Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P*   *L*   # 64

Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Check EVERY sentence for missing period and put one as appropriate. There are multiple instances of that just in CL1.

SuggestedRemedy

Do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4**   *P*   *L*   # 65

Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Accept the PA [Pete Angelo] comment and make XGMII definition to remain "10 GIGABIT Ethernet...".

SuggestedRemedy

Delete editors comments that starts with "??? -- 1.1.3.2f..." and revert back XGMII definition in CL125, CL127, CL129, diagrams and other places to remain and be consistent to "10 GIGABIT...".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **23**   *L* **43**   # 14

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Annex 128A describes the 2.5GSEI and not just Clause 128A.2

SuggestedRemedy

Change Clause 128A.2 to
Annex 128A

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **23**   *L* **52**   # 15

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Annex 130A describes the 5GSEI and not just Clause 130A.2

SuggestedRemedy

Change Clause 130A.2 to
Annex 130A

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **24**   *L* **11**   # 16

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Need to add 2.5GSEI and 5GSEI

SuggestedRemedy

Add
2.5GSEI 2.5Gb/s Storage Enclosure Interface
5GSEI 5Gb/s Storage Enclosure Interface

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.1.1.2**   *P* **26**   *L* **8**   # 30

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Multiple issues with 30.5.1.1.2

1) Need to add 2.5GBASE-X and 5GBASE-R since they are enumerated in lines 23 and 24.
2) Current definitions on 2.5GBASE-KX and 5GBASE-KR should be PMD not PCS/PMA

SuggestedRemedy

Add
2.5GBASE-X   X PCS/PMA as specified in Clause 127 over undefined PMD
5GBASE-R   R PCS/PMA as specified in Clause 129 over undefined PMD

Change current definitions to
2.5GBASE-KX   X PCS/PMA over an electrical backplane PMD as specified in Clause 128

5GBASE-KX   R PCS/PMA over an electrical backplane PMD as specified in Clause 130

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **30**
SC **30.5.1.1.2**

Page 1 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:54 PM

Cl **30**　　　*SC* **30.5.1.1.2**　　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **9**　　　　# 66
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
　　Change "new entry in" to "two new entries" on line 9 and also line 15

SuggestedRemedy
　　do so.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.7.1**　　　　　*P* **27**　　　*L* **45**　　　　# 31
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
　　Heading 45.2.1.7.1 is incorrect

SuggestedRemedy
　　Change to 45.2.1.7.4

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.8**　　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **21**　　　　# 32
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
　　Table 45-11 should be 45-12

SuggestedRemedy
　　Table 45-11 should be 45-12

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.14c**　　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **36**　　　　# 67
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
　　Delete Editors note. Bit assignments are coordinated, so the note is longer needed

SuggestedRemedy
　　Do so

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.14c**　　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **40**　　　　# 33
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
　　Table 45-17g by inserting a row for the bit 1.21.3
　　should be
　　Table 45-17c by inserting a row for the bit 1.21.2

SuggestedRemedy
　　Fix per comment

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.14c.b**　　　　　*P* **29**　　　*L* **20**　　　　# 68
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
　　Delete two editors notes one on line 20 and the other on line 27. Tutorial infomation is not
　　needed.

SuggestedRemedy
　　Do so.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.88**　　　　　*P* **29**　　　*L* **40**　　　　# 34
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
　　Delete PA comment.
　　Same registers controls both 1000BASE-KX and 2.5GBASE-KX

SuggestedRemedy
　　Delete PA comment.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**
SC **45.2.1.88**

Page 2 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.88**　　　　*P* **29**　　　*L* **40**　　　# 69

Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Delete "Comment PA:..." The "Response:..." text is correct, so act on this comment and resolution by deleting the ??...?? note text.

SuggestedRemedy

Do so.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.88**　　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **7**　　　# 35

Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Delete PA comment - but need to accept the comment.
See below for remedy.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete PA comment.
add:
"The assignment of bits in the 1000BASE-KX/2.5GBASE-KX control register shown in Table 45-69"

(i.e. add the /2.5GBASE-KX to the sentence

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.89**　　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **7**　　　# 70

Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Delete "Comment PA:..." The "Response:..." text is correct, so act on this comment and resolution by deleting the ??...?? note text.

