IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 1	SC 1	P14	L 4	# i <u>-120</u>	C/ 5	SC 5.2		P 20	L 24	# <u>i-231</u>			
Grow, Robert RMG Consulting					Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation								
Comment Type TR Comment Status A The use of an undated reference (i.e., IEEE Std 802.3) indicates the current version of the reference. Today, this reference includes approved P802.3bt, approved P802.3cb, and by completion should include at a minimum P802.3cd. This standard clearly can't track a moving target. A dated reference should be used, and clarity should be added on what parts of IEEE Std 802.3-2018 are not included. It appears that the current approved mendments are not included. It would also be appropriate to indicate that the YANG modules do not include all cmanagement capabilities for DTE specified in Clause 30.					Commer spec Suggest Cha Respons REJ	Comment Type TR Comment Status R speed is m/s according to SI units SuggestedRemedy France Change to data rate Response Response Status W REJECT. W Response							
SuggestedRemedy Add appropriate words about this standard incorporating selected management capabilities for some DTEs defined in IEEE Std 802.3-2018.						Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management							
Respor AC	ose CEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Response Status U	Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".										
Change						Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads '/ unit of signaling speed, expressed'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter							

This standard defines YANG modules for Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes DTEs operating on mixing segments, using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), link segments, and as Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).

То

This standard defines YANG modules for various Ethernet devices specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes half-duplex and full-duplex data terminal equipment (DTE) using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), and Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

C/ 5 SC 5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 5	SC 5.3.1	P 24	L19	# <u>i-232</u>		CI 5	SC 5.3.2	P 27	L10	# <u>i-233</u>		
Weber,	Karl	Beckhoff Auto			Weber, Karl		Beckhoff Auto	Beckhoff Automation				
Comme spe	ent Type TR eed is m/s according	Comment Status R g to SI units			SI	Comment Typ speed is i	oe TR m/s accordin	Comment Status R ng to SI units		S		
Sugges Ch	stedRemedy ange to data rate					SuggestedRe Change te	<i>medy</i> o data rate					
Respor RE	nse JECT.	Response Status W				<i>Response</i> REJECT.		Response Status W				
Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.						Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.						
Mo not	reover, definition of mandate the use o	"units" in RFC6020 (https://to f SI units, stating that it is "a s	ools.ietf.org/html/ string that contai	rfc6020#page-50) d ns a textual definitio	oes	Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) do not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition						

not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

of the units associated with the type".

C/ 5 SC **5.3.2**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 5	SC 5.3.2	P 27	L17	# i <u>-23</u> 4		C/ 5 S	SC 5.3.2	P 30	L 48	# <u>i-235</u>			
Weber	, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	Beckhoff Automation					Beckhoff Auto	Beckhoff Automation				
Comment Type TR Comment Status R speed is m/s according to SI units				SI	Comment Type speed is m	S							
S <i>ugge</i> s Ch	s <i>tedRemedy</i> ange to data rate					SuggestedRen Change to	<i>nedy</i> data rate						
Respoi RE	nse JECT.	Response Status W				Response REJECT.		Response Status W					
Us htt	ed consistently with ps://tools.ietf.org/htn	IETF RFC, for example see Inl/rfc7223 defining YANG Date	eaf "speed" in ta Model for Inter	rface Management.		Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Managemen							
Mo	preover, definition of the transfer to the transfer of the tra	"units" in RFC6020 (https://to f SI units, stating that it is "a s	ols.ietf.org/html/ string that contai	rfc6020#page-50) d ns a textual definitio	oes n	Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) doe not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition							

not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

of the units associated with the type".

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 5 Weber Kar	SC 5.3.2	P 30 Beckhoff Autom	L 49 ation	# i-236		C/ 5 Weber Ka	SC	5.3.2.1	P27 Beckh	L1	0	# i-158			
Comment 7 speed i	<i>⊽pe</i> TR s m/s according t	Comment Status R o SI units			SI	Comment speed	<i>Type</i> -type is	TR not the ap	Comment Status	R ed should mean	"data rate")	SI			
SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate							SuggestedRemedy Replace this parameter by "phy-type" according to IEEE 802.3 30.3.2.1.2								
Response Response Status W REJECT.					Response REJE	Response Response Status W REJECT.									
Used c https://t	Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.							Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.							
Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".							Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".								
Further unit of Symbo Other L as 'In te second	more, the definitions signaling speed, et s for Units of Meri Jnits)' which is ref elecommunication .', see < http://www	on of baud (Bd) used heavily i expressed'. ANSI/IEEE Std asurement (SI Units, Customa erenced by the IEEE-SA Star is, a unit of signaling >>speed w.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/ed	'A aud os>.	Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http: 3="" editorial="" requirements="" wg_tools="" words.html#bps="" www.ieee802.org="">.</http:>											
C/ 5 Weber Kar	SC 5.3.2	P 30 Beckhoff Autom	L53 ation	# i-237		C/ 5 Weber Ka	SC	5.3.2.1	P3: Beckh	3 L4	8	# i-163			
Comment 7 speed i	vveber, Kari Becknott Automation Comment Type TR Comment Status A speed is m/s according to SI units SI units						Comment Type TR Comment Status R According to 30.3.1.1.37, Max Frame is a enumerated value								
SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate						SuggestedRemedy Change definition to the 4 enumeration values									
Response ACCEF	PT IN PRINCIPLE	Response Status W				Response REJE	CT.		Response Status	w					
Change	e "Operational spo	eed" to "Operational speed (d	ata rate)"			A pre- allowe	configu ed by 30	red value i).3.1.1.37	is more useful, espec	cially considering	g support for fra	ames larger than			

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1