

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC P1 L27 # 275
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket
 802.3cd is published.
 On page 10 the description of what this amendment does is missing.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3cd-201x to 802.3cd-2018 here and on page 10
 Also change "IEEE Std 802.3-201x" to "IEEE Std 802.3-2018" throughout the document.
 Also on page 10 replace "This amendment includes [complete]" with appropriate text.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P1 L27 # 279
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket
 802.3cd has been published
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: 802.3cd-201x
 To: 802.3cd-2018
 Also on P10 L43.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P10 L31 # 280
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket
 802.3-2018 has been published
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: 802.3-201x
 To: 802.3-2018
 Also on P10 L37 & P10 L45.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P10 L38 # 282
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket
 802.3bt also added Annex 145C.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: Annex 145A, and Annex 145B.
 To: Annex 145A, Annex 145B, and Annex 145C.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P10 L50 # 64
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** frontmatter; bucket
 The summary text for IEEE Std 802.3ca-20xx is missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add suitable summary text
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #59

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P10 L52 # 281
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** frontmatter; bucket
 Need to add a description of this ammendment

SuggestedRemedy

Change: This amendment includes [complete]
 To: This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Clause 141 through Clause 144 and Annex 142A. This amendment extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPONs) to multiple channels of 25 Gb/s providing both symmetric and asymmetric operation for the following data rates (downstream/upstream): 25/10 Gb/s, 25/25 Gb/s, 50/10 Gb/s, 50/25 Gb/s, and 50/50 Gb/s. This standard specifies the 25 Gb/s EPON Multi-Channel Reconciliation Sublayer (MCRS), 25GBASE-PQ Physical Coding Sublayers (PCSs), Physical Media Attachments (PMAs), and Physical Medium Dependent sublayers (PMDs) that support both symmetric and asymmetric data rates while maintaining complete backward compatibility with already deployed 10 Gb/s EPON equipment. Backward compatibility with deployed 1G-EPON and ITU-T G.984 GPON is maintained with 25GBASE-PQ for the specific case of 1G-EPON and GPON ONUs using reduced-band (40 nm) lasers. The EPON operation is defined for distances of at least 20 km, and for a split ratio of at least 1:32.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #59

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P20 L46 # 65
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket
 The TOC entries for Annex 31A and Annex 142A are mixed together and they both say (normative).

SuggestedRemedy

Fix the TOC

Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00** SC **0** P10 L49 # 58
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** frontmatter; bucket
 Information for Amendment 4: 802.3cg is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert, "IEEE Std 802.3cg™-20xx Amendment 4—This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Clause 146 through Clause 148 and Annex 146A and Annex 146B. This amendment adds 10 Mb/s Physical Layer specifications and management parameters for operation over a single balanced pair of conductors."

Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See comment #59

Cl **00** SC **0** P21 L46 # 429
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** frontmatter; bucket
 This is too out of date: "other IEEE 802.3 amendment projects running in parallel (e.g., IEEE P802.3bj and IEEE P802.3bk)"

SuggestedRemedy

Use an up-to-date example, refer to template maintainer to update if not already done

Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #59

Cl **1** SC **1.3** P22 L13 # 66
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket
 IEEE references in the in-force standard do not have a date at the end of the title

SuggestedRemedy

Delete ", 24 July 2017"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 1 SC 1.3 P22 L15 # 67
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 IEC references in the in-force standard have an em dash in front of "Part" with no spaces on either side. This is also true for other "-" separators in the title.
 SuggestedRemedy
 For the IEC reference being added replace " - " before "Performance", "Part", and "Uncontrolled" with an em dash with no spaces before and after.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P22 L24 # 68
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The sorting order for definitions in 1.4 is defined at:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#sort
 This order has not been correctly applied to the P802.3ca draft.
 Also, definitions are usually presented in subclause order in amendments.
 SuggestedRemedy
 In 1.4, change the editing instructions and definition numbering as follows:
 Insert the following new definitions after 1.4.90 "200GXS":
 1.4.90a 25/10G-EPON: ...
 1.4.90b 25/25G-EPON: ...
 Insert the following new definition after 1.4.100 "25GBASE-T":
 1.4.100a 25G-EPON: ...
 Insert the following new definitions before 1.4.128aa "50GBASE-CR" as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018:
 1.4.128aaa 50/10G-EPON: ...
 1.4.128aab 50/25G-EPON: ...
 1.4.128aac 50/50G-EPON: ...
 Insert the following new definition after 1.4.128ah "50 Gb/s Media Independent Interface (50GMII)" as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018:
 1.4.128ai 50G-EPON: ...
 Insert the following new definitions after 1.4.244 "Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE)":
 1.4.244a envelope: ...
 1.4.244b envelope allocation: ...
 1.4.244c envelope descriptor: ...
 Insert the following new definitions after 1.4.245 "envelope frame":
 1.4.245a envelope header: ...
 1.4.245b envelope quantum: ...
 1.4.245c EQT: ...
 Insert the following new definition after 1.4.277 "Gigabit Media Independent Interface (GMII)":
 1.4.277a GPON: ...
 Change 1.4.278 as follows:
 1.4.278 Grant: ...
 Change 1.4.312 (re-numbered from 1.4.313 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows:
 1.4.312 Logical Link Identifier (LLID): ...
 Insert new definition for "MCRS channel" after 1.4.319 "maximum differential input" (re-numbered from 1.4.320 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows:
 1.4.319a MCRS channel: ...
 Insert new definition for "Nx25G-EPON" after 1.4.350 "NRZI" (re-numbered from 1.4.351 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 1 SC 1.4.90a P22 L45 # 432
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 the maximum sustained throughput
 SuggestedRemedy
 a maximum sustained throughput (several times)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P23 L51 # 69
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "CDR" is already present in 1.5 Abbreviations in the base standard.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove "CDR clock data recovery" from the list of new abbreviations
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P23 L52 # 306
 Lyskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket, CDR
 CDR is already present in IEEE 802.3-2018.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P23 L52 # 434
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket, CDR
 CDR doesn't stand for clock data recovery
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to clock and data recovery
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #306

