Cl **FM** *SC* **FM**   *P* **13**   *L* **1**   # 87

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

 Page number misaligned. PDF page numbers will be used in this comment set.

SuggestedRemedy

 Ensure the draft page numbers and the PDF page numbers match.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

 ACCEPT.

Cl **6** *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **64**   *L*   # 149

Jethanandani, Mahesh   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**

 Namespace is incorrect

SuggestedRemedy

 Follow namespace allocation as defined by IEEE

Response   *Response Status* **C**

 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

 Use "urn:ieee:std:802.3:yang:<module-name>" in each module.

 For reference, when inserting comments into YANG module, use YANG comment format, not an Editorial Note.

Cl **6** *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **64**   *L* **1**   # 137

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

 Fix indentation issues in the model.

SuggestedRemedy

 Here are some examples. There is no standard indetation used in the model. Sometimes the indentation is 0, sometimes 2 spaces and sometimes more than 2 spaces. Suggest that you pick on 2 spaces. An example is under organization. The next line is at 0 indentation, where it should be 2. Same for description of the model. Revision statement has an indentation of 5 spaces and within it the reference statement has an indentation of - 2.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

 Add an explanatory paragraph to the front of each instance of YANG module statign that indentation and formatting is correct in the "electronic" version.

 Contact Staff Editor to confirm that hozirozntal layout for the imported modules is OK.

Cl **6** *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **64**   *L* **27**   # 145

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**

 Organization and contact text in D1.1 doesn't match what's in GIT at https://github.com/YangModels/yang/blob/master/standard/ieee/802.3/draft/ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang
 We need these to be the same, otherwise external reviewers will not see curent drafts.
 In this case, D1.1. Organization and contact don't match what's in github

SuggestedRemedy

 Make draft and github are consistent

Response   *Response Status* **C**

 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

 Add a note to each YANG module:

 "Copyright release for YANG modules: Users of this standard may freely reproduce the YANG module contained in this subclause so that it can be used for its intended purpose."

 Electronic copies of YANG modules will be updated at the time next version becomes available.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **6**   Page 1 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn *SC* **6.5.2**   9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **64**   *L* **28**   # 135
Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
  Typo - "IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Workign Group"

SuggestedRemedy
  "IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group"

Response   *Response Status* **C**
  ACCEPT.

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **64**   *L* **36**   # 146
Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
  Typo - confirguring

SuggestedRemedy
  configuring

Response   *Response Status* **C**
  ACCEPT.

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **64**   *L* **38**   # 147
Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
  Another 2 typos - provdes funcitonality

SuggestedRemedy
  provides functionality

Response   *Response Status* **C**
  ACCEPT.

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **65**   *L* **33**   # 136
Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **R**
  Do not use camel cases. Use - instead. Examples include
  enum deliveringPower
  enum otherFault

SuggestedRemedy
  Use "-" instead of camel case.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
  REJECT.

  No style guide reference is available at this time. Please provide a link, if available.

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **67**   *L* **54**   # 144
Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **R**
  What is the idea of making multi-pair a presence container?

SuggestedRemedy
  Change if appropriate

Response   *Response Status* **C**
  REJECT.

  The presense container allows us to report if this instance is DTE power via MDI or Power
  over Data Line ("PoDL").

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **68**   *L* **57**   # 139
Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**
  Remove operational part of the model and collapse it into one container to be NDMA
  compliant.

SuggestedRemedy
  Update model structure as discussed in TF AdHoc

Response   *Response Status* **C**
  REJECT.

  No consensus to change - see
  http://www.ieee802.org/3/cf/public/sept17/zhuang_3cf_02_0917.pdf for details on NDMA
  process.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **6**   Page 2 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **6.5.2**   9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **69**   *L* **15**   # 140

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**

Remove when statements in operational state. Even if the condition does not apply, are you not going to report operational value reported by the system??

SuggestedRemedy

Remove when statements in operational state.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.