SuggestedRemedy

do so.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.3**　　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **22**　　　# 36

Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Delete PA comment - but need to accept the comment.
See below for remedy.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete PA comment.

In table 45-119 from 802.3by change to
(i.e. add the 5G speed)

3.34 through 3.37
5/10/25GBASE-R PCS test pattern seed A
45.2.3.15

3.38 through 3.41
5/10/25GBASE-R PCS test pattern seed B
45.2.3.16

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.3**　　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **24**　　　# 37

Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Missed a register change needed for loopback.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following:

45.2.3.1 PCS control 1 register (Register 3.0)
45.2.3.1.2 Loopback (3.0.14)
Copy the text from 802.3bz and make the following change:
Change all instances of 10GBASE-R to 5/10GBASE-R

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**
SC **45.2.3**

Page 3 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.7a**   *P* **31**   *L* **3**   # 71
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Delete Editor's note -- outlived its useful relevence.

SuggestedRemedy
    do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.13.1**   *P* **32**   *L* **34**   # 38
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Missing space

SuggestedRemedy
    Add space to the following:

    in 126.3.7.1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.13.5**   *P* **32**   *L* **50**   # 39
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Missing underline

SuggestedRemedy
    Underline 5/ in 5/10/25GBASE-R

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.16**   *P* **34**   *L* **9**   # 40
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Wrong seed

SuggestedRemedy
    Change seed A
    to
    seed B

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.14ab**   *P* **35**   *L* **30**   # 41
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
    5GBASE-R should be 5GBASE-KR

SuggestedRemedy
    See comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.3**   *P* **37**   *L*   # 73
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Insert the following 2.5KX and 5KR rows before the 5T row in 45.5.3 as modified by IEEE
    Std 802.3bz-2016 (unchanged rows not shown)
    ItemFeatureSubclauseValue/CommentStatusSupport
    2.5GKXImplementation of 2.5GBASE-KX PMA/PMD45.2.1.14c.bPMA:OYes [ ]
    No [ ]
    5GKRImplementation of 5GBASE-KR PMA/PMD45.2.1.14c.aPMA:OYes [ ]
    No [ ]

SuggestedRemedy
    Do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**
SC **45.3**

Page 4 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.2.3**　　　　*P* **37**　　*L*　　# 72

Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Insert the following 2.5G and 5G rows (this should have been done by 802.3bz but wasn't. Submited as a sponsor ballot comment to .3bz) before the 5T row in 45.5.3 as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bz-2016 (unchanged rows not shown).

ItemFeatureSubclauseValue/CommentStatusSupport
2.5GImplementation of 2.5 Gb/s PMA/PMD45.2.1.4PMA:OYes [ ]
No [ ]
5GImplementation of 5 Gb/s PMA/PMD45.2.1.4PMA:OYes [ ]
No [ ]

SuggestedRemedy

Either a) confirm that 802.3bz added this, b) put the editing instructions as provided.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.3.1**　　　　*P* **37**　　*L*　　# 74

Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Change the following MM124 row by adding 2.5GBASE-KX and 5GBASE-KR as shown below. (unchanged rows not shown). Note: 802.3by does NOT have similar modification. Should it?

SuggestedRemedy

ItemFeatureSubclauseValue/CommentStatusSupport
Add 2.5G and 5G in MM124 as follows -
MM124 Backplane Ethernet AN ability bit is set to 1 for 1000BASE-KX, 2.5GBASE-KX, 5GBASE-KR, 10GBASE-KX4 and 10GBASE-KR PHYs.45.2.7.12.32.5GKX:M; 5GKX:M; KX:M; KX4:M ;KR:MYes [ ] N/A [ ]

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.3.6**　　　　*P* **38**　　*L*　　# 75

Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Add PCS options for 2.5G-KX and 5G-KR, and build/complete the optional mandatory tables for both.

