Cl **FM** *SC* **FM** *P* **1** *L* **23** # 1

Anslow, Pete — Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

This says "Draft D1.0 is prepared for Task Force review."

SuggestedRemedy

Change "is prepared for Task Force review" to "is prepared for Working Group ballot recirculation"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **13** *L* **18** # 2

Anslow, Pete — Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

The editing instruction says "Insert the following sentence at the end of 90.7."
However, paraphrasing the content of 90.7:
The first paragraph (quoted in the draft) is about data delay measurement.
Note 1 is about not adding media delay.
The next paragraph is about how to report the measurement values
Note 2 is about adjustments that the TimeSync Client may need to make
Consequently, it does not seem that the best place to add text regarding multi-lane receive path data delay measurement is at the end of 90.7

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to: "Insert the following paragraph after the first paragraph of 90.7."
Alternatively, delete the second editing instruction and show the new paragraph in underline font.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **FM** *SC* **FM** *P* **1** *L* **23** # 3

Zimmerman, George — CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

"Draft 1.0 is prepared for Task Force Review" - this is for working group ballot. While the ballot announcement says D1.0, the subject email says D2.0, which is usual for WG ballot.

SuggestedRemedy

Update draft number to 2.1 on next round, and change "Task Force review" to "Working Group recirculation."

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **13** *L* **20** # 4

Marris, Arthur — Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

It would be nice if there was some explanation of why the lane with the maximum media propagation delay has been chosen. Choosing this lane will result in the lowest reported receive path delay. I looked through the 802.3 maintenance web page and could not find any presentations on this other than maintenance request 1286

SuggestedRemedy

Add some text to justify choosing the lane with the maximum media propagation delay.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **FM** *SC* **FM** *P* **11** *L* **5** # 5

Gardner, Andrew — Linear Technology

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

Since it seems likely that IEEE P802.3bu will be published before IEEE P802.3bs add it to the list of prior amendments.

SuggestedRemedy

see comment

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **15** *L* **1** # 6

Dawe, Piers — Mellanox

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

In 802.3, the shorthand for transmit is usually Tx and for receive, it's usually Rx (although names of variables or similar, or parts of names, often have different case).

SuggestedRemedy

Change TX to Tx and RX to Rx

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **14** *L* **1** # 7

Dawe, Piers Mellanox

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

"the input of the beginning of the SFD at the xMII": the SFD doesn't have an input, nor does its beginning.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "the input of the beginning of the SFD at the xMII" to "the arrival of the beginning of the SFD at the xMII" or "the input of the beginning of the SFD to the xMII". Similarly in the receive direction.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **14** *L* **1** # 8

Dawe, Piers Mellanox

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

In one direction, the SFD is "input" at an MDI, in the other direction it is "presented" to an MDI. The language doesn't seem consistent. A PHY delivers signals to the MDI.

SuggestedRemedy

input ... output? presentation ... delivery / arrival ... presentation ?

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **15** *L* **1** # 9

Dawe, Piers Mellanox

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**

What does "TX MDI" mean? The term does not occur in 802.3-2015. There is only one PHY in Figure 90-3 and only one MDI. The PHY transmits and receives over the same MDI.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "TX" and "RX" or explain what you mean.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **367** *L* # 10

Dawe, Piers Mellanox

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

The RS is part of the Physical Layer, presumably the gRS is too.

SuggestedRemedy

Correct Figure 90-3

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **90** *SC* **90.7** *P* **21** *L* **1** # 11

Dawe, Piers Mellanox

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**

How can the PHY implementer know which lane has the maximum media propagation delay? For WDM, he knows in advance. Otherwise, he doesn't know. A PHY might work out which lane arrived latest, by looking at its deskew buffer, but doesn't know if that is caused by the medium or the other PHY.

SuggestedRemedy

It might make more sense to measure the Rx lane that arrives latest at the MDI.
But having non-static delay values seems unattractive anyway.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **FM** *SC* **FM** *P* **7** *L* **13** # 12

Law, David HPE

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

Please add Working Group voter list supplied in IEEE_P802d3ce_WG_names_DL_060916.fm

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**