

PI – Definition – Comment 141, Maintenance Request 1273

IEEE 802.3: 4PPOE Task Force

George Zimmerman, Ph.D.
CME Consulting

Comment 141

CI 33	SC 33.1.3	P 21	L 38	# 141
Jones, Chad		Cisco		

Comment Type	T	Comment Status	D	Definitions
--------------	---	----------------	---	-------------

Maintenance Request #1273 on behalf of George Zimmerman, CME Consulting/LTC

Text in the existing standard is ambiguous and is inconsistent with the more precise definition in the definitions section. The imprecise language "generic term" does not point to a specific interface point necessary for the specifications attached to the PI, including a pin-out. In contrast the language in the definitions section is more precise.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: The Power Interface (PI) is the generic term that refers to the mechanical and electrical interface between the PSE or PD and the transmission medium.

To: The Power Interface (PI) is the mechanical and electrical interface between the Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE) or Powered Device (PD) and the transmission medium as defined in 1.4.324 (1.4.336 in P802.3bx/D2.0). In an Endpoint PSE and in a PD the Power Interface is the MDI as defined in 1.4.256 (1.4.268 in P802.3bx/D2.0)

Proposed Response	Response Status	W
-------------------	-----------------	---

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Definition of PI in IEEE Std. 802.3-2012

- Definitions applicable to the standard are in Clause 1.4
- PI is a term defined there

1.4.324 Power Interface (PI): The mechanical and electrical interface between the Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE) or Powered Device (PD) and the transmission medium. In an Endpoint PSE and in a PD the Power Interface is the MDI.

- “The mechanical and electrical interface between the Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE) or Powered Device (PD) and the transmission medium. In an Endpoint PSE and in a PD the Power Interface is the MDI.”

Clause 33 Paraphrases & May Change This Meaning

- 33.1.3 paraphrases the definition, and, as a result causes confusion, making it imprecise.

“The Power Interface (PI) is the generic term that refers to the mechanical and electrical interface between the PSE or PD and the transmission medium.

In an Endpoint PSE and in a PD, the PI is encompassed within the MDI.”

Confusion Results

- “generic term” – makes it imprecise
 - Interface points, where specs are defined, need precise definitions
- “is encompassed within the MDI” vs. “is the MDI”
 - Are these the same?
- Proposed fix – use the more definition already in the standard.

Proposed Fix (Accept in Principle)

- Change:

“The Power Interface (PI) is the generic term that refers to the mechanical and electrical interface between the PSE or PD and the transmission medium.

In an Endpoint PSE and in a PD, the PI is encompassed within the MDI.”

- To:

“The Power Interface (PI) is the mechanical and electrical interface between the Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE) or Powered Device (PD) and the transmission medium as defined in 1.4.324 (1.4.336 in P802.3bx/D2.0).

In an Endpoint PSE and in a PD the Power Interface is the MDI as defined in 1.4.256 (1.4.268 in P802.3bx/D2.0)”