

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 146 SC 146.7.1.4 P L # 304
DiMinico, Christopher MC Communication

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

146.7.1.4 Maximum link delay is TBD.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide value with TBD and extend frequency range to .1 MHz. The propagation delay of a 10BASE-T1L link segment shall not exceed 5700 (TBD) ns at all frequencies between .1 MHz and 20 MHz

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Table 200A-1-Point-to-point link segment DCR characteristics lists Length at IL limit (m) for 14 AWG to 24 AWG. 14 AWG length at IL limit is 1589 m.

Using Equation 80-1: media delay = $10^9 / nc$ ns/m
Where: n=NVP, c=speed of light
With NVP= 0.6,
media delay = 5.56 ns/m
media delay of 1589 m = 8834 ns

Replace TBD with 8834 ns extend lower frequency to 0.1 MHz.

146.7.1.4 Maximum link delay
The propagation delay of a 10BASE-T1L link segment shall not exceed 8834 ns at all frequencies between .1 MHz and 20 MHz.

Resolve with comment#259 which may impact length at IL limit.

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 123
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R EZ

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment field is empty.

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 156
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R EZ

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment field is empty.

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 143
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R EZ

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment field is empty.

CI 00 SC 0 P 1 L 35 # 311
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

"amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-201x as amended by IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x" - I didn't expect to see 'as amended by' here. I understand the base standard will be -2018, but I don't think we yet know the other amendments preceding this. This comment also impacts the header and front matter on page 11.

SuggestedRemedy

Chief editor to consult with 802.3 leadership on order of amendments and other possible published amendments (including YANG, 802.3.2, which would need to be mentioned on page 11), and update header, page 1 and page 11 frontmatter accordingly

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Chief Editor to consult with 802.3 leadership on order of amendments and other possible published amendments (including YANG, 802.3.2, which would need to be mentioned on page 11), and update header, page 1 and page 11 frontmatter accordingly.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 00 SC 0 P 1 L 36 # 314

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

"[review/balloting stage]" - should be "Task Force Review".

SuggestedRemedy

replace text as shown in comment.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "[review/balloting stage]" with "Task Force Review".

Cl 00 SC Front Matter P 1 L 39 # 1

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Document copyright date will need to be updated for next draft

SuggestedRemedy

Global - Change document copyright date from "2017" to "2018"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Change document copyright date from "2017" to "2018" (fix variables in clauses).

Cl 00 SC 0 P 3 L 1 # 312

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

"Std 802.3-201x 201xspecifies" - extra 201x inserted. (probably a frame variable insert)

SuggestedRemedy

Change '201xspecifies' to 'specifies'

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "201xspecifies" with "specifies".

Cl 00 SC Front Matter P 3 L 1 # 2

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

There are a couple of "unresolved text inserts" in the clause headers throughout the document.

SuggestedRemedy

Editor to resolve all header text inserts

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Search all clause headers for "unresolved text inserts" and resolve with appropriate inserts.

Cl 00 SC 0 P 8 L 4 # 313

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

"802.3xx" - needs to be "802.3cg". Also missing task force names and officers on lines 13 & 14. This happens in a number of places throughout the draft (setting variables in the various subsections I suspect)

SuggestedRemedy

Global search and replace 802.3xx for 802.3cg (fix variables in clauses), including Task Force name and task force officer materials.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Global search and replace "802.3xx" with "802.3cg" (fix variables in clauses). Insert Task Force names and task force officers on lines 13 and 14 and other all locations in document as needed.

Cl 01 SC 1.4 P 24 L 12 # 34

Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

10BASE-T:

SuggestedRemedy

10BASE-T

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "10BASE-T:" with "10BASE-T".

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 01 SC 1.4 P 24 L 18 # 35
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
 10BASE-T1S Definition

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: IEEE802.3 Physical Layer specification for a 10 Mb/s Ethernet full duplex or half-duplex point-to-point or half-duplex multidrop local area network over a single balanced twisted pair.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Duplexing and other options aren't typically called out in definitions (readers that want options can go to the referenced clause). Recommend to align definitions with 10BASE-T with reach differentiators as follows:

Change definition for 10BASE-T1L to, "IEEE 802.3 Physical Layer specification for a 10 Mb/s Ethernet local area network over single balanced twisted-pair cabling up to at least 1 000 m reach. (See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 146.)"

Change definition for 10BASE-T1S to, "IEEE 802.3 Physical Layer specification for a 10 Mb/s Ethernet local area network over short reach single balanced twisted-pair cabling. (See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 147.)"

CI 01 SC 1.4 P 24 L 19 # 26
 Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type TR Comment Status A Editorial
 "balanced twisted pair" has been changed in PAR, CSD, Objectives, also "full-duplex" is only optional

SuggestedRemedy

"Single balanced pair" and change "full duplex" to "half duplex, optional full duplex"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment 35.

CI 01 SC 1.4 P 24 L 19 # 315
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A PLCA
 Missing definition for PLCA. Suggested text borrowed from intro to clause 148.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert 1.4.371a after 1.4.371 (in 802.3cj d3p0) physical header subframe (PHS):
 "1.4.371a Physical Layer Collision Avoidance (PLCA): A method for creating transmit opportunities at proper times in order to avoid physical collisions on the medium and improve performance of half-duplex 10BASE-T1S multidrop networks on mixing segments (see Clause 148)."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert 1.4.371a after 1.4.371 (in 802.3cj d3p0) physical header subframe (PHS):
 "1.4.371a Physical Layer Collision Avoidance (PLCA): A method for creating transmit opportunities at proper times in order to avoid physical collisions on the medium and improve performance of half-duplex 10BASE-T1S multidrop networks on mixing segments (See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 148)."

CI 01 SC 1.5 P 24 L 25 # 316
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A PLCA
 Add PLCA to abbreviations - delete placeholder

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "ABBR expanded version" with "PLCA Physical Layer Collision Avoidance"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "ABBR expanded version" with "PLCA Physical Layer Collision Avoidance".

CI 01 SC 1.5 P 24 L 26 # 36
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 ABBR expanded version

SuggestedRemedy

Seems that this can be removed, later on other abbreviations can be added.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Delete "ABBR expanded version". (See comment #316)

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 22 **SC 22.2.2.4** **P 25** **L 10** # **317**
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A** *Editorial*

"Change 22.2.2.4 and Table 22-1 as follows" - don't repeat unchanged text in the editing instruction - it opens it for comment and unnecessary changes

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Change 2nd paragraph of 22.2.4 as shown" - delete lines 11-15 (first paragraph). Add new editing instruction after 2nd paragraph add new editing instruction - "Insert after 2nd paragraph of 22.2.4" (remove underline from lines 22-26). At line 27, add new editing instruction "Insert two new rows between 0, 1, 0001 Assert LPI and Reserved row, and change reserved row of Table 22-1 as shown:"

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change editing instruction on line 10 to "Change the second paragraph in 22.2.4 as follows:" and delete lines 11-15 (first paragraph);

Add new editing instruction after second paragraph on line 20, "Insert new text after the second paragraph in 22.2.4 as follows:" and remove underline from lines 22-26 and delete lines 27-10 (last two sentences); and

Add new editing instruction on line 27, "Insert new rows for 0, 1, 0010 and 0, 1, 0011 after 0, 1, 0001 and replace the Reserved row as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" and delete unchanged rows and format table to show "." in place of unchanged row immediately before new row and immediately after replaced row and remove change marks for new and replaced rows.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #317 and #37)

Cl 22 **SC 22.2.2.4** **P 25** **L 14** # **37**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A** *Editorial*

. TXD<0 >is .

SuggestedRemedy

. TXD<0> is .

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #317.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #317 and #37)

Cl 22 **SC 22.2.2.4** **P 25** **L 18** # **38**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A** *EZ*

<XREF>Table 22-1

SuggestedRemedy

Remove <XREF>

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT. Delete "<XREF>".

Cl 22 **SC 22.2.2.4** **P 25** **L 23** # **39**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A** *EZ*

<XREF>Table 22-1

SuggestedRemedy

Remove <XREF>

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT. Delete "<XREF>".

Cl 22 **SC 22.2.2.4** **P 25** **L 30** # **40**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A** *EZ*

<XREF>Table 22-1

SuggestedRemedy

Remove <XREF>

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT. Delete "<XREF>".

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 26 L 3 # 318
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

"Change 22.2.2.8 and Table 22-8 as follows(make no change to Figure 22-7" - don't repeat unchanged text in the editing instruction - it opens it for comment and unnecessary changes

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Insert new 4th paragraph after 3rd paragraph in 22.2.8" - delete lines 5-16 (first 3 paragraphs) and 22-32 (following paragraphs) and remove underscore on lines 18-21 (inserted paragraphs). Add new editing instruction after inserted paragraph, ""Insert two new rows between 0, 1, 0001 Assert LPI and Reserved row, and change reserved row of Table 22-2 as shown:"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change editing instruction on line 3 to "Insert new text after the third paragraph in 22.2.8 as follows:" and delete lines 5-16 and 22-31 (first three paragraphs and last three paragraphs) and remove underline from lines 17-21;

Add new editing instruction before Table 22-2 on line 32, "Insert new rows for 0, 1, 0010 and 0, 1, 0011 after 0, 1, 0001 and replace the Reserved row as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" and delete unchanged rows and format table to show "." in place of unchanged row immediately before new row and immediately after replaced row and remove change marks for new and replaced rows.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #318, #42, #43, and #44)

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 26 L 18 # 41
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. the PHY indicates that is receiving .

SuggestedRemedy

. the PHY indicates that it is receiving .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "this is" with "that it is".

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 26 L 25 # 42
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

TXD <3:0>

SuggestedRemedy

TXD<3:0>

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #318.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 26 L 26 # 43
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

RXD <3:0>

SuggestedRemedy

RXD<3:0>

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #318.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 26 L 30 # 44
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

<XREF>Table 22-2

SuggestedRemedy

Remove <XREF>

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #318

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.11 P 27 L 3 # 319
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

"Change 22.2.2.11 as follows - don't repeat unchanged text in the editing instruction - it opens it for comment and unnecessary changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace editing instruction with "Insert new 3rd paragraph after 2nd paragraph in 22.2.2.11:" - delete lines 5-10 and 16-21 - remove underscore on inserted new text.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change editing instruction on line 3 to "Insert new text after the second paragraph in 22.2.2.11 as follows:" and delete lines 5-10 and 16-21 (first two paragraphs and last two paragraphs) and remove underline from lines 10-14.

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.11 P 27 L 11 # 45
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. CRS along with COL signal .

SuggestedRemedy

. CRS along with the COL signal .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "with COL" with "with the COL".

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.12 P 27 L 25 # 320
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

"Change 22.2.2.12 as follows."- don't repeat unchanged text in the editing instruction - it opens it for comment and unnecessary changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace editing instruction with "Insert new 3rd paragraph after 2nd paragraph in 22.2.2.12:" - delete lines 26-34 and 39-45 - remove underscore on inserted new text.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change editing instruction on line 25 to "Insert new text after the third paragraph in 22.2.2.12 as follows:" and delete lines 26-34 and 39-45 (first three paragraphs and last two paragraphs) and remove underline from lines 35-38.

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.12 P 27 L 35 # 46
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. COL along with CRS signal .

SuggestedRemedy

. COL along with the CRS signal .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "with CRS" with "with the CRS".

CI 30 SC 30 P 31 L 1 # 324
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A PLCA

It seems odd nothing is needed in Clause 30 for PLCA (Clause 148)

SuggestedRemedy

Insert Editor's Note (to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot) - Task Force to consider necessary Clause 30 management parameters related to Clause 148 PLCA

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Insert Editor's Note "(to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot) - Task Force to consider necessary Clause 30 management parameters related to Clause 148 PLCA."

CI 30 SC 30.3 P 31 L 3 # 321
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

Editor's note - check this list of amendments - it's inconsistent with the rest of the draft and likely out of date.

SuggestedRemedy

Coordinate with IEEE chief editor on order of amendments and version of 802.3 to amend. Remove editor's note here and others like it - replace with a single editor's note up front to reduce possible confusion later.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete Editor's note on line 3 and search and delete all other occurrences of this note in the draft.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P 31 L 21 # 47
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
10BASE-T1S Clause 147 10 Mb/s PAM3

SuggestedRemedy
10BASE-T1S Clause 147 10 Mb/s DME

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Replace "10 Mb/s PAM3" with "10 Mb/s DME".
(Same resolution proposed for comments #47 and #322)

Cl 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P 31 L 21 # 322
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ
"Clause 147 10Mb/s PAM3" - Clause 147 is DME, not PAM3

SuggestedRemedy
Change PAM3 to DME

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Replace "10 Mb/s PAM3" with "10 Mb/s DME".
(Same resolution proposed for comments #47 and #322)

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P 31 L 30 # 48
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. for "1000BASE-T":\

SuggestedRemedy
. for "10BASE-T":

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Delete "\" after "10BASE-T":

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P 31 L 32 # 49
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
1000BASE-T1L

SuggestedRemedy
10BASE-T1L

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "1000BASE-T1L" with "10BASE-T1L" and replace
"1000BASE-T1S" with "10BASE-T1S".
(Same resolution proposed for comments #323, #49 and #50)

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P 31 L 33 # 50
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
1000BASE-T1S

SuggestedRemedy
10BASE-T1S

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "1000BASE-T1L" with "10BASE-T1L" and replace
"1000BASE-T1S" with "10BASE-T1S".
(Same resolution proposed for comments #323, #49 and #50)

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P 31 L 33 # 323
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
"1000BASE-T1L" and "1000BASE-T1S" should be "10BASE."

SuggestedRemedy
Replace 1000BASE-T1 with 10BASE-T1 (two instances)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Replace "1000BASE-T1L" with "10BASE-T1L" and replace "1000BASE-T1S"
with "10BASE-T1S".

(Same resolution proposed for comments #323, #49 and #50)

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 30 SC 30.6.1.1.5 P 32 L 4 # 51
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial
"Rem Fault" Definition

SuggestedRemedy

As there is no "Rem Fault" Bit in Clause 146 and Clause 147, a change of the definition is not necessary, therefore please delete the "Rem Fault" Definition Change.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Delete Editor's instruction and revised definition for "Rem Fault" on lines 1-4.

Cl 30 SC 30.6.1.1.5 P 32 L 12 # 52
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial
"Force MS" Definition

SuggestedRemedy

As the "Force MS" Definition is specific to the handling of the M/S Force Bit in Clause 98 there is no need to reference Clause 146 or Clause 147, therefore please delete the "Force MS" Definition Change.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Delete Editor's note, Editor's instruction, and revised definition for "Force MS" on lines 5-15.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 P 33 L 24 # 325
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status R Editorial
Rows in table 45-3 marked . are unusual (don't see them in 802.3bp) - may be confusing, as they are not inserts. I see these in several other tables, somewhat inconsistently

SuggestedRemedy

Coordinate with 802.3 chief editor (is this new style?) and if it is not new style, delete lines 24 and 41 (rows with .), and scrub other tables in clause 45 to delete these rows.

Response Response Status C
REJECT. Chief Editor consulted with Pete Anslow who advised that groups of unchanged rows in tables where new rows are added or existing rows are replaced should be represented by ellipsis (".").

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 P 33 L 29 # 53
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers
Register 1.2296 10BASE-T1L training, Subclause 45.2.1.174c

SuggestedRemedy

Change to Register 1.2296 Reserved, remove Subclause Reference, details see presentation "Clause 45 MDIO Registers"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement proposed and modified changes in "Clause 45 MDIO Registers" presentation.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 P 33 L 30 # 54
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers
Register 1.2297 10BASE-T1L link partner training, Subclause 45.2.1.174d

SuggestedRemedy

Change to Register 1.2297 Reserved, remove Subclause Reference, details see presentation "Clause 45 MDIO Registers"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement proposed and modified changes in "Clause 45 MDIO Registers" presentation.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.16 P 34 L 10 # 296
McCarthy, Mick Analog Devices Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A Registers
T1L is generally being introduced as the earlier of the two, i.e. Clause 147 vs. 148. I would expect therefore that this would be consistent with all register and bit entries throughout?

SuggestedRemedy

Make Bit 1.18.2 refer to T1L and 1.18.3 for T1S.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. See comment #296)

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.16 P 34 L 10 # 55
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers

Bit 1.18.3 is for 10BASE-T1L PHY, bit 1.18.2 is for 10BASE-T1S PHY

SuggestedRemedy

Change so that bit 1.18.3 is reflecting the 10BASE-T1S PHY and bit 1.18.2 is reflecting the 10BASE-T1L PHY (reason for this is that the bit position in register 1.18 reflects the PHY type Selection field in register 1.1200.3:0 and in this field 10BASE-T1L is type 0010 (2) and 10BASE-T1S is type 0011 (3)).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Swap table entries in the "Name" column to show that bit 1.18.3 is reserved for the 10BASE-T1S PHY and bit 1.18.2 is reserved for the 10BASE-T1L PHY.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #55 and #296)

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.173 P 34 L 29 # 56
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers

Type Selection field is marked as RO.

SuggestedRemedy

Type Selection field needs to be marked as R/W (otherwise the type could not be set, if the PHY is supporting more than one standard).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "RO" with "R/W".

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.173 P 34 L 31 # 297
McCarthy, Mick Analog Devices Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A Registers

T1L and T1S positions are out of order in the Table 45-141

SuggestedRemedy

"0 0 1 0 = 10BASE-T1L" should appear immediately above 1000BASE-T1 entry

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Reverse positions of "0 0 1 0 = 10BASE-T1L" and "0 0 1 1 = 10BASE-T1S" in table and keep change marks.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174a P 35 L 10 # 57
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers

Bit 1.2294.13 Reserved

SuggestedRemedy

Change bit 1.2294.13 to Loopback, 1 = Enable loopback mode, 0 = Disable loopback mode, mode is R/W, add the following text to the standard: 45.2.1.174a.x Loopback (1.2294.13) The 10BASE-T1L PMA shall be placed in loopback mode of operation when bit 1.2294.13 is set to a one. When bit 1.2294.13 is set to a one, the 10BASE-T1L PMA shall accept data on the transmit path and return it on the receive path. The default value of bit 1.2294.13 is zero. Bit 1.2294.13 is a copy of 1.0.0 and setting or clearing either bit shall set or clear the other bit. Setting either bit shall enable loopback.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. (Editor's note: Proposed resolution is written assuming that comment 58 has been accepted and implemented).