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P23 L54 # 70
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 New abbreviations are usually presented in alphabetical order
 SuggestedRemedy
 Sort the new abbreviations in to alphabetical order
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P24 L9 # 260
 D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Add abbreviation MCRS
 SuggestedRemedy
 MCRS - multi channel reconciliation sublayer
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P24 L10 # 71
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 According to:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html
 "Physical Layer" is "always capped"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 "PLID physical layer ID" to:
 "PLID Physical Layer ID"
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Per comment + change capitalization on page 203/11

Cl 31A SC 31A P246 L16 # 109
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The Value/Comment entry for PAUSE has been in place since the 1998 version of IEEE Std 802.3 without change.
 The Value/Comment entry for GATE has been in place since the 2005 version of IEEE Std 802.3 without change.
 There is no special feature of the P802.3ca draft that requires these changes to be made.
SuggestedRemedy
 remove the changes shown to these rows of the table.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Retain changes to PAUSE and GATE (missing "s" at the end of verb), remove unchanged rows for REPORT, REGISTER_REQ, REGISTER, and REGISTER_ACK. Update the editorial instruction by adding "(unchanged rows are not shown)" at the end.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 P29 L20 # 72
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The two underlined ellipsis characters in the middle of the table should not be underlined.
 The rows for registers 3.80, 3.81, and 3.82 should be in Table 45-176 not Table 45-3
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the row with the two underlined ellipsis characters in the middle of the table.
 Move the rows for registers 3.80, 3.81, and 3.82 to Table 45-176
 Change the bottom ruling of Table 45-3 to the table default.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 P29 L20 # 113
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Ellipses need not be shown as added in Table 45-3 7th row.
SuggestedRemedy
 remove underlining on ellipses.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 P29 L29 # 60
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Editing instruction needs to include 802.3cg which also modified Table 45-3.
SuggestedRemedy
 change "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018 and IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018" to "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018, IEE Std 802.3cd, and IEEE 802.3cg-201x)
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.23a P30 L5 # 75
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

The name in the title of 45.2.1.23a.2 is Downstream differential encoding, so this is what should be in the "Name" entry for bit 1.29.15 in Table 45-26a

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 45-26a:
 In the Name cell for bit 1.29.15, change "DS_Diff_Enc" to "Downstream differential encoding"
 In the Description cell for bit 1.29.15, change "Downstream differential encoding" to:
 "1 = Downstream differential encoding enabled
 0 = Downstream differential encoding disabled"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.23a.1 P29 L37 # 73
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

The subclauses either side of 45.2.1.23a define the bits in order of largest to smallest.

SuggestedRemedy

Swap the order of the definitions so that bit 1.29.15 is defined in 45.2.1.23a.1 and bits 1.29.5:0 in 45.2.1.23a.2

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.23a.1 P29 L37 # 114
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Bit definitions are typically ordered high to low (at least that is how they are defined in 45.2.1.1 - ...3).

SuggestedRemedy

Swap sub-clauses so that 45.2.1.23a.2 Downstream Differential Encoding (1.29.15) comes before 45.2.1.23a.1 PMA/PMD type selection (1.29.5:0).

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.23a.2 P29 L45 # 74
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

In the title of 45.2.1.23a.2 "Downstream Differential Encoding" should be "Downstream differential encoding" (lower case d and e)

SuggestedRemedy

In the title of 45.2.1.23a.2 change: "Downstream Differential Encoding" to: "Downstream differential encoding"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.23a.2 P29 L50 # 115
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

"TX PMA" and "RX PMA" are poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Change
 "TX PMA" to "transmit PMA" and
 "RX PMA" to "receive PMA"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.134a P31 L54 # 77
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

When tables split across pages, the bottom ruling of the table on the first page should be "very thin"

SuggestedRemedy

Make the bottom ruling "very thin" for:
 Table 45-103a at the foot of page 31 and page 32
 Table 45-217a at the foot of page 43
 Table 141-7 at the foot of page 59
 Table 142-5 at the foot of page 118 and page 119
 Table 144-4 at the foot of page 201

