IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/FM SC FM	P1	L 1	# i-18	C/FM SC FM	P 8	L 2	# i-21
Anslow, Peter	Ciena Corpora	ation		Anslow, Peter	Ciena Corpora	ation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
"IEEE P802.3.2(TM	I)/D2.1" should be "IEEE P802.3.	2(TM)/D3.0"		The first 6 names on	page 8 are repeats of names of	on page 7.	
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
replace "D2.1" with	the draft number text inset.			Remove "McMillan, I	_arry" through "Miguelez, Phil" f	from the list on p	bage 8
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/FM SC FM	P2	L1	# i-19	C/FM SC FM	<i>P</i> 10	L1	# [i-22
Anslow, Peter	Ciena Corpora	ation		Anslow, Peter	Ciena Corpora	ation	
Comment Type E The even page hea	Comment Status X der in the front matter is for P802	2.3cc		Comment Type E The heading for "Intr	Comment Status X oduction" is missing.		
SuggestedRemedy Make consistent wit	th the other headers.			SuggestedRemedy Add the heading			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/FM SC FM	P 7	L 21	# i-20	C/FM SC FM	P10	L1	# i-116
Anslow, Peter	Ciena Corpora	ation		Grow, Robert	RMG Consult	ing	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	n the list of WG ballot participants	s need changin	g to avoid any names	The title "Introduction	n" is missing.		
wrapping across tw	o lines.			SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy				Please restore the tit	tle. (If necessary, get the templ	lates fixed.)	
Re-size the column template.	s to be the same as the latest ve	rsion of the 802	2.3 FrameMaker	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status O						

C/ FM SC FM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/FM SCFM	P10	D L6	# <u>i-117</u>	CI 0	SC 0	Р	L	# i-27
Grow, Robert	RMG (Consulting		Perry, Lis	sa			
Comment Type E	Comment Status	x		Commer	t Type G	Comment Status X		
The introduction	is too terse.			This	draft meets all e	ditorial requirements.		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggeste	edRemedy			
more on the lines better the base of IEEE Std 802.3b important.) and in this standard. two 802.3 amend this standard incl	ith the WG Chair, modify to s of IEEE Std 802.3.1 would ocument(s) used for this sta t-2918 by definition becomin include some description of This standard will likely be ments dated 2018, therefor udes capabilities associated hat capabilities are based of	be good The Introdu andard. (With the app ng part of IEEE Std 80 f the parts of Std 802.3 IEEE Std 802.3.2-201 re, the introduction sho d with amendments to	ction should describe roval of P802.3bt, and 2.3-2018, this is very 3 management include 9, but there should be build be clear on wheth 802.3-2018. It also	ed	d Response	Response Status 0		
Proposed Response	Response Status	0						
C/ FM SC FM Brow, Robert		D L7 Consulting	# i-118					
Comment Type E The 2018 revisio	Comment Status n has been published.	x						
SuggestedRemedy The Introduction	should reference IEEE Std	802.3-2018 (not 201X).					
Proposed Response	Response Status	0						
C/ FM SC FM Grow, Robert		D L 8 Consulting	# i-119					
Comment Type E Grammar.	Comment Status	x						
SuggestedRemedy "results" should t	be "result"							

C/ 0 SC 0

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

7 SC 1	P1	L 1	# i-244	C/ 1	SC 1	P14	L 4	# i-120
lansfield, Scott				Grow, Rol	bert	RMG Const	ulting	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	t Type TR	Comment Status X		
Please change "ethernet" name, namespace, and fi		f all P802.3.2 rela	ted modules (module	refere	ence. Today, th	ed reference (i.e., IEEE Std 8 iis reference includes approve	ed P802.3bt, appr	oved P802.3cb, and by
uggestedRemedy						clude at a minimum P802.3c		
For example: ieee802-ethernet-interfac to ieee802-dot3-interface.ya	, 0			parts amen	of IEEE Std 80 adments are not	2.3-2018 are not included. It included. It would also be a de all cmanagement capabili	appears that the oppropriate to indic	current approved ate that the YANG
				Suggeste	dRemedy			
Another example:						ds about this standard incorp ed in IEEE Std 802.3-2018.	orating selected m	nanagement capabilities
module ieee802-ethernet yang-version 1.1;	-interface {			Proposed	l Response	Response Status O		
namespace "urn:ieee:std:802.3:yar	g:ieee802-ethernet-inter	face";		C/ 1	SC 1	P14	L6	# i-121
	•			Grow, Rol	bert	RMG Const	ulting	
То				Comment	t Type E	Comment Status X		
module ieee802-dot3-inte yang-version 1.1;	rface {					ation of Multipoint Control Pr alization is most common).	otocol (though Sto	d 802.3 is not
namespace "urn:ieee:std:802.3:yar	g:ieee802-dot3-interface	";		Suggeste Chan	<i>dRemedy</i> ge this instance	Э.		
Please complete for: ieee802-ethernet-interfac ieee802-ethernet-interfac ieee802-ethernet-link-oar ieee802-ethernet-pon.yar ieee802-ethernet-pse.yar	e.yang n.yang Ig			Proposed	l Response	Response Status O		

Proposed Response

Response Status 0

C/ 1 SC 1

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 1 SC 1.3	P 14	L 26	# i-140	C/ 1	SC 1	1.5	P14	L 51	# i-32
Cummings, Rodney	National Instr	ruments C		Remein, D	Duane		Huawei Techno	logies	
Comment Type GR	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status X		
	/YangModels/yang/tree/master/s			There	are mul	tiple moc	lules.		
correct URL, becau	use once 802.3.2 publishes, its Y	'ANG module wil	l no longer be a draft.	Suggestee	dRemedy	V			
	ost recent decision in the IEEE & .org/yangsters/yangsters.				YANG m		fined" to efined"		
the location would "https://github.com	be /YangModels/yang/tree/master/s	standard/ieee/802	2.3/published"	Proposed	Respons	se	Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy				. <u> </u>					
	EE 802 YANGsters to determine	the correct GitH	ub location for	C/ 1	SC 1	1.5	P14	L 63	# i-33
published IEEE wo	orking group YANG modules.			Remein, D	Duane		Huawei Techno	logies	
	that coordination fails, use			Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status X		
"https://github.com	/YangModels/yang/tree/master/s	standard/ieee/802	2.3/published"		are mul				
oposed Response	Response Status O						on pg 15 line 4 and 9		
				Suggestee		V			
/ 1 SC 1.4	P14	L 44	# i-31	Chang "this N	ge: YANG mo	odule "	to		
emein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies			e YANG I				
comment Type T	Comment Status X	0		Proposed	Respons	se	Response Status 0		
	f we did not restrict the higher pro	otocol to just NE	CONF and						
	the following statement: Manage			C/ 1	SC 1	6	P15	L14	# i-122
	e are hosted on the managed de 41) or RESTCONF (see IETF RF		a through NETCONF	Grow, Rot		1.0	RMG Consultin		π 1-122
Same issue pg 17				Comment		TR	Comment Status X	9	
uggestedRemedy							does not use the word in the c	ontext typically	used in 802 3 per i
Change:							bilerplate text.	Sinchi typically	
	ETF RFC 6241) and RESTCONF ETF RFC 6241) or RESTCONF (Suggestee	dRemedy	y			
	Response Status 0			Consi	ider chan	nging to "	Syntax validation".		
Proposed Response						-			

C/ 1 SC 1.6

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 1 SC 1.6	P 15	L18	# i-34	CI 2 SC 2	P16	L13	# i-123
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techno	ologies		Grow, Robert	RMG Consult	ing	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	provide an exhaustive list of tools			The Editorial Note is a	no longer relevant		
validate the module developed.	es to allow recreation of the enviro	onment under wh	hich the modules were	SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy				Remove the note.			
,	ools used and their version/edition.			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0						
				CI 2 SC 2	P16	L13	# i-35
CI 2 SC 2	P16	L 9	# i-139	Remein, Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
Grow, Robert	RMG Consultir	ng		Comment Type ER	Comment Status X		
				If the definition of the second state of the s			
There is no reference	Comment Status X ace to IEEE Std 802.1 which is refe			has completed it's wo	at the edition of 802.3 will chan rk.	ige from that refe	erenced and P802.3
There is no reference reference to IEEE S				has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy		nge from that refe	erenced and P802.3
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy	ce to IEEE Std 802.1 which is refe			has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note.	rk.	nge from that refe	erenced and P802.3
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references.	ce to IEEE Std 802.1 which is refe			has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy		ige from that refe	erenced and P802.3
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references.	ce to IEEE Std 802.1 which is refe			has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note.	rk.	ige from that refe	erenced and P802.3
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references.	tice to IEEE Std 802.1 which is refe Std 802d, which specifies the use			has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note. Proposed Response	rk. Response Status O P16	L 28	# i-36
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references. Proposed Response	tice to IEEE Std 802.1 which is refe Std 802d, which specifies the use			has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note. Proposed Response	rk. Response Status O	L 28	
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references. Proposed Response	Response Status O	of the IEEE bra	anch of the URN arcs.	has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note. Proposed Response CI 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane Comment Type T R	rk. Response Status O P16	L 28	
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references. Proposed Response Cl 2 SC 2 Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type E	Response Status O	of the IEEE bra	anch of the URN arcs.	has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note. Proposed Response CI 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR RFC 3621 Is IETF IETF RFC 36	rk. <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 16 Huawei Techr	L 28 nologies erger, December	# [<u>i-36</u>
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references. Proposed Response Cl 2 SC 2 Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type E An editorial note can August 2018	Response Status O P16 Comment Status X	of the IEEE bra	anch of the URN arcs.	has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note. Proposed Response Cl 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR RFC 3621 Is IETF IETF RFC 36 has it been supersede	rk. Response Status O P16 Huawei Techr Comment Status X 21, Power Ethernet MIB, A. Be	L 28 nologies erger, December	# [<u>i-36</u>
There is no reference reference to IEEE S SuggestedRemedy Add references. Proposed Response CI 2 SC 2 Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type E An editorial note car	Response Status O P16 Comment Status X	of the IEEE bra	anch of the URN arcs.	has completed it's wo SuggestedRemedy remove the Ed Note. Proposed Response CI 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR RFC 3621 Is IETF IETF RFC 36 has it been supersede noted as obsolete.	rk. <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 16 Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X 21, Power Ethernet MIB, A. Be ed by 802.3.1 2013? If supers	L 28 nologies erger, December	# [<u>i-36</u>

CI 2 SC 2

C/ 2 SC 2	P16	L 30	# i-127	C/ 2	SC 2	P16	L 46	# i-39
Grow, Robert	RMG Consulting			Remein, Du	ane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment 7	ype TR	Comment Status X		
With the addition of Ta references.	able 5-2, RFC 3635, EtherLike M	IB should be a	added to the normative	RFC 65 Per http		r.ietf.org/doc/rfc6536/ RFC 653	36 is obsolete.	
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
Add reference.				Replace	e with RFC 834	41		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed R	esponse	Response Status O		
C/ 2 SC 2	P16	L 31	# i-37	C/ 2	SC 2	P16	L 55	# i-40
Remein, Duane	Huawei Technolo	ogies		Remein, Du	ane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment T	ype TR	Comment Status X		
RFC 5246 Per https://datatracke	r.ietf.org/doc/rfc8446/ RFC 5246 i	is obsolete.		RFC 79 Per http		r.ietf.org/doc/rfc7950/ RFC 79	50 has been upd	lated.
Per https://datatracker	r.ietf.org/doc/rfc8446/ RFC 5246 i	is obsolete.			s://datatracke	r.ietf.org/doc/rfc7950/ RFC 79	50 has been upd	lated.
	Ū	is obsolete.		Per http Suggested	s://datatracke	r.ietf.org/doc/rfc7950/ RFC 79	50 has been upd	lated.
Per https://datatracker SuggestedRemedy Replace with RFC 844	Ū	is obsolete.		Per http Suggested	os://datatracke Remedy to RFC 8342	r.ietf.org/doc/rfc7950/ RFC 799	50 has been upd	lated.
Per https://datatracker SuggestedRemedy Replace with RFC 844 Proposed Response	46	is obsolete.	# [i-38	Per http Suggested Add ref	os://datatracke Remedy to RFC 8342	Ū	50 has been upd	lated. # [i-124
Per https://datatracker SuggestedRemedy Replace with RFC 844 Proposed Response	46 Response Status O	L 39	# [i-38	Per http Suggestedf Add ref Proposed R	s://datatracke Remedy to RFC 8342 Pesponse SC 3	Response Status O	L 5	
Per https://datatracker SuggestedRemedy Replace with RFC 844 Proposed Response Cl 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane	46 Response Status O P 16	L 39	# j-38	Per http Suggested/ Add ref Proposed R Cl 3	s://datatracke Remedy to RFC 8342 Response SC 3 rt	Response Status 0	L 5	
Per https://datatracker SuggestedRemedy Replace with RFC 844 Proposed Response CI 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR RFC 6241	46 Response Status O P 16 Huawei Technolo	<i>L</i> 39 ogies		Per http Suggestedf Add ref Proposed R Cl 3 Grow, Robe Comment 7 A numb	ss://datatracke Remedy to RFC 8342 Response SC 3 rt Sype ER rer of terms us	Response Status 0 P17 RMG Consulti	L 5 ing id in Std 802.3. 0	# [<u>i-124</u> Can we modify the
Per https://datatracker SuggestedRemedy Replace with RFC 844 Proposed Response CI 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR RFC 6241 Per https://datatracker	46 Response Status O P16 Huawei Technolo Comment Status X	<i>L</i> 39 ogies		Per http Suggestedf Add ref Proposed R Cl 3 Grow, Robe Comment 7 A numb	ss://datatracke Remedy to RFC 8342 Pesponse SC 3 rt Sype ER eer of terms us text (e.g., add	Response Status O P17 RMG Consulti Comment Status X ed in the document are define	L 5 ing id in Std 802.3. 0	# [<u>i-124</u> Can we modify the
Per https://datatracker SuggestedRemedy Replace with RFC 844 Proposed Response CI 2 SC 2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR RFC 6241	46 Response Status O P16 Huawei Technolo Comment Status X	<i>L</i> 39 ogies		Per http Suggested/ Add ref Proposed R Cl 3 Grow, Robe Comment 7 A numb header Suggested/ Some t	s://datatracke Remedy to RFC 8342 Response SC 3 rt ype ER her of terms us text (e.g., add Remedy erms used in t	Response Status O P17 RMG Consulti Comment Status X ed in the document are define	<i>L</i> 5 ing ind in Std 802.3. (oh or a NOTE) to EEE Std 802.3, a	# [<u>i-124</u> Can we modify the o describe this? and where alternati

