

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 00 **SC 0** **P** **L** # **312**
Huszák, Gergely Kone

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

There are unnecessary and inconsistent repetitions of references to table 147-1 (e.g. "5B symbol as defined in Table 147-1")

SuggestedRemedy

Remove all but the first reference (in C147) to table 147-1

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete "(See Table 147-1)" at:

page 134 line 36;

page 135 lines 9, 11, 14, 16, 19, 21;

page 143 lines 10 and 19

*keep references to Table 147-1 in first reference, ENCODE and DECODE function definitions

CI 00 **SC 0** **P 1** **L 6** # **301**
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

"Draft Standard for Ethernet-Amendment:" appears twice on the title page.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "Draft Standard for Ethernet Amendment:" on lines 12-15.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Delete "Draft Standard for Ethernet Amendment:" on lines 12-15.

CI 30 **SC 30.5.1.1.4** **P 29** **L 35** # **302**
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

1000BASE-RH was made the third sentence and 100BASE-T1 the fourth sentence in the draft 3.2 revision of 802.3cj.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Change the third sentence" to "Change the fourth sentence" in the editing instruction on line 35.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Change "Change the third sentence" to "Change the fourth sentence" in the editing instruction on line 35.

CI 30 **SC 30.5.1.1.4** **P 29** **L 38** # **303**
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

Unchanged text should not be shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete, "All other states of link_status map to the enumeration "not available"." on line 38.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Delete, "All other states of link_status map to the enumeration "not available"." on line 38.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174b.1** **P 34** **L 38** # **338**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

When read as one ...

SuggestedRemedy

When read as a one . (align with other text parts of Clause 45)

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change from,
"When read as one"

to,
"When read as a one" on line 38

Change from,
"When read as zero"

to,
"When read as a zero" on line 39

I Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174b.2** **P 34** **L 43** # **339**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

When read as one ...

SuggestedRemedy

When read as a one . (align with other text parts of Clause 45)

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Change from,
"When read as one"

to,
"When read as a one" on line 43

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174b.5** **P 35** **L 11** # **340**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

.. Is controlled using .

SuggestedRemedy

is controlled by using .

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

"Controlled by using" doesn't show up at all in section 4 of 802.3-2015.

"Controlled using" shows up many times.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174b.6** **P 35** **L 16** # **341**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X** **EZ**

When read as zero ...

SuggestedRemedy

When read as a zero . (align with other text parts of Clause 45)

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Change from,
"When read as zero"

to,
"When read as a zero"

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174b.6** **P 35** **L 16** # **342**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X** **EZ**

When read as one ...

SuggestedRemedy

When read as a one . (align with other text parts of Clause 45)

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Change from,
"When read as one"

to,
"When read as a one"

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174b.6** **P 35** **L 17** # **343**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

. that the polarity of receiver is reversed.

SuggestedRemedy

. that the polarity of the receiver is reversed.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Change from,
the polarity of receiver

to,
the polarity of the receiver

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174d.3** **P 37** **L 22** # **464**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

2 reference errors

SuggestedRemedy

Change 1.2294.11 to 1.2299.11, 2 places in paragraph.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Change1.2294.11 to 1.2299.11 in two locations in clause 45.2.1.174d.3

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.174h.1** **P 41** **L 31** # **465**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
Wrong link

SuggestedRemedy
Change 147.5.2, text and link to 147.5.1

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Change from,
147.5.2

to,
147.5.1

and update link

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.58e.1** **P 47** **L 35** # **466**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
Missing definition

SuggestedRemedy
PCS_status is not defined in 147.3.7.1, nor anywhere else in the draft.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete,
This bit is a reflection of the PCS_status variable defined in 147.3.7.1.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.58e.2** **P 47** **L 41** # **467**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
Missing definition

SuggestedRemedy
hi_rfer is not defined in 147.3.7.1, nor anywhere else in the draft.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Delete.
This bit is a reflection of the state of the hi_rfer variable defined in 147.3.7.1.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.58e.3** **P 47** **L 47** # **468**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
Missing definition

SuggestedRemedy
block_lock is not defined in 147.3.7.1, nor anywhere else in the draft.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete,
This bit is a reflection of the state of the block_lock variable defined in 147.3.7.1.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.58e.6** **P 48** **L 14** # **469**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
Missing definition

SuggestedRemedy
RFER_count is not defined in 147.3.7.2, nor anywhere else in the draft.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete,
The BER counter formed by bits 3.2293.5:0 is a six bit count as defined by RFER_count in 147.3.7.2.

