IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/FM SC FM P7 L13	# 106	C/FM SC FM	P10	L	# 156
Law, David HPE		Anslow, Pete	Ciena		
Comment Type E Comment Status D	bucket	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		buck
Please change 'IEEE P802.3.2/802.3cf' to read 'IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 80 and 14.	02.3cf)' on line 13		t D2.0 was ACCEPT with sear 2018 in all sections of the		:
SuggestedRemedy			t year in the TOC is still 201		
See comment.		Also, line numbers are	missing from the TOC		
Proposed Response Response Status W		SuggestedRemedy			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.		Make the copyright yea	ar 2018 in the TOC and add	line numbers to t	he TOC.
		Proposed Response	Response Status W		
C/FM SC FM P7 L16	# 110	PROPOSED ACCEPT			
Law, David HPE		C/ 00 SC 0	Р	L	# 158
Comment Type E Comment Status D	bucket	Anslow, Pete	Ciena		
Please add the list of EEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the IE (IEEE 802.3cf) working group ballot.	EEE P802.3.2	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		buck
SuggestedRemedy			t D2.0 was ACCEPT with s	uggested remedy	:
See comment.		"Remove the blank pages of the b	ges between clauses" ges are still there at the end	of sections 1, 2,	3, 4, and 6.
Proposed Response Response Status W			5		
		SuggestedRemedy			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.		SuggestedRemedy Remove the blank pag	es between clauses		
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	# 107		es between clauses Response Status W		
	# 107	Remove the blank pag	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE	# 107 bucket	Remove the blank pag Proposed Response	Response Status W	L	# 157
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W	L	# <u>157</u>
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D Jonathan Goldberg is now the IEEE 802.3 IEEE Staff Liaison.		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT CI 00 SC 0	Response Status W	L	# <u>157</u> buck
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT CI 00 SC 0 Anslow, Pete Comment Type E The footer in all section	Response Status W P Ciena Comment Status D ns of the draft except the fro	L ntmatter do not c	buck
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D Jonathan Goldberg is now the IEEE 802.3 IEEE Staff Liaison. SuggestedRemedy Please change 'Lisa Perry' to read 'Jonathan Goldberg'.		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT CI 00 SC 0 Anslow, Pete Comment Type E The footer in all section	Response Status W P Ciena Comment Status D	<i>L</i> ntmatter do not c	buck
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D Jonathan Goldberg is now the IEEE 802.3 IEEE Staff Liaison. SuggestedRemedy Please change 'Lisa Perry' to read 'Jonathan Goldberg'.		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT CI 00 SC 0 Anslow, Pete Comment Type E The footer in all section requirements of 9.1.2 c SuggestedRemedy	Response Status W P Ciena Comment Status D ns of the draft except the fro of the IEEE style manual.		buck
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D Jonathan Goldberg is now the IEEE 802.3 IEEE Staff Liaison. SuggestedRemedy Please change 'Lisa Perry' to read 'Jonathan Goldberg'. Proposed Response Response Status W		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT Cl 00 SC 0 Anslow, Pete Comment Type E The footer in all sectior requirements of 9.1.2 c SuggestedRemedy Update the footer in all	Response Status W P Ciena Comment Status D ns of the draft except the fro of the IEEE style manual.		buck
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D Jonathan Goldberg is now the IEEE 802.3 IEEE Staff Liaison. SuggestedRemedy Please change 'Lisa Perry' to read 'Jonathan Goldberg'. Proposed Response Response Status W		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT CI 00 SC 0 Anslow, Pete Comment Type E The footer in all section requirements of 9.1.2 c SuggestedRemedy Update the footer in all "Copyright © 2018 IEE This is an unapproved	Response Status W P Ciena Comment Status D ns of the draft except the fro of the IEEE style manual. sections of the draft to con E. All rights reserved. IEEE Standards Draft, subj	tain:	buck
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D Jonathan Goldberg is now the IEEE 802.3 IEEE Staff Liaison. SuggestedRemedy Please change 'Lisa Perry' to read 'Jonathan Goldberg'. Proposed Response Response Status W		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT CI 00 SC 0 Anslow, Pete Comment Type E The footer in all section requirements of 9.1.2 c SuggestedRemedy Update the footer in all "Copyright © 2018 IEE This is an unapproved with centred alignment	Response Status W P Ciena Comment Status D ns of the draft except the from of the IEEE style manual. sections of the draft to con E. All rights reserved. IEEE Standards Draft, subj	tain:	buck
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ FM SC FM P9 L18 Law, David HPE Comment Type E Comment Status D Jonathan Goldberg is now the IEEE 802.3 IEEE Staff Liaison. SuggestedRemedy Please change 'Lisa Perry' to read 'Jonathan Goldberg'. Proposed Response Response Status W		Remove the blank pag Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT CI 00 SC 0 Anslow, Pete Comment Type E The footer in all section requirements of 9.1.2 c SuggestedRemedy Update the footer in all "Copyright © 2018 IEE This is an unapproved	Response Status W P Ciena Comment Status D ns of the draft except the fro of the IEEE style manual. sections of the draft to con E. All rights reserved. IEEE Standards Draft, subj Response Status W	tain:	buck

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 00 SC	C 0	P10	L	# 162	C/ 00	SC 0		P 25	L81	# 183
Marris, Arthur	•		esign Syste		Seda, Ma	rta		Calix	-••	
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D		bucket	Comment	Туре Е		Comment Status D		
Why are 5.1 Why do son Shouldn't se SuggestedReme Rename su	I and 5.3.2 ne sections ection 8.4 c edy bclauses 5	gs are not in a consistent of 2 both named the same "YA s have a section for securit come before section 8.3? 5.3.2, 6.5.2, 7.3.2 and 8.5.2 security come before section	NG module struc	and others do not?	data. be rep how ti read a dereg would repres netco Suggester updat	If something presented as he actions of and set descr istered, what be cleaner to sents the logi nf actions. dRemedy ed comment	g is no a neto registr iption happe o mak cal linl (4/25/		istration action,). As currently c e.g., deregistere -admin-state wit to be deregister nin-state as a rea , power-down, re	power down), it should lefined, it is unclear d enum value has a th value of ing?). It seems it ad-only attribute that gistering set actions as
Remove "7.	2.1 EPON	architecture highlights" and	d promote the su	bclauses below 7.2.1.	propo	sal where ac	tions a	02_0518_ieee802-ethernet- are used for power/reset/reg eve the status.		
Also consid	er whether	the contents of 7.2.1 are r	eally relevant to t	his standard.	Proposed	Response		Response Status W		
Proposed Resp PROPOSEI		Response Status W			,	,		N PRINCIPLE.		
		5.3.2, 6.5.2, 7.3.2 and 8.5.2	to read "YANG r	nodule"	•	while new act	· ·	per seda_3cf_02_0518_iee re defined in lines 2189-223		, ,
Move section	on 8.4 for s	ecurity before section 8.3 f	or the object map	pping				ons" to "container mpcp-log		actions".
Remove "7.	2.1 EPON	architecture highlights" and	d promote the sul	bclauses below 7.2.1.	- char interfa - char	nge "Request ace"	: a pov power	action requested of the inter	o "Request a sta	0

CI 00 SC 0

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

1/00 SC 0 P77 L33 # 172	Remove the if-feature on page 117 line 31/32	
eda, Marta Calix	C/ 00 SC 0 P98 L29 # 174	
omment Type T Comment Status D	Seda, Marta Calix	
The epon YANG code and tree shows that you have put the fec-capability under the fec-	Comment Type E Comment Status D	
supported YANG feature.	I could not find a corresponding 802.3.1 MIB object that matches ompe-pkts-in des	cription
'+ro fec-capability? fec-capability {fec-supported}?	SuggestedRemedy	
Page 85 defines the fec-supported yang feature to have the values unknown, supported	What is ompe-pkts-in equivalent to in the 802.3.1 MIB model? It seems to aggreg	oto
and unsupported.	ONUPONcastLLID and OLTPONcastLLID (however the present ieee snmp MIBs d	
uggestedRemedy	define it this way).	
The fec-capability feature is defined as:	Proposed Response Response Status W	
feature	PROPOSED REJECT.	
fec-supported {		
description "This object indicates the support of operation of the optional	Reference is to IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.7.1.3 for ompe-pkts-in-errored-sld (an examp	le).
FEC sublayer of the 1000BASE-PX PHY specified in IEEE Std 802.3,	CI 00 SC 0 P112 L3 # 177	
65.2. The value of 'unknown' is reported in the initialization,	Seda, Marta Calix	
for non FEC support state or type not yet known. The value of 'not supported' is reported when the sublayer is not supported.	Comment Type T Comment Status D	
The value of 'supported' is reported when the sublayer is	mpcp-queue-threshold-count-max is defined as a RW attribute. 802.3.1	
supported. This object is applicable for an OLT, with the	dot3ExtPkgObjectReportMaximumNumThreshold is defined as a Read-only attribu	te. Not
same value for all logical links, and for an ONU. All objects in the fec/statistics container have a zero value	that the description of the attribute is also read.	
when the interface is not supporting FEC.";	SuggestedRemedy	
	Please fix by adding a config false statement in the YANG file.	
YANG feature are either there or not (they don't assume integer values as described). I would recommend cleaning this up and instead using the below definition.	undeted commont $(4/24/19)$.	
feature fec-supported {	updated comment (4/24/18): the attached seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang line 838 fixes this.	
description "FEC is supported }	Proposed Response Response Status W	
	PROPOSED ACCEPT.	
A YANG user may want to know whether the device has FEC support or not. The fec- capability leaf/attribute should therefore not be under YANG feature fec-supported).	TROPOSED ACCELT.	
(remove the if-feature on page 117 line 31/32).	Comment type was changed from E to T	
Updated comment (4/24/18) For your convenience, this issue has been fixed in the attached		
seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang (line 2072).		
seda_sci_oz_os io_leeeooz-ethemet-pon.yang (inte zorz).		
roposed Response Response Status W		
roposed Response Response Status W		
roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 00 SC 0 Page 3 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:30 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 1	SC 1	P13	L 4	# 108
Law, Davi	id	HPE		

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D**

I have a number of concerns in relation to the first paragraph of the overview text, including its alignment with the definitions found in IEEE Std 802.3-2015 subclause 1.4 'Definitions':

[1] Is it correct that these YANG models are for 'Ethernet links', instead aren't they for the end stations. A point to point full duplex 'Ethernet link' doesn't just have a YANG model, it will have two, one in each of the two end stations on the link. Similarly for a shared media 'Ethernet link' where instead of a model it will have as many YANG models as there are end stations.

[2] CSMA/CD can operate over both 'shared media' (a 'mixing segment', see IEEE Std 802.3-2015 subclause 1.4.277) such as coax, and 'point-to-point' media (a 'link segment', see IEEE Std 802.3-2015 subclause 1.4.255) such as twisted pair. Based on this the statement that 'This document defines YANG modules for shared media Ethernet links using CSMA/CD, dedicated Ethernet links in point-to-point ...' precludes YANG models for CSMA/CD operation over link segments which I don't think is correct. I believe a YANG model is provided for CSMA/CD operation regardless of the segment type.

[3] One of the potential components of a 'dedicated Ethernet point-to-point link' is a Midspan PSE. Since subclause 6.2 of YANG module of PSEs states 'The module augments the ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module with attributes for PoE function' it appears that the PSE YANG module can only be associated with an 'Ethernet interface'. Since a Midspan PSE doesn't have an 'Ethernet interface' it appears to me the PSE YANG module is only applicable to Endpoint PSEs. Similarly one of the potential components of a 'shared media Ethernet link' is a repeater, however this is no YANG module provided for Repeaters.

Based on all the above it seems that the draft provides a YANG model for an Ethernet end station ('data terminal equipment (DTE)', see IEEE Std 802.3-2015 subclause 1.4.173).

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that the first paragraph be changed to read 'This standard defines YANG modules for Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes DTEs operation on mixing segments, using either CSMA/CD or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), operation on link segments, and operation as Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change the first para to read

'This standard defines YANG modules for Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes DTEs operating on mixing segments, using either CSMA/CD or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), link segments, and as Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).'

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 1	SC 1		P 13	L 9	# 109
Law, Dav	id		HPE		
~		•			

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

I would suggest that an edited version the second paragraph of Clause 1 'Overview' be moved to be the 'Introduction' text in the frontmatter which hasn't been provided yet.

SuggestedRemedy

[1] Delete the second paragraph of Clause 1 'Overview'.

[2] Add the following new 'Introduction' text to the frontmatter immediately before the Table of Contents.

Introduction

<BOX>

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std 802.3.2-20XX, IEEE Draft Standard for Ethernet YANG Data Model Definitions. </BOX>

This initial version of this standard is based on the managed object definitions provided in IEEE Std 802.3TM-201X. IEEE Std 802.3 will continue to evolve. New Ethernet capabilities are anticipated to be added within the next few years, as amendments to IEEE Std 802.3. This may results in amendments or revision to IEEE Std 802.3.2.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 1 SC 1 Page 4 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:30 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 1	SC 1.2	P13	1	# 184
	30 1.2	7 13	L	# 104
Seda, N	larta	Calix		

Comment Type Е Comment Status D

This section describes the 802.3/draft folder however does not list out the multiple files you have in that folder nor its purpose. Also if you go up two levels (in github), you have a draft folder containing yang types.

SuggestedRemedy

This document would benefit with descriptions around the structure that you have (or intending to have). For example, add a paragraph that states:

The following YANG modules are contained in that folder:

, jeee802-ethernet-pon.vang (IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64/77 Ethernet PON YANG model) .. Etc

The following IETF modules are used: // It is useful to understand what other SDO modules you are augmenting to. - ietf-interfaces. etc

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

Git repository is not the normative resource for this project. Git is used only as means for distributuon of machine readable content. Document structure is clear enough in listing individual YANG modules and specific modules list imports providing necessary information on what external modules are loaded (imported).

C/ 1	SC 1.2	P13	L 27	# 111
Law, David		HPE		

Comment Type Comment Status D ER

Subclause 10.4.3 'Purpose' of the IEEE-SA Standards Style Manual states that 'For new and revision projects, the purpose (if included) of the draft shall be within the parameters of the purpose given on the PAR, as determined by the balloting group voting on the draft.

Since the IEEE P802.3.2 PAR item 5.4 'purpose' reads 'The purpose of the standard is to define YANG models for IEEE Std 802.3 and publish these models in a machine-readable format.' suggest that all the other text that has been added about where the machinereadable files can be found and what to do in the case of discrepancies between the machine-readable YANG modules and pdf should be moved to a separate subclause.

SuggestedRemedy

Move all the subclause 1.2 'Purpose' text, with the exception of the first paragraph which match the purpose text in the PAR. to a new subclause.

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Move all the subclause 1.2 'Purpose' text, with the exception of the first paragraph which match the purpose text in the PAR, to a new subclause 1.3. entitled "Machine-readable YANG modules"

C/ 1	SC 1.4	Р	L	# 186
Seda, Mar	ta	Calix		

Comment Status D Comment Type T

NETCONF over TLS is not mentioned in the first paragraph (RFC 5539).

SuggestedRemedy

It is true that IETF mandates NETCONF over SSH. Some mention of NETCONF over TLS should be added to this paragraph (you could take IETF's position that it is optional).

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Comment type was changed from E to T

Change "The lowest NETCONF layer is the secure transport layer, and the mandatory-to-implement secure transport is Secure Shell (SSH) (see IETF RFC 6242)" to "The lowest NETCONF layer is the secure transport layer, and the mandatory-to-implement secure transport is Secure Shell (SSH) (see IETF RFC 6242) or TLS (see IETF RFC 5246)."

C/ 1

SC 1.4

Page 5 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:30 AM

Comments Received IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 1 SC 1.4	P13	L 55	# 91	C/ 3 SC 3	P18	L 7	# 101
huang, Yan	Huawei Tech	inologies		Slavick, Jeff	Broadcom Inc		
omment Type ER C	Comment Status D			Comment Type T	Comment Status D		bucke
"The YANG module defined		gned to be acces	sed" There are 5	Definitions don't beg	in with what you're defining that's	s already been	stated.
modules but one model def	inea			SuggestedRemedy			
uggestedRemedy change it to "The YANG mc defined in this standard is		andard are" or "	The YANG model	Change 3.1 data mo and accessed.	del: To be "3.1 data model: [Description of h	now data is reprsented
	esponse Status W			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN P	•			PROPOSED REJEC	CT.		
change the referenced text	-	ned in this standa	rd are"	Comment type was o	changed from E to T		
1 2 SC 2	P16	L 49	# 92	Current definition is r	not circular or self referencing.		
nuang, Yan	Huawei Tech		# <u>52</u>	C/ 3 SC 3	P18	L10	# 102
0	Comment Status D	5	8343	Slavick, Jeff	Broadcom Inc		
IETF 7223bis which is A YA as RFC 8343.		erface Manageme		Comment Type T Definitions don't beg	Comment Status D in with what you're defining that	s already been	bucke stated.
uggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
replace all RFC 7223 to RF	C 8343.			Remove "A YANG m	nodule defines a" from the defint	ion text for YAN	NG module.
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12	C 8343.			Remove "A YANG m Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC	Response Status W	ion text for YAN	NG module.
p16,line49 p28,line36	C 8343.			Proposed Response	Response Status W	ion text for YAN	NG module.
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12 p33,line31 p34,line28 p34,line47 p36,line23	C 8343.			Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC Comment type was o	Response Status W	ion text for YAN	NG module.
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12 p33,line31 p34,line28 p34,line47 p36,line23				Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC Comment type was o	Response Status W CT. changed from E to T	L9	NG module. # 103
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12 p33,line31 p34,line28 p34,line47 p36,line23 oposed Response Re	esponse Status W			Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC Comment type was o Current definition is n	Response Status W CT. changed from E to T not circular or self referencing.		
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12 p33,line31 p34,line28 p34,line47 p36,line23 roposed Response Re PROPOSED ACCEPT IN P	esponse Status W RINCIPLE.			Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC Comment type was of Current definition is n C/ 5 SC 5.2	Response Status W CT. changed from E to T not circular or self referencing. P23		
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12 p33,line31 p34,line28 p34,line47 p36,line23 roposed Response Re	esponse Status W RINCIPLE. 343 to list of normative r	references + remo	ove RFC 7223 from the	Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC Comment type was of Current definition is n C/ 5 SC 5.2 Slavick, Jeff Comment Type TR	Response Status W CT. changed from E to T not circular or self referencing. P23 Broadcom Inc <i>Comment Status</i> D legAdminControl is really acAuto	L9	# 103
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12 p33,line31 p34,line28 p34,line47 p36,line23 roposed Response Re PROPOSED ACCEPT IN P Per comment + add RFC 83	esponse Status W RINCIPLE. 343 to list of normative r	references + remo	ove RFC 7223 from the	Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC Comment type was of Current definition is n Cl 5 SC 5.2 Slavick, Jeff Comment Type TR In Table 501 aAutoN	Response Status W CT. changed from E to T not circular or self referencing. P23 Broadcom Inc <i>Comment Status</i> D legAdminControl is really acAuto	L9	# 103
p16,line49 p28,line36 p33,line12 p33,line31 p34,line28 p34,line47 p36,line23 Proposed Response Re PROPOSED ACCEPT IN P Per comment + add RFC 83	esponse Status W RINCIPLE. 343 to list of normative r	references + remo	ove RFC 7223 from the	Proposed Response PROPOSED REJEC Comment type was of Current definition is n Cl 5 SC 5.2 Slavick, Jeff Comment Type TR In Table 501 aAutoN clause that can be re SuggestedRemedy	Response Status W CT. changed from E to T not circular or self referencing. P23 Broadcom Inc <i>Comment Status</i> D legAdminControl is really acAuto eferenced. dminControl to acAutoNegAdmir	L 9 DNegAdminCor	# 103

Page 6 of 47

5/9/2018 7:00:30 AM

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general C/ 5 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SC 5.2 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