CI 3 SC 3

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 3 SC 3.1	P17	L 7	# i-41	C/ 5	SC 5.1	P 19	L14	# i-141
Remein, Duane	Huawei Tec	hnologies		Cumming	ls, Rodney	National Ins	truments C	
Comment Type E missing period at e	Comment Status X			Comment It is u	51	Comment Status X hese two sentences are inter	nded to be norma	tive.
SuggestedRemedy per comment			lf yes If yes "shall	s, "shall" "should" s, it would be acc l" be supported.	' or "may" is needed. eptable to state that the liste	d attributes (name	e, description,etc)	
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Other status	r attributes includ	acceptable to state that "Oth de oper-status, which is esse e to determine if an interface	ntial to use of an i	interface. Without oper-
C/4 SC4	P 18	L 5	# i-125	uues				
Grow, Robert	RMG Consu	ulting				e assumes that the answer is parding other attributes.	s no, and therefor	e this standard cannot
Comment Type ER				Suggeste	dRemedy			
	acronyms are used in the docu of additions includes acronyms d.			data i expec	nodes of the bas	ences with "This standard do e ietf-interfaces YANG modu rted: name, description, type ess."	ule, but the followi	ng data nodes are
included in Std 80 DTE data termin	al equipment	, ,		Proposea	l Response	Response Status O		
EPON Ethernet pa number of uses ju	ssive optical networks (though	all uses found are	e in clause 7, the	C/ 5	SC 5.2	P19	L 49	# i-42
IEEE Institute of	Electrical and Electronics Engli	neers		Remein, I	Duane	Huawei Tec	hnologies	
	gineering Task Force k Configuration Protocol			Comment	t Type TR	Comment Status X		
PoE Power over	0	e reference title)		The E which	Editorial Note see	ems to be conveying informa ned in the published docume		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Table				
				00	dRemedy			
				Remo Node Table	s that do not ma	Note and add the following a p into RFC 2819 (RMON) bu	at the end of the pa at into the ETHER	ara in 5.2. LIKE MIB appear in

Proposed Response Response Status **0**

C/ 5 SC 5.2

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.2	P 19	L 50	# i-2	C/ 5 SC 5.3.1	P 24	L19	# i-232
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Comm	nunicatio		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Au	tomation	
Comment Type E Unnecessary editorial	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR speed is m/s accordir	Comment Status X og to SI units		
SuggestedRemedy Remove the note on I	ine 50-52.			SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.2 Weber, Karl	P 20 Beckhoff Auto	L 24 mation	# i-231	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Remein, Duane	Р 26 Huawei Tech	L 3 nnologies	# i-43
Comment Type TR speed is m/s accordir	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X to multiple YANG modules.		
SuggestedRemedy	g to of anito			SuggestedRemedy			
Change to data rate				Change:			
Proposed Response	Response Status O				G module definition," to G module definitions,"		
				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
CI 5 SC 5.2	P 21	L 45	# i-23				
Anslow, Peter	Ciena Corpora	ition					
Comment Type E The final bottom bord	Comment Status X er in Table 5-1 should be "Thin	" i.e., follow the	table definition.				
SuggestedRemedy Remove the override	from the final bottom border in	Table 5-1					
Proposed Response	Response Status O						
C/ 5 SC 5.2 Grow, Robert	P 22 RMG Consulti	L19	# i-126				
		iig					
	Comment Status X 2 and 5-3 are inconsistent. One mon name (RFC 3635 EtherLi		(RFC 2819, RMON)				
	•						
SuggestedRemedy							
SuggestedRemedy Make consistent, pref	ferably using RFC #.						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 Page 8 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:13 PM

CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 26	L3	# i-44	C/ 5	SC 5.3.2		P 26	L 9	# i-142
Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	inologies		Cummings	s, Rodney	N	ational Instr	ruments C	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment	Type GR	Comment Sta	atus X		
	similar to it in 6.5.2 pg 54 line y confusing due to multiple c Clause 5).			"https correc	://github.com/ t URL, becau	YangModels/yang/tr se once 802.3.2 pub	ee/master/s blishes, its Y	tandard/ieee/802 ANG module wil	2.3/draft" is not the Il no longer be a draft.
"In the following YANC DESCRIPTION text ar	G module definition, should and the corresponding definition and mappings in 5.3 shall tak	on in 5.2 through		Accor http:	ding to the mo s://1.ieee802.o	ost recent decision ir org/yangsters/yangs	n the IEEE 8 ters-guidelin	302 YANGsters g nes/yangsters-re	group: pository-guidelines/
What is "DESCRIPTIC	DN text [®] referring to? I can fine ept in these four paras. If it is	nd no other occu			cation would b	be YangModels/yang/tr	ee/master/s	tandard/ieee/802	2.3/published"
attribute "description"	then the references to "corre appings in 5.3" do not make	sponding definition	on in 5.2 through 5.3"	Suggestee	0	ranginoaolo, yang, a			,publicitieu
"description" is part of SuggestedRemedy		sense given mar				E 802 YANGsters to rking group YANG m		the correct GitH	ub location for
If "DESCRIPTION text "description" in the mo	t" refers to one or more of the odule itself then:	e ~478 instances	of the YANG attribute			hat coordination fails YangModels/yang/tr		tandard/ieee/802	2.3/published"
	and the corresponding definiti and mappings in 5.3 shall tak			Proposed	Response	Response Sta	tus O		
and tree hierarchy in 5 shall take precedence				<i>CI</i> 5 Weber, Ka	SC 5.3.2	В	P27 eckhoff Aut	L 10 omation	# <u>i-233</u>
italicize description in	the above change.			Comment	Type TR	Comment Sta	atus X		
0	in 6.5.2, 7.4.2, and 8.5.2.			speed	l is m/s accord	ding to SI units			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Suggested Chang	<i>dRemedy</i> ge to data rate	9			
				Proposed	Response	Response Sta	tus O		
				CI 5	SC 5.3.2		P 27	L17	# i-234
				Weber, Ka	arl	В	eckhoff Aut	omation	
				Comment speed	51	Comment Sta ding to SI units	atus X		
				Suggested Chang	<i>dRemedy</i> ge to data rate	9			
				Proposed	Response	Response Sta	tus O		

Page 9 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:13 PM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

# i-239	L 7	P 45	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	# i-235	L 48	P 30	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2
	omation	Beckhoff Aut	Weber, Karl		Itomation	Beckhoff Aut	Weber, Karl
		Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according			Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according
			SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate				SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate
		Response Status O	Proposed Response			Response Status O	Proposed Response
# <u>i-241</u>	L 37 comation	P 45 Beckhoff Aut	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Weber, Karl	# i-236	L 49 Itomation	P 30 Beckhoff Aut	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Weber, Karl
		Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according			Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according
			SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate				SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate
		Response Status O	Proposed Response			Response Status O	Proposed Response
# <u>i-243</u>	L 38	P 45 Beckhoff Aut	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Weber, Karl	# i-237	L 53 Itomation	P 30 Beckhoff Aut	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Weber, Karl
		Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according			Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according
			SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate				SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate
		Response Status O	Proposed Response			Response Status O	Proposed Response
# <u>i-240</u>	L4 comation	P 46 Beckhoff Aut	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Weber, Karl	# i-238	L 49 Itomation	P 44 Beckhoff Aut	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Weber, Karl
		Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according			Comment Status X g to SI units	Comment Type TR speed is m/s according
			SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate				SuggestedRemedy Change to data rate
		Response Status 0	Proposed Response			Response Status 0	Proposed Response

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/ 5

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC 5.3.2

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 5.3.2
 SC 5.3.2

Page 10 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:13 PM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 46	L 46	# i-242	CI 5 SC	5.3.2.1		P 26	L 44	# <u>i-3</u>
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation		Hajduczenia, Ma	irek		Charter Com	municatio	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type	т	Comment	Status X		
speed is m/s accordin	ig to SI units								A itself and publishe
SuggestedRemedy									nothing more than a shed on IANA website
Change to data rate						reference to la			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			SuggestedReme	edy				
				Change					
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl	P Beckhoff Auto	L 60 omation	# <u>i-167</u>			ub.com/YangMo a-if-type.yang";	odels/yang/blo	b/master/	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			to					
Counts octets but FCS SuggestedRemedy	S seems to be bytes			reference "h 03.yang";	ttp://www.	iana.org/assign	ments/yang-p	arameters/iana-il	-type@2018-07-
Change byte to octet				Proposed Respo	onse	Response S	Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status O								
				CI 5 SC	5.3.2.1		P 26	L 56	# i-46
					0101211			-00	1 1 40
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 26	L14	# i-45	Remein, Duane	0101211		Huawei Tech		" 140
	Р 26 Huawei Techr		# i-45		GR	Comment	Huawei Tech		" <u>1</u> -10
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techr Comment Status X	nologies		Remein, Duane Comment Type	GR URL will I	become obsole	Huawei Tech S <i>tatus</i> X	nologies	should ref the 802.3
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself.	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X vision entry" and "date of last	nologies revisions"? The	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane <i>Comment Type</i> This contact	GR URL will b oup not the	become obsole	Huawei Tech S <i>tatus</i> X	nologies	
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11	Huawei Techr Comment Status X	nologies revisions"? The	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme	GR URL will he bup not the edy nge "Web	become obsole e project. o URL: http://ww	Huawei Tech S <i>tatus</i> X te when the pr	nologies	should ref the 802.3
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11 SuggestedRemedy	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X vision entry" and "date of last	nologies revisions"? The 11, ,7.4.2 pg 7§	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme Globally cha	GR URL will I bup not the edy nge "Web beee802.org	become obsole e project. o URL: http://ww	Huawei Tech Status X te when the pr w.ieee802.org	nologies roject finishes. It	should ref the 802.3
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11 SuggestedRemedy Clarify which attributes	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X evision entry" and "date of last Pg 43 line 47, 6.5.2 pg 54 line ⁴	nologies revisions"? The 11, ,7.4.2 pg 7§	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme Globally cha http://www.ie Proposed Respo	GR URL will I bup not the edy nge "Web eee802.org	become obsole e project. 9 URL: http://ww g/3/"	Huawei Tech Status X te when the pr rw.ieee802.org Status O	nologies roject finishes. It g/3/cf/" to "Web L	should ref the 802.3 JRL:
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11 SuggestedRemedy	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X evision entry" and "date of last ^D g 43 line 47, 6.5.2 pg 54 line s in the YANG module are bei	nologies revisions"? The 11, ,7.4.2 pg 7§	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme Globally cha http://www.ie Proposed Respo	GR URL will I bup not the edy nge "Web beee802.org	become obsole e project. 9 URL: http://ww g/3/"	Huawei Tech Status X te when the pr w.ieee802.org	nologies roject finishes. It g/3/cf/" to "Web L	should ref the 802.3
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11 SuggestedRemedy Clarify which attributes	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X evision entry" and "date of last ^D g 43 line 47, 6.5.2 pg 54 line s in the YANG module are bei	nologies revisions"? The 11, ,7.4.2 pg 7§	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme Globally cha http://www.ie Proposed Respo Cl 5 SC Weber, Karl	GR URL will H bup not the edy nge "Web eee802.org onse	become obsole e project. b URL: http://ww g/3/" <i>Response</i> S	Huawei Tech Status X te when the pr rw.ieee802.org Status O P27 Beckhoff Aut	nologies roject finishes. It g/3/cf/" to "Web L	should ref the 802.3 JRL:
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11 SuggestedRemedy Clarify which attributes	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X evision entry" and "date of last ^D g 43 line 47, 6.5.2 pg 54 line s in the YANG module are bei	nologies revisions"? The 11, ,7.4.2 pg 7§	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme Globally cha http://www.ie Proposed Respo Cl 5 SC Weber, Karl Comment Type	GR URL will H bup not the edy nge "Web eee802.org onse 5.3.2.1 TR	become obsole e project. 9 URL: http://ww g/3/" <i>Response S</i>	Huawei Tech Status X te when the pr w.ieee802.org Status O P27 Beckhoff Auto Status X	nologies roject finishes. It g/3/cf/" to "Web L	should ref the 802.3 JRL: # <u>i-158</u>
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11 SuggestedRemedy Clarify which attributes	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X evision entry" and "date of last ^D g 43 line 47, 6.5.2 pg 54 line s in the YANG module are bei	nologies revisions"? The 11, ,7.4.2 pg 7§	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme Globally cha http://www.ie Proposed Respo CI 5 SC Weber, Karl Comment Type speed-type i	GR URL will H bup not the edy nge "Web eee802.org onse 5.3.2.1 TR s not the a	become obsole e project. 9 URL: http://ww g/3/" <i>Response S</i>	Huawei Tech Status X te when the pr w.ieee802.org Status O P27 Beckhoff Auto Status X	nologies roject finishes. It g/3/cf/" to "Web L L10 omation	should ref the 802.3 JRL: # <u>i-158</u>
Remein, Duane Comment Type TR What is meant by "Re in the module itself. Same issue 5.3.2.2 P 130 line 11 SuggestedRemedy Clarify which attributes	Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X evision entry" and "date of last ^D g 43 line 47, 6.5.2 pg 54 line s in the YANG module are bei	nologies revisions"? The 11, ,7.4.2 pg 7§	se terms do not appear	Remein, Duane Comment Type This contact Working Gro SuggestedReme Globally cha http://www.ie Proposed Respo Cl 5 SC Weber, Karl Comment Type speed-type i SuggestedReme	GR URL will I bup not the edy nge "Web eee802.org onse 5.3.2.1 TR s not the a edy	become obsole e project. 0 URL: http://ww g/3/" <i>Response</i> S <i>Comment</i> s	Huawei Tech Status X te when the pr w.ieee802.org Status O P27 Beckhoff Auto Status X n (speed shou	nologies roject finishes. It g/3/cf/" to "Web L L10 omation	should ref the 802.3 JRL: # <u>i-158</u> te")

