## Approved Responses

## IEEE P802.3cf D1.2 YANG Data Model Definitions 3rd Task Force review comments

Comment Type E Comment Status D

What happened to the legacy module? Was it decided to exclude this module from this work?

SuggestedRemedy

n/a

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

No proposed response.

C/ 5 SC 5.3 P26 L1 # 173

Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

data nodes merged in updated nmda-style modules.

the same for:

p62, line 1, sub-clause 6.3. p160, line 1, sub-clause 8.3

SuggestedRemedy

replace mapping tables with tables in 'revised mapping tables' file.

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Use "revised mapping tables.docx" as posted on November 2017 TF meeting website

Cl 5 SC 5.4.2.1 P32 L10 # 153

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

General comment on style used in all YANG modules. It has been suggested that 802.3cf rationalized the style of its YANG clauses. This has since become a potential item for 802.1 to address in all 802 projects. We should note this action is being considered and may be adopted by 802.3cf.

Note that the proposed resolution does not address what will happen if these guidelines are not adopted. It would probably be a good idea for the TF to agree on a strategy to address this possibility.

## SuggestedRemedy

Add editors note before each YANG section:

Editors note: Guideline for 802 YANG modules are potentially being developed under the auspices of 802.1. If these guidelines are completed prior to Sponsor ballot these may be adopted by P802.3cf and applied to this module.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 5 SC 5.4.2.1 P33 L15 # 154

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status D

inconsistent style used for keyword "units" in the draft, sometimes the unit value is in quotes (as on pg 33/ln 15), other times it is not (as on pg 39/ln 26), still other times it is in single quotes (as on pg 73 ln 43).

## SuggestedRemedy

use without quotes consistently (note RFC 6020 indicates the unit value is a string but usually omits quotes).

Proposed Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

C/ 5 SC 5.4.2.1 P33 L36 # 174

Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

warning in yanglint validation: "Value "iana-if-type:ethernetCsmacd" is not valid for the node "type" (ietf-interfaces:type = 'iana-if-type:ethernetCsmacd')".

Comment Status A

Related lines:

Comment Type

p37, L38, sub-clause 5.4.2.1.

TR

p55, L1,26, sub-clause 5.4.2.2.

p56, L1,14, sub-clasue 5.4.2.2

SuggestedRemedy

Changing the when expressions to "derived-from-or-self(../if:type, 'ianaift:ethernetCsmacd')"

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P L # [167

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

inconsistent style used for keyword "if-feature" in draft. Sometimes a single line is used sometime a two line style is used. The two line style can cross page boundaries reducing readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Use single line version throughout as shown in RFC 6020.

Proposed Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P36 L39 # 155

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status D

inconsistent style used for feature name after keyword "if-feature" sometime the name is in quotes other time it is without quotes.

SuggestedRemedy

use without quotes consistently (Note RFC 6020 omits quotes in all examples).

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P90 L10 # 170

Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

nmda style transition for EPON, Ethernet interfaces, pse, ELO modules. The same reason for modules in following clause:

sub-clause 5.4.2, page 32, line 13,

sub-clase 6.5.2, page 66, line 10,

sub-clase 8.5.2, page 166,line 10.

SuggestedRemedy

replace the ieee802-ethernet-pon module with epon module on github link https://github.com/yanzhuang/8023EthernetYANG/blob/master/standard/ieee/802.3/draft/iee e802-ethernet-pon.yang

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P90 L32 # 149

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter

Comment Type E Comment Status A

"eth-old" just looks offensive for anybody working on CSMA/CD. Change prefix into something more neutral.

SuggestedRemedy

change all instances of "eth-old" prefix to "eth-legacy"

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P91 L13 # 156

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

inconsistent style used for keyword "type" in draft. Sometimes a single line is used as in "type keyword {", other times a two line style is used as in "type <LF> keyword {". Two line style may cross page boundaries reducing readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Use single line version throughout as shown in RFC 6020.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

C/ 7 SC 7.3.2 P91 L14 # [157

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

inconsistent style used for keyword "type" in draft. Sometimes a single line is used, sometime a two line style is used. Two line style may cross page boundaries reducing readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Use single line version throughout as shown in RFC 6020.

Proposed Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P92 L42 # 158

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

inconsistent style used for keyword "default" in draft. Sometimes a single line is used, sometime a two line style is used. Two line style may cross page boundaries reducing readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Use single line version throughout as shown in RFC 6020.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P92 L42 # [159

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status D

inconsistent style used for keyword "default" in draft. Sometimes default value is in quotes (as on pg 92 ln 42) other time there are no quotes (as on pg 42 ln 6.