SuggestedRemedy

PCS table entries are
ItemFeatureSubclauseValue/CommentStatusSupport
*2.5GXImplementation of 2.5GBASE-X PCS45.2.3.7aAN:MYes [ ]
N/A [ ]
*5GRImplementation of 5GBASE-R PCS45.2.3.7aAN:MYes [ ]
N/A [ ]

And complete the PICS group for each of 2.5GX and 5GR.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **73**　　*SC* **73.7.4.1**　　　　*P* **49**　　*L* **3**　　# 42

Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Add space between
in 73.7.4.1

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **78**　　*SC* **78.1.1**　　　　*P* **53**　　*L* **18**　　# 43

Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Not all PCS types support FEC.
Clause 129 PCS does not support BASE-R FEC.

SuggestedRemedy

Change
these PCS types
to
the Clause 49 PCS and Clause 82 PCS

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **78**
SC **78.1.1**

Page 5 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **78**　　　*SC* **78.1.3.3**　　　　　*P* **53**　　　*L* **25**　　　# 44
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **X**
　　Clause 78.1.3.3.1 got dropped.
　　Put back

SuggestedRemedy
　　78.1.3.3.1 PHY LPI transmit operation

　　Change the fourth paragraph of 78.1.3.3.1 as shown.

　　The EEE capability in most PHYs (for example, 100BASE-TX, 10GBASE-T, 1000BASE-
　　KX, 2.5GBASEKX, 5GBASE-KR, 10GBASE-KR, and 10GBASE-KX4) requires the local
　　PHY transmitter to go quiet
　　after sleep is signalled.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **78**　　　*SC* **78.1.4**　　　　　*P* **53**　　　*L* **30**　　　# 45
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**
　　Delete extra colon at end of sentence

SuggestedRemedy
　　See comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**　　　*SC* **125**　　　　　*P* **55**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 17
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **X**
　　Strip down Clause 125 to bare minimum highlighting the differences only.

SuggestedRemedy
　　See comment. Editor has discretion.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**　　　*SC* **125.1.2**　　　　　*P* **55**　　　*L*　　　# 86
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**
　　Act on the Editor's note and convert the CL125 to series of editing instructions. Draft is not
　　complete unless done so.

SuggestedRemedy
　　Do so, and make editing instructions more explicit and clearer, wherever neceesary.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**　　　*SC* **125.1.2**　　　　　*P* **55**　　　*L* **40**　　　# 18
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **ER**　　　*Comment Status* **X**
　　Item d is new - need to underline it.

SuggestedRemedy
　　See comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**　　　*SC* **125.1.4**　　　　　*P* **58**　　　*L* **13**　　　# 1
Lo, William　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **ER**　　　*Comment Status* **D**
　　2.5GBASE-KX and 5GBASE-KR are new - need to underline it.

SuggestedRemedy
　　See comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
　　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **125**
SC **125.1.4**

Page 6 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **125**   *SC* **125.1.4**   *P* **58**   *L* **19**   # 2

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   missing space

SuggestedRemedy
   Add space between

   reference columns

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **125**   *SC* **125.2.2**   *P* **59**   *L* **52**   # 3

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Sentence is new - need to underline it.

SuggestedRemedy
   See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **125**   *SC* **125.2.4.2**   *P* **60**   *L* **32**   # 4

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Clause 125.2.4.2 is new - need to underline entire clause.

SuggestedRemedy
   See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **125**   *SC* **125.3**   *P* **61**   *L* **22**   # 5

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Delete PA comment in both cells

   Clause 70.4 1000BASE-KX PCS+PMA+PMD delay is 328 bits
   This is not an integer pause_quanta. i.e 328/512 = 0.640625

   For 2.5GBASE-KX we are making the entire PCS+PMA+PMD to be 1024 which is an
   integer pause_quanta. We are giving PCS more budget where it is needed instead of
   doing 512 bits for PCS+PMA and 512 bits for PMD.

SuggestedRemedy
   Delete PA comment in both cells

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.4.5**   *P* **70**   *L* **54**   # 6

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Delete (( ))

SuggestedRemedy
   Delete the parenthesis

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.5**   *P* **71**   *L* **49**   # 7

Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Delete extra period at end of paragraph

SuggestedRemedy
   See comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **127**
SC **127.2.5**

Page 7 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.6.1.3**   *P* **77**   *L* **26**   # 8
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Delete extra period at end of paragraph

SuggestedRemedy
See comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.6.1.3**   *P* **77**   *L* **31**   # 9
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Add period at end of paragraph

SuggestedRemedy
See comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.6.1.4**   *P* **80**   *L* **50**   # 10
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
should be table 36-1a-e

SuggestedRemedy
Change 36a-e
to
36-1a-e

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.6.1.4**   *P* **81**   *L* **4**   # 11
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
should be table 36-1a-e

SuggestedRemedy
Change 36a-e
to
36-1a-e

Two instances of this.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.6.2.6**   *P* **94**   *L* **16**   # 12
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
) at the wrong place.
Put it at the end.