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.134a.9 P34 L16 # 1 [redacted]
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Make sure that the PMD name is not broken across lines.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Applies to 45.2.1.134a.9, 45.2.1.134a.10, 45.2.1.134a.11, 45.2.1.134a.12, 45.2.1.134a.13, 45.2.1.134a.14, 45.2.1.134a.15, 45.2.1.134a.16, 45.2.1.134a.23, 45.2.1.134a.24, 45.2.1.134a.25, 45.2.1.134a.26, 45.2.1.134a.27, 45.2.1.134a.28, 45.2.1.134a.29, 45.2.1.134a.30, 45.2.1.134a.31, 45.2.1.134a.32
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.134a.9 P34 L16 # 116 [redacted]
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 PMA/PMD name crosses the line.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the character format so that the line is not broken by the PMD name at the following locations (pg/line): 34/16, 34/22, 34/28, 34/34, 34/40, 34/46, 34/52, 35/4, 35/46, 35/52, 36/4, 36/10, 36/16, 36/22, 36/28, 36/34, 36/40, & 36/46. Editors licenses to fix any others found.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3 P38 L12 # 78 [redacted]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In the new names for registers 3.76, 3.77 and 3.78, 3.79 in Table 45-176, there shouldn't be a comma in "PR10G-EPON, and Nx25GEPON"
 This is shown correctly in 45.2.3.41 and 45.2.3.42
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the new names for registers 3.76, 3.77 and 3.78, 3.79 in Table 45-176, delete the comma in "PR10G-EPON, and Nx25GEPON" (2 instances)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3 P38 L17 # 79 [redacted]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The Nx25G-EPON synchronization pattern registers in 45.2.3.45a are registers 3.83 through 3.134
 SuggestedRemedy
 In table 45-176 change "3.83 through 3.135" to "3.83 through 3.134"
 In the reserved row change "3.136 through 3.199" to "3.135 through 3.199"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3 P39 L3 # 61 [redacted]
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Editing instruction needs to include 802.3cg which also modified Table 45-176.
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018 and IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018" to "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018, IEE Std 802.3cd, and IEEE 802.3cg-201x"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.8 P40 L8 # 81 [redacted]
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In Table 45-182, row for bit 3.9.7, "apable" should be "capable"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In Table 45-182, row for bit 3.9.7, change "apable" to "capable"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P41 L39 # 84
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "update" is not a valid editing instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the editing instruction, replace "Update" with "Change"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P41 L44 # 62
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The font of "and" and "and Nx25G EPON" is smaller than the rest of the text.
 SuggestedRemedy
 fix font of "and", and "an Nx25G EPON"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P41 L41 # 85
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 One of the changes shown in 45.2.3.43 to the name of register 3.80 (timer changed to interval) is not reflected in Table 45-176.
 Note that another comment proposes to move the row in Table 45-3 for this register to Table 45-176 where it belongs.
 SuggestedRemedy
 After moving the row for register 3.80 from Table 45-3 to Table 45-176, reflect the change from "timer" to "interval" in the register name using underline and strikethrough.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P42 L2 # 86
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "76.3.3.4" should be in forest green. "142.3.5.6" should be a cross-reference.
 Equivalent issues in 45.2.3.44.1 and 45.2.3.45
 SuggestedRemedy
 Convert to text and apply character tag "External" to:
 "76.3.3.4" in 45.2.3.43
 "76.3.3.4" in 45.2.3.44.1
 "76.3.3.4" in 45.2.3.45
 Make a cross-reference:
 "142.3.5.6" in 45.2.3.43
 "142.3.5.2" in 45.2.3.44.1
 "142.3.5.6" in 45.2.3.45

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P41 L44 # 492
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D post-deadline; bucket
 Inconsistent font size.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make fonts the same size.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P42 L5 # 328
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 underline of word stopped short
 SuggestedRemedy
 extend the underline to include the last letter in "interval"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.44 P42 L25 # 87
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 ", and Nx25G EPON" has been inserted after "BER" in the first sentence of 45.2.3.44 instead of before.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move the insertion of ", and Nx25G EPON" before "BER" in the first sentence of 45.2.3.44 so that it reads "... 10/1GBASE-PRX, and Nx25G EPON BER monitor ..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.44.1 P42 L49 # 88
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In the first sentence of 45.2.3.44.1, there is a spurious " BER" after "10/1GBASE-PRX"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the first sentence of 45.2.3.44.1, delete " BER" after "10/1GBASE-PRX"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.44.2 P43 L4 # 89
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In the first sentence of 45.2.3.44.2, there is a spurious " BER" after "10/1GBASE-PRX" and " PCS" is missing after the insertion of ", and Nx25G EPON"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the first sentence of 45.2.3.44.1, delete " BER" after "10/1GBASE-PRX" and add " PCS" after the insertion of ", and Nx25G EPON"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.45a P43 L47 # 119
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Register bits in Cl 45 tables are typically listed from high bit to low bit and low register to high register.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Reorder row for register bits 3.83.5 to 3.83.0 in Table 45-217a in descending bit order.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.8aa P40 L25 # 82
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The heading numbering for 45.2.3.8aa through 45.2.3.11ad should be 45.2.3.8.aa through 45.2.3.8.ad as per the editing instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the heading numbering for 45.2.3.8aa through 45.2.3.11ad to 45.2.3.8.aa through 45.2.3.8.ad as per the editing instruction.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.8aa P40 L28 # 83
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 At the end of the paragraph "the 25GBASE-PQ PCS type" should be "the 25/25GBASE-PQ PCS type"
 SuggestedRemedy
 At the end of the paragraph change "the 25GBASE-PQ PCS type" to "the 25/25GBASE-PQ PCS type"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 56 SC 56.1 P47 L1 # 395
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Per IEEE Standards Style Manual, there should be no borders around the graphic. And, it doesn't match figs 56-2 to 5.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the black box round the figure and its title.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2 P47 L1 # 283
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Why is there a box around Figure 56-5a? There is not a box around the other Clause 56 Figures and this is not they style found in other Clauses.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove box around Figure 56-5a.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1 P47 L1 # 91
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Figures in 802.3 do not have a border round them.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the border from Figure 56-5a
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2 P47 L52 # 256
 D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Title of diagram not consistent with other similar diagrams in Clause 56 of 802.3
 See also Fig 141-1, p56
 See also Fig 142-1, p.104
 See also Fig 143-17, p 173
 See also Fig 144-2 P 182
 SuggestedRemedy
 rename title of diagram - Figure 56-4—Architectural positioning of EFM:
 P2MP n X 25G-EPON architecture

