs."	"in a power on state" just two paragraphs above in 145.2.8.1 we changed "a power on state" to "POWER_ON". Did we miss one?						
Insert the same note in 1	45.3.6.1, on page 201, line	e 4.		Suggested						
				00		te" to "POWER_ON"				
				Response		Response Status C				
				REJEC	CT.	·				
						power on states (SS and DS thus only needs to reference		u site above only		
TYPE: TR/technical required					7/	Pa 1 Li A	-	Page 24 of 38		

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn Li 43 2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM SORT ORDER: Page, Line

C/ 145 SC 145.2.8.6 P175 L54 # r02-122 Darshan, Yair	<i>Cl</i> 145 <i>SC</i> 145.2.8. Lukacs, Miklos	B P178 Silicon Labora	L 12 atories	# r02-78			
Comment Type T Comment Status A Inrush	Comment Type E	Comment Status A		Editoria			
"Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature	Ilps is referring to to a current on a pairset, but this is not shown in the name of this parameter.						
PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period."	SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2)					
 The above text doesn't cover single-signature PD class 1-4 operating only over 4-pairs regarding power up requirements. They should have the same requirements as for single- signature PD class 5-8. 	Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C					
2. The current text in page 175 lines 54 and page 176 lines 1-2 take care of the possibility to flip between 2P and 4P and is good however this text is also true for class 1-4 operating only over 4-pairs as well.	C/ 145 SC 145.2.8. Lukacs, Miklos	8 P178 Silicon Labora	L 32 atories	# <u>r02-79</u>			
3. If we are working over 2-pairs only, no special requirements are needed for powerup because it is straight forward and explained in page 175 lines 52-53 as for when powerup	Comment Type E	Comment Status A		Editoria			
occurs.	Ilps is referring to to a parameter.	current on a pairset, but this i	is not shown in t	he name of this			
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a	, ,		is not shown in t	he name of this			
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period."	parameter. SuggestedRemedy		is not shown in t	he name of this			
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." To: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs connected to single-signature PD that operates over 4-pairs shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the	parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2 Response	Response Status C	L 40	the name of this # <u>r02-80</u>			
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." To: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs connected to single-signature PD that operates	parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2 Response ACCEPT. CI 145 SC 145.2.8.	Response Status C 8 P178	L 40				
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of Tlnrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within Tlnrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." To: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of Tlnrush. PSEs connected to single-signature PD that operates over 4-pairs shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within Tlnrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." Response Response Status C	parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2 Response ACCEPT. CI 145 SC 145.2.8. Lukacs, Miklos Comment Type E	Response Status C B P178 Silicon Labor	L 40 atories	# <u>r02-80</u> Editoria			
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." To: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs connected to single-signature PD that operates over 4-pairs shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period."	parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2 Response ACCEPT. CI 145 SC 145.2.8. Lukacs, Miklos Comment Type E Ilps is referring to to a	Response Status C B P178 Silicon Labor Comment Status A current on a pairset, but this i	L 40 atories	# <u>r02-80</u> Editoria			
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." To: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs connected to single-signature PD that operates over 4-pairs shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2 Response ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.2.8. Lukacs, Miklos Comment Type E Ilps is referring to to a parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2 Response	Response Status C B P178 Silicon Labor Comment Status A current on a pairset, but this i	L 40 atories	# <u>r02-80</u> Editoria			
occurs. SuggestedRemedy Change from: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs that have assigned Class 5 to 8 to a single-signature PD shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." To: "Power up occurs on each pairset between the transition to a power up state on that pairset and the expiration of TInrush. PSEs connected to single-signature PD that operates over 4-pairs shall reach POWER_UP on both pairsets within TInrush max, starting with the first pairset transitioning into the power up state, and where the second pairset transitions to a power up state anytime within this time period." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. adopt changes in yseboodt_05_0118.pdf	parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2 Response ACCEPT. CI 145 SC 145.2.8. Lukacs, Miklos Comment Type E Ilps is referring to to a parameter. SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilps to Ilps-2	Response Status C B P178 Silicon Labor Comment Status A current on a pairset, but this i	L 40 atories	# <u>r02-80</u> Editoria			

Pa **178** Li **40**

C/ 145 SC 14 Lukacs, Miklos	5.2.8.12	P 179 Silicon Labor	L 52 atories	# r02-81	C/ 145 Darshan,	SC 145.3.3.3 Yair	.3	P188	L 47	#	r02-114	
Comment Type E	= 0	Comment Status A		Editorial	Comment	Туре Т	Commen	t Status A			P	D SD
Ilps is referring to parameter.	o to a curre	nt on a pairset, but this	is not shown in t	he name of this	than I	efinition of "tinrus Inrush_PD and II	nrush_PD-2P	from TInrush_I	PD to Tdelay; se	e TInrusł		
SuggestedRemedy						145-29. " is inco	rrect this time	er has nothing to	do with I delay.	•		
Rename Ilps to I	llps-2p				Suggester	arkemeay ange to:						
Response ACCEPT.	R	esponse Status C			"tinrus TInrus	shpdmax_timer A sh_PD max in Ta	ble 145-29."				see	
C/ 145 SC 14	5.2.8.12	P180	L 4	# r02-82	Chan	5	0					
Lukacs, Miklos		Silicon Labor	atories			shpdmax_timer_n X; see TInrush_F			rmine when the	PD exits	INRUSH O	ver
Comment Type G Ilps is referring to parameter.	-	<i>Comment Status</i> A nt on a pairset, but this	is not shown in t	<i>Editorial</i> he name of this	Response		Response	Status C				
SuggestedRemedy Rename Ilpsto II Response ACCEPT.	• •	esponse Status C			"tinrus TInrus 2. The Chan	ange to: shpdmax_timer A sh_PD max in Ta e same for dual-s ge to: shpdmax_timer_r	ble 145-29." ignature PD c	on page 195 cla	use 145.3.3.4.3	:		n
C/ 145 SC 14	5.3.2	P183	L16	# r02-83		X; see TInrush_F						
Lukacs, Miklos		Silicon Labor	atories			to review usage			X", and "on Moo	de X" and	bring them	
Comment Type E		Comment Status A		Editorial	into a	lignment (prefere	nce is to use	on).				
The PD shall wit	thstand any	following sentence: voltage from 0 V to 57 ' ble 145-20 indefinitely v			Cl 145 Yseboodt	SC 145.3.3.3 Lennart	.5	P 191 Philips Lightir	L 44 ng	#	r02-45	
SuggestedRemedy		-		-	Comment	Туре Т	Commen	t Status R			Р	D SD
add "to the PD P	ין"					om POWERED t >= V Off_PD)" o			e "pd_power_up	odate * po	_dll_enable	э*
57V applied to	o the PD PI	per any			, C	_ ,						
Response	R	esponse Status C				onvention in thes	e state diagra	ams is to use x>	y and x <y and="" n<="" td=""><td>not include</td><td>equality.</td><td></td></y>	not include	equality.	
ACCEPT.					Suggeste				~			
						ge "VPD >= Voff_	-	_	D".			
					Response		Response	Status C				
					REJE	CT.						
						vould result in a c erform a POWER			g POWERED is	true and	the PD wor	uld