SuggestedRemedy
) at the wrong place.
Put it at the end just like the other 4 states below it.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **127**   *SC* **127.2.6.2.7**   *P* **95**   *L* **4**   # 13
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Wrong reference
(See Clause 36.2.5.2.9)

SuggestedRemedy
Figure 127-10 should be Table 36-10

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **127**
SC **127.2.6.2.7**

Page 8 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **128**   *SC* **128.4**   *P* **108**   *L* **25**   # 19
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Delete extra comma

SuggestedRemedy
   Delete extra comma after Clasue 31

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **128**   *SC* **128.6.5**   *P* **110**   *L* **34**   # 87
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Delete Editor's note. No longer relevent.

SuggestedRemedy
   do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **128**   *SC* **128.6.5**   *P* **110**   *L* **35**   # 20
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Remove editor's note
   TBDs are resolved.

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove editor's note

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **128**   *SC* **128.6.6**   *P* **111**   *L* **4**   # 21
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Wrong reference

SuggestedRemedy
   Should be 45.2.1.1.5

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **128**   *SC* **128.7**   *P* **112**   *L*   # 88
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Delete Editor's note. No longer relevent.

SuggestedRemedy
   do so

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **128**   *SC* **128.7**   *P* **112**   *L* **3**   # 22
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
   Remove editor's note
   TBDs are resolved.

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove editor's note

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **128**
SC **128.7**

Page 9 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **128A** *SC* **128A.1** *P* **172** *L* **52** # 53
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
0.3608 s/b: 3.608 in first equation

SuggestedRemedy
change equation 128A-1

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128A** *SC* **Figure 128A-3** *P* **173** *L* **28** # 54
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
reformat graph to match equation

SuggestedRemedy
replace Figure with new plot from Dan Smith

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128A** *SC* **128A.3.1.2** *P* **176** *L* **41** # 95
Kim, Yong Broadcom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**
Delete both editors notes (line 41 and line 50)

SuggestedRemedy
DO SO

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128A** *SC* **Figure 128A-7** *P* **177** *L* **51** # 55
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
reformat graph to match equation and use logaritmic x-axis

SuggestedRemedy
replace Figure with new plot from Dan Smith

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128A** *SC* **128A.3.1.4.1** *P* **178** *L* **5** # 96
Kim, Yong Broadcom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**
Delete editors note.

SuggestedRemedy
do so.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128B** *SC* *P* **189** *L* **5** # 97
Kim, Yong Broadcom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**
Delete editors note.

SuggestedRemedy
do so.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128A** *SC* **128A.3.3** *P* **182** *L* **33** # 76
Kim, Yong Broadcom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**
Delete editors note

SuggestedRemedy
do so.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128D** *SC* *P* **201** *L* **8** # 77
Kim, Yong Broadcom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**
Delete editors note.

SuggestedRemedy
do so.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **128D**
SC

Page 10 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **128D** *SC* **128D.2** *P* **203** *L* **3** # 78
Kim, Yong Broadcom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**
Discuss editors note (clause contributor's comment) and close it.

And also apply that discussoin to note on 130A.2, and consider both.

SuggestedRemedy
Decide on a action to close this note on 128D.2 and 130A.2

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128D** *SC* **128D.2.2** *P* **204** *L* **32** # 60
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
Insertion Loss is the incorrect term..