SC 5.2 P23 L23 # 104 Jeff Broadcom Inc Image: Comparison of the second seco	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P28 L62 # 43 Trowbridge, Steve Nokia
	-
nt Type TR Comment Status D comment D2.0 comment #207 all MIB/RFC fields were suppose to be moved into le 5-2. However, dot3HCInPFCFrames and dot3HCOutPFCFrames are still in Table tedRemedy	There is a difference between the content in pdf and in Git: the git version also contains a
ve these fields into Table 5-2.	SuggestedRemedy
ed Response Response Status W DPOSED ACCEPT.	Assure the content of the pdf and the git is identical. Probably add the reference statemer in the pdf. Correct the indentation in the YANG module (Git).
SC 5.3.2.1 P28 L36 # 42	Proposed Response Response Status W
dge, Steve Nokia	PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
nt Type T Comment Status D &	43
C 7223 is the former RFC specifying the interface model. It is the none-NMDA version	Add back reference to the draft per comment #126
ently IETF approved an update which is NMDA compliant: RFC 8343. As IEEE follow NMDA approach and as the updated interface model reached RFC status it would be	Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P28 L63 # 126
er to refer to RFC 8343.	Remein, Duane Huawei
tedRemedy	Comment Type TR Comment Status D
place:	The draft seems to be missing several lines from the file on Github.
IF RFC 7223"	SuggestedRemedy
FF RFC 8343" nalogy: change this reference throughout the full document.	Restore the following lines in the draft which immediately follow the description. Note that the Github file seems to contain tab characters which should be replaced with spaces as interplaced before the second s
ed Response Response Status W	done below.
OPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	reference "IEEE Std 802.3-2018, unless dated explicitly";
e comment #92.	typedef eth-if-speed-type {
nment type was changed from E to T	type decimal64 { fraction-digits 3; } units "Gb/s"; description "Used to represent the configured, negotiated, or actual speed of an Ethernet interface in Gigabits per second (Gb/s), accurate to 3 decimal places (i.e., accurate to 1 Mb/s)"; }
	Proposed Response Response Status W
	PROPOSED ACCEPT.
R/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/edito	al G/general C/ 5 Page 7 of 47

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
 SC 5.3.2.1
 5/9/2018 7:00:31 AM

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 5.3.2.1
 S/9/2018 7:00:31 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 29	L 35	# 44	CI 5 SC	5.3.2.1	P 30	L 21	# 45
Trowbridge, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridge, Stev	/e	Nokia		
Comment Type T Comment S	tatus D		bucket	Comment Type	т	Comment Status D		buck
This is a continuation of D2.0 commen The data node "dupplex" is read-write. contain 'the configured, negotiated, or This is not well reflected in the descript in the description of the typedef 'eth-if-	Depending or actual' value.	the datastore the datastore the datastore datast for the datast fo	nis data node can ata node "speed".	The typedef support of pa	"pause-fc- ause frame e descripti	of D2.0 comment 339 in ge direction-type" mentions c es can also be negotiated. on similar to the descriptio	onfiguration and op It might be worth t	perational state. The o accentuate this by
SuggestedRemedy				Replace:	uy			
Replace: "The current duplex mode of operation by: "Used to represent the configured, neg interface."			e of an Ethernet	"Enumerates explicit confi by:	guration, o	ble PAUSE frame based f or when reporting the opera configured, negotiated, or	ational state"	
Proposed Response Response St	atus W			Proposed Respo	onse	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				PROPOSED	ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.		
Comment type was abanged from E to	т			Comment ty	pe was cha	anged from E to T		
Comment type was changed from E to	-					0		
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment S There are several discrepancies betwee Github. In the draft there are no long li	P29 Iuawei <i>tatus</i> D en the module			Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by:	guration, o	ble PAUSE frame based f or when reporting the opera configured, negotiated, or	ational state"	
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment Si There are several discrepancies betwe Github. In the draft there are no long li several.	P29 Iuawei <i>tatus</i> D en the module	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting.	guration, o	or when reporting the opera	ational state"	
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment St There are several discrepancies betwe Github. In the draft there are no long li several. SuggestedRemedy	P29 Iuawei <i>tatus</i> D en the module	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting.	guration, o	or when reporting the opera	ational state" actual PAUSE fra	me-based flow control
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment Si There are several discrepancies betwe Github. In the draft there are no long li several.	P29 Iuawei <i>tatus</i> D en the module	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting. C/ 5 SC	guration, o	or when reporting the operation of the o	ational state" actual PAUSE fra	me-based flow control
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment Si There are several discrepancies betwe Github. In the draft there are no long li several. SuggestedRemedy Correct the long lines in the Github. fixed in remein_3cf_4_0518 Proposed Response Response St	P29 Huawei fatus D en the module nes in the des	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting. <i>CI</i> 5 <i>SC</i> Boyd, Joey <i>Comment Type</i> Since you ca	guration, o resent the 5.3.2.1 T an have Eti	or when reporting the operation of the o	ational state" • actual PAUSE fra 	me-based flow control # <u>39</u>
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment Si There are several discrepancies betwee Github. In the draft there are no long li several. SuggestedRemedy Correct the long lines in the Github. fixed in remein_3cf_4_0518	P29 Huawei fatus D en the module nes in the des	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting. <i>CI</i> 5 <i>SC</i> Boyd, Joey <i>Comment Type</i> Since you ca	guration, o resent the 5.3.2.1 T an have Ett ould have	or when reporting the operation configured, negotiated, or P30 ADTRAN Comment Status D hernet interfaces which do	ational state" • actual PAUSE fra 	me-based flow control # <u>39</u>
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment Si There are several discrepancies betwe Github. In the draft there are no long li several. SuggestedRemedy Correct the long lines in the Github. fixed in remein_3cf_4_0518 Proposed Response Response St	P29 Huawei fatus D en the module nes in the des	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting. <i>CI</i> 5 <i>SC</i> Boyd, Joey <i>Comment Type</i> Since you ca container sh	guration, o resent the 5.3.2.1 T an have Ett ould have edy	or when reporting the operation configured, negotiated, or P30 ADTRAN Comment Status D hernet interfaces which do	ational state" • actual PAUSE fra 	me-based flow control # <u>39</u>
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment Si There are several discrepancies betwee Github. In the draft there are no long lisseveral. SuggestedRemedy Correct the long lines in the Github. fixed in remein_3cf_4_0518 Proposed Response Response St	P29 Huawei fatus D en the module nes in the des	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting. <i>CI</i> 5 <i>SC</i> Boyd, Joey <i>Comment Type</i> Since you ca container sh <i>SuggestedReme</i> Add the follo presence "The prese	guration, o resent the 5.3.2.1 T an have Ett ould have edy wwing: nce of this	or when reporting the operation configured, negotiated, or P30 ADTRAN Comment Status D hernet interfaces which do	ational state" actual PAUSE fra <i>L</i> 58	me-based flow control # <u>39</u>
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Remein, Duane H Comment Type TR Comment Si There are several discrepancies betwee Github. In the draft there are no long lisseveral. SuggestedRemedy Correct the long lines in the Github. fixed in remein_3cf_4_0518 Proposed Response Response St	P29 Huawei fatus D en the module nes in the des	e in the draft and	the module on	Replace: "Enumerates explicit confi by: "Used to rep setting. <i>CI</i> 5 <i>SC</i> Boyd, Joey <i>Comment Type</i> Since you ca container sh <i>SuggestedReme</i> Add the follo presence "The prese	guration, o resent the 5.3.2.1 T an have Ett ould have edy wing: nce of this on this Ett	or when reporting the operation of the o	ational state" actual PAUSE fra <i>L</i> 58	me-based flow control # <u>39</u>

CI 5	SC	5.3.2.1	P 30	L 63	# 46	CI 5	SC	5.3.2.1	P 31	L11	# 47	
Trowbridg	ge, Steve	e	Nokia			Trowbridg	ge, Steve	е	Nokia			
Comment	t Type	т	Comment Status D		bucket	Commen	t Type	т	Comment Status D			bucket
definit One p corres comm contai Suggested "This If not type o by: "This negot If not	ition. possible sponding nents). I iner leve edRemed ace: leaf allo specified of Etherr containe tiation to specified	solution is g leaf (and hereby as el. Ok, but dy ws the adh d then the het PHY as be restric d then the	f D2.0 comment 339, i.e. ass to put all the leaf specific in this was the underlying assu- sume that the IEEE preferent then the description is modif vertised duplex value in the r default behavior is to negoti- ssociated with the interface." is a data node that allows the ted. default behavior for the dupl particular type of Ethernet P	formation into the second seco	e description of the various D2.0 so some description at restricted. values for the particular ex value in the to negotiate all	For a how t config Suggeste "If au config nego nego By: "If au config	manage the syste guration edRemed by the l to-negot gured, th tiated all tiated (d to-negot gured, th tiated all	ement inte em shall be is not affe dy last senter tiation is en hen the de lows for bi- lepending tiation is en hen the de lows for bi-	f D2.0 comment 339 in gener rface one expects to define the ehave, and via operational dated ted by the peer device capa note, i.e. replace: nabled, and PAUSE frame based flo -directional or egress-only PA on the peer device capabilities nabled, and PAUSE frame based flo -directional or egress-only PA fault PAUSE frame based flo -directional or egress-only PA <i>Response Status</i> W	hat via configura at the system re bilities/configura ased flow contro w control capabi AUSE frame bas s/configuration). ased flow contro w control capabi	ation data one in eports back. The ation. I has not been ilities that are ed flow control " I has not been ilities that are	explicitly to be explicitly
Proposed	l Respon		Response Status W						IN PRINCIPLE.			
			nged from E to T			Remo	ove the l	last senter	nce, i.e. replace:	and flow contro	l haa not haan	ovolicitly
	Duane <i>t Type</i> e is a dis		P 31 Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D between the module in the d			config nego nego By: "If au	gured, th tiated all tiated (d to-negot	nen the de lows for bi- lepending tiation is e	nabled, and PAUSE frame based flo fault PAUSE frame based flo -directional or egress-only PA on the peer device capabilitie nabled, and PAUSE frame ba	w control capabi AUSE frame bas s/configuration). ased flow contro	ilities that are ed flow control ." I has not been	to be
appea	ars in the	e descripti	not appear. If I download the on for the auto-negotiation co n the draft misrepresents the	ontainer. It seer					fault PAUSE frame based flo directional or egress-only PAI			
	ect the m	isspelling	in the Github, mein_3cf_4_0518.									
Proposed PROF		nse ACCEPT.	Response Status W									

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.1	P 31	L 35	# 48	C/ 5 S	SC 5.3.2.1	P 31	L 38	# 49
Trowbrid	dge, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridge, St	eve	Nokia		
Comme	ent Type T	Comment Status D		bucket	Comment Type	ə T	Comment Status D		
Ass	signing a default a	of D2.0 comment 339 in gene utomatically means the leaf wi pport auto-negotiation. Add so	ill always have a	-	The leaf "r	negotiation-s	of D2.0 comment 339 in gene tatus" has 4 values. Shall the on? If yes, which value?		nterfaces that do not
Sugges	stedRemedy				SuggestedRer	nedy			
"Fo is ig	d at the end of the or interface types th gnored."; <i>ed Response</i>	to decription nat do not support auto-negoti Response Status W	ation then the re	lated configuration data	value:	egotiation {	ct exists for all Ethernet interfa	aces. Therefore	introduce an extra
•	OPOSED ACCEP	•			that type o	f interface, c	executed. This can be becau or because auto-negotiation is value 'unknown' for the situat	not enabled.";	
Cor	mment type was c	hanged from E to T				is unknow		lion auto-negotia	
۸dc	d at the end of the	to decription			Proposed Res	ponse	Response Status W		
"Fo		nat do not support auto-negoti	ation, the related	l configuration data is	PROPOSE	ED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.		
5	,				The object values:	exists for al	I Ethernet interfaces. Add an	extra value to th	e already defined enum
					descriptior		executed. The auto-negotati	on function is eit	her not supported on

"No auto-negotiation is executed. The auto-negotation function is either not supported on this interface or has not been enabled.";

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 32	L17	# 50	CI 5	SC 5.3	.2.1	P 32	L 47	# 52
Frowbridge, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridge	e, Steve		Nokia		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			Comment	Туре Е		Comment Status		
Leaf duplex: the stateme	D2.0 comment 339 in gene ent "The default value is im in the type definition, see F	plementation-dep	endent." is in conflict	The de	escription f		f D2.0 comment 339 in leaf "direction" can be i		
default value creates a 3 At minimum the 2 staten	Brd situation, i.e. the leaf ha nents shall be made consis he leaf duplex and I propos	is no value. stent. Hereby I as			ce: ates which				nabled in, or whether it is
uggestedRemedy		·					ow-control settings are based flow-control is ne		
1. Remove p29 line 32, i 2. P32 line 18: add some Replace:				The de By: "If auto The co	efault value o-negotiatio	e is imp on is ei n of this	blementation-depender nabled, then PAUSE bas s leaf indicates for whic	i." Ised flow-control i h direction PAUSI	s negotiated by default. E frame based flow contro
	configuration and if not con ent. The operational datasto			impler	nentation-c d value".		er it is disabled. If not c lent. The operational da Response Status V	tastore shall alwa	applied value is ays contain the actually
roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT II	Response Status W			•	OSED RE	JECT.	Response Status V		
	o is implementation depend	dont" in "loof dunl	ov"	Existin	ng text is su	ufficien	t and technically correc	t.	
Strike: "The default value	e is implementation-depend			Existin C/ 5	ng text is su SC 5.3		t and technically correct	t. L 2	# 53
Strike: "The default value 5 SC 5.3.2.1	e is implementation-depend P 32 Nokia	dent" in "leaf dupl L 38	ex" # <u>51</u>	C/ 5 Trowbridge	SC 5.3 e, Steve	.2.1	P 34 Nokia		# 53
Strike: "The default value 5 SC 5.3.2.1 owbridge, Steve	P 32			Cl 5 Trowbridge Comment	SC 5.3 e, Steve <i>Type</i> E	.2.1	P 34 Nokia Comment Status	L 2	
Strike: "The default value 5 SC 5.3.2.1 owbridge, Steve <i>omment Type</i> E This is a continuation of	P 32 Nokia <i>Comment Status</i> D D2.0 comment 339 in gene	L38	# <u>51</u>	CI 5 Trowbridge Comment This is	SC 5.3 e, Steve <i>Type</i> E a continua	.2.1	P34 Nokia Comment Status D f D2.0 comment 339 in	L2 general and comr	
Strike: "The default value of 5 SC 5.3.2.1 rowbridge, Steve comment Type E This is a continuation of The description of the lea	P 32 Nokia Comment Status D	L38	# <u>51</u>	CI 5 Trowbridge Comment This is	SC 5.3 e, Steve <i>Type</i> E a continua c/enable: in	.2.1	P34 Nokia Comment Status D f D2.0 comment 339 in	L2 general and comr	ment 343 in specific.
Strike: "The default value of 5 SC 5.3.2.1 rowbridge, Steve comment Type E This is a continuation of The description of the lea uggestedRemedy Replace:	P32 Nokia <i>Comment Status</i> D D2.0 comment 339 in gene af "speed" can improved.	L38	# <u>51</u>	Cl 5 Trowbridge Comment This is leaf pf Suggested Replac "The d	SC 5.3 e, Steve Type E a a continua c/enable: in IRemedy ce:	.2.1 ation of	P34 Nokia Comment Status D f D2.0 comment 339 in	L2 general and comr efault value is imp	ment 343 in specific.
Strike: "The default value 5 SC 5.3.2.1 owbridge, Steve <i>comment Type</i> E This is a continuation of The description of the lease <i>uggestedRemedy</i> Replace: "The default value is implementation-depended by: "The leaf is optional for of implementation-depended	P32 Nokia <i>Comment Status</i> D D2.0 comment 339 in gene af "speed" can improved.	L38 eral and comment	# <u>51</u> 341 in specific.	Cl 5 Trowbridge Comment This is leaf pf Suggested "The d by: "The le implen	SC 5.3 SC 5.3 Se, Steve Type E a continua c/enable: in <i>Remedy</i> ce: lefault valu eaf is optio	.2.1 ation of mprove le is im nal for	P34 Nokia Comment Status D f D2.0 comment 339 in a the description "The o plementation-depende configuration and if no	L2 general and comr efault value is imp nt" configured then t	ment 343 in specific. plementation-dependent"
Strike: "The default value 5 SC 5.3.2.1 rowbridge, Steve <i>comment Type</i> E This is a continuation of The description of the lease <i>uggestedRemedy</i> Replace: "The default value is impley: "The leaf is optional for continue in the lease implementation-dependent applied value".	P32 Nokia Comment Status D D2.0 comment 339 in gene af "speed" can improved.	L38 eral and comment	# <u>51</u> 341 in specific.	Cl 5 Trowbridge Comment This is leaf pf Suggested "The d by: "The le implen	SC 5.3 SC 5.3 Se, Steve Type E s a continua c/enable: in IRemedy ce: lefault valu eaf is optio nentation-o d value".	.2.1 ation of mprove le is im nal for	P34 Nokia Comment Status D f D2.0 comment 339 in a the description "The o plementation-depende configuration and if no	L2 general and comr efault value is imp nt" configured then t tastore shall alwa	ment 343 in specific. plementation-dependent"
Strike: "The default value 5 SC 5.3.2.1 rowbridge, Steve comment Type E This is a continuation of The description of the lease uggestedRemedy Replace: "The default value is impley: "The leaf is optional for of implementation-dependent applied value". roposed Response	P32 Nokia Comment Status D D2.0 comment 339 in gene af "speed" can improved.	L38 eral and comment	# <u>51</u> 341 in specific.	Cl 5 Trowbridge Comment This is leaf pf Suggested "The d by: "The le implen applied	SC 5.3 SC 5.3 Se, Steve Type E s a continua c/enable: in IRemedy ce: lefault valu eaf is optio nentation-o d value".	.2.1 ation of mprove le is im nal for depend	P34 Nokia Comment Status D f D2.0 comment 339 in e the description "The o plementation-depende configuration and if no lent. The operational da	L2 general and comr efault value is imp nt" configured then t tastore shall alwa	ment 343 in specific. plementation-dependent"
Strike: "The default value of 5 SC 5.3.2.1 rowbridge, Steve Comment Type E This is a continuation of The description of the lease SuggestedRemedy Replace: "The default value is impley: "The leaf is optional for of implementation-depended	<i>P</i> 32 Nokia <i>Comment Status</i> D D2.0 comment 339 in gene af "speed" can improved.	L38 eral and comment	# <u>51</u> 341 in specific.	Cl 5 Trowbridge Comment This is leaf pf Suggested "The d by: "The le impler applied Proposed PROP	SC 5.3 SC 5.3 Se, Steve Type E s a continua c/enable: in IRemedy ce: lefault valu eaf is optio nentation-c d value". Response OSED RE.	.2.1 ation of mprove le is im nal for depend	P34 Nokia Comment Status D f D2.0 comment 339 in e the description "The o plementation-depende configuration and if no lent. The operational da	L2 general and comr efault value is imp nt" configured then t tastore shall alwa	ment 343 in specific. plementation-dependent"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Page 11 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:31 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 5	SC 5.3.2.1	P 35	L11	# 54	C/ 5	SC	5.3.2.1	P 36	L 2	# 55
Trowbrid	ge, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridg	ge, Steve	e	Nokia		
Commen	t Type T	Comment Status D			Commen	t Type	т	Comment Status D		buck
leaf f	orce-flow-control: i	f D2.0 comment 339 in gene mprove the description "The		mplementation-				is part of a config false contai ult values are not relevant in		
simu Solut	tion: either remove	has a default value, see p 34 the default statement (and in h. Here the first is assumed.				ove the "	'default fa	lse" statement.		
Suggeste	edRemedy				Proposed PRO	,	nse ACCEPT	Response Status W		
2. Re	eplace:	atement from p34 line 56.			CI 5 Trowbridg		5.3.2.1	Р36 Nokia	L 45	# 56
imple appli Proposed PRO	ementation-depended ed value". <i>d Response</i> POSED ACCEPT ove the statement	configuration and if not confi lent. The operational datasto <i>Response Status</i> W IN PRINCIPLE. "The default value is implem	re shall always c	ontain the actually	The object object interfa First: 2nd:	is a cont descriptio at is also aces YA this des it is in co specifie	on of the c counted b NG modu cription is pontradictio d counter	Comment Status D of D2.0 comment 338. container includes "A frame the by the corresponding instance le (IETF RFC 7223)." In not part of an object so it is in n with the statement in section is not supported.	e of 'in-errors' lea	af defined in the ietf- refers to.
<i>CI</i> 5 Remein,	SC 5.3.2.1 Duane	P 35 Huawei	L 62	# 129	Remo "A fra	ove the p ame that	paragraph is counte	: d by an instance of this objec af defined in the ietf-interface		
•	• •	Comment Status D twice. Also on pf 87 line 61		bucket	Proposed	l Respor		Response Status W		e (IETE RFC 7223).
00	nge to "capabilities"	' (Included in remein_3cf_3_	0518 for pg 87 i	emein_3cf_4_0518 for	Chan	iged con	nment typ	e from E to T		
Proposed	d Response	Response Status W								