Change name for bit 1.2294.13 from "Reserved" to "Loopback"

Change description for bit 1.2294.13 to

1 = Enable loopback mode

0 = Disable loopback mode

Change mode for bit 1.2294.13 to R/W

Insert new subclause after "45.2.1.174a.2 Transmit disable (1.2294.14)" and renumber subsequent subclauses:

"45.2.1.174a.3 Loopback (1.2294.13)

The 10BASE-T1L PMA shall be placed in loopback mode of operation when bit 1.2294.13 is set to a one. When bit 1.2294.13 is set to a one, the 10BASE-T1L PMA shall accept data on the transmit path and return it on the receive path. The default value of bit 1.2294.13 is zero. Bit 1.2294.13 is a copy of 1.0.0 and setting or clearing either bit shall set or clear the other bit. Setting either bit shall enable loopback."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.174a P 35 L 10 # 58
Grabber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers

Bit 1.2294.12 Reserved

SuggestedRemedy

Change bit 1.2294.12 to Reduced transmit level, 1 = Enable reduced transmit level, 0 = Disable reduced transmit level, mode is R/W, add the following text to the standard: 45.2.1.174a.x Transmit Level (1.2294.12) If bit 1.2294.12 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1L PMA shall transmit with the reduced driving level according to 146.5.4.1, if bit 1.2294.12 is set to zero, the 10BASE-T1L PMA shall transmit with the normal driving level, according to 146.5.4.1. The default value of bit 1.2294.12 is zero.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change bit entry for reserved row from "1.2294.13:12" to "1.2294.13".

Add new row for bit 1.2294.12 with the following entries:

Name: Reduced transmit level

Description:

1 = Enable reduced transmit level

0 = Disable reduced transmit level

Mode: R/W

Insert new subclause after "45.2.1.174a.2 Transmit disable (1.2294.14)" and renumber subsequent subclauses (Editor's note: leave 45.2.1.174a.3 as a placeholder for implementation of comment 59):

"45.2.1.174a.4 Reduced transmit level (1.2294.12)

When bit 1.2294.12 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1L PMA shall transmit with the reduced driving level according to 146.5.4.1. When bit 1.2294.12 is set to zero, the 10BASE-T1L PMA shall transmit with the normal driving level, according to 146.5.4.1. The default value of bit 1.2294.12 is zero."

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.174a P 35 L 17 # 327
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status D Registers

"Low-power" - while 45.2.1.174a (and subclauses) define control for a low-power mode for 10BASE-T1L, clause 147 does not define such a mode.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete row for 1.2294.11 in Table 45-142a, and subclause 45.2.1.174a.3 insert, OR, add editor's note to Clause 147 (to be removed prior to WG ballot) - "Low Power mode (no data transmission, hot standby) needs to be defined"

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

CI 45 SC 45.1.174a.1 P 35 L 34 # 326
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

"Bits highlighted in yellow should be verified" - I don't see any highlights (and everything should be verified or noted for uncertainties if they are known.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete editor's note.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Delete Editor's Note on lines 34-36.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.174a.3 P 36 L 10 # 298
McCarthy, Mick Analog Devices Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

For consistency, should this note read "may interrupt data communication"?

SuggestedRemedy

Replace text "This operation interrupts data communication" with "This operation may interrupt data communication".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "operation interrupts" with "operation may interrupt".

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174b P 36 L 24 # 60
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers

Bit 1.2295.12 Reserved

SuggestedRemedy

Change bit 1.2295.12 to Reduced transmit level ability, 1 = PHY has reduced transmit level ability, 0 = PHY does not have reduced transmit level ability, RO only, add the following text to the standard: 45.2.1.174b.x Reduced transmit level ability (1.2295.12) When read as one, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY supports a reduced transmit level. When read as a zero, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY does not support a reduced transmit level.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. (Editor's note: Proposed resolution is written assuming that comment 59 has been accepted and implemented).

Change name for bit 1.2295.12 from "Reserved" to "Reduced transmit level ability"

Change description for bit 1.2295.12 to
1 = PHY has reduced transmit level ability
0 = PHY does not have reduced transmit level ability

Insert new subclause before "45.2.1.174b.1 10BASE-T1L OAM ability (1.2295.11)" and renumber subsequent subclauses:

"45.2.1.174b.1 Reduced transmit level ability (1.2295.12)

When read as one, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY supports a reduced transmit level. When read as a zero, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY does not support a reduced transmit level."

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174b P 36 L 24 # 59
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers

Bit 1.2295.13 Reserved

SuggestedRemedy

Change bit 1.2295.13 to Loopback ability, 1 = PHY has loopback ability, 0 = PHY has no loopback ability, RO only, add the following text to the standard: 45.2.1.174b.x Loopback ability (1.2295.13) When read as one, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY supports PMA loopback. When read as zero, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY does not support PMA loopback.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change bit entry for reserved row from "1.2295.15:12" to "1.2295.15:14".

Add new row for bit 1.2295.13 with the following entries:

Name: Loopback ability

Description:

1 = 1 = PHY has loopback ability
0 = 0 = PHY has no loopback ability

Mode: RO

Add new row for bit 1.2295.12 with the following entries:

Name: Reserved

Description:

Value always 0

Mode: RO

Insert new subclause before "45.2.1.174b.1 10BASE-T1L OAM ability (1.2295.11)" and renumber subsequent subclauses (Editor's note: leave 45.2.1.174b.1 as a placeholder for implementation of comment 59):

"45.2.1.174b.2 Loopback ability (1.2295.13)

When read as one, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY supports PMA loopback. When read as zero, this bit indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PHY does not support PMA loopback."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174 P 36 L 24 # 61
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers

Bit 1.2295.11 10BASE-T1L OAM Ability

SuggestedRemedy

Change to Bit 1.2295.11 Reserved

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change Reserved bits from "1.2295.15:12" to "1.2295.15:11" on line 24 and delete the row for bit 1.2295.11 on line 25.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174b.1 P 37 L 1 # 62
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

10BASE-T1L OAM Ability

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Sub clause.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete subcause 45.2.1.174b.1, all contents, and Editor's Note from lines 1-10.

Change the entries for bit 1.2295.11 to:

Name: Reserved

Description:

Value always 0

Mode: RO

(See comment #328)

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174b.1 P 37 L 4 # 328
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

If an OAM channel is to remain for the long reach PHY, a placeholder must be added to Clause 147

SuggestedRemedy

Delete 45.2.1.174b.1, and bit 1.2295.11 from Table 45-142b, and 45.2.1.174c.2 (and bit 1.2296.1), 45.2.1.174d.2 (and bit 1.2297.1) and scrub to delete all other references to 10BASE-T1L OAM channel, OR add Editor's note to Clause 147 (to be removed prior to WG ballot) "Definition needed for OAM channel - comments and text encouraged to add it.)"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete subcause 45.2.1.174b.1, all contents, and Editor's Note from lines 1-10.

Change the entries for bit 1.2295.11 in Table 45-142b to:

Name: Reserved

Description:

Value always 0

Mode: RO

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174c, 45.2.1.174c.1, 45.2.1.174c.2, 45.2.1.174c.3, and Table 45-142c.

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174d, 45.2.1.174d.1, 45.2.1.174d.2, 45.2.1.174d.3, and Table 45-142d.

Search for and delete all other references to 10BASE-T1L OAM channel.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #63, #64, #328, and #330)

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174b.4 P 37 L 26 # 329

Zimmerman, George

CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status D EEE

"supports the low-power ability" - WHAT low power ability? Is this the low-power mode, or the lower transmit level specified (incompletely in 146.5.4.1).

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Low-power ability" to "Reduced transmit voltage ability" globally, and insert "specified in 146.5.4.1".

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174c P 38 L 1 # 63

Graber, Steffen

Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

10BASE-T1L training register

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Clause and also table 45-142c.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete subcause 45.2.1.174b.1, all contents, and Editor's Note from lines 1-10.

Change the entries for bit 1.2295.11 in Table 45-142b to:

Name: Reserved

Description:

Value always 0

Mode: RO

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174c, 45.2.1.174c.1, 45.2.1.174c.2, 45.2.1.174c.3, and Table 45-142c.

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174d, 45.2.1.174d.1, 45.2.1.174d.2, 45.2.1.174d.3, and Table 45-142d.

Search for and delete all other references to 10BASE-T1L OAM channel.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #63, #64, #328, and #330)

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174c P 38 L 3 # 330

Zimmerman, George

CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

Editor's note - regarding user field - in many past incidents, exchange of a user defined field has aided interoperability and enhanced operational utility. I recommend we keep this for 10BASE-T1L

SuggestedRemedy

delete editor's note. (text for the field is already in place), and editor's note on p39 line 9 at 45.2.1.174d)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete subcause 45.2.1.174b.1, all contents, and Editor's Note from lines 1-10.

Change the entries for bit 1.2295.11 in Table 45-142b to:

Name: Reserved

Description:

Value always 0

Mode: RO

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174c, 45.2.1.174c.1, 45.2.1.174c.2, 45.2.1.174c.3, and Table 45-142c.

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174d, 45.2.1.174d.1, 45.2.1.174d.2, 45.2.1.174d.3, and Table 45-142d.

Search for and delete all other references to 10BASE-T1L OAM channel.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #63, #64, #328, and #330)

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174d P 39 L 7 # 64
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM
10BASE-T1L link partner training register

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Clause and also table 45-142c.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete subcause 45.2.1.174b.1, all contents, and Editor's Note from lines 1-10.

Change the entries for bit 1.2295.11 in Table 45-142b to:

Name: Reserved

Description:

Value always 0

Mode: RO

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174c, 45.2.1.174c.1, 45.2.1.174c.2, 45.2.1.174c.3, and Table 45-142c.

Delete subclauses 45.2.1.174d, 45.2.1.174d.1, 45.2.1.174d.2, 45.2.1.174d.3, and Table 45-142d.

Search for and delete all other references to 10BASE-T1L OAM channel.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #63, #64, #328, and #330)

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174e P 40 L 10 # 66
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers
Test mode control read only.

SuggestedRemedy

Test mode control mode needs to be R/W (otherwise the test modes cannot be enabled).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change RW entry for bits 1.2298.15:13 from "RO" to "R/W".

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174e P 40 L 10 # 65
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers
Test mode control (test modes 4 to 7)

SuggestedRemedy

There exist only 2 test modes, please set test modes 4 to 7 to reserved.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Change description for bits 1.2298.15:13 to:

15 14 13

1 x x = Reserved

0 1 1 = Reserved

0 1 0 = Test mode 2

0 0 1 = Test mode 1

0 0 0 = Normal (non-test) operation

(Same resolution proposed for comments #65 and #331)

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174e P 40 L 12 # 331
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers
The only test modes defined in clause 146 are test modes 1 and 2. also, why should mode 3 be reserved?

SuggestedRemedy

delete rows in table 45-142e for test modes 4 through 7 and replace with "1 x x = Reserved"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #65

Cl 45 SC 45.2.174e P 40 L 25 # 68
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Registers
. are described in 146.5.2, Table 146-5, and Table 146-5.

SuggestedRemedy

. are described in 146.5.2. (the two tables will be replaced later by a PSD mask).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "described in 146.5.2, Table 146-5, and Table 146-5" with "described in 146.5.2"

l Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 45 SC 45.2.174e P 40 L 25 # 67
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A Registers
 . bits 1.2297.15:13 .
 SuggestedRemedy
 . bits 1.2298.15:13 .
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT. Replace "1.2297.15:13" with "1.2298.15:13"

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174f.3 P 41 L 21 # 332
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EEE
 "Low power ability" - this needs to be defined in clause 147. the text here seems to define the PMA/PMD behavior, which should be in the state diagram of clause 147 - but there is no state diagram to add this.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move text on lines 24-28 ("This action." to "exit the low-power mode") to create new section "147.1.3 Low-power mode 10BASE-T1S PHYs may optionally support a transition to a low-power state where data communication is interrupted. This low power mode may be entered by setting bit 1.2299.11, or equivalent functionality if the MDIO interface is not present. This action... (text from 4.2.1.174f goes on from here)."
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174g.1 P 42 L 33 # 333
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type T Comment Status D OAM
 "10BASE-T1S OAM ability" - OAM ability doesn't exist in clause 146
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete 45.2.1.174g.1, and all clause 45 references to 10BASE-T1S OAM ability OR, add editor's note to clause 146 - "Editor's note (to be removed before WG ballot): OAM channel to be defined in clause 146 or deleted from management - comments and text requested."
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174h P 43 L 26 # 334
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM
 Editor's note - regarding user field - in many past incidents, exchange of a user defined field has aided interoperability and enhanced operational utility. I recommend we keep this for 10BASE-T1S
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete editor's note. (text for the field is already in place), and editor's note on p44 line 20 at 45.2.1.174i)

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT. Delete Editor's Note starting on line 26.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.174j P 45 L 18 # 335
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type T Comment Status A Registers
 The only test modes defined in clause 147 are test modes 1, 2 and 3. here 1,2, and 4-7 are defined, while 3 is reserved.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace descriptions in Table 45-142j at lines 18-21 for Test modes 7 - 4 with "1 x x = Reserved", Replace description "0 1 1 = Reserved" with "0 1 1 = Test mode 3"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT. Change description for bits 1.2303.15:13 to:
 15 14 13
 1 x x = Reserved
 0 1 1 = Test mode 3
 0 1 0 = Test mode 2
 0 0 1 = Test mode 1
 0 0 0 = Normal (non-test) operation

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3 P 46 L 3 # 336
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status A Registers
 Editor's note - "subclause references are placeholders" appears to be old and out of date (subclauses are as numbered in the draft). If there is some specific deficiency, I don't see it.
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete editor's note
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT. Delete Editor's Note starting on line 3.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3 P 46 L 18 # 69
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PCS

3.2280 10BASE-T1L PCS status 2

SuggestedRemedy

Set register 3.2280 to "Reserved", remove Sub clause reference.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change name for register 3.2280 from "10BASE-T1L PCS status 2" to "Reserved" and delete reference to subclause 45.2.3.58c in Table 45-168. Show underline change marks.

Delete subclauses 45.2.3.58c, 45.2.3.58c.1, 45.2.3.58c.2, 45.2.3.58c.3, 45.2.3.58c.4, 45.2.3.58c.5, 45.2.3.58c.6, and Table 45-220c and renumber following subclauses sequentially.

Add Editor's Note to page 46, line 10 that says, "Editor's Note (To be removed prior to draft 2.0) Need to consider where and how to add register bit(s) and/or status bit(s) to monitor disparity errors."

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3 P 46 L 19 # 70
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

3.2281 to 3.2290 OAM Registers

SuggestedRemedy

Set registers 3.2281 to 3.2290 to "Reserved" and remove Sub Clause references.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. This proposal assumes that comment #69 has been implemented. Change register "3.2280" to "3.2280 through 3.2290". Show underline change marks.

Delete rows for registers 3.2281 to 3.2290 in Table 145-168.

Delete subclauses 45.2.3.58d, 45.2.3.58e, 45.2.3.58f, 45.2.3.58g, and all subclauses and Tables contain therein and renumber following subclauses sequentially.

(Same resolution proposed for comments#70, #72, #73, #74, and #75)

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.58c P 48 L 8 # 338
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

"PCS high BER" and "Latched high BER" - unlike 1000BASE-T1, 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S have no way to detect BER on their own. There may be more appropriate signal quality measures (right now SNR is only in OAM) but as defined these registers don't have a standardized meaning. These might be PMA status rather than PCS status

SuggestedRemedy

Delete PCS high BER 3.2280.9, and Latched high BER 3.2280.7, and descrbing sections; also delete same bits on 10BASE-T1S. Add ed's notes by 10BASE-T1S and 10BASE-T1L PCS and PMA status registers - "Editor's note (to be removed prior to WG ballot) - Commenters to consider what signal quality metrics are needed to report, and comment/provide text appropriately"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #69

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.58c P 48 L 43 # 71
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

10BASE-T1L PCS status 2 register

SuggestedRemedy

Remove Sub clause, and also table 45-220c.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #69

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.58c P 48 L 45 # 337
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A PCS

"Editor's note - 10BASE-T1L PCS doesn't have block lock, but may be replaced by something like disparity error." - disparity error appears to be the right thing - replace block lock bit with disparity error. This happens for both the normal and latched versions.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete editor's note. Change bit 2280.6 from "PCS has (does not have) block lock" to "1 = PCS reports no disparity errors, 0 = PCS reports disparity errors", and change 45.2.3.58c.3 from "PCS block lock" to "PCS disparity", and change 45.2.3.58c.3 to read: "When read as a one, bit 3.2280.8 indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PCS receiver has detected no disparity errors. When read as a zero, bit 3.2280.8 indicates that the 10BASE-T1L PCS receiver has detected disparity errors. This bit is a reflection of the variable disparity_error defined at 146.3.4.1.1." (similarly replace "latched high block lock" with parallel text for disparity errors)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #69

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.58b.6 P 48 L 48 # 157
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PCS

This bit is a latching low version of bit 3.2280.10. The PCS receive link status bit shall be implemented with latching low behavior.

SuggestedRemedy

This bit is a latching low reflection of the variable scr_status. If the bit is read, while scr_status = OK, this bit is set. If scr_status = NOT_OK, this bit is reset.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace,
"This bit is a latching low version of bit 3.2280.10. The PCS receive link status bit shall be implemented with latching low behavior."

with,
"This bit is a latching low reflection of the variable scr_status. If the bit is read, while scr_status = OK, this bit is set. If scr_status = NOT_OK, this bit is reset."

