Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P*   *L*   # 292
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
copyright_year variable should be 2016 in all clause files

SuggestedRemedy
change copyright_year variable to 2016 in all clause files

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **2**   # 405
Grow, R0obert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
There is an approved amendment with others to come. (Only based on ballot stage
P802.,3bz will be Amendment 8 or9.) Amendments also are listed here.

SuggestedRemedy
Rather than attempting to track approval order, I'd recommend simply a comma followed
by <approved amendments to be added during publication preparation>

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **32**   # 406
Grow, R0obert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Messed up copyright information. It appears that the FM variable copyright year was not
updated to 2016.

SuggestedRemedy
Fix whatever is required to get correct copyright year wherever it appears.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
(duplicate comment)

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **10**   *L* **17**   # 307
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Missing summaries of other ongoing projects

SuggestedRemedy
Please implement comment #i-55 from P802.3bp D3.0
(http://www.ieee802.org/3/bp/comments/8023bp_D30_approved.pdf)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.4.6.1**   *P* **138**   *L* **38**   # 397
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
In Figure 126-26 there are arrows going to a label called "I".
        The drawing of this label is assymetric.

SuggestedRemedy
Make label drawing symmetric.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.5.3.4**   *P* **149**   *L* **10**   # 355
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
"The masks are shown graphically in Figure 126–36" - clearly, these are shown graphically
on a figure …

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "These masks are shown in Figure 126–36"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **149**   Page 1 of 11
Li **10**   3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.1.3.1**　　　　　*P* **149**　　　*L* **9**　　　*#* 357
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Reference to Figure 126–6 would be very helpful here, since that is where the transmit direction is shown

SuggestedRemedy
Change "In the transmit direction" to "In the transmit direction (see Figure 126-6)" - make sure link is live
In line 26, Change "In the receive direction" to "In the receive direction (see Figure 126-7)" - make sure link is live

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.6**　　　　　　*P* **152**　　　*L* **33**　　　*#* 393
Marris, Arthur　　　　　　　　　　Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
grammar

SuggestedRemedy
change "makes" to "make"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.6.1.2**　　　　　*P* **154**　　　*L* **21**　　　*#* 204
McClellan, Brett　　　　　　　　　Marvell

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
change U25 to match 802.3bq

SuggestedRemedy
change "Reserved, transmit as 0"
to "25GBASE-T ability
(1 = support of 25GBASE-T and 0 = no support)"
add "Defined in 45.2.7.10.4b" under description

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accept comment proposed remedy.

Additionally, U12 and U11 base text need alignment to 802.3bq D3.1. Since Clause 126 is new, there is no need to show edit, text for U12 and U11 should read MultiGBASE-T, without strikeout text or underline markings.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7**　　　　　　*P* **157**　　　*L* **51**　　　*#* 364
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
"effective data rate of 625 Mb/s in each direction simultaneously" - likely, per pair, otherwise the aggregate of 2.5Gbps is not achieved

SuggestedRemedy
Change "effective data rate of 625 Mb/s in each direction simultaneously" to "effective data rate of 625 Mb/s per pair, in each direction simultaneously"
Same change in line 52 for 1250 Mb/s data rate

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.2**　　　　　*P* **158**　　　*L* **39**　　　*#* 270
Flatman, Alan　　　　　　　　　　Independent

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Notes a) and b) are identical.

SuggestedRemedy
Use only Note a)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.2**　　　　　*P* **158**　　　*L* **41**　　　*#* 275
Malicoat, David　　　　　　　　　HPE

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Notes a) and b) are identical.

SuggestedRemedy
Consolidate 'a' and 'b' to a single noe for Table 126-18

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **158**
Li **41**

Page 2 of 11
3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.2**　　　　　*P* **158**　　*L* **41**　　　# 278
Thompson, Geoff　　　　　　GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*
Two footnotes have same content.

SuggestedRemedy
Consolidate into single footnote.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.2**　　　　　*P* **159**　　*L* **11**　　　# 272
Flatman, Alan　　　　　　Independent

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*
Notes a) and b) are identical.

SuggestedRemedy
Use only Note a)

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.2**　　　　　*P* **159**　　*L* **13**　　　# 279
Thompson, Geoff　　　　　　GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*
Two footnotes have same content.

SuggestedRemedy
Consolidate into single footnote.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.2**　　　　　*P* **159**　　*L* **13**　　　# 274
Malicoat, David　　　　　　HPE

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*
Notes a) and b) are identical.