The idea here is that when the condition does not apply, the given object / condition is not reported at all; otherwise, the meaning of the given container is lost (in here, there is no need for multi-pair container unless the system operates as multi-pair system).

See also comment #144.

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **71**   *L* **33**   # 138

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Descriptions are minimal in some statements (e.g. leaf pse-type) . Need to do a better job of updating descriptions. An enum of typeA with a description that says "typeA" does not mean much.

SuggestedRemedy

provide a little more information in the descriptions.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Please make sure all references to 802.3 subclauses are preceded with "IEEE Std 802.3, "

Please provide specific updated descriptions, where references to base 802.3 standard are not sufficient.

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **73**   *L* **40**   # 143

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**

Please indicate cumulative-energy units as millijoules

SuggestedRemedy

units 'millijoule';

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Add unit statement per comment.

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **73**   *L* **52**   # 142

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**

Why is actual-power units in watt, but the description says milliwatts.

SuggestedRemedy

Resolve inconsistency

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change units from watt to milliwatt

Cl **6**   *SC* **6.5.2**   *P* **74**   *L* **16**   # 141

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**

Fill description statements current marked as "" (e.g. cumulative-energy)

SuggestedRemedy

provide useful descriptions

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Module author to provide missing descriptions to be included in D1.2.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **6**
SC **6.5.2**

Page 3 of 13
9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **85**   *L* **56**   # 86

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

Shouldn't we reference the 2018 standard (assuming it is released before this amendment). This issues exists in 4 locations in the draft.

SuggestedRemedy

Add Editors notes to update reference prior to publication.

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Update all dated references to 802.3 from 2015 to 2018.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **86**   *L* **39**   # 88

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

Paragraph alignment seems to be incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

If possible indent "a)", "b)", … items to align with previous text. Ideally the following text in the item should be indented to align with first line of item.

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

It is raw text file that is imported. Will add 2 spaces to align accordingly.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **87**   *L* **33**   # 89

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

Indent first line of description.

SuggestedRemedy

per comment

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **87**   *L* **46**   # 92

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

This description describes what an LLID is not what the mpcp-llid-count is.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with "Indicates the number of registered LLIDs. The initialization value is 0. This is applicable for an OLT with the same value for all virtual interfaces and for an ONU."

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **87**   *L* **47**   # 90

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **A**

While much improved from Draft 1.0 (Thank you very much) the indenting throughout section 7.3.2 is still somewhat inconsistent. Some successive lines are indented 2 tab spaces while similar lines are indented 4 Tabs, etc. Note this is especially true for descriptions. For example see pg 89 where no less than 5 descriptoin indenting styles are used.

SuggestedRemedy

Check indention throughout the section and make it consistent.

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #137

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **87**   *L* **50**   # 91

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

The following statements are incorrect. "Typically, the number of logical links expected in a PON is equal the number of ONUs, which is 32-64, plus an additional entry for broadcast LLID. At the ONU the number of LLIDs for an interface is one." I understand that this misinformative text exists in 802.3.1 and will happily submit a maintenance request if required. Note that the last sentence "At the ONU the number of LLIDs for an interface is one." is ambiguous as it is not clear which interface(s) are being referred to.

SuggestedRemedy

Strike the text.

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7**
SC **7.3.2**

Page 4 of 13
9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **90**   *L* **63**   # 93
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
Missing period "An attempt to set the value of 'unknown' is illegal;"

SuggestedRemedy
Change to: An attempt to set the value of 'unknown' is illegal.;

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **91**   *L* **42**   # 94
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **R**   *bucket*
The use of undefined abbreviations does nothing to assist the technician in understanding the item.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace all instances of ' Tx ' with 'transmit' and all instances of ' Rx ' with 'receive' where it appears in the description. Note this does not include '-Tx-' or '-Rx-'.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
REJECT.

These terms are well known and have never caused any misinterpretation before.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **94**   *L* **13**   # 95
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
Does 'the given moment of time' mean when read or when reported?