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 5 Boyd, Joey	SC 5.3.2.1	P 36 ADTRAN	L 58	# 40		<i>CI</i> 5 Zhuang, Y	SC 5.3.2.2 an	P 46 Huawei Tec	L 57 hnologies	# 93
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D				Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D		
the uni	its are frames an	ese counts is the Ethernet fra d the descriptions refer to fra	mes. In light of	that, I believe the	e leaf	missin Suggested	•	quest half-duplex interfaces	derived from ethe	rnetCsmacd.
		ames' instead of 'pkts'. It is une consistency but this mode				00		elf(/if:type, 'ianaift:ethernet	tCsmacd')" to "whe	en" statements
Suggested		le consistency but this mode	i is dealing exci	usively with han		P46, L	ine 57:		,	
00		to use 'frames' instead of 'pki	ts'.				'derived-from-or ine 21:	-self(/if:type, 'ianaift:ethern	etCsmacd') and e	th-if:duplex = 'half'"
0	Response	Response Status W						r-self(//if:type, 'ianaift:ethe	ernetCsmacd') and	l/eth-if:duplex = 'half'"
•	OSED ACCEPT.					p47, lii when 'half'"		r-self(//if:type, 'ianaift:et	hernetCsmacd') a	nd//eth-if:duplex =
Comm	ent type was cha	anged from E to T				Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
CI 5 Remein, D	SC 5.3.2.1	Р 42 Ниаwei	L14	# 130			OSED ACCEPT	,		
-		Comment Status D			hugkat	C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.3	P 46	L 64	# 94
Comment	51	e word description appears in	n the description	n text it is surrou	bucket	Zhuang, Y	an	Huawei Tec	hnologies	
	quotes, not so he		in the description		lueu by	Comment	Type ER	Comment Status D		
uggested	Remedy					chang	e the wording "d	eprecated" in description.		
	ind the word with					Suggested	Remedy			
		mein_3cf_4_0518					e the description			
	Response	Response Status W				0		et interface configuration par	rameters for half d	uplex."
PROP	OSED ACCEPT.					Proposed		Response Status W		
5/5	SC 5.3.2.1	P 43	L19	# 131		PROP	USED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.		
Remein, D	uane	Huawei					e the descriptior			
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			bucket	"Augm	ent with Etherne	et interface configuration pa	rameters for half d	uplex operation."
This se	entence does not					C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.4	P 47	L 56	# 95
		ccurrences of the transition fi ERTED to state LPI ASSER				Zhuang, Y	an	Huawei Tec	hnologies	
	_	e diagram is the RS"				Comment	Type ER	Comment Status D		
uggested	Remedy					incorre	ect description			
Chang	e to (observe inc	enting and line feeds):				Suggested	Remedy			
	LPI_DEASS	ccurrences of the transition fine transition fine text of the transition fine text of the text of				0	e the description ent with statistic	n to statistics: cs for half duplex Ethernet in	nterface."	
This fix		e diagram of the RS" DED in remein_3cf_4_0518				Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
Proposed I	Response	Response Status W				PROP	OSED ACCEPT			
	, OSED ACCEPT.									
YPE: TR/		d ER/editorial required GR/g patched A/accepted R/reject						C/ sc	5	Page 13 of 47

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 5 SC Table 5-1Table 5-2T P L # 191	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 P56 L1 # 132
Seda, Marta Calix	Remein, Duane Huawei
Comment Type E Comment Status D	Comment Type TR Comment Status D
Use of more YANG friendly terms.	There is a discrepancy between the module in the draft and the module on Github. In t
uggestedRemedy	draft "auto-negotation" does not appear. If I download the module from Github the misspelling appears in the description for the negotiation-status leaf. It seems that the
One table header is titled "corresponding ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG data nodes".	module text shown on pg 31 line 51 in the draft misrepresents the Github module.
Shouldn't the header be relabeled "Corresponding ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module"? (swap the term data node with module).	SuggestedRemedy
	Correct the misspelling in the Github
The 2nd to last column has a header called Data Node. The column content contain leaf names. Would it be more accurate to relabel this header instead to "Leaf Name"?.	Proposed Response Response Status W
	PROPOSED ACCEPT.
The last column has a header titled R/W. YANG supports the ability to declare something	
as config true/false. (the term R/W isn't used in YANG). I personally prefer keeping this column (it is short and to the point) instead of swapping the contents to YANG terms.	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 P56 L15 # 133 Remein, Duane Huawei
Would it be possible to move this column to the left of the Reference column?	
roposed Response Response Status W	Comment Type E Comment Status D k
PROPOSED REJECT.	Numerous editorial changes to descriptions including: Sentence capitalization, ending periods, and tab replacement with spaces. A few typo corrections included that are
This table lists nodes within the module correspondign to specific attribute in Clause 30.	detailed in other comments.
Current description is correct.	SuggestedRemedy
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 P L # 167	See remein_3cf_1_0518 ieee802-ethernet-pse diff.docx
David Tremblay Hewlett Packard Enter	Proposed Response Response Status W
	PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Comment Type E Comment Status D Include reference to Clause 145, where applicable	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 P56 L37 # 96
	Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies
add clause 145 reference for multi-pair PSE and any other applicable locations	Comment Type TR Comment Status D
	The prefix "yang" is not defined in ieee802-ethernet-pse module. Missing import of "ieth
Proposed Response Response Status W	yang-types"
	SuggestedRemedy
PROPOSED REJECT.	
Specific references where and if needed are invited. The Editor will not guess what specific	add import statement for ietf-yang-types:
	add import statement for ietf-yang-types: import ietf-yang-types {
Specific references where and if needed are invited. The Editor will not guess what specific	add import statement for ietf-yang-types:
Specific references where and if needed are invited. The Editor will not guess what specific locations in the module need references to Clause 145.	add import statement for ietf-yang-types: import ietf-yang-types { prefix yang;
Specific references where and if needed are invited. The Editor will not guess what specific locations in the module need references to Clause 145. Also, the proposed references seem to point to .3bt, which is out of scope for this project at	add import statement for ietf-yang-types: import ietf-yang-types { prefix yang;

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

 C/
 6
 Page 1

 SC 6.5.2
 5/9/201

Page 14 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:31 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Anslow, Pete	Р 58 Ciena	L10	# 159	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L19 # 114 Remein, Duane Huawei
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		buck	Comment Type T Comment Status D bu
Comment #234 against D "Change "30.15.1.3" to "3	02.0 was ACCEPT with sug 30.15.1.1.3"	gested remedy:	5467	Description can stand some wording improvements: "whether to enable the PSE function on the interface.";
[since 30.15.1.3 does not However, this change has				SuggestedRemedy
SuggestedRemedy Change "30.15.1.3" to "30				Change to: "When true enables the PSE function on the interface, when false disables the PSE function on the interface.";
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	,			PROPOSED ACCEPT.
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 59	L 2	# 112	Comment type was changed from E to T
Remein, Duane	Huawei			Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L32 # 115
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		buck	Remein, Duane Huawei
Is this description for the	power class or the state?			Comment Type TR Comment Status D
SuggestedRemedy Change: "initializing, true state not	t yet known only for PoDL P	SE." To:		What is "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" I could not find another reference to this in the draft. This looks like a carryover from CI 30 (See 30.12.2.1.8 aLldpXdot3LocPowerPairControlable)
"Initializing, true Power C	lass not yet known (only for	PoDL PSE)."		SuggestedRemedy
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Replace with correct reference (not sure what that is). Note the sentence should end in a
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				period.
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	DED	1 49	# 442	Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P59 Huawei	L 48	# 113	
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	P 59 Huawei Comment Status D	L48		Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Huawei Comment Status D	L 48	# <u>113</u> buck	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability".
PROPOSED ACCEPT. 6 SC 6.5.2 emein, Duane comment Type E "Augements"? Misspelled	Huawei Comment Status D	L 48		Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability".
PROPOSED ACCEPT. 6 SC 6.5.2 1 emein, Duane 1 comment Type E 1 Augements"? Misspelled 1 suggestedRemedy 1 change to "Augments"	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D d.	L 48		Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability". Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L47 # 116
PROPOSED ACCEPT. 2/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E "Augements"? Misspelled SuggestedRemedy change to "Augments" (included in remein_3cf_1)	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D d.	L 48		Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability". Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L47 # 116 Remein, Duane Huawei
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E "Augements"? Misspelled SuggestedRemedy change to "Augments" (included in remein_3cf_1)	Huawei Comment Status D d. 1_0518)	L 48		Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability". Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L47 # 116 Remein, Duane Huawei Comment Type T Comment Status D bu Wording: "Describes the capability of controlling the power pairs functionality to switch pi
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E "Augements"? Misspelled SuggestedRemedy change to "Augments" (included in remein_3cf_1 Proposed Response	Huawei Comment Status D d. 1_0518)	L 48		Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability". Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L47 # 116 Remein, Duane Huawei Comment Type T Comment Status D bu Wording: "Describes the capability of controlling the power pairs functionality to switch pi for sourcing power." Science Status D
PROPOSED ACCEPT. 2/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E "Augements"? Misspelled SuggestedRemedy change to "Augments" (included in remein_3cf_1 Proposed Response	Huawei Comment Status D d. 1_0518)	L48		Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability". Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L47 # 116 Remein, Duane Huawei Comment Type T Comment Status D bu Wording: "Describes the capability of controlling the power pairs functionality to switch pi for sourcing power." SuggestedRemedy Change to: "Describes the ability to control switching the power sourcing pins of the PSE
PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E "Augements"? Misspelled SuggestedRemedy change to "Augments" (included in remein_3cf_1 Proposed Response	Huawei Comment Status D d. 1_0518)	L 48		Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "pethPsePortPowerPairsControl" with "pairs-control-ability". Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P60 L47 # 116 Remein, Duane Huawei Comment Type T Comment Status D bu Wording: "Describes the capability of controlling the power pairs functionality to switch pi for sourcing power." SuggestedRemedy Change to: "Describes the ability to control switching the power sourcing pins of the PSE (may need to be on two lines) The power sourcing pins of the PSE (may need to be on two lines)

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	C/ 6	Page 15 of 47
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	SC 6.5.2	5/9/2018 7:00:31 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line		

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/6 SC 6.5.2	P 61	L 25	# 117	C/ 6	SC 6.5.2	P61	L 36	# 119
Remein, Duane	Huawei			Remein, Duar	ne	Huawei		
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		bucket	Comment Typ	e T	Comment Status D		bucke
Wording: "This counte POWER_DENIED"; The SD doesn't enter s	er is incremented when the PS states, the PSE does.	SE state diagram	enters the state	ERROR_	DELAY_SH	er is incremented when the F ORT, per IEEE Std 802.3, Fi states, the PSE does.		enters the state
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRe	medy			
Change to: "This counter is increm (may need to be on m	nented when the PSE enters ultiple lines).	the POWER_DE	NIED state.";	IEEE Std	nter is increr 802.3, Figu		the ERROR_DE	LAY_SHORT state, per
Proposed Response	Response Status W					nultiple lines).		
PROPOSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			Proposed Res PROPOS	sponse ED ACCEP [.]	Response Status W		
Comment type was ch	nanged from E to T			Comment	type was cl	hanged from E to T		
Change to:						5		
"This counter is increm Std 802.3, Figure 33-9	nented when the PSE enters	the POWER_DE	NIED state, per IEEE		SC 6.5.2	P61	L 47	# 120
(may need to be on m				Remein, Duar		Huawei		
	. ,			Commont Tur	· · ·	Commont Status D		1
N 00 0 5 0		1.00	"	Comment Typ		Comment Status D		
Remein, Duane	P 61 Huawei	L 36	# 118	Wording: from the s	"This counte state POWE	er is incremented when the F R_ON to the state IDLE due		
Remein, Duane	Huawei Comment Status D		bucket	Wording: from the s The SD d	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter	er is incremented when the P		transitions directly
Remein, Duane Comment Type T Wording: "This counte	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS		bucket	Wording: from the s	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter medy	er is incremented when the F R_ON to the state IDLE due		transitions directly
Remein, Duane	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D.";		bucket	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter <i>medy</i> o: nter is increr	er is incremented when the F R_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi	to tmpdo_timer_c	transitions directly done being asserted";
Remein, Duane Comment Type T Wording: "This counte SIGNATURE_INVALIE The SD doesn't enter s	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D.";		bucket	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou to the IDL	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter <i>medy</i> o: nter is increr E state due	er is incremented when the F R_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi to tmpdo_timer_done being	to tmpdo_timer_c	transitions directly done being asserted";
Remein, Duane Comment Type T Wording: "This counte SIGNATURE_INVALIE The SD doesn't enter s	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D.";		bucket	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou to the IDL (may nee	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter <i>medy</i> o: nter is increr E state due ed to be on r	er is incremented when the F IR_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi to tmpdo_timer_done being nultiple lines).	to tmpdo_timer_c	transitions directly done being asserted";
temein, Duane Comment Type T Wording: "This counte SIGNATURE_INVALIE The SD doesn't enter s SuggestedRemedy Change to: "This counter is increm	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D."; states, the PSE does. nented when the PSE enters	SE state diagram	bucket enters the state	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou to the IDL (may nee Proposed Res	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter <i>medy</i> o: nter is increr E state due ed to be on r sponse	er is incremented when the F R_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi to tmpdo_timer_done being nultiple lines). <i>Response Status</i> W	to tmpdo_timer_c	transitions directly done being asserted";
Remein, Duane Comment Type T Wording: "This counte SIGNATURE_INVALIE The SD doesn't enter s SuggestedRemedy Change to: "This counter is increm (may need to be on mage)	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D."; states, the PSE does. nented when the PSE enters ultiple lines).	SE state diagram	bucket enters the state	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou to the IDL (may nee Proposed Res	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter <i>medy</i> o: nter is increr E state due ed to be on r sponse	er is incremented when the F IR_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi to tmpdo_timer_done being nultiple lines).	to tmpdo_timer_c	transitions directly done being asserted";
Remein, Duane Comment Type T Wording: "This counte SIGNATURE_INVALIE The SD doesn't enter s SuggestedRemedy Change to: "This counter is increm (may need to be on me Proposed Response	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D."; states, the PSE does. nented when the PSE enters ultiple lines). <i>Response Status</i> W	SE state diagram	bucket enters the state	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou to the IDL (may nee Proposed Res PROPOS	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter medy o: nter is increr E state due ed to be on r sponse ED ACCEP	er is incremented when the F R_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi to tmpdo_timer_done being nultiple lines). <i>Response Status</i> W	to tmpdo_timer_c	transitions directly done being asserted";
Remein, Duane Comment Type T Wording: "This counte SIGNATURE_INVALIE The SD doesn't enter s SuggestedRemedy Change to: "This counter is increm (may need to be on mage)	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D."; states, the PSE does. nented when the PSE enters ultiple lines). <i>Response Status</i> W	SE state diagram	bucket enters the state	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou to the IDL (may nee Proposed Res PROPOS Comment	"This counte state POWE oesn't enter medy o: nter is increr E state due ed to be on r sponse ED ACCEP t type was cl	er is incremented when the F IR_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi to tmpdo_timer_done being nultiple lines). <i>Response Status</i> W T IN PRINCIPLE.	to tmpdo_timer_c	transitions directly done being asserted";
emein, Duane comment Type T Wording: "This counte SIGNATURE_INVALIE The SD doesn't enter s uggestedRemedy Change to: "This counter is increm (may need to be on maging troposed Response	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D er is incremented when the PS D."; states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE enters ultiple lines). <i>Response Status</i> W T IN PRINCIPLE.	SE state diagram	bucket enters the state	Wording: from the s The SD d SuggestedRe Change to "This cou to the IDL (may nee Proposed Res PROPOS Comment Change to "This cou	"This counted state POWE oesn't enter medy o: nter is increr E state due ed to be on r sponse ED ACCEP" a type was ch o: nter is increr	er is incremented when the F IR_ON to the state IDLE due states, the PSE does. mented when the PSE transi to tmpdo_timer_done being nultiple lines). <i>Response Status</i> W T IN PRINCIPLE.	to tmpdo_timer_d tions directly from asserted";	transitions directly done being asserted"; the POWER_ON state

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 6 SC 6.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P61	L 59	# 121	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 62	L 51	# 123
Remein, Duane	Huawei			Remein, Duane	Huawei		
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		bucket	Comment Type T	Comment Status D		
Wording: "This counter i ERROR_DELAY_OVER The SD doesn't enter sta	,	E state diagram	enters the state	the YANG leaf actual-pow	ver"? It's clearly in the refe wer. Shouldn't that be in th		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy Change:			
Change to:	ented when the PSE enters the transmitted when the PSE enters the transmitted when transmitted when the transmitted when tr	the ERROR_DEI	LAY_OVER state.";	"An integer value indicati milliwatts."; To:	ng the accuracy associate		
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT I	IN PRINCIPLE.			PROPOSED ACCEPT.			
Comment type was char Change to:	nged from E to T			C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane	P 63 Huawei	L 7	# 124
		the ERROR_DEI	LAY_OVER state, per	Comment Type T Description can stand so on the interface.";	Comment Status D me wording improvements	s: "whether to ena	bucke able the PSE function
C/6 SC 6.5.2	P 62	L46	# 122	SuggestedRemedy			
0 0.0.2	1 02	-+0	# 122	ouggoolourioniouy			
Remein, Duane	Huawei	240	π 122	Change to: "When true enables the I	PSE function on the interfa	ace, when false d	isables the PSE
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Incorrect type "type uinte	Huawei Comment Status D		π 122	Change to: "When true enables the I function on the interface. Proposed Response		ace, when false d	isables the PSE
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Incorrect type "type uinte Description and CI 30 in	Huawei Comment Status D 64;"		π <u>122</u>	Change to: "When true enables the I function on the interface.	"; Response Status W	ace, when false d	isables the PSE
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Incorrect type "type uinte Description and CI 30 in SuggestedRemedy Change type to int64	Huawei Comment Status D 64;"		π <u>122</u>	Change to: "When true enables the I function on the interface. Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	"; Response Status W	ace, when false d	
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Incorrect type "type uinte Description and CI 30 in SuggestedRemedy Change type to int64	Huawei Comment Status D 64;" ndicate this is a signed numb		π <u>122</u>	Change to: "When true enables the F function on the interface. <i>Proposed Response</i> PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was chan	"; <i>Response Status</i> W ged from E to T		isables the PSE # 134
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Incorrect type "type uinte Description and Cl 30 in SuggestedRemedy Change type to int64 Proposed Response	Huawei Comment Status D 64;" ndicate this is a signed numb		π 122	Change to: "When true enables the F function on the interface. Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was chan Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type T	"; Response Status W ged from E to T P64	L38	# [<u>134</u> bucke
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Incorrect type "type uinte Description and CI 30 in SuggestedRemedy Change type to int64 Proposed Response	Huawei Comment Status D 64;" ndicate this is a signed numb		π <u>122</u>	Change to: "When true enables the F function on the interface. Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was chan Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type T	"; <i>Response Status</i> W ged from E to T <i>P</i> 64 Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D h port we are talking about	L38	# [<u>134</u> bucke
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Incorrect type "type uinte Description and CI 30 in SuggestedRemedy Change type to int64 Proposed Response	Huawei Comment Status D 64;" ndicate this is a signed numb		π <u>122</u>	Change to: "When true enables the I function on the interface. Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was chan Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type T We should be clear which SuggestedRemedy	"; <i>Response Status</i> W ged from E to T <i>P</i> 64 Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> D h port we are talking about	L38	# [<u>134</u> bucke