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change title to read Figure 56-5a—Architectural positioning of EFM:
 P2MP Nx25G-EPON architecture

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2 P46 L32 # 394
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 PON with the nominal MAC data
 SuggestedRemedy
 PON with a nominal MAC data (several places)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2 P47 L52 # 255
 D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The architectural diagram has a border box around it. Not consistent with other Clause 56 diagrams in IEEE 802.3
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete border box
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P48 L38 # 92
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Editing instructions do not include the project name and not all of the rows of the table are shown.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change editing instruction to: "Insert new PMD types at the end of Table 56-1 (below 10GPASS-XR-U entry), as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P48 L46 # 93
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Only one body row of Table 56-1 (containing ellipsis) is shown before the page break. As the editing instruction is "Insert", the inserted rows should not be underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move the first row of Table 56-1 on to the next page and remove the underlining from the inserted rows.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P50 L21 # 94
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Editing instructions use the term "paragraph" rather than "statement".
 The "Insert" editing instruction does not use underline to indicate insertion.
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the editing instruction, change "after the statement" to "after the paragraph".
 Remove the underline from the inserted text.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141 P55 L1 # 121
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 It is customary to include an editing Instruction prior to new clauses as noted in the WG Template v3.9.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert before Clause 141
 "Insert new clauses and corresponding annexes as follows:"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.2.5 P58 L1 # 403
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "A medium PMD power class" and "A high PMD power class" but "The medium power budget class"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per style manual: use the same name for the same thing, every time.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "The medium power budget class" to "The medium PMD power class". Change "high power budget class" to "The high PMD power class"
 Cl 141 SC 141.2.5 P58 L50 # 401
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 with the split ratio of
 SuggestedRemedy
 with a split ratio of
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 141 SC 141.2.6 P59 L9 # 18
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 it would be easier on reader's eyes to see r₁ and not r1. Same for r2. This is used only in this clse, so changes are minimum
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.2.7 P59 L35 # 329
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Table 141-7, as table is split across pages, missing bottom ruling of table on page 59 and missing "(continued)" in table title on page 60. This is Framemaker table stuff.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the ruling. Do the variable thing to add the "(continue)".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.2.7 P59 L38 # 409
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Dow
 nstream
 SuggestedRemedy
 Break after the /
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.2.7 P59 L40 # 19
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Footnote (b) location in Table 141-7 is odd (it moved to a new line)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make sure footnote (b) location is with the main text of the column caption (extend column size a bit)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.2.7 P60 L1 # 20
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 No "(continued) marker for Table 141-7 caption
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make sure it is added
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.3 P61 L29 # 123
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There are 9 instance of "PQ type PMD" and 15 instances of "Nx25G-EPON PMD". These two terms are synonymous and we should only use one. Note that Fig 141-2 is referred to using PQ type PMDs but the title indicates Nx25F-EPON PMD and Table 141-1 title is " for Nx25G-EPON PMDs" but PMD type is "PQ type PMD".
 Fewer new terms are easier on the 1st time reader.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instance of
 "PQ type PMD" to
 "25G-EPON PMD"
 Note 1x in Cl 142
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change all instance of
 "PQ type PMD" to
 "Nx25G-EPON PMD"

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 141 SC 141.5 P65 L # 350
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There are 48 uses of a plus-minus symbol in the draft. The majority uses a non-breaking space between the symbol and the following number. Suggest making the 5 uses in lines 6 through 7 and 15 through 19 consistent.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the non-breaking space after the plus-minus symbol.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.5 P65 L24 # 124
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There are 2 instances of "PQ PHY". Whereas Nx25G-EPON PHY appears 256 times. Random new terms are not desirable.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "PQ PHY" to "Nx25G-EPON PHY"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.5 P65 L25 # 125
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There are 2 instances of "PQ compliant". Whereas Nx25G-EPON PHY appears 256 times. Random new terms are not desirable.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instances of "PQ compliant" to "Nx25G-EPON compliant"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.5.1 P66 L16 # 95
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 IEEE uses an en-dash as a minus sign
 Empty cells in tables contain an em-dash

SuggestedRemedy
 Change the minus sign to an en-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-p) throughout the entire draft. For example:
 3 instances in Table 141-13
 3 instances in Table 141-14
 8 instances in Table 141-15 (and footnote d)
 9 instances in Table 141-16 (and footnote e)
 3 instances in Table 141-17
 3 instances in Table 141-18
 8 instances in Table 141-19 (and footnote c)
 8 instances in Table 141-20
 4 instances in Table 141-21
 etc.
 Populate empty table cells with an em-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-q) throughout the entire draft. For example:
 2 instances in Table 141-13
 2 instances in Table 141-14
 2 instances in Table 141-17
 2 instances in Table 141-18
 etc.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.5.1 P66 L22 # 96
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 ">=" should be a single character (Ctrl-q 8 in Symbol font)
 Same issue in Table 141-14

SuggestedRemedy
 change ">=" to a single character (Ctrl-q 8 in Symbol font) here and in Table 141-14 (page 67, line 22)

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 141 SC 141.7.9.4 P76 L44 # 129
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This is the only instance of "lane" that doesn't apply to the IEEE address (as in Hoe's Lane) or an xMII lane.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "lane" to "channel"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.7.10 P76 L48 # 422
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Receive sensitivity
 SuggestedRemedy
 Receiver sensitivity
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.7.14 P78 L48 # 426
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 141.7.13.2
 SuggestedRemedy
 141.7.14.2
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #132