SuggestedRemedy
Change all "Insertion Loss" references to
"Return Loss" on lines 32 and 37

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128D** *SC* **128D.2.2** *P* **204** *L* **32** # 59
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
Equation 128D-4 is incorrect

SuggestedRemedy
Change equation 128D-4 to:
$y(f) = 17-f$ $0.01<=f<4$
$y(f)= 15-0.5f$ $4<=f<5.15625$

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128D** *SC* **Figure 128D-2** *P* **202** *L* **27** # 56
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
reformat graph to match equation

SuggestedRemedy
replace Figure with new plot from Dan Smith

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128D** *SC* **Figure 128D-4** *P* **204** *L* **22** # 57
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
reformat graph to match equation and use logaritmic x-axis

SuggestedRemedy
replace Figure with new plot from Dan Smith

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **128D** *SC* **Figure 128D-5** *P* **205** *L* **19** # 58
Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
reformat graph to match equation and use logaritmic x-axis

SuggestedRemedy
replace Figure with new plot from Dan Smith

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **128D**
SC **Figure 128D-5**

Page 11 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.1.1**   *P* **125**   *L* **12**   # 23
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Need both PCS and PMA

SuggestedRemedy
    "the PMA"
    should be
    "the PCS and PMA"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.1.3**   *P* **126**   *L* **33**   # 24
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Need both PCS and PMA

SuggestedRemedy
    "PMA"
    should be
    "PCS and PMA"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.2.1**   *P* **127**   *L* **46**   # 25
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Add missing period at end of paragraph.

SuggestedRemedy
    See comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.2.2**   *P* **129**   *L* **30**   # 26
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Incorrect variable label.

SuggestedRemedy
    rx_data_unit
    should be
    rx_data-group

    2 instances

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.2.3**   *P* **37**   *L*   # 89
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Change "Note that these.." to "These.."

SuggestedRemedy
    Style. Ugggghhh!

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.2.3**   *P* **129**   *L* **34**   # 27
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
    It would be good if Clause 129.2.3 heading and text appear before Figure 129-2
    since text is describing the figures.

SuggestedRemedy
    See comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **129**
SC **129.2.3**

Page 12 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.2.4**   *P* **130**   *L* **8**   # 28
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
It would be good if table 129-1 and 129-2 appear right after clause 129.2.4
since text is describing the tables.

SuggestedRemedy
See comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **129**   *SC* **129.7**   *P* **132**   *L*   # 90
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
PICS for CL 129 not done. Also CL127, CL128, CL130, Annex 128A, Annex 128D, Annex
130A PICS also needs to be completed.

SuggestedRemedy
Do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **130**   *SC* **130.6.8**   *P* **145**   *L* **17**   # 29
Lo, William   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Wrong reference

SuggestedRemedy
45.2.1.7.1 should be
45.2.1.7.4

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **130**   *SC* **130.7.1**   *P* **146**   *L* **5**   # 91
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Editor's note no longer relevent. Delete.

SuggestedRemedy
Do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **130**   *SC* **130.7.1**   *P* **146**   *L* **35**   # 51
Wu, Peter   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
The total jitter is 0.30 UI instaed of 0.28 UI at table 130-4

SuggestedRemedy
Change 0.28 to 0.30

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **130**   *SC* **130.7.1.2**   *P* **147**   *L* **30**   # 52
Wu, Peter   Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
At Equation 130-1, Return_loss min is not necessary

SuggestedRemedy
removed, it reads:
Return_loss(f) >= 20

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **130**   Page 13 of 16
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **130.7.1.2**   6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **130**　　　*SC* **130.7.1.2**　　　　　*P* **147**　　*L* **35**　　　# 46
Wu, Peter　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
At Equation 130-2, the X operator should be removed and base 10 should be
pulled closer to log, and the "returnloss min" is not necessary, missing "MHz" (refer to
format used in Equation 72-3)

SuggestedRemedy
remove "x" and pull "10" to "log", and remove "Returnloss min", add "MHZ" in Equation.

Return_loss(f) >= 10 - 13.275log10(f/1289MHz)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **130**　　　*SC* **130.7.1.6**　　　　　*P* **149**　　*L* **29**　　　# 47
Wu, Peter　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
"Return_lossmin" at 130-5 is not necessary

SuggestedRemedy
Remove Returnloss min =

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **130**　　　*SC* **130.7.1.6**　　　　　*P* **149**　　*L* **34**　　　# 48
Wu, Peter　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
Same problem as we have at Equation 130-2.