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

		_							
CI 6	SC 6.5.2	P 64	L 65	# 135	CI 7	SC 7.2.1.1	P 68	L 56	# 164
Remein, E	Duane	Huawei			Gorshe, Ster	/e	Microsemi Cor	р.	
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D		bucket	Comment Ty	,	Comment Status D		
SIGN	AŤURE_INVAL	ter is incremented when the PS .ID."; r states, the PSE does.	SE state diagram	enters the state		location is th	10G-EPON has been added, s e list of reference clauses that		updates are required.
Chang "This (may Proposed PROF Comn Chang "This	counter is incre- need to be on <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEF nent type was o ge to:	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. changed from E to T			Modify t and add "The IEE Figures the corre — Claus — Claus and con — Claus number a) Defini	the following E layering a 56–3 and 56- sponding lay e 30: Manag e 75: PMD for e 77: MPCP rol protocol f e 76: Recompo f extensions	or 10G-EPON media (burst-mod (Multipoint Control Protocol), w or the media access of 10G-EP ciliation Sublayer and Physical to standard Gigabit Ethernet P tional (frame-based) FEC for 10	rface is defined ving clauses in de PMD) hich defines the ON. Coding Sublaye CS, i.e.,	l in the diagram of IEEE Std 802.3 define e Multipoint architecture
C/ 6	SC 6.5.2	P66	L18	# 136	Proposed Re PROPO	'	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE.		
Descr Suggester Chang Proposed	<i>Type</i> TR rect type "type u	0 indicate this is a signed numl Response Status W	per.		and add "The IEF Figures the corre — Claus — Claus number a) Defin b) PMA — Claus and con	the following E layering al 56–3 and 56- sponding lay e 30: Manag e 75: PMD for e 76: Recom- of extensions tion of the op or 10G-EPO e 77: MPCP rol protocol for description of	or 10G-EPON media (burst-mod ciliation Sublayer and Physical to standard Gigabit Ethernet P tional (frame-based) FEC for 10	rface is defined ving clauses in de PMD) Coding Sublaye CCS, i.e., DG-EPON hich defines the ON."	l in the diagram of IEEE Std 802.3 define er, which defines a e Multipoint architectur

C/ 7 SC 7.2.1.1

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.2.1.7 P74 L3 # 165	Cl 7 SC 7.3 P76 L51 # 138
Gorshe, Steve Microsemi Corp.	Remein, Duane Huawei
Comment Type T Comment Status D Is it correct that this sub-clause does not elaborate on 10G-EPON FEC since it mandatory and hence not a management parameter?	Comment Type TR Comment Status D There is a discrepancy between the module in the draft and the module on Github. In the draft "threholds" appears once in the Tree hierarchy. If I download the pon module from Github the misspelling appears twice. It seems that the module text shown on pg 101 line
SuggestedRemedy	24 and 31 in the draft misrepresents the Github module.
If the assumption of the comment is correct, it could be helpful to the reader to note that in the introductory paragraph of 7.2.1.7.	SuggestedRemedy
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Correct the misspelling in Github and re-integrate the module into the draft. Correct the misspelling in the Tree hierarchy of the draft.
Comment type was changed from E to T	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Strike "but is mandatory for 10G-EPON" on page 74, line 3. Replace all instances of EPON to 1G-EPON on page 74, lines 3 - 35.	Cl 7 SC 7.3 P79 L10 # 139 Remein, Duane Huawei
Insert text from hajduczenia_3cf_01_0518.pdf on page 74, line 36 (after Figure 7-5).	Comment Type E Comment Status D buc
Cl 7 SC 7.2.1.7 P74 L34 # 166 Gorshe, Steve Microsemi Corp. Comment Type TR Comment Status D	The style used for the type instruction is inconsistent within the module and between other modules. Sometime it is a one-line instruction, sometimes on two-lines without indentation and sometimes it is on two-lines with indentation. This also is an issue with the range instruction within a type.
The Figure 7-5 title needs to be modified, since it only applies to 1G-EPON.	SuggestedRemedy
SuggestedRemedy Modify the Figure 7-5 title to read "1G-EPON FEC protected frame"	Use a one-line instructions exclusively. So for example this: type uint64 {
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	range "0 32767"; }
Modify the Figure 7-5 title to read "1G-EPON FEC-protected frame"	becomes this: type uint64 { range "0 - 22767":
Cl 7 SC 7.3 P76 L51 # 137 Remein, Duane Huawei	range "0 32767"; } (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518)
Comment Type T Comment Status D "threholds"? What is a threholds?	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
SuggestedRemedy replace threholds with thresholds (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518)	Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	
replace threholds with thresholds (this change is included in remein_3cf_3_0518)	
TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial	G/general C/ 7 Page 19 of 47

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/
 7
 Page 19 of 47

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
 SC 7.3
 5/9/2018 7:00:31 AM

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 7.3
 S/9/2018 7:00:31 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

partment Type E Comment Status D bucket The style used for the units instruction, is inconsistent within the module and between other Contract Type E Comment Type E </th <th>7 SC 7.3</th> <th>P88</th> <th>L25</th> <th># 140</th> <th>Cl 7</th> <th>SC 7.3/2</th> <th>P78</th> <th>L26</th> <th># 163</th>	7 SC 7.3	P88	L 25	# 140	Cl 7	SC 7.3/2	P78	L26	# 163
The spice used or the units instructions is inconsistent within the module and between other instructions secturisively (this change is included in remein, 3cfr, 3, 0518). 7223 is yellow Use a one-line instructions secturisively (this change is included in remein, 3cfr, 3, 0518). 82000000000000000000000000000000000000	emein, Duane	Huawei						sign Syste	
modules. Sometime it is a on-line instruction, sometimes on two-lines with indentation. generative it is a non-line instruction, sometimes on two-lines with indentation. generative it is a non-line instruction sexclusively (his change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Generative it is a non-line instruction is inconsistent within the module and between the sexclusively (his change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Generative it is a non-line instruction is inconsistent within the module and between the area stalled to exat ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Addpt changes to a single-line instruction, sometimes on two-lines with indentation. Generative it is a non-line instruction, sometimes on two-lines with indentation. generative in it is a on-line instruction is inconsistent within the module and between the area stall two instances of TBD' in the draft. Comment Type is Comment Type is non-line with indentation. generative in its a non-line instruction is inconsistent within the module and between the two-lines with indentation. Sector is non-line instruction is inconsistent within the module and between the area stall two instances of TBD' in the draft. generative in its a non-line instruction is inconsistent with indentation. Sector is non-line instructions are advices to the module as the instruction is inconsistent with indentation. generative in the instruction is inconsistent with indentation. Sector is non-line instructions inconsistence with indentation. generative in the EPON YNAK module use the in-xxx and out-xxx formatil ysta is in-in-xxx and out-xxx formatil ysta is in-in-xxx and out-xxx formatily tas is in-in-xxx and out-xx	51					51	Comment Status D		bucket
and sometimes it is on two-lines with indentation. SuggestedRendy Use a one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518), proceed Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein.3cfr_3_0518 T SC 7.3 P88 L28 # 141 To SC 7.3 P88 L28 # 141 House Clean version of the draft does not have a single-instruct on the instructions inconsistent within the module and between thermody. Clean version of the draft does not have a single instruct on the instructions inconsistent within the module and between thermody. Y be one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Required comment 728 against D.2 was ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE with response status W Y so C 7.3.2 P88 L20 # 141 Y as y ADT RAN SuggestedRendy Y as y ADT RAN Required comment 728 against D.2 was ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Required comment 728 against D.2 was ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Y as y ADT RAN ADT RAN Remove "rx-fault" leaf alogenher including entry in the table of properties. Y as y C 7.3.2 P88 L20 # 141 Image Status W					7223 is	s yellow			
Addpt changes to a single-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Proposed Response Response Status W Addpt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3dr_3_0518 T S C 7.3 P8 k L2 k # [dit] Anslow. Pete Clean Clean Comment Status D Anslow. Pete Clean To solve used for the config instructions, sometimes on two-lines without indentation. Business and advectimes it is on two-lines without and between other modules. Sometime it is a one-line instructions, sometimes on two-lines without indentation. Regulated comment 1/2 against D JO was ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3dr_3_0518 T S C 7.3.2 P8 k L20 # dit					•••	-			
To be a dimensional status/control	uggestedRemedy				Correc	t formatting of '	'7223" here and elsewhere in	the document.	
approve Segonses Alegonse Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instruction sper remein_3cf_3_0518 7 SC 7.3 P88 L28 # [141] The style used for the config instruction is inconsistent within the module and between other modules. Sometimes its a one-line instruction, sometimes its in the instruction, sometimes its in a one-line with indentation. Comment Type E Comment Status D cx-fault Regurate Call Segonse Status W Regurate Call Regonse Status V Regonse Status V Regonse Status V Regonse Status V Regonse Regonse Status V Reginse Call Reginse Status V Reginse Call Re	Use a one-line instruc	ctions exclusively (this change	is included in ren	nein_3cfr_3_0518).	Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 $CI = SC = S_3$ $P127$ $L11$ $\# = 10^{-10}$ $T = SC = T_3$ $P88$ $L28$ $\# = 14^{-10}$ ame in, DuaneHuawei $Ci = SC = S_3$ $P127$ $L11$ $\# = 10^{-10}$ $T = SVP = K$ Comment Status DbucketThe style used for the config instructions insonsistent with in the module and between other modules. Sometimes it is on two-lines with indentation. $Required comment #228 against D.2 was ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE with response status CRegestedRemedyUse one-line instructions per temein_3cf_3_0518Required comment #228 against D.2 was ACCEPT in PRINCIPLE with response status CRodpt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518Required comment #228 against D.2 was ACCEPT in PRINCIPLE.Rodpt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518P127L11\# = 10^{-10}T = SC 7.3.2P88L20\# = 10^{-10}Repore Status WPROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.Repore Required comment W = 10^{-10}Repore Required comment).rot the EPON YANG modules.Repore Required comment W = 10^{-10}Repore Required comment).rot the EPON YANG modules.Repore Required comment W = 10^{-10}Repore Required comment).rot the EPON YANG modules.Repore Required comment W = 10^{-10}Repore Required comment).rot the EPON YANG modules.Repore Required comment W = 10^{-10}Repore Required comment).rot the EPON YANG modules.Repore Required comment W = 10^{-10}Required Remedy$	roposed Response	Response Status W			PROP	OSED REJECT	Γ.		
T SC 7.3 P88 L28 # [41] amein, Duane Huawei bucket primmert Type E Comment Status D bucket The style used for the config instruction is insonsistent within the module and between other modules. Sometimes it is on two-lines with indentation. bucket Several TED instances are addressed by individual comments. The remaining items are addressed below." Use one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Weaver, there are still two instances of "TBD" in the draft. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Required comment Type Required comment. Addpt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518. Weaver, there are still two instances of "TBD" in the draft. T SC 7.3.2 P88 L20 # [1] widd, Joey ADTRAN bucket widd uses the back-in and xxx-out naming convention wile those in the EPON YANG module. bucket Comment Type TR Comment Status D xx-fault rggested/Remedy Comment Type T Comment Type TR Comment Type TR L11 # [1] reduction of the prophysical status Weaver, there are still two instances of "TBD" Breadetom ment. Breadetom ment.	PROPOSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.			Clean	version of the d	lraft does not have a single in	stnce of "7233" ii	n yellow.
T SC 7.3 P88 L28 # [41] amein, Duane Huawei bucket primmert Type E Comment Status D bucket The style used for the config instruction is insonsistent within the module and between other modules. Sometimes it is on two-lines with indentation. bucket Several TED instances are addressed by individual comments. The remaining items are addressed below." Use one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Weaver, there are still two instances of "TBD" in the draft. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Required comment Type Required comment. Addpt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518. Weaver, there are still two instances of "TBD" in the draft. T SC 7.3.2 P88 L20 # [1] widd, Joey ADTRAN bucket widd uses the back-in and xxx-out naming convention wile those in the EPON YANG module. bucket Comment Type TR Comment Status D xx-fault rggested/Remedy Comment Type T Comment Type TR Comment Type TR L11 # [1] reduction of the prophysical status Weaver, there are still two instances of "TBD" Breadetom ment. Breadetom ment.	Adont changes to a s	single-line instructions per rem	ein 3cf 3 0518		C/ 8	SC 83	P127	/ 11	# 160
7 SC 7.3 P88 L28 # [14] memin, Duane Huawi Comment Status D Sc 6.41 Comment Status D Sc 6.41 memori Type E Comment Status D bucket Sc 7.3 P88 Sc 7.3 Comment Status D Sc 6.41 The style used for the config instruction is inconsistent within the module and between other modules. Sometime it is a one-line instruction, sometimes on two-lines with indentation. Sc 7.32 Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 T Sc 7.3.2 P88 L20 # [1] The counters in the EPON YANG module. ADTRAN Sc 7.3.2 P88 L20 # [1] The counters in the EPON YANG module. Down way on a dui-xxx format just as left-interface does it would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as left-interface does form duide use the xx-in and xx-out naming convention while those in the EPON YANG module. Sc 8.4 P127 L11 # [105] Suggested/Remedy Comment type T Comment type TR Comment Status D cx-fault The table of thome tore values from xx-in to out-xxx and out-xxx form tyx-is								211	# [100
Anoth, Double Factor Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 Factor Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 Factor Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 Factor Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 Factor Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 Factor The counters in the EPON YANG module use the xxx-in and xxx-out naming convention while those in the EPON YANG module use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does form xx and out-xxx and out-xxx in the xx and out-xxx in			L 28	# 141	,				ry-fault
mment Type E Comment Status D bucktet The style used for the config instructions in isconsistent within the module and between other modules. Sometimes it is on two-lines with indentation. Several TBD instances are addressed by individual comments. The remaining items are didressed below." Use one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cf_3_0518). W opposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 Proposed Response Response Status W mment Type T Comment Status D bucktet The counters in the EPON YANG module use the in-xxx and out-xxx format its at as interinterfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format its at as interinterfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. Comment Type T Comment Status D bucktet of the EPON YANG module. Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Comment Type T Comment Status D r.411 # 105 SuggestedRemedy Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. Comment Type T Comment Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. SuggestedRemedy Change naming of counter values from track in the tor track of the tor from the tor track of the tor from the tor track of the tor from the tor tor track and from track of the tor from the tor from the tor from the tor from the tor tor tor track and from trac						51		T IN PRINCIPI F	
other modules. Sometime it is a one-line instruction, sometimes on two-lines without indentation. However, there are still two instances of "TBD" in the draft. Suggested/Remedy Use one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 Image: The comment Status is a distribution of the table of properties. 7 SC 7.3.2 P88 L20 # 41					"Sever	al TBD instance			
indentation and sometimes it is on two-lines with indentation. SuggestedRemedy Use one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). W posed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. P88 L20 # [1] rd opt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518. Proposed Response Response Status W product changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518. Comment Status D Locket more in the EPON YANG module use the txx-in and xxx-out naming convents bucket Reinace them with appropriate mapping for the rx-fault Interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format fust as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format fust as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx. SuggestedRemedy Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment trace dResponse Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Status Advector Advector Advector Advector A							ill two instances of "TBD" in th	e draft	
IggestedRemedy Teplace them with suitable text. Until this is done, the draft is not ready to progress to Sponsor balls (thence Required comment). proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. 7 SC 7.3.2 P88 L20 # 41			,						
Use one-line instructions exclusively (this change is included in remein_3cfr_3_0518). Sponsor ballot (hence Required comment). copposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. P88 L20 # 41	uggestedRemedy				00		itable text. Until this is done t	he draft is not re	adv to progress to
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 7 SC 7.3.2 P88 L20 # [41	Use one-line instructi	ions exclusively (this change is	included in reme						ady to progress to
Adopt changes to a single-line instructions per remein_3cf_3_0518 7 SC 7.3.2 P88 L20 # 1 7 SC 7.3.2 P88 L20 # 1 Image: source sour			s included in terrie	in_3ctr_3_0518).	Spons	or ballot (hence	Required comment).		
interference interference <td< td=""><td>roposed Response</td><td><i>,</i> , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,</td><td></td><td>in_3ctr_3_0518).</td><td>•</td><td>`</td><td>, ,</td><td></td><td></td></td<>	roposed Response	<i>,</i> , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		in_3ctr_3_0518).	•	`	, ,		
pypl, Joey ADTRAN Slavick, Jeff Broadcom Inc pmment Type T Comment Status D bucket Comment Type TR Comment Status D rx-fault The counters in the EPON YANG module use the xxx-in and xxx-out naming convention while those in the Ethernet YANG modules use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. Proposed Response Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T See c	roposed Response	Response Status W		ın_3ctr_3_0518).	Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
pypl, Joey ADTRAN Slavick, Jeff Broadcom Inc pmment Type T Comment Status D bucket Comment Type TR Comment Status D rx-fault The counters in the EPON YANG module use the xxx-in and xxx-out naming convention while those in the Ethernet YANG modules use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ieff-interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. Proposed Response Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T See c	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W		in_3ctr_3_0518).	Proposed I PROP	Response OSED ACCEP ⁻	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE.	the table of prop	erties.
The counters in the EPON YANG module use the xxx-in and xxx-out naming convention while those in the Ethernet YANG modules use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ietf- interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format for the EPON YANG module uggestedRemedy Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. oposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T YPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general Science of TBD} The rx-fault Data node has a reference of {TBD} SuggestedRemedy Replace the {TBD}s with appropriate mapping for the rx-fault entry. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T YPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE.	ein_3cf_3_0518		Proposed PROP Remov	Response OSED ACCEP ⁻ /e "rx-fault" leaf	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE.		
The counters in the EPON YANG module use the xxx-in and xxx-out naming convention while those in the Ethernet YANG modules use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ietf- interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format for the EPON YANG module uggestedRemedy Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. oposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T YPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general Science of TBD} The rx-fault Data node has a reference of {TBD} SuggestedRemedy Replace the {TBD}s with appropriate mapping for the rx-fault entry. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T YPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per reme P88	ein_3cf_3_0518		Proposed PROP PROP Remov	Response OSED ACCEP ⁻ /e "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127	L11	
interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format for the EPON YANG module SuggestedRemedy Replace the {TBD}s with appropriate mapping for the rx-fault entry. uggestedRemedy Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. Proposed Response Response Status W W oposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. See comment #160 See comment #160 'PE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general C/ 8 Page 20 of 47	PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per reme P88 ADTRAN	ein_3cf_3_0518	# 41	Proposed I PROP Remov C/ 8 Slavick, Je	Response OSED ACCEP ve "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In	L11	# 105
Interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to doe the INPXX and outeXXX format Replace the TBD}s with appropriate mapping for the rx-fault entry. Interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to doe the INPXX and outeXXX format Replace the TBD}s with appropriate mapping for the rx-fault entry. Interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to doe the INPXX and outeXXX format Proposed Response Response Status W Interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to doe the INPXX and outeXXX format Proposed Response Response Status W Interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to doe the INPXX and outeXXX format Proposed Response Response Status W Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #160 PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T See comment #160 Page 20 of 47 (PE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general C/ 8 Page 20 of 47	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20	# 41 bucket	Proposed I PROP Remov Cl 8 Slavick, Je Comment	Response OSED ACCEP ve "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff <i>Type</i> TR	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D	L11	# 105
Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T The counters in the Eth	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x hernet YANG modules use the	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf-	Proposed I PROP C/ 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx	Response OSED ACCEP re "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff Type TR fault Data node	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D	L11	# 105
Change naming of counter values from xxx-in to out-xxx and from xxx-out to in-xxx. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T The counters in the Eth while those in the Eth interfaces does. It wo	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x hernet YANG modules use the pould provide greater consistence	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf-	Proposed I PROP Remov C/ 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx Suggested	Response OSED ACCEP re "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff Type TR fault Data node Remedy	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D e has a reference of {TBD}	L11 C	# 105
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T (PE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general C/ 8 Page 20 of 47	Adopt changes to a s Adopt changes to a s 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T The counters in the Etwile those in the Etwinterfaces does. It wo for the EPON YANG	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x hernet YANG modules use the pould provide greater consistence	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf-	Proposed I PROP Remov Cl 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx Suggested Replace	Response OSED ACCEP ve "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff <i>Type</i> TR fault Data node <i>Remedy</i> se the {TBD}s w	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D e has a reference of {TBD}	L11 C	# 105
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T (PE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general C/ 8 Page 20 of 47	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T The counters in the Et while those in the Eth interfaces does. It wo for the EPON YANG uggestedRemedy	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x hernet YANG modules use the build provide greater consistence module.	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx y to use the in-xx	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf- x and out-xxx format	Proposed I PROP Remov Cl 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx Suggested Replac	Response OSED ACCEP re "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff Type TR fault Data node Remedy re the {TBD}s w Response	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D e has a reference of {TBD} vith appropriate mapping for th Response Status W	L11 C	# 105
(PE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general C/ 8 Page 20 of 47	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T The counters in the Et while those in the Eth interfaces does. It wo for the EPON YANG uggestedRemedy	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x hernet YANG modules use the x build provide greater consistence module	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx y to use the in-xx	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf- x and out-xxx format	Proposed I PROP Remov Cl 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx Suggested Replac Proposed I PROP	Response OSED ACCEP ve "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff <i>Type</i> TR fault Data node <i>Remedy</i> se the {TBD}s w <i>Response</i> OSED ACCEP	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D e has a reference of {TBD} vith appropriate mapping for th Response Status W	L11 C	# 105
	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T The counters in the Et while those in the Eth interfaces does. It wo for the EPON YANG uggestedRemedy Change naming of co roposed Response	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x hernet YANG modules use the x hernet YANG modules use the x hould provide greater consistence module	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx y to use the in-xx	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf- x and out-xxx format	Proposed I PROP Remov Cl 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx Suggested Replac Proposed I PROP	Response OSED ACCEP ve "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff <i>Type</i> TR fault Data node <i>Remedy</i> se the {TBD}s w <i>Response</i> OSED ACCEP	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D e has a reference of {TBD} vith appropriate mapping for th Response Status W	L11 C	# 105
	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey omment Type T The counters in the Et while those in the Eth interfaces does. It wo for the EPON YANG uggestedRemedy Change naming of co roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x bound provide greater consistence module Dunter values from xxx-in to our Response Status W PT.	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx y to use the in-xx	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf- x and out-xxx format	Proposed I PROP Remov Cl 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx Suggested Replac Proposed I PROP	Response OSED ACCEP ve "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff <i>Type</i> TR fault Data node <i>Remedy</i> se the {TBD}s w <i>Response</i> OSED ACCEP	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D e has a reference of {TBD} vith appropriate mapping for th Response Status W	L11 C	# 105
INVISIONENT STATES TRANSPORTED A VIGOCOMPTOD VIGOCOMPTOD STATES COMPANY COMPANY STATES	roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Adopt changes to a s 7 SC 7.3.2 byd, Joey comment Type T The counters in the Et while those in the Eth interfaces does. It wo for the EPON YANG uggestedRemedy Change naming of co roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Comment type was c	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. single-line instructions per remo P88 ADTRAN Comment Status D EPON YANG module use the x bound provide greater consistence module bounter values from xxx-in to our Response Status W PT. changed from E to T	ein_3cf_3_0518 <i>L</i> 20 xx-in and xxx-out in-xxx and out-xx by to use the in-xx t-xxx and from xx2	# 41 bucket naming convention x format just as ietf- x and out-xxx format k-out to in-xxx.	Proposed I PROP Remov C/ 8 Slavick, Je Comment The rx Suggested Replac Proposed I PROP See co	Response OSED ACCEP ve "rx-fault" leaf SC 8.4 ff <i>Type</i> TR fault Data node <i>Remedy</i> se the {TBD}s w <i>Response</i> OSED ACCEP	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. altogether, including entry in P127 Broadcom In Comment Status D e has a reference of {TBD} that appropriate mapping for th Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE.	L11 C	# 1 <u>05</u> rx-fault