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.58d P 50 L 10 # 72
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

10BASE-T1L OAM transmit register

SuggestedRemedy

Remove Sub clause, and also table 45-220d.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #70.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.58e P 51 L 43 # 73
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

10BASE-T1L OAM message register

SuggestedRemedy

Remove Sub clause, and also table 45-220e.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #70.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.58f P 52 L 17 # 74
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

10BASE-T1L OAM receive register

SuggestedRemedy

Remove Sub clause, and also table 45-220f.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #70.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.58g P 53 L 21 # 75
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

10BASE-T1L OAM message register

SuggestedRemedy

Remove Sub clause.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #70.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.58n P 60 L 24 # 309

iyer, venkat microchip

Comment Type T Comment Status A OAM

missing registers

SuggestedRemedy

addtable with registers 3.2300 to 3.2303

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add sentence to the end of the last sentence in clause 45.2.3.58n, "The assignment of bits in the Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message register bit is shown in Table 45-220m."

Add new Table 45-220m - Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message register bit definitions

Row 1:
Bit(s)
Name
Description
R/W^a

Row 2:
3.2300.15:8
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 1
Message octet 1. LSB received first.
RO

Row 3:
3.2300.7:0
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 0 Message octet 0. LSB received first.
RO

Row 4:
3.2301.15:8
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 3
Message octet 3. LSB received first.
RO

Row 5:
3.2301.7:0
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 2
Message octet 2. LSB received first.
RO

Row 6:
3.2302.15:8
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 5
Message octet 5. LSB received first.

RO

Row 7:
3.2302.7:0
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 4
Message octet 4. LSB received first.
RO

Row 8:
3.2303.15:8
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 7
Message octet 7. LSB received first.
RO

Row 9:
3.2303.7:0
Link partner 10BASE-T1S OAM message 6
Message octet 6. LSB received first.
RO

^aRO = Read Only

Note: If comment #70 is not accepted, then register definitions for addresses 3.2287 to 3.2290 will need to be included in a similar table (Link partner 10BASE-T1L OAM message register bit definitions) added to 45.2.3.58g.

CI 98 SC 98.2.1.1.2 P 65 L 17 # 76

Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

., the state machine .

SuggestedRemedy

., a state machine ...

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "the state machine" with "a state machine"

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 98 SC 98.2.1.1.2 P 65 L 24 # 77
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
0.01%

SuggestedRemedy

0.01 % (several times a % symbol is used throughout the standard, depending on the chapter there is a space between the number and the % symbol or not, it could make sense to unify this throughout the document, this is the only comment on this, further % symbol occurrences are not commented).

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. According to the Style Manual, the value of a quantity shall be expressed by an Arabic numeral followed by a space and the appropriate unit name or symbol. Perform ag loba search for "%" and insert non-breaking space between the number and percent sign.

Cl 98 SC 98.2.1.1.2 P 66 L 8 # 78
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
800.4

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 800.04 (800 ns + 50 ppm = 800.04 ns)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Replace "800.4" with "800.04"

Cl 98 SC 98.5.2 P 67 L 23 # 29
Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
AN LINK GOOD CHECK is not the usual text format used in the standard

SuggestedRemedy

Use for example "link_good_check=OK state"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. There is an error in clause 98.5.2 (page 225, line 15) and the PICS for 98.5.2 (page 235, line 31) of 802.3cj D3.0 that will be corrected with a late comment on the revision.

Replace "AN LINK GOOD CHECK " with "AN GOOD CHECK" on page 67, line 24, page 68, line 39, and in the PICS on page 73, line 17.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #29 and #28)

Cl 98 SC 98.5.2 P 67 L 23 # 28
Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial
AN LINK GOOD CHECK is not defined

SuggestedRemedy

Define AN LINK GOOD CHECK, what does that mean? Why is that different to "link_status=OK"?

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. There is an error in clause 98.5.2 (page 225, line 15) and the PICS for 98.5.2 (page 235, line 31) of 802.3cj D3.0 that will be corrected with a late comment on the revision.

Replace "AN LINK GOOD CHECK " with "AN GOOD CHECK" on page 67, line 24, page 68, line 39, and in the PICS on page 73, line 17.

(Same resolution proposed for comments #29 and #28)

Cl 98 SC 98.5.2 P 67 L 45 # 299
McCarthy, Mick Analog Devices Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Typo in spelling of timer

SuggestedRemedy

replace "timerr" with "timer"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Replace "timerr" with "timer"

(Same resolution proposed for comments #299 and #79)

Cl 98 SC 98.5.2 P 67 L 45 # 79
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
backoff_timerr

SuggestedRemedy

backoff_timer

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT. Replace "timerr" with "timer"

(Same resolution proposed for comments #299 and #79)

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 98 SC 98.5.6 P 70 L 23 # 27
Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type E Comment Status A AutoNeg
Abbreviation "AN" is not used in Standard anywhere else

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "AN" in figure 98-11 and 98-12 or write "auto negotiation"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. State names are allowed to be non-defined abbreviations and desired to be short, so make no change in the figures. Globally search for "auto negotiation", "auto-negotiation", and other permutations with different capitalization and replace with "Auto-Negotiation".

Cl 98 SC 98.6.8 P 72 L 39 # 80
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
e from mode is not underlined

SuggestedRemedy

underline mode completely

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Extend underline change mark to the "e" from "mode".

Cl 98 SC 98.6.8 P 73 L 19 # 81
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
there is a "." at the end of the comment

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "." at the end of the comment (all other comments are not closed with a ".").

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Delete "." after the word "mode"

Cl 104 SC 104.4.1 P 75 L 22 # 82
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
a from and is not underlines

SuggestedRemedy

underline and completely

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Extend underline change mark to the "a" from "and".

Cl 104 SC 104.4.1 P 75 L 46 # 83
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
Parameter Text is written in "justify" style.

SuggestedRemedy

Sometimes hard to read. Could make sense to change the tables especially of Clause 104 to left alignment of text for the parameter column. This may affect all tables in Clause 104. There are no other comments on this for other table positions.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Left justify the "Parameter" column and disallow hyphenation of the words in the column.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.3 P 77 L 41 # 84
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
100O

SuggestedRemedy

100 O

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert space between 100 and ohms symbol if allowed by the equation editor.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.3 P 81 L 34 # 85
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. 12, 13,14, 15, 18, 18, and 19, .

SuggestedRemedy

. 12, 13,14, 15, 17, 18, and 19, .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "18, 18, and 19" with "17, 18, and 19"

Cl 104 SC 104.9.4.3 P 84 L 27 # 86
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Powered Device (PD)

SuggestedRemedy

Powered Device (PD)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. Replace "(PD" with "(PD)"

Cl 146 SC 146.1 P 87 L 9 # 87
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Physical Layer (PHY)

SuggestedRemedy

Physical Layer Device (PHY)

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

802.3 standard nomenclature is to refer to the physical layer, not the the physical layer device. The physical layer may be comprised of one or more devices.

Cl 146 SC 146.1 P 87 L 19 # 88
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

A 10BASE-T1L that supports .

SuggestedRemedy

A 10BASE-T1L PHY that supports .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 87 L 38 # 278
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial

10BASE-T1L PHY is an industrial PHY. Don't need to meet automotive requirement.

SuggestedRemedy

change ". of automotive and industrial environments" to " . of industrial environment"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment 30 (duplicate of this)

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 87 L 38 # 30
Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type TR Comment Status A Editorial
10BASE-T1L is not suitable for automotive applications

SuggestedRemedy

remove "automotive and"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change paragraph from:

The 10BASE-T1L PHY operates using full-duplex communications over a single twisted-pair copper cable with an effective rate of 10 Mb/s in each direction simultaneously while meeting the requirements (EMC, temperature, etc.) of automotive and industrial environments. The PHY supports operation on a link segment supporting up to ten in-line connectors using a single twisted-pair copper cable for up to at least 1000 meters to support applications requiring extended physical reach, such as industrial and automation controls.

To

The 10BASE-T1L PHY operates using full-duplex communications over a single twisted-pair copper cable with an effective rate of 10 Mb/s in each direction simultaneously. The PHY supports operation on a link segment supporting up to ten in-line connectors using a single twisted-pair copper cable for up to at least 1000 meters.

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 87 L 44 # 31
Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type ER Comment Status A Editorial
"MII TX_D" is not a single signal

SuggestedRemedy

change to "MII TXD<0:3>" or similar to the standard format

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change TX_D to TXD<3:0>

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 88 L 31 # 89
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A AutoNeg
Clause 98

SuggestedRemedy

Accept Clause 98 as optional auto-negotiation method for 10BASE-T1L
(Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 2, Graber_3cg_19_1117.pdf)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "Auto-Negotiation (Clause 98) may optionally be used by 10BASE-T1L devices" to "Auto-Negotiation may be used by 10BASE-T1L devices"

and

Delete sentence on line 34 "The implementation of the Auto-Negotiation function is optional."

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 88 L 33 # 90
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A AutoNeg
. through the use of half-duplex differential Manchester encoding.

SuggestedRemedy

Accept this text part (see Clause 98 Comment).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

(editor change text to normal text from bold italic)

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 88 L 35 # 91
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A AutoNeg
If Auto-Negotiation is implemented, it shall meet the requirements of Clause 98.

SuggestedRemedy

Accept this text part (see Clause 98 Comment).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 88 L 52 # 92
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A EEE

A 10BASE-T1L PHY may optionally support Energy-Efficient Ethernet (see Clause 78).

SuggestedRemedy

Accept this text part (currently no EEE is defined for 10BASE-T1L, but it is demanded in the objectives).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment 93

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2 P 88 L 53 # 93
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A AutoNeg

. and advertising the EEE capability as described in 146.4.x.x.x (TBD)

SuggestedRemedy

Delete this text part (EEE capability is suggested to be negotiated during auto negotiation process (Clause 98)).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "A 10BASE-T1L PHY may optionally support Energy-Efficient Ethernet (see Clause 78) and advertise the EEE capability as described in 146.4.x.x.x(TBD)."
to "A 10BASE-T1L PHY optionally supports Energy-Efficient Ethernet (see Clause 78)."
Add editor's note: "Editor's note - to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot:
The task force needs to resolve whether EEE is advertised (or forced - see 100BASE-T1), if so, how it is advertised. Comments and contributions are requested, and the text may be placed elsewhere."

Cl 146 SC 146.1.2.1ff P 89 L 5 # 370
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type E Comment Status A Late

Text for clause 146.1.2.1 and following clauses is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Add text proposed in document "Clause 146 Proposed Additional Text.pdf" for the mentioned clause(s).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Incorporate text for review, without acceptance, on pages 1 and 2 of "Clause 146 Proposed Additional Text.pdf" for 146.1.2.1, 146.1.2.2, 146.1.2.3, 146.1.3 (and subclauses), and 146.2 (and subclauses) with the following Editor's note: "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot): The following text was added to D1.1 for Task Force Review,WITHOUT ACCEPTANCE because it is substantial new matter. Reviewers are encouraged to comment and propose acceptance or modification in the Task Force review process."

Cl 146 SC 146.3.1 P 89 L 47 # 94
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. while any of the above reset conditions hold true.

SuggestedRemedy

. while any of the above reset conditions holds true.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.2.1 P 91 L 39 # 95
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

When set to FALSE .

SuggestedRemedy

When this variable is set to FALSE . (to align the text with tx_error_mii description)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace "When set to FALSE ." with "When this variable is set to FALSE ."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1 P 92 L 13 # 96
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 In each symbol period, PCS Transmit .
 SuggestedRemedy
 In each symbol period PCS Transmit .
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1 P 92 L 41 # 97
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 . symbols An at each .
 SuggestedRemedy
 . symbols An (where n is a subscript character) at each .
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change An to format "n" as a subscript.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1 P 92 L 46 # 98
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 . at receiver side .
 SuggestedRemedy
 . at the receiver side .
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1 P 92 L 48 # 99
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 . at receiver PHY .
 SuggestedRemedy
 . at the receiver PHY .
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1.1 P 93 L 21 # 100
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 When set to FALSE .
 SuggestedRemedy
 When this variable is set to FALSE . (to align the text with tx_error_mii description)
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "When set to FALSE" to "When this variable is set to FALSE"

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1.1 P 94 L 2 # 101
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 . the values {-1, 0, +1}.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please write in one line.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1.2 P 94 L 12 # 102
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 . its arguments Sdn[3:0] and the .
 SuggestedRemedy
 . its arguments Sdn[3:0] and the . (Sdn, where n is a subscript character)
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1.2 P 94 L 16 # 103
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 ENCODE(Sdn[3:0], tx_disparity)
 SuggestedRemedy
 ENCODE(Sdn[3:0], tx_disparity) (Sdn, where n is a subscript character)
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl **146** *SC* **146.3.3.1.2** *P* **94** *L* **19** # **104**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *EZ*

. based on the Sdn[3:0] value .

SuggestedRemedy

. based on the Sdn[3:0] value . (Sdn, where n is a subscript character)

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **146** *SC* **146.3.3.1.3** *P* **94** *L* **45** # **105**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *EZ*

. timer expiration

SuggestedRemedy

. timer expiration. (add dot)

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **146** *SC* **146.3.3.1.3** *P* **94** *L* **46** # **106**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A** *State Diagram*

No Restart defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Restart time: Immediately after expiration, timer restart resets the condition symb_triplet_timer_done.

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Insert following "Continuous timer" line 46 and before "Duration" line 47:

"Restart time: Immediately after expiration, timer restart resets the condition symb_triplet_timer_done."

Cl **146** *SC* **146.3.3.1.4** *P* **95** *L* **7** # **158**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A** *State Diagram*

Adding of additional error variable to several state machine states (latching of tx_error_mii until end of transmission, to guarantee, that if the tx_error_mii variable is only TRUE for a short moment during transmission, that the ESD_ERR is signaled)

SuggestedRemedy

Add error <= FALSE to state "SEND IDLE", add error <= error + tx_error_mii to all of the following states: "SSD COMMA1 VECTOR", "SSD COMMA2 VECTOR", "SSD DISPRESET VECTOR", "SSD VECTOR", "TRANSMIT DATA", exchange "tx_error_mii" with "error" in all conditions within the state machine (in total 4 replacements).

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **146** *SC* **146.3.3.1.4** *P* **95** *L* **8** # **107**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *EZ*

Sdn[3:0]

SuggestedRemedy

Sdn[3:0], where n is a subscript character

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1 P 95 L 11 # 260
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A State Diagram

Figure 146-4: The transition condition "STD * ELSE" for the State "SEND_IDLE" and "TRANSMIT DATA" is not explicit. The same comment applies to other figures. Task Force needs to discuss this and determine whether this "ELSE" style is OK or not before taking any action

SuggestedRemedy

Change "STD * ELSE" for the state "SEND_IDLE" to "STD * tx_enable_mii = FALSE"; change "STD * ELSE" for the state "TRANSMIT DATA" to "STD * tx_enable_mii = TRUE". Refer to PAGE 2 of the accompanied presentation xu_3cg_01_0118.pdf.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
802.3 nomenclature defines a branch labeled as "ELSE" as "A branch taken when other exit conditions are not satisfied", but not any logical function of "ELSE". Editor searched and did not find other instances of "ELSE * xyz" in IEEE Std 802.3-2015.

Allowing functions of "ELSE" creates ambiguity.

Change "STD * ELSE" for the state "SEND_IDLE" to "STD * (tx_enable_mii = FALSE)"; change "STD * ELSE" for the state "TRANSMIT DATA" to "STD * (tx_enable_mii = TRUE)".

Editor to search and scrub state diagrams for other possible misused "functions of ELSE".

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.1.4 P 95 L 50 # 108
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

STD * (tx_enable_mii = FALSE)* (tx_error_mii = TRUE)

SuggestedRemedy

STD * (tx_enable_mii = FALSE) * (tx_error_mii = TRUE)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
(insert missing space after first close-paren)

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.2 P 96 L 9 # 109
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

tx_symbol_triplet

SuggestedRemedy

tx_symb_triplet

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.2.1 P 96 L 33 # 159
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

G(x) =

SuggestedRemedy

Please replace by gm(x) =, where m is a subscript character. This is to align the notation with the receiver descrambler polynomial notation.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.2.1 P 96 L 37 # 160
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

G(x) =

SuggestedRemedy

Please replace by gs(x) =, where s is a subscript character. This is to align the notation with the receiver descrambler polynomial notation.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.2.1 P 96 L 41 # 110
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ

At each symbol period, .

SuggestedRemedy

At each triple ternary symbol period, .

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.4 P 97 L 47 # 111
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. shall be generated as follows

SuggestedRemedy

.. shall be generated as follows:

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Remove space between "follows" and ":-"

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.4 P 98 L 1 # 112
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

:

SuggestedRemedy

Remove : (needs to be on previous page)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Change accomplished by 111

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.4 P 98 L 15 # 113
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Misalignment of equations

SuggestedRemedy

Please align Sdn[1:0] to Sdn[2] and Sdn[3] Equation.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.5 P 98 L 27 # 114
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. using the 4B3T algorithm using a running disparity value, .

SuggestedRemedy

. using the 4B3T algorithm in conjunction with a running disparity value, ...

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.5 P 98 L 33 # 339
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status A PCS

values of COMMA1 and COMMA2 symbols are identical - this should be just COMMA.
Also effects variables at 146.3.3.1.1 and state diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "is used as COMMA1 and COMMA2 value" to "is used as the COMMA value".
Delete table 146-2 and editor's note on page 99 line 44. change page 92 line 51 to delete COMMA2 and change COMMA1 to just plain COMMA. Also change values used in states SSD_COMMA1_VECTOR and SSD_COMMA2_VECTOR (but not state names) to just plain COMMA in Figure 146-4 (page 95)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement described changes, and change values of COMMA1 and COMMA2 to COMMA in Figure 146-7 (PCS receive machine). Editor to scrub document for any references which may have been missed and update.

