

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3ca D3.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P11 L48 # i-16
 Powell, William Nokia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**
 IEEE 802.3cg-20xx should be updated with year
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3cg-20xx to 802.3cg-2019
 Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P24 L14 # i-1
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**
 MEC comment: remove text in lines 14-23, it is no longer being used
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl **0** SC **0** P L # i-5
 Berger, Catherine
 Comment Type **G** Comment Status **X**
 This draft meets all editorial requirements.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl **1** SC **1.4** P24 L40 # i-14
 Rannow, R K Myself
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **X**
 Verbose "both" for A and B
 Nearly 25 instances
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the word "both" to help make a more succinct document.
 Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl **30** SC **30.5.1.1.2** P28 L54 # i-12
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **X**
 The existing entries in aMauType attribute in 802.3-2018 use line rate, not the MAC data rate. The 802.3ca should also show line rates in the new entries being added to this attribute.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Throughout the entire subclause 30.5.1.1.2, replace "25G" with "25.78125 GBd", and replace "10G" with "10.3125 GBd".
 Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl **141** SC **141.3.2** P69 L51 # i-17
 Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X**
 The statement: "these are not readily testable in a system implementation" addresses aspects of an implementation that are outside the scope of the standard and are not definitively known.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the text to read: "these may not be readily testable in a system implementation"
 Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3ca D3.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 141 SC 141.7.14 P88 L4 # i-2
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 MEC comment: note that "Interspersed normative and informative text is not allowed. As such, neither clauses nor subclauses shall be labeled as informative. You have a couple of instances where a subclause is labeled as "informative". This label should either be removed as the text will be normative, or you should move that text to the corresponding annex of that clause.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove "(informative)" on page 88, line 4; page 115, line 5 (subclause title); page 165, line 20 (subclause title)
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 142 SC 142.1.3 P114 L46 # i-3
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 MEC comment: Avoid making guarantees if there is a possibility of unforeseen situations or circumstances altering an outcome. For example, words such as "ensure," "guarantee," "maximize," "minimize," etc., should be modified, if they are inaccurate. Substitutions might include "reduce" or "improve." For example, "to ensure safety" might be changed to "to improve safety" or "to prevent" might be changed to "to reduce."
 SuggestedRemedy
 The following rewordings are recommended to be made:
 - page 114, line 46, change "minimize" to "reduce"
 - page 147, line 33, change "To ensure there is no" to "To reduce"
 - page 184, line 34, change "set of rules ensures that" to "set of rules helps sure that"
 - page 222, line 39, change "Moreover, in order to assure maximum utilization" to "Moreover, in order to improve the upstream channel utilization"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 142 SC 142.2.5.3 P129 L14 # i-7
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 The definition of function "PassToFecEncoding states "This function passes a 257-bit block v to the FEC engine for encoding". This is imprecise. The values passed to this function are not encoded. They are used for calculating the parity and then are discarded.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use the following function definition:
 "This function passes a 257-bit block v to the FEC engine for calculating the LDPC code"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 142 SC 142.4 P141 L20 # i-4
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 Typo in SET_BER_FLAG state: BerThrehsold should be BerThreshold
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 142A SC 142A.2 P265 L19 # i-15
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 *** Comment submitted with the file 103097500003-laubach_3ca_1_0120.txt attached ***
 Independent review of test vectors revealed that the bits for the 257-bit TV1 vector are correct, but reversed. This is based on reviewing against the description in 142.2.4.2. This comment provides the 56 updated 257-bit TV1 vector values, as provided by the individual(s) that created the original test vectors.
 SuggestedRemedy
 1) Replace the contents of file "ldpc_tv1_pre_zeropadding" (as mentioned in Table 142A-1) with the contents of laubach_3ca_1_0120.txt, with any editorial changes as needed and as for making "machine readable" and available. 2) Update table "Table 142A-2--Test Vector 1 values": update each of the 56 test vectors with the updated 257-bit values as contained in laubach_3ca_1_0120.txt.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3ca D3.0 25/50G-EPON Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 143 SC 143.3.1.2.2 P161 L32 # i-6
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 We have defined special LLID constant value called ESC_LLID and use it almost everywhere in the draft. However, in two places, the draft still shows a magic value 0x00-00.
 SuggestedRemedy
 On page 161, In 32, change "link_id set to 0x00-00" to "link_id set to ESC_LLID (see Table 144-1)."
 On page 169, In 49, change "link_id == 0x00-00" to "link_id == ESC_LLID"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 143 SC 143.3.4.4 P175 L31 # i-8
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 In the definition of function IsMisaligned(), the magic value 0x0A-0A-0A-0A is used. But the draft has defined a named constant for that
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "0x0A-0A-0A-0A" with "IBI_EQ<71:40>"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 143 SC 143.3.4.5.2 P178 L25 # i-9
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Typo in Figure 143-16 (OutxEQ).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Strike character "x" in "OutxEQ"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 144 SC 144.3.6.6 P218 L16 # i-13
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 In Figure 144-12 letters F and FR denote sub-field names. But in figures 144-17 and 144-18, "x" is used to denote bits that are unused. This difference in labeling needs to be clarified.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the following footnote to figure 144-17:
 "Bits marked "x" are not considered part of the <i>GrantLength</i> field and are ignored on reception."
 Add the following footnote to figure 144-18:
 "Bits marked "x" are not considered part of the <i>Value</i> field and are ignored on reception."
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 144 SC 144.3.7.8 P230 L36 # i-11
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Incorrect variable name used in Figure 144-22
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "GRANT_MARGIN" with "GrantMargin"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 144 SC 144.3.8.11 P237 L8 # i-10
 Kramer, Glen Broadcom Corporation
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Figure 144-27 shows incorrect primitive name. MPRS_CTRL shall be MCRS_CTRL.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace MPRS with MCRS in two places (line 8 and line 30)
 Proposed Response Response Status O