

IEEE P802.3bw D1.3 100BASE-T1 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 1.4.x P 20 L 29 # 1 [REDACTED]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 comma missing in "IEEE Std 802.3 96.4.4"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "IEEE Std 802.3, 96.4.4"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.x P 20 L 16 # 4 [REDACTED]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 For the definitions in 1.4 the colon at the end of the term to be defined should be bold.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the colons after 4B/3B and SYMB_ID to be bold font.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P L # 2 [REDACTED]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The convention for headings, table titles and figure titles in 802.3 is to capitalise only the first letter unless they contain a proper noun.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct the capitalisation of the titles of: 96.4.7, 96.5.4, 96.5.4.1, 96.7.1.1, 96.10.4.4, Annex 96A title, 96A.1, 96A.2
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.x P 20 L 25 # 5 [REDACTED]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In the definition "1.4.x SYMB_ID", 96.2.5.1 and 96.2.6.1 should be cross-references
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make 96.2.5.1 and 96.2.6.1 cross-references
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.165 P 18 L 30 # 3 [REDACTED]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In the 802.3 revision D2.1 an additional definition for "Company Identifier (CID)" has been inserted as 1.4.162. This has had the effect of increasing the subclause number of definitions that were 1.4.162 and higher by one.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the subclause number of all of the existing definitions being modified that have subclause numbers above 1.4.162 by one.
 This will result in "1.4.165 Control mode" becoming "1.4.166 Control mode" through to "1.4.397 ternary symbol" becoming "1.4.398 ternary symbol".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.x P 20 L 16 # 6 [REDACTED]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The position for the new definitions should be defined so that the editor applying the amendment knows where they go and they should be given individual numbers so that they can be cross-referenced.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "1.4.x 100BASE-T1" to "1.4.16a 100BASE-T1"
 Change "1.4.x 4B/3B" to "1.4.87a 4B/3B"
 Change "1.4.x FORCE mode" to "1.4.221a FORCE mode"
 Change "1.4.x SYMB_ID:" to "1.4.392a SYMB_ID:"
 Give each new definition its own Insert editing instruction. For example make the instruction for 100BASE-T1:
 Insert the following new definition into the list after 1.4.16 100BASE-T:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3bw D1.3 100BASE-T1 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.10 P 23 L 27 # 9
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The table for PMA/PMD extended ability register bit definitions should be Table 45-14 rather than Table 45-13
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to Table 45-14
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 96 SC 95.5.3 P 61 L 14 # 13
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In Figures 96-18 and 96-19 "10K O" should be "10 kO" where "O" stands for capital omega
 SuggestedRemedy
 In Figures 96-18 and 96-19, change "10K O" to "10 kO" where "O" stands for capital omega
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 96 SC 96.5.4.4 P 65 L 32 # 14
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In equations 96-4, 96-5, 96-6, 96-7, 96-8, 96-9, 96-10, and 96-11 there are spaces missing between the number and "MHz"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In equations 96-4, 96-5, 96-6, 96-7, 96-8, 96-9, 96-10, and 96-11 add a space between the number and "MHz" for all instances per equation.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 96 SC 96.5.5.3 P 67 L 5 # 15
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Figure 96-24 has some text in block capitals
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change text in block capital to normal case.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 96 SC 96.10.4.1 P 73 L 31 # 16
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In the Value/Comment columns of the various PICS tables, the entry should start with a capital letter
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make the first letter of the entry in the Value/Comment columns of the various PICS tables a capital letter.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 96 SC 96.10.4.2 P 75 L 6 # 17
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
 Item PCR1 has "See Figure 96-10a and Figure 96-10a"
 Presumably, this should be: "See Figure 96-10a and Figure 96-10b"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "See Figure 96-10a and Figure 96-10b"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3bw D1.3 100BASE-T1 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 96 SC 96.4.2 P 55 L 24 # 18
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

As 45.2.1.7.4 is in the draft, this should be a cross-reference rather than green text.