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.5 P 98 L 35 # 115
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. during training:

SuggestedRemedy

. during training.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.5 P 99 L 34 # 116
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PCS

Table 146-2

SuggestedRemedy

Remove table 146-2 (redundant information to last paragraph on page 98).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accomplished by comment 339

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.2.5 P 99 L 48 # 117
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PCS

Last paragraph between lines 48 and 54.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove text and replace by: The DISPRESET3 triplet, together with the following fourth symbol group (which always has a disparity of 1), is used to bring back the running disparity to a defined value of 2. The following coding shall be used for the DISPRESET3 symbol triplet:

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change line 49 as follows:
Change "to a defined value." to "to a defined value of 2."
Delete lines 49 - 52, from "The DISRESET3 symbol triplet." to "disparity again."
Change lines 52-53 from "The following coding shall be used for the DISPRESET3 symbol triplet:" to "The coding shown in Table 146-3 shall be used for the DISPRESET3 symbol triplet."

To read:
The DISPRESET3 triplet, together with the following fourth symbol group (which always has a disparity of 1), shall be used to bring back the running disparity to a defined value of 2. The coding in Table 146-3 shall be used for the DISPRESET3 symbol triplet:

Cl 146 SC 146.3.3.2.5 P 100 L 8 # 118
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PCS

The fourth symbol group .

SuggestedRemedy

Place this text line between Table 146-3 and Table 146-4 (move to line 16).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "shall be encoded as follows" to "shall be encoded as shown in Table 146-4"

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 100 L 44 # 119
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PCS

., shall be implemented to prevent any mis-detection of ESD that would make the PCS Receive state machine lock up in the DATA state.

SuggestedRemedy

., shall be implemented to prevent in case of any mis-detection of an ESD that the PCS Receive state machine locks up in the DATA state.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "A JAB state machine as shown in Figure 146-9, shall be implemented to prevent any mis-detection of ESD that would make the PCS Receive state machine lock up in the DATA state."

to "The PCS Receive function shall conform to the JAB state diagram in Figure 146-9. This prevents the possible lock-up of the PCS Receive state diagram in the DATA state due to mis-detection of an ESD."

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 100 L 50 # 120
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. that perform DATA encoding.

SuggestedRemedy

. that perform data encoding.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 100 L 51 # 121
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

., the depth of data flush-in delay line .

SuggestedRemedy

., the depth of the data flush-in delay line .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 102 L 3 # 161
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram

Condition to enter IDLE state (second arrow from left)

SuggestedRemedy

Add brackets around (receiving = FALSE) . until end of the conditions, to ensure, that (pcs_Reset = ON) is not misinterpreted as staying in conjunction with the (receiving = FALSE) statement. Additionally add opening bracket before rcv_jab_detected = TRUE).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add opening bracket before rcv_jab_detected = TRUE

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 102 L 13 # 162
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram

RSTCD * (RXn = COMMA1) * (valid_idle = FALSE)

SuggestedRemedy

RSTCD * (RXn != COMMA1) * (valid_idle = FALSE)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change COMMA1 to COMMA based on comment 339.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 102 L 14 # 122
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

(valid_idele = FALSE)

SuggestedRemedy

(valid_idle = FALSE)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 102 L 14 # 262
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A State Diagram

Figure 146-7: The transition condition "RSTCD * (RXn = COMMA1)" from the state IDLE to the state CHECK SSD COMMA2 is not complete or correct

SuggestedRemedy

Change the transtion condition "RSTCD * (RXn = COMMA1)" to "RSTCD * (RXn = COMMA1) * (valid_idle = TRUE)"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment 162. Correction of the typo corrects the transition in this state.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1 P 102 L 14 # 261
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Figure 146-7: typo "valid_idele"

SuggestedRemedy

change "valid_idele" to "valid_idle"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT. (dup of 122)

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1.1 P 105 L 10 # 163
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. take one of the values .

SuggestedRemedy

Please adjust text alignment.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1.1 P 105 L 17 # 164
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
.at receiver side .

SuggestedRemedy
. at the receiver side .

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1.1 P 105 L 18 # 165
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. set to 2. Values: .

SuggestedRemedy
Add new line before Values.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1.1 P 105 L 25 # 166
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. is set FALSE.

SuggestedRemedy
. is set as FALSE.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
Change "is set FALSE" to "is set to FALSE" (this is the usual phrasing)

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1.2 P 105 L 33 # 167
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
The function checks .

SuggestedRemedy
This function checks .

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1.2 P 105 L 36 # 168
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A State Diagram
Editor's Note

SuggestedRemedy
Remove Editor's Note and hint about about Srn[2:3]. The description of Srn[2] and Srn[3] is only a hint and not really necessary (if anybody thinks a little about this it should be clear), so the suggestion is to remove it.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.1.3 P 106 L 19 # 169
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
The timer shall expire TBD after being started.

SuggestedRemedy
The timer shall expire 4 ms ± 100 µs after being started. Please remove the italic text. Outcome of the discussion on Orlando about Jumbo Frames was that a size of 4 Kbyte is suitable for 10BASE-T1L. This equals to a little above 3.3 ms. Therefore the suggestion is to set the timer to 4 ms ± 100 µs.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.2 P 106 L 27 # 171
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
The receiver de-interleaves .

SuggestedRemedy
Remove this sentence as it is redundant to the first sentence of the next paragragh.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete "The receiver de-interleaves the sequences of rx_symb_vector to rx_symb_triplet accordingly."

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.2 P 106 L 27 # 170
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

. and searches for SSD or receive error indicator.

SuggestedRemedy

. and searches for a SSD or receive error indicator.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "searches for SSD or receive error indicator" with "searches for an SSD or a receive error indicator."

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.2 P 106 L 43 # 172
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

PCS Receive shall set RX_DV = TRUE when it receives SSD, and shall set RX_DV = FALSE when it receives ESD or ESD with error.

SuggestedRemedy

PCS Receive shall set RX_DV = TRUE when it receives a SSD, and shall set RX_DV = FALSE when it receives an ESD or ESD with error.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "PCS Receive shall set RX_DV = TRUE when it receives SSD, and shall set RX_DV = FALSE when it receives ESD or ESD with error."
to
"PCS Receive shall set RX_DV = TRUE when it receives an SSD, and shall set RX_DV = FALSE when it receives an ESD or ESD with error."

Cl 146 SC 146.3.4.2 P 106 L 49 # 173
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PCS

Editor's Note and Figure 146-10

SuggestedRemedy

This diagram was just for explanation, it is not really needed for implementing the standard, so the suggestion is to follow the editor's recommendation and remove it.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.5 P 107 L 52 # 174
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PCS

. when the loopback bit in MDIO register 3.0.14, defined in 45.2.3.1.2, is set to a one .

SuggestedRemedy

. when the loopback bit in MDIO register 3.0.14, defined in 45.2.3.1.2, or the loopback bit in MDIO register 3.2278.14, defined in 45.2.3.58a, is set to a one .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.3.5 P 108 L 25 # 175
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PCS

Editor's Note and following paragraph.

SuggestedRemedy

It is right, that the comparison is done on top of the MAC layer and not by the MAC layer itself. In principle it is clear, how the PCS loopback should work, so the suggestion is to remove this paragraph.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete lines 25-32 (editor's note and referenced paragraph)

Cl 146 SC 146.4 P 109 L 18 # 176
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA

loc_rcvr_status is fed into LINK MONITOR block.

SuggestedRemedy

Use tx_mode instead of loc_rcvr_status (the status of the LINK MONITOR depends on link_control and tx_mode only).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
The comment reflects what the Link Monitor state machine does, but link monitor only ain and goes to fail if the PHY control goes back to TRANSMITTER DISABLE and can oscillate back and forth trying to retrain and failing with loc_rcvr_status = NOT_OK except for short intervals and link never down.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.4.2 P 110 L 7 # 177
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

. conveys to the PMA using tx_symb_vector the value .

SuggestedRemedy

. conveys to the PMA, using tx_symb_vector, the value .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "conveys to the PMA using tx_symb_vector the value" to
"conveys to the PMA via the parameter tx_symb_vector the value"
(standard usage in IEEE Std. 802.3)

Cl 146 SC 146.4.2 P 110 L 23 # 178
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

PMA Transmit Function

SuggestedRemedy

PMA Transmit function

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.2 P 110 L 25 # 179
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

PMA Transmit Function

SuggestedRemedy

PMA Transmit function

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.3 P 110 L 41 # 180
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA

This variable indicates to the PCS Transmitter, PCS Receiver, PMA PHY Control function and Link Monitor whether .

SuggestedRemedy

This variable indicates to the PCS Transmitter, PCS Receiver and PMA PHY Control function whether . (the Link Monitor is not getting this information).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See comment 176

Cl 146 SC 146.4.3 P 111 L 18 # 181
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

link_status = Fail

SuggestedRemedy

link_stauts = FAIL

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace "link_status = Fail" with "link_status = FAIL"

Cl 146 SC 146.4.3 P 111 L 19 # 182
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA

. shall contribute to the receive fault bit specified in 45.2.1.7.5.

SuggestedRemedy

. shall contribute to the receive fault bit specified in 45.2.1.7.5 and 45.2.1.174b.6.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 111 L 38 # 183
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
TBD

SuggestedRemedy

3000 ms (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 5, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace "If there is no predetermined configuration available, the maximum time, until link_status = OK is reached, shall be less than TBD (suggested are 3000 ms)." (PAGE 111 LINE 36)
with
"If there is no predetermined configuration available, the maximum time, until link_status = OK is reached, is less than 3 000 +/- 30 ms."

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 111 L 39 # 184
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. filter coefficient is available .

SuggestedRemedy

. filter coefficients is available .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.5 P 111 L 45 # 185
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram
Chapter ordering seems to need reordering.

SuggestedRemedy

146.5 describes the link monitor function, so this capter should be placed after Figure 146-15. Additionally chapter 146.4.7 should start before Figure 146-5 (it is the headling for the Figure 146-15) and have the numbering 146.4.4.1, chapter 146.4.7.1 should be chapter 146.4.4.2, chapter 146.4.7.2 should be chapter 146.4.4.3, then chapter 146.4.5 (link monitor function should be placed), chapter 146.4.5.2 should then be chapter 146.4.5.1 and chapter 146.4.5.1 should be chapter 146.4.5.2.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Move subclauses to 146.4.7 (146.4.7.1 and 146.4.7.2) before 145.4.5 so they become 146.4.4.1 and 146.4.4.2
Move 146.4.7 after (new) 146.4.4.2 and demote a level so it is 146.4.4.3 and anchor figure 146-15 in new 146.4.4.3.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 111 L 51 # 186
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram
Editor's Note about the note on the bottom of page 112.

SuggestedRemedy

In principle we do not need it, but it could be an explanation, why the state machine is having the clock_recovered completed path (and it allows for a different implementation waiting until the training is ready), so my personal view would be to keep it, but finally it depends on the groups' decision if we want to keep it or not.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete the editor's note at page 111 line 51 and
delete NOTE at page 112 lines 47-52

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 112 L 1 # 187
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram
link_control = DISABLE + pma_reset = ON

SuggestedRemedy

(pma_reset = ON) + (link_control = DISABLE) (add brackets)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 112 L 10 # 188
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram
(link_control=ENABLE) * (config = MASTER)

SuggestedRemedy

(link_control = ENABLE) * (config = MASTER) (add spaces around = symbol)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 112 L 31 # 263
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A State Diagram
Figure 146-15: "stop maxwait_timer" should be "start maxwait_timer" to limit the amount of time during which a receiver dwells in the SEND IDLE state

SuggestedRemedy

Change "stop maxwait_timer" to " start maxwait_timer"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 112 L 32 # 189
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
stop maxwait_timer

SuggestedRemedy

start maxwait_timer

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. (dup with comment 263)

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 112 L 42 # 190
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram
rectangular brackets in logical equation

SuggestedRemedy

Remove rectangular opening and closing bracket in condition (there is no nee to group the AND conditions).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use rectangular bracket to enclose the concatenated OR's. Delete opening "[" and final closing ")" and replace "(" with "[" so that arc out of SEND IDLE OR DATA changes from:
"minwait_timer_done * [
(TX_EN = FALSE) * (
(loc_rcvr_status = NOT_OK) +
(rem_rcvr_status= NOT_OK) +
(scr_status = NOT_OK))]"

to

"minwait_timer_done *
(tx_enable_mii = FALSE) *
[(loc_rcvr_status = NOT_OK) +
(rem_rcvr_status= NOT_OK) +
(scr_status = NOT_OK)]"

Cl 146 SC 146.4.5 P 112 L 43 # 192
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A State Diagram
(TX_EN = FALSE)

SuggestedRemedy

(tx_enable_mii = FALSE)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accomplished by comment 190

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 112 L 43 # 191
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram

Opening bracket at the end of the line, space before second closing bracket at the end of the equation.

SuggestedRemedy

Please move opening bracket into next line, please remove space before closing bracket at the end of the equation.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accomplished by 190

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 113 L 6 # 193
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. SEND_I.

SuggestedRemedy

. SEND_I (remove final dot, as in the other "value" sections).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.4 P 113 L 11 # 194
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

. FAIL.

SuggestedRemedy

. FAIL (remove final dot, as in the other "value" sections).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.5.2 P 113 L 17 # 195
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

pma_reset = ON + link_control = DISABLE

SuggestedRemedy

(pma_reset = ON) + (link_control = DISABLE) (add brackets)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.6 P 113 L 44 # 196
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PMA

PMA clock recovery outputs are also used .

SuggestedRemedy

Please remove this sentence.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 113 L 52 # 197
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R State Diagram

Allows reset of all PMA functions.

SuggestedRemedy

Allows reset of all PMA functions, set by PCS Reset.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

If MDIO is present, this is set by PMA/PMD reset. Other phys do not call out the reset MDIO bit.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 113 L 54 # 198
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R State Diagram
Set by: PMA Reset.

SuggestedRemedy
Please remove this line

Response Response Status C
REJECT.
The text is correct.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 3 # 199
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. or DISABLE.

SuggestedRemedy
. or DISABLE (remove dot at the end of the line)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 7 # 200
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. or SLAVE.

SuggestedRemedy
. or SLAVE (remove dot at the end of the line)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 9 # 265
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A State Diagram
link_status is never used in the PHY control state diagram, should be deleted.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the link_status variable definition (line 9-11)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 11 # 201
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. or FAIL.

SuggestedRemedy
. or FAIL (remove dot at the end of the line)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 22 # 202
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R State Diagram
NOT_OK: Reliable operation of the receive function for the remote PHY is not detected.

SuggestedRemedy
NOT_OK: Operation of the receive function for the remote PHY is unreliable. (align this text with loc_rcvr_status)

Response Response Status C
REJECT.
The remote phy and the local phy are different. You have absolute knowledge of the local PHY, the remote PHY needs to be detected.

Cl 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 30 # 203
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. according to the value assumed by this variable.

SuggestedRemedy
. according to the value of this variable.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

l Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 31 # 204
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Text for SEND_N, SEND_I and SEND_Z seems to be unaligned.

SuggestedRemedy

Please align text of SEND_N, SEND_I and SEND_Z.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Align start of 2nd line of each entry.

CI 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 35 # 205
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram

. is to take place.

SuggestedRemedy

. has to take place.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "This value is asserted when transmission of zero code-groups is to take place." to "This value is asserted when transmitting zero code-groups."

CI 146 SC 146.4.7.1 P 114 L 37 # 206
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram

Add variable tx_enable_mii to statemachine variable list.

SuggestedRemedy

tx_enable_mii: The tx_enable_mii variable is generated in the PCS data transmission enabling state diagram as specified in Figure 146-3. When set to FALSE transmission is disabled, when set to TRUE transmission is enabled. Values: TRUE or FALSE

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4.7.2 P 114 L 42 # 207
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs

The timer shall expire TBD after being started.

SuggestedRemedy

The timer shall expire 3000 ms $\pm$ 30 ms after being started. (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 5, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "TBD (suggested are 3000 ms $\pm$ 30 ms, which is the expected maximum training time) after being started" to "3000 ms $\pm$ 30 ms after being started.

CI 146 SC 146.4.7.2 P 114 L 46 # 208
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs

The timer shall expire TBD after being started.

SuggestedRemedy

The timer shall expire 200 ms $\pm$ 2 ms after being started. (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 8, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "TBD (suggested are 200 ms $\pm$ 2 ms, this is the maximum time the PHY should try to recover a failed link, e.g. during a power disturbance, before a complete retraining is started) after being started." to "200 ms $\pm$ 2 ms after being started."

CI 146 SC 146.4.7 P 114 L 47 # 264
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram

The whole clause should be under the Clause 146.4.4 PHY Control Function

SuggestedRemedy

Move the contents of Clause146.4.7.1 and Clause 146.4.7.2 under Clause 146.4.4, delete "state diagram" sub title.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment 185

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 146 SC 146.4.7.2 P 114 L 51 # 209
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
The timer shall expire TBD after being started.

SuggestedRemedy

The timer shall expire 20 μ s $\pm$ 1 μ s after being started. (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 9, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change "TBD (suggested are 20 is $\pm$ 1 is, this timer limits the toggle rate between "SEND IDLE" and "SEND IDLE OR DATA" states and allows stabilization of the status variables, the timer is chosen, in a way that a toggling to "SEND IDLE" and back does not destroy more than one 64 byte telegram) after being started."

to "20 μ s $\pm$ 1 μ s after being started. "

CI 146 SC 146.5.1 P 115 L 16 # 210
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
1500

SuggestedRemedy

150 O

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
(insert nonbreaking space between 150 and Ohm symbol)

CI 146 SC 146.5.2 P 115 L 39 # 211
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
1.xxxx.xx:xx

SuggestedRemedy

1.2298.15:13

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "The test modes can be enabled by setting bits 1.xxxx.xx:xx (10BASE-T1L PMA/PMD Test Control Register) of the PHY Management register set as described in 45.2.1.xxx."
to
"The test modes can be enabled by setting bits 1.2298.15:13 (10BASE-T1L Test Mode Control Register) of the PHY Management register set as described in 45.2.1.174e."