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8 S	SC 8.5.2	P 28	L17	# 125	C/ 8	SC	8.5.2	P 133	L 28	# 57
Remein, Duan	е	Huawei			Trowbridg	ge, Steve	е	Nokia		
Comment Typ	e E	Comment Status D		bucket	Commen	t Type	Е	Comment Status D		72
	, and a few s	anges in descriptions including style (always begin text on ne		s, several long lines	Rece As IE	ntly IET	F approve ws the N	r RFC specifying the interface ad an update which is NMDA (MDA approach and as the upd or to refer to RFC 8343.	compliant: RFC	8343.
See reme	in_3cf_4_051	8 ieee802-ethernet-interface	diff.docx		Suggeste	dRemed	dv			
	ED ACCEPT	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. e/subclause - 6/6.5.2 is likely	toract		Repla "IETF by	ace: FRFC 72	223"			
			U			F RFC 8 alogy: cl		s reference throughout the full	document.	
CI 8 S Remein, Duan	SC 8.5.2 e	P 133 Huawei	L15	# 142	Proposed	•		Response Status W		
Comment Typ	e E	Comment Status D		bucket		IOSLD	ACCELLI			
periods, ta included th Style char 1) descrip 2) type ins 3) units ins	ab replaceme nat are detailen nges include: tion always s structions on structions on	inges to descriptions including int with spaces and style cons ed in other comments. tart on new line. one line (see separate comm one line (see separate comm n one line (see separate comm	sistency. A few ent). nent).		CI 8 Trowbridg Comment This i	ge, Steve <i>t Type</i> is a cont	8.5.2 e TR tinuation c	P133 Nokia Comment Status D of D2.0 comment 367.	L 43	# <u>58</u>
SuggestedRei See remei		8 ieee802-ethernet-link-oam	diff.docx		the "i the p	mport ie df versic	ee802-eth on still cor	etween the content in pdf and nernet-interface { prefix "eth-if ntains this statement.	"; }" statement,	which is correct; while
Proposed Res	ponse	Response Status W			On p	133 line	60 it also	makes this statement in text	which is incorre	ct too.
PROPOSI	ED ACCEPT.				Suggeste		,			
					2. Re	move th	he statem	statement on line 43. ent on line 60. Jgments the 'ieee802-etherne	t-interface' mod	ule."
					Proposed PRO		nse ACCEPT	Response Status W		

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2

Comments Received IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Zhuang, Yan	P 133 Huawei Techr	L 43	# 97	C/ 8 SC 8. Remein, Duane	5.2	P 134 Huawei	L13	# 144
Comment Type TR imported module ieee80 SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status D 02-ethernet-interface not use ee802-ethernet-interface. Response Status W	-	ernet-link-oam module.	<i>Comment Type</i> There are sever	draft the	Comment Status D repancies between the module ere are no long lines in the des		
PROPOSED ACCEPT. See comment 58				fixed in remein_ Proposed Response	_3cf_2_(ə	0518 Response Status W		
C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Remein, Duane	P 133 Huawei	L 47	# 143	PROPOSED AC		IN PRINCIPLE.	the draft.	
Comment Type E Typo "Working"	Comment Status D		bucket					
SuggestedRemedy fixed in remein_3cf_2_0	0518							
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W							
C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Trowbridge, Steve	Р 133 Nokia	L 62	# 59					
reference.	Comment Status D etween the content in pdf and nt in Git uses tab characters	-						
Probably: add the refere	ne pdf and the git is identical. ence statement in the pdf. by replacing 'tab' by spaces		dule (in Git).					
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.							
Git content will be sunc	hronized to the draft (this is t	he normative do	cument).					
Format fixes per comm	ent #142							

C/ 8 SC **8.5.2**

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8	SC 8.5.2	P134	L 28	# 60	C/ 8	SC 8.5.2	P 134	L 36	# 61
owbridg	je, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridg	e, Steve	Nokia		
ommen	tType TR	Comment Status D			Comment	Type TR	Comment Status D		
		of D2.0 comment 345. Basica s accepted in principle) but fo					D2.0 comment 346. Basic accepted in principle) but f		
the d	escription it is not	ture link-monitoring" says the clear whether this means su or support receiving and rep	pport for initiating	g a threshold crossing	retriev reque	al. From the desc	ure remote-mib-retrieval" sa ription it is not clear whethe e, or support receiving and oth.	er this means supp	ort initiating a variable
uggeste	dRemedy				Suggeste	dRemedy			
Make	it clear in the dea	allow announcing the suppor scription what it is about. n for all corresponding data.	t for both proced	ures separately.	Make	it clear in the desc	llow announcing the suppo cription what it is about. for all corresponding data.	rt for both procedu	ires separately.
de "" " By: feat de "" { } feat de " { } }	ure link-monitorin scription This feature mean erence EEE Std 802.3, 5 80.3.6.1.7 aOAMF ure link-monitorin scription This feature mean ide and can gene erence EEE Std 802.3, 5 80.3.6.1.7 aOAMF ure link-monitorin scription This feature mean eceived from the in its own manage erence EEE Std 802.3, 5	as the device supports Link M 7.1.2:c:1,30.3.6.1.6 aOAMLo RemoteConfiguration"; g-local { as the device monitors the lin erate Link Event OAMPDUs to 7.1.2:c:1,30.3.6.1.6 aOAMLo RemoteConfiguration";	k at the local o the peer device ocalConfiguration k Event OAMPD about this event	e."; n, and DUs	des "T refe "I aOAM } By: featu des "T s featu des "T d d v C refe "I	ire remote-mib-ret scription his feature means rence EEE Std 802.3, 57 RemoteConfigura ire remote-mib-ret scription his feature means eer device. I.e. the othe peer side and erence EEE Std 802.3, 57 0.3.6.1.7 aOAMRe ire remote-mib-ret scription his feature means ata from the mana ariable Requests OAMPDUs."; erence EEE Std 802.3, 57	the device supports remote .1.2:c:2,30.3.6.1.6 aOAML tion"; rieval-initiate { the device supports data is device can send Variable d process the received Variable .1.2:c:2,30.3.6.1.6 aOAML emoteConfiguration";	ocalConfiguration, retrieval from the Requests OAMPE able Response O/ ocalConfiguration, device to retrieve can process recei th Variable Respon	DUs AMPDUs."; and ved nse
PRO	POSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			roposed	Response	Response Status W		
	ges per suggeste nonitoring-remote	d remedy + Replace "link-mo " in the draft.	onitoring" with "lin	nk-monitoring-local and		POSED ACCEPT I	,		
OMMEN	IT STATUS: D/dis	ed ER/editorial required GR spatched A/accepted R/reje ubclause, page, line				d Z/withdrawn	C/ 8 SC 8		Page 23 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:31

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Changes per suggested remedy + Replace "feature remote-mib-retrieval" with "remote-mib-retrieval-initiate and remote-mib-retrieval-respond" in the draft.

<i>CI 8</i> Remein, Du	SC 8.5.2 Jane	Р 137 Ниаwei	L 29	# 145
Comment 7 config"		Comment Status D elled out in description		bucket
SuggestedI fixed in	Remedy remein_3cf_2_	_0518		
Proposed F PROPO	Response DSED ACCEP1	Response Status W		
<i>CI</i> 8 Boyd, Joey	SC 8.5.2	P138 ADTRAN	L 9	# 31
	is not sufficien ing type is HH:I Remedy	Comment Status D t to represent an OUI using HH:HH meaning it would tak		
type y lengt } descri "24-t refere	iption bit Organizatior	ally Unique Identifier";		
} Proposed F				
	DSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		

CI 8	SC	8.5.2	P138	3 L 24	# 146	
Remein, I	Duane		Huawei			
Commen	t Type	т	Comment Status	כ		
			E Std 802.3 OAM adm bled state	in is enabled" wo	rding is misleading. Sin	nilar
Suggeste	dRemed	ły				
802.3	3 OAM is		sabled admin state." (li		" (line 24) and "IEEE St	d
Proposed	l Respon	ise	Response Status	N		
PRO	POSED	ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			
			se 57 OAM is in the di		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
α	~~~	~ - ~	DADA		11 4 4 7	
CI 8		8.5.2	P138		# 147	
Remein, I		8.5.2	Huawei		# 147	
Remein, I Comment	Duane t Type	E	Huawei Comment Status)	Ŀ	bucket
Remein, I Comment	Duane t Type	E	Huawei)	Ŀ	bucke
Remein, I Comment	Duane <i>t Type</i> ription is	E a fragme	Huawei Comment Status)	Ŀ	buckei
Remein, I Comment desci Suggeste chang	Duane <i>t Type</i> ription is edRemed ge to rea	E a fragme ly	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM	D pitalized in a desc	ription.	bucket
Remein, I Comment desci Suggeste chang fixed Proposed	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Resport	E a fragme dy nd: "The a n_3cf_2_	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 <i>Response Status</i> 1	D pitalized in a desc function on an in	ription.	bucket
Remein, I Comment desci Suggeste chang fixed Proposed	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Respon POSED	E a fragme dy nd: "The a n_3cf_2_ ose	Huawei <i>Comment Status</i> I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 <i>Response Status</i> 1	D pitalized in a desc function on an in N	ription.	bucket
Remein, I Comment desci Suggeste chang fixed Proposed PRO	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Resport POSED	E a fragme fy id: "The a n_3cf_2_ ose ACCEPT	Huawei Comment Status I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 Response Status I	D pitalized in a desc function on an in N 3	ription. rerface."	bucket
Remein, I Comment descri Suggeste chang fixed Proposed PROI	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Respor POSED SC Duane	E a fragme fy id: "The a n_3cf_2_ ose ACCEPT	Huawei Comment Status I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 Response Status I P138	D pitalized in a desc function on an in N 3 L61	ription. erface." # 148	bucket
Remein, I Comment desci Suggeste chan fixed Proposed PROI CI 8 Remein, I Comment	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Respor POSED SC Duane t Type	E a fragme dy nd: "The a n_3cf_2_ ose ACCEPT 8.5.2	Huawei Comment Status I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 Response Status I P138 Huawei Comment Status I	D pitalized in a desc function on an in N 3 L61	ription. erface." # 148	
Remein, I Comment desci Suggeste chan fixed Proposed PROI CI 8 Remein, I Comment	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Respon POSED SC Duane t Type " should	E a fragme dy dd: "The a n_3cf_2_ ase ACCEPT 8.5.2 E be capita	Huawei Comment Status I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 Response Status I P138 Huawei Comment Status I	D pitalized in a desc function on an in N 3 L61	ription. erface." # 148	
Remein, I Comment descr Suggeste chang fixed Proposed PROI CI 8 Remein, I Comment "unix" Suggeste	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Respon POSED SC Duane t Type " should	E a fragme dy id: "The a n_3cf_2_ ose ACCEPT 8.5.2 E be capita	Huawei Comment Status I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 Response Status I P138 Huawei Comment Status I	D pitalized in a desc function on an in N 3 L61	ription. erface." # 148	
Remein, I Comment descr Suggeste chang fixed Proposed PROI CI 8 Remein, I Comment "unix" Suggeste	Duane t Type ription is edRemed ge to rea in remei d Respor POSED SC Duane t Type " should edRemed ralize Un	E a fragme dy d: "The a n_3cf_2_ ase ACCEPT 8.5.2 E be capita dy ix.	Huawei Comment Status I nt. OAM should be ca dmin state of the OAM 0518 Response Status I P138 Huawei Comment Status I	D pitalized in a desc function on an in N 3	ription. erface." # 148	

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	C/ 8	Page 24 of 47
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	SC 8.5.2	5/9/2018 7:00:31 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line		

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8	SC 8.5.2	P139	L19	# 62	"The type of threshold event"; reference
Frowbridg	ge, Steve	Nokia			"IEEE Std 802.3, 57.5.3";
Commen	t Type TR	Comment Status D			}
	51	ent but also a bit an indirect cor	tinuation of D2	0 commont 245 The	leaf window {
		omment is to assure by YANG s			type uint64;
		eeded this might be device spe			mandatory true;
		elink-monitoring.	cille by using lea	atures, in this case it	description
Telate		ink-monitoring.			"Size of the window in which the event was generated. Units
The	inderstanding is	s that for the notification 'non-th	reshold-data' (pa	age 151 line 35) the	are dependent on the threshold event type.";
		a nodes are not applicable and			/ leaf threshold {
	esent in the not				type uint64;
		a nodes because it uses the co	mmon aroupina	"event-details". This is	mandatory true;
		and therefore can not besolve			description
	•	uping into 2 separate grouping	•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	"Size of the threshold that was breached during the window.
		1 3 4 1 4 3 4 1 3			Units are dependent on the threshold event type.";
Withi	n these data no	des it is written "The default va	lue is implement	tation-dependent". At	}
		ode is mandatory. This is incons			leaf value {
Suggosto	edRemedy	-			type uint64;
00					mandatory true;
		vent-details" into 2 groupings: "			description
		er "threshold is removed from t			"Breaching value. Units are dependent on the threshold
group	oing "threshold-e	event-details". Then adapt the u	use statements v	where needed:	event type, and match that of the threshold.";
4		a an thus a h a lala .			}
	nove the contai		(the 2nd ")")		}
delete	e nom page 15	9 line 19 up to page 140 line 3 ((ine znu }).		}
2. ins	sert the new gro	uping e.g. at page 140 line 31 c	containing the co	ontainer "threshold" as	3. Assure threshold data nodes are still available in the log by adding a new uses
define	ed now (note: it	includes the if-feature statement	nt with an update	e)	statement:
grou	uping threshold-	event-details {			list event-log-entry {
de	scription				key "index";
1"	Nodes describin	ig a threshold event, used in the	e event log and i	in	description
r	notifications";				"Ethernet Link OAM event log entry";
	ference				leaf index {
"	ETF RFC 4878	, Dot3OamEventLogEntry";			type uint64;
					description "Index of this event in the event log";
	ntainer threshol				}
		pe = 'threshold-event-type'" {			uses event-details;
	description				uses threshold-event-details;
,	"These nodes	only apply to threshold event ty	/pes";		
}	footuro "link	onitoring loopl or link monitoring	romoto".		4. Assure the threshold data nodes are still available in the notification "threshold-event" by
		onitoring-local or link-monitoring	y-remote ;		adding a new uses statement:
	escription	to threshold (link monitoring) e	vonte":		notification threshold-event {
	Noues specific	to the shout (link monitoring) e	vents,		if-feature "link-monitoring-local or link-monitoring-remote";
	eaf threshold-ev	ent-ture (description
	type threshold-e				"This notification is sent when a local or remote threshold
	type uneshoute	Svonc-onum,			crossing event is detected.";

or remote threshold crossing event is detected."; uses event-details {

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/gen	eral required T/technical E/editorial G/general	C/ 8	Page 25 of 47
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected	RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	SC 8.5.2	5/9/2018 7:00:32 AM

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

mandatory true;

description

Comments Received IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

rating quant type (
refine event-type { must ". = 'threshold-event-type'" {	Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P140 L38 # 34
description	Boyd, Joey ADTRAN
"This leaf is set to 'threshold-event-type'";	Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
} } uses threshold-event-details; }	The counters in the ELO YANG module use the xxx-rx and xxx-tx naming convention while those in the Ethernet YANG modules use the in-xxx and out-xxx format just as ietf- interfaces does. It would provide greater consistency to use the in-xxx and out-xxx format for the ELO YANG module
	SuggestedRemedy
5. and keep the notification non-threshold-event as is and then this will not longer contain	Change naming of counter values from xxx-tx to out-xxx and from xxx-rx to in-xxx.
the data nodes for a threshold-event.	Proposed Response Response Status W
roposed Response Response Status W	PROPOSED ACCEPT.
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	_ Comment type was changed from E to T
1 8 SC 8.5.2 P139 L40 # 32	C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P140 L58 # 63
oyd, Joey ADTRAN	Trowbridge, Steve Nokia
omment Type T Comment Status D	Comment Type T Comment Status D
The leaf node, window, is mandatory yet has text in the description which states "The default value is implementation-dependent". This statement could be confusing from a NETCONF/YANG perspective in that the 'mandatory true' statement implies that the node does not have a default value and must be configured by the client.	This is a continuation of D2.0 comment 345 and comment 360. Basically: make the counters feature dependent. SuggestedRemedy
uggestedRemedy	Replace:
Remove the last sentence in the description, "The default value is implementation- dependent."	leaf unique-event-notification-tx { type yang:counter64; By:
roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Leaf unique-event-notification-tx { if-feature link-monitoring-local; type yang:counter64;
/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P139 L49 # 33	Proposed Response Response Status W
oyd, Joey ADTRAN	PROPOSED ACCEPT.
omment Type T Comment Status D	
The leaf node, threashold, is mandatory yet has text in the description which states "The default value is implementation-dependent". This statement could be confusing from a NETCONF/YANG perspective in that the 'mandatory true' statement implies that the node does not have a default value and must be configured by the client.	
uggestedRemedy	
Remove the last sentence in the description, "The default value is implementation-	
dependent."	