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/generalC/5Page 11 of 45COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawnSC 5.3.2.110/18/2018 10:18:13 PMSORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, lineSC 5.3.2.1SC 5.3.2.110/18/2018 10:18:13 PM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

	P 28	L 57	# i-4	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	1 P32	L3	# i-28
łajduczenia, Marek	Charter Comm	nunicatio		Zhuang, Yan	Huawei Te	echnologies	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type T	Comment Status X		
	reference to 802.3 anymore, it is 5 Std 802.3 compliant Ethernet in		hat any "Ethernet		ing as "Priority-based PAUSE	E frame". It is called	I "PFC frame".
SuggestedRemedy				Word "will" shall no	t be used.		
Change "IEEE Std 8 (page/line): 28/57 32/39 44/31	302.3 Ethernet interface" to "Ethe	rnet interface" ir	ι following locations	when auto-negotiat frame based flow c	d the intended meaning of the ed is enabled, then the config ontrol settings that The default value is impleme	guration will restrict	the priority PAUSE
Proposed Response	Response Status O			from Glen Krame	r		
				SuggestedRemedy			
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl	P 31 Beckhoff Auto	L 24 mation	# i-159	Replace description "IEEE Std 802.3 Pr Priority-based flow	iority-based PAUSE frame ba	ased flow control."	with "IEEE Std 802.3
	Comment Status X t according to the International S g/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		ee	"True indicates tha that IEEE Std 802.	eaf enable description: t IEEE Std 802.3 priority-base 3 priority-based flow control is prity-based flow control is ena	disabled. For inter	
				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Delete units - line							
	Response Status O					1.40	# : 404
Proposed Response			# [100	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2. Weber, Karl		L 46 Automation	# i-161
Proposed Response	P31	L 46	# i-160				# <u>I-161</u>
Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Veber, Karl Comment Type E	P 31 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X	mation		Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur	Beckhoff A	Automation nal System of Units	
Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Veber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit	P 31 Beckhoff Auto	mation System of Units s		Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur https://www.bipm.o SuggestedRemedy	Beckhoff / Comment Status X it according to the Internation	Automation nal System of Units	
Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Neber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit	P 31 Beckhoff Auto <i>Comment Status</i> X t according to the International S	mation System of Units s		Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur https://www.bipm.o	Beckhoff / Comment Status X it according to the Internation	Automation nal System of Units	

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P32	L 56	# i-47	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P34	L12	# i-164
Remein, Duane	F 32 Huawei Techn		# I-41	Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Aut		# 1-104
Comment Type E Indentation of "(IETF F Same issue pg 33 line SuggestedRemedy align with rest of descr Proposed Response	11.	-		Comment Type E fps is written different SuggestedRemedy Change to f/s Proposed Response	Comment Status X ly compared to Gb/s Response Status 0		
7 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 32 Beckhoff Auto	L 65	# [i-162	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl	P 35 Beckhoff Aut	L 25 omation	# <u>i-165</u>
https://www.bipm.org/u SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status X ccording to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	ystem of Units s	see		Comment Status X according to the International utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		e
Delete units - line Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P33	L 48	# i-163	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl	P 35 Beckhoff Aut	L 54 omation	# i-166
Veber, Karl Comment Type TR According to 30.3.1.1.:	Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X 37, Max Frame is a enumerate				Comment Status X ccording to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		e
SuggestedRemedy Change definition to th	e 4 enumeration values			SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2	.1 P36	L10	# i-168	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 37	L 21	# i-171
Neber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	nit according to the International S org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		ee		according to the International a utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		e
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
CI 5 SC 5.3.2		L 33	# i-169	Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P37	L 46	# i-172
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	nit according to the International S org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		ee		according to the International utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		эе
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
· ·	.1 P36	L 60	# [i-170	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P38	L7	# <u>i-173</u>
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2	.1 P36 Beckhoff Auto		# i- <u>170</u>		,	-	# [i-173
· ·			# <u>i</u> -170	Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 38	-	# [i-173
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2. Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur	Beckhoff Auto	omation System of Units s		CI 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit a	P 38 Beckhoff Auto	omation System of Units se	
Cl 5 SC 5.3.2. Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur https://www.bipm.o	Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X hit according to the International S	omation System of Units s		CI 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit a	P38 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X according to the International	omation System of Units se	
CI 5 SC 5.3.2. Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur	Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X hit according to the International S	omation System of Units s		Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit a https://www.bipm.org/	P38 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X according to the International	omation System of Units se	

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 . Weber, Karl	1 P 38 Beckhoff Au	L 30	# i-174	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl	P 39 Beckhoff A	L 40	# <u>i-177</u>
		lomation		,		utomation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X	0		Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	it according to the International rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		see		according to the Internationa /utils/common/pdf/si_brochu		see
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	1 <i>P</i> 38	L 64	# i-175	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 40	L37	# i-178
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Au	tomation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff A	utomation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	it according to the International rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochur		see		according to the Internationa /utils/common/pdf/si_brochu		see
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
	1 P 39	L 17	# i-176	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P41	L1	# i-179
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Au	tomation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff A	utomation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	it according to the International rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		see		init according to the Internati /utils/common/pdf/si_brochu		its see
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Delete units - line							

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 41	L 47	# i-180	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.4		L 6	# i-183
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Autor	mation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	unit according to the Internationa g/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		lits see		t according to the International S g/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		ee
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Weber, Karl	P 42 Beckhoff Autor	L 48	# i-182	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.2	2 P 45 Ciena Corpora	L6	# [i-24
		nation				ation	
Comment Type T type is counter64 wh	Comment Status X ile the in-discard counter is cour	nter32		Comment Type E "10GB/s" should be	Comment Status X "10 Gb/s" (add a space and low	er case B)	
SuggestedRemedy change to counter32				SuggestedRemedy Change "10GB/s" to	o "10 Gb/s"		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 42	L 49	# i-181	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.2	2 P 45	L 21	# i-48
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Autor	mation		Remein, Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
	Comment Status X according to the International S	,	see	Comment Type E Indentation of augm	Comment Status X ent statement.		
	g/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_ has no units definition	8_en.pdf		SuggestedRemedy	ad by one extre level		
SuggestedRemedy					ed by one extra level.		
Delete units - line				Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0						

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	.2 P 47	L 22	# i-184	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.2	P 48	L 25	# i-187
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Aut	tomation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	mation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	nit according to the International org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		see		t according to the Internationa utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		see
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
CI 5 SC 5.3.2	.2 P47	L 46	# i-185	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.2	P 48	L 49	# i-188
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Aut	tomation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	nit according to the International org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		see		cording to the International Sy utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		e
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line				Delete units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
	.2 P48	L 5	# i-186	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.2	P 49	L 25	# i-189
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2							
	Beckhoff Aut	tomation		Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Aut Comment Status X	tomation		Weber, Karl Comment Type E	Beckhoff Auto	mation	
Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur		System of Units s		Comment Type E collisions is not an uni		I System of Units	See
Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur https://www.bipm.c	Comment Status X	System of Units s		Comment Type E collisions is not an uni	Comment Status X t according to the Internationa	I System of Units	see
Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an ur	Comment Status X	System of Units s		Comment Type E collisions is not an uni https://www.bipm.org/	Comment Status X t according to the Internationa	I System of Units	s See

C/6 SC 6.1	P 50	L13	# i-49	CI 6	SC 6.2	P 50	L 20	# i-50
emein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies		Remein, D	Juane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
omment Type E Co	mment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
Is this a test to see who is pa and there are 2 in Clause 5.	ying attention? There	e is only one data	module in this clause	missin	0			
uggestedRemedy				Suggested				
Change: "The YANG modules defined		the Ethernetinterf	ace YANG data		ge e focused" to e is focused"			
module defined in Clause 5 "The YANG module defined modules defined in Clause 5.	in this clause extends	the Ethernetinter	face YANG data	Proposed	Response	Response Status O		
٨	^			CI 6	SC 6.2	P 50	L 21	# i-51
roposed Response Res	ponse Status O			Remein, D	Juane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
				<i>Comment</i> missin	<i>Type</i> E	Comment Status X		
6 SC 6.1 mmerman, George	P 60	L 15	# i-246	Suggesteg	dRemedv			
omment Type T Co Now that 802.3bt is finished, parameters are not covered t through 8 are no longer PoDI a bunch of work, right now, it included in this draft.	by YANG. Some chan only). Others may b	nges are obvious e more subtle. R	(power classes 6 ather than generating	"the Po and or "for Po	er over Ethern	0		
uggestedRemedy				Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
Insert "This initial version of I made to IEEE Std 802.3-201 document was already in Spo	8 by IEEE Std 802.3bt			<i>Cl</i> 6 Remein, D	SC 6.2	Р 50 Huawei Techr	L22	# i-52
roposed Response Res	ponse Status O						lologies	
	-			Comment "powe	21	Comment Status X ne" or "Power over Data Line"? V	Ve should be co	nsistent.
				• •				
				Suggested Chang	-	er data line" to "Power over Data	Line"	

C/ 6 SC 6.2

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 6 SC 6.3	P 50	L12	# i-129	C/ 6	SC 6.3	P 51	L 5	# i-54
Grow, Robert	RMG Consult	ing		Remein,	Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
Comment Type E First use of PD in doc	Comment Status X ument not expanded.			<i>Commen</i> Gran	<i>nt Type</i> E mmar	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggeste	edRemedy			
Add expansion Power	ed Device.			chan				
Proposed Response	Response Status O			write "The	e." to	of data nodes defined in this Y of data nodes defined in this Y		-
C/ 6 SC 6.3 Remein, Duane	P 51 Huawei Tech	L 1 nologies	# <u>i-53</u>		-write. d Response	Response Status O		
Comment Type E Why does 6.3 warrant	Comment Status X t starting on a new page?			CI 6	SC 6.3	P51	L 30	# i-55
SuggestedRemedy				Remein,	Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies	
Remove page break				Commen	nt Type E	Comment Status X		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Gran	nmar			
CI 6 SC 6.3	P51	L1	# i-128	Char "and	possible to enci	rypt their values" to:		
Grow, Robert	RMG Consult	ing			to possibly encr	51		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Proposed	d Response	Response Status O		
	e raised with the approval of P							
Std 802.3-2018 includ IEEE Std 802.3bt-201	ng part of IEEE Std 802.3-201 les all approved amendments x is addition of "Power over E	. One problem for thernet and in s	or P802.3.2 created by ome cases	C/ 6 Weber, k	SC 6.5.1 Karl	P 60 Beckhoff Auto	L 27 mation	# i-156
	Power via the MDI with various over 2 pairs). This includes ch			Commen units	51	Comment Status X d be plural and without quoting		
802.3bt-201x). (The \	ify capabilities consistent with WG Chair should have a targe			00	edRemedy nge to millijoules			
SuggestedRemedy				Proposed	d Response	Response Status O		
	via the MDI terminology to be erms. Add new attributes and							
Proposed Response	Response Status 0							

C/ 6 SC 6.5.1

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/6 SC 6.5.1	P60	L 47	# i-151	C/ 6 SC 6.5.1	P60	L 5 9	# i-154
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto		# 1131	Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto		# 1134
the power-accuracy le SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status X which is different from the desc eaf which do not allow to specif power to integer and units to r Response Status O	y sub-milliwatt v		Comment Type E units definition should SuggestedRemedy change to milliwatts Proposed Response	Comment Status X d be plural and without quoting Response Status O		
/ 6 SC 6.5.1	P 60 Beckhoff Auto	L 47	# i-152	C/ 6 SC 6.5.1 Weber, Karl	P60 Beckhoff Auto	L 59 omation	# [i-155
omment Type T	Comment Status X ore than 2 Megawatt maximum	power if the ur	nit is milliWatt. This is	Comment Type T unsigned32 means m far more than needed SuggestedRemedy change type of actua		n power if the un	it is milliWatt. This is
change type of actual Proposed Response	power to integer32. Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
7 6 SC 6.5.1	P 60 Beckhoff Auto	L 47	# i-153	C/ 6 SC 6.5.1 Weber, Karl	P 64 Beckhoff Auto	L2 omation	# i-157
Comment Type E units definition should SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status X	maton		Comment Type TR units definition missir SuggestedRemedy add "units millijoules	5		
change to milliwatts Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		

