

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D1.4 25/50G-EPON Task Force 5th Task Force review comments

Cl 1 SC 1.4.128d P20 L11 # 392
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 50/50-EPON - Missing "G"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to 50/50G-EPON
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.129a P20 L15 # 330
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 speeds
 SuggestedRemedy
 throughputs
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 The change would imply MAC level throughput, which is not what the speed designator is for.

Cl 31A SC 31A P22 L16 # 331
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 recipient stop
 SuggestedRemedy
 recipient stops
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Use appropriate markup, since this is base standard text

Cl 31A SC 31A P22 L20 # 332
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 recipient allow
 SuggestedRemedy
 recipient allows
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Use appropriate markup, since this is base standard text

Cl 31A SC 31A P22 L41 # 333
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 recipient allow
 SuggestedRemedy
 recipient allows
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 31A SC 31A P23 L12 # 334
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 Request that recipients to attempt
 SuggestedRemedy
 Request that recipients attempt
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D1.4 25/50G-EPON Task Force 5th Task Force review comments

Cl 31A SC 31A P23 L19 # 363
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 Requests that the recipient stop transmissions in
 SuggestedRemedy
 Request that the recipient stops transmission in
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Use appropriate markup, since this is base standard text

Cl 31A SC 31A P23 L26 # 364
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This frame is used ...
 SuggestedRemedy
 Request that the MAC Control generates ...
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Current text is correct as is.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2 P27 L1 # 367
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 at 25.78125
 SuggestedRemedy
 at a 25.78125
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2 P27 L2 # 368
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 and 25.87125 GBd or 10.3125 GBd
 SuggestedRemedy
 and a 25.87125 GBd or a 10.3125 GBd
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2.1 P27 L15 # 369
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 in 77.4.
 SuggestedRemedy
 in Clause 77.4.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 References to subclauses do not need "Clause" statement.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2.1 P27 L17 # 370
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 plus one or more
 SuggestedRemedy
 and one or more
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D1.4 25/50G-EPON Task Force 5th Task Force review comments

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P29 L19 # 371
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 For ... signaling systems transmit rate
 SuggestedRemedy
 For ... signaling systems the transmit rate
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P29 L26 # 373
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 all of these
 SuggestedRemedy
 all these
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P29 L26 # 372
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 sentence segment: mandatory FEC capability; in particular in Clause 56.1.2, the term "mandatory FEC function" is used.
 SuggestedRemedy
 mandatory FEC function
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P29 L29 # 374
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 a new table 56-4 and Changing existing
 SuggestedRemedy
 a new Table 56-4 and changing the existing
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.1.1 P34 L19 # 375
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 OLT to the ONU
 SuggestedRemedy
 OLT to the ONUs OR OLT to an ONU
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "OLT to ONUs"

Cl 141 SC 141.3.1.5 P41 L48 # 284
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing link in red
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use "141.3.5" + make link live
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.9.1 P60 L41 # 413
 Ferretti, Vince Corning
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 Insertion loss is not specified in Table 141.21
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "specified in Tables 141.1 through 141.5"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change to "specified in Table 141-1 through Table 141-5". Make links live.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D1.4 25/50G-EPON Task Force 5th Task Force review comments

Cl 141 SC 141.9.3 P61 L19 # 414
 Ferretti, Vince Corning

Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 Insertion loss is not specified in Table 141.21

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "specified in Tables 141.1 through 141.5"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to "specified in Table 141-1 through Table 141-5". Make links live

Cl 142 SC 142.1 P64 L9 # 376
 Powell, William Nokia

Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 The term "passive optical multipoint networks (PONs)" is introduced here. It seems more logical to use the "regular" term. The previous sentence already points out that this is a point-to-multipoint (P2MP) network.

SuggestedRemedy

remove "multipoint" to obtain: passive optical networks (PONs)

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.3 P83 L15 # 323
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Appears to be a pre-mature line return after "return"

SuggestedRemedy

Fix if possible.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.3 P83 L20 # 361
 Powell, William Nokia

Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 Sentence: This function adds the block v to the input of FIFO buffer.