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	Pa 191	Page 26 of 38
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 44	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line		

C/ 145 SC 145.3.6.1.1 P 203 L 31 # r02-46 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Philips Lighting	C/ 145 SC 145.3.6.2 P203 L46 # r02-134 Darshan, Yair
Comment Type E Comment Status A Editoria	Comment Type T Comment Status D Autoclass
Comment Type E Comment Status A Editoria "Implementations should employ appropriate methods (such as hysteresis in V Mark_th) to avoid erroneous transitions." Fails to explain what kind of transitions are meant. SuggestedRemedy Replace by: "Implementations should employ appropriate methods (such as hysteresis in V Mark_th) to avoid erroneous transitions between class and mark states when the PSE switches from a class voltage to a mark voltage or vica versa." Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT.	Comment TypeTComment StatusDAutoclassThis is a repeat of comment r01-460 from D3.1 which was supposed to be addressed by http://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/nov17/yseboodt_05_1117_final.pdf and it didn't. In the text "After power up, a PD that implements Autoclass shall draw its highest required power, PAutoclass_PD, subject to the requirements on PClass_PD in 145.3.8.2,
	Proposed Response Response Status Z
	REJECT.
	This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.
	This comment was withdrawn before the start of comment resolution.

Pa **203** Li **46**

C/ 145 SC 145.3.6.2 Yseboodt, Lennart	P 204 Philips Lighting	L 8	# r02-47	C/ 145 SC 145.3.8 Yseboodt, Lennart	P 205 Philips Lighting	L 36	# r02-50
Comment Type E OOS	Comment Status A		Editorial	Comment Type E OOS	Comment Status A		Editoria
"Measured from transition	on to state DO_CLASS_EVENT	1"		Table 145-29, item 7,	Tdelay, description is "Inrush to	operating sta	te delay per pairset"
No need to say 'state'. SuggestedRemedy Strike 'state'. Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			the 'per pairset' is red SuggestedRemedy Remove 'per pairset' Response		rush to PD cu	urrent control delay"
C/ 145 SC 145.3.8 Yseboodt, Lennart	P205 Philips Lighting	L16	# <u>r02-48</u>	ACCEPT. 	P 207 Philips Lighting	L16	# r02-51
Comment Type TR Table 145-29, item 3, for Copy-paste mistake. SuggestedRemedy Change to "Class 5"	Comment Status A r dual-signature, last row is labe	Iled "Class 7	Editorial 7 to 8".	Comment Type E Table 145-29, item 17 SuggestedRemedy Unbold.	Comment Status A , itemnumber is in bold when it :	should not be.	Editoria
Also, both descriptions f Response ACCEPT.	or item 3 need to be appended Response Status C	with "per the	assigned Class".	Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C		
C/ 145 SC 145.3.8 Yseboodt, Lennart	P205 Philips Lighting	L 30	# <u>r02-49</u>	Cl 145 SC 145.3.8. Yseboodt, Lennart Comment Type TR "The PD shall turn off	1 P208 Philips Lighting Comment Status A at a voltage in the range of V O	L7	# <u>r02-52</u> Inrust
Comment Type ER OOS	Comment Status A		Editorial	Except when in the IN		ii_i D.	
Table 145-29, item 5 (Ilr 5 are both 0.4.	nrush_PD-2P), the values for du	al-sig Class	1-4 and dual-sig Class	SuggestedRemedy Replace by:			
SuggestedRemedy Merge into single entry. Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIF			
				of V Off_PD."	ching POWER_DELAY, the PD	Shall luth off a	at a voltage in the range

Pa 2/1

Pa **208** Li **7** Page 28 of 38 2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