SuggestedRemedy

use without quotes consistently (Note RFC 6020 indicates the default value is a string but usually omits quotes).

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P93 L12 # 160

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status A Incorrectly marked comments: pg/ln. 93/12-13.

SuggestedRemedy

mark lines 12 & 13 as comments

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Remove this comment altogether.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P93 L21 # 151

Comment Status A

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter

Meaningless editorial notes. We keep on adding notes to satisfy one commenter's desire to push people to review the draft. It is a voluneer project and if someone is inclined to review and correct, they will submit comment. Likewise, if the original commenter feels the need to improve text, he is welcome to submit a comment against the draft, without the need for

rather vague and pointless comments in the module

SuggestedRemedy

Comment Type E

Remove

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 7 SC 7.3.2 P93 L51 # 150

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter

Comment Type T Comment Status A

OLT and ONU roles are defined as "server" and "client", respectively. In the world of SDN where everything seems to be going, it is more like a "controller" and "client"

SuggestedRemedy

Change all instances of "server" to "controller" when referencing OLT in Clause 7.

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Remove " = server" and " = client" instead.

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P98 L3 # 168 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies Comment Type т Comment Status A The grouping 'trx-threshold-crossing-notification' is not used in the module after its definition SuggestedRemedy remove this grouping Response Response Status C ACCEPT. CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P101 L18 # 169 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies Comment Type TR Comment Status A No definition for featur "trx-power-level-reporting-supported". Missing description and reference.

would ask author to add description and reference information.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following description: "This object indicates the support for optical transceiver power level monitoring and reporting capability. When 'true', the given interface supports the optical power level monitoring and reporting function. Otherwise, the value is 'false'."

There is no 802.3 reference to point to for this specific feature.

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P101 L18 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies Comment Type Comment Status A This feature statement appear to be incorrect and possibly missing significant content. "feature trx-power-level-reporting-supported;" SugaestedRemedy I believe the Feature statement should be of the form: feature trx-power-level-reporting-supported {

Add missing content including description, reference etc. (I'm not sure what the author intended or I would provide it here).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #169

CI 7 P101 SC 7.3.2 L19 # 162

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type Comment Status D Ε

inconsistent style used for keyword "feature" in draft. Sometimes a single line is used sometime a two line style is used. Two line style may cross page boundaries reducing readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Use single line version throughout as shown in RFC 6020.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

# 161

C/ 7 SC 7.3.2 P104 L13 # 163

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

indenting inconsistent in draft reducing readability (ex pg /ln104/12, 110/46, 125/27, 133/49, 134/21, 140/33, 144/15, 144/50, 154/57).

SuggestedRemedy

Use 2 space indenting consistently so that "{" causes subsequent lines to be indented by 2 spaces and "}" removes 2 spaces from indenting.

Indent strings an additional 2 spaces if starting new line and one additional space after initial line of string as such:

"This is the first line on a long string that continues on a second line and then ends.";

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P127 L14 # 171

Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type TR Comment Status A missing "description" for fec-capability leaf.

SuggestedRemedy

would ask author to add description.

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Suggested text for description: "This object is used to identify whether the given interface is cable of suppporting FEC or not."

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P133 L57
Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

When style used for keyword "config" includes a line feed it sometime causes the parameter value (true or false) to be on a different page. If would be easier to read if the keyword and the value were on a single line.

SuggestedRemedy

Use single line version so as not to cross pages.

Proposed Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P166 L14 # 172

Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status A

inconsist module name in namespace "urn:ieee:std:802.3;yang:ethernet-link-oam"

SuggestedRemedy

should be "urn:ieee:std:802.3:yang:ieee802-ethernet-link-oam"

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P168 L40 # 165

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status A

check commented line pg 168 line 40. Is this intentional and correct?

SuggestedRemedy

If intentional add editors note with the explanation of why it is commented.

If unintentional remove "//"

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Remove "//" since we are Yang 1.1 compliant.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P184 L22 # 166

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Large comment block with no explanation pg 184/22 - 185/21.

SugaestedRemedy

Remove comment block or add explanation

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Insert additional text into the draft at this location: "Text is marked as comment right now and will be removed next time around if not indicated otherwise."

# 164