SuggestedRemedy
Consolidate 'a' and 'b' to a single noe for Table 126-19

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.2.4.1**　　　*P* **160**　　*L* **25**　　　# 202
McClellan, Brett　　　　　　Marvell

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*
This paragraph describes MDNEXT loss, but should discuss NEXT loss.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace this paragraph with the following text:

"In order to limit the crosstalk at the near end of a link segment, the differential pair-to-pair near-end crosstalk (NEXT) loss between a duplex channel and the other three duplex channels is specified to meet the bit error rate specified in 126.5.4.1. The NEXT loss between any two 2.5GBASE-T duplex channels of a link segment shall meet the values determined using Equation (126–13). The NEXT loss between any two 5GBASE-T duplex channels of a link segment shall meet the values determined using Equation (126–14). The factor of 2 in Equation (126–13) and Equation (126–14) corresponds to the number of connectors at the near-end of the duplex channels."

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.7.3.1**　　　　*P* **165**　　*L* **8**　　　# 203
McClellan, Brett　　　　　　Marvell

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*
font size is wrong

SuggestedRemedy
fix font size

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Editor to reformat equation as necessary and provide consistent font size.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.8.2.2**　　　　*P* **169**　　*L* **28**　　　# 284
Thompson, Geoff　　　　　　GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*
"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to WG ballot)" hasn't been.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove editor's note.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **169**
Li **28**

Page 3 of 11
3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.12**   *P* **172**   *L* **1**   # 371
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    Seems like tables for PICS were moved from page 172 to 173 for some reason.

SuggestedRemedy
    Please bring initial tables to under 126.12

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.12.1**   *P* **173**   *L* **1**   # 304
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    126.12.1 through 126.12.1.2 should be on the same page as the 126.12 heading

SuggestedRemedy
    Fix the pagination.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.12.1.2**   *P* **173**   *L* **20**   # 305
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    "IEEE Std 802.3-201x" should be "IEEE Std 802.3bz-201x"

SuggestedRemedy
    Change "IEEE Std 802.3-201x" to "IEEE Std 802.3bz-201x" in two places

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **28B**   *SC* **28B.3**   *P* **187**   *L* **14**   # 344
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    Editor's note in line 14 is not needed

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove, editorial instruction is clear already

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **28C**   *SC* **28C.11**   *P* **188**   *L* **15**   # 345
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    missing serial comma after "Clause 126 (2.5G/5GBASE-T)" in line 15

SuggestedRemedy
    Per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **28C**   *SC* **28C.11**   *P* **188**   *L* **19**   # 346
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    Extra space not shown in strike-through in "55.6.1, and 113.6.1"

SuggestedRemedy
    Show one of spaces in strike-through either before or after "and"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **113A**   *SC* **113A**   *P* **191**   *L* **1**   # 347
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    Remove Annex 113A since it has no content. All comments on Annex 113A should be
    directed to 3bq, where the Annex is currently included

SuggestedRemedy
    Per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **2**   *L* **1**   # 407
Grow, R0obert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    Punctuation and grammar. Starts with a sentence fragment (no verb, not full stop).

SuggestedRemedy
    Delete "This amendment" following the sentence fragment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT. (duplicate comment)

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Pa* **2**   Page 4 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Li* **1**   3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **2**　　*L* **1**　　# 306

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Unnecessary "This amendment"

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "This amendment"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
"This amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 This amendment defines Ethernet Media"
(delete second occurence)

Cl **FM**　　*SC*　　　　　　　*P* **2**　　*L* **46**　　# 386

Lusted, Kent　　　　　　Intel

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Update copyright date to 2016

SuggestedRemedy

Update copyright date to 2016

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1**　　*SC* **1.4.131a**　　　　*P* **21**　　*L* **40**　　# 293

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Editing instruction should say where this definition can be found.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Change definition for Category 8 balanced cabling, as shown:" to "Change
1.4.131a as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bq-201x, as follows:"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1**　　*SC* **1.4.131a**　　　　*P* **21**　　*L* **40**　　# 308

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Category 8 definition does not exist in 802.3bx standard and it is an addition to existing
standard. Editorial instruction seems to imply it is already in the base standard