C/ 145 SC 145.3.8.1 P208 L15 # r02-53	C/ 145 SC 145.3.8.2 P208 L25 # r02-104
Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting	
Comment Type E Comment Status R Editorial OOS "The PD shall turn on at a voltage in the range of V On_PD . After the PD turns on, the PD shall stay on over the entire V Port_PD-2P range. The PD shall turn off at a voltage in the range of V Off_PD . For dual-signature PDs the requirements for V On_PD and V Off_PD apply to each pairset individually. A PD shall not turn off due to peak power draw, causing V PD to go as low as V Overload-2P , as specified in 145.3.8.4, or due to a voltage transient as defined in 145.3.8.6. This behavior is encoded in the variable pd_overload and pd_overload_mode(X). The PD shall turn on or off without startup oscillation and within the first trial at any load value when fed by V Port_PSE-2P min to V Port_PSE-2P max (as defined in Table 145-16) with a series resistance less than or equal to R Ch . !!!V On_PD min is set at 30 V to align with V Off_PD min. It is recommended that a PD implements hysteresis between V On_PD	Comment TypeTComment Status APres: Bennett1In table 145-29, the symbol for the parameter "input AVERAGE power" is defined as Pport_PD. Section 145.3.8.4.1, Peak Operating Power Exceptions, uses Pport_PD as an AVERAGE power for computations. (It's also described as an AVERAGE power in section 33.3.7.2.1 of the existing standard.)The recent addition to 145.3.8.2 changes the Pport_PD definition to instantaneous power. This causes errors in 145.3.8.4.1 and it results in an ambiguity in table 145-29, where the symbol no longer matches the described parameter. The proposed solution changes Pport_PD and Pport_PD-2P back to an average power.The Existing Text in Draft 3.2 is:PPort_PD is the power drawn by a single-signature PD, defined in Equation (145-23). PPort_PD-2P is the
and V Off_PD.!!!" The part between !!! seems to be misplaced and belongs to the previous paragraph. SuggestedRemedy Maio contenance highlighted with III to the percent above it	power drawn by a given Mode of a dual-signature PD, defined in Equation (145-24). Pport_PD = VPD*lport (145-23) Pport_PD-2P = VPD*lport-2P (145-24) For single-signature PDs, the AVERAGE value of PPort_PD shall not exceed PClass_PD for the assigned class. For
Move sentences highlighted with !!! to the paragraph above it.	a dual-signature PD, the AVERAGE value of PPort_PD-2P shall not exceed PClass_PD-2P for the assigned class.
Response Response Status C REJECT.	SuggestedRemedy
That sentence is there because the hysteresis that it suggests is to solve startup oscillation	Move the word "average" in lines 32 and 33 to lines 25 and 26, and modify the equations to represent the following:
C/ 145 SC 145.3.8.1 P 208 L 18 # r02-54 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Comment Type TR Comment Status A NoPower	PPort_PD is the AVERAGE power drawn by a single-signature PD, defined in Equation (145-23). PPort_PD-2P is the AVERAGE power drawn by a given Mode of a dual-signature PD, defined in Equation (145-24).
"When the PD is in POWER_DELAY or POWERED and V PD falls below V Off_PD, the PD transitions to NOPOWER and may show a valid or invalid detection signature, and may or may not draw mark current, draw any class current, and show MPS. When nopower is TRUE interoperability between PSE and PD is no longer guaranteed."	Pport_PD = the integral of VPD(t)*lport(t) dt from t=n to (n+1) (145-23) Pport_PD-2P = the integral of VPD(t)*lport-2P(t) dt from t=n to (n+1) (145-24) For single-signature PDs, the value of PPort_PD shall not exceed PClass_PD for the assigned class. For a dual-signature PD, the value of PPort_PD-2P shall not exceed
Need to be synced with changes to the state diagram done in D3.1.	PClass_PD-2P for the assigned class.
SuggestedRemedy "When the PD is in POWEROFF and V PD falls below V Off_PD min, the PD transitions to NOPOWER and may show a valid or invalid detection signature, and may or may not draw mark current, draw any class current, and show MPS. When nopower is TRUE	OPTION 1: Remove the equations: PPort_PD is the AVERAGE power drawn by a single-signature PD. PPort_PD-2P is the
interoperability between PSE and PD is no longer guaranteed." Response Response Status C ACCEPT.	AVERAGE power drawn by a given Mode of a dual-signature PD. For single-signature PDs, the value of PPort_PD shall not exceed PClass_PD for the assigned class. For a dual-signature PD, the value of PPort_PD-2P shall not exceed PClass_PD-2P for the assigned class.
ACCEPT. TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/g COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/wr SOBT OPDER: Data	eneral Page 29 of 38

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/gene	eral required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected	RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line	