SuggestedRemedy
Change to 'the time reported'.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This is a technical change - comment type changes from E to T.

Apply the change globally.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **94**   *L* **37**   # 96
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
Is 'under the control of the logical layer' really correct? 802.3.1 uses 'Setting this object to true(1) will cause the optical interface to start transmission (according to the control protocol specified for the logical interface). Setting this object to false(2) will cause the interface to stop the optical transmission. When getting true(1), the optical interface is in transmitting mode (obeying to the logical control protocol).'

SuggestedRemedy
Change 'layer' to 'protocol' in 2x.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "logical layer" to "logical control protocol" for consistency with 802.3.1

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **95**   *L* **21**   # 98
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
Augments definition'

SuggestedRemedy
Augments the definition'

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **95**   *L* **57**   # 99
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
of 'fec-mode''

SuggestedRemedy
of the 'fec-mode''

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line   *Cl* **7** *SC* **7.3.2**   Page 5 of 13
9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM

Cl **7**　　　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　　*P* **95**　　　　*L* **64**　　　　# 97

Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　*bucket*

This description could be improved: 'An object that indicates the support of operation of the optional FEC sublayer of the 1000BASE-PX PHY specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.2. The value of 'unknown' is assigned in the initialization, for non FEC support state or type not yet known. The value of 'not supported' is assigned when the sublayer is not supported. The value of 'supported' value is assigned when the sublayer is supported. This object is applicable for an OLT, with the same value for all logical links, and for an ONU. All objects in the fec/statistics container will have a zero value when the interface is not supporting FEC.'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to:
'An object that indicates the support of operation of the optional FEC sublayer of the 1000BASE-PX PHY specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.2. The value of 'unknown' is reported in the initialization, for non FEC support state or type not yet known. The value of 'not supported' is reported when the sublayer is not supported. The value of 'supported' is reported when the sublayer is supported. This object is applicable for an OLT, with the same value for all logical links, and for an ONU. All objects in the fec/statistics container will have a zero value when the interface is not supporting FEC.'

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Comment is against page 94, line 64.

Change to:
'An object that indicates the support of operation of the optional FEC sublayer of the 1000BASE-PX PHY specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.2. The value of 'unknown' is reported in the initialization, for non FEC support state or type not yet known. The value of 'not supported' is reported when the sublayer is not supported. The value of 'supported' is reported when the sublayer is supported. This object is applicable for an OLT, with the same value for all logical links, and for an ONU. All objects in the fec/statistics container will >>have<< a zero value when the interface is not supporting FEC.'

One change was to eliminate the word "will" from text.

Cl **7**　　　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　　*P* **95**　　　　*L* **65**　　　　# 107

Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

This phrase occurs ~61 times in the draft typically prefaced by "At the OLT". We could avoid future editing if we removed the preface now as in 100G-EPON I expect that ONUs will naturally support multiple LLIDs (which most physical ONUs do today). Even with the removal of the preface the statement will still be true for both ONUs and OLTs.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the preface 'At the OLT, ' when it appears in front of 'it has a distinct value for each logical link'. There are several instances where this is used in conjunction with queues and/or queue sets (e.g., pg 102 ln 34 & pg 105 line 46); in these instances the editor is granted license to use his best judgment in changing the text. Omit the change at the following locations; pg107/ln 43, 108 / 44, 110 / 14, 111 / 16,&50, and 112 / 52. Note there is a separate comment against instance at pg 138 line 13.

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7**　　　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　　*P* **96**　　　　*L* **53**　　　　# 100

Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　*bucket*

Does this object exist in YANG? 'Any discontinuity should be reported in the ifCounterDiscontinuityTime object'. Note this text appears in the draft about 31 times.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with a reference to the appropriate YANG thingy. Sorry but I'm not sure what that is.

