

P802.3cc D3.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Over Single Mode Fiber Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.8 P 20 L 52 # i-21  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

"PMD Transmit Disable" function is made available for both "25GBASE-LR and 25GBASE-ER" respectively. If "DISABLE" feature is included, where is the "ENABLE" attribute? Why is it not needed?

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The normal state is for the transmitter to be enabled. When it is not disabled, it is enabled.

CI 105 SC 105.5 P 25 L 28 # i-23  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type GR Comment Status R

Quote as: "cShould there be a discrepancy between this table and the delay requirements of the relevant sublayer clause, the sublayer clause prevails." This 'Note c' is not necessary should "Table 105-3" is correctly aligned with Sub-clause "114.3" in this document. Suggest deleting notation as shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Note c as: "cShould there be a discrepancy between this table and the delay requirements of the relevant sublayer clause, the sublayer clause prevails."

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

"Note c" already exists in established standards. For example, see Table 80-5, which has an identical note. Also, "Note c" already exists in Table 105-3, to which these new rows are being added.

CI 108 SC 108.5.3.2 P 26 L 17 # i-24  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

Last sentence applies to "25GBASE-R RS-FEC" where "25GBASE-SR, 25GBASE-LR, and 25GBASE-ER PHY" are covered. That seemed to coordinate with "Table 105-2" as "Mandatory". However, "25GBASE-CR and 25GBASE-KR" have the same mandatory requirement as indicated in "Table 105-2" but were not included in this last sentence. Suggest the suitable addition as shown for Table 105-2 alignment.

SuggestedRemedy

Last sentence revision as: "This option shall not be used when the 25GBASE-R RS-FEC sublayer is used to form part of a 25GBASE-CR, 25GBASE-KR, 25GBASE-SR, 25GBASE-LR, or 25GBASE-ER PHY."

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

"Mandatory" in Table 105-2 indicates that RS-FEC is required. However, the sentence in Clause 108.5.3.2 realtes to the option of having the RS-FEC perform error detection without error correction. This option is not allowed for only 25GBASE-SR, 25GBASE-LR, and 25GBASE-ER.

CI 108 SC 108.7.3 P 27 L 10 # i-25  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type GR Comment Status R

Add the corresponding "Subclause" references on "\*\*LR and \*ER" rows in the 'Table' of Subclause "108.7.3" for completeness.

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The table in 108.7.3, to which this is being added, already has \*KR, \*CR, and \*SR, and these also leave the Subclause reference blank. For consistency, \*LR and \*ER should follow this convention.

# P802.3cc D3.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Over Single Mode Fiber Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 114 SC 114.5.5 P 32 L 23 # i-26  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

"PMD Reset Function" should be labeled "(OPTIONAL)" to coordinate with the "Table" in Subclause "114.12.4.1" as per "Item CF11" if such.

## SuggestedRemedy

Rewrite as: "114.5.5 PMD reset function (optional)"

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

Follows convention established in prior standards (see Clause 88.5.6 and CF12 in Clause 88.12.4.1).

CI 114 SC 114.6.1 P 34 L 9 # i-27  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

Should the "RIN20OMA(max)" value in "Table 114-6" coordinate with Subclause "114.7.7 b)" in Page 38, Line 37?

## SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

Subclause 114.7.7 describes the definition of RIN20OMA and its measurement methodology. The value in Table 114-6 specifies the maximum value that is allowed when measured as described in 114.7.7. So the clause is correct as written.

CI 114 SC 114.6.3 P 36 L 15 # i-28  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

The value of "Channel Insertion Loss (max)" for "25GBASE-ER (30km)" in "Table 114-8" should match the same item in Page 40, Line 7 of "Table 114-11". "Table 114-8" showed "15 dB" compared to "18 dB" in "Table 114-11".

## SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The maximum channel insertion loss value for 30 km in Table 114-11 includes the additional insertion loss allowed given in Table 114-8. The sum is 18 dB (channel loss of 15 dB + additional insertion loss of 3 dB). See Table 88-14 as a prior example.

CI 114 SC 114.9 P 39 L 39 # i-29  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

Add and define "INS" marking of cable to align with the "\*\*INS" row of "Table" in Subclause "114.12.3" Page 42, Line 11.

## SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

INS is defined in 114.12.3. INS is not a physical marking of the cable. It is a PICS designation. Clause follows example of prior standards (see Subclauses 88.10 and 88.12.3 in 802.3-2015 Section 6).

# P802.3cc D3.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Over Single Mode Fiber Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 114 SC 114.12.3 P 42 L 6 # i-32  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type GR Comment Status R

In the "Table" of Subclause "114.12.3", the "\*" -asterisk" sign must be defined as notation of this "Table".

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

This is covered in Subclause 114.12.1, which directs readers to Clause 21 for detailed descriptions of symbols used in PICS proforma. In particular, Subclase 21.6 states, "Each item whose reference is used in a conditional symbol is indicated by an asterisk in the Item column."

CI 114 SC 114.7.5.1 P 37 L 48 # i-33  
BUCANEG, DEMETRIO JR Hawaiian Electric Com

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

Item "e) RIN of less than -138 dB/Hz" must be the correct value for the "RIN20OMA(max)" of "Table 114-6" in Page 34, Line 9. If so, please synchronize magnitude for alignment and disregard references to item "b)" in Subclause "114.7.7". Add reference statement to this effect.

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

RIN of less than -138 dB/Hz corresponds to the requirements of the high quality reference transmitter for measuring TDP. The RIN20OMA spec of -130 dB in Table 114-6 is the specification required of an actual transmitter.