Cl 141 SC 141.7.14 P78 L48 # 132
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The illustration is Figure 141-5 not 141.7.13.2
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "141.7.13.2" to "Figure 141-5"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.9.2 P81 L17 # 369
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 described in Table 141-21
 SuggestedRemedy
 given in Table 141-21
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.9.2 P81 L25 # 435
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Max Dispersion (at 20km)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Max dispersion (at 20 space km)
 Similarly for Min
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.9.2 P81 L25 # 100
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In Table 141-21 "20km" should be "20 km" (space between a number and its unit)
 SuggestedRemedy
 In Table 141-21, change "20km" to "20 km" (2 instances)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 141 SC 141.9.2 P81 L28 # 370
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 section
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make the table full width
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.10.4.1 P87 L24 # 101
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The PICS proforma tables in 141.10.4.1 do not have the appropriate entries in the "Support" column.
 Same issue in 141.10.4.42 (OM10), 142.5.4, 142.5.5, 143.5.4.2, 144.5.4.1, 144.5.4.2, 144.5.4.4, 144.5.4.5
 SuggestedRemedy
 In 149.11.4.1, 141.10.4.42 (OM10), 142.5.4, 142.5.5, 143.5.4.2, 144.5.4.1, 144.5.4.2, 144.5.4.4, 144.5.4.5 for items with status of:
 "M" change the Support entry to "Yes []"
 "O" change the Support entry to "Yes [] No []"
 "Something:M" change the Support entry to "Yes [] N/A []"
 "Something:O" change the Support entry to "Yes [] No [] N/A []"
 "O.Number" change the Support entry to "Yes [] No []"
 "O/Number" change the Support entry to "Yes [] No []"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 141 SC 141.10.4.42 P101 L43 # 102
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 PICS items begin with a "*" when they are referenced by another PICS item in the Status column. "OM10" does not appear in any other Item, so should not begin with a "*"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "**OM10" to "OM10"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142 P103 L0 # 290
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There are change bars on the header and footer that should not be there.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove change bars on pages 103 through 179
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.1.1.4 P106 L31 # 493
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D post-deadline; bucket
 Decrement operator has no apparent space between first "-" and second "-".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use a dash character or font with a break between characters.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.1.2 P107 L27 # 375
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 As this is the first use of EQT in this clause, and this is the first project to use EQT
 SuggestedRemedy
 Say what it is, e.g. with a cross-reference.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add a cross reference to 1.4.245b.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 142 SC 142.1.2 P107 L34 # 135
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "aforementioned delay limits" should be "aforementioned delay variation limits"
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.1.3 P108 L4 # 136
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This text is duplicated 4-5 lines above.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Strike the duplicate text
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.1 P110 L7 # 137
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 While this is a nice nostalgic carry-over from the previous century the term "tx_raw" is not defined in the clause and really adds no value.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Strike both instance of "tx_raw" (here and on pg 124 line 42).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.4.1 P112 L1 # 139
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In most cases we use "parity-check" (with a hyphen). Here and in a few other locations we omit the hyphen. We should be consistent.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the following instances of "parity check" with "parity-check":
 pg line
 112 1
 114 48
 115 1
 116 12
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.4.1 P112 L4 # 140
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The "H" in "... matrix H composed by a ..." and "Ai,j" in "256 sub-matrices Ai,j:" should be in italics. Same for other occurrences in these terms, "ai,j", "(i,j)", "Hc", "Z", "K", "Kmax", "S", "P", "M", "N", "Nmax", "R", "Rmax", "u", "u1", "u2", "uK", "p", "p1", "p2", "pM", "T", "c", "i", and "k" (in K+1) scatter throughout the text and Figure 142-6 in Cl 142.2.4 and it's sub-clauses. Also in Figure 142-13—FEC decoder.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 142 SC 142.2.4.2 P114 L51 # 294
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing non-breaking spaces in number that have 4 or more digits to the left of the decimal per 13.3.2 of the 2014 IEEE-SA Style Manual.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: 17664
 To: 17 664
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.4.3 P116 L29 # 144
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 We seem to have a mix of "De-interleaver", "de-interleaver", "Interleaver", and "interleaver".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Be consistent. Change all to initial Caps
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.2 P122 L26 # 330
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing crossref formatting for "142.1.1.5". Same for line 41.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make them into proper cross references.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.2 P123 L36 # 331
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing period after "TxFifo"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the period at the end of the sentence.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.3 P124 L11 # 148
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Is the "v" in "of a 72-bit block v" in italics? It doesn't appear to be. Same issue at line 14, 22, & 34 ("a[4]" in this case).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Ensure the "v" is italicized.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.4.1 P126 L36 # 104
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The PROCESS_DATA state contains 4 instances of "<=" that should be the "Assignment operator" as per the first two rows
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the PROCESS_DATA state change 4 instances of "<=" to the "Assignment operator" as per the first two rows
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.4.2 P125 L5 # 332
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The hyphen for the line break looks awkward.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Suggest making PAR_PLACEHOLDER unbreakable.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.4.3 P125 L17 # 149
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing "the", "a", or "an"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "not transmitting, laser is turned on" to
 "not transmitting, the laser is turned on"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3 P125 L37 # 333
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The first of the hyphen-bullet lines ends in a period, the other two do not (lines 38 and 39).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Editor to choose how to have consistent (or appropriate) line ending for all three lines.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Remove "." at the end of the first line.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.1.1 P126 L36 # 487
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The Assignment operator character defined in Table 21-1 should be used rather than the two separate symbols '<' and '='.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace the four instances of '<=' with the Assignment operator in the PROCESS_DATA state in Figure 142-10.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.1.1 P126 L36 # 495
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D post-deadline; bucket
 Four incorrect symbols are used.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use the "assignment operator" symbol instead of "<=" in the following 3 assignments:
 xBuffer[0] <= Scramble(xBuffer[0])
 xBuffer[1] <= Scramble(xBuffer[1])
 xBuffer[2] <= Scramble(xBuffer[2])
 xBuffer[3] <= Scramble(xBuffer[3])
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.2 P133 L2 # 156
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Persistent-FecFail crosses the line and shouldn't.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.2 P133 L35 # 158
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 PMA_SIGNAL.indication(SIGNAL_OK) crosses the line and shouldn't
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.3 P133 L51 # 159
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This is the only instance of "de-coding". There are ~27 instances of decode (or some form of decode).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the hyphen.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.3 P134 L25 # 160
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 PMA_UNITDATA.indication(rx_code_group<256:0>) crosses the line and shouldn't
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.4 P134 L36 # 334
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing period, end of last sentence of paragrpah.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the period.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.7 P136 L45 # 163
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing "the"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "of Output Process" to "of the Output Process"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.3.5.7 P137 L4 # 164
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Figure needs clean-up; Block divider line overrun block boundaries, connectors often don't touch blocks.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.4.2 P138 L10 # 168
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Change "RX" to "receive"
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 142 SC 142.4.2 P138 L11 # 169
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Clause 45 does not contain "ONU registers"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "mapped to Clause 45 ONU register 1.29.15" to
 "mapped to Clause 45 register bit 1.29.15 (see 45.2.1.23a.2)"
 use live link for xRef.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.4.2 P138 L12 # 335
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing period, end of last sentence of paragraph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the period.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142 SC 142.4.4.1 P138 L13 # 170
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Per Clause 1.5 CDR mean clock and data recovery not clock data recovery
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142A SC 142A.2 P249 L37 # 270
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Caption number is missing "14". Just says "2A.2"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add missing text
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142A SC 142A.2 P249 L37 # 110
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The heading "2A.2 QC-LDPC FEC Encoder Test Vectors" should be "142A.2" not "2A.2"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the heading "2A.2 QC-LDPC FEC Encoder Test Vectors" change "142A.2" to "2A.2"
 (Re-apply the heading style AH1,A.1)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 142A SC 142A.2 P249 L37 # 482
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The sub-clause shows as "2A.2" instead of 142A.2
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix it
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 142A SC 142A.2 P249 L51 # 483
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 machine is mis-spelled in editors note
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix it
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change text of the editorial note to
 Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): At publication time machine readable
 files will be
 published under <http://standards.ieee.org/downloads/802.3/> in a machine readable format.
 Tables are accessible right now at: <http://www.ieee802.org/3/ca/index.shtml>