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This object would be defined in Ethernet interface module, but there is no reference for it at this time. Insert Editorial note in all locations to mark required reference.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　*Cl* **7**　　　Page 6 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **97**   *L* **27**   # 101

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **R**
   TBD reference?

SuggestedRemedy
   Replace with proper pointer.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
   REJECT.

   Please provide the respective "correct" reference to IEEE Std 802.3.1, specific object in
   MIB.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **97**   *L* **50**   # 102

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
   These statements seem unreliable:
   'The set operation can be done at any time. Changing the value of 'trx-transmit-admin-state'
   to 'disabled'.
   This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. At the OLT, it has a distinct value for
   each logical link.
   The value of this object is only reliable when can lead to a halt in the optical transmission of
   the respective interface leading to an interruption of service of the users connected to the
   respective logical link.'

SuggestedRemedy
   Change to:
   'The set operation can be done at any time. Changing the value of 'trx-transmit-admin-state'
   to 'disabled' can lead to a halt in the optical transmission of the respective interface leading
   to an interruption of service of the users connected to the respective logical link.
   This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. At the OLT, it has a distinct value for
   each logical link.
   The value of this object is only relevant when the state of the interface is 'enabled' as set by
   the mpcp-admin-state. '

Response   *Response Status* **C**
   ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **98**   *L* **18**   # 103

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
   Reword; 'This object controls the setting of low alarm threshold for the input power into the
   optical receiver.'

SuggestedRemedy
   To: 'This object controls the low alarm threshold setting of the optical receiver input power.'

Response   *Response Status* **C**
   ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **98**   *L* **25**   # 104

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
   Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-in-low-threshold' object may be done at any
   time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-in-low-threshold-crossing' event, if a too
   high a value is set.'

SuggestedRemedy
   To: 'The 'trx-power-in-low-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause
   generation of a 'trx-power-in-low-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too high.'

Response   *Response Status* **C**
   ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **98**   *L* **50**   # 105

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
   Reword; 'This object controls the setting of high alarm threshold for the input power into the
   optical receiver.'

SuggestedRemedy
   To: 'This object controls the high alarm threshold setting of the optical receiver input power.'

Response   *Response Status* **C**
   ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **7**   Page 7 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **7.3.2**   9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7**　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　*P* **98**　　　*L* **57**　　　# 106
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　*bucket*
Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-in-high-threshold' object may be done at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-in-high-threshold-crossing' event, if a too low a value is set.'

SuggestedRemedy
To: 'The 'trx-power-in-high-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-in-high-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too low.'

Response　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **7**　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　*P* **99**　　　*L* **17**　　　# 109
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　*bucket*
Reword; 'This object controls the setting of low alarm threshold for the output power out of the optical transmitter.'

SuggestedRemedy
To: 'This object controls the low alarm threshold setting of the optical transmitter output power.'

Response　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **7**　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　*P* **99**　　　*L* **24**　　　# 110
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　*bucket*
Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-out-low-threshold' object may be done at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-low-threshold-crossing' event, if a too high a value is set.'

SuggestedRemedy
To: 'The 'trx-power-out-low-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-low-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too high.'

Response　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **7**　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　*P* **99**　　　*L* **49**　　　# 111
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　*bucket*
Reword; 'This object controls the setting of high alarm threshold for the output power out of the optical transmitter.'

SuggestedRemedy
To: 'This object controls the high alarm threshold setting of the optical transmitter output power.'

Response　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **7**　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　*P* **99**　　　*L* **56**　　　# 112
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　*bucket*
Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-out-high-threshold' object may be done at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-high-threshold-crossing' event, if a too low a value is set.'

SuggestedRemedy
To: 'The 'trx-power-out-high-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-high-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too low.'

Response　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **7**　　*SC* **7.3.2**　　　　　*P* **100**　　　*L* **8**　　　# 114
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　*bucket*
Reword 'allowing ONUs report'

SuggestedRemedy
To 'allowing ONUs to report'

Response　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7**
SC **7.3.2**

Page 8 of 13
9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **100**   *L* **65**   # 113
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
    Invalid reference to dot3ExtPkgQueueSetsTable. Occurs 4 times in the draft.