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Trowbridge, Steve	P141 Nokia	L 2	# 64	C/ 8 Trowbridge	SC 8.5.2	Р141 Nokia	L 12	# 65
Comment Type T	Comment Status D			Comment 7		Comment Status D		
21	2.0 comment 345 and cor	mment 360. Basi	cally: make the	This is	51	of D2.0 comment 345 and con	nment 360. Basi	cally: make the
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
Replace: leaf unique-event-notifi type yang:counter64; By: leaf unique-event-notifi if-feature link-monitor type yang:counter64;	cation-rx {			type By: leaf if-fe	e: duplicate-event- yang:counter6- duplicate-event- eature link-moni e yang:counter6	4; notification-tx { toring-local;		
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W			Proposed F PROPO	Response OSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Frowbridge, Steve	P 141 Nokia	L12	# 66	C/ 8 Trowbridge	SC 8.5.2 , Steve	P141 Nokia	L 53	# 67
Comment Type T	Comment Status D			Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status D		
This is a continuation of I counters feature dependent	02.0 comment 345 and con nt.	mment 360. Basi	cally: make the		a continuation or rs feature deper	of D2.0 comment 345 and con Ident.	nment 360. Basi	cally: make the
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
Replace: leaf duplicate-event-no type yang:counter64; By: leaf duplicate-event-no if-feature link-monitor type yang:counter64;	tification-rx {			typ By: leaf if-fe	variable-reques e yang:counter6 variable-reques	4; -tx { ib-retrieval-initiate;		
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Proposed F	Response	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT.					OSED ACCEPT			

CI 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

X 8 SC 8.5.2 P141 L62 # 68 rowbridge, Steve Nokia	C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P142 L18 # 70 Trowbridge, Steve Nokia
Comment Type T Comment Status D	Comment Type T Comment Status D
This is a continuation of D2.0 comment 345 and comment 360. Basically: make the counters feature dependent.	This is a continuation of D2.0 comment 345 and comment 360. Basically: make the counters feature dependent.
uggestedRemedy Replace: leaf variable-request-rx { type yang:counter64; By: leaf variable-request-rx { if-feature remote-mib-retrieval-respond; type yang:counter64; Proposed Response Response Status PROPOSED ACCEPT.	SuggestedRemedy Replace: leaf variable-response-rx { type yang:counter64; By: leaf variable-response-rx { if-feature remote-mib-retrieval-initiate; type yang:counter64; Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P 142 L 8 # 69 owbridge, Steve Nokia	C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P143 L18 # 149 Remein, Duane Huawei
omment Type T Comment Status D This is a continuation of D2.0 comment 345 and comment 360. Basically: make the counters feature dependent. uggestedRemedy Replace: leaf variable-response-tx { type yang:counter64; By: leaf variable-response-tx { if-feature remote-mib-retrieval-respond; type yang:counter64; By: leaf variable-response tx { if-feature remote-mib-retrieval-respond; type yang:counter64;	Comment Type TR Comment Status D This is more a question than a comment but I don't see how these groupings, discovery-remote and discovery-local (pg 144 line 25), map into Cl 30. The ref is to 30.2.6.1.3 (aOAMMode) and 30.3.6.1.7 (aOAMDiscoveryState) but these two sections seem unrelated. How is this properly related to Cl 30? SuggestedRemedy Upon receiving a good understandable explanation I will withdraw this comment (unless some corrective action needs to be taken). Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. V
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	See comment #89

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

8 SC 8.5.2 P143 L18 # 89 powbridge, Steve Nokia PROPOSED ACCEPT. prement Type T Comment Status D The grouping 'discovery-remote' is about reporting information received from the peer side. PROPOSED ACCEPT. How can this baye a default value? How can this be implementation dependent? Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P143 L19 # 150					Proposed	Response	Response Status W				
Watchings, Steve Notice The grouping discovery-remet is about reporting information received from the peer side. C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P143 L19 # [50] Propose to remove such statements. C/ 7 Comment Status D Signal Affermady Comment Type T Change the former definition of discovery-grouping to: Grouping discovery-remote (description file discovery process remote end of a link."); Itel mode { Suggested/Remedy Change the former definition of discovery process remote end of a link."; Suggested/Remedy Change the former definition of discovery process remote end of a link."; Suggested/Remedy Nodes description Nodes description glub endotes description glub endote			L18	# 89	•		•				
The grouping discovery-remote is about reporting information received from the peer side. Propose to remove such statements. grouping discovery-remote { description "Nodes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; fear mode { type mode; type boolean; description turk monitoring support."; } Heaf mb-retrieval { type boolean; description the timb-retrieval { type boolean; type boolea	owbridge, Steve	Nokia									
<pre>ibw can this have a default value? How can this be implementation dependent? Propose to remove such statements. ggestedRemody Change the former definition of discovery-grouping to: grouping discovery-remute { description "Nodes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; leaf mb-retrieval { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback kupport."; leaf imb-retrieval { type boolean; description "Change to: "Nodes describing the fault value? How can this be implementation dependent? who dependent of the fault value? How can this be implementation dependent? Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket description who de geasive active). Change to: "Nodes describing the fault value? How can this be implementation dependent? Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket description who de geasive active). change to: "Nodes describing the remote end discovery process of a link." This fix is NOT INCLUDED in remein.3d_2_0618 ProposeD ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Comment type was changed from E to T change to: "Nodes describing the remote end discovery process of a link." fielerence "IEEE Stat 802.3, 30.3, 6, 1.7"; leaf Indirectional link fault support."; } leaf Indirectional link fault support."; } leaf Indirectional link fault support."; } leaf Indirectional link fault support."; // pre boolean; description "Undirectional link fault support."; } } </pre>	21							L19	# 150		
Propose to remove such statements. Ducket ggestedRemedy Change the former definition of discovery-grouping to: grouping discovery-enote { description "Nodes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; leaf mode { "bype mode; description "Mode (passive/active)."; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3, 6.1.3"; } container functions-supported { description "The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3, 6.1.7"; leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf ink-monitoring { type boolean; description "Tentric loopback support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description					Remein, I	Duane	Huawei				
gestedRemedy description Change the former definition of discovery-grouping to: grouping discovery-remote { description SuggestedRemedy Nodes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; leaf mode (type mode; description SuggestedRemedy description Response Status W Proposed Response Response Status W ProDeCS Response Status W description PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. description Container functions-supported { description description The factors supported by this interface"; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.3"; } container functions-supported by this interface"; reference Comment type was changed from E to T Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." Supposed Response The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference Container functional-link-fault { type boolean; description Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." } Ised funk-time fault support."; } } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description The Info Multi support."; } } Ised mib-retrieval { type boolean; description leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description Supposed Response Status W <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>dependent?</td> <td>Comment</td> <td>Туре Т</td> <td>Comment Status D</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>bucket</td>				dependent?	Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D			bucket	
Change the former definition of discovery-grouping to: SuggestedRemedy grouping discovery-emote { Change to: "Nodes describing the emote end discovery process of a link." "Nodes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; Proposed Response Response Status W Velation of the discovery process remote end of a link."; Proposed Response Response Status W Velation of the discovery process remote end of a link."; Proposed Response Response Status W Velation of the discovery process of a link." Proposed Response Response Status W Velation of the discovery process of a link." Comment type was changed from E to T reference "IEEE Std 902.3, 30.3.6.1.3"; Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." reference "IEEE Std 902.3, 30.3.6.1.3"; Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." reference "IEEE Std 902.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." "IEEE Std 902.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; Iead undificational-link-taut { type boolean; description "Undirectional-link-taut { type boolean; description "Undirectional-link-taut { type boolean; description "Link monitoring { type boolean; description "Lin	•				descr	iption wording "I	Nodes describing the discove	ry process remote	end of a link."		
grouping discovery-remote { description "Nodes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; leaf mode { description "Modes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; description "Modes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; description "Modes (passive/active)."; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.3"; Container functions supported { description "The link NAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional link fault support."; leaf uni-directional link fault support."; leaf uni-directional link fault support."; leaf uni-directional link fault support."; } leaf inh-monitoring { type boolean; description "Kemote Loopback support."; } leaf inh-monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description "Leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; }		definition of discoverv-aroupina	ı to:		SuggestedRemedy						
<pre>"Nodes describing the discovery process remote end of a link."; Proposed Response Response Status W prope mode; description "Mode (passive/active)."; reference "EEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.3"; Container functions-supported { description "The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "EEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Chalter Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf indopback { type boolean; description "Chalter Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf indopback support."; } leaf indo-terriveal { type boolean; description "Leaf indo-terriveal { type boolean; description "Leaf indo-terriveal { type boolean; description "Leaf indo-terriveal { type boolean; description "EEE Std 802.3, Support."; }</pre>	grouping discovery		,					covery process of	a link."		
<pre>leaf mode {</pre>		an the diagonany process remain	to and of a link ".								
type mode: PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. description "Mode (passive/active)."; reference Comment type was changed from E to T "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.3"; Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." container functions-supported { description "The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "EEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf unif-fractional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support.";) leaf Inch-monitoring { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; leaf ink-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; leaf inh-remiteval { type boolean; description leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description		ig the discovery process remo	te end of a link. ;			•	•				
<pre>"Mode (passive/active)."; Comment type was changed from E to T "ference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3,6.1.3"; } container functions-supported { description "The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3,6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf ink-monitoring { type boolean; description "Lete first interface"; reference leaf ink-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description "Link monitoring in the monitoring in the monitoring support."; } </pre>	•				PROF	POSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.				
<pre>"EEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.3"; Change to: "Nodes describing the remote-end discovery process of a link." } container functions-supported { description "The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link/ault { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description</pre>	"Mode (passive	e/active).";			Comr	nent type was c	hanged from E to T				
<pre>} container functions-supported { description "The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3, 6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } </pre>		2 20 2 6 1 2".			Chan	ae to: "Nodes de	escribina the remote-end disc	overv process of	a link."		
description "The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description	}	3, 30.3.0.1.3 ,			·	0	0				
<pre>"The Link OAM functions supported by this interface"; reference "EEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf nib-retrieval { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } </pre>		s-supported {									
reference "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description											
<pre>"IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.7"; leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description "Link monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } </pre>		I functions supported by this inf	terface";								
<pre>leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description "Link monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } </pre>		2 20 2 6 1 7".									
<pre>type boolean; description "Undirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description</pre>											
description "Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description											
<pre>"Unidirectional link fault support."; } leaf loopback { type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description</pre>											
type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description		Il link fault support.";									
type boolean; description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description	}										
description "Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description											
<pre>"Remote Loopback support."; } leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description</pre>											
<pre>} is a structure in the second s</pre>		a ba a la a company la									
type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description	Remote Loop	браск ѕирроп.;									
type boolean; description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description	} leaf link-monitori	ing {									
description "Link monitoring support."; } leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description											
} leaf mib-retrieval { type boolean; description	,										
type boolean; description	"Link monitori	ng support.";									
type boolean; description	}										
type boolean; description	loof mile retrieve										
description		1 {									
} } }		retrieval support.":									
}` }	}	····· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·									
}	}										
}	-										
	}										

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Page 29 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:32 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Boyd, Joey	P 143 ADTRAN	L 60	# 35	Cl 8 S Remein, Duar	SC 8.5.2 e	P 144 Huawei	L 27	# 151	
Comment Type T The module defines a fea does not use the appropri- SuggestedRemedy Change to: leaf mib-retrieval { if-feature "remote-mib-r type boolean; description "MIB variable retrieval			ional yet this node	Comment Typ descriptio SuggestedRen Change to This fix is Proposed Res PROPOS Comment	e T n wording "I <i>nedy</i> o: "Nodes di NOT INCLI <i>ponse</i> ED ACCEP type was c	Comment Status D Nodes describing the discovery escribing the local end discovery JDED in remein_3cf_2_0518 Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. hanged from E to T escribing the local end discovery	ery process of a	a link."	bucket
changed to: leaf mib-retrieval { if-feature "remote-mib-r type boolean; description "MIB variable retrieval	new definitions in #61 to rep etrieval-initiate or remote-m	nib-retrieval-resp							
Add if-feature "link-monit P143, L51?	oring-local or link-monitoring	g-remote" to "lea	af link-monitoring" on						

CI 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

		_						_			
CI 8	SC 8.5.2	P144	L 45	# 71	CI 8		8.5.2	P144	L 52	# 72	
Trowbrid	ge, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridg	ge, Stev	е	Nokia			
Commer	nt Type T	Comment Status D			Commen	t Type	Е	Comment Status D			
		of D2.0 comment 361 and also vice behaviour is always well		ogy with comment				of D2.0 comment 362 and also vice behaviour is always well o		alogy with comment	
361:	add the if feature				The understanding of the leaf "loopback" is that this affects the setting of the 'OAM Remote Loopback support" bit in the OAM configuration field put in the Information OAMPDU.						
	339: Clarify the description in analogy with the comments on the ethernet PHY model.						dy				
00	SuggestedRemedy										
	Replace:						back {	loophook initiator			
	leaf uni-directional-link-fault { type boolean; description						e remote- olean;	loopback-initiate;			
							true;				
	"Unidirectional link fault support.					description					
	The default value	ue is implementation-depende	nt.";		"Remote Loopback support";						
} by:					} By:						
	eaf uni-directional	-link-fault {				af loopt	back {				
	if-feature uni-dire				if-feature "remote-loopback-initiate or remote-loopback-respond";						
	type boolean;					type boo					
	description					default t	,				
		ink fault support. setting of the 'Unidirectional S	Support! bit			descript		ack support.			
		figuration field put in the Infor		I				e setting of the 'OAM Remote L	oopback Supp	ort'	
		ess to the peer device that it ca						configuration field put in the In			
		that are operating in unidirection	onal mode			OAMF	PDU. This	bit indicates to the peer devic	e that		
	(traffic flowing in one direction only).					the OAM entity can initiate and respond to loopback commands.";					
		onal for configuration and if no			}						
	then the applied value is implementation-dependent. The operational datastore shall always contain the actually applied value.";					Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.					
}	.,										
Propose	d Response	Response Status W									
	POSED ACCEPT	•									

CI 8 SC 8.5.2

use at the local side.

container link-monitor {

data node level.

SuggestedRemedy

1. Replace:

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8	SC 8.5.2	P144	L61	# 73		key threshold-ty description	/pe;
Trowbridg	ge, Steve	Nokia			By:		
	51	Comment Status D of D2.0 comment 345. Basica	lly: make the da	ata nodes feature		list event-type { if-feature link-m key threshold-ty description	U /
		nitor has a leaf "link-monitorin nts' bit in the OAM configurat				d Response POSED ACCEP ⁻	Response Si T.

C/ 8	SC 8.5.2	P 144	L62	# 36
Boyd, Joey	,	ADTRAN	I	

Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D	bucket
--------------	---	------------------	--------

Response Status W

Some 'if-feature' statements place quotes around the name of the feature, while this one does not.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide consistency in format by encasing all feature names in double quotes, e.g. iffeature "link-monitoring".

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use quotes around all "if-feature" statements in the draft

if-feature link-monitoring; description "Configure link monitor parameters":

OAMPDU, this relates to both directions.

By:

container link-monitor { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote or link-monitoring-local": description "Configure link monitor parameters";

The container also contains a list "event-type". Assumption: these provide the threshold for

Therefore: remove the feature at the container level and introduce the proper feature at

2. Replace:

leaf link-monitoring { type boolean; default true; description "Enable or disable monitoring";

By:

```
leaf link-monitoring {
 type boolean;
 default true;
 description
  "Enable or disable monitoring
   This affects the setting of the 'Link Events' bit in the
   OAM configuration field put in the Information OAMPDU.
   This bit indicatess to the peer device that the OAM entity
   can send and receive Event Notification OAMPDUs.":
}
```

3. Replace:

list event-type {

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2

Page 32 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:32 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

					0 1			
Cl 8 Trowbridge	SC 8.5.2 e, Steve	P145 Nokia	L11	# 90	C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Remein, Duane	P 145 Huawei	L 34	# 152
	t event-type has value. This is i	Comment Status D s as key the threshold-type. In nconsistent: the key is always			idea of indenting wit	Comment Status D description leaves much to b thin a description I think in this		
 Suggested	Remedy				SuggestedRemedy See remein_3cf_10	0518 pdf		
	ce: st event-type { key threshold-ty description	pe;			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	Response Status W		
	threshold ever particular ever both window s leaf threshold-ty type threshold- description "The type of t specifying the	event-enum; hreshold event for which this l e configuration. ralue is implementation-depen	r a used for ist entry is		Implement together	with comment #74		
	threshold ever particular ever both window s leaf threshold-ty type threshold- description "The type of t	pe; ng at most one entry for each nt types. If there is no entry for type, the default values are ize and threshold."; pe { event-enum; hreshold event for which this l e configuration.";	r a used for					
Proposed PROP	Response OSED ACCEPT	Response Status W						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 Page 33 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:32 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8	SC 8.5.2	P146	L 6	# 74	C/ 8	SC 8.5.2	P 146	L 41	# 75			
rowbridg	e, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridg	e, Steve	Nokia					
comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D			Comment Type T Comment Status D							
		leaf "window" does specify a ne default value is implement			This comment is a continuation of comment 363 (couple to the right feature) and extended in analogy with comment 339: i.e. assure the device behaviour is always well defined							
uqqeste	dRemedy				-	6 H H						
Proposed to keep the specified default values and remove the last statement: Symbol Period: Units: number of symbols						iption "The default va	unctions-supported/mib-r alue is implementation-de nalogy with the comment	pendent".				
		er of symbols ber of symbols in one second	t for the		Suggeste	SuggestedRemedy						
underlying physical layer						ice:						
Min: number of symbols in one second for the underlying physical layer Max: number of symbols in one minute for the underlying physical layer Frame: Units: deciseconds Default: 1 second Min: 1 second Max: 1 minute Frame Period: Units: number of frames						af mib-retrieval {						
						type boolean;						
						description "MIB variable retriev	val support					
								ent "·				
					The default value is implementation-dependent.";							
					By:							
						leaf mib-retrieval {						
						if-feature "remote-mib-retrieval-initiate or remote-mib-retrieval-respond"; type boolean; description						
		ber of minFrameSize frames	in one second			"MIB variable retrieval support.						
		lying physical layer					tting of the 'Variable Retri	eval' bit in				
	Min: number	of minFrameSize frames in o	one second for			the OAM configuration field put in the Information OAMPDU.						
		g physical layer			This bit indicates to the peer device that the OAM entity							
		of minFrameSize frames in g physical layer	one minute for			can send and receive Variable Request and Response OAMPDUs.						
	Frame Secor	y priysical layer			OAMEDOS.							
	Units: decise					The leaf is optional for configuration and if not configured						
	Default: 60 se	econds				then the applied va	lue is implementation-de	pendent. The				
	Min: 10 seco						ore shall always contain th	ne actually				
	Max: 900 sec	conds.";			,	applied value.";						
roposed	Response	Response Status W			}							
PROF	OSED ACCEPT				,		_					
					,		Response Status W					
Comr	nent type was cha	anged from E to T			PROI	POSED ACCEPT IN	PRINCIPLE.					
					Repla							
					af mib-retrieval {							
						type boolean; description "MIB variable retrieval support.						
					The default value is implementation-dependent.";							
					}	}						
					By:							
	the elevel end		(0/		<u>-</u>					
		ed ER/editorial required GR					C/ 8		Page 34 of 47			
		spatched A/accepted R/reje	cied RESPO	NOE STATUS: U/open W	whitten C/close	a Z/withdrawn	SC 8.	. J. Z	5/9/2018 7:00:32			