Cl 143 SC 143.2.4.4 P146 L40 # 336
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "46.2.1" should be forest green. Same for Page 154, line 52 for "46.1.7.2"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make it so.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.2.5 P148 L2 # 496
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D post-deadline; bucket
 Figure 143-5 vertical axis label has characters overlapping.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use smaller font to prevent characters from overlapping.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.1 P153 L5 # 171
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The M and N in "M instances of the PLS service interface (one per MAC) and N xMII
 instances" should be in italics.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.1.1 P153 L41 # 51
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Compound adjective
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "In all single channel RS definitions" to "In all single-channel RS definitions"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.1.2.1 P155 L18 # 173
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In "This opens an envelope on channel ch for the LLID specified by link_id with a length (in
 EQs) of env_length. If all channels are idle, the EnvPam variable (see 143.3.3.4) is set to
 the value of epam (see EnvStartHeader() function definition in 143.3.3.5)."
 "ch", "link_id", "env_length", "EnvPam", "epam" should be in italics.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 143 SC 143.3.1.2.2 P155 L26 # 174
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "ch" and "link_id", "env_length", "EnvPam", "epam" should be in italics.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.2 P156 L3 # 175
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 If we are treating field names as variables (as in Cl 144.3.6.x) then all field names in this section should be in italics.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.2 P157 L5 # 105
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The IEEE Style Manual states that for a number range "Dashes should never be used because they can be misconstrued as subtraction signs."
 Several table in the draft violate this rule.
 SuggestedRemedy
 In table 143-3, change all instances of "x-y" to "x to y"
 Make equivalent change throughout the draft where a hyphen is used to indicate a range including:
 Table 144-2, Table 144-3, Table 144-4, Table 144-7, Table 144-8, Table 144-11, Table 144-12.
 142.4.4.2 page 139, line36 ("20-30")
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.2.1 P157 L43 # 53
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The statement "The following test sequences show" is not clear, since associated tables are on the next page.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "The following test sequences show" to "The test sequences in Table 143-4, Table 143-5, and Table 143-6 show"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.3.2 P159 L42 # 176
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "are be added" should be "are to be added"
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.3.3 P161 L37 # 337
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 It would be a good idea to avoid hyphenating content names and any simple math equation where it might have confusing interpretation between minus sign and a hyphen. Same for line 43.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the line breaking.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 143 SC 143.3.3.3 P161 L44 # 338
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 End of sentence for Description needs a period.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the period to the end of sentence.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.3.4 P161 L11 # 177
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "is also as the row index" should be "is also used as the row index"
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.3.5 P163 L32 # 366
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "," versus " ;"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "for(octet_index = 0; octet_index < 8, octet_index++)" to "for(octet_index = 0; octet_index < 8>>>>;<<<< octet_index++)", change marked in >>>><<<<
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.3.6.2 P165 L15 # 362
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Figure 143-12 seems to be using "*" symbol designating "AND" logical operation. All other SDs have been modified to use the new set of definitions. This one was left behind
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instances of "*" to "AND" in Figure 143-12
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.4.3 P168 L43 # 179
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "RX_- CLK[ch]" should not cross the line.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.3.4.4 P169 L28 # 266
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Incorrect format for a hexadecimal numeric value
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace 0x0A0A0A0A with 0x0A-0A-0A-0A
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 143 SC 143.3.4.4 P169 L36 # 180
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Make code for OutputToMac(int16 link_id, EQ eq) more condensed and readable by putting comments on same line as instruction, combining comments "// Rx other ctrl. character { // including /T/ (value 0xFD)" etc.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.4.1.1 P174 L17 # 184
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There is no need for an abbreviation which is never used (to say nothing of confusing if used)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Strike "(DC)" and "(UC)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.4.1.1 P174 L30 # 404
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Nx25GEPON
 SuggestedRemedy
 Nx25G-EPON
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.4.1.2 P175 L5 # 340
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "143.4.4" should be a proper crossref and not just RED in colorf.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make it a proper cross ref.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.4.2 P176 L2 # 186
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing "The"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add before: "ONU MCRS always sets the write pointer ..."
 and at line 14 before "PCS receiver synchronizes on start-of-burst delimiter ..."
 and at line 17 before "xMII and is received into ... "
 and at line 17 before "OLT MCRS EnvRx buffer."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 143 SC 143.4.3 P176 L45 # 188
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 I believe MPCP has already been introduced in this clause
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 "Multi-Point Control Protocol (MPCP)" to
 "MPCP"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.1 P180 L20 # 190
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing "the", "a", or "an"
 SuggestedRemedy
 At the following locations (pg/line) change "" to read "":
 180/20 "TDM-based access to P2MP medium" -> "TDM-based access to _the_ P2MP medium"
 181/27 "binding each instance of MAC" -> "binding each instance of _a_ MAC"
 183/3 "upstream transmissions in EPON" -> "upstream transmissions in _an_ EPON"
 186/5 "envelope transmission over multi-channel P2MP media" -> "envelope transmission over _a_ multi-channel P2MP media"
 187/1 "For accuracy of receive clock" -> "For accuracy of _the_ receive clock"
 187/11 "MPCPDU is received from MAC" -> "MPCPDU is received from _the_ MAC"
 189/35 "To achieve this goal, MPCP includes processes that measure range" -> "To achieve this goal, _the_ MPCP includes processes that measure _the_ range" (2x)
 190/11 "transmits DISCOVERY MPCPDU with timestamp value" -> "transmits a DISCOVERY MPCPDU with a timestamp value" (2x)
 193/12 "of GATE Generation Process and a separate instance of Registration Completion Process" -> "of _the_ GATE Generation Process and a separate instance of _the_ Registration Completion Process"
 195/26 "may only contain PLID, MLID, or ULID, but never GLID" -> "may only contain _a_ PLID, MLID, or ULID, but never _a_ GLID"
 208/49 "registered ONUs using unicast" -> "registered ONUs using a unicast"
 214/43 "transmitting at line rate" -> "transmitting at a line rate"
 214/48 "transmitting at line rate" -> "transmitting at a line rate"
 222/5 "timer counts down time" -> "timer counts down the time"
 227/18 "ONU is capable of receiving DISCOVERY MPCPDU" -> "ONU is capable of receiving a DISCOVERY MPCPDU"
 227/19 "transmitted by the OLT on DISC_PLID" -> "transmitted by the OLT on the DISC_PLID"
 227/27 "ONU skips such discovery attempt" -> "ONU skips such discovery attempts" (add an "s" to attempt)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.1 P180 L21 # 341
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Bullets have inconsistent endings, one ends in a period, the other doesn't.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Editor to choose how to have consistent (or appropriate) line endings
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Remove "." at the end of the second bullet.
 Cl 144 SC 144.1.1.3 P183 L8 # 195
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "registration requests" should be singular
 "details" at line 13 too.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Cl 144 SC 144.1.3 P183 L26 # 2
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Empty lines
 Similar issue in 144.1.4
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the empty lines
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.1.4.2 P184 L10 # 314
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Multiplexor
 SuggestedRemedy
 Multiplexor is used more frequently. Suggest that all instances of multiplexor be changed.
 Page 184 lines 42 and 45. Page 186 line 33. Page 187 line 19 and 30.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.1.4.2 P184 L45 # 3
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Name of primitive is broken across lines
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make sure primitive names do not break across lines.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.1.4.4 P186 L3 # 197
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 MCRS already introduced on pg 181
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 "Multi-Channel Reconciliation sublayer (MCRS, see Clause 143)" to
 "MCRS (see Clause 143)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #4