Received Comments IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model	Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments
Cl 6 SC 6.5.1 P 64 L 21 # [i-147] Neber, Karl Beckhoff Automation	C/ 6 SC 6.5.1 P 64 L 36 # i-150 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation
Comment Type T Comment Status X unsigned32 means more than 2 Megawatt maximum power if the unit is milliWatt. This is far more than needed.	Comment Type T Comment Status X unsigned32 means more than 2 Megawatt maximum power if the unit is milliWatt. This is far more than needed.
SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy
change type of actual power to integer32. Proposed Response Response Status O	change type of actual power to integer32. Proposed Response Response Status O
C/ 6 SC 6.5.1 P 64 L 21 # i-148 Veber, Karl Beckhoff Automation	C/ 6 SC 6.5.1 P 64 L 36 # i-149 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation
Comment Type E Comment Status X units definition should be plural and without quoting	Comment Type E Comment Status X units definition should be plural and without quoting
SuggestedRemedy change to milliwatts	SuggestedRemedy change to milliwatts
Proposed Response Response Status O	Proposed Response Response Status O
C/ 6 SC 6.5.1 P 64 L 21 # i-146 Veber, Karl Beckhoff Automation	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 P 54 L 9 # i-143 Cummings, Rodney National Instruments C
Comment Type TR Comment Status X The units is watt which is different from the description actual-power on Page 60 and the power-accuracy leaf which do not allow to specify sub-milliwatt values	Comment Type GR Comment Status X "https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/master/standard/ieee/802.3/draft" is not the correct URL, because once 802.3.2 publishes, its YANG module will no longer be a draft.
SuggestedRemedy change type of actual power to integer and units to milliwatts	According to the most recent decision in the IEEE 802 YANGsters group: https://1.ieee802.org/yangsters/yangsters-guidelines/yangsters-repository-guidelines/
Proposed Response Response Status O	the location would be "https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/master/standard/ieee/802.3/published"
	SuggestedRemedy
	Coordinate with IEEE 802 YANGsters to determine the correct GitHub location for published IEEE working group YANG modules.
	If for some reason that coordination fails, use "https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/master/standard/ieee/802.3/published"
	Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 6 SC 6.5.2	P 61	L 12	# <u>i-56</u>	Cl 7	SC 7.2	P65	L12	# <u>i-58</u>
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies		Remein, Du	iane	Huawei Techi	nologies	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	уре Е	Comment Status X		
Indenting the line beg therefore wraps to the	ginning ""PoDL PSE configurati	ion" is excessi	vely indented and	missing	y verb			
SuggestedRemedy	e next line.			Suggestedl	Remedy			
,	lents and ensure the line wraps	nonerly is requ	ired to fit on two lines	Change "clause	e focused" to			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0	property to requ			is focused"			
Toposed Nesponse				Proposed F	Response	Response Status O		
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 62	L 52	# i-245					
Zimmerman, George				CI 7	SC 7.2.1	P 65	L18	# i-59
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Remein, Du	iane	Huawei Techi	nologies	
"description - Power	class of the PSE port." - param	eter is the powe	r class of the detected	Comment 7	ype ER	Comment Status X		
PD on the PSE port,	not the power class which the I	PSE itself can pr	ovide	We sho	ould future pro	of this sentence "EPON is defi	ned in IEEE Std	802.3, covering
•		•						
SunnastadRamadv				FIIVALG	ai Lavei anu iv	edia Access Control sublaver	OT IGEPON	
Change "Power class	s of the PSE port." to "Power cl	ass of the PD de	etected on the PSE		G-EPON inter	edia Access Control sublayer aces." so we don't have to ren		ge it when we finish
port."	·	ass of the PD de	tected on the PSE	and 10	G-EPON interl EPON.			ge it when we finish
Change "Power class	s of the PSE port." to "Power cl Response Status 0	ass of the PD de	etected on the PSE	and 10 Nx25G <i>Suggestedl</i> Change	G-EPON interl EPON. Remedy	aces." so we don't have to ren	nember to chang	
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response	Response Status O			and 10 Nx25G <i>Suggestedl</i> Change	G-EPON interl EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla	aces." so we don't have to ren	nember to chang	
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response	·	L 15	etected on the PSE # i-57	and 10 Nx25G Suggested/ Change Access	G-EPON interl EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla	aces." so we don't have to ren N is defined in IEEE Std 802.3 yers.	nember to chang	
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane	Response Status 0	L 15		and 10 Nx25G Suggested/ Change Access	G-EPON interl EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla	aces." so we don't have to ren N is defined in IEEE Std 802.3 yers.	nember to chang	
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line beg	Response Status O P 63 Huawei Techr Comment Status X ginning "enters the the SIGNAT	L 15 nologies	# [i-57	and 100 Nx25G Suggested Change Access Proposed F	G-EPON interf EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla Response SC 7.2.1	aces." so we don't have to ren N is defined in IEEE Std 802.3 yers. <i>Response Status</i> O	nember to chang 3, covering Phys <i>L</i> 20	sical Layers and Media
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line beg space indentation an	Response Status O P 63 Huawei Techr Comment Status X ginning "enters the the SIGNAT	L 15 nologies	# [i-57	and 100 Nx25G Suggestedl Change Access Proposed F Cl 7	G-EPON interf EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla Response SC 7.2.1 Iane	aces." so we don't have to ren N is defined in IEEE Std 802.3 yers. <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 65	nember to chang 3, covering Phys <i>L</i> 20	sical Layers and Media
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line beg space indentation an	Response Status O P 63 Huawei Techr Comment Status X ginning "enters the the SIGNAT	L 15 nologies	# [i-57	and 100 Nx25G Suggested/ Change Access Proposed F CI 7 Remein, Du Comment 1 This se	G-EPON interf EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla Response SC 7.2.1 nane Type T ntence is inco	aces." so we don't have to ren ON is defined in IEEE Std 802.3 yers. <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 65 Huawei Techi	nember to chang 3, covering Phys <i>L</i> 20 nologies	sical Layers and Media # l <u>i-60</u>
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line beg space indentation an SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P 63 Huawei Techr Comment Status X ginning "enters the the SIGNAT	L 15 nologies	# [i-57	and 100 Nx25G Suggested/ Change Access Proposed F CI 7 Remein, Du Comment 1 This se	G-EPON interf EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla Response SC 7.2.1 nane Type T ntence is inco at we also hav	aces." so we don't have to ren ON is defined in IEEE Std 802.3 yers. <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 65 Huawei Tech <i>Comment Status</i> X rrect "EPON is a variant of Gig	nember to chang 3, covering Phys <i>L</i> 20 nologies	sical Layers and Media # l <u>i-60</u>
Change "Power class port." Proposed Response Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line beg space indentation an SuggestedRemedy per comment	Response Status O P63 Huawei Techr Comment Status X ginning "enters the the SIGNAT id one less "the ".	L 15 nologies	# [i-57	and 100 Nx25G Suggested Access Proposed F Cl 7 Remein, Du Comment 7 This se give tha Suggested	G-EPON interf EPON. Remedy to read "EPC Control subla Response SC 7.2.1 Iane Type T Intence is inco at we also hav Remedy	aces." so we don't have to ren ON is defined in IEEE Std 802.3 yers. <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 65 Huawei Tech <i>Comment Status</i> X rrect "EPON is a variant of Gig	nember to chang 3, covering Phys <i>L</i> 20 nologies gabit Ethernet us	# [<u>i-60</u>

CI 7 SC 7.2.1

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7 SC 7.2.1	P 65	L 53	# i-61	C/ 7 SC 7.2.1	P65	L 62	# i-131
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techn	ologies		Grow, Robert	RMG Consult	ing	
Comment Type ER Co The detailed description from maintenance headache in th appropriate clauses (which is brief description. I would also be fine with a sin SuggestedRemedy Replace from "The IEEE layer clause with the following:	e future and is unneces NOT done for any othe nple ref to 802.3 as is d	sary. We shoul er modules in th lone in the rest o	d at most just list the is standard) with a very of this draft.	SuggestedRemedy Add expansion Phys	Comment Status X document not expanded. sical Coding Sublayer (though S of expansions in the document Response Status O		
The following clauses in IEE Clause 30: Management, Clause 60: Physical Mediu Clause 64: MPCP (Multipo Clause 65: Reconciliation Media Attachment (PMA) sul The following clauses in I EE Clause 30: Management, Clause 75: PMD sublayer Clause 76: RS, PCS, and Clause 77: MPCP for 10G- Proposed Response Res	m Dependent(PMD) sul int Control Protocol) for Sublayer (RS), Physical blayers for 1G-EPON. E Std 802.3 define 10G for 10G-EPON, PMA sublayers for 10G-	blayer for 1G-EF 1G-EPON, Coding Sublay -EPON:		Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type E MPCP is already exp SuggestedRemedy Change Clause 77: MPCP (N to	Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> X panded and defined Multipoint Control Protocol), whi		# <u>i-5</u>
C/ 7 SC 7.2.1 Grow, Robert	P 65 RMG Consulti	L 59	# [i-130	Clause 77: MPCP, v Proposed Response	which Response Status O		
Comment Type E Co First use of PMD in documer	mment Status X	0		C/ 7 SC 7.2.1 Grow, Robert	P 76 RMG Consult	L 1 ing	# [i-132
SuggestedRemedy Add expansion Physical Mec version in 1.5 a quick check Proposed Response Res				SuggestedRemedy Add expansion Phys	Comment Status X document not expanded. sical Medium Dependent (thoug sk check of expansions in the do Response Status O		

Page 23 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:13 PM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 7 SC 7.2.1 P76 L1 # i-133 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting	Cl 7SC 7.2.2P 66L 28# i-6Hajduczenia, MarekCharter Communicatio
Comment Type E Comment Status X	Comment Type E Comment Status X
First use of FEC in document not expanded.	Missing comma after "802.3"
Suggested Remedy	SuggestedRemedy
Add expansion forward error correction (Std 802.3 uses an uncapitalized version in 1.5 but	Per comment
capitalized on a varient, RS-FEC a quick check of expansions in the document mostly uses the uncapitalized version).	Proposed Response Response Status O
Proposed Response Response Status O	
	Cl 7SC 7.2.2P 67L 1# i-8Hajduczenia, MarekCharter Communicatio
C/ 7 SC 7.2.2 P66 L 24 # i-7	Comment Type T Comment Status X
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio Comment Type TR Comment Status X	Updates are needed to Figure 7-2 to make it applicable to 1G-EPON and 10G-EPON alik
Principles of operation apply to 1G-EPON only and should be updated to apply to 10G- EPON as well. SuggestedRemedy	change "GMII" to "GMII (1G-EPON) or XGMII (10G-EPON) Proposed Response Response Status O
see the attached file (hajduczenia_d30_1) for reference with tracked changes	Cl 7 SC 7.2.3 P67 L1 # [i-63
Proposed Response Response Status O	Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
	Comment Type TR Comment Status X
Cl 7 SC 7.2.2 P66 L24 # i-62	This Figure is incorrect, will likely create a maintenance headache in the future, and is unnecessary. EPON does NOT just use GMII.
Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies	SuggestedRemedy
Comment Type TR Comment Status X	Either change GMII to xGMII and add an explanation of what is meant by this term or
This detailed description is incorrect, will likely create a maintenance headache in the future, and is unnecessary. EPON does NOT just extend " the specification of Gigabit	remove the figure.
	Proposed Response Response Status O
Ethernet".	
Ethernet".	

CI 7 SC 7.2.3

Received Comment	is IEEE P802.3cf	D3.0 YANG Data Model	Definitions Initial Sponsor	ballot comments		
C/ 7 SC 7.2.3 Grow, Robert	P67 L34 RMG Consulting	# i-134	<i>Cl</i> 7 SC 7.2.4 Hajduczenia, Marek	P 67 Charter Commu	L 44 inicatio	# [i-9
Comment Type E Figure 7-2 title has inc to use this capitalizatio	Comment Status X onsistent capitalization of Multipoint MAC	Control (Std 802.3 seems	Comment Type TR *** Comment submitted	Comment Status X d with the file 98317800003-haj	duczenia_d30_	2.docx attached ***
SuggestedRemedy Capitalize Control.	,		alike.	7.2.4 needs to revised to be app	olicable to 1G-E	PON and 10G-EPON
Proposed Response	Response Status 0		SuggestedRemedy Use the text in hajducz	enia_d30_2 with tracked chang	es	
CI 7 SC 7.2.3	P67 L38	# i-135	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Grow, Robert Comment Type E	RMG Consulting Comment Status X		C/ 7 SC 7.2.5 Remein, Duane	P 67 Huawei Technol	L 57 logies	# <u>i-65</u>
	tion of time-division multiple access (Std 8 blower case in all three occurances). on multiple access.	U2.3 IS 2:1 ON	is unnecessary. Note t	Comment Status X mplete, will likely create a main that the ref on pg 68 line 13 is n sial, reserved LLID, see IEEE S	nissing 10G-EF	ON information
Proposed Response	Response Status O		SuggestedRemedy Strike the sub-clause.			
C/ 7 SC 7.2.4 Remein, Duane	P 67 L 44 Huawei Technologies	# i-64	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
is unnecessary. EPOI derived "from earlier 1	Comment Status X omplete, will likely create a maintenance h N "OLT and ONU optical parameters were 000 Mb/s Ethernet PMD specifications".	indeed only partially This does of course totally	Cl 7 SC 7.2.6 Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type TR *** Comment submitted	P 68 Charter Commu <i>Comment Status</i> X d with the file 98318000003-hajo		# <u>i-10</u> 3.docx attached ***
SuggestedRemedy Strike the sub-clause.			The text of subclause 7 EPON alike.	7.2.6 needs to be updated to be	applicable to 1	G-EPON and 10G-
Proposed Response	Response Status O		SuggestedRemedy Use the text in hajducz	enia_d30_3 with tracked chang	es from D3.0	
			Proposed Response	Response Status O		