CI 146 SC 146.5.2 P 115 L 40 # 212
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
45.2.1.xxx

SuggestedRemedy

45.2.1.174e

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Accomplished by 211

CI 146 SC 146.5.2 P 115 L 44 # 213
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PSD
Transmitter output voltage, timing jitter, rise and fall times test mode

SuggestedRemedy

Transmitter output voltage and timing jitter test mode (the change of this text depends on the decision of the group about specifying the transmitter in time domain or by PSD mask, see presentation "10BASE-T1L PSD Mask").

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.3 P 116 L 10 # 214
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PMA
100 O $\pm$ 1 %

SuggestedRemedy

100 O $\pm$ 0.1 % (as stated in the text)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace 1 % with 0.1 % in Figure 146-17

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 146 SC 146.5.3 P 116 L 15 # 215
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA
. resistance > 10 kO

SuggestedRemedy

. resistance > 100 kO (100 kO cause 0.1 % measurement error, when compared to 100 O, thus it makes sense to increase the input impedance from 10 k to 100 k to reduce the measurement error caused by the differential probe)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace 10 k with 100 k in Figure 146-17

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.1 P 116 L 41 # 216
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PSD
See also 146.5.4.6 . test pattern.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove this sentence (the change of this text depends on the decision of the group about specifying the transmitter in time domain or by PSD mask, see presentation "10BASE-T1L PSD Mask").

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.1 P 116 L 45 # 217
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA
Fixed transmitter driving levels . described in 45.2.1.xxx.

SuggestedRemedy

The transmitter driving level can be selected by setting bit 1.2294.12 (10BASE-T1L PMA control register) of the PHY Management register set as described in 45.2.1.174a.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change "Fixed transmitter driving levels can be selected by setting bits 1.xxxx.xx:xx (10BASE-T1L PMA/PMD Control Register) of the PHY Management register set as described in 45.2.1.xxx." to
"The transmitter driving level can be selected by setting bit 1.2294.12 (10BASE-T1L PMA control register) of the PHY Management register set as described in 45.2.1.174a."

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.1 P 117 L 4 # 218
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA
Editor's Note about tutorial text and next paragraph (tutorial text itself)

SuggestedRemedy

Proposal is to remove the text and add a new insertion loss limit in chapter 146.7.1.1 for PHYs using a reduced driving level of $IL(f) = 8.61 * \sqrt{f} + 0.07 * f + 1.4/\sqrt{f} + 4 * 0.02 * \sqrt{f}$. A driving level of 1 V instead of 2.4 V is causing 7.6 dB less SNR, per 100 m of the 10BASE-T1L link segment the attenuation is 2.6 dB @ Nyquist, thus reducing the cable length by 300 m will lead to a reduction of the IL of 7.8 dB at Nyquist thus fitting to the lower driving level of the PHY transmitters. For the link segment being valid for the reduced driving levels only 4 inline connectors are assumed. All other parameters of the link segment characteristics may stay the same.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete Editor's note at line 4 and subsequent paragraph at lines 10-14. (assuming insertion loss proposal is in cabling part)

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.2 P 117 L 17 # 219
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
Output Droop is TBD

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the TBDs by: The transmitter output droop shall be less than 20 % taking the inner 9 bit times of the 10 bit times pulse duration (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 11, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation). Depending, if the group decides to specify a PSD mask or to specify the transmitter in time domain, it is also possible, that the transmitter droop specification is replaced by a PSD mask definition, see presentation "10BASE-T1L PSD Mask"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "The transmitter output droop shall be less than TBD (suggested are 20 %) taking the inner TBD (suggested are 9 bit times) of the TBD (suggested are 10 bit times) pulse duration."

to "The transmitter output droop shall be less than 20 % taking the inner 9 bit times of the 10 bit times pulse duration"

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.5.4.3 P 117 L 35 # 220
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA
Editor's Note

SuggestedRemedy

Keep the ± 10 ns Jitter tolerance. (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 12, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete Editor's note.

Cl 146 SC 146.5.4.4 P 117 L 40 # 221
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PSD
Transmitter rise and fall times specification.

SuggestedRemedy

Depending on the groups decision, if a transmitter PSD mask definition of a time domain definition is chosen, see presentation "10BASE-T1L PSD Mask", this chapter will be replaced by a PSD mask definition. If the group decides to stay with the time domain definition, then the rise and fall times may be specified for a significantly wider range, suggested is range for the rise and fall times (10 to 90 %) of 13.333 ns to 53.333 ns (which is 1/8 to 1/2 symbol time for a 0 to 100 % transition, which also is reflected in the PSD mask simulations). Reason for this is that the rise and fall times have shown to be much less critical than initially thought. The current FPGA based evaluaton board, which initially used a rise and fall time of 53.333 ns in the meantime was changed for a rise and fall time of 26.666 ns, which produced a slightly better signal quality (less remaining error at the slicer input), without having a negative influence on the clock recovery.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace transmitter rise and fall time specification with PSD mask as described in comment 222.

Cl 146 SC 146.5.4.6 P 118 L 17 # 222
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PSD
Normalized test patterns.

SuggestedRemedy

Depending on the groups decision, if a transmitter PSD mask definition of a time domain definition is chosen, see presentation "10BASE-T1L PSD Mask", this chapter will be replaced by a PSD mask definition. If the group decides to stay with the time domain transmitter definitions, then the tolerance for the rise and fall times may be widened, see also previous comment (page 117, 146.5.4.4, line 40).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace test patterns with a PSD mask as described in presentation and mark with an Editor's note - "to be removed prior to Working Group ballot - The values of the mask and power level are TBD and commenters are encouraged to review and comment on them."

Cl 146 SC 146.5.5 P 121 L 24 # 223
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
The PMA shall meet the Receive function specified in .

SuggestedRemedy

The PMA shall meet the requirements specified in .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.5.5 P 121 L 25 # 224
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
The link segment used in test configurations .

SuggestedRemedy

The link segment used in the test configurations .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.5.5.2 P 121 L 36 # 225
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

The receiver feature shall .

SuggestedRemedy

The receiver shall .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.5.5.3 P 121 L 46 # 226
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs

Gaussian Noise TBDs.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the TBDs by: . with Gaussian distribution, bandwidth of 10 MHz and magnitude of -106 dBm/Hz. (see presentation Graber_3cg_14_0917.pdf)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "with Gaussian distribution, bandwidth of TBD MHz and magnitude of -TBD dBm/Hz."

to "with Gaussian distribution, bandwidth of 10 MHz and magnitude of -106 dBm/Hz."

and make identical change in NOTE on page 122, line 17:

Change from "The noise signal fed into the receiver shall have a magnitude of TBD (suggested are

-106 dBm/Hz, needs further analysis) with a bandwidth of TBD (suggested are 10 MHz) taking the 100 ohm termination within the PHY into account."

to "The noise signal fed into the receiver shall have a magnitude of -106 dBm/Hz with a bandwidth of 10 MHz taking the 100 ohm termination within the PHY into account."

Cl 146 SC 146.5.5.3 P 122 L 7 # 227
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D PMA

500 O resistor values

SuggestedRemedy

Currently in the draft there is only a noise test for Gaussian noise, as the test for the alien noise crosstalk test as defined in the document 10BASE-T1L Clause 164 Rev. F.pdf has not yet been agreed by the group. Depending, if this test is intended to be used or not, it would make sense to change the resistor values to 3 kO to be able to connect a 10BASE-T1L PHY in master mode to do the test and to adapt the driver levels to the intended alien noise level. (see also presentation Graber_3cg_14_0917.pdf)

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

The change in resistor values appears to be suggested only if we use additionally a test with a master PHY connected to sum as a noise source; however, that test is not in the document, and it would need a new figure if it were.

Cl 146 SC 146.5.5.3 P 122 L 16 # 228
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs

Gaussian Noise TBDs.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the TBDs by: . shall have a magnitude of -106 dBm/Hz with a bandwidth of 10 MHz taking the ... (see presentation Graber_3cg_14_0917.pdf)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment 226

l Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.5.6 P 122 L 32 # 229
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
. shall be less than TBD for the normal driving levels and TBD for the reduced driving levels

SuggestedRemedy

. shall be less than 2.76 Vpp for the normal driving levels and less than 1.15 V for the reduced driving levels . (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 13, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "shall be less than TBD
(suggested are 2.76 V peak-to-peak) for the normal driving levels and TBD (suggested are 1.15 V peak-to-peak)
for the reduced driving levels"
to
"shall be less than 2.76 Vpp for the normal driving levels and 1.15 Vpp for the reduced driving levels"

Cl 146 SC 146.5.6 P 122 L 35 # 230
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. modes..

SuggestedRemedy

. modes. (remove second dot).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.5.7 P 122 L 44 # 231
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA
. shall be placed in local loopback mode when the PMA local loopback bit in MDIO register 1.0.0, defined in 45.2.1.1, is set to a one .

SuggestedRemedy

. shall be placed in local loopback mode when the PMA local loopback bit in MDIO register 1.0.0, defined in 45.2.1.1, or the PMA loopback bit in MDIO register 1.2294.13, defined in 45.2.1.174a, is set to a one .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change "shall be placed in local loopback mode when the PMA local loopback bit in MDIO register 1.0.0, defined in 45.2.1.1, is set to a one ."
to
"shall be placed in local loopback mode when the PMA local loopback bit in MDIO register 1.0.0, defined in 45.2.1.1, or the PMA loopback bit in MDIO register 1.2294.13, defined in 45.2.1.174a, is set to a one."

Cl 146 SC 146.6.1 P 123 L 35 # 232
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. is undefined..

SuggestedRemedy

. is undefined. (remove second dot at the end of the sentence).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.6.2 P 123 L 49 # 233
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ
When MDIO is implemented, . as described in 45.2.1.xxx.

SuggestedRemedy

When MDIO is implemented, MASTER/SLAVE mode can be selected by setting bit 1.2100.14 (BASE-T1 PMA/PMD control register) of the PHY Management register set as described in 45.2.1.131.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

l Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.6.3 P 124 L 1 # 234
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R Editorial

MDIO mapping table

SuggestedRemedy

Suggestion is to remove this table as the information is redundant to te information in Clause 45 and also to the information in other 146 chapters. If the decision will be that chapter 146.6.3 is not being removed, then the register definitions need to be updated to reflect all relevant registers at other positions of Clause 146 and the 10BASE-T1L section of Clause 45.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

These tables are helpful and common in 802.3. Need content to revise table contents.

Cl 146 SC 146.7 P 124 L 26 # 7
 Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

Need to use terminology consistent with the PAR, CSD, and objectives. Also it is more than cable that forms a link segment, it is cabling including cable, connectors, and cords.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "a single twisted-pair copper cable" to " single balanced pair cabling"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use terminolgy consistent with Amendment:
 Physical Layer Specifications and
 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s
 Operation over Single Balanced
 Twisted-pair Cabling and Associated
 Power Delivery.

Change: The single twisted-pair copper cable
 To: The single balanced twisted-pair cabling

Editorial license to change instances of "single twisted-pair copper cable"
 to "single balanced twisted-pair cabling" when referring to link segment.

Cl 146 SC 146.7 P 124 L 27 # 8
 Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

Need to use terminology consistent with the PAR, CSD, and objectives. Also it is more than cable that forms a link segment, it is cabling including cable, connectors, and cords.

SuggestedRemedy

change "single twisted-pair copper cable" to " single balanced pair cabling"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved with comment#7

Cl 146 SC 146.7 P 124 L 28 # 9
 Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

Need to use terminology consistent with the PAR, CSD, and objectives. Also it is more than cable that forms a link segment, it is cabling including cable, connectors, and cords.

SuggestedRemedy

Change " single twisted-pair copper cable" to " single balanced pair cabling"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved with comment#7

Cl 146 SC 146.7 P 124 L 31 # 235
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Cabling

A link segment is specified based on process control applications that supports up to ten in-line connectors .

SuggestedRemedy

The link segment is specified based on process control applications and supports up to ten in-line connectors .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 **SC 146.7** **P 124** **L 32** # **10**
 Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T **Comment Status A** **Cabling**

Need to use terminology consistent with the PAR, CSD, and objectives. Also it is more than cable that forms a link segment, it is cabling including cable, connectors, and cords.

SuggestedRemedy

Change " single twisted-pair copper cable" to " single balanced pair cabling"

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Resolved with comment#7

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1** **P 124** **L 34** # **11**
 Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type ER **Comment Status A** **Cabling**

Use consistent terminology to avoid confusion

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Link transmission parameters for 10BASE-T1L" to"Link segment transmission parameters for 10BASE-T1L"

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1.1** **P 124** **L 40** # **236**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T **Comment Status D** **Cabling**

Insertion loss definition for PHYs using reduced transmitter driving levels.

SuggestedRemedy

We need to discuss, if we want to add another IL definition for a link segment being used in conjunction with PHYs with reduced transmitter driving levels. Sugestion is to add a new insertion loss limit in chapter 146.7.1.1 for PHYs using a reduced driving level of $IL(f) = 8.61 * \sqrt{f} + 0.07 * f + 1.4/\sqrt{f} + 4 * 0.02 * \sqrt{f}$. A driving level of 1 V instead of 2.4 V is causing 7.6 dB less SNR, per 100 m of the 10BASE-T1L link segment the attenuation is 2.6 dB @ Nyquist, thus reducing the cable length by 300 m will lead to a reduction of the IL of 7.8 dB at Nyquist thus fitting to the lower driving level of the PHY transmitters. For the link segment being valid for the reduced driving levels only 4 inline connectors are assumed. All other parameters of the link segment characteristins may stay the same.

Proposed Response **Response Status Z**

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1.1** **P 124** **L 43** # **3**
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type T **Comment Status R** **Cabling**

It may be difficult to make swept frequency measurements with existing balun set-ups below 300 kHz.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert new sentence, "Insertion loss values below 0.3 MHz are for information only."

Response **Response Status C**

REJECT.

The insertion loss determined using Equation (146-6) where f is the frequency in MHz ($0.1 \leq f \leq 20$ MHz) is a requirement i.e., "shall" be met.

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1.1** **P 124** **L 45** # **237**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T **Comment Status R** **Cabling**

IL formula.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: $Insertion\ loss(f) = 12.3 * \sqrt{f} + 0.1 * f + 2 / \sqrt{f} + 10 * 0.02 * \sqrt{f}$. Reason for the proposed change is, that we should specify the IL independent form the length of the link segment and that the multiplier with 10 for the cable (10 x 100 m) implicit specifies the length (as 10 x 100 m). For different wire diameters this could be different, so the idea is to multiply the 10 into the other coefficients of the IL definition.

Response **Response Status C**

REJECT.

No consensus to change:

Support comment A19

Don't support comment B12

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.1 P 125 L 3 # 238
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling
Insertion loss diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

There seems to be some approximation in the calculated insertion loss for the low frequency range (e.g. at 100 kHz the Equation 146-6 gives 10.3 dB of IL, while Figure 146-22 shows approx. 5 dB of IL. As the cable behavior is more likely than shown in Figure 146-22, the question is, if we need to adopt the IL Equation 146-6 in the low frequency range to adopt the behavior of the real cable.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Error in the Figure 146-22 matlab plotting function. Figure to be regenerated with correct Equation 146-6 values.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.1 P 125 L 27 # 12
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type ER Comment Status A Cabling
Redundant text that says the same thing described in linwa 42 - 50 on page 124

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "The insertion loss for the link segment calculated using Equation (146-6) accounts for the insertion loss of a single twisted-pair copper cable and ten in-line connectors within each link segment."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.2 P 125 L 30 # 303
DiMinico, Christopher MC Communication

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling
Characteristic impedance is not directly measureable and represents the input impedance of transmission line with nonreflecting terminations.
The differential return loss of a link segment can be determined from measurements of the scattering parameter SDD11/SDD22. It sufficiently characterizes the difference between the incident power and the reflected power relative to a specified reference impedance (100 ohms).

SuggestedRemedy

Delete 146.7.1.2 Differential characteristic impedance link segment parameter.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.2 P 125 L 30 # 239
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling
Differential characteristic impedance definition.

SuggestedRemedy

Based on the actual RL specification the allowed differential impedance range for the cable is 80 to 120 ohms. Due to the existance of some cables with a wider characteristic impedance range, going down to even 70 ohms (e.g. Belden 3076F), we have to decide, if we want to support such cables and thereforinspecify 70 to 130 ohms. In this case we also need to discuss, what maximum change of characteristic impedance at the in-line connectors we want to allow between two link segment sections. My personal view is to limit this to 20 ohms difference in characteristic impedance at maximum, while otherwise, this would cause significant reflections, which not only burden the echo canceller but also significantly increase the IL of the link segment thus significantly reducing the maximum possible link segment length.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolved with comment#303.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.2 P 125 L 32 # 13
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status D Cabling
Replance editors note with characteristic impedance

SuggestedRemedy

The characteristic impedance is specified in equation 146 -7

Characteristic impedance is 100 ohms for $1 \leq f \leq 20 \text{ MHz}$ (146-7)

$100 + iX$ for $0.1 \leq f < 1 \text{ MHz}$ (TBD)

where the characteristic impedance changes from a real number to a complex number below 1 MHz

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1.3** **P 125** **L 38** # **240**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T **Comment Status A** **Cabling**

Link segment return loss definition.

SuggestedRemedy

The return loss specification is based on a cable with a characteristic impedance of 80 to 120 ohms being connected to a 100 ohms reference impedance. As in the meantime some cables (e.g.Belden 3076F) are known, which have a characteristic impedance in the interesting frequency range going down to 70 ohms, we have to think about the maximum tolerable return loss (e.g. to take 15 dB instead of 19 dB into account for 1 MHz to 20 MHz). Nevertheless, even, if the return loss of such cables is quite bad in the frequency range above 1 MHz, in the lower frequency range the RL is quite good, as these cables are optimized for low frequency applications, which would mean, that for the lower frequency range we should keep the existing RL specification (or could even improve it).