Page 29 of	58
2/12/2018	3:26:20 PM

Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIP	Response Status C LE.			<i>Cl</i> 145 So Darshan, Yair	C 145.3.8.3		P 209	L 34	#	r02-115	
adopt yseboodt_04_0	118.pdf			Comment Type	т	Comment S	tatus A			li	nrush
[Editor's note added a	fter the close of comment resolu	tion:						h and IInrush-2P, Port-2P to VPort_			5-
the full file path is http	://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/ja	an18/yseboodt_04	4_0118.pdf]	CPort < 1	80 uF for sin	gle-signature F	Ds assigned	d to Class 1 throu ne within Tinrush	ıgh 6"		
C/ 145 SC 145.3.8.	2 P208	L 35	# r02-55	point of this	text.						
Yseboodt, Lennart	Philips Lighting			SuggestedRem	ledy						
	Comment Status A w more power than P Autoclass_ ower level, up to the PD requeste ed in 145.5."			16, which is TInrush_PI CPort < 1	s sufficient cu D max when:	irrent to charge	e CPort or CF	h and Ilnrush-2P, Port-2P to VPort_ d to Class 1 throu	PSE-2P		5-
Only applies if the PD through DLL.	has either performed L1 Autocla	ass, or it has requ	lested Autoclass	" Response		Response St	atus C				
				ACCEPT IN							
SuggestedRemedy "A PD that has enable	ed Autoclass during Physical Lay	er classification o	or has requested	Change fro							
"A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification	ed Autoclass during Physical Lay L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to the on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C	in P Autoclass_P	D, unless the PD	"A PSE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush	ge CPort or CF	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru	ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P" ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P with	Table 14	5-16, whic	h is
"A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification Response ACCEPT.	L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to th on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C	in P Autoclass_P	D, unless the PD	"A PŠE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim sufficient cu when"	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush	ge CPort or CF	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru	Port_PSE-2P" Ish-2P, defined in	Table 14 in TInrus	5-16, whic	h is
"A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification desponse ACCEPT. The Accept SC 145.3.8.	L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to th on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C	n P Autoclass_P ne PD requested	D , unless the PD Class, through Data	"A PŠE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim sufficient cu when"	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush urrent to char	ge CPort or CF current to IInru ge CPort or CF	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru Port-2P to VF	Port_PSE-2P" Ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P with 	Table 14 in TInrus	5-16, whic h_PD max	h is
"A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification Response ACCEPT. C/ 145 SC 145.3.8. (seboodt, Lennart Comment Type E	L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to the on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C 2 <i>P</i> 208 Philips Lighting <i>Comment Status</i> A	n P Autoclass_P ne PD requested	D , unless the PD Class, through Data	"A PŠE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim sufficient cu when" <i>Cl</i> 145 St	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush urrent to char C 145.3.8.3	ge CPort or CF current to IInru ge CPort or CF	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru Port-2P to VF P209 Microsemi Co	Port_PSE-2P" Ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P with 	Table 14 in TInrus	5-16, whic h_PD max r02-69	h is
 "A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification ACCEPT. 145 SC 145.3.8. seboodt, Lennart comment Type E Variable "PAutoclass_ uggestedRemedy 	L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to the on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C 2 P208 Philips Lighting <i>Comment Status</i> A _PD" is written without subscript.	n P Autoclass_P ne PD requested	D , unless the PD Class, through Data # r02-56	"A PŠE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim sufficient cu when" C/ 145 Su Peker, Arkadiy Comment Type The objecti inrush curre	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush urrent to char C 145.3.8.3 TR ve of the follo ent to Ilnrush	ge CPort or CF current to IInru ge CPort or CF I Comment St owing text is mi	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru Port-2P to VF P209 Microsemi Co tatus A issing (charg P, defined in	Port_PSE-2P" Ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P with <i>L</i> 34 orporation ing within Tinrush Table 145-16, wh	Table 14 in TInrus # n) "A PSE	5-16, whic h_PD max r02-69 <i>li</i> limits the	h is
"A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification Response ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.3.8. (seboodt, Lennart Comment Type E Variable "PAutoclass_ SuggestedRemedy Change to correct sub	L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to the on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C 2 P208 Philips Lighting <i>Comment Status</i> A _PD" is written without subscript.	n P Autoclass_P ne PD requested	D , unless the PD Class, through Data # r02-56	"A PŠE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim sufficient cu when" C/ 145 Su Peker, Arkadiy Comment Type The objecti inrush curre	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush urrent to char C 145.3.8.3 TR ve of the follo ent to Ilnrush CPort or CPor	ge CPort or CF current to IInru ge CPort or CF <i>Comment S</i> owing text is mi and IInrush-2F	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru Port-2P to VF P209 Microsemi Co tatus A issing (charg P, defined in	Port_PSE-2P" Ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P with <i>L</i> 34 orporation ing within Tinrush Table 145-16, wh	Table 14 in TInrus # n) "A PSE	5-16, whic h_PD max r02-69 <i>li</i> limits the	h is
"A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification Response ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.3.8. (seboodt, Lennart Comment Type E Variable "PAutoclass_ SuggestedRemedy Change to correct sub	L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to the on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C 2 P208 Philips Lighting <i>Comment Status</i> A _PD" is written without subscript.	n P Autoclass_P ne PD requested	D , unless the PD Class, through Data # r02-56	"A PŠE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim sufficient cu when" C/ 145 St Peker, Arkadiy Comment Type The objecti inrush curre to charge C SuggestedRem Change fro "A PSE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush urrent to char C 145.3.8.3 TR ve of the follo ent to IInrush CPort or CPor redy m: its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush	ge CPort or CF current to IInru ge CPort or CF <i>Comment S</i> owing text is mi and IInrush-2F t-2P to VPort_ current to IInru ge CPort or CF current to IInru	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru Port-2P to VF P209 Microsemi Co tatus A issing (charg P, defined in PSE-2P whe ush and IInru Port-2P to VF ush and IInru	Port_PSE-2P" Ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P with <i>L</i> 34 orporation ing within Tinrush Table 145-16, wh	Table 14 in TInrus # n) "A PSE ich is suf Table 14 Table 14	5-16, which PD max <u>r02-69</u> // limits the ficient curr 5-16, whic 5-16, whic	h is nrush ent h is
"A PD that has enable Autoclass through DL successfully negotiate Link Layer classification Response ACCEPT. Cl 145 SC 145.3.8. Yseboodt, Lennart Comment Type E Variable "PAutoclass_ SuggestedRemedy Change to correct sub Response	L, shall not draw more power that as a different power level, up to the on as defined in 145.5." <i>Response Status</i> C 2 P208 Philips Lighting <i>Comment Status</i> A _PD" is written without subscript.	n P Autoclass_P ne PD requested	D , unless the PD Class, through Data # r02-56	"A PŠE lim sufficient cu To: "A PSE lim sufficient cu when" C/ 145 Su Peker, Arkadiy Comment Type The objecti inrush curre to charge C SuggestedRem Change fro "A PSE lim sufficient cu	its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush urrent to char C 145.3.8.3 TR ve of the follo ent to IInrush CPort or CPor redy m: its the inrush urrent to char its the inrush	ge CPort or CF current to IInru ge CPort or CF <i>Comment S</i> owing text is mi and IInrush-2F t-2P to VPort_ current to IInru ge CPort or CF current to IInru	Port-2P to VF ush and IInru Port-2P to VF P209 Microsemi Co tatus A issing (charg P, defined in PSE-2P whe ush and IInru Port-2P to VF ush and IInru Port-2P to VF	Port_PSE-2P" Ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P with <i>L</i> 34 orporation ing within Tinrush Table 145-16, when an" Ish-2P, defined in Port_PSE-2P"	Table 14 in TInrus # n) "A PSE ich is suf Table 14 Table 14	5-16, which PD max <u>r02-69</u> // limits the ficient curr 5-16, whic 5-16, whic	h is nrush ent h is

