

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 104 SC 104.3.3.6 P 42 L 33 # 104  
 Dove, Daniel Dove Networking Solut

Comment Type T Comment Status D resubmit (late)

This is a question: Currently we assign pi\_powered<=TRUE in the POWER\_UP state. Is there any issue with doing it here, vs the POWER\_ON state where things are likely to be more stable?

SuggestedRemedy

Task force to discuss and resolve the question.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

See comment 119.

Assigning TRUE to pi\_powered during POWER\_UP state is consistent with what is done in PoE.

Cl 104 SC 104.3.3.6 P 42 L 48 # 105  
 Dove, Daniel Dove Networking Solut

Comment Type E Comment Status D resubmit (late)

VERY Minor Nit: The arc logic from RESTART and RESTART\_DELAY statements are too close to the boxes, causing the "\_" characters to be partially obscured.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the arc statements up a tiddly bit.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

See comment 392.

Cl 104 SC 104.3.3.6 P 42 L 48 # 106  
 Dove, Daniel Dove Networking Solut

Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)

In SLEEP state, pi\_sleeping<=TRUE and pi\_powered<=FALSE assignments are redundant. The SETTLE\_SLEEP state asserts these values and there is no other way into the SLEEP state, so they are redundant.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove those two value assignments

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See comment 11.

Cl 30 SC 30.14.1.1.5 P 22 L 28 # 129  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor

Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)

"typeAB" should read "typeB"

SuggestedRemedy

See comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

See comment 262.

Cl 30 SC 30.14.1.1.5 P 22 L 33 # 130  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor

Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)

missing a space "...clause 104.4.1.This value..."

SuggestedRemedy

See comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 30 SC 30.14.1.1.5 P 24 L 33 # 131  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor

Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)

there is no ERROR state. Should be OVERLOAD state.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Search and replace on "ERROR state" and replace with "OVERLOAD state".

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 30 SC 30.14.1.4 P 25 L 1 # 132  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 aPSECumulativeEnergy should read aPoDLPSECumulativeEnergy  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.a1 P 28 L 26 # 136  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 missing a period "shown in Table 45-211f The default value"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 30 SC 30.14.1.4 P 25 L 5 # 133  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 add punctuation to increment rate, ie 100,000 per second  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.a1 P 28 L 28 # 137  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 found the extra period. remove second period @ end of sentence  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2 P 27 L 25 # 134  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Bits b.5.15:11 are defined as Reserved w/ value always 0 and Bit m.5.12 is defined as Power Unit present. How can these definitions exist simultaneously?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change Reserved row from b 5.15:11 to b 5.15:13  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.a.1.2 P 29 L 7 # 138  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 mr\_pse\_enable is not defined in 104.3.3.3 (or anywhere)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change PSE state machine variable 'pse\_enable' to 'mr\_pse\_enable'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.  
 Search and replace "pse\_enable" with "mr\_pse\_enable".

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.a P 28 L 19 # 135  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 missing a space "Status 2register"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.2.1 P 30 L 27 # 139  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 there is no ERROR state in the PSE SD. Should be OVERLOAD state.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.2.8 P 31 L 15 # 142  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 PSE Status is (12.1.2:0), written incorrectly as (12.1.3:1)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.2.2 P 30 L 32 # 140  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 mr\_valid\_signature is not defined in 104.3.3.3 (or anywhere)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change PSE state machine variable 'valid\_signature' to 'mr\_valid\_signature'  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 Search and replace "valid\_signature" with "mr\_valid\_signature".  
 See comment 331.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.6 P 49 L 19 # 143  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 DO DETECTION' should be 'DO\_DETECTION'  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.2.5 P 30 L 52 # 141  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 there is no ERROR state in the PSE SD. Should be OVERLOAD state here.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.6 P 49 L 22 # 144  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 sccp\_watchdog\_tmr' should be 'sccp\_watchdog\_timer'  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.6 P 49 L 29 # 145  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 sccp\_watchdog\_tmr' should be 'sccp\_watchdog\_timer'  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 104 SC 104.4.4 P 49 L 46 # 146  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 Remove indent at beginning of line 46.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 51 L 1 # 150  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 Table 104-6 title should have 'continued' at top of page 51  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.4 P 49 L 49 # 147  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 There are only two characteristics in table 104-5.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete 'at least' from sentence.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 51 L 51 # 151  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 See 104.4.6.2' is not linked  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.4 P 50 L 5 # 148  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 Vconnector' should just be 'Vpd' in Table 104-4  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 51 L 51 # 152  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 "See 104.4.6.2" is not linked  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.4 P 50 L 18 # 149  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 lconnector' should just be 'lpd' in Table 104-5  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 30 SC 30.14.1 P 20 L 50 # 153  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 Missing period at end of sentence.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 30 SC 30.14.1.1.4 P 22 L 12 # 154  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 "typeAB" should read "typeB"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.  
 See comment 262.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.2.9 P 31 L 21 # 155  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 PSE Status is (12.1.2:0), written incorrectly as (12.1.3:1)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.2.9 P 31 L 25 # 156  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 error\_condition is not defined in 104.3.3.3 (or anywhere)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 propose changing this reference from "error\_condition" to "overload\_detected" in the text  
 and table 45-211g  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7a.3.1 P 32 L 4 # 157  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 PSE Status is (12.1.2:0), written incorrectly as (12.1.3:1)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.3.5 P 42 L 41 # 158  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Separate "offull" into "of" and "full"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.  
 See comment 13.