SuggestedRemedy

Rewrite: This function adds block v to the input of the FIFO buffer.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.3 P83 L23 # 362
 Powell, William Nokia

Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 Sentence: This function writes block v, to each element of FIFO buffer. Suggest to remove the comma, and to insert "the".

SuggestedRemedy

Rewrite: This function writes block v to each element of the FIFO buffer.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.3 P83 L40 # 292
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Dead reference to Figure 143-2

SuggestedRemedy

Make link live, it is correct reference

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3 P84 L50 # 285
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing link in red

SuggestedRemedy

Use "142.3.1.1" + make link live

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D1.4 25/50G-EPON Task Force 5th Task Force review comments

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.2 P90 L 32 # 287
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing link in red
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use "142.1.3" + make link live
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.3 P90 L 48 # 288
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing link in red
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use "142.2.5.3" + make link live
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.2.4.3 P101 L 18 # 299
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Text says LLID is N, figure says LLID is L.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace LLID N with LLID L.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.3.2 P115 L 51 # 289
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing link in red
 SuggestedRemedy
 Link is correct, just make it live
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.4.1 P128 L 34 # 395
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "These are passive optical multipoint networks (PONs)"
 We use terms "passive optical networks (PON)" and "point-to-multipoint (P2MP)", but we never define "passive optical multipoint networks" (POMN?)
 Also, not clear what "these" refers to.

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "These" with "P2MP networks". Strike "multipoint".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.1 P135 L 19 # 300
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing descriptions for bandwidth allocation, authentication, provisioning, and more.
 SuggestedRemedy
 "This clause does not address..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.1.1 P135 L 38 # 305
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Reference to clause instead of figure.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace Clause 144-1 with Figure 144-1.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D1.4 25/50G-EPON Task Force 5th Task Force review comments

Cl 144 SC 144.2.1 P141 L31 # 280
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 I believe note in red can be removed, since botj Control Parser and Control Multiplexer are already shown in Figure 144-5/6, respectively.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Strike the note in red.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.1.1 P144 L54 # 290
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Red link: 143.2.6
 SuggestedRemedy
 Link is correct, just make it live
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.1.1 P146 L2 # 282
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Red link: 143.2.6
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make link live, remove red highlight
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.1.1 P146 L16 # 281
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Dead link: 143.2.6
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make link live
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.3 P148 L53 # 283
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Table 144-1 is missing bottom cell line
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the missing line at line 53
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.4 P149 L44 # 313
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There is no subclause 144.6.2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Looking at previous EPON standards, it is likely supposed to be a reference to the empty 144.1.2.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.5 P161 L3 # 308
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This is the only page in the draft that uses the term off-line ONU. The term, unregistered, is used more frequently.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace off-line with unregistered on lines 3, 4, and 27.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D1.4 25/50G-EPON Task Force 5th Task Force review comments

Cl 144 SC 144.3.5 P161 L 50 # 407
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "bonding" should be "binding" in the following sentences:
 "Upon receipt of a valid REGISTER_REQ MPCPDU, the OLT registers the ONU, allocating and assigning two new port identities (PLID and MLID), and bonding them to corresponding MACs in the OLT."
 "It is the responsibility of Layer Management to perform the MAC bonding, and start transmission from/to the newly registered ONU."
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "bonding" with "binding"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.3 P170 L 54 # 291
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing link in red
 SuggestedRemedy
 Given that the only location where envelope descriptor is defined is the same subclause, see Env structure, te reference is not needed.
 Change "(see 144.x.x.x)" to (see <i>Env</i> variable)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.4.2 P178 L 54 # 312
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There is no subclause 144.6.2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Looking at previous EPON standards, it is likely supposed to be a reference to the empty 144.1.2.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.4.3 P181 L 35 # 389
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing "n" in "Chanel"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "Channel"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl Abstrac SC Abstract P2 L1 # 329
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 extends operation
 SuggestedRemedy
 extends the operation
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.