C/ 7 SC **7.2.6**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.2.6 Remein, Duane	Р 69 Huawei Techr	L 3 nologies	# <u>i-67</u>	CI 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane		70 L 50 vei Technologies	# <u>i-70</u>
Comment Type E "SLA" is only used o	Comment Status X one other time in the draft, there	is no need to at	breviate it.	51	E Comment Status pping" should be "a non-ove		
SuggestedRemedy Strike "(SLA)" here a	and replace "SLA" on line 50 wit	h "service level	agreement"	SuggestedRemedy per comment			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Respons	e Response Status	0	
C/ 7 SC 7.2.6 Remein, Duane	Р 69 Huawei Techr	L 45 nologies	# [i-68	Cl 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane		70 L 55 vei Technologies	# i-71
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type	E Comment Status	X	
I would also be happ egregious as some	py with removing the entire sub- others.	clause but don't	find this section as	SuggestedRemedy per comment			
Change to: "GATE a	and REPORT MPCPDUs are de	fined in Clause (64 of IEEE Std 802.3	Proposed Respons	e Response Status	0	
for 1G-EPON and in	Clause 77 for 10G-EPON".	fined in Clause (64 of IEEE Std 802.3	Proposed Respons	,		# [i-72
Change to: "GATE a for 1G-EPON and in		fined in Clause (64 of IEEE Std 802.3	 	2.6 PT		# [<mark>i-72</mark>
Change to: "GATE a for 1G-EPON and in Proposed Response	Clause 77 for 10G-EPON".	L 63	64 of IEEE Std 802.3 # i-69	Cl 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane Comment Type	2.6 PT Huav E Comment Status using the measured RTT" v	70 <i>L</i> 60 vei Technologies	
Change to: "GATE a for 1G-EPON and in Proposed Response	n Clause 77 for 10G-EPON". Response Status O	L 63		Cl 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane Comment Type "using its LLID,	2.6 PT Huav E Comment Status using the measured RTT" v	70 <i>L</i> 60 vei Technologies	
Change to: "GATE a for 1G-EPON and in Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.2.6 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Another opportunity	n Clause 77 for 10G-EPON". Response Status O P69 Huawei Techr Comment Status X to do maintenance before first r	L 63 nologies release "The MP	# i-69	CI 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane Comment Type "using its LLID, measured RTT	2.6 PT Huav E Comment Status using the measured RTT" v	70 <i>L</i> 60 vei Technologies	
Change to: "GATE a for 1G-EPON and in Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.2.6 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Another opportunity is presented in Figur Std 802.3."	A Clause 77 for 10G-EPON". Response Status O P69 Huawei Techr Comment Status X to do maintenance before first r ire 7-4, while details are described py with removing the entire sub-	L 63 nologies release "The MP ed in Clause 64 o	# i-69 CP registration process of IEEE	Cl 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane Comment Type "using its LLID, measured RTT SuggestedRemedy	2.6 PT Huav E Comment Status using the measured RTT" v	70 <i>L</i> 60 vei Technologies : X vould be better as "usir	
Change to: "GATE a for 1G-EPON and in Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.2.6 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Another opportunity is presented in Figur Std 802.3." I would also be happ	A Clause 77 for 10G-EPON". Response Status O P69 Huawei Techr Comment Status X to do maintenance before first r ire 7-4, while details are described py with removing the entire sub-	L 63 nologies release "The MP ed in Clause 64 o	# i-69 CP registration process of IEEE	Cl 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane Comment Type "using its LLID, measured RTT SuggestedRemedy per comment	2.6 PT Huav E Comment Status using the measured RTT" v	70 <i>L</i> 60 vei Technologies : X vould be better as "usir	
Change to: "GATE a for 1G-EPON and in Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.2.6 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR Another opportunity is presented in Figur Std 802.3." I would also be happ egregious as some of SuggestedRemedy Change to: "The MP described in Clause	P 69 Huawei Techr Comment Status X to do maintenance before first r re 7-4, while details are describe py with removing the entire sub- others.	<i>L</i> 63 nologies release "The MP ed in Clause 64 clause but don't ented in Figure 7	# [i-69 CP registration process of IEEE find this section as	Cl 7 SC 7. Remein, Duane Comment Type "using its LLID, measured RTT SuggestedRemedy per comment	2.6 PT Huav E Comment Status using the measured RTT" v	70 <i>L</i> 60 vei Technologies : X vould be better as "usir	

CI 7 SC **7.2.6**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7 SC 7.2.7	P 71	L 1	# i-73	Cl 7	SC 7.4.2	P 68	L 1	# <u>i-66</u>
Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies		Remein, Duar	е	Huawei Teo	chnologies	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Typ	e ER	Comment Status X		
	oorly balanced between 1G-EP beginning deployments), will lik necessary.			interface" and an inf	virtual inte	several terms for the same erface", and "LLID". While the es not appear we are being and should be corrected.	nere may be differ	ences between a link
Strike the sub-clause	1			SuggestedRe	nedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Replace " Pg 86 line	virtual interf 10, pg 86	with "logical link" in 4 places ace" with "logical interface" line 16, pg 86 line 23, pg 96 "logical link"	(18x) with the follo	
CI 7 SC 7.2.8 Remein, Duane	P 72 Huawei Tech	L 17 nologies	# i-74	Proposed Res	ponse	Response Status O		
Comment Type T Use of "GMII" in the f The rest of this section	Comment Status X figure dates it. on reads well and is very applic	able to this doc	ument.	<i>Cl 7</i> Remein, Duar	SC 7.4.2 le	Р 76 Huawei Teo	L 50 chnologies	# i-75
the figure). "In Figure	/III" and add the following at po 7-6 the use of the term "xMII" f the MII family of interfaces (e	is used to gene	rically refer to any	and Claus	only two ins	Comment Status X stances of "Clause 64/77" w nake future maintenance sir tly.		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			SuggestedRe	nedy			
				Replace b	oth instance	es of "Clause 64/77" with "C	lause 64 and Clau	ise 77"
C/ 7 SC 7.3 Anslow, Peter	P 75 Ciena Corpor	L 57 ation	# i-25	Proposed Res	ponse	Response Status O		
Comment Type E The final bottom bord	Comment Status X der in Table 7-1 should be "Thi	n" i.e., follow the	table definition.					
SuggestedRemedy								
	from the final bottom border in	n Table 7-1						

C/ **7** SC **7.4.2**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/7 SC 7.4.2	P 79	L 8	# i-144	C/ 7 SC	7.4.2	P 80	L 20	# i-11
Cummings, Rodney	National Instr	ruments C		Hajduczenia, Ma	rek	Charter Co	ommunicatio	
Comment Type GR	Comment Status X			Comment Type	т	Comment Status X		
	YangModels/yang/tree/master/s			Unnecessar	/ repetitior	of reference		
correct URL, becaus	se once 802.3.2 publishes, its Y	ANG module will	I no longer be a draft.	SuggestedReme	dy			
	ost recent decision in the IEEE 8 org/yangsters/yangsters-guidelir oe			Change refe "IEEE Std 8	rence for t)2.3, 65.1.	td 802.3, 65.1.3.3 for 1G- ypedef mpcp-llid to read 3.3 for 1G-EPON and 76 e for typedef mpcp-llid-co	2.6.1.3 for 10G-EP	
"https://github.com/	YangModels/yang/tree/master/s	tandard/ieee/802	2.3/published"	Proposed Respo	nse	Response Status 0		
uggestedRemedy								
	E 802 YANGsters to determine king group YANG modules.	the correct GitH	ub location for	CI 7 SC	7.4.2	P81	L 34	# li-12
	king gloup TANO modules.			Hajduczenia, Ma			ommunicatio	<i>π</i> [-12
	hat coordination fails, use			Comment Type	E	Comment Status X		
"https://aithub.com/	YangModels/yang/tree/master/s							
1 0	o , o	aandard/leee/602	2.3/publisned	51	_			
1 0	Response Status O	andard/leee/802	2.3/published	"mpcp" shou	ld be all c			
roposed Response	o , o	andard/leee/602	2.3/published	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme	ld be all c dy	aps		
1 0	o , o	L 15	# [i-76	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp	ld be all c <i>dy</i> cp" to "MF	aps PCP"		
roposed Response	Response Status O	L 15	·	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme	ld be all c <i>dy</i> cp" to "MF	aps		
roposed Response	Response Status O P80 Huawei Tech Comment Status X	L 15 nologies	# [i-76	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp	ld be all c <i>dy</i> cp" to "MF	aps PCP"		
7 SC 7.4.2 mein, Duane mment Type E This sentence will re	Response Status O P 80 Huawei Tech Comment Status X equire maintenance in the future	L 15 nologies e once Nx25G-EF	# i-76	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp Proposed Respo	ld be all c <i>dy</i> cp" to "MF	aps PCP"	L 64	# [i-13
7 SC 7.4.2 mein, Duane mment Type E This sentence will re adds little to the draf	Response Status O P80 Huawei Tech Comment Status X equire maintenance in the future ft and can be removed, forcing t	L 15 nologies e once Nx25G-EF the reader to read	# i-76 PON is approved. It d the source	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp Proposed Respo	Id be all c dy cp" to "MF nse 7.4.2	aps PCP" Response Status O P81	L 64 ommunicatio	# l <u>i-13</u>
7 SC 7.4.2 mein, Duane omment Type E This sentence will re adds little to the draf document, which is	Response Status O P 80 Huawei Tech Comment Status X equire maintenance in the future	L 15 nologies e once Nx25G-EF the reader to rea opy/summarize th	# i-76 PON is approved. It d the source nat standard here.	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp Proposed Respo Cl 7 SC	Id be all c dy cp" to "MF nse 7.4.2	aps PCP" Response Status O P81	-••	# [<u>i-13</u>
7 SC 7.4.2 emein, Duane omment Type E This sentence will re adds little to the draf document, which is "LLIDs between the	Response Status O P80 Huawei Tech Comment Status X equire maintenance in the future ft and can be removed, forcing to probable better than trying to co	L 15 nologies e once Nx25G-EF the reader to reader to py/summarize the are assigned for	# i-76 PON is approved. It d the source nat standard here. ONU discovery and	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp Proposed Respo Cl 7 SC Hajduczenia, Ma Comment Type These are m	Id be all c dy cp" to "MF nse 7.4.2 rek T t "Etherne	PCP" Response Status O P81 Charter Co	ommunicatio	
7 SC 7.4.2 emein, Duane omment Type E This sentence will re adds little to the draf document, which is j "LLIDs between the registration. Other L process."	Response Status O P80 Huawei Tech Comment Status X equire maintenance in the future ft and can be removed, forcing to probable better than trying to co value of 0x07FFE and 0x7FFF	L 15 nologies e once Nx25G-EF the reader to reader to py/summarize the are assigned for	# i-76 PON is approved. It d the source nat standard here. ONU discovery and	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp Proposed Respo Cl 7 SC Hajduczenia, Ma Comment Type These are m	Id be all c dy cp" to "MF nse 7.4.2 rek T t "Etherne of Ethern	aps PCP" <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 81 Charter Co <i>Comment Status</i> X et interfaces" but "EPON in	ommunicatio	
7 SC 7.4.2 emein, Duane omment Type E This sentence will re adds little to the draf document, which is "LLIDs between the registration. Other L	Response Status O P80 Huawei Tech Comment Status X equire maintenance in the future fit and can be removed, forcing t probable better than trying to co value of 0x07FFE and 0x7FFF LIDs are dynamically assigned	L 15 nologies e once Nx25G-EF the reader to reader to py/summarize the are assigned for	# i-76 PON is approved. It d the source nat standard here. ONU discovery and	"mpcp" shou SuggestedReme Change "mp Proposed Respo Cl 7 SC Hajduczenia, Ma Comment Type These are n the extensio SuggestedReme	dy cp" to "MF nse 7.4.2 rek T ot "Etherne of Ethern dy	aps PCP" <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 81 Charter Co <i>Comment Status</i> X et interfaces" but "EPON in	ommunicatio	module defines, bein

CI 7 SC 7.4.2

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7 SC 7.4.2 P84 L34	# i-15	CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P84	L 64	# i-78
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio		Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies	
Comment Type T Comment Status X		Comment Type GR	Comment Status X		
Confusing description of typedef trx-admin-state			00BASE-PX" only four times in ASE-PR and 10/1GBASE-PRX		
SuggestedRemedy			of maintenance it would be be		
Change description to read: When read as 'disabled', the transmitter is currently disabled (r	ot transmittiing)	consistently			
When set to 'disabled', the transmitter is expected to be disabled	0/	SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response Response Status 0			e "1000BASE-PX" with "1G-EF ce "1000BASE-PX PHY" with "		
		Pg 107 line 1 replace	e "10GBASE-PR or 10/1GBAS	E-PRX" with "100	G-EPON"
	# i-14	Pg 107 line 26 & 56 EPON or 10G-EPON	replace "1000BASE-PX, 10GE	BASE-PR or 10/10	GBASE-PRX" with "1G
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio		Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Comment Type E Comment Status X					
Empty reference field					"
SuggestedRemedy		Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Remein, Duane	Р 86 Huawei Tech	L10	# i-79
Strike				inologies	
Proposed Response Response Status O		Comment Type E	Comment Status X ginning "This action applies to		virtual interface "."
		should be indented of Same issue line 23.			intual internace.,
CI 7 SC 7.4.2 P84 L57	# i-77	SuggestedRemedy			
Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies		per comment			
Comment Type T Comment Status X		Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
It seems odd to have a blank Reference					
SuggestedRemedy		CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P86	L 23	# i-80
Change "" to "Not Applicable"		Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies	
Proposed Response Response Status O		Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
		Indenting the line be should be indented of	ginning "This action applies to ne additional space.	an OLT or ONU	virtual interface."
		SuggestedRemedy			
		per comment			
		Proposed Response	Response Status O		