SuggestedRemedy

Change editorial instruction in line 40 to read: "Change definition for Category 8 balanced
cabling, as added by P802.3XXXX-201X, as shown:" - update project reference + year for
the specific amendment that added this definition in the first place.
Likely, P802.3bq is the source of this text

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change editing instruction to read:
"Change definition for Category 8 balanced cabling, (as inserted by IEEE 802.3bq-201x) as
shown:"

Cl **1**　　*SC* **1.4.131a**　　　　*P* **21**　　*L* **42**　　# 211

Shariff, Masood　　　　　CommScope

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

1.4.131aCategory 8 balanced cabling:

Need a space after 131a

SuggestedRemedy

1.4.131a Category 8 balanced cabling:

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1**　　*SC* **1.4.277b**　　　　*P* **22**　　*L* **1**　　# 309

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Just for symmetry - definition includes statement: "for both 25GBASE-T and 40GBASE-T",
it might be better to emphasize the fact that Clause 126 specifies both 2.5G and 5G BASE-
T

SuggestedRemedy

Change "2.5GBASE-T and 5GBASE-T" to "for both 2.5GBASE-T and 5GBASE-T"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **22**
Li **1**

Page 5 of 11
3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM

Cl **1**　　*SC* **1.4.277b**　　　*P* **22**　　*L* **1**　　# `387`
Lusted, Kent　　　　　　　　Intel

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*EZ*
Since Clause 126 and Clause 113 have references to the specific BASE-T PHYs with the clause, it would be useful to add a "(10GBASE-T)" after Clause 55.

SuggestedRemedy
add a "(10GBASE-T)" after Clause 55.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **4**　　*SC* **4.4.2**　　　*P* **23**　　*L* **5**　　# `311`
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*EZ*
Two editorial issues:
(1) no subheading 4.4 is shown (and should be)
(2) changes to table 4-2 are not shown in underline (and should be)

SuggestedRemedy
(1) Insert missing subheading 4.4 with title name
(2) show changes to Table 4-2 in underline

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **4**　　*SC* **4.4.2**　　　*P* **23**　　*L* **54**　　# `391`
Marris, Arthur　　　　　　　Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*EZ*
No page number

SuggestedRemedy
Add page numbers on pages 23 and 24

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　*P* **3**　　*L* **0**　　# `288`
Chalupsky, David　　　　　　Intel Corp.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*EZ*
correct nomenclature: there are many instances of "2.5/5GBASE-T" as well as "2.5G/5GBASE-T". 2.5G/5GBASE-T is preferred

SuggestedRemedy
replace all instances of "2.5/5G/BASE-T" with 2.5G/5GBASE-T. This appears in the header, ToC, section headings, state diagrams, as well as throughout the text.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.4**　　*P* **32**　　*L* **23**　　# `402`
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*EZ*
Odd structure for Ed Inst
"Change Reserved row and
Insert rows below it in Table 45-6 to include speeds of 2.5Gb/s and 5Gb/s as shown (unchanged rows not
shown):."

SuggestedRemedy
Remove line feed & period after colon.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.4**　　*P* **32**　　*L* **24**　　# `315`
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*EZ*
Editorial note broken into two lines

SuggestedRemedy
Change the note to read: "Change Reserved row and insert rows below the Reserved row in Table 45-6 to include speeds of 2.5Gb/s and 5Gb/s as shown (unchanged rows not shown):"
Mark rows 1.4.14 and 1.4.13 with underline (this is inserted text versus text already in place)
Similar issue in 45.2.3.7 (text broken into two lines) + missing underline for register 3.8.12

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **32**
Li **24**

Page 6 of 11
3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.4**　　　　　*P* **32**　　　*L* **43**　　　# `316`
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*
Incorrect editorial note - these are subclauses. Also, no reference where they are expected to be inserted at

SuggestedRemedy
Change "Insert two new clauses following 45.2.1.4 as follows:" to "Insert two following subclauses before 45.2.1.4.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.6**　　　　　*P* **33**　　　*L* **11**　　　# `372`
Chacon, Geoffrey　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*
Missing -T from 2.5GBASE-T PMA

SuggestedRemedy
Replace 2.5GBASE-PMA for 2.5GBASE-T PMA

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.6**　　　　　*P* **33**　　　*L* **13**　　　# `294`
Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*
"2.5GBASE-PMA" should be "2.5GBASE-T PMA"