CI 45 **SC 45.5** **P 53** **L 1** # **401**
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
PICS for clause 45 need completing

SuggestedRemedy
PICS editor to fill in from changes in clause 45

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Chief Editor to coordinate with Curtis Donahue to develop PICS for clause 45.

I Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl **98** *SC* **98.5.2** *P* **58** *L* **37** # **346**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*

If T[4] bit is 0 then the timer duration is set as .

SuggestedRemedy

If T[4] bit is 0, then the timer duration will be set as . (add comma and use will be instead of is)

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

Change "If T[4] bit is 0 then the timer duration is set as" to "If T[4] is 0, the timer duration is"

Cl **98** *SC* **98.5.2** *P* **58** *L* **37** # **345**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

If T[4] bit is 1 then the timer duration is set as .

SuggestedRemedy

If T[4] bit is 1, then the timer duration will be set as . (add comma and use will be instead of is)

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "If T[4] bit is 1 then the timer duration is set as" to "If T[4] is 1, the timer duration is"

Cl **98** *SC* **98.5.2** *P* **59** *L* **48** # **347**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

If T[4] bit is 1 then the timer duration is set as .

SuggestedRemedy

If T[4] bit is 1, then the timer duration will be set as . (add comma and use will be instead of is)

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "If T[4] bit is 1 then the timer duration is set as" to
 "If T[4] is 1, the timer duration is"

Cl **98** *SC* **98.5.2** *P* **59** *L* **50** # **348**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

If T[4] bit is 0 then the timer duration is set as .

SuggestedRemedy

If T[4] bit is 0, then the timer duration will be set as . (add comma and use will be instead of is)

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change "If T[4] bit is 0 then the timer duration is set as" to

"If T[4] is 0, the timer duration is"

Cl **98** *SC* **98.5.2** *P* **60** *L* **30** # **217**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Editor's Note

SuggestedRemedy

Please remove Editor's note.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Delete Editor's Note on lines 31-34.

Cl **98** *SC* **98.6.8** *P* **64** *L* **5** # **349**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

All value/comment fields in the table start with "Expire".

SuggestedRemedy

Please change "Expire" to "Expires" in each row of the table, as only a single timer is referenced.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 104 **SC 104.6.2** **P 69** **L 42** # **407**
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

The PI for Type E PSEs and PDs shall meet the fault tolerance requirements as specified in 146.8.xxx. - needs to be filled in. Since Type E is only for 10BASE-T1L, this is only for clause 146.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 146.8.xxx to 146.8.4 (cross reference)

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Duplicate of Comment 248

Same resolution - change 146.8.xxx to 146.8.4

Cl 104 **SC 104.6.2** **P 69** **L 43** # **248**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

. as specified in 146.8.xxx.

SuggestedRemedy

. as specified in 146.8.4.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.1** **P 77** **L 9** # **334**
Shariff, Masood CommScope

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

Improve sentence.

Provided in this clause are fully functional and electrical specifications for the type 10BASE-T1L PCS and PMA.

SuggestedRemedy

Provided in this clause are fully functional and electrical specifications for the type 10BASE-T1L PCS and PMA.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved by comment 471

Cl 146 **SC 146.1** **P 77** **L 9** # **471**
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

Typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change "fully functional and electrical specifications" to "full functional and electrical specifications"

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "Provided in this clause are fully functional and electrical specifications for type 10BASE-T1L PCS and PMA." to

"Provided in this clause are fully functional and electrical specifications for type 10BASE-T1L PCS, PMA, and MDI."

Cl 146 **SC 146.3.1** **P 82** **L 38** # **257**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

Font for MEDIA INDEPENDENT INTERFACE and PMA SERVICE INTERFACE does not match.