Page 30 of 38 2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

<i>Cl</i> 145 <i>SC</i> 145.3.8.3 <i>P</i> 210 <i>L</i> 32 # <u>r02-116</u> Darshan, Yair	C/ 145 SC 145.3.8.4 P211 L4 # r02-58 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Philips Lighting
Comment TypeTComment StatusDPD PowerThere is an error in the text "A dual-signature PD can also be implemented with a single load, resulting in a lower than Cx + Cy capacitance value as seen by the PSE.". The value in this case generally will be lower than Cx+Cy but in this particular case of a single load it will be Cx.	Comment Type TR Comment Status A PD Power Equations 145-25 and 145-26 result in PDMaxPowerValue (which is an integer representing the max power in 1/10th of a Watt) multiplied by a constant, and the result being interpreted as Watts. This results in PPeak_PD being 10x too large.
SuggestedRemedy Change from: "A dual-signature PD can also be implemented with a single load, resulting in a lower than Cx + Cy capacitance value as seen by the PSE." To: "A dual-signature PD can also be implemented with a single load, resulting in Cx capacitance value as seen by the PSE."	SuggestedRemedy Divide every constant by 10. So constants 1.29 1.11 1.05 become 0.129 0.111 0.105. For both equations. Response Response Status C
Proposed Response Response Status Z REJECT.	
This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.	C/ 145 SC 145.3.8.4 P211 L4 # r02-59 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Philips Lighting
CI 145 SC 145.3.8.4 P211 L1 # r02-57 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Philips Lighting PD Power "These equations may be used to calculate P Peak_PD or P Peak_PD-2P after Data Link Layer classification and for Autoclass by substituting PDMaxPowerValue with P PD Power	Comment Type T Comment Status A PD Power The sentence "These equations may be used to calculate P Peak_PD or P Peak_PD-2P after Data Link Layer classification and for Autoclass by substituting PDMaxPowerValue with PAutoclass_PD." is wrong. A PowerValue cannot be mixed with a Power level SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy
	Change to "These equations may be used to calculate P Peak_PD or P Peak_PD-2P after Data Link Layer classification and for Autoclass by substituting PDMaxPowerValue with the corresponding value of PAutoclass_PD." Response Response Status C
The equations below say "for Class x", but that needs to be assigned Class. It doesn't fit in	Change to "These equations may be used to calculate P Peak_PD or P Peak_PD-2P after Data Link Layer classification and for Autoclass by substituting PDMaxPowerValue with thecorresponding value of PAutoclass_PD."

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/gener	al required T/technical E/editorial G/general	Pa 212	Page 31 of 38
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected SORT ORDER: Page, Line	RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 14	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM

Cl 145 SC 145.3 Yseboodt, Lennart	.8.6 P212 Philips Lighting	L 22 g	# r02-61	C/ 145 Yseboodt, I	SC 145.3.8. 9 ₋ennart	9 P213 Philips Lighting	L 8	# r02-62
	Comment Status A 1, TR2, and TR3 tests consists of driven from the 'initial voltage' to			"a". Suggestedi	145-31 in row	Comment Status A Iunbalance_peak-2P the assign	ned class 1 to	Editoria 4 also needs the note
	d TR3 tests consists of a voltage om the 'initial voltage' to the 'final			Response ACCEF	РТ.	Response Status C		
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			C/ 145 Yseboodt, I	SC 145.3.8.9	9 P213 Philips Lighting	L 44	# r02-63
(for TR1 and TR2)	Comment Status A 1, TR2, and TR3 tests consists of driven age' to the 'final voltage' a the 'sou	-		5 % du any pai V Port_ resistar in Figu	signature PDs ty cycle, and sh r when PD PI p PSE-2P min + nces, R source re 145-30."	Comment Status A shall not exceed I Unbalance_le all not exceed I Unbalance_per airs of the same polarity are co 0.31 V to V Port_PSE-2P max _min and R source_max, as def	ak-2P , as def nnected to an through two c fined in Equat	fined in Table 145-31 on ny voltage in the range of common mode tion (145-28) and shown
and TR2), driven fr To:	nd TR3 tests consists of a voltage om the 'initial voltage' to the 'final d TR3 tests consists of a voltage	voltage' a the	source dv/dt' rate"	does no We rea and two	ot make sense. Ily want to indic o negative pairs	of the same polarity are connect cate the PD is to be connected i c. a Table that lists all of those opt	in 4-pair mode	0 0
and TR2), driven fr Response ACCEPT IN PRING Change to: "The TR1, TR2, an	om the 'initial voltage' to the 'final <i>Response Status</i> C	voltage' at the source, with a	'source dv/dt' rate" current limit (for TR1	5 % du any pai 145-20 through	-signature PDs ty cycle, and sh r when the PD , to any voltage a two common r	shall not exceed I Unbalance_pall nall not exceed I Unbalance_pea is connected per any valid 4-pa in the range of V Port_PSE-2P mode resistances, R source_mi I shown in Figure 145-30."	ak-2P , as def ir configuratio ² min + 0.31 V	fined in Table 145-31 on on, as defined in Table / to V Port_PSE-2P max
·· ·	5	0		Same	hange for dual			

Unbalance

Editorial

Response Status C

Response

ACCEPT.