Same issue for:

- 45.2.1.7.5 in 96.4.3 (Page 55, line 47)
- 45.2.1.7.4 in 96.10.4.3 (Page 75, line 31)
- 45.2.1.7.5 in 96.10.4.3 (Page 75, line 34)
- Figure 96-16 in 96.10.4.3 (Page 75, line 36)

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

- 45.2.1.7.4 in 96.4.2 (Page 55, line 24)
 - 45.2.1.7.5 in 96.4.3 (Page 55, line 47)
 - 45.2.1.7.4 in 96.10.4.3 (Page 75, line 31)
 - 45.2.1.7.5 in 96.10.4.3 (Page 75, line 34)
 - Figure 96-16 in 96.10.4.3 (Page 75, line 36)
- to cross-references

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96 SC 96.10.4.4 P 77 L 14 # 19
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The +/- symbol should not be separated from "100 ppm"

SuggestedRemedy

Move the +/- symbol to the next line

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96A SC 96A P 80 L 1 # 20
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Annex 96A has the wrong draft number and the wrong date in the header.
 (Of course, this would not happen if the method used in the 802.3 template had not been changed.)

SuggestedRemedy

Make the headers consistent throughout the draft.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 99 SC P 1 L 1 # 21
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The P802.3bw amendment will be an amendment to the result of the P802.3bx revision project. This is correctly reflected in the draft from page 17 onwards, but not in the frontmatter or TOC

SuggestedRemedy

Change the base_year variable in the frontmatter and TOC files to 201x

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 99 SC P 13 L 1 # 24
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The table of contents does not reflect the contents of the latest draft (page numbers wrong, headings wrong)

SuggestedRemedy

Make the TOC update properly. (I can help do this if required).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3bw D1.3 100BASE-T1 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 96 SC 96.5.4.4 P 64 L 21 # 41
 Chini, Ahmad Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "pseudo random" should be "pseudo-random", same as page 59 line 30.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "pseudo random" to "pseudo-random" on page 64 line 21.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.326 P 19 L 21 # 58
 Estes, Dave Spirent Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Type, there should be a comma separating Clause 65 and Clause 66.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert a comma between Clause 65 and Clause 66
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96 SC 96.1.1 P 27 L 18 # 42
 Chini, Ahmad Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "100ms" should be "100 ms"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "100ms" to "100 ms" on page 27 line 18
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.x P 20 L 19 # 59
 Estes, Dave Spirent Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Typo, remove "the" before "100BASE-T1"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "technique used by the 100BASE-T1" to "technique used by 100BASE-T1"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96 SC 96.5.4.4 P 64 L 29 # 50
 Chini, Ahmad Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 A period is missing at the end of sentence
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add a period on page 64 line 29.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96 SC 96.3.2.3 P 39 L 32 # 66
 Amason, Dale Freescale
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Figures 96-6a, 96-6b, 96-6c should follow subclause 96.3.2.2.2 where they are referenced.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move figures to follow subclause 96.3.2.2.2
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.325 P 19 L 12 # 57
 Estes, Dave Spirent Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Type, "lause" should be "Clause"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "lause" to "Clause"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96 SC 96.3.2.4 P 43 L 34 # 67
 Amason, Dale Freescale
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Figure 96-8 is drawn with different type face (Times Roman) than other figures in document (Helvetica/Arial).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change type in Figure to be consistent with document.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3bw D1.3 100BASE-T1 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 96 SC 96.4.1 P 53 L 4 # 68

Amason, Dale Freescale

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Clause 28 referenced in Figure 96-13 is not highlighted in green as in other figures.

SuggestedRemedy

Update figure to be consistent with other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96 SC 96.5.3 P 61 L 10 # 69

Amason, Dale Freescale

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Figure 96-20 is drawn with Times Roman type instead of Helvetica.

SuggestedRemedy

Redraw with Helvetica type to be consistent with other figures in document.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 96 SC 96.5.4.3 P 64 L 16 # 70

Amason, Dale Freescale

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Figure 96-22 drawn with Times Roman font instead of Helvetica.

SuggestedRemedy

Redraw figure to be consistent with other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.