Cl 144 SC 144.1.4.4 P186 L4 # 4
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 MCRS primitibe defined before
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "sublayer (MCRS, see Clause 143)." to "sublayer (see Clause 143)."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.2.1 P186 L27 # 5
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 We usually use the term "forward" to describe the action of delivering frames somewhere
 else
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "passing these frames" to "forwarding these frames"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.2.1.3 P187 L9 # 201
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 What is a PLID? The mnemonic has not yet been introduced.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "PLID" to "Physical Layer ID (PLID)"
 On pg 194 line 45 change "Physical Layer ID (PLID)" to "PLID"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.3.1 P189 L34 # 203
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "To main purpose of the MPCP" or not "To main purpose of the MPCP" Either way "To" is wrong.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 "To main purpose of the MPCP" to
 "The main purpose of the MPCP"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.1.1 P191 L33 # 343
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 For consistency, statements 1) and 2) need periods at the end of the sentence.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make it so.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.1.1 P192 L34 # 204
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 MLID has not been introduced.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "MLID" to "Management Link ID (MLID)"
 On pg 195 line 3 change "Management Link ID (MLID) carries" to "The MLID carries"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.1.2 P192 L44 # 206
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This is the only instance of the word allowances in the draft. We should not indiscriminately use different terms for the same thing.
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to allocations
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.2 P193 L5 # 344
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Only one of the five hyphenated (bulleted) have an ending period. Same for list beginning on page 193, line 52.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Editor to choose how to have consistent (or appropriate) line endings
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Remove "." at the end of the last sentence.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.2 P193 L12 # 207
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "as separate instance" should be "a separate instance"
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Per comment. Also should be "are created"