Cl 104 SC 104.3.6 P 43 L 14 # 159  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Item 3 references subclause 104.3.6.1 but there is nothing there relating to transients.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Reference 104.3.6.3 instead. Change noise to transients in 104.3.6.3.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 104 SC 104.3.6 P 43 L 38 # 160  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 Fix indent on item 6.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.3.6.1 P 44 L 29 # 161  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 Subclause 104.3.6.1 is referenced by item #1 in table 104-3 but there is nothing in 104.3.6.1 relating to VPSE(PON)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add the following text to 104.3.6.1: "A PSE operating in the POWER\_ON state shall apply a voltage in the range of PSE(PON) at the PI.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.1 P 46 L 44 # 162  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 tpwr\_delay is not defined  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to tpowerdly  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.1 P 46 L 44 # 163  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 tpwr\_delay' should be 'tpowerdly'  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment 403.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 47 L 51 # 164  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 PPD should be Ppd  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.1 P 52 L 4 # 165  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D resubmit (late)  
 "The PD shall turn off at a voltage greater than or equal to Voff" should be "The PD shall turn off at a voltage less than the range of Von and greater than or equal to Voff min as defined in Table 104-6."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.1 P 52 L 6 # 166  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Change Vport\_PSE to just Vpse for consistency.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.2 P 52 L 19 # 167  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Twakeup\_PD shouldn't wrap at the end of the line.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.3 P 52 L 26 # 168  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Replace 'input power of the device' with just 'Ppd'.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.3 P 52 L 26 # 169  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Vport\_PD' should be 'Vpd'  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.4 P 52 L 35 # 170  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Replace 'Pclass\_PD' with just 'Ppd'.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**  
 PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.4 P 52 L 35 # 171  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 reference to Pclass\_pd in table 104-1. There is no Pclass\_pd but there is a Ppd. Are these the same?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change text from Pclass\_pd to Ppd.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Use Ppd throughout.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.5 P 52 L 44 # 172  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Remove all instances of 'port\_' from the subscripts used by Equation 104-1.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

IEEE802.3bu One Pair Power over Datalines Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 104 SC 104.5.1 P 52 L 18 # 173  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 A PD shall provide DC isolation.' is not quantified making a compliance test meaningless.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Propose "A PD shall ... all MDI leads of greater than 1 megaohm for voltages up to 60V".  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See 344.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.2 P 56 L 18 # 174  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Change 'slots' to 'slot' in this sentence.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.4 P 57 L 47 # 175  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Add 'voltage' to the parameter descriptions for items 2 and 3 in table 104-7.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.4 P 58 L 9 # 176  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 Add 'time' to parameter descriptions for items 9-15  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC Table 104-1 P 32 L 21 # 177  
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology  
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D** resubmit (late)  
 The assumption that the reference channel resistance is 15m of 26 AWG is limiting for PoDL.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Consider changing the reference channel to 15m of 22 AWG.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**  
 PROPOSED REJECT.  
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.