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The link segment is specified based on process control applications. The commentor reports that some cable types used in these applications exhibit return loss of 15 dB between 1 MHz to 20 MHz.

In 146.7.1.3 Return loss

Add editor's note >>Editor's Note (to be removed prior to draft 2.0):

The Task Force is assessing the need to change the return loss to support cables reported by commentor with return loss of 15 dB between 1 MHz to 20 MHz.

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1.3** **P 125** **L 41** # **14**
 Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T **Comment Status D** **Cabling**

The characteristic impedance below 1 MHz complex and its magnitude has been shown to be below 100 ohms. Also need to use consistent terminology.

SuggestedRemedy

Change" The reference impedance for the return loss specification is 100 ohms" to "The reference characteristic impedance for the return loss specification is specified in clause 146.7.1.2"

Proposed Response **Response Status Z**

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1.3** **P 125** **L 42** # **4**
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type T **Comment Status R** **Cabling**

It may be difficult to make swept frequency measurements with existing balun set-ups below 300 kHz.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert new sentence, "Return loss values below 0.3 MHz are for information only."

Response **Response Status C**

REJECT. The Return loss determined using Equation (146-7) where f is the frequency in MHz ($0.1 \leq f \leq 20$ MHz) is a requirement i.e., "shall" be met.

Cl 146 **SC 146.7.1.3** **P 125** **L 46** # **21**
 Schicketanz, Dieter Reutlingen University

Comment Type T **Comment Status A** **Cabling**

Return loss of 10-SPE-1000m link was presented by Fritsche.Schicketanz in 2016 and the high frequency limit was never reviewed. The low frequency was expanded in March 2017 by C.DiMinico. Measurements done showed that the frequency portion from 10 MHz to 20 MHz does not follow reality and also deviates from general cable and link limits. A measurement was presented in page 2 Schicketanz_122017_10SPE_01_adhoc.pdf at the webex Dec 20-2018

SuggestedRemedy

replace in equation 146-7 second line 20 by 10 and add a third line $24-5\log(f) 10 < f < 20$

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved with comment#240

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.4 P 126 L 26 # 305
DiMinico, Christopher MC Communication

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

The electromagnetic environments in 146.7.1 need to correspond to link segment paramters.

SuggestedRemedy

insert after 146.7.1.4 subclause 146.7.1.5 Coupling attenuation
The coupling attenuation requirements of the link segment depend on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements in Table xx-xx shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 146-8, E1, E2, or E3. The coupling attenuation is tested as specified in IEC 62153-4-14.

When the PSANEXT (146.7.2.2) and PSAFEXT (146.7.2.3) for a link segment are met, the coupling attenuation limits are met by design.

Table xx-xx to be similar to Table 97-14 with F(MHz)=30 MHz, E1=40 dB, E2=50 dB, and E3=60 dB

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
insert after 146.7.1.4 subclause 146.7.1.5 Coupling attenuation
The coupling attenuation requirements of the link segment depend on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements in Table xx-xx shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 146-8, E1, E2, or E3. The coupling attenuation is tested as specified in IEC 62153-4-14.

Table xx-xx to be similar to Table 97-14 with f(MHz)=TBD MHz, E1=TBD dB, E2=TBD dB, and E3=TBD dB.

Editors note that in Table146-8 the radiated RF min f(MHz) is 80 MHz and 10BASE-T1L link segment max f(MHz) is 20 MHz. The basis for coupling attenuation TBDs are the electromagnetic environment is not adequitely specified; propose TBDs for Radiated RF - AM E1, E2, and E3 as placeholders.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.4 P 126 L 27 # 241
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

Maximum link delay (TBD)

SuggestedRemedy

Suggestion is to specify a maximum link delay of 7500 ns for all frequencies between 1 MHz to 20 MHz (align the link segment delay time with the delay time defined in Clause 98, assuming 5 ns per meter this would allow 1500 m, assuming 5.5 ns per meter this would allow approx. 1360 m, which allows for some additional cable length, e.g. using larger wire diameters). If the group decides to use another link delay time also Clause 98 needs to be adopted accordingly.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolve with comment#304

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.4 P 126 L 28 # 22
Schicketanz, Dieter Reutlingen University

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

At the moment no link delay specified

SuggestedRemedy

suggest to replace the TBD by 5500 ns at 3.75 MHz

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolve with comment#304

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.4 P 126 L 29 # 15
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type TR Comment Status A Cabling

Missing delay specification

SuggestedRemedy

The propagation delay of a 10BASE-T1L link segment shall not exceed 5500 ns at 3.75 MHz.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolved with comment#304

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 127 L 11 # 16
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

Missing TCL parameter related to the MICE table 146-8. The values proposed are from ISO 11801-1, 2017

SuggestedRemedy

TCL for unshielded single balanced pair cabling installed in E1, E2, and E3 MICE environments shall meet or exceed the values in table XX

Table XX

Frequency E1 E2 E3
1 <= f < =20 53 - 15lg(f) 63 - 15lg(f) 73 - 15lg(f)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved with comment#24.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 127 L 11 # 24
Schicketanz, Dieter Reutlingen University

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

TCL and ELTCTL missing

SuggestedRemedy

Add a subclause below line 11 page 127: 146.7.1.5.2 Mode conversion loss of unshielded link segments. The mode conversion requirements of unshielded link segments depend on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements in Table 146-8-B shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 145-8, E1, E2, or E3. Add a table 146-8-B with values as presented in Schicketanz_122017_10SPE_01_adhoc.pdf page8

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. insert after 146.7.1.4 subclause Differential to common mode conversion. The mode conversion requirements of unshielded link segments depend on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements of Table xx-xx 146-8-B shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 145-8, E1, E2, or E3. Add a table Table xx-xx with TBDs instead of proposed values as presented in Schicketanz_122017_10SPE_01_adhoc.pdf.

Note that in Table 146-8 the radiated RF min f(MHz) is 80 MHz and 10BASE-T1L link segment max f(MHz) is 20 MHz. The basis for mode conversion TBDs are the electromagnetic environment is not adequately specified.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 127 L 11 # 18
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

Missing coupling attenuation parameter related to the MICE table 146-8. The values proposed are from ISO 11801-1, 2017

SuggestedRemedy

Coupling attenuation for shielded single balaanced pair cabling installed in E1, E2, and E3 MICE environments shall meet or exceed the values in table ZZ

Table ZZ

Frequency E1 E2 E3
30 <= f <= 100 40 50 60

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Resolve with comment#305

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 127 L 11 # 23
Schicketanz, Dieter Reutlingen University

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

As the editor mentions coupling attenuation missing

SuggestedRemedy

Add a subclause at line 11 page 127: 146.7.1.5.1 coupling attenuation of shielded link segments.
The coupling attenuation requirements of shielded link segments depend on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements in Table 146-8-A shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 145-8, E1, E2, or E3. The coupling attenuation is tested as specified in IEC 62153-4-14. Add a table 146-8-A with values 40,50,60 dBat 30 MHz like presented in Schicketanz_122017_10SPE_01_adhoc.pdf page7

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Resolved with comment#305.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 127 L 11 # 17
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status A Cabling

Missing ELTCTL parameter related to the MICE table 146-8. The values proposed are from ISO 11801-1, 2017

SuggestedRemedy

ELTCTL for unshielded single balanced pair cabling insgtalled in E1, E2, and E3 MICE environments shall meet or exceed the values in table YY

Table YY

Frequency E1 E2 E3

1 <=f <= 20 30 - 20lg(f) 40 - 20lg (f) 50 - 20lg (f)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolved with comment#24.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.2.2 P 127 L 41 # 5
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type T Comment Status R Cabling

It may be difficult to make swept frequency measurements with existing balun set-ups below 300 kHz.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert new sentence, "PSANEXT loss values below 0.3 MHz are for information only."

Response Response Status C

REJECT. The PSANEXT loss determined using Equation (146-9) where f is the frequency in MHz (0.1<= f<=20 MHz) is a requirement i.e., "shall" be met.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.2.2 P 127 L 44 # 19
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status D Cabling

Use the alien near end crosstalk specification from ISO 11801-1 for Category 6A, which is the minimum Category with alien cross talk specifications

SuggestedRemedy

Change to PSANEXT >= 60 - 10 log (f/100)

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.2.3 P 128 L 16 # 6
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type T Comment Status R Cabling

It may be difficult to make swept frequency measurements with existing balun set-ups below 300 kHz.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert new sentence, "PSAFEXT loss values below 0.3 MHz are for information only."

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

The PAFEXT loss determined using Equation (146-11) where f is the frequency in MHz (0.1<= f<=20 MHz) is a requirement i.e., "shall" be met.

Cl 146 SC 146.7.2.3 P 128 L 18 # 20
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type T Comment Status D Cabling

Use the alien far end crosstalk specification from ISO 11801-1 for Category 6A, which is the minimum Category with alien cross talk specifications

SuggestedRemedy

Use PSAFEXT >= 37 - 20 log (f/100)

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 **SC 146.8** **P 128** **L 25** # **371**
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A** **Late**
Text for clause 146.8 (MDI specification) is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Add text proposed in document "Clause 146 Proposed Additional Text.pdf" for the mentioned clause(s).

Response **Response Status** **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Incorporate text for review, without acceptance, on pages 3 and 4 of "Clause 146 Proposed Additional Text.pdf" for 146.8 (and subclauses) with the following Editor's note: "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot): The following text was added to D1.1 for Task Force Review, WITHOUT ACCEPTANCE, because it is substantial new matter. Reviewers are encouraged to comment and propose acceptance or modification in the Task Force review process."

Cl 146 **SC 146.9.2** **P 129** **L 1** # **372**
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A** **Late**
Text for clause 146.9.2 (Network safety) is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Add text proposed in document "Clause 146 Proposed Additional Text.pdf" for the mentioned clause(s).

Response **Response Status** **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Incorporate text for review, without acceptance, on pages 4 and 2 of "Clause 146 Proposed Additional Text.pdf" for 146.1.2.1, 146.1.2.2, 146.1.2.3, 146.1.3 (and subclauses), and 146.2 (and subclauses) with the following Editor's note: "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot): The following text was added to D1.1 for Task Force Review, WITHOUT ACCEPTANCE, because it is substantial new matter. Reviewers are encouraged to comment and propose acceptance or modification in the Task Force review process."

Cl 146 **SC 146.10** **P 129** **L 15** # **242**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A** **TBDs**
Missing max. transmit delay time.

SuggestedRemedy

The delay for the transmit path, from the MII input to the MDI, shall be less than 3.2 μ s (32 bit times). Current FPGA based evaluation board takes approx. 20 bit times, so 32 bit times seems to provide enough headroom for different implementations. Assuming the suggested transmit and receive delays they add up to approx. 10 μ s, for a ring consisting of 100 PHYs, the max. delay within a ring caused by the PHYs adds up to approx. 1 ms round trip time.

Response **Response Status** **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change lines 15-17 from:

"The delay for the transmit path, from the MII input to the MDI, shall be less than TBD (suggested are 3.2 μ s (32 bit times), current implementation on evaluation board takes about 20 bit times maximum)."

to: "The delay for the transmit path, from the MII input to the MDI, shall be less than 3.2 μ s (32 bit times)."

Cl 146 **SC 146.1** **P 129** **L 17** # **243**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A** **TBDs**
Missing max. receive delay time.

SuggestedRemedy

The delay for the receive path, from the MDI to the MII output, shall be less than 6.4 μ s (64 bit times). Current FPGA based evaluation board takes approx. 50 bit times, so 64 bit times seem to provide enough headroom for different implementations. Assuming the suggested transmit and receive delays they add up to approx. 10 μ s, for a ring consisting of 100 PHYs, the max. delay within a ring caused by the PHYs adds up to approx. 1 ms round trip time.

Response **Response Status** **C**
ACCEPT.

Change lines 18-19 from:

"The delay for the receive path, from the MDI to the MII output, shall be less than TBD (suggested are 6.4 is (64 bit times))."

to:

"The delay for the receive path, from the MDI to the MII output, shall be less than 6.4 μ s (64 bit times)."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl **146** SC **146.11.1** P **130** L **8** # **124**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 10BASE-T1
 SuggestedRemedy
 10BASE-T1L
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **146** SC **146.11.2.2** P **131** L **6** # **125**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 10BASE-T1
 SuggestedRemedy
 10BASE-T1L
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **146** SC **146.11.3** P **131** L **38** # **126**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 TBD
 SuggestedRemedy
 146.5.4.1
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.
 (Change "TBD" to 146.5.4.1 (cross ref))

Cl **146** SC **146.11.3** P **131** L **40** # **127**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 98
 SuggestedRemedy
 78
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.
 (Change ref to Clause 78)

Cl **146** SC **146.11.4.1.1** P **132** L **14** # **128**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 See Table 146-1
 SuggestedRemedy
 See Equation 146-1
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.
 (change cross ref to Equation 146-1 from Table 146-1)

Cl **146** SC **146.11.4.1.1** P **132** L **16** # **129**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 See Table 146-2
 SuggestedRemedy
 See Equation 146-2
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.
 (Change cross ref from Table to Equation)

Cl **146** SC **146.11.4.1.1** P **132** L **19** # **130**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 Nevr initialized .
 SuggestedRemedy
 Never initialized .
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **146** SC **146.11.4.1.2** P **133** L **25** # **131**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 ALSE
 SuggestedRemedy
 FALSE
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.1.2 P 133 L 31 # 132
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
See Figure 146-4

SuggestedRemedy
See Equation 146-4

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
Change Cross ref from Figure to Equation

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.1.2 P 133 L 33 # 133
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
See Figure 146-5

SuggestedRemedy
See Equation 146-5

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
(change cross ref from Figure to Equation)

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.1 P 134 L 35 # 134
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Set pma_rest = ON .

SuggestedRemedy
Set pma_reset = ON .

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.1 P 134 L 38 # 135
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
146.4.2

SuggestedRemedy
Change text formatting/size to standard

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.1 P 134 L 44 # 136
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
TBD

SuggestedRemedy
3000 ms (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 5, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(Align with change to TBD in 146.4.4, comment 183)

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 135 L 10 # 244
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Enable by setting bits 1.xxxx.xx:xx as described in 45.2.1.xxx when MDIO implemented .

SuggestedRemedy
Enable by setting bits 1.2298.15:13 as described in 45.2.1.174e when MDIO implemented .

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 135 L 31 # 137
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A PMA
100 O $\pm$ 1 %

SuggestedRemedy
100 O $\pm$ 0.1 % (please adopt also formatting to standard text)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 135 L 39 # 138
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
100 O $\pm$ 1 %

SuggestedRemedy
100 O $\pm$ 0.1 % (please adopt also formatting to standard text)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 135 L 41 # 139
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
., connected to the trans-mitter output.

SuggestedRemedy

., connected to the transmitter output.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 3 # 245
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ
Default setting chosen by . otherwise.

SuggestedRemedy

Default setting chosen by Auto-Negotiation, if Auto-Negotiation is disabled or not available, by setting bit 1.2294.12 as described in 45.2.1.174a when MDIO implemented, similar functionality provided otherwise

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
Change "1.xxxx.xx.xx as described in 45.2.1.xxx" to "1.2294.12 as described in 45.2.1.174a"

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 9 # 246
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
Less than TBD

SuggestedRemedy

Less than 20 % when measured on test mode 2 (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 11, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Align with 146.5.4.2, comment 219

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 14 # 247
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A PSD
TBD when measured on test mode 1

SuggestedRemedy

Remove and replace by PSD mask limits (the change of this text depends on the decision of the group about specifying the transmitter in time domain or by PSD mask, see presentation "10BASE-T1L PSD Mask").

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace time domain template PICS with new transmitter PSD mask PICS

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 17 # 140
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
7.5 MBd ± 50 ppm

SuggestedRemedy

Change formatting to standard text formatting.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change font size of MBd ± 50 ppm to match the rest of the text.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 24 # 141
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
7.5 MBd ± 50 ppm

SuggestedRemedy

Change formatting to standard text formatting.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change font size of MBd ± 50 ppm to match the rest of the text.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 25 # 248
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
Magnitude of TBD with a bandwidth of TBD

SuggestedRemedy

Magnitude of -106 dBm/Hz with a bandwidth of 10 MHz (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 13, -106 dBm/Hz provide 8 dB margin to the FPGA based evaluation board, other noise measurement setups need to be discussed within the group)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(align with comment 226)

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 28 # 249
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
Less than TBD

SuggestedRemedy

Less than 2.76 Vpp for normal transmit level and 1.15 Vpp for reduced transmit level (Graber_3cg_18_1117.pdf, page 13, results of discussions in Orlando about this presentation)

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Align with comment 229

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 136 L 30 # 250
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. in MDIO register 1.0.0, defined in 45.2.1.1, is set to a one.

SuggestedRemedy

. in MDIO register 1.0.0, defined in 45.2.1.1, or in MDIO register 1.2294.13, defined in 45.2.1.174a is set to a one.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.3 P 137 L 6 # 142
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
. by management of hardware configuration .

SuggestedRemedy

. by management or hardware configuration .

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "of" to "or"

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.3 P 137 L 15 # 251
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ
Default setting chosen by . otherwise.

SuggestedRemedy

Default setting chosen by Auto-Negotiation, if Auto-Negotiation is disabled or not available, by setting bit 1.2100.14 as described in 45.2.1.131 when MDIO implemented, similar functionality provided otherwise

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.4 P 137 L 34 # 252
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A TBDs
Not exceed TBD for all frequencies between 1 MHz to 20 MHz.

