

The proposed solution for comment #209 needs further work. There are several issues that remain with the proposed table:

- 1) **“The ESC_PLID values shall not be transmitted other than as an empty EnvAlloc[n] field.”**
This doesn't read right. A field cannot be empty. It is always there and it carries a value (which, in this case, is zero). Also, *EnvAlloc[]* is a 5-octet structure. How can 2-octet value be transmitted as the 5-octet structure?
- 2) **“If received, envelopes with the ESC_PLID value in the LLID field shall be ignored by all ONUs.”**
This one is also confusing. The previous text talks about transmitting *EnvAlloc* and *LLIDstatus* fields. But here, suddenly we say that envelopes with these values shall be ignored. What about *EnvAlloc* and *LLIDstatus* fields with these values? Also, why only the ONUs shall ignore the envelopes with ESC_PLID? Why the OLT shouldn't ignore them as well?
- 3) Requirements in table and text after table essentially repeat each other
Table: **“Unregistered ONUs shall accept only the envelopes with the DISC_PLID value in the LLID field.”**
Text: **“All unregistered ONUs only accept envelopes with DISC_PLID values.”**

Table: **“Registered ONUs shall ignore envelopes with the DISC_PLID value in the LLID field.”**
Text: **“Upon successful registration, an ONU no longer accepts envelopes with DISC_PLID.”**
- 4) The requirement to accept PLID and MLID assigned during registration has now disappeared. It used to be part of the “shall” in text that was removed by this comment.
- 5) Too many ‘shalls’. Each row in a table contains 2 ‘shalls’. That is 12 ‘shalls’. We don't need that many.

The proposal in *kramer_3ca_9_0719.pdf* takes the opposite approach:

- 1) Limit Table 144-1 to what it was initially intended to do – only describe what the different LLIDs or LLID ranges are used for.
- 2) Move all the requirements to the text after the table. Doing so reduces the number of ‘shalls’ from 12 to 6, while we still cover all the behavior we need to cover.

Other small changes:

- 1) ESC_PLID is renamed to ESC_LLID. This value has nothing to do with PLID.
- 2) Designations “Reserved” and “Available” are replaced with “n/a”. These are not designations.