Cl 145 SC 145.3.9 P215 L31 # r02-64	C/ 145 SC 145.3.9 P215 L44 # r02-84
Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting	Abramson, David Texas Instruments Inc
Comment Type TR Comment Status A MPS	Comment Type TR Comment Status A MPS
"A single-signature PD shall use the I Port_MPS value associated with assigned Class 5 to 8 when pse_assigned_class is 5, 6, 7, or 8, or when PDRequestedPowerValue is greater than 255."	When combining all of the PD MPS requirements into a table, we inadvertantly caused Type 3 and Type 4 PDs to draw more power (than Type 1 and 2) when connected to Type 1 and Type 2 PSEs.
We need to weave in an exception for when PDRequestedPowerValue == 0xACAC, because in that case, assigned Class is leading.	This is because the 75ms for Tmps_pd number already accounted for the effect of the cable impedance and PD capacitance as the PSE limit was 60ms. For Type 3 and 4, we reduced the margin from 15ms to 1ms, but required the PD Tmps_pd to be measured with
SuggestedRemedy	the cable impedance there (meaning that the PD designer had to account for the effect of
Change as follows: "A single-signature PD shall use the I Port_MPS value associated with assigned Class 5 to 8 when pse_assigned_class is 5, 6, 7, or 8, or when PDRequestedPowerValue is greater than 255, but not equal to 0xACAC."	the cap and impedance). However, the sentences (which were separate) got combined into a single sentence when all the numbers were moved to a table, adding the cap/impedance requirement on top of the 15ms margin for the 75ms requirement.
	Also, we should make sure Tmpdo_pd is met with the cable impedance present.
This has become very ugly any better way to specify this ?	SuggestedRemedy
Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. C	Change: "A PD shall meet the TMPS_PD requirement with a series resistance of RCh, which represents the worst case cable resistance between the measurement point and the PD PL."
Change as follows: "A single-signature PD shall use the I Port_MPS value associated with assigned Class 5 to 8 when pse_assigned_class is 5, 6, 7, or 8, or when PDRequestedPowerValue is in the range of 256 to 999. When PDRequestedPowerValue or PSEAllocatedPowerValue is	To: "A PD shall meet the TMPS_PD and TMPDO_PD requirements with any series resistance between 0 Ohms and RCh between the PD PI and the source when long_class_event = TRUE."
equal to 0xACAC, the PD shall use the I Port_MPS value associated with the assigned class.	Response Response Status C
	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
	Change: "A PD shall meet the TMPS_PD requirement with a series resistance of RCh, which represents the worst case cable resistance between the measurement point and the PD PI."

To: "A PD shall meet the TMPS_PD and TMPDO_PD requirements with any series resistance in the range of RChan between the PD PI and the source when long_class_event = TRUE."

Pa **215** Li **44**

Cl 145 SC 145.3. Yseboodt, Lennart	P215 Philips Lighting	L 44	# r02-	65	Cl 145 Maytum, Mich	SC 145.4.1 ael	P 217 RETIRED	L 26	# r02-95
Comment Type TR	Comment Status A			MPS	Comment Typ	e TR	Comment Status R		Isolation
represents the wors Once again we have Also, there is no rea	 T MPS_PD requirement with a case cable resistance between a requirement that only applies son to imply the measurement measuring current, which is identic 	the measuren at a single po nust be made	ment point and th wint (RChan=RCh at the far end of	he PD PI." h).	a 60 s intervoltage is voltage is 10/700 wa propagate together v	erval betweer way to low a as the result o s down the li vith lowering	nsisting of a 1500 V, 10/700 n in pulses." This is technically in nd it is applicable to long dist of an ITU-T global study on te ine dispersion increases the f the peak voltage. An Etherne the more appropriate wavesh	ncorrect for two ance telephone elephone lines. A ront time and tin t cable is nothing	reasons: The peak lines. The 1.5 kV As the lightning surge ne to half value,
Replace by:					SuggestedRe	medy			
"A PD shall meet th	e T MPS_PD requirement with a	series resista	nce in the range	e of 0	Replace i	em "c" of 14	5.4.1 (1.5 kV, 10/700) with ite	m "c" of 126.5.1	(2.4 kV, 1.2/50)
Ohm to R Ch betwe	en the PD PI and the source."				Response		Response Status W		
Response ACCEPT IN PRINC	Response Status C PLE.				, REJECT.				
5	II meet the TMPS_PD requireme worst case cable resistance be				sense to j requireme conflicting	ust change the sa requirement	SE-T MDI are the same in the he PI isolation requirements v me time, in fact not doing this ts. Isolation Ad Hoc working on	vithout changing s at the same tim	g the BASE-T isolation ne could result in
	t the TMPS_PD and TMPDO_PI			S	the isolati	on subclause	es throughout IEEE 802.3. It is	s therefore bette	

resistance in the range of RChan between the PD PI and the source when long_class_event = TRUE."

work and address this issues holistically, including Clause 145.(3) Any change to this text needs to ensure that existing implementation remain conformant.(4) This comment is out of scope as it is on unchanged text.