Page 29 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:13 PM

CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P86	L 64	# i-81	Cl 7	SC 7.4.2	P88	L 63	# 100
Cr r Remein,		P 80 Huawei Techr	• •	# 1-81	Weber, Karl	30 7.4.2	P88 Beckhoff Autor		# i-190
Commer leaf	nt Type TR fec-mode {	Comment Status X		ink "2 EEC is not	Comment Typ frames is	not an unit a	Comment Status X according to the International S utils/common/pdf/si brochure	ystem of Units see	
conf	figurable on an llid	by llid basis	or each logical		SuggestedRe	1 0	utils/common/pui/si_brochure_	o_en.pui	
Suggest	edRemedy				Delete ur				
	nge: as a distinct value s object has the sa				Proposed Re	sponse	Response Status 0		
Propose	ed Response	Response Status O			<i>Cl 7</i> Weber, Karl	SC 7.4.2	P89 Beckhoff Autor	L 27 mation	# i-191
CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P 88	L 21	# <u>i-82</u>	Comment Ty	be E	Comment Status X		
Remein,	Duane	Huawei Techr	ologies				according to the International S /utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		
Commei		Comment Status X			SuggestedRe			o_en.pu	
	trx-transmit-admir	ו-state { a distinct value for each logica	al link" implies	the object can be rw for	Delete ur				
both		J. This is not implied in 802.3			Proposed Re		Response Status O		
Suggest	edRemedy								
	as a distinct value	" to: t has a distinct value"			<i>Cl</i> 7 Weber, Karl	SC 7.4.2	P 89 Beckhoff Autor	L 58 mation	# <u>i-192</u>
	ed Response	Response Status 0				not an unit a	Comment Status X according to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		
CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P 88	L 37	# i-83	SuggestedRe	medy			
Remein,	Duane	Huawei Techr	ologies		Delete ur	its - line			
<i>Commei</i> The	51	Comment Status X oorly "Contain all Ethernet inte	rface specific c	apabilities."	Proposed Re	sponse	Response Status O		
00	edRemedy nge to "This conta	iner includes all Ethernet inter	face specific ca	pabilities."					
-		D							

Proposed Response Response Status **0**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 7 SC **7.4.2**

CI 7 SC 7.4.2 P90 L4	# i-84	CI 7	SC	7.4.2	P 90	L 22	# i-193
Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies		Weber, Ka	arl		Beckhoff Aut	omation	
Comment Type TR Comment Status X		Comment	t Type	Е	Comment Status X		
leaf mpcp-discovery-window-count { This statement differs from the definition in the ref. "It has a distinc link."	t value for each logical	https:	//www.b	oipm.org/	ot an unit according to the In- utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		m of Units see
SuggestedRemedy		Suggeste	e units -				
After leaf mpcp-discovery-window-count { add: when "//ompe-mode = 'olt'"; Change:		Proposed			Response Status O		
"This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. It has a distinct link. At the ONU, the value should be zero." to:	value for each logical	CI 7	SC	7.4.2	P 90	L34	# i-85
"This object is applicable for an OLT and has the same value for e	ach logical link."	Remein, I	Duane		Huawei Tech	nologies	
Proposed Response Response Status O		Comment	t Type	TR	Comment Status X		
Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P 90 L 9 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies	# li-86	link." Same	e issue p	og 90 line	from the definition in the ref. 34,	n has a distinct	value for each logical
Comment Type E Comment Status X		Suggeste		,			
Indenting the line beginning "re-initialization of the management sy times" should be indented one less space. Exact same issue line 38, pg 91 line 4, pg 91 line 34, pg 91 line 64 line 54, pg 97 line 45, pg 98 line 7, pg 98 line 35, pg 99 line 2, pg 9 31,, pg 106 line 44, pg 107 line 9, pg 107 line 38, pg 108 line 3, pg line 1. Note there are instances where the quoted text is correctly indente search and replace cannot be used.	, pg 93 line 25,, pg 95 18 line 65, pg 100 line 114 line 35, and pg 115	when Chan "This link. <i>A</i>	"//om ge: object is At the O object is	npe-mode s applicat NU, the v s applicat	ery-timeout-count { add: = = 'olt'"; ble for an OLT and an ONU. alue should be zero." to: ble for an OLT and has the s <i>Response Status</i> O		0
SuggestedRemedy							
per comment		CI 7	SC	7.4.2	P 90	L 51	# i-194
Proposed Response Response Status O		Weber, Ka	arl		Beckhoff Aut	omation	
		Comment	t Type	Е	Comment Status X		
					ccording to the International itils/common/pdf/si_brochure		see
		Suggeste	dReme	dy			
		Delete	e units -	line			
		Proposed					

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P 90	L 64	# i-87	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P 91	L 30	# i-88
Remein, Di	uane	Huawei Techr	nologies		Remein, Dua	ne	Huawei Tech	nologies	
This ca for an (should Suggested After le when " Chang "This o link. At	t-mpcp-register- annot be true, R OLT and an ON be zero." <i>Remedy</i> eaf out-mpcp-reg //ompe-mode e biject is applicat the ONU, the v biject is applicat	eg-Req are only transmitted b U. It has a distinct value for e gister-req { add:	ach logical link. t has a distinct v	At the ONU, the value alue for each logical	The ONU the ONU SuggestedRe After leat when "/ Change: "This obj for each	pcp-register- J never recei , the value sl emedy in-mpcp-reg /ompe-mod ect is applica logical link." ect is applica	ves Reg-Req "This object is a hould be zero for each logical ister-req { add: e = 'olt'"; ble for an OLT and an ONU. /	link." At the ONU, the v	value should be zero
	<i>Type</i> E is not an unit a	P 91 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X ccording to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure	System of Units	# <u>i-195</u>	Weber, Karl Comment Ty frames is	not an unit a ww.bipm.org/	P91 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X according to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure	System of Units s	# [<u>i-196</u>

C/ 7 SC **7.4.2**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P 91	L 60	# i-89	CI 7 SC	C 7.4.2		P 92	L 24	# i-90
Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies		Remein, Duane		Н	luawei Techr	nologies	
comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type	TR	Comment Sta	atus X		
transmitted from the C The same error exist a (see separate comme SuggestedRemedy After leaf statement ad	zero for each logical link give DNU." Really??? Maybe we s at the following locations pg 9 ints). dd	hould make this	a constant = 0 then.	It has a dist The ONU c Same issue pg 93 line 2 pg 93 line 5	ar to me wh inct value f annot recei for the foll 1: leaf in-m 0: leaf out-		nk. At the ON sages.	IU, the value sh	
when "//ompe-mode	e = 'onu'";			SuggestedRem	edy				
Change: "This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. The value should be zero for each logical link." to: "This object is applicable for an ONU and has a distinct value for each logical link." <i>roposed Response</i> Response Status O				After the lea	af statemer	nts add:			
logical link." to: "This object is applical	ble for an ONU and has a dis			when "//c Change at e "This object link. At the	each locatio is applical ONU, the v	e = 'olt'"; on:	ero."" to:		alue for each logical ch logical link."
logical link." to: "This object is applical Proposed Response	ble for an ONU and has a dis	tinct value for ea		when "//c Change at e "This object link. At the	each locatio is applical ONU, the v is applical	e = 'olt'"; on: ble for an OLT and value should be ze	ero."" to: Id has the sa		0
logical link." to: "This object is applical proposed Response 7 SC 7.4.2 /eber, Karl comment Type E frames is not an unit a	ble for an ONU and has a dis Response Status O P92 Beckhoff Aut Comment Status X according to the International	tinct value for ear <i>L</i> 11 omation System of Units s	ch logical link." # [i-197	when "//c Change at e "This object link. At the e "This object Proposed Resp	each locatio is applical ONU, the v is applical	e = 'olt'"; on: ble for an OLT and value should be ze ble for an OLT and <i>Response Sta</i>	ero."" to: Id has the sa	me value for ea	Ū
logical link." to: "This object is applical Proposed Response 27 7 SC 7.4.2 Veber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit a https://www.bipm.org/o	ble for an ONU and has a dis Response Status 0 P 92 Beckhoff Aut Comment Status X	tinct value for ear <i>L</i> 11 omation System of Units s	ch logical link." # [i-197	when "/./c Change at e "This object link. At the e "This object <i>Proposed Resp</i> <i>Cl</i> 7 So Weber, Karl <i>Comment Type</i> frames is no	each locatic is applical ONU, the v is applical onse C 7.4.2 E E ot an unit a	e = 'olt'"; on: ble for an OLT and value should be ze ble for an OLT and <i>Response Sta</i>	ero."" to: ad has the sa atus O P92 Beckhoff Auto atus X hternational S	me value for eacher <i>L</i> 42 omation System of Units	ch logical link." # [<u>i-198</u>
logical link." to: "This object is applical Proposed Response C/ 7 SC 7.4.2 Veber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit a https://www.bipm.org/o SuggestedRemedy	ble for an ONU and has a dis Response Status O P92 Beckhoff Aut Comment Status X according to the International	tinct value for ear <i>L</i> 11 omation System of Units s	ch logical link." # [i-197	when "/./c Change at e "This object link. At the e "This object <i>Proposed Resp</i> <i>Cl</i> 7 So Weber, Karl <i>Comment Type</i> frames is no	each location is application ONU, the v is application onse C 7.4.2 E t an unit a bipm.org/t edy	e = 'olt'"; on: ble for an OLT and value should be ze ble for an OLT and <i>Response Sta</i> <i>Response Sta</i> <i>Comment Sta</i> ccording to the In	ero."" to: ad has the sa atus O P92 Beckhoff Auto atus X hternational S	me value for eacher <i>L</i> 42 omation System of Units	ch logical link." # [<u>i-198</u>

C/ **7** SC **7.4.2**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P 92	L 55	# i-91	CI7 SC	7.4.2	P 93	L 58	# <u>i-16</u>
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techn	ologies		Hajduczenia, Mare	ek	Charter Com	municatio	
transmitted from the	Comment Status X { e zero for each logical link given ONU." Really??? Maybe we sh t at: pg 92, line 55, pg 94 line 16	ould make this	a constant = 0 then.	· · · //· ·	ly	Comment Status X fCounterDiscontinuityTime		
SuggestedRemedy After leaf out-mpcp-r when "//ompe-mod Change: "This object is applic	1 1	he value should	d be zero for each	with		ue of the ifCounterDiscontinu		e ietf-interfaces YANG
logical link." to:	able for an ONUL and been a disti		and the strengt Parts II	module (IETF				
" This object is applic Proposed Response	able for an ONU and has a disti Response Status O	inct value for ea	ach logical link."	Proposed Respon	se	Response Status 0		
	P93 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X according to the International S g/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	System of Units	# [<u>-199</u> see		ipm.org/u ly line	Beckhoff Aut <i>Comment Status</i> X ccording to the International tils/common/pdf/si_brochure <i>Response Status</i> O	System of Units	see
	Response Status O P 93 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X according to the International S g/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	System of Units	# [<u>-200</u>]					
Proposed Response	Response Status O							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 7 SC 7.4.2

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI7 SC	7.4.2	P 94	L16	# i-92	C/ 7 SC 7.4.2	2 P 95	L 12	# i-93
Remein, Duane		Huawei Techn	ologies		Remein, Duane	Huawei Teo	chnologies	
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
transmitted fro	ould be ze	ero for each logical link given IU." Really??? Maybe we sh pg 92, line 55, pg 94 line 16	ould make this		transmitted from t	ter { be zero for each logical link giv he ONU." Really??? Maybe we kist at: pg 92, line 55, pg 94 line	should make this	
SuggestedRemed	dy				SuggestedRemedy			
logical link." to	npe-mode s applicabl o: s applicabl				logical link." to:			
Toposeu Nespon	130				r roposeu nesponse	Nesponse Status		
C/ 7 SC 7 Veber, Karl	7.4.2	P 94 Beckhoff Autor	L 33 mation	# <u>i-202</u>	<i>Cl</i> 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl	2 P 95 Beckhoff Au	L 39 utomation	# i-204
		Comment Status X cording to the International S ils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		see	Comment Type E frames is not an u https://www.bipm.	Comment Status X init according to the Internationa org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochu	I System of Units re_8_en.pdf	see
SuggestedRemed Delete units -					SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line			
Proposed Respon	nse	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
CI7 SC	7.4.2	P 94	L 64	# i-203	CI 7 SC 7.4.2	2 <i>P</i> 95	L 45	# [i-94
Veber, Karl		Beckhoff Auto	mation		Remein, Duane	Huawei Teo	chnologies	
comment Type	Е	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
	an unit ac pipm.org/ut	cording to the International S ils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	ystem of Units : _8_en.pdf	see	For each leaf in th but only MPCP fra	is container it should be made o ames.	clear that this is no	ot a count for all frames
frames is not a https://www.bi					SuggestedRemedy			
https://www.bi	dy				Change "A count	of frames" to "A count of MPCP	frames" in the dea	scription of each leaf in
https://www.bi							indified in the det	
https://www.bi SuggestedRemed	line	Response Status 0			this container.	e): 95/45, 96/6, 96/31, 96/64, 97		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/generalC/7Page 35 of 45COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawnSC 7.4.210/18/2018 10:18:13 PMSORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, lineSC 7.4.2SC 7.4.210/18/2018 10:18:13 PM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI7 SC 7.4.2	P 96	L 1	# i-205	C/7 SC 7.4.2	P 96	L 45	# i-95
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	mation		Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
	ccording to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		see		with-good-llid-good-crc8 { counts frames with valid SLI	D _in an ONU_ ap	oplicable to the OLT?
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete units - line					ames-with-good-Ilid-good-cro	:8 { add:	
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			when "//ompe-mode Change: "This object is applicat each virtual interface."	ble for an OLT and an ONU.	At the OLT, it has	s distinct values for
C/7 SC 7.4.2	P 96	L 27	# i-206	"This object is applicat	ole for an ONU and has a dis	tinct value for ea	ch logical link."
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	mation		Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X						
	ccording to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		see	CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P96	L 46	# i-96
SuggestedRemedy				Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies	
Delete units - line				Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			"has distinct values for Same issue pg 97 line	each virtual interface" really 12	? Multiple values	for each LLID?
				SuggestedRemedy			
CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P 96	L 35	# i-17	Change:			
łajduczenia, Marek	Charter Comm	unicatio		"has distinct values" to "has a distinct value"	:		
	Comment Status X			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Comment Type E							

and "65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3", where reference to 802.3 is absent