SuggestedRemedy
Change "2.5GBASE-PMA" to "2.5GBASE-T PMA"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.10.a**　　　*P* **34**　　　*L* **27**　　　# `317`
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*
No editorial note for 45.2.1.10.a

SuggestedRemedy
Please insert editorial note before 45.2.1.10.a, or extend editorial note on page 34, line 15 to include reference to a new subclause being added

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Insert editing instruction to "Insert new subclause, 45.2.1.10.a before 45.2.1.10.1 as follows: " prior to header for 45.2.1.10.a (P34 L27)

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.14g**　　　*P* **34**　　　*L* **34**　　　# `318`
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*
These are subclauses, not clauses

SuggestedRemedy
Change "clauses" to "subclauses" on page 34, line 34

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.78**　　　*P* **37**　　　*L* **34**　　　# `319`
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*
Two editorial issues:
(1) missing "," after "e.g."
(2) missing space between numeral and unit in "1.25ns for 10GBASE-T"

SuggestedRemedy
(1) Make sure there is "," after "e.g." in text that is being added or modified (minor change)
(2) Make sure that units and numerals are separated with a non-breakable space
There are multiple instances for each fix

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　*Pa* **37**　　Page 7 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　*Li* **34**　　3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.6**   *P* **40**   *L* **13**   # 373

Chacon, Geoffrey   Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Change 2.5GBASE-R PCS for 2.5GBASE-T PCS

SuggestedRemedy

Change 2.5GBASE-R PCS for 2.5GBASE-T PCS

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.6**   *P* **40**   *L* **14**   # 322

Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

"Select 2.5GBASE-R PCS type" - I do not believe you're adding 2.5GBASE-R type

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Select 2.5GBASE-R PCS type" to "Select 2.5GBASE-T PCS type"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.7.1a**   *P* **40**   *L* **38**   # 296

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Editing instruction should be more specific.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Insert new clause after 45.2.3.7.1 as follows:" to "Insert 45.2.3.7.1a and 45.2.3.7.1b after 45.2.3.7.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.9a**   *P* **41**   *L* **1**   # 297

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Incorrect editing instruction. 45.2.3.9a is being inserted by P802.3bq

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "Insert 3 new clauses and Table 45-125a after 45.2.3.9.11 as shown:

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.9a.a**   *P* **41**   *L* **21**   # 298

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Editing instruction should be more specific.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Insert 2 new clauses after 45.2.3.9a and before 45.2.3.9a.1, both inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bq-201x, as shown:" to "Insert 45.2.3.9a.a and 45.2.3.9a.b before 45.2.3.9a.1, as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bq-201x, as follows:"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(difference is parentheses around ref to 802.3bq)

Change "Insert 2 new clauses after 45.2.3.9a and before 45.2.3.9a.1, both inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bq-201x, as shown:" to "Insert 45.2.3.9a.a and 45.2.3.9a.b before 45.2.3.9a.1 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bq-201x) as follows:"

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.13.4**   *P* **41**   *L* **52**   # 326

Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Odd green markup in "10GBASE-T, and"

SuggestedRemedy

take a look at PDF and remove green underline

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.13.5**   *P* **42**   *L* **3**   # 327

Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

It seems that 45.2.3.13.5 is also modified by .3bq, but the note does not accoutn for it

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the note to indicate that this text is modified as previously modified by .3bq

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change editing instruction to state "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bq-201x"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Pa* **42**   Page 8 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Li* **3**   3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7**　　　　*P* **42**　　*L* **49**　　# 328

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

One more broken editorial note

SuggestedRemedy

please pull it together into a single text block. No need to separate "Insert" from the rest of the text
Same on page 44, line 3

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.14b.a**　　*P* **50**　　*L* **38**　　# 332

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Text in 45.2.7.14b.a and 45.2.7.14b.b seems to be larger by 2 points than in other subclauses

SuggestedRemedy

Please apply proper style (T,Text) in para in 45.2.7.14b.a and 45.2.7.14b.b

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.3.2**　　　*P* **51**　　*L* **14**　　# 333

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Unnecessary "," in Subclause column entries for *2.5T and *5T entries

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **46**　　*SC* **46.1**　　　　*P* **53**　　*L* **7**　　# 334

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

It is "subclause" and not "Clause"

SuggestedRemedy

Change all instances of the word "Clause" to "Subclause/subclause" (as needed) when referencing second and lower heading numbers - there are multiple instances in the draft

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **78**　　*SC* **78.2**　　　　*P* **57**　　*L* **34**　　# 300

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

1.2.6 states: "Unless otherwise stated, numerical limits in this standard are to be taken as exact, with the number of significant digits and trailing zeros having no significance."