SuggestedRemedy
    Replace with reference to the appropriate YANG model object.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

    Strike "sets, as defined in
    dot3ExtPkgQueueSetsTable" - it has no context in YANG

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **101**   *L* **28**   # 117
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
    Description does not give the user any information about the objects meaning, only the
    values it can assume. '"This object can have a value between 0 and 7, limited by the value
    stored in the 'mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-report' object.";'
    There may be something funky going on in this section (like stray or duplicate
    description?), it's difficult to tell with the random indenting. Please check carefully.
    Same issues pg 102 ln 2, pg 102 ln 49, pg 104 ln 46, pg 127 ln 31, pg 128 ln 4, pg 128 ln
    47, pg 130 ln 45 which will need different solution text.

SuggestedRemedy
    Change to; '"This object indicates the identity (index) of a queue in the ONU. It can have a
    value between 0 and 7, limited by the value stored in the 'mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-
    report' object.";'
    Editor given license to correct remaining instances noted in a similar fashion.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **101**   *L* **34**   # 115
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
    "See '…' object" seems to be understood in previous references.

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove the understood phrasing 'See … object' for all references where it is used.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **101**   *L* **40**   # 116
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*
    "An object" any object or some specific one? This error or the similar error of "An object
    that …" occurs 12x in the draft.

SuggestedRemedy
    change to "This object"

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **102**   *L* **25**   # 118
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**
    invalid range '0 .. '

SuggestedRemedy
    Strike, clarified by object following name.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**
    PROPOSED REJECT.

    This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **7**   Page 9 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **7.3.2**   9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P***107** *L***1** # 119

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

While true this statement may not tell the end user, who is unlikely to know what the ReceiveFrame function call is or does, much 'This counter is incremented when a ReceiveFrame function
call returns a valid frame with: 1) a lengthOrType field value equal to the reserved Type for 802.3_MAC_Control as specified in IEEE Std 802.3 31.4.1.3, 2) an opcode indicating an MPCP frame.'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'This counter is incremented when a frame is received at the interface which is an MPCP frame or has a Length/Type Ethernet header field value equal to the reserved Type for
802.3_MAC_Control as specified in IEEE Std 802.3 31.4.1.3,'

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to: 'This counter is incremented when a frame is received at the interface which is an MPCP frame or has a Length/Type Ethernet header field value equal to the reserved Type for
802.3_MAC_Control as specified in IEEE Std 802.3>>,<< 31.4.1.3,'

Added missing comma, as marked

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P***107** *L***4** # 129

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **R**

Craft persons might be more familiar with normal 802.3 header field names, Source Address, Destination Address, Length/Type.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace; 'lengthOrType' with Length/Type' (2x) and on pg 135 ln 44 'source_address' with 'Source Address' and 'destination field' with 'Destination Address field'

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.

Used in 802.3.1 with no issues on interpretation / clarity.

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P***108** *L***38** # 120

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

Are these instructions for the craft? If so we should tell him/her where the counter is located so they can increment it as instructed :-) 'Increment the counter by one for each ...' This error occurs 10x in the draft.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'This counter is incremented by one for each...'

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P***109** *L***12** # 121

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

Really for mpcp-register-req-in? 'At the OLT, the value should be zero for each logical link.'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'At the ONU, the value should be zero for each logical link.'

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P***113** *L***58** # 122

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **R**

We should not assume the craft knows every abbreviation we do. 'SLD'

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'SLD' to 'start of LLID delimiter' 11x

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.

Used in 802.3.1 with no issues.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **7**   Page 10 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn *SC* **7.3.2** 9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P* **114** *L* **53** # 123

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T** *Comment Status*   **A**

Bad description of bad llid. 'A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate, and pass the CRC-8 check as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate.'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'A count of frames received that contain a valid start of LLID delimiter field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate, and pass the CRC-8 check as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate, but are discarded due to the LLID check.'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to: 'A count of frames received that contain a valid >>SLD<< field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate, and pass the CRC-8 check as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate, but are discarded due to the LLID check.'