Proposed Response Response Status **0**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

	P 96	L 58	# i-97	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P 97	L 41	# <u>i-98</u>
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies		Remein, Du	ane	Huawei Tec	hnologies	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment T	vpe TR	Comment Status X		
We should be clear the applicable to the ONI SuggestedRemedy	-with-good-llid-good-crc8 { hat a counter that counts frame J. ames-with-good-llid-good-crc8		D _in an OLT_ is not	has mul 1) The c 2) It has 3) Corre	tiple errors : lescription im an incorrect cted ref clear	with-bad-Ilid { plies that each device has a d ref 'ly states this is only applicab a valid SLD field in an OLT"		
when "//ompe-mod	de = 'olt'";			SuggestedF				
At pg 97 line 12 Char	nge: stinct values for each virtual int	erface " to		1) Chan				
	able for an OLT and has a disti		ch logical link."	,	0	able for an OLT and an ONU.	It has a distinct v	alue for each logica
Proposed Response	Response Status O			2) Chan	ge Ref from 3	able for an OLT and has the s 30.3.7.1.5 to 30.3.7.1.8 frames-with-bad-Ilid { " add:		-
C/ 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl	P96 Beckhoff Auto	L 61 omation	# i-207	Proposed R	esponse	Response Status O		
	Comment Status X according to the International S /utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		see	<i>Cl 7</i> Weber, Karl	SC 7.4.2	P 97 Beckhoff Au	L 57	# <u>i-209</u>
SuggestedRemedy	/ullis/common/pul/si_brochure	_0_en.par		,	_		lomation	
				Comment T	vpe E	Comment Status X		
Delete units - line						according to the International		see
Proposed Response	Response Status O			https://v	ww.bipm.org	according to the International /utils/common/pdf/si_brochur		see
	Response Status O			https://v SuggestedF	ww.bipm.org e <i>medy</i>			see
Proposed Response	Response Status O P 97 Beckhoff Auto	L 29 omation	# i-208	https://v SuggestedF	ww.bipm.org <i>emedy</i> nits - line			see
Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl	P 97		# i-208	https://v <i>SuggestedF</i> Delete u	ww.bipm.org emedy nits - line esponse	/utils/common/pdf/si_brochur		
Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit	P 97 Beckhoff Auto	omation System of Units		https://v <i>SuggestedF</i> Delete u	ww.bipm.org <i>emedy</i> nits - line	/utils/common/pdf/si_brochur	e_8_en.pdf 	see # [i-210
Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit https://www.bipm.org	P 97 Beckhoff Auto <i>Comment Status</i> X according to the International S	omation System of Units		https://v SuggestedF Delete u Proposed R Cl 7	ww.bipm.org emedy nits - line esponse SC 7.4.2	/utils/common/pdf/si_brochur Response Status 0 P98	e_8_en.pdf 	
Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit https://www.bipm.org SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line	P97 Beckhoff Auto Comment Status X according to the International S /utils/common/pdf/si_brochure	omation System of Units		https://v SuggestedF Delete u Proposed R Cl 7 Weber, Karl Comment T frames	ww.bipm.org lemedy inits - line esponse SC 7.4.2 vpe E s not an unit	/utils/common/pdf/si_brochur Response Status O P98 Beckhoff Au	e_8_en.pdf <i>L</i> 20 tomation System of Units	# [<u>i-210</u>
Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl Comment Type E frames is not an unit https://www.bipm.org SuggestedRemedy	P 97 Beckhoff Auto <i>Comment Status</i> X according to the International S	omation System of Units		https://v SuggestedF Delete u Proposed R C/ 7 Weber, Karl Comment T frames https://v SuggestedF	ww.bipm.org emedy nits - line esponse SC 7.4.2 vpe E s not an unit ww.bipm.org	/utils/common/pdf/si_brochur Response Status O P98 Beckhoff Au Comment Status X according to the International	e_8_en.pdf <i>L</i> 20 tomation System of Units	# [<u>i-210</u>

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/generalC/7Page 37 of 45COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawnSC 7.4.210/18/2018 10:18:14 PMSORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, lineSC 7.4.2SC 7.4.210/18/2018 10:18:14 PM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/7 SC 7.4.2	P 98	L 49	# i-211	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P 99	L 47	# i-213
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Au	Itomation		Weber, Kar	1	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	уре Е	Comment Status X		
	nit according to the Internationa org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochu		see			according to the International S /utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		ee
SuggestedRemedy				Suggestedl	Remedy			
Delete units - line				Delete	units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed F	Response	Response Status O		
CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P 99	L16	# i-212	Cl 7	SC 7.4.2	P100	L14	# i-214
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Au	Itomation		Weber, Kar	1	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	уре Е	Comment Status X		
	nit according to the Internationa org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochu		see			according to the International S /utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		ee
SuggestedRemedy				Suggestedl	Remedy			
Delete units - line				Delete	units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed F	Response	Response Status O		
CI7 SC 7.4.2	P 99	L 33	# [i-99	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P100	L 58	# <u>i-215</u>
Remein, Duane	Huawei Tec	hnologies		Weber, Kar	1	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	уре Е	Comment Status X		
	"re-initialization of the manage	ment system, and	at other times" and the			according to the International S utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		ee
	indented one less space. "defined in the ietf-interfaces Y I two less spaces.	ANG module (IET	F RFC 8343).";"	<i>Suggestedl</i> Delete	R <i>emedy</i> units - line			
SuggestedRemedy				Proposed F	Response	Response Status O		
per comment								

CI 7 SC 7.4.2

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P 105	L 2	# i-100	CI 7	SC 7.4.2		P 106	L 56	# <u>i-217</u>
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techne	ologies		Weber, Kar	l		Beckhoff Aut	omation	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment 7	ype E	Comment S	status X		
continuous manner, for observation bin."	contradicting: "At the OLT, the r each incoming data burst, ar measurement or a burst meas e 32,	nd stored in a roll	ling 15-minutes' long	https:// Suggested	www.bipm.org	unit according to /utils/common/pd			Units see
SuggestedRemedy				Proposed F	esponse	Response St	tatus O		
Strike ", for each incom	ning data burst,"								
Proposed Response	Response Status O			CI 7	SC 7.4.2		P106	L61	# i-102
				Remein, Du	ane		Huawei Tech	nologies	
7 SC 7.4.2	P 106	L 24	# i-216	Comment T	ype TR	Comment S	status X		
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Autor	mation				oding-violations {			
Comment Type E	Comment Status X					t this counter is o	only valid whe	en FEC is enabl	led.
	nit according to the Internatior		nits see	Suggested	-	te need.			
		0		(`honge					
SuggestedRemedy	tills/common/pdf/si_brochure_	8_en.pdf		groups	00BASE-PX F	HY, this object re tly from the link v			umber of invalid code- n FEC is disabled this
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line	itils/common/pdf/si_brochure_ Response Status O	8_en.pdf		"For 10 groups	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin	HY, this object re tly from the link v	when FEC is		
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line Proposed Response		8_en.pdf 	# [i-101	"For 10 groups counter	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin	HY, this object re tly from the link v g."	when FEC is		
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2	Response Status O	L 29	# i <u>-101</u>	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F	00BASE-PX F received direc stops countin desponse SC 7.4.2	HY, this object re tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i>	when FEC is tatus O	enabled. When	n FEC is disabled this
uggestedRemedy Delete units - line roposed Response I 7 SC 7.4.2 emein, Duane	Response Status 0 P106	L 29	# [<u>i-101</u>	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F CI 7 Weber, Kar Comment 1	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin Response SC 7.4.2	HY, this object ro tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i> <i>Comment S</i>	when FEC is tatus O P107 Beckhoff Aut Status X	enabled. When	# [i-218
uggestedRemedy Delete units - line roposed Response I 7 SC 7.4.2 emein, Duane omment Type TR leaf fec-code-group-viol This description does n	Response Status O P106 Huawei Techno Comment Status X plations {	<i>L</i> 29 ologies e Ref (30.5.1.1.1	14	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F CI 7 Weber, Kar Comment 1 code-gi	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin <i>Response</i> SC 7.4.2 Sype E roup is not an	HY, this object re tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i>	when FEC is tatus O P107 Beckhoff Aut Status X the Internatio	enabled. When <i>L</i> 21 omation onal System of I	# [i-218
uggestedRemedy Delete units - line roposed Response I 7 SC 7.4.2 emein, Duane omment Type TR leaf fec-code-group-viol This description does n aPCSCodingViolation)	Response Status O P106 Huawei Techno Comment Status X plations { not match the description in the which refers to Table 35-1 dea	L 29 ologies e Ref (30.5.1.1.1 aling with GMII c	14 code groups (8b10b l	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F CI 7 Weber, Kar Comment 1 code-gi	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin <i>Response</i> SC 7.4.2 Sype E oup is not an www.bipm.org.	HY, this object re tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i> <i>Comment S</i> unit according to	when FEC is tatus O P107 Beckhoff Aut Status X the Internatio	enabled. When <i>L</i> 21 omation onal System of I	# [i-218
uggestedRemedy Delete units - line roposed Response 7 7 SC 7.4.2 emein, Duane comment Type TR leaf fec-code-group-viol This description does n aPCSCodingViolation) believe) not FEC codev looks wrong given the c	Response Status O P106 Huawei Techno Comment Status X olations { not match the description in the which refers to Table 35-1 de words. I'm not quite sure whico object name and ref) or the Ref	<i>L</i> 29 ologies e Ref (30.5.1.1.1 aling with GMII c th is in error, the ef. In either case	14 code groups (8b10b I description (which	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F Cl 7 Weber, Kar Comment 1 code-gu https://v	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin <i>Response</i> SC 7.4.2 Sype E oup is not an www.bipm.org.	HY, this object re tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i> <i>Comment S</i> unit according to	when FEC is tatus O P107 Beckhoff Aut Status X the Internatio	enabled. When <i>L</i> 21 omation onal System of I	# [i-218
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR leaf fec-code-group-viol This description does n aPCSCodingViolation) believe) not FEC codev looks wrong given the c	Response Status O P106 Huawei Techno Comment Status X olations { not match the description in the which refers to Table 35-1 dea words. I'm not quite sure which	<i>L</i> 29 ologies e Ref (30.5.1.1.1 aling with GMII c th is in error, the ef. In either case	14 code groups (8b10b I description (which	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F Cl 7 Weber, Kar Comment 1 code-gu https://v	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin Response SC 7.4.2 Sype E roup is not an www.bipm.org, Remedy units - line	HY, this object re tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i> <i>Comment S</i> unit according to	when FEC is tatus O P107 Beckhoff Aut Status X the Internatio If/si_brochure	enabled. When <i>L</i> 21 omation onal System of I	# [i-218
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line Proposed Response 27 7 SC 7.4.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR leaf fec-code-group-viol This description does n aPCSCodingViolation) believe) not FEC codev looks wrong given the o The suggested solution SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P106 Huawei Techno Comment Status X blations { not match the description in the which refers to Table 35-1 dec words. I'm not quite sure which object name and ref) or the Ref n assumed the description is in	<i>L</i> 29 ologies e Ref (30.5.1.1.1 aling with GMII c th is in error, the ef. In either case	14 code groups (8b10b I description (which	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F Cl 7 Weber, Kar Comment 1 code-g https:// Suggested/ Delete	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin Response SC 7.4.2 Sype E roup is not an www.bipm.org, Remedy units - line	HY, this object re tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i> <i>Comment S</i> unit according to utils/common/pd	when FEC is tatus O P107 Beckhoff Aut Status X the Internatio If/si_brochure	enabled. When <i>L</i> 21 omation onal System of I	# [i-218
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR leaf fec-code-group-viol This description does n aPCSCodingViolation) believe) not FEC codev looks wrong given the c The suggested solution SuggestedRemedy Replace the first two pa "For 1G-EPON this is a reception error" or "Car	Response Status O P106 Huawei Techno Comment Status X olations { not match the description in the which refers to Table 35-1 dea words. I'm not quite sure whice object name and ref) or the Ref n assumed the description is in ara of this description with: a count of the number of event rrier Extend Error" on the GMI r is undefined when FEC is op	<i>L</i> 29 ologies e Ref (30.5.1.1.1 aling with GMII o th is in error, the of. In either case n error. ts that cause the I (see Table 35-1	14 code groups (8b10b I description (which e this needs fixing. e PHY to indicate "Data	"For 10 groups counter Proposed F Cl 7 Weber, Kar Comment 1 code-g https:// Suggested/ Delete	00BASE-PX F received direct stops countin Response SC 7.4.2 Sype E roup is not an www.bipm.org, Remedy units - line	HY, this object re tly from the link v g." <i>Response St</i> <i>Comment S</i> unit according to utils/common/pd	when FEC is tatus O P107 Beckhoff Aut Status X the Internatio If/si_brochure	enabled. When <i>L</i> 21 omation onal System of I	# [i-218

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Received Comments

C/ 7 SC **7.4.2**

C/7 SC 7.4.2	P 107	L 50	# i-219	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P110	L 35	# <u>i-105</u>
Veber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	omation		Remein, I	Duane	Huawei Tech	nologies	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	t Type E	Comment Status X		
	unit according to the Internation g/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		Inits see			inning "ONU. It can have a val nted one less space.	ue between 0 ar	nd 7, limited by the
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line				00	edRemedy comment			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed	d Response	Response Status O		
CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P109	L 6	# i-103	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P113	L 40	# i-220
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies		Weber, K	Carl	Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	t Type E	Comment Status X		
Change "in to" to "to	"					ording to the International Syst /utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggeste	edRemedy			
per comment				Delet	te units - line			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed	d Response	Response Status 0		
CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P110	L3	# i-104	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P114	L 21	# li-106
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techr	nologies		Remein, I		Huawei Tech		<i>"</i> [1100
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment		Comment Status X	<u> </u>	
the ONU, it has a dis missing "At the OLT	dundant "It has a distinct value f stinct value for every queue." be " line 40, pg 111 line 14, pg 111 li	ecause the prev	ious sentence is	leaf ir The v objec	n-mpcp-queue-fr wording of this de			

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

"It has a distinct value for each logical link and every queue." to: "At the OLT it has a distinct value for each logical link and every queue."