Pa **217** Li **26**

C/ 145 SC 145.4.1 P217 L 39 # r02-70 Peker, Arkadiy Microsemi Corporation	C/ 145 SC 145.4.1 P217 L39 # r02-119 Darshan, Yair				
Comment Type TR Comment Status A Pres: Darsh					
The requirement in "Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between any one conductor of Mode A and any one conductor of Mode B when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, of either Mode is less than VOff_PD min, as defined in Table 145-29. See Table 79-6f." is impossible to meet due to the following reasons: There are diodes between some of the pins that are low impedance. It should be isolated between pairs of the same polarity that the PSE is required to support only i.e. the requirement should be the minimum requirement to keep interoperability. <i>SuggestedRemedy</i> Change from: "Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between any one conductor of Mode A and any one conductor of Mode B when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, of either Mode is less than VOff_PD min, as defined in Table 145-29. See Table 79-6f." To: "Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between any negative pairs when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, of either Mode is less than VOff_PD min as defined in Table 145-29. See Table 79-6f."	 There are few errors in the text "Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between any one conductor of Mode A and any one conductor of Mode B when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, of either Mode is less than VOff_PD min, as defined in Table 145-29. See Table 79-6f.". a) we can't ask for 10uA leakage current between any one conductor of Mode A and any one conductor of Mode B since there are pins that connected to diodes in forward bias conduction. The intent was to have isolation between pairs of the same polarity at polarity where the PSE guaranteed switching and measures the current/voltage when doing connection check and/or detection. b) The requirement should apply to the negative pairs while for the positive pairs it should be optional and the reason is that the PSE has a mandatory requirement to switch on the negative pairs hence PD is guaranteed to be supported in terms of isolation on the negative pairs but there is not guaranteed for the positive pairs to be supported. c) in addition to (b) there is no technical need to require both sides isolated in the PD since it is not cost effective and it doesn't give any technical value to do it. It actually limits the use of TVS connected to a common point. d) The 10uA isolation requirement value is correct up to 10.1V but need to be higher than 				
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	10uA between 10.1V and 30V since the source of the leakage is voltage depended and leakage current is increased as voltage increased.				
Add sentence "The PSE shall meet all specifications related to current on the negative pa					
or pairs unless otherwise noted." as a new paragraph at the end of the PSE PI section (145.2.4).	Adopt darshan_02_0118.pdf				
On Page 217, line 39	Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
Change: Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between ar one conductor of Mode A and any one conductor of Mode B when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, of either Mode is less than Voff_PD min, as defined in Table 145-29.	Add sentence "The PSE shall meet all specifications related to current on the negative p or pairs unless otherwise noted." as a new paragraph at the end of the PSE PI section (145.2.4).				
To: Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between any negative conductor of Mode A and any negative conductor of Mode B when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, is less than Voff_PD min, as defined in Table 145-29, on either mode.	On Page 217, line 39 Change: Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between any one conductor of Mode A and any one conductor of Mode B when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, of either Mode is less than Voff_PD min, as defined in Table 145-29.				
	To: Dual-signature PDs shall have less than or equal to 10 uA of current between any negative conductor of Mode A and any negative conductor of Mode B when VPD, as defined in 145.1.3, is less than Voff_PD min, as defined in Table 145-29, on either mode.				

Pa **217** Li **39**

C/ 145 SC 145.4.9.4.1 P 229 L 50 # r02-66 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting	C/ 145 SC 145.4.9.4.2 P230 L9 # r02-67 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips Lighting Philips Lighting
Comment Type T Comment Status A AES "Calculations that result in PSANEXT loss values greater than 67 dB shall revert to a requirement of 67 dB minimum." We can shave off a separate shall by incorporating this into the equation. SuggestedRemedy Replace Equation (145-36) as follows: PSANEXT loss - min(67, 70.5 - 20 * log10(f/100))	Comment Type T Comment Status A AES "Calculations that result in PSAFEXT loss values greater than 67 dB shall revert to a requirement of 67 dB minimum." We can shave off a separate shall by incorporating this into the equation. SuggestedRemedy Replace Equation (145-37) as follows: PSAFEXT loss - min(67, 67 - 20 * log10(f/100))
and delete quoted text. Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Editor to update equation and requirement to align with clause 55. [Editor's Note added after comment resolution: replacing a shall that limited the result to 67dB with text from clause 55 that instead states 'results that exceed 67dB are for information only.' The goal is to harmonize 802.3 and get rid of redundant shalls.]	and delete quoted text. Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Editor to update equation and requirement to align with clause 55. [Editor's Note added after comment resolution: replacing a shall that limited the result to 67dB with text from clause 55 that instead states 'results that exceed 67dB are for information only.' The goal is to harmonize 802.3 and get rid of redundant shalls.]
C/ 145 SC 145.4.9.4.2 P 230 L4 # r02-92 Mcclellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor Marvell Semiconductor	C/ 145 SC 145.5.2 P230 L 40 # r02-22 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc. Cisco Systems, Inc. Cisco Systems, Inc. Cisco Systems, Inc.
Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial multiple references to Equation (145-36) in this paragraph should be Equation (145-37) SuggestedRemedy C change "Equation (145-36)" to "Equation (145-37)" in four instances of this paragraph Response Response Status C ACCEPT. C ACCEPT. C C C	Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial DLL field convention is: 'Name' field. 4 errors to this convention in 145.5.2: L40: "PSE allocated power value" field L42: "PD requested power value" field L45: "PD requested power value" field L47: "PD requested power value" field L47: "PD requested power value" field SuggestedRemedy change all to single quotes. L40: 'PSE allocated power value' field L42: 'PD requested power value' field L40: 'PSE allocated power value' field L42: 'PD requested power value' field L42: 'PD requested power value' field L40: 'PSE allocated power value' field L42: 'PD requested power value' field L45: 'PD requested power value' field
	Response Response Status C ACCEPT.