SuggestedRemedy
remove "x" and pull "10" to "log", and remove "Returnloss min", add "MHZ" in Equation.

Return_loss(f) >= 7 - 13.275log10(f/1250MHz)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **130**　　　*SC* **130.7.1.11**　　　　*P* **152**　　*L* **3**　　　# 49
Wu, Peter　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
missing desciption for v4

SuggestedRemedy
add:
v4 = mimimum voltage measured in the interval t3-T and t3

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **130**　　　*SC* **130.7.2.1**　　　　　*P* **153**　　*L* **3**　　　# 50
Wu, Peter　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell Semiconducto

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
Table 130-6 has two tests defined, but at the decription, only one is
mentioned.

SuggestedRemedy
Changed the text to:
The receiver interference tolerance shall consist of two separate tests as
described in Annex 130B with the
Parameters specified in Table 130–6. The data pattern for the interference
tolerance test shall be the test
Patterns 2 or 3 as defined in 52.9.1.1. The receiver shall satisfy the
requirements for interference tolerance specified in Annex 130B for both
tests

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **130**　　　*SC* **130.7.2.3**　　　　　*P* **153**　　*L* **36**　　　# 92
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
Change "It should be noted that there may..." to "There may..."

SuggestedRemedy
delete extra words that does not convey anything.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **130**
SC **130.7.2.3**

Page 14 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **130**　　*SC* **130.7.2.4**　　　　*P* **153**　　*L* **47**　　　# 93
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**
　Change "Note that this may be..." to "This may be..."

SuggestedRemedy
　Delete extra words that does not convey anything.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **130A**　　*SC* **130A.1**　　　　*P* **210**　　*L* **51**　　　# 61
Smith, Daniel　　　　　　　　　Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **X**
　Incorrect coefficient in equation 130A-1

SuggestedRemedy
　Replace 0.3608 with 3.608 in first equation

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **130A**　　*SC* **130A.3.1.2**　　*P* **214**　　*L* **45**　　　# 79
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**
　Delete editors note.

SuggestedRemedy
　Do so.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **130A**　　*SC* **130A.3.1.3**　　*P* **215**　　*L* **19**　　　# 80
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**
　delete editors note.

SuggestedRemedy
　do so.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **130A**　　*SC* **130A.3.1.4.1**　*P* **216**　　*L* **45**　　　# 81
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**
　Delete editors note.

SuggestedRemedy
　do so.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **130A**　　*SC* **130A.3.3**　　　*P* **221**　　*L* **3**　　　# 82
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**
　Delete editors note

SuggestedRemedy
　do so.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **130A**　　*SC* **130A.3.3.1**　　*P* **221**　　*L* **42**　　　# 83
Kim, Yong　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**
　Delete editors note.

SuggestedRemedy
　do so.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **130A**　　*SC* **Figure 130A-3**　*P* **211**　　*L* **28**　　　# 62
Smith, Daniel　　　　　　　　　Seagate Technology

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **X**
　reformat graph to match equation

SuggestedRemedy
　replace Figure with new plot from Dan Smith

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **130A**
SC **Figure 130A-3**

Page 15 of 16
6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM

Cl **130A**   *SC* **Figure 130A-7**   *P* **216**   *L* **20**   # 63
Smith, Daniel   Seagate Technology

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
     reformat graph to match equation and use logaritmic x-axis

SuggestedRemedy
     replace Figure with new plot from Dan Smith

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **130B**   *SC*   *P* **229**   *L* **6**   # 84
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
     Delete editors note

SuggestedRemedy
     do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **130C**   *SC*   *P* **233**   *L* **1**   # 85
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
     Consider deleting Annex 130C entirely. And find all references to Annex 130C and point
     it/them to Annex 128C.

SuggestedRemedy
     Do so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **Annex**   *SC*   *P* **165**   *L* **14**   # 94
Kim, Yong   Broadcom

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
     It would be useful to reference SGMII spec. If there is a reliable repository of SGMII, it
     would be good to have it listed here.

SuggestedRemedy
     If SGMII could be referenced (where to be found or what to contact to get it, etc), please
     put the reference here.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **Annex**   Page 16 of 16
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC*   6/23/2016 7:28:55 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line