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

leaf mib-retrieval { if-feature "remote-mib-retrieval-initiate or remote-mib-retrieval-respond"; type boolean;	C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P147 L15 # 76 Trowbridge, Steve Nokia							
description "MIB variable retrieval support. This affects the setting of the 'Variable Retrieval' bit in the OAM configuration field put in the Information OAMPDU.	Comment Type TR Comment Status D This comment is a continuation of comment 344 and others. I.e. use the proper feature.							
This bit indicates to the peer device that the OAM entity can send and receive Variable Request and Response OAMPDUs.	The grouping discovery-info, leaf operational-status is: - presented with an if-feature coupling it to the support of loopback. The set of values cover much more, e.g. disabled, link-fault, passive-wait. Therefore the leaf should exist without if-feature.							
The leaf is optional for configuration and if not configured then the applied value is implementation-dependent. The operational datastore shall always contain the actually applied value.";	 defined as read-write. An operational state should be read-only. there is a conflict between: a parameter being mandatory and having a default value. Beside, default values only apply to read-write. Therefore tremove the statement about the implementation specific default. 							
}	SuggestedRemedy							
} There was missing "}"	Replace: leaf operational-status { if-feature "remote-loopback-initiate or remote-loopback-respond"; type operational-state; mandatory true; description "Operational status. The default value is implementation-dependent."; reference "IETF RFC 4878, dot3OamOperStatus; IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.4, 30.3.6.1.10, and 30.3.6.1.11"; By:							
	leaf operational-status { type operational-state; config false; mandatory true; description "Operational status."; reference "IETF RFC 4878, dot3OamOperStatus; IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.4, 30.3.6.1.10, and 30.3.6.1.11"; }							
	Proposed Response Response Status W							
	PROPOSED ACCEPT.							

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2	P147	L28	# 77	C/ 8	SC 8.5.2		P148	L 24	# 37		
Trowbridge, Steve	Nokia			Boyd, Joey			ADTRAN				
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			Comment	Туре Т	Comm	ent Status D				
This comment is a cor l.e. use the proper fea	ntinuation of comment 365. ture.					ys that this aug st (as it should		et interface mode	el yet just augments the		
The typedef loopback- status (initiating, local-	-status allows to report both fo -loopback, …)	r the local as for	the perceived remote	Suggested Chang		description to:					
SuggestedRemedy Replace the if-feature "if-feature "remote-loo					, gments the i	nterface mode rnet Link OAM					
By "if-feature "remote-loo	pback-initiate or remote-loopb	ack-respond"		Proposed I	Response OSED ACC	,	nse Status W				
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			C/ 8	SC 8.5.2		P148	L 64	# 153		
C/ 8 SC 8.5.2	8 SC 8.5.2 P148 L24 # 78					Remein, Duane Huawei					
Trowbridge, Steve	Nokia			Comment Type ER Comment Status D							
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			It strike	es me as ve	ry odd to have	a question as a de	escription.			
	ntinuation of D2.0 comment 36	66.		Suggested							
0	nt should be written more gen	eral in YANG 1.	1 syntax.	-		ional link-fault	ng and line brakes) has been detected				
SuggestedRemedy Replace:				Proposed I	Response	Respor	nse Status W				
" augment "/if:interfac when "if:type = 'iana	es/if:interface" { ift:ethernetCsmacd' or if:type	= 'ianaift:ptm'" {"		PROP	OSED ACC	EPT.					
	es/if:interface' { elf(if:type, 'ianaift:ethernetCsn elf(if:type, 'ianaift:ptm') " {"	nacd') or									
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W										

CI 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P150 L4 # 79	C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P150 L18 # 82
Trowbridge, Steve Nokia	Trowbridge, Steve Nokia
Comment Type T Comment Status D This is a continuation of D2.0 comment 368.	Comment Type T Comment Status D simlar reasoning as for remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries
The leaf "rx-fault" is declared mandatory. However, not all interfaces will support unidirectional link fault detection. Therefore make the leaf optional. SuggestedRemedy Replace: leaf rx-fault {	SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-frame-period-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64; Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
if-feature uni-directional-link-fault; type boolean; config false; mandatory true; description By: leaf rx-fault { if-feature uni-directional-link-fault; type boolean; config false; description Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P150 L26 # 83 Trowbridge, Steve Nokia Comment Type T Comment Status D simlar reasoning as for remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-frame-second-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64; Proposed Response Response Status W
Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P150 L11 # 81 Trowbridge, Steve Nokia Comment Type T Comment Status D	PROPOSED ACCEPT.
simlar reasoning as for remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-frame-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64; Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.	

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

	P150	L 37	# 84	CI 8	SC 8.5.2		P150	L 50	# 155
owbridge, Steve	Nokia			Remein, I	Duane		Huawei		
omment Type TR	Comment Status D			Comment	Туре Е	Comment	t Status D		
This is a continuation of	D2.0 comment 350.			We co	ould be more	informative than:	"True if the ope	eration was succe	essful, false otherwise
The major problem with	issue with the current mode	el is that there is	a indication about on	Suggestee	dRemedy				
which interface the loop action and put it inside	back shall be performed. The he container 'link-oam' beca ce (i.e. use YANG 1.1 synta	nis can be solved ause then the act	I by making the rpc an	Chang		re indentation and remote-loopback wise.";		,	
ggestedRemedy				Proposed	Response	Response	Status W		
Update the version in g	t and replace the rpc by an 0 line 32 (i.e. after the closir			PROF	POSED ACC	EPT.			
	acket of line 34 (i.e; the closi			CI 8	SC 8.5.2	2	P 150	L 50	# 154
				Remein, D	Duane		Huawei		
action remote-loopt	ack {			Comment	Туре Е	Comment	t Status D		
•	oopback-initiate; e loopback on the specified	interface.";		descri		g: enable or disable value is impleme			
reference "IEEE Std 802.3,	57 1 2·b"·			Suggestee	dRemedy				
input { leaf enable { type boolean; mandatory true;	51.1.2.0 ,			Chan	ge to: "When true When false	enables remote lo disables remote l value is impleme	loopback,	ent.";	
description "Whether to er }	able or disable remote loop	back.";		1	Response POSED ACC	Response	Status W		
} output {				CI 8	SC 8.5.2	2	P150	L 52	# 38
leaf success {				Boyd, Joe			ADTRAN		
type boolean; mandatory true;				Comment	Tvpe T	Comment	t Status D		
description								out the default v	alue does not apply.
"True if the op	eration was successful, false	e otherwise.";		Suggestee		, , , ,			
} leaf error-messa type string;	je {			Remo		entence in the des	scription, "The d	lefault value is im	plementation-
description "If the operatio details.";	n failed, optionally used to p	provide extra		-	Response POSED ACC		Status W		
}									
}									
} posed Response	Response Status W								

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 8 Page 38 of 47 SC 8.5.2 5/9/2018 7:00:32 AM

See comment #100

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	C/ 8 SC 8.5.2	P150	L 56	# 80	C/ 8	SC 8	.5.2	P151	L17	# 85
This is a continuation of D2.0 comment 345 and 369. I.e. define the features per direction of the EFM OAM procedure, and couple the counters to the correct feature. Assumption: the local counters can always be presented to the management interface, independent of whether these counters are communicated to the peer device via an Event notification OAMPDU. Therefor these counters are not coupled to a feature. The remote counters shall be coupled to the feature "link-monitoring-remote" because if the peer device via an term the local device can not report to the management system. SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64;" Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P151 L9 # 161 Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	Trowbridge, Steve	Nokia			Trowbridge,	Steve		Nokia		
of the EFM OAM procedure, and couple the counters to the correct feature. Assumption: the local counters can always be presented to the management interface, independent of whether these counters are communicated to the peer device via an Event notification OAMPDU. Therefor these counters are not coupled to a feature. The remote counters shall be coupled to the feature "link-monitoring-remote" because if the peer device does not send the data then the local device can not report to the management system. SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64;" Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. C(1 & SC 8.5.2 P151 L9 # 161 Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	Comment Type T	Comment Status D			Comment T	ype	TR	Comment Status D		
Assumption: the local counters can always be presented to the management interface, independent of whether these counters are communicated to the peer device via an Event notification OAMPDU. Therefor these counters are not coupled to a feature. The remote counters shall be coupled to the feature "link-monitoring-remote" because if the peer device does not send the data then the local device can not report to the management system. SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64;" Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P151 L9 # 161 Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy					This is a	a contir	nuation	of D2.0 comment 351.		
beer device does not send the data then the local device can not report to the management system. SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64;" Proposed Response Response Status PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 8 Ci 8 SC 8.5.2 P151 L9 The "Editorial Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	independent of whet notification OAMPDU The remote counters	her these counters are community. J. Therefor these counters are n shall be coupled to the feature	cated to the pe ot coupled to a "link-monitoring	er device via an Event feature. -remote" because if the	notificat moving within th	tion doe the not ne cont	es not id tification ext of ar	entify which interface this reportion inside the container 'link-oam	orting is about. T	This can be solved by
SuggestedRemedy Add an if-feature statement: leaf remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries { container 'statistics', BEFORE the closing bracket of line 34 (i.e; the closing brac	•	send the data then the local de	vice can not rep	port to the management	00	-		the notification after page 150	line 32 (i.e. afte	r the closing bracket
leaf remote-error-symbol-period-log-entries { if-feature "link-monitoring-remote"; type yang:counter64;" Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 8 SC 8.5.2 P151 L9 # 161 Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	•				containe	er 'stat	istics', E			
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P151 L9 # 161 Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	leaf remote-erro if-feature "link	r-symbol-period-log-entries { monitoring-remote";			•	•		,		
Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P151 L9 # 161 Anslow, Pete Ciena Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	Proposed Response	Response Status W								
Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	PROPOSED ACCER	т.								
Comment Type TR Comment Status D The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	CI 8 SC 8.5.2	P151	L 9	# 161						
The "Editorial Comment" that states that "Alignment is needed." SuggestedRemedy	Anslow, Pete	Ciena								
SuggestedRemedy	Comment Type TR	Comment Status D								
	The "Editorial Comm	ent" that states that "Alignment	is needed."							
	SuggestedRemedy									
Do the necessary alignment and remove the "Editorial Comment". Until this is done, the draft is not ready to progress to Sponsor ballot (hence Required comment).										
Proposed Response Response Status W	Proposed Response	Response Status W								

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8 SC 8.5.2	P 151	L18	# 86	CI 8	SC	8.5.2	P151	L 35	# 87
Frowbridge, Steve	Nokia			Trowbrid	ge, Stev	e	Nokia		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			Commer	t Type	TR	Comment Status D		
I.e. split the feature feature to the correct The feature indicat - the local side det device - the device receiv The description su Assumption: feature SuggestedRemedy	on of D2.0 comment 345 for link-monitoring into one per sponding data nodes. es the threshold-event shall be s ected a threshold crossing and s ed an event-notification from the ggests use for only on direction: e use is correct and description	ent for 2 possible ent an event-noti peer device. at the local side.	e reasons: ification to the peer	The notif A se relat Suggest Mov cont	major pr cation 'tl cation b cond pro ed data i edReme e the def	roblem with hreshold- ut no indice bblem has nodes white dy finition of the ratistics', E	of D2.0 comment 352. h the notification 'non-thresho event' and needs to be solved cation about the interface for been menioned in another co ich are not applicable. the notification after page 150 BEFORE the closing bracket of	l in the same wa which the notific omment: it conta l line 32 (i.e. afte	y. I.e. there is a ation is applicable. ains threhold crossing er the closing bracket o
description "This notificatio crossing even By: notification thre if-feature "link description	onitoring-local or link-monitoring n is sent when a local threshold is detected.";	ng-remote";		"eve Propose	nt-details I Respo	s" has bee	contain the threshold crossing en split into 2 groupings. <i>Response Status</i> W	g related data no	odes the grouping

"This notification is sent when a local or remote threshold crossing event is detected.";

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

D2.0 suggested to have a method for reseting the EFM OAM statistics but it was kept in comment so it did not exist. Having this method was/is considered useful and therefor the suggestion was to define it. From YANG syntax perspective it is suggested to define it using YANG 1.1 syntax and define it as an action. Hereby we provide the corresponding YANG. SuggestedRemedy Below action to be added to efm-oam augmented table. I.e. define the notification after page 150 line 32 (i.e. after the closing bracket of container 'Istatistics', BEFORE the closing bracket of line 34 (i.e; the closing bracket of container 'Iink-oam'. action reset-stats { description "Reset Ethernet Link OAM statistics on this interface"; output {	pe TR Comment Status D m is not found/defined in iana-if-type in RFC 7224. amedy new identity for ptm as: ptm { anaitt:iana-interface-type; ption ptm."; nce the augmentation to: :type = 'ianaift:ethernetCsmacd' or if:type = 'link-oam:ptm'"
This is continuation of D2.0 comment 349. ianaift:ptm i D2.0 suggested to have a method for reseting the EFM OAM statistics but it was kept in comment so it did not exist. Having this method was/is considered useful and therefor the suggestion was to define it. From YANG syntax perspective it is suggested to define it using YANG 1.1 syntax and define it as an action. SuggestedRemed Hereby we provide the corresponding YANG. "For ptm reference";"?"; SuggestedRemedy "For ptm reference";"?"; Below action to be added to efm-oam augmented table. I.e. define the notification after page 150 line 32 (i.e. after the closing bracket of container 'link-oam'. Proposed Resp action reset-stats { Proposed Resp description "Reset Ethernet Link OAM statistics on this interface"; Proposed Resp output { leaf success { Following c	m is not found/defined in iana-if-type in RFC 7224. emedy new identity for ptm as: ptm { anaift:iana-interface-type; ption ptm."; nce the augmentation to: :type = 'ianaift:ethernetCsmacd' or if:type = 'link-oam:ptm'"
D2.0 suggested to have a method for reseting the EFM OAM statistics but it was kept in comment so it did not exist. Having this method was/is considered useful and therefor the suggestion was to define it. From YANG syntax perspective it is suggested to define it using YANG 1.1 syntax and define it as an action. Hereby we provide the corresponding YANG. SuggestedRemedy Below action to be added to efm-oam augmented table. I.e. define the notification after page 150 line 32 (i.e. after the closing bracket of container 'Istatistics', BEFORE the closing bracket of line 34 (i.e; the closing bracket of container 'link-oam'. action reset-stats { description "Reset Ethernet Link OAM statistics on this interface"; output { leaf success { }	emedy new identity for ptm as: ptm { anaift:iana-interface-type; ption ptm."; nce the augmentation to: :type = 'ianaift:ethernetCsmacd' or if:type = 'link-oam:ptm'"
bit is using YANG 1.1 syntax and define it as an action. define it as an action. Hereby we provide the corresponding YANG. "For ptm Suggested Remedy "For ptm bit action reset-stats { change the closing bracket of container 'link-oam'. action reset-stats { description action reset-stats { description when "if:type Proposed Resp action reset-stats { Proposed Resp description "Reset Ethernet Link OAM statistics on this interface"; output { Leaf success {	new identity for ptm as: ptm { anaift:iana-interface-type; ption ptm."; nce the augmentation to: type = 'ianaift:ethernetCsmacd' or if:type = 'link-oam:ptm'"
mandatory true; PTM is defined ascription performance of the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation was successful, false otherwise."; Suggested change reference to the operation	SED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. g comment #366 on D2.0 it seems that ptm interface type exists in BBF YANG and if so - should be conditions as such. efined in the latest iana-if-type module in Git, but not in IETF RFC. Hence, the to iana-if-type should be updated to a github link. ed Remedy: reference of iana-if-type reference at P133, line 34 as below: na-if-type { ianaift; nce " https://github.com/YangModels/yang/blob/master/standard/ietf/RFC/iana-if-

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 8 SC 8.5.3

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/8 SC 8.5.4	P148	L 25	# 99	C/ about ie SC Question about ieee80 P L # 170
Zhuang, Yan	Huawei Techn	ologies		Seda, Marta Calix
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			Comment Type E Comment Status D
missing {} and description SuggestedRemedy change codes to:	for "when" statement.			I was expecting to see a more hierarchical container model for epon YANG (along the lines of how http://www.ieee802.org/3/1/public/mib_modules/20130411/802dot3dot1C9mib.txt is organized). For example: Add a container for mpcp-control:
when "if:type = 'ianaift:eth description "Applies to Et } description "Augments Ethernet ir specific to Ethernet Li	hernet interfaces"; terface model with nodes	ink-oam:ptm'" {		+ mpcp-control +mpcp-admin-state? +mpcp-oper-status? +mpcp-logical-link-admin-state?, etc + fec + fec + fec-mode, etc + ompe-control
Proposed Response	Response Status W			+ ompe-mode, etc
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN	PRINCIPLE.			SuggestedRemedy
Change to				I was surprised to see so many leaf-names at the root level. Adding containers would improve the readability of the tree. This is a stylistic comment.
when "derived-from-or-se derived-from-or-self(if description "Augments Ethernet ir }	:type, 'link-oam:ptm')" {	smacd') or		Updated comment (4/25/2018) In the attached seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang and seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.tree show a possible containment model you could use (so as to make it easier for users of this YANG file to find related attributes).
description "Aug specific to Ethernet Li	ments Ethernet interface r nk OAM";	nodel with node	S	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT.
Note that PTM type is not	defined in if:type			-
C/ 8 SC 8.5.5 Zhuang, Yan	P 151 Huawei Techn	L 18 ologies	# 100	This is a personal preference - when model was more nested, concerns about too many levels of nesting were received and addressed.
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D	0		
feature "link-monitoring-re ieee802-ethernet-link-oam	mote" and "link-monitoring	-remote" is not o	defined in module	
SuggestedRemedy				
remove the statement "if-f	eature "link-monitoring-loc	al or link-monito	ring-remote";"	
	Response Status W		- ·	
Proposed Response				

d IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

taise," files from ginub (than have to compare what is in the word document against what is in ginub and then spend time adding it to the YANG file). Suggested/Remedy updated comment (4/25/2018): The attached seda_SC1_C2_C018 is leee802-ethemet-pon.yang has removed extra carriage returns to improve readability (easier to see how information is grouped together). For all 802.3 projects. published draft (and then standard) is the only normative document (4/25/2018): Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (pageline) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. Clieee-802 SC ieee-802-ether-pon.yan P L # 185 Comment Type Comment Status D There is no description that explains your branching philosophy. For example, if a user wants to pull the latest YANG file, should they be using the "master branch?" For amendment or corrigendums, what branch mile contains tabs. Tabs should be removed. Suggested/Remedy Iwould recomment fixing this. When I go to github, I see multiple branches. The containst taps. Tabs sexists in lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file is should remove them. Suggested/Remedy Iwould recomment (4/25/18): the exists no lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file is should remove them. Proposed Response Response Status W <	/ ieee-802 SC ieee-802-ether-pon.yan P L # 182	C/ Inconsi SC Inconsistency P L # 190
The VAINC file read-ability could be improved by removing earnage returns after units, range, config. type statements. This is a stylist comment. For example, config false; uggested/Remedy ugdeted comment (4/25/2018): The attached seda_3c1_02_0516_leee802-ethernet-pon, yang has removed extra carriage returns to improve readability (leasier to see how information is grouped together). PROPOSED REJECT. Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked there adability in morting whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. If lee 2002 SC leee-802-ether-pon, yang $P \ L \# [18]$ The file contains tabs. Tabs should be nerowed. uggested/Remedy If lee 2003 SC leee-802-ether-pon, yang $P \ L \# [18]$ The is contains tabs. Tabs should be nerowed. uggested/Remedy If lee 2003 SC leee-802-ether-pon, yang $P \ L \# [18]$ The is contains tabs. Tabs should be nerowed. uggested/Remedy uggested/Remedy uggested/Remedy If leee-802 SC leee-802-ether-pon, yang $P \ L \# [18]$ The is not description that explains your branching philosophy. For example, if a user to the should memory with the form of a diff file with tracked to memory $P \ L \# [18]$ The is not description that explains your branching philosophy. For example, if a user wants to pull the latest YANG file, should the pull equests that you may here multiple YANG weissins (ne for example for issue 1) another one for Corrigendum, what branch will contain the particular YANG file of intere Suggested/Remedy If would comment (4/25/18): the exists in lines 80-639, 1495,2400. The final version of here Adeption that you inserve the asset should be removed. Uggested/Remedy Reported Response Response Status W PROPOSED RELECT. Reported Response Response Status W PROPOSED RELECT. Reported Response Response Status W PROPOSED RELECT. Reported Response Response Status W Reported Response Response Status	eda, Marta Calix	Seda, Marta Calix
range, config, type statements. This is a stylist comment.For example, config false;Could be changed to: config false;aggestedRemedyupdated comment (4/25/2018): The attached seds_3d_02_0518_leee802-ethemet-pon, yang has removed extra carriage returns to improve readability leasier to see how information is grouped together).oposed ResponseResponse Status W PROPOSED REJECT.Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either speld out explicitly (logaline) is thrown in the form of addf file with incaded changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems.Idee-802 SC ieee-802-ether-pon.yan PLL#[81]eda, MartaCalixComment TypeComment Status DThe file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed.gggestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the glinbu document (the problems.AMG file should remove them.PROPOSED REJECT.Responses Tabus WPROPOSED REJECT.Give har update into the porting whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems.problems.idee-302 SC ieee-302-ether-pon.yan PLtigestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the glinbu document (the prosed Response Messages tabus W PROPOSED REJECT.PROPOSED REJECT.Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT.PROPOSED REJECT.Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT.Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT.Proposed Response Response	omment Type E Comment Status D	Comment Type E Comment Status D
For Example, config faile; could be changed to: config faile; uggestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/2016): The attached seds_3d_2(2,026): Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. / izee-802_SC ieee-802-ether-ponyan P L # [81] moment Type E Comment Status D The file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed. L # [81] uggestedRemedy Update comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the problem). Tabs exists in lines 38-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file, should be they outgoing to use? Is the herase is approved, what branch will contain the particular YANG file should termove them. uggestedRemedy Update comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the problem). Tabs exists in lines 38-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file. Should be they be using to use? Is the herase is approved, what branch are convention are you going to use? Is the herase is approved, what pranch manc convention are you going to use? Is the herase is approved, what pranch manc convention are you going to use? Is the heraster MANG file. Should they be using the shoul		
config false; could be changed to: config false; uggestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/2018): The attached seda_3d_0.02_0518_icee802-ethemet-pon,yang has removed extra carriage returns to improve readability (easier to see how information is grouped together). roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. For all 802.3 projects, pullished draft (ast cycle, it seems like push request did ne work well, though). Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either specificly (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. If eee-802 SC ieee-802-ether-pon,yan P L # [18] rede-802 SC ieee-802-ether. Caix Comment Type Caix If elee-802 SC ieee-802-ether. D There is no description that explains your branching philosophy. For example, if a user wants to pull the latest YANG file, should they be using the "master branch." For amenent or corrigendums, what branch ame convention at you using the "master branch." For amenent track of like on the specifies of antice to use needs carification. For example, will the latest YANG file should remove them. ruggestedRemedy Updated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (they file "master branch." Some other branch (say developmen fiking this. Then lago thasplaines that you usay	For example.	SuggestedRemedy
config false; The patched seda, 3cf, 02, 0518; isee802-ethernet-pon yang has removed extra carriage returns to improve readability (easier to see how information is grouped together). PROPOSED REJECT. forpoard Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editoral problems. C/ Missing SC Missing P L # 105 Vi lee-802 SC iee-802-ether-pon.yan P L # 1081 W 1082 vi lee-802 SC iee-802-ether-pon.yan P L # 1081 W 1082 vi gested/Remedy Vioudit recomment fixing this. When I go to github, I see multiple branches. The convention that you intend to use needs clafification. For example, will the latest YANG files be in the "master" branch? What about pull requests that you may be reviewing (C what branch name convention are you going to use? I shi the possibility that you may have multiple YANG versions (one for example for Issue 1; another one for Corrigendum 1, etc). PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking.	config	It would be good to have a "single source of truth" location. I would prefer to pull the YAN files from github (than have to compare what is in the word document against what is in github and then spend time adding it to the YANG file).
uggestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/2013): The attached seda_3ct_02_0518_jeee802-ethermet-pon yang has removed extra carriage returns to improve readability (easier to see how information is grouped together). ropposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. If leee-802 SC ieee-802-ether-pon.yan P L # [185] omment Type E Comment Status D The file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed. Imposed Response Response Status W uggestedRemedy uwold recomment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the pdf file "masks" the problem). Tabs exists in lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file should remove them. Noord Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. Noord Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. References are to Git document, and not against the	0	Proposed Response Response Status W
updated comment (4/25/2018): The attached seda_3d_02_0518 jeee802-ethermet-pon,yang has removed extra carriage returns to improve readability (easier to see how information is grouped together). roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. // idee.802 SC ieee-802-ether-pon.yan P L # [181] Omment Type E Comment Status D The file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed. Updated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the YANG file should remove them. For passed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. Not a normative part of the standard and provided only for convenience of publica of all 802.3 modules will be published under the standard branch (not draft, as published right now)		PROPOSED REJECT.
PROPOSED REJECT. Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. Seda, Marta Calix If eee-802_SC ieee-802_ether-pon.yan P L # [181] Import Type E Comment Status D The file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed. Import [Import [Im	updated comment (4/25/2018): The attached seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang has removed extra carriage	For all 802.3 projects, pulished draft (and then standard) is the only normative document. Git publication is aligned to published draft (last cycle, it seems like push request did not work well, though).
Given the number of changes to the module per other comments, specific changes could be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a diff file with tracked changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial problems. <i>It</i> leee-802 SC leee-802-ether-pon.yan <i>P L #</i> 181 <i>Comment Type</i> E <i>Comment Status</i> D The file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed. <i>uggestedRemedy</i> <i>updated comment (4/25/18):</i> the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the part of master (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the possibility that you may have multiple YANG versions (one for example for Issue 1; another one for Corrigendum 1, etc). <i>PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE</i> . References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking.	roposed Response Response Status W	C/Missing SC Missing P L # 185
be either spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it shown in the form of a difference of the spelled out explicity (page/line) it spectra.	PROPOSED REJECT.	Seda, Marta Calix
 I would recommend fixing this. When I go to github, I see multiple branches. The convention taty ou intend to use needs clarification. For example, will the latest YANU files be in the "master" branch? What about pull requests that you may be reviewing (b haven't approved yet) (are those part of master or some other branch (say development file "masks" the problem). Tabs exists in lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file should remove them. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. 	changed for readability. Importing whole module is not an aceptable solution to editorial	There is no description that explains your branching philosophy. For example, if a user wants to pull the latest YANG file, should they be using the "master branch"? For amendment or corrigendums, what branch will contain the particular YANG file of interest
Comment Type E Comment Status D The file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed. InggestedRemedy Updated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the pdf file "masks" the problem). Tabs exists in lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file should remove them. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. Convention that you intend to use needs clarification. For example, will the latest YANG files be in the "master" branch? What about pull requests that you may be reviewing (b haven't approved yet) (are those part of master or some other branch (say developmen After a release is approved, what branch name convention are you going to use? Is the the possibility that you may have multiple YANG versions (one for example for Issue 1; another one for Corrigendum 1, etc). PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. Convention that you intend to use needs clarification. For example, will the latest YANG files be in the "master" branch? What about pull requests that you may be reviewing (b haven't approved yet) (are those part of master or some other branch (say developmen After a release is approved, what branch name convention are you going to use? Is the the possibility that you may have multiple YANG versions (one for example for Issue 1; another one for Corrigendum 1, etc). Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking.	ieee-802 SC ieee-802-ether-pon.yan P L # 181	
comment TypeEComment StatusDThe file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed.Tabs should be removed.uggestedRemedyupdated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the pdf file "masks" the problem). Tabs exists in lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file should remove them.roposed ResponseResponse StatusWPROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking.WReferences will be published under the standard branch (not draft, as published right now)	eda, Marta Calix	I would recommend fixing this. When I go to github, I see multiple branches. The
After a release is approved, what branch name convention are you going to use? Is the uggestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the pdf file "masks" the problem). Tabs exists in lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file should remove them. The proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The proceed Response response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The final version of the future for simpler filtering and tracking.	omment Type E Comment Status D	files be in the "master" branch? What about pull requests that you may be reviewing (bu
uggestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/18): the existence of tabs was noticed in the github document (the pdf file "masks" the problem). Tabs exists in lines 36-39, 1495,2460. The final version of the YANG file should remove them. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. He possibility that you may have multiple YANG versions (one for example for Issue 1; another one for Corrigendum 1, etc). Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Git is not a normative part of the standard and provided only for convenience of publica of machine readable files. Once the standard is approved, the final versions of all 802.3 modules will be published under the standard branch (not draft, as published right now)	The file contains tabs. Tabs should be removed.	haven't approved yet) (are those part of master or some other branch (say development)
the YANG file should remove them. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. Hoposed Response Tresponse Tresponse Status W PROPOSED REJECT. Git is not a normative part of the standard and provided only for convenience of publica of machine readable files. Once the standard is approved, the final versions of all 802.3 modules will be published under the standard branch (not draft, as published right now)		the possibility that you may have multiple YANG versions (one for example for Issue 1;
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. PROPOSED REJECT. Git is not a normative part of the standard and provided only for convenience of publica of machine readable files. Once the standard is approved, the final versions of all 802.3 modules will be published under the standard branch (not draft, as published right now)		Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking. Git is not a normative part of the standard and provided only for convenience of publica of machine readable files. Once the standard is approved, the final versions of all 802.3 modules will be published under the standard branch (not draft, as published right now)		PROPOSED REJECT.
References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line numbers in the future for simpler filtering and tracking.		Git is not a normative part of the standard and provided only for convenience of publication
Tabs will be removed from the module and replaced with spaces.	References are to Git document, and not against the draft. Please use draft page/line	of machine readable files. Once the standard is approved, the final versions of all 802.3.2 modules will be published under the standard branch (not draft, as published right now).
	Tabs will be removed from the module and replaced with spaces.	

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ Missing SC Missing

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ Missing SC Missing P L # 187 Geda, Marta Calix	C/ Missing SC Missing P L # 180 Seda, Marta Calix
Comment Type T Comment Status D None of the YANG modules contain a revision.	Comment Type T Comment Status D 802.3.1 dot3RecognizedMulticastIDsTable/dot3RecognizedMulticastID is missing.
SuggestedRemedy I would highly recommend that the revision statement (it helps identify what revision you are dealing with). Without this information, it is difficult to discern the maturity of the YANG file. Please refer to https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6087#page-12 for YANG best practices to follow. Please note that pyanglint when run against the ieee YANG files flags this as an error. For Example, revision 2018-04-18 {	SuggestedRemedy updated comment (4/25/18): the attached seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang line 1075-1087 fixes this issue. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type was changed from E to T
description "Initial revision."; reference "IEEE Std 802.3-2018, Clause 64/77, unless dated explicitly IEEE Std 802.3.1-2013, Clause 9, unless dated explicitly"; }	C/ Missing SC Missing P L # Seda, Marta Calix Comment Type T Comment Status D 802.3.1 dot3ExtPkgControlTable/dot3ExtPkgObjectRegisterAction is missing.
Updated comment (4/24/2018): In the attached seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon, this pyang error has been fixed (someone noted that I should provide more examples on how to fix this issue). Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. Per comment #372 on D2.0, all revision statements were removed until the final version of the module is published (when this standard is published).	Updated comment (4/25/18): In the SNMP model, you could set a virtual interface to register/re-register/de-register. In the YANG model it is unclear how you do this. mpcp-logical-link-admin-state is read/write leaf that uses the mpcp-logical-link-admin-state typedef. Within the mpcp-logical-link- admin-state leaf, there are descriptions on how to "set" the powerup/down action. The registration actions are listed as read only. It seems that a netconf action would be more appropriate to request that you want to register, re-register or de-register an interface. If
C/ Missing SC Missing P L # 189 Seda, Marta Calix Comment Type E Comment Status D	the interface can't honor that request, the netconf command is rejected. For your convenience, seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang line 2223-2235, 36 388, and seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.tree line 91-93 proposes the support c netconf actions for registration actions of the interfaces.
The github repository contains the YANG files and the pdf file contains the tree and YANG code.	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
SuggestedRemedy It would be helpful to put the YANG tree along with the YANG code. Otherwise one has to run pyang to derive the YANG tree. In most cases a developer will prefer to use YANG files instead of the pdf file. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT. PROPOSED REJECT.	Comment type was changed from E to T Use seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang line 2218-2235, 365-388, and seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.tree line 91-93 for the support of netconf actions for registration actions of the interfaces.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ Missing SC Missing Page 44 of 47 5/9/2018 7:00:32 AM

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

				5 1			
C/ Missing SC Missing	P	L	# 175	C/ Missing SC Missing	P	L	# 171
Seda, Marta	Calix			Seda, Marta	Calix		
Comment Type T	Comment Status D			Comment Type T	Comment Status D		
802.3.1 dot3ExtPkgContro	lTable/dot3ExtPkgObjec	tPowerDown obj	ect is missing.		df document text map the		
SuggestedRemedy					pesn't include such table (I eady implemented EPON S		id be helpful to include
Updated comment (4/25/1				SuggestedRemedy			
It is unclear how you set t					the YANG containment/leav	was to the SNMD	MID
logical-link-admin-state is typedef. Within the mpcp-				Add a table that maps	the TANG containment/lea		IVIID.
set operational or disable itself because you have de have those choices at a tir	state" that you cause the efined mpcp-logical-link-a	ese events to occ admin-state to be	ur. That is a problem in an enum (you can only	Updated comment (4/2 For your convenience, SNMP mappings.	25/18): seda_3cf_03_0518_YANG	-SNMP_Mapping	shows the YANG to
and register it as well? It s				Proposed Response	Response Status W		
indicate that you want the interface can't honor that r				PROPOSED ACCEPT	,		
seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee8	02-ethernet-pon.vang lin	e 2197-2209. 31	8-344. and	Comment type was ch	anged from E to T		
seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee8 actions to power-up and p	02-ethernet-pon.tree line	85-87 proposes			8_YANG-SNMP_Mapping t		ion for adding a table o
Proposed Response	Response Status W				IG mapping for EPON Clau	ise.	
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN	PRINCIPLE.			C/ Missing SC Missing	P 98	L 29	# 173
				Seda, Marta	Calix		
Comment type was chang	ed from E to I			Comment Type T	Comment Status D		
Use seda_3cf_02_0518_ic seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee8	02-ethernet-pon.tree line	85-87 provides		802.3.1 dot3OmpEmul supported.	ationTable/ONUPONcastLl	ID and OLTPON	castLLID is not
actions to power-up and p	ower-down the interfaces	3.		SuggestedRemedy			
				seda_3cf_01_0518_ie counters. The appea	24/18) the attached seda_3cf_02_ ee802-ethernet-pon.tree ha r in seda_3cf_02_0518_iee eda_3cf_01_0518_ieee802	s has added these e802-ethernet-po	e two missing n.yang in lines 1551
				Proposed Response	Response Status W		

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang lines 1551 through 1607, and in seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.tree on lines 52 & 53 for reference.

C/ Missing SC Missing

IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ pyang e SC pyang errors P L # 188	C/ updated SC updated comment P104 L14 # 178
Seda, Marta Calix	Seda, Marta Calix
Comment Type E Comment Status D	Comment Type T Comment Status D
The github repository	Container statistics-trx is missing a suspected flag attribute.
(https://github.com/YangModels/yang/blob/master/standard/ieee/802.3/draft/ieee802- ethernet-interface.yang) seems to have some formatting issues.	SuggestedRemedy
 Line 40-45, seems to have extra spaces or tabs (unexpected aligning). if you run pyanglint against the files, I am getting some minor errors. if you run pyangmax-line-length=70, there are many lines that exceed the recommended 70 characters. (BBF uses 70 as max line length) 	updated comment (4/24/18): Eventually I found where the suspect flag went. It got mapped to trx-data-reliable. trx-data- reliable needs to be moved within container statistics-trx.
SuggestedRemedy	The attached seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang (line 2021-2034) and seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon (line 75) show examples of how this could be fixed.
Before publishing a standard, please make sure that you are not getting tool errors (the errors I am seeing are minor).	Proposed Response Response Status W
	PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Updated comment (4/24/2018): In the attached seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon, the pyang errors have been fixed.	Comment type was changed from E to T
	Use seda_3cf_02_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon.yang (line 2021-2034) and seda_3cf_01_0518_ieee802-ethernet-pon (line 75) for the fix.
Proposed Response Response Status W	C/ YANG fi SC YANG file names P L # 168
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Seda, Marta Calix
Make sure that Git published documents reflect the latest published version of the draft.	Comment Type E Comment Status D
Cl updated SC updated comment P L # 179 Seda, Marta Calix	If you look at the file naming convention of other SDOs, it uses the convention <sdo>- <whateverthis about="" is="">.yang. All IEEE Github files start with ieee802 (in the 802 folder). Likewise in the 801 folder, the file prefix is ieee801.</whateverthis></sdo>
Comment Type E Comment Status D	SuggestedRemedy
802.3.1 dot3ExtPkgOptIfTransmitAlarm is missing.	Could the YANG file names follow conventions used by other SDOs? (rename them ieee-
SuggestedRemedy	802). (add a "-" between ieee and 802). That would align the convention with the file naming conventions of IETF and BBF.
updated comment (4/25/18)	-
IETF is working on an alarm module. You may want to think about how you want this	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT.
netconf alarm to be represented relative to that module (e.g., what base notification identity to use). I don't have a good solution for this (you could add to the ieee text the alarm notifications that need to be supported.	This is the approved naming convention for all 802 YANG modules.
Proposed Response Response Status W	
PROPOSED REJECT.	

Comments Received IEEE P802.3cf D2.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ YANG p SC YANG pr	efixes P	L	# 169
Seda, Marta	Calix		
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		
	ation in IETF YANG best p ee-eth-pon). In searching		
It is suggested that a second	g/html/draft-ietf-netmod-rf stable prefix be selected re All normative YANG modu th the prefix "ietf-". Anothe s the IEEE, might use the p	epresenting the les published by er standards	r the
SuggestedRemedy			
	he other hand does enforc		ney don't enforce it in their ises bbf- <feature> as</feature>
Proposed Response	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.		
Comment type was cha	anged from E to T		
Add "ieee802-" to all pr or referenced.	refixes in all YANG module	es, all locations v	where prefixes are defined

C/ YANG p SC YANG prefixes