Pa	230	
Li	40	

C/ 145 SC 145.5.3							
	-	L 50	# r02-23	C/ 145C SC 145C	P 295	L11	# r02-120
ones, Chad	Cisco System	s, Inc.		Darshan, Yair			
Comment Type E	Comment Status A		Editorial	Comment Type T	Comment Status D		Anr
p231, L50 p232, L3, L8, L14, L P241, L2, L7, L12, L				system while in actua	is to mention that the current of I system the unbalance as spe esulting with lower cable power	ecified by 145.2.	
P247, L9, L15					after line 11 page 295:		
SuggestedRemedy	and California and South a second				and calculations are derived		
0	ound field names as is the conv	ention.			and 145.3.8.9 which reduces		
Response	Response Status C			cable power dissipation			
ACCEPT.				Proposed Response	Response Status Z		
/ 145 SC 145.5.3	3.2.2 P231	L 52	# r02-117	REJECT.			
arshan, Yair				This comment was W	ITHDRAWN by the commenter	er.	
<i>comment Type</i> E The link to MirroredP	Comment Status D PDAutoclassRequest is Table 14	45-39 and not Ta	Pres: Yseboodt2 able 145-38	C/ 145C SC 145C.1	P 295	L 24	# r02-17
uggestedRemedy				Jones, Chad	Cisco System	is, inc.	
Change from Table	145-38 to Table 145-39			Comment Type E	Comment Status A		Edito
Proposed Response	145-38 to Table 145-39 Response Status Z				me so that it doesn't encroach	the arrow.	Edito
5				move 'IL =0.6A up so	me so that it doesn't encroach	the arrow.	Edito
Proposed Response REJECT.		ır.		move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lir	me so that it doesn't encroach ne 4	the arrow.	Edito
roposed Response REJECT. This comment was V	Response Status Z		n.	move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lin SuggestedRemedy make the change as o Response	me so that it doesn't encroach ne 4	the arrow.	Edito
This comment was with the second seco	Response Status Z VITHDRAWN by the commente vithdrawn before the start of com 3.2.5 P239	nment resolution	n. # [r <u>02-68</u>]	move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lir <i>SuggestedRemedy</i> make the change as o	me so that it doesn't encroach ne 4 commented	the arrow.	Edito # r02-19
This comment was v This comment was v This comment was v 145 SC 145.5.3 seboodt, Lennart	Response Status Z VITHDRAWN by the commenter withdrawn before the start of commenter start of commenter starts P239 B.2.5 P239 Philips Lightin	nment resolution	# <u>r02-68</u>	move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lin SuggestedRemedy make the change as o Response ACCEPT.	me so that it doesn't encroach ne 4 commented <i>Response Status</i> C	L34	
This comment was W This comment was W This comment was w 145 SC 145.5.3 Seboodt, Lennart comment Type E	Response Status Z VITHDRAWN by the commente vithdrawn before the start of com 3.2.5 P239	nment resolution L14 g	# <u>r02-68</u> Editorial	move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lir SuggestedRemedy make the change as o Response ACCEPT. Cl 145C SC 145C.2 Jones, Chad Comment Type E	me so that it doesn't encroach the 4 commented <i>Response Status</i> C <i>P</i> 297 Cisco System <i>Comment Status</i> A	L 34 ns, Inc.	# <u>r02-19</u>
roposed Response REJECT. This comment was V This comment was v 145 SC 145.5.3 seboodt, Lennart omment Type E Need Wider INITIAL	Response Status Z VITHDRAWN by the commenter withdrawn before the start of com 3.2.5 P239 Philips Lightin Comment Status A	nment resolution L14 g	# <u>r02-68</u> Editorial	move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lin SuggestedRemedy make the change as of Response ACCEPT. Cl 145C SC 145C.2 Jones, Chad Comment Type E missing space: along	me so that it doesn't encroach the 4 commented <i>Response Status</i> C <i>P</i> 297 Cisco System	L 34 ns, Inc.	
This comment was V This comment was V This comment was V 145 SC 145.5.3 seboodt, Lennart comment Type E Need Wider INITIAL	Response Status Z VITHDRAWN by the commenter withdrawn before the start of com 3.2.5 P239 Philips Lightin Comment Status A	nment resolution <i>L</i> 14 g to have statem	# <u>r02-68</u> Editorial	move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lin SuggestedRemedy make the change as a Response ACCEPT. Cl 145C SC 145C.2 Jones, Chad Comment Type E missing space: along SuggestedRemedy	me so that it doesn't encroach the 4 commented <i>Response Status</i> C <i>P</i> 297 Cisco System <i>Comment Status</i> A with other worstcase elements	L 34 ns, Inc.	# <u>r02-19</u>
Proposed Response REJECT. This comment was V This comment was v C/ 145 SC 145.5.3 (seboodt, Lennart Comment Type E Need Wider INITIAL SuggestedRemedy	Response Status Z VITHDRAWN by the commenter withdrawn before the start of common start of comment start of comment Status P239 Philips Lightin Comment Status A IZE block, same width as IDLE, IZE block, same width as IDLE,	nment resolution <i>L</i> 14 g to have statem	# <u>r02-68</u> Editorial	move 'IL =0.6A up so Same for page 296 lin SuggestedRemedy make the change as a Response ACCEPT. Cl 145C SC 145C.2 Jones, Chad Comment Type E missing space: along SuggestedRemedy	me so that it doesn't encroach the 4 commented <i>Response Status</i> C <i>P</i> 297 Cisco System <i>Comment Status</i> A	L 34 ns, Inc.	# <u>r02-19</u>

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	Pa 297	Page 37 of 38
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 34	2/12/2018 3:26:20 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line		

C/ 145C Jones, Chad	SC 145C.3	P 2 9	98 L: Systems, Inc.	3 #	r02-18
Comment Ty		Comment Status			Editorial
contents	of the column w	vere converted to A	but the heading	was left mA.	
SuggestedRe	emedy				
Change heading of third column of Table 145C-1 from 'Icond (mA)' to 'Icond (A)'					
Response		Response Status	С		

ACCEPT.

Pa **298** Li **3**