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

The wording in 802.3.1 is: "A count of the number of times a frame reception occurs from

the corresponding 'Queue'."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to read "A count of the number of times a frame reception event results in a frame being queued in (for ONUs) or received from (for OLTs) the corresponding queue."

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/ 7

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC 7.4.2

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 7.4.2
 SC 7.4.2

Page 40 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:14 PM

7 SC 7.4.2	P115	L 19	# i-107	CI 7	SC	7.4.2	P116	L 50	# i-108
emein, Duane	Huawei Techn	ologies		Remein, I	Duane		Huawei Techn	ologies	
comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	t Type	т	Comment Status X		
	nning ""This object reflects the ne should be indented one add		e drop events from" all			hould refe n in 77 (7	rence 802.3.1 not 802.3. At t 7.3.3.2).	ne very least it s	should also point to th
uggestedRemedy per comment		iniorial space.			ige: .3.2" to	-			
roposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed		ncTime" nse	Response Status O		
7 SC 7.4.2 /eber, Karl	P116 Beckhoff Auto	L 32 mation	# i-221	CI 7		7.4.2	P116	L 65	# i-109
comment Type E	Comment Status X			Remein, I	Duane		Huawei Techn	ologies	
	nit according to the Internationation utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		ts see	Comment There		E able in Ef	Comment Status X PON "is cable of supporting"`		
uggestedRemedy Delete units - line				<i>Suggeste</i> Chan		<i>dy</i> e to capat	ble		
roposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed	l Respor	nse	Response Status O		
7 SC 7.4.2 huang, Yan	P 116 Huawei Techn	L 42 ologies	# i-30	C/ 7 Weber, K		7.4.2	P 118 Beckhoff Auto	L18 mation	# i-223
	Comment Status X ements in the descriptions of m mandatry requirements here.	pcp-related obje	ects. I do not suppose	https:	16ns) is ://www.b	pipm.org/u	Comment Status X it according to the Internationa itils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		its see
uggestedRemedy				Suggeste	edRemed te units -				
,	thout using the word "shall"								
•				Proposed	ı ĸespor	nse	Response Status 0		

C/ **7** SC **7.4.2**

Proposed Response

Response Status 0

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/7 SC 7.4.2	P 118	L 44	# i-222	C/ 7 SC 7.4.2	P 119	L 38	# i-111
/eber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	mation		Remein, Duane	Huawei Tech	nnologies	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
	unit according to the Internation rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_		its see		time { T is always zero why is it cons s "A read-only value that indic		
uggestedRemedy Delete units - line				ONU can store"	s A lead-only value that mult		an number of grants a
Proposed Response				SuggestedRemedy			
roposed Response	Response Status O			After leaf mpcp-roun when "//ompe-mo Change:			
C/ 7 SC 7.4.2 Veber, Karl	P 119 Beckhoff Auto	L 5 mation	# i-224	"This object is applic link. At the OLT, the	able for an OLT and an ONU. value should be zero.";" to: able for an ONU and has a dis		Ŭ
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Proposed Response	Response Status O		aon logical linti ,
https://www.bipm.or	unit according to the Internation rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	al System of Un _8_en.pdf	its see				
https://www.bipm.or	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	al System of Un _8_en.pdf	its see	CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P120	L1	# i-112
https://www.bipm.or	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure	al System of Un _8_en.pdf	its see	Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Remein, Duane	P 120 Huawei Tech		# [i-112
https://www.bipm.or SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	al System of Un _8_en.pdf	its see				# [<u>i-112</u>
https://www.bipm.or uggestedRemedy Delete units - line	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	al System of Un _8_en.pdf		Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line be	Huawei Tech	nnologies	
https://www.bipm.or uggestedRemedy Delete units - line roposed Response	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	al System of Un _8_en.pdf 	# <u>i-110</u>	Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line be	Huawei Tech Comment Status X ginning "This object is applicat ented one less space.	nnologies	
https://www.bipm.or uggestedRemedy Delete units - line roposed Response	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_	_8_en.pdf L 20		Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line be same" should be ind	Huawei Tech Comment Status X ginning "This object is applicat ented one less space.	nnologies	
https://www.bipm.or SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line Proposed Response C/ 7 SC 7.4.2 Semein, Duane	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_ Response Status 0 P119	_8_en.pdf L 20		Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line be same" should be ind Exact same issue ex	Huawei Tech Comment Status X ginning "This object is applicat ented one less space.	nnologies	
https://www.bipm.or suggestedRemedy Delete units - line proposed Response 7 7 SC 7.4.2 semein, Duane comment Type TR leaf mpcp-round-trip	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_ Response Status 0 P119 Huawei Techr Comment Status X	_8_en.pdf L 20		Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line be same" should be ind Exact same issue ex SuggestedRemedy	Huawei Tech Comment Status X ginning "This object is applicat ented one less space.	nnologies	
https://www.bipm.or SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line Proposed Response Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 Remein, Duane Comment Type TR leaf mpcp-round-trip	rg/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_ <i>Response Status</i> 0 <i>P</i> 119 Huawei Techr <i>Comment Status</i> X p-time {	_8_en.pdf L 20		Remein, Duane Comment Type E Indenting the line be same" should be ind Exact same issue ex SuggestedRemedy per comment	Huawei Tech Comment Status X ginning "This object is applicat ented one less space. ists on line 49	nnologies	

Cl 7 SC **7.4.2**

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P120	L 20	# i-113	CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P142	L 20	# i-225
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techn	ologies		Weber, Karl		Beckhoff Auto	omation	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Typ	be E	Comment Status X		
		reflects the ma	ximum number of		/w.bipm.org/	cording to the International Sy utils/common/pdf/si_brochure		e
SuggestedRemedy	L'			Delete un	its - line			
,	num-queue-count-per-report {	add:		Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status O		
"This object is applica link.";" to:	ble for an OLT and an ONU. It		-	Cl 7 Weber, Karl	SC 7.4.2	P145 Beckhoff Auto	L 28 omation	# i-230
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Comment Typ uint64 is t		Comment Status X		
C/ 7 SC 7.4.2 Weber, Karl	P142 Beckhoff Auto	L 18	# i-227	SuggestedRe restrict to	unt16			
Comment Type T uint64 is too large	Comment Status X			Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy restrict to unt16				CI 7 Weber, Karl	SC 7.4.2	P145 Beckhoff Auto	L 28 omation	# i-229
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Comment Typ Is not mtu		Comment Status X		
CI 7 SC 7.4.2	P142	L 18	# i-226	SuggestedRe change to				
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auto	mation		Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status O		
Comment Type T Is not mtu but pdu	Comment Status X							
SuggestedRemedy change to oammtu								
Proposed Response	Response Status O							

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

C/ 7 SC 7.4.	2 P145	L 29	# i-228	C/8 SC 8.4	P 126	L 46	# i-26
Weber, Karl	Beckhoff Auton	nation		Anslow, Peter	Ciena Corpo	ration	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	t according to the International Sys		96	The final bottom bord	ler in Table 8-1 should be "Thi	n" i.e., follow the	table definition.
	org/utils/common/pdf/si_brochure_8	s_en.par		SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy Delete units - line				Remove the override	from the final bottom border i	n Table 8-1	
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
r roposeu Response							
	D. (20	1.0	"	CI 8 SC 8.5.2	P 130	L 9	# i-145
C/ 8 SC 8.2.4 Grow. Robert	P 122 RMG Consultin	L 3	# i-136	Cummings, Rodney	National Inst	ruments C	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X	9		Comment Type GR	Comment Status X		
••	d acronym for OAMPDU are not clo	selv enouah li	nked.		angModels/yang/tree/master/s e once 802.3.2 publishes, its \		
SuggestedRemedy		leely energies					-
	after "Ethernet OAM protocol data	unit".			t recent decision in the IEEE g/yangsters/yangsters-guideli		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			SuggestedRemedy		<i>y</i> 0	, ,
					802 YANGsters to determine	the correct GitH	ub location for
C/ 8 SC 8.3	P 122	L 46	# i-137	published IEEE work	ing group YANG modules.		
Grow, Robert	RMG Consultin	-	# 1107		at coordination fails, use		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X	-			angModels/yang/tree/master/s	standard/ieee/802	2.3/published"
	are not capitalized in this case.			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy							
NETCONF/REST	CONF						
Proposed Response	Response Status O						
C/ 8 SC 8.3.	P 122	L 46	# i-114				
Remein, Duane	Huawei Techno	ologies					
Comment Type E	Comment Status X						
Capitalization "Ne	tconf/Restconf" should be in all cap	S					
SuggestedRemedy							
per comment							
Proposed Response	Response Status O						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 Page 44 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:14 PM

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 8	SC 8.5.2	P 135	L 56	# i-138
Grow, Ro	bert	RMG Consul	ting	
Comment	t Type TR	Comment Status X		
speci [:] value	fication. The len	this, it seems like something gth is specified as a hex strin e other two hex digits? Follow anything beyond definition tex	g of 8 but the de ving the referenc	finition is a 24-bit
Suggeste	dRemedy			
		e reconciled, either to add mi OUI to get to 8 hex digits, or		
	use of a supersed EE Std 802-2014	ded reference should be fixed	. The correspon	ding topic is in Clause 8
IEEE	Std 802-20xx (e	ither 2001 or 2014) should be	added to the ref	erences.
Proposed	l Response	Response Status O		
C/ 8	SC 8.5.2	P143	L 23	# i-115
Remein, [Huawei Tech		# [-115
Comment	t Type E	Comment Status X		
Inden		inning ""Enable or disable mo scription for no apparent reas		r to be indented less
Inden than t Suggeste	the rest of the de		son.	r to be indented less
Inden than t <i>Suggeste</i> Adjus	the rest of the de	scription for no apparent reas	son.	r to be indented less
Inden than t <i>Suggeste</i> Adjus	the rest of the de dRemedy at the indenting to	scription for no apparent reas	son.	r to be indented less # i-29
Inden than t Suggeste Adjus Proposed	the rest of the de dRemedy st the indenting to I Response SC 8.5.2	scription for no apparent reas o match the rest of the descrip <i>Response Status</i> O	btion	
Inden than t Suggeste Adjus Proposed Cl 8 Zhuang, N Comment Word	the rest of the de dRemedy st the indenting to I Response SC 8.5.2 Yan	scription for no apparent reas o match the rest of the descrip <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 150 Huawei Tech <i>Comment Status</i> X	btion	
Inden than t Suggeste Adjus Proposed Cl 8 Zhuang, N Comment Word from	the rest of the de dRemedy st the indenting to I Response SC 8.5.2 Yan t Type T "will" shall not b	scription for no apparent reas o match the rest of the descrip <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 150 Huawei Tech <i>Comment Status</i> X	btion	
Inden than t Suggeste Adjus Proposed Cl 8 Zhuang, N Comment Word from Suggeste	the rest of the de dRemedy st the indenting to I Response SC 8.5.2 Yan t Type T I "will" shall not b o Glen Kramer dRemedy	scription for no apparent reas o match the rest of the descrip <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 150 Huawei Tech <i>Comment Status</i> X	btion L 17 nologies	
Inden than t Suggeste Adjus Proposed Cl 8 Zhuang, N Comment Word from Suggeste Repla	the rest of the de <i>dRemedy</i> st the indenting to <i>I Response</i> SC 8.5.2 Yan t <i>Type</i> T I "will" shall not b in Glen Kramer <i>dRemedy</i> ace ""This leaf wi	scription for no apparent reas o match the rest of the descrip <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 150 Huawei Tech <i>Comment Status</i> X e used.	btion L 17 nologies	

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 Page 45 of 45 10/18/2018 10:18:14 PM