SuggestedRemedy

Please match used font to rest of the document.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.3.4.1.1** **P 96** **L 22** # **352**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**

. received that this not allowed .

SuggestedRemedy

. received that is not allowed .

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

I Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 146 **SC 146.3.4.1.1** **P 96** **L 25** # **353**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 . in Figure 146-10 else it is set .
SuggestedRemedy
 .. in Figure 146-10, else it is set . (comma is missing)
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "Figure 146-10 else it is set to FALSE." to
 "Figure 146-10 and set FALSE otherwise"

CI 146 **SC 146.4.4** **P 101** **L 23** # **260**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 AUTONEG mode
SuggestedRemedy
 Auto-Negotiation
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change AUTONEG to Auto-Negotiation on lines 23 and 26.

CI 146 **SC 146.4.4** **P 101** **L 23** # **261**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 PMA_CONFIG
SuggestedRemedy
 variable config
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change PMA_CONFIG to "the configuration of the PMA" on lines 23 and 26

CI 146 **SC 146.4.4** **P 101** **L 25** # **263**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 PMA_CONFIG
SuggestedRemedy
 variable config
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by comment 261

CI 146 **SC 146.4.4** **P 101** **L 25** # **262**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 AUTONEG mode
SuggestedRemedy
 Auto-Negotiation
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by comment 260

CI 146 **SC 146.6.2** **P 111** **L 11** # **274**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 Default setting is to use Auto-Negotiation.
SuggestedRemedy
 Default setting is to use Auto-Negotiation, if available.
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "Default setting is to use Auto-Negotiation."
 to "The default setting is to use Auto-Negotiation, if available."

Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

Cl 146 **SC 146.6.3** **P 111** **L 26** # **275**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
 10BASE-T1 PMA/PMD control register

SuggestedRemedy

BASE-T1 PMA/PMD control register

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "10BASE-T1" to "BASE-T1"

Cl 146 **SC 146.6.3** **P 111** **L 28** # **276**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
 10BASE-T1 PMA/PMD control register

SuggestedRemedy

BASE-T1 PMA/PMD control register

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change 10BASE-T1 to BASE-T1

Cl 147 **SC 147.1** **P 129** **L 8** # **472**
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
 Typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change from "PCS, and PMA" to "PCS and PMA"

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Change "the PCS, and PMA sublayers" to "the PCS and PMA sublayers"

Cl 147 **SC 147.1** **P 129** **L 9** # **473**
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
 Typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change "fully functional and electrical specifications" to "full functional and electrical specifications"

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Change "clause are fully functional and electrical" to "clause are full functional and electrical"

Cl 147 **SC 147.1.2** **P 129** **L 53** # **415**
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
 "12.5 MBd rate (+/- TBD). " - rate is redundant (Bd is rate), and tolerance is inappropriate here - this is not the specification for the signalling rate - this is general description.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "12.5 MBd rate (+/- TBD)." to "12.5 MBd."

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Change "12.5 MBd rate" to "12.5 MBd"

Cl 147 **SC 147.1.2** **P 130** **L 3** # **474**
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
 Wrong link

SuggestedRemedy

Change text and link from 147.5 to 147.4.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Change link "147.5" to "147.4"

I Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation over Single Balanced Twisted-pair Cabling and Associat

CI 147 SC 147.2 P 131 L 4 # 452
Pannell, Don NXP (donald.pannell@

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ
Right side of the figure is cut off.

SuggestedRemedy
Readjust the size of the figure so that all of it's text shows.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Fix figure

CI 147 SC Figure 147-2 P 131 L 5 # 475
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Figure is chopped off at right

SuggestedRemedy
Adjust figure

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Already dealt with by #452

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 163 L 20 # 428
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Figure 148-TBD appears to refer to Figures 148-3 and 148-4.

SuggestedRemedy
Change Figure 148-TBD to "Figure 148-3 and Figure 148-4" (cross references)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 163 L 26 # 444
Pannell, Don NXP (donald.pannell@

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"with local_nodeID variable set to 0 immediately"

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "with local_nodeID variable set to 0, immediately" i.e., add in the ',' after the '0'.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 148
SC 148.4.5.1

Page 8 of 8
5/7/2018 11:02:44 AM