SLD used for consistency

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P* **118** *L* **1** # 124

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T** *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

LLID not contained! '… in the LLID and do not the ONU's LLID ...'

SuggestedRemedy

change to: '… in the LLID and do not contain the ONU's LLID ...'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P* **121** *L* **45** # 125

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **TR** *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

For Tx power out this is incorrect 'At the ONU, the measurement is performed in a continuous manner. At the OLT, the measurement is performed in a burst-mode manner, for each incoming data burst.'
Similar error under trx-power-out-low-15-minutes-bin pg 122 ln 11 and for trx-power-out-high-15-minutes-bin pg 122 ln 39

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'At the ONU, the measurement is performed in a burst-mode manner for each outgoing data burst. At the OLT, the measurement is performed in a continuous manner.'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P* **121** *L* **56** # 126

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T** *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

Wrong ref doc.

SuggestedRemedy

change to 802.3.1

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7** *SC* **7.3.2** *P* **133** *L* **7** # 127

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E** *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

Wording: 'each frame is dropped'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'each frame dropped"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7**
SC **7.3.2**

Page 11 of 13
9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **134**   *L* **62**   # 128

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

While you might know what 2^32 - 1 is equal to I doubt a craft will off the top of his/her head. 'If this value exceeds 2^32 - 1 TQ, the value 2^32 - 1 TQ shall be returned.' Same issue occurs pg 136 ln 58, pg 137 ln 23

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 'If this value exceeds 4,294,967,295 TQ, the value 4,294,967,295 TQ shall be returned.'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **135**   *L* **55**   # 130

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

There is no mention of 'MPCP subtype' in Cl 31A

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'MAC Control opcode' so item 3) reads '3) a MAC control opcode value equal to the subtype reserved for MPCP as specified in IEEE Std 802.3, Annex 31A.'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to: 'MAC Control opcode' so item 3) reads '3) a MAC >>Control<< opcode value equal to the subtype reserved for MPCP as specified in IEEE Std 802.3, Annex 31A.'

Capitalization was modified.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **137**   *L* **52**   # 131

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

Similar to 2^32 '2^16 - 1'

SuggestedRemedy

change to: '65,535'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **138**   *L* **13**   # 108

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

It appears that the distinct value for each LLID is 0 at the OLT. 'At the OLT, it has a distinct value for each logical link. At the OLT, the value should be zero.'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'At the OLT, the value should be zero. At the ONU it has a distinct value for each logical link.'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **139**   *L* **47**   # 132

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

For readability: '32768'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to '32,768'

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **139**   *L* **47**   # 133

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *bucket*

This is just wrong 'Typically, the number of logical links expected in a PON is equal the number of ONUs, which is 32-64, plus an additional entry for broadcast LLID.'

SuggestedRemedy

Strike phrase. If I need to enter a maintenance request against 802.3.1 please let me know.

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required   ER/editorial required   GR/general required   T/technical   E/editorial   G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched   A/accepted   R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl   **7**
SC   **7.3.2**

Page 12 of 13
9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.3.2**   *P* **140**   *L* **8**   # 134

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

This object likely represents 802.3.1 dot3ExtPkgObjectReportMaximumNumQueues which
appears to be incorrectly defined in 802.3.1. In several places 802.3.1 state that this object
limits the number of queues that can be reported.

SuggestedRemedy

Change description to: 'This object reflects the maximum number of queues (0-7) that can
be accepted by the OLT in a single REPORT MPCPDU as defined in IEEE Std 802.3,
Clause 64 and Clause 77. This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. It has a
distinct value for each logical link.'

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **7**   Page 13 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **7.3.2**   9/11/2017 9:04:13 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line