SuggestedRemedy

Not exceed 7500 ns for all frequencies between 1 MHz to 20 MHz (align the link segment delay time with the delay time defined in Clause 98, assuming 5 ns per meter this would allow 1500 m, assuming 5.5 ns per meter this would allow approx. 1360 m, which allows for some additional cable length, e.g. using larger wire diameters). If the group decides to use another link delay time also Clause 98 needs to be adopted accordingly.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Align with change to 146.7.1.4

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl **146** SC **146.11.4.6** P **138** L **25** # **253**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T** Comment Status **A** TBDs
 Less than TBD

SuggestedRemedy

Less than 3.2 µs (32 bit times)

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **146** SC **146.11.4.6** P **138** L **26** # **254**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T** Comment Status **A** TBDs
 Less than TBD

SuggestedRemedy

Less than 6.4 µs (64 bit times)

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **147** SC **147.1** P **139** L **9** # **144**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** Editorial
 . 10BASE-T1S Physical Layer (PHY).

SuggestedRemedy

.. 10BASE-T1S Physical Layer Device (PHY).

Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **147** SC **147.1** P **139** L **13** # **145**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** Editorial
 10BASET1S

SuggestedRemedy

10BASE-T1S

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.
 Change "10BASET1S" to "10BASE-T1S"

Cl **147** SC **147.1** P **139** L **19** # **146**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** EZ
 A 10BASE-T1S that supports .

SuggestedRemedy

A 10BASE-T1S PHY that supports .

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.
 Change "10BASE-T1S that" to "10BASE-T1S PHY that"

Cl **147** SC **147.1.2** P **139** L **44** # **147**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** Editorial
 . with up to 10cm stubs, .

SuggestedRemedy

. with up to 10 cm stubs, .

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.
 Change "10cm" to "10 cm"
 Note: The newly added space (to between "10" and "cm") is preferred to be a single <non-breaking white-space> character, to keep the clause consistent

l Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 147 SC 147.1.2 P 139 L 47 # 266
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial

The third paragraph is not consistent with the project objectives: point-point and mixing link segments should be described separately

SuggestedRemedy

Refer to PAGE 3 of the accompanied presentation xu_3cg_01_0118.pdf.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change this:<

The 10BASE-T1S PHY can operate using full-duplex or half-duplex point-to-point communications over a single twisted-pair copper cable with an effective rate of 10 Mb/s in each direction simultaneously.

Additionally, the 10BASE-T1S PHY can operate using half-duplex multidrop communications over a single twisted-pair copper cable interconnecting up to at least eight in-line PHYs with up to 10cm stubs, achieving an overall effective rate of 10 Mb/s, shared among the nodes.

In any operating mode the 10BASE-T1S PHY supports operation on a link segment or mixing segment supporting up to four in-line connectors using a single twisted-pair copper cable for up to at least 15 meters to support low cost applications requiring short physical reach, such as industrial, automotive and automation controls.

> to this <

The 10BASE-T1S PHY can operate using full-duplex or half-duplex point-to-point communications on a link segment using a single twisted-pair copper cable and supporting up to four in-line connectors and up to at least 15 meters with an effective rate of 10 Mb/s in each direction simultaneously.

Additionally, the 10BASE-T1S PHY can operate using half-duplex multidrop communications on a mixing segment using a single twisted-pair copper cable interconnecting up to at least TBD in-line PHYs with up to 10cm stubs and supporting up to at least TBD meters, achieving an overall effective rate of 10 Mb/s, shared among the nodes.

In any operating mode the 10BASE-T1S PHY supports low cost applications requiring short physical reach, such as industrial, automotive and automation controls.

>

Note: the 2 "TBD" entries must be highlighted

Cl 147 SC 147.2 P 140 L 40 # 148
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

. explained in 147.2.2.4, .

SuggestedRemedy

. explained in 147.2.3, .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "147.2.2.4" to "147.2.3"

Note: this is not regular text replacement, but fix of a link (where it points to)

Cl 147 SC 147.2.1 P 141 L 1 # 149
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

. reset condition hold true.

SuggestedRemedy

. reset condition holds true.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "hold" to "holds"

Cl 147 SC 147.2 P 141 L 17 # 267
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A Technical

Figure 147-2: plca_en from the "MANAGEMENT" block to "PCS TRANSMIT" block is not shown explicitly, should we add this?

SuggestedRemedy

Add plca_en signal flow from the "MANAGEMENT" block to the "PCS_TRANSMIT" block?

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The signal plca_en shall be added to the figure as suggested. Furthermore it shall also be described in 147.2.2.2 as follows: "The plca_en signal described in 148.4.5.2. When the optional PLCA RS is not implemented, plca_en shall be set to OFF"

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.1 P 142 L 9 # 150
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

The PMA encode tx_sym, .

SuggestedRemedy

The PMA encodes tx_sym, .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Change "encode" to "encodes"

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.1 P 142 L 12 # 310
iyer, venkat microchip

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial

example of use of 'symbol' instead of 'symbol group'

SuggestedRemedy

multi-bit fields are referred to as symbol groups in other places e.g. 147.3.3

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
1. Change "SYNC symbols to the PMA" to "SYNC symbol groups to the PMA"
2. Change "SSD symbol" to "SSD symbol group"
Notes:
- Check other pages for similar issues too
- Mention this to Piergiorgio to make sure he could harmonize clause 146 as well

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.1 P 142 L 21 # 279
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Technical

"PCS Transmit" should read

SuggestedRemedy

"PCS Receive"

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

This symbol indeed is generated by PCS Transmit and not Receive (for the PMA Transmit to convert into "high impedance mode" or "zero voltage level")
If the sentence is not clear enough, it could still be rephrased (to make sure the above-mentioned property gets better emphasis) to avoid confusion on reader's side

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.2 P 142 L 24 # 268
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A Technical

plca_en and SILIENCE referred in Figure 147-3 are not defined in 147.2.2.2 Variables

SuggestedRemedy

Add definitions for plca_en, SILIENCE and pcs_txdn.
plca_en Generated by management interface, enables PLCA functions. Values: ON or OFF
SILIENCE The 5B symbol defined as 'I' in 4B/5B encoding

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Add the following to under 147.2.2.2:<
SILIENCE
The 5B symbol defined as 'I' in 4B/5B encoding
>
The signal plca_en should already be described as an outcome of the resolution of comment #267

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.2 P 142 L 48 # 151
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

(see also Table 147-1:

SuggestedRemedy

(see also Table 147-1):

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Change "147-1:" to "147-1):", in other words add a closing parenthesis between "1" and "):")

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.2 P 143 L 5 # 152
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Technical

This variable is set in the PCS data transmission as defined in .

SuggestedRemedy

This variable is set in the PCS Transmit state diagram as defined in .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
1. 143/5 change "This variable is set in the PCS data transmission as defined in" to "This variable is set in the PCS Transmit state, as described in"
2. 147/19 change "This variable is set in the PCS data receive as defined in" to "This variable is set in the PCS Receive state, as described in"

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.2 P 143 L 10 # 153
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Technical

This variable is set in the PCS data transmission as defined in .

SuggestedRemedy

This variable is set in the PCS Transmit state diagram as defined in .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "This variable is set in the PCS data transmission as defined in" to "This variable is set in the PCS Transmit state, as described in"

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.2 P 143 L 13 # 154
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status R Editorial

if such error is detected, .

SuggestedRemedy

if such an error is detected, .

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Current text is fine as well (in fact both, the original and the proposed, text are)

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.3 P 144 L 15 # 155
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status D Technical

N code of 4B/5B encoding is being used for the BEACON.

SuggestedRemedy

4B/5B normally defines no N code, but an S code with "11001" bit sequence, is there a reason, why an N code is being defined and the standard S code is not being used?

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Discussed and clarified with Mr. Graber and: no changes are needed

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2 P 145 L 37 # 269
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Technical

Figure 147-3: "err <= err | pcs_txer" is not consistent with others, '|' should be '+'.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "err <= err | pcs_txer" to "err <= err + pcs_txer"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "err <= err | pcs_txer" to "err <= err + pcs_txer"

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2.3 P 145 L 37 # 308
iyer, venkat microchip

Comment Type T Comment Status A Technical

err<=err | pcs_txer

SuggestedRemedy

replace | with +

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "err <= err | pcs_txer" to "err <= err + pcs_txer"

Cl 147 SC 147.2.2 P 146 L 11 # 270
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A Technical

Figure 147-4: "err <= err + pcs_txen" is wrong. "pcs_txen" should be "pcs_txer".

SuggestedRemedy

change "err <= err + pcs_txen" to "err <= err + pcs_txer"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "err <= err + pcs_txen" to "err <= err + pcs_txer"

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 147 SC 147.2.3 P 147 L 11 # 280
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type TR Comment Status D Technical

If frame end is detected through "SILENCE", frame must always be invalidated. One bit error causes one frame error .

SuggestedRemedy

Discussion in the task force?!

Proposed Text: ". is encountered. To increase protection against frame end loss, the ESD symbol is doubled. The state machine also detects (loss of) end of frame through SILENCE on the ."

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Change "The DATA state, in which 5B symbols are decoded into MII data, is left when ESD followed by either ESDOK or ESDERR symbol is encountered or when the PMA detects SILENCE on the media (e.g. the transmitter prematurely stops data transmission)." to "The DATA state, in which 5B symbols are decoded into MII data, is left when ESD followed by either ESDOK or ESDERR symbol is encountered. To increase protection against loss of frame end, the ESD symbol is doubled. The state machine also detects (the loss of) end of frame through SILENCE on the media (e.g. when the transmitter prematurely stops data transmission)."

When DATA state is left through detection of SILENCE, the RX FSM switches to BAD_ESD state, which asserts RXER, so the frame is already invalidated

CI 147 SC 147.2.3.2 P 147 L 41 # 281
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type TR Comment Status A Technical

What is the behaviour of decoder, if the 5B-word is not valid? Solution should not preclude an error-correcting code later in the signal processing chain .

SuggestedRemedy

"Truncate last bit" is simple, but probably sub-optimal solution.

Discussion in the task force?!

Proposed text: "If the receive 5B word is none of the symbols 0 through F, the first four bits are passed on as decoder output instead."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Steal text from clause 23.2.1.3.1

CI 147 SC 147.2.3 P 149 L 22 # 364
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type T Comment Status A Late

refer to presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slides #2 and #3

NOTE: presentation use the wording prior to PLCA editorial fitting changes

SuggestedRemedy

As specified in presentation

http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slide #2

In figure 147-6, in the state transition between the DATA and BAD_ESD state, replace description with the following text: "RSCD * ((RXn-2 = ESD * RXn-1 != ESDOK) + RXn-3 = SILENCE)"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In figure 147-6, in the state transition between the DATA and BAD_ESD state, replace description with the following text: "RSCD * ((RXn-2 = ESD * RXn-1 != ESDOK) + RXn-3 = SILENCE)"

Beruto_3cg_01_0118.pdf

CI 147 SC Figure 147-6 P 149 L 24 # 282
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type TR Comment Status D Technical

In case, the ESD symbol, which is just one bit different from symbol "1" is missed, the state machine hangs or tries to decode silence/disturbances on the line.

SuggestedRemedy

Discussion in the task force?!

Parallel branch with behavior as comment 7 above must be drawn.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

If ESD is lost, sooner or later the FSM will exit DATA state because silence is detected
Packet would be discarded anyway by the MAC
PHY should not try to do the MAC's job

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl **147** *SC* **147.2.5** *P* **150** *L* **16** # **283**
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *Technical*

A mismatch in "PMA loopback detected symbols" versus sent symbols can also be caused by interference on the line.

Without echo cancellation (which would drive complexity), detecting SYNC and SSD from another participant is nearly impossible.

SuggestedRemedy

Discussion in the task force: how detrimental to the performance is it, when COL is raised in case of an acutal collision and a bit error?

I changed right column to "No". If the leading phrase "A collision may be" marks just an example, but not a mandatory part of the standard clause, I am ok with the sentence.

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Agreed resolution is to change "may" to "can", more precisely "collision may be" to "collision can be"

Cl **147** *SC* **147.3** *P* **151** *L* **39** # **284**
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *Editorial*

Draft for new objectives makes full-duplex optional.

SuggestedRemedy

"provides half-duplex (and optional full-duplex)"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **Z**

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

New objectives have not been approved yet, so this can not be anything else than reject at this time

In the future however, the following change may apply, depending on the details of what changes to the objectives get approved: "The PMA provides both full duplex and half duplex communications to and from medium" to "The PMA provides full duplex and optionally half duplex communication to and from a medium"

Cl **147** *SC* **147.3** *P* **151** *L* **40** # **285**
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A** *Technical*

Manchester with silent/high-Z state is actually 3-Level

SuggestedRemedy

"DME with high-Z state"

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "employing 2-level Differential Manchester Encoding modulation" to "employing Differential Manchester Encoding"

Cl **147** *SC* **Table 147-2** *P* **152** *L* **42** # **286**
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *State Diagram*

Delay between transmission should actually be part of PCS state machine and given in clock cycles.

SuggestedRemedy

Wait state on page 146 around line 33.

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Insert at page 152 line 42 "

"Editor's Note - to be removed prior to Working Group ballot - Commenters are encouraged to improve the clarity of this requirement, including its relationship to the PCS state diagram, and whether it belongs in the PMA or the PCS."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 147 SC 147.3.2 P 152 L 48 # 271
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial

This paragraph is not logically correct.

SuggestedRemedy

Refer to PAGE 5 of the accompanied presentation xu_3cg_01_0118.pdf.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace the paragraph starting at 152/48 and ending at 152/50 with this:<

If the tx_sym parameter value is the special 5B symbol 'I', the PMD would act according to its operation mode, as follows:

- When in multidrop mode, the PDM shall be put into high-impedance/Z state,
- While in point-to-point mode, the PDM shall drive a differential voltage of 0 V (BI_DA+ = BI_DA-) instead

>

Notes:

- Commenter wrote "Refer to PAGE 5 of the accompanied presentation xu_3cg_01_0118.pdf", but the correct information seems to be not page 5, but 4 (of 5)
- Spaces between "0" and "V", and "+" and "=" are preferred to be a single <non-breaking white-space> characters, to keep the clause consistent
- First paragraph (preceding the 2-element list) should have "keep with next paragraph" set

CI 147 SC 147.4.1 P 154 L 10 # 287
 Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

"data symbol" should read

SuggestedRemedy

"DME symbol" for clarity

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

This is not a DME encoded stream. It's a simple voltage level sequence. Might be discussed within the group (TBD)

CI 147 SC 147.4.1 P 154 L 20 # 288
 Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type T Comment Status A PMA

PRBS6 or PRBS7 should be appropriate. Pseudo-Random data can also be fed into the 4B/5B-encoder to recreate the proper spectrum/PSD.

SuggestedRemedy

Presentation in Geneva .

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editorial note: Conrad will provide polynomial for PRBS7 later (soon)

Presentation number: Zerna_3cg_02_0118.pdf, adopted text "first proposal (PRBS7, slide 8)"

CI 147 SC 147.4.1.1 P 154 L 35 # 289
 Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type E Comment Status A AutoNeg

"Additionally" should read

SuggestedRemedy

"Optionally"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "Additionally" to "Optionally"

CI 147 SC 147.4.1.3 P 155 L # 302
 Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type T Comment Status A PSD

PSD mask should be specified as described in

http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_short_reach_PSD_mask_upd.pdf slides #3 and #4

SuggestedRemedy

Add PSD mask proposed limits. NOTE: this requires some more discussion in the group.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Adopt PSD mask formula from beruto_3cg_02_0118_revB.pdf slide 3 (and graph).

Add "Editor's Note - to be removed prior to Working Group ballot - Reviewers are encouraged to evaluate the absolute level of the PSD, and should concentrate on scaling to determine allowable emissions masks."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 147 SC 147.5.1 P 155 L 42 # 306
 iyer, venkat microchip
 Comment Type E Comment Status R Editorial
 "twisted pair" will be replaced in objectives
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with single balanced pair throughout doc
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 New objectives have not been voted yet, so this can not be anything else than reject at this time
 In the future however, note that there are many locations this may affect (including the header for each page), thus the text that is to replace all forms of Twisted Pair (such as "twisted pair" and "twisted-pair" will all possible capitalizations) must be, clear, compact and compatible with all uses

Cl 147 SC 147.5.1.1 P 155 L 47 # 290
 Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Technical
 Termination precision of +-10% over process and temperature actually requires trimmed devices in most semiconductor technologies.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Discussion in the task force, if requirement can be relaxed to +-20% for example
 Proposed Change: Replace "+-10%" with "+-20%"
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.
 DEFERRED
 Changes needed:
 - 155/47: change "the PMD shall provide fixed" to "the PMD should provide fixed"
 - 155/50: add new stence to the paragraph "Where a load is not specified, the transmitter shall meet the requirements of this clause with a 100 O resistive differential load connected to each transmitter output."

Cl 147 SC 147.5.1.2 P 156 L 12 # 291
 Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Technical
 Precision of multi-drop head- and end-terminations should be specified.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Input from OEMs to be checked in channel simulation. Higher precision devices are more expensive .
 Proposed Change: " . shall be terminated by two external 100Ohm (nominal, precision +-10%) resistances or a PMD termination at the edges as depicted in Figure 147-10."
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 147 SC 147.5.1.2 P 156 L 13 # 292
 Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A Technical
 "10KOhm" should be
 SuggestedRemedy
 "min. 10kOhm from DC to 25MHz"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Change "10K O" to "minimum 10 kO from DC to 25 MHz"
 Note: The space characters (between "10" and "kO", and "25" and "MHz") is preferred to be a single <non-breaking white-space> characters, to keep the clause consistent

Cl 147 SC 147.6 P 157 L 1 # 293
 Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A Cabling
 This given data is the baseline for
 SuggestedRemedy
 "Point-2-Point Segment Limits", not the mixing segment
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change: Mixing segment limits
 To: Point-to-point link segment transmission parameters
 Editorial license to address subclause heading

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl **147** *SC* **147.6.3** *P* **157** *L* **28** # **294**
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *Cabling*
ModeConversion should be better .