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.3.5 P196 L14 # 345
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 First list item ends in a ";", the other items have no ending punctuation.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Editor to choose how to have consistent (or appropriate) line endings
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Remove ";

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.1 P197 L1 # 346
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Move the page break from before this line to after this paragraph. The preceding page looks like it is missing information at the bottom of the page.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Editor to choose.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Move the page break from before this line to after this paragraph.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.3 P201 L6 # 215
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The variable name Timestamp should not cross the line
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.3 P201 L22 # 347
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In tables in this subclause, there should be some consistency on whether to use a period at the end of an item in the Comment column. For example, in some cases "Ignored on reception" has an ending period, in other tables, it does not. Suggest being consistent across this subclause for those table Comments that read like a statement.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Editor to choose how to have consistent (or appropriate) line endings
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Remove periods within tables when a non-complete sentence is used.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.4 P202 L49 # 217
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Is "destination address" the same as "Destination Address" and "DestinationAddress"?
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "DestinationAddress"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.4 P203 L11 # 218
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 PLID has already been introduced.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "physical layer identifier (PLID, see 144.3.4.1)" to
 "PLID (see 144.3.4.1)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.4 P203 L14 # 219
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 MLID has already been introduced.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 "management link identifier (MLID, see 144.3.4.2)" to
 "MLID, (see 144.3.4.2)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.5 P204 L39 # 108
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "Figure 144-14" should be a cross-reference.
 Likewise for "Figure 144-16" on page 208, line 52
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Figure 144-14" and "Figure 144-16" on page 208, line 52 to be cross-references.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.7 P208 L52 # 348
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "Figure 144-16" needs to be a proper cross reference.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make it so.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7 P210 L34 # 274
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Fix cross reference (see 143.1.3)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix cross reference (see 143.1.3)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #223

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7 P210 L34 # 349
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Turn "143.1.3" into a proper cross reference or remove the Red text.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make it so.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7 P210 L34 # 299
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 There is a reference to a place in this document that is red text and does not have a hyperlink.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 141.1.3 to a Cross-Reference.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #223

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7 P210 L34 # 7
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Reference in red?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to 142.1.3 and make it live
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7.1 P213 L14 # 351
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 The "u" in "us" is not a symbol.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Should be the proper mu symbol.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7 P210 L34 # 223
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Why is this a ref to 143.1.3 and in red font?
 SuggestedRemedy
 make this a live link to 142.1.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7.4 P216 L12 # 352
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Of the items in the a) to f) list, one ends in a period, the rest do not. Use consistent line endings.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Editor to choose how to have consistent (or appropriate) line endings
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7 P210 L46 # 8
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Compound adjective "16 bit wide"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "16-bit wide"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7.8 P218 L36 # 234
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "Registered" should be in italics
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7 P211 L13 # 10
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Wrong field names
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "the Laser On Time and Laser Off Time fields." to "the <i>LaserOnTime</i> and <i>LaserOffTime</i> fields." - make sure names are italicized
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Two instances

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7.8 P219 L49 # 316
 Lynskey, Eric Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In Figure 144-22, timestampDrift should be capitalized.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to TimestampDrift.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.8 P220 L3 # 336
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 see 1.4.278 should be a live link
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.8.6 P222 L22 # 305
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 "An array 16-bit elements" is missing "of"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "An array of 16-bit elements"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.9.1 P227 L6 # 14
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Table 144-9 has very inconsistent line width
 SuggestedRemedy
 Align with standard for 802.3 drafts
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.3.9.1 P227 L10 # 245
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Allowing
 15G-EP and 50G-EP
 ON ON
 to cross the line is confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
 ensure "EPON" appears on a single line
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.4.2 P230 L1 # 248
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Does one have to change both US & DS? Seems a bit onerous to me.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 "enabling / disabling one of downstream and upstream channels" to
 "enabling / disabling one of the downstream or upstream channels"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 144 SC 144.4.2.5 P231 L38 # 250
 Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologies, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Grammar typo

SuggestedRemedy
 change:
 "allowing the ONU notify the OLT" to
 "allowing the ONU to notify the OLT"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3ca D2.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 144 SC 144.5.4.4 P242 L53 # 354
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Tables in the PICS need bottom ruling enabled.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make it so.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl Content SC Contents P20 L46 # 428
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Annex 31A (normative) Annex 142A (normative) 142A.1Example of initial control seed
 sequence
 2A.2QC-LDPC FEC Encoder Test Vectors
 SuggestedRemedy
 Sort out formatting / document structure
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl TOC SC TOC P20 L46 # 271
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 TOC entries 31A, 142A and 142A.1 all got concatenated into a single entry
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix TOC format
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.