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 78–2 remove the trailing zeros from "12.80" and "6.40"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **125**　　*SC* **125.1.2**　　*P* **59**　　*L* **24**　　# 336

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Text in lines 24 -31 does not use proper formatting

SuggestedRemedy

Please apply proper lettered list stype

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **125**　　*SC* **125.1.4**　　*P* **61**　　*L* **23**　　# 301

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

In Table 125–2, "46" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 125–2, make "46" a cross-reference

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **61**
Li **23**

Page 9 of 11
3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM

Cl **125** *SC* **125.2.2** *P* **62** *L* **4** # 302

Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"gray-coded" should be "Gray-coded"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "gray-coded" to "Gray-coded"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **125** *SC* **125.2.3** *P* **62** *L* **9** # 341

Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Network

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Incorrect text format - no visible separation between two paras

SuggestedRemedy

Please apply "T,Text" style to both paragraphs in lines 8-16

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126** *SC* **126.1** *P* **65** *L* **21** # 349

Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Network

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"2.5Gb/s or 5Gb/s" - missing space between numercal and unit

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "2.5 Gb/s or 5 Gb/s", make sure non-breaking space is used
Scrub the draft as a whole

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126** *SC* **126.1** *P* **65** *L* **9** # 303

Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

There should be a non-breaking space (Ctrl space) between a number and its unit.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a non-breaking space in 2.5Gb/s and 5Gb/s (two instances each)

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126** *SC* **126.1.2** *P* **66** *L* **26** # 351

Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Network

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Text: "* XGMII IS OPTIONAL" seems too close to caption of the figure - consider moving it upwards and right, where XGMII is defined

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126** *SC* **126.1.2** *P* **66** *L* **5** # 416

Trowbridge, Steve Alcatel-Lucent

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Several sloppy things in the drawing of Figure 126.1. The shaded vertical lines on either side of "HIGHER LAYERS" are different widths. The dotted line at the bottom of the PHYSICAL box in the ISO stack and the MEDIUM symbol doesn't line up with the boxes it attaches to on either side, and overlaps the MEDIUM box.

SuggestedRemedy

Zoom in close and nudge the elements of this figure to line up.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126** *SC* **126.1.3** *P* **69** *L* **19** # 417

Trowbridge, Steve Alcatel-Lucent

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

The vertical lines with the arrowheads on the left hand side for PCS and PMA don't line up.

SuggestedRemedy

Nudge the PCS line to the left or the PMA line to the right so they line up.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general *Pa* **69** Page 10 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn *Li* **19** 3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.1.3.3**　　　　*P* **71**　　　*L* **26**　　# 360
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　Bright House Network

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Avoid the use of "will" - change "that will be mapped into a single 64B/65B block" to "that is then mapped into a single 64B/65B block"

SuggestedRemedy
Make sure there are no unnecessary instances of "will" outside of FM.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See BQ ALIGN comments

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.3.2**　　　　*P* **83**　　　*L* **10**　　# 418
Trowbridge, Steve　　　　　　Alcatel-Lucent

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Several sloppy things in the drawing of Figure 126-5. The arrowheads for scr_status and PMA_UNITDATA.request overlap the dashed boxes next to them with which they are unrelated. The gap in the vertical line at the left for PCS is too wide - consider making PCS vertical text and even it out in the gap.

SuggestedRemedy
Tidy up the figure

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.3.2.2.8**　　*P* **89**　　　*L* **6**　　# 419
Trowbridge, Steve　　　　　　Alcatel-Lucent

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Several sloppy things in Figure 126-8 should be cleaned up. The words "Bit Position:" has the colon on the wrong side of the line for the box it is in. The character designations for the control block formats (e.g., C0C1C2C3/C4C5C6C7) aren't centered in the boxes and some run up against the line on the right.

SuggestedRemedy
Tidy up the figure

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **all**　　　*L* **99**　　# 289
Chalupsky, David　　　　　　Intel Corp.

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
change copyright to 2016

SuggestedRemedy
change copyright date in footer to "2016'

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **all**
Li **99**

Page 11 of 11
3/5/2016 6:11:39 PM