SuggestedRemedy
Presentation in Geneva .

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolved by comment #300

Cl **147** *SC* **147.6.3** *P* **157** *L* **28** # **300**
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A** *Cabling*
As described in
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_short_reach_PSD_mask_upd.pdf It is
not possible to meet EMC requirements with -30db of MC loss. -43db looks more feasible.

SuggestedRemedy
Change equation 147-3 so that the MC value is "43" from 0.3 to 20 MHz and "43-
20*log10(f/20)" from 20MHz to 200 Mhz. NOTE: this requires some more discussion in the
group.

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **148** *SC* **148** *P* **161** *L* **1** # **301**
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *EZ*
Placeholder

SuggestedRemedy
Remove "placeholder"

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.
Delete "placeholder" from page 161, line 1

Cl **148** *SC* **148** *P* **161** *L* **1** # **340**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *EZ*
No longer a placeholder.

SuggestedRemedy
148. PLCA Reconciliation Sublayer Placeholder

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.
Delete "placeholder" from page 161, line 1
NOTE: duplicate of #301

Cl **148** *SC* **148.1** *P* **161** *L* **7** # **341**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A** *PLCA*
Correct description of advantages.

SuggestedRemedy
This clause specifies the optional PHY Level Collision Avoidance (PLCA) capabilities.
PLCA provides improved performance over standard CSMA/CD method in terms of
maximum throughput and maximum latency for small multidrop networks having a limited
number of nodes and low propagation delays high utilization.

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Replace paragraph at page 161, starting at line 5 with the following text:

This clause specifies the optional PHY Level Collision Avoidance (PLCA) capabilities.
PLCA provides improved performance over standard CSMA/CD method in terms of
maximum throughput and maximum latency for small multidrop networks having a limited
number of nodes and high utilization.

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.1 P 161 L 41 # 342
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

Provide an introduction to this gRS.

SuggestedRemedy

Within the scope of this clause, the term generic Reconciliation Sublayer (gRS) is used to denote any IEEE 802.3 Reconciliation Sublayer (RS) used to interface a MAC with any PHY supporting the PLCA capability through the xMII.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

For commenter: PLCA at this time is defined for MII only. It makes more sense to me using the word MII instead of xMII in the suggested remedy

For editor: add at page 161, line 41 the following text

Within the scope of this clause, the term generic Reconciliation Sublayer (gRS) is used to denote any IEEE 802.3 Reconciliation Sublayer (RS) used to interface a MAC with any PHY supporting the PLCA capability through the MII.

Cl 148 SC Figure 148-1 P 162 L # 295
Zerna, Conrad Fraunhofer

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Interface switched?

SuggestedRemedy

MI should go to MAC (from gRS), not PHY.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

gRS lies between the MAC and the MII

Cl 148 SC 148.4.2 P 162 L 38 # 343
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

Time synchronization interaction is not depicted as stated.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Figure 148-1 with Figure 90-2.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace Figure 148-1 with redrawn Figure 90-2, replacing xMII with MII

Cl 148 SC 148.4.2 P 163 L 1 # 344
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Ambiguous wording.

SuggestedRemedy

When PLCA functions are not supported or are disabled by the management interface

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "When PLCA functions are not supported or disabled by management interface" to "When PLCA functions are not supported or are disabled by the management interface"

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.2 P 163 L 41 # 345
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
Clarify wording.

SuggestedRemedy

When TSSI support is also specified in the actual RS, the SFD detection shall be defined such as the SFD of transmitted frames shall be is detected after the PLCA variable delay line, as shown in Figure 148-2. This ensures the network latency measurement is not affected by the random jitter synchronization latency added by PLCA. No special attention is required for SFD detection of received frames.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Replace paragraph starting at line 41 with the following text:

When TSSI support is also specified in the actual RS, the SFD detection of transmitted frames shall be detected after the PLCA variable delay line, as shown in Figure 148-2. This ensures the network latency measurement is not affected by the synchronization latency added by PLCA. No special attention is required for SFD detection of received frames.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.2 P 163 L 48 # 346
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
The mapping clauses inherited "Reconciliation sublayer" and not "Reconciliation Sublayer" as a defined term. Preferred is RS as a well known acronym.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Reconciliation sublayer" and "Reconciliation Sublayer" with RS through the remainder of the clause.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Find and replace all occurrence of "Reconciliation sublayer" or "Reconciliation Sublayer" with the acronym "RS" starting from page 163 up to the end of clause 148

Editor to review style and determine whether the occurrence should be spelled out.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.3.3.1 P 164 L 41 # 347
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

SuggestedRemedy

Maps the primitive

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

At page 164, line 41, change "Maps" with "Map".

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.1.1 P 165 L 48 # 272
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status A PLCA
The description is wrong. RX_DV signal should never be asserted even when an early receive indication is signaled

SuggestedRemedy

A BEACON request shall not make the PHY assert the CRS signal with the exception of signaling an early receive indication as specified in 148.4.4.1.3. A BEACON request shall not make the PHY assert the RX_DV signal.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Change "A BEACON request shall not make the PHY assert the CRS or RX_DV signals with the exception of signaling an early receive indication as specified in 148.4.4.1.3" to "A BEACON request shall not make the PHY assert the CRS signal with the exception of signaling an early receive indication as specified in 148.4.4.1.3. A BEACON request shall not make the PHY assert the RX_DV signal"

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.2.1 P 166 L 34 # 348
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Terms do not require parentheses.

SuggestedRemedy
the value "BEACON"BEACON

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Remove parentheses around the word BEACON

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.2.1 P 166 L 34 # 349
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Terms do not require parentheses.

SuggestedRemedy
"NONE"NONE

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Remove parentheses around the word NONE

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.2.1 P 166 L 44 # 351
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Terms do not require parentheses.

SuggestedRemedy
"NONE"NONE

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Remove parentheses around the word NONE

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.2.1 P 166 L 44 # 350
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Terms do not require parentheses.

SuggestedRemedy
the value "COMMIT"COMMIT

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Remove parentheses around the word COMMIT

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.2.3 P 167 L 11 # 352
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
"<=" has a special symbol

SuggestedRemedy
Use the assignment operator from the "List of Special Symbols" prior to Clause 1.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
Change "<=" with appropriate unicode character (left arrow with open end) normally used to indicate assign

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.2.4 P 167 L 25 # 353
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
"<=" has a special symbol

SuggestedRemedy
Use the assignment operator from the "List of Special Symbols" prior to Clause 1.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
Change "<=" with appropriate unicode character (left arrow with open end) normally used to indicate assign

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 167 L 42 # 273
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Typo "PYHs"

SuggestedRemedy
PHYS

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
Change "PYHs" to "PHYS"

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 167 L 42 # 354
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Spelling error.

SuggestedRemedy
Slave PYHs PHYS wait

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Change PYHs to PHYS

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 168 L 5 # 355
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
The WAIT_TO bullets for CRS does not APPEAR to match the state diagram, and would benefit from a clarification.

SuggestedRemedy

2) The PHY asserts the CRS signal (plca_eri = TRUE), indicating a data reception is about to occur.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Change "The PHY asserts the CRS signal, indicating a data reception is about to occur" to "The PHY asserts the CRS signal (plca_eri = TRUE), indicating a data reception is about to occur"

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 168 L 35 # 356
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
Clarify wording.

SuggestedRemedy

When condition (4) is met, other PHY's transmit opportunity is yielded, another PHY has yielded its transmit opportunity, causing the transmit opportunity counter to be incremented and TO_TIMER to be reset.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Replace paragraph starting at line 35 up to the period with the following text:

When condition (4) is met, another PHY has yielded its transmit opportunity, causing the transmit opportunity counter to be incremented and TO_TIMER to be reset.

Cl 148 SC Fig. 148-3 P 169 L # 357
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A State Diagram
RECV_BEACON_TMR and BEACON_TMR do not match timer definitions of *_TIMER.

SuggestedRemedy

Use RECV_BEACON_TIMER and BEACON_TIMER in the figure.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "RECV_BEACON_TMR" to "RECV_BEACON_TIMER" in the figure

Change "BEACON_TMR" to "BEACON_TIMER" in the figure

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 170 L 36 # 274
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ
 "Committed <= FALSE" is not necessary, because this has been done in the "TRANSMIT" state
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "Committed <= FALSE"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Delete "Committed <= FALSE" text from the "NEXT_TS" box

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 170 L 38 # 275
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type T Comment Status A State Diagram
 The condition is wrong, "myID = 0" means only Master transits to the "RESYNC" state, but all PHYs shall transit to the "RESYNC" state
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change " myID = 0 * curID = MAX_ID" to "curID = MAX_ID"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 This is actually the intended behavior: slave PHYs shall transition to WAIT_TO state. When the master sends the BEACON, the slave PHYs transit first to EARLY_RECEIVE (plca_eri = TRUE) then to RESYNC state once the BEACON is signaled via rx_cmd. In this way only the master needs to have MAX_ID configured.
 Insert an Editor's Note at Page 167 line 22:
 Editor's Note (to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot) - Commenters are encouraged to review description in text and state diagram of early receive indication and its behavior to valid correctness and conciseness of both the diagram and the text.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 171 L 1 # 358
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Incorrect variable name.
 SuggestedRemedy
 plca_eng plca_en
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Change "plca_eng" to "plca_en"
 Duplicate of #276

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 171 L 1 # 307
 iyer, venkat microchip
 Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial
 typo: plca_eng
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with plca_en
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Change "plca_eng" to "plca_en"
 Duplicate of #276

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 171 L 1 # 276
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 typo "plca_eng"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "plca_eng" to "plca_en"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Change "plca_eng" to "plca_en"

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 171 L 8 # 359
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Incorrect Values for plca_eri. Does not match state diagram.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Values: ON or OFF Values: TRUE or FALSE
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database
 Change text from: ON or OFF
 to: TRUE or FALSE

1 Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 171 L 13 # 360
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Incorrect Values for plca_crs. Does not match state diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

Values: ON or OFF Values: TRUE or FALSE

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Change text from: ON or OFF
to: TRUE or FALSE

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 171 L 28 # 361
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

myID is split into two incomplete entries. Wording is awkward. Combine into a single entry.
Replace entire text as follows.

SuggestedRemedy

ID representing the PLCA transmit oppor-tunity assigned to the PHY. Generated by the management interface (register TBD). May also be set by the auto-negotiation protocol as described in Clause 98. The special value '0' is assigned to the master node, indicating the PHY shall generate BEACON signals. Values: integer value from 0 (master) to MAX_ID

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

For commenter: Possible typo, "oppor-tunity" should be "opportunity"

For editor: Replace text starting at line 28, ending at line 38 with the following text

ID representing the PLCA transmit opportunity assigned to the PHY. Generated by the management interface (register TBD). May also be set by the auto-negotiation protocol as described in Clause 98. The special value '0' is assigned to the master node, indicating the PHY shall generate BEACON signals. Values: integer value from 0 (master) to MAX_ID

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 171 L 32 # 277
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

The text layout is wrong. "myID may also be set .. To MAXID" should be part of "myID" variable definition.

SuggestedRemedy

Reformat the text to make " "myID may also be set .. To MAXID" be part of definition of myID

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This is corrected with the resolution of #361

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 172 L 1 # 362
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

framePending describes the MAC being ready to send a "packet".

SuggestedRemedy

Either change "packet" to "frame" or change the variable to reflect what is being sent by the MAC. I suggest these are packets.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to review clause 148 usage and change "frame" to "packet" as applicable.

Editor to insert "(see 1.4.312)" after first occurrence of packet in clause 148.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.4 P 172 L 23 # 363
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

PHYs (I believe) are gender neutral.

SuggestedRemedy

any PHY that meets her its own transmit opportunity

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: Formatting from commenter's .xls file did not carry over to the Access database

Change "her" to "its"

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 174 L 14 # 365
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type T Comment Status A Late
refer to presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slides #4 and #5

NOTE: presentation use the wording prior to PLCA editorial fitting changes

SuggestedRemedy

As specified in presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slide #4

In figure 148-5, in the state transition between the RECEIVE and IDLE state, replace description with the following text: "plca_crs = FALSE"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In figure 148-5, in the state transition between the RECEIVE and IDLE state, replace description with the following text: "plca_crs = FALSE"

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 174 L 24 # 366
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type T Comment Status A Late
refer to presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slides #4 and #5

NOTE: presentation use the wording prior to PLCA editorial fitting changes

SuggestedRemedy

As specified in presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slide #4

In figure 148-5, in the state transition between the IDLE and RECEIVE state, replace description with the following text: "plca_crs = TRUE"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In figure 148-5, in the state transition between the IDLE and RECEIVE state, replace description with the following text: "plca_crs = TRUE"

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 174 L 36 # 367
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type T Comment Status A Late
refer to presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slides #4 and #5

NOTE: presentation use the wording prior to PLCA editorial fitting changes

SuggestedRemedy

As specified in presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slide #4

In figure 148-5, in the HOLD state, replace description with the following text: "framePending = TRUE CARRIER_STATUS=CARRIER_ON a <= a + 1"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In figure 148-5, in the HOLD state, replace description with the following text: "framePending <= TRUE CARRIER_STATUS=CARRIER_ON a <= a + 1"

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 175 L 24 # 368
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type T Comment Status A Late
refer to presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slides #4 and #5

NOTE: presentation use the wording prior to PLCA editorial fitting changes

SuggestedRemedy

As specified in presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slide #4

In figure 148-6, in the TRANSMIT state, change "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON if plca_crs = TRUE CARRIER_OFF else" to "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In figure 148-6, in the TRANSMIT state, change "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON if plca_crs = TRUE CARRIER_OFF else" to "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON"

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 175 L 36 # 369
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type T Comment Status A Late

refer to presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slides #4 and #5

SuggestedRemedy

As specified in presentation
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/8023cg_T1S_baseline_amendments.pdf slide #4

In figure 148-6, in the FLUSH state, change "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON if plca_crs = TRUE CARRIER_OFF else" to "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In figure 148-6, in the FLUSH state, change "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON if plca_crs = TRUE CARRIER_OFF else" to "CARRIER_STATUS <= CARRIER_ON"

Cl 146 SC 146A.1 P 181 L 22 # 32
Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type T Comment Status A Intrinsic Safety

External terminations resistors are not only recommended, they are required

SuggestedRemedy

change "recommended" to "required"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Requirements cannot be made in informative annexes.
See presentation - 180123_Intrinsic Safety Annex.pdf slide 5
Replace page 181 lines 17-34 with the following (based on page 5 of the presentation, but not identical)
"The PHY described in Clause 146 does not preclude working within an intrinsically safe device and system as defined in IEC 60079.
Nevertheless the realization of the PHY IC has a strong impact on the intrinsic safety concept. Requirements such as energy and current limitations in relevant intrinsic safety standards (e.g., IEC 60079-11) can drive implementation-specific needs.
External termination resistors can be used to limit the energy to or from the intrinsically safe link segment in case of a failure. Internal termination resistors are not consistent with requirements related to current limitation according to the relevant intrinsic safety standards, e.g., requirements related to infallible components in IEC 60079-11:2011 Chapter 8.
Providing separate pins for receive and transmit, external resistors for current and energy limitation can be added to a high impedance receive path.
Further information about how to use a 10BASE-T1L PHY within intrinsically safe applications may be found in IEC 60079-0, IEC 60079-11 and other relevant national and international standards."

Cl 146 SC 146A.1 P 181 L 26 # 33
Gottron, Jens Siemens AG

Comment Type T Comment Status A Intrinsic Safety

seperate pins are not only recommended, they are required

SuggestedRemedy

change "recommended" to "required"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment 32

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 146 SC 146A P 182 L 4 # 256
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
Missing Dots in schematics for suppressor diode connections.

SuggestedRemedy

Please add in all figures of this Annex (Figure 146A-1, 146A-2 and 146A-3) the connection dots for the suppressor diodes.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146A P 182 L 12 # 255
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
IEEE802.3cg PHY IC

SuggestedRemedy

Please replace in all figures of this Annex (Figure 146A-1, 146A-2 and 146A-3) by 10BASE-T1L PHY IC.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146A P 183 L 23 # 257
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status A Intrinsic Safety
500 µH

SuggestedRemedy

Please remove the 500 µH label from the schematic.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

CI 200 SC 200A P 184 L 3 # 258
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D Power
(normative)

SuggestedRemedy

Is the intention of this Annex to be (normative) or is the intention of this Annex to be (informative)?

Proposed Response Response Status Z
REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Commenter has not provided information to make changes to the draft.

Annex 200A is normative.

Please note there has been TG discussion to provide "information" for powered trunk cable topologies not "requirements".

CI 200 SC 200A P 185 L 3 # 25
Schicketanz, Dieter Reutlingen University

Comment Type T Comment Status A Power
This Annex describes power distribution possibilities. There may be others. This annex is a nice overview but cannot be normative because it is not a unique solution. May be 2 annexes one normative (power classes) and one informative could solve the dilemma.

SuggestedRemedy

Change normative to informative

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In 200A.1.1.1.2 Point-to-point class power requirements are given inTable 200A-2 for each class.

As is, now, the annex is normative.

Insert at the beginning of Annex 200A:

"Editor's Note - to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot - Reviewers are encouraged to consider whether the requirement in this annex be moved elsewhere in IEEE Standard 802.3, e.g., Clause 104, and the remaining annex be made informative."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 200 SC 200A P 186 L 38 # 259
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status A Power
 4.00 ohms per 10 connectors DCR.

SuggestedRemedy

This value seems to be to high. Needs to be discussed with connector manufacturers.
 Expectation is to be in the range of 50 mohms to max. 100 mohms per inline connector,
 thus leading too 0.5 to 1 ohms for 10 connecotrs DCR. Therefore adopt also link segment
 resistance at IL limit accordingly.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Recalculate the values in Table 200A-1 (entire table) using a connector DCR of 50
 milliohms.