

Motions and Straw Polls

IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mbps Single-Pair Ethernet Task Force

George Zimmerman (Chair P802.3cg) - CME Consulting, Inc.

Milpitas, CA – February 2019

Motion #1

- **Motion #1:** Move to approve the agenda as shown in [agenda_3cg_02_0119.pdf](#).
- **M: Phil Brownlee S: Steffen Graber**
- **Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)**
- **Motion Passes**

Motion #2

- **Motion #2: Move to approve minutes of IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mbps Single Pair Ethernet Task Force from January 2019 as posted.**
- **M: David Brandt S: Martin Zielinski**
- **Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)**
- **Motion Passes**

Motion #3

- **Move to consider 4 comments (#93, #94, #95, and #96) submitted after the P802.3cg draft 2.3 Working Group 3rd Recirculation ballot deadline, included with Editor's proposed resolutions.**
- **M: Valerie Maguire S: Peter Jones**
- **(Technical \geq 75%)**
- **Y: 20 N: 0 A: 0**
- **Motion Passes**

Motion #4

- **Accept the resolutions to all P802.3cg d2p3 comments marked with the Topic “EZ” and posted as, “EZ Bucket” comments with proposed resolutions sorted by clause/subclause, excluding withdrawn comments.**
- **M: Valerie Maguire S: Bob Voss**
- **(Technical \geq 75%)**
- **Y: 18 N: 0 A: 1**
- **Motion Passes**

Motion #5

- **Accept the resolutions to all P802.3cg d2p2 comments marked with the Topic “Editorial” and posted as, “Editorial” comments with proposed resolutions sorted by clause/subclause, excluding any withdrawn comments and comments 76 and 107.**
- **M: Valerie Maguire S:Steffen Graber**
- **(Technical \geq 75%)**
- **Y: 18 N: 0 A: 1**
- **Motion Passes**

Motion #6

- **Move to resolve comments 25, 26, 28, 31, 32, 45, 54, 61, 62, 69, 71, 75, 77, 78, 79, 80, and 93 as: Reject. This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.**
- **M: Valerie Maguire S: Theo Brillhart**
- **(Technical \geq 75%)**
- **Y: 18 N: 0 A: 1**
- **Motion Passes**

Motion #7

- **Move to instruct the editors to generate draft 2.4 from draft 2.3 and the closed comments with editorial license to align PICS with comment responses, and request that IEEE 802.3 progress the draft to a 15-day fourth WG Recirculation Ballot**
- **M: Valerie Maguire**
- **S: Bob Voss**
- **(Technical $\geq 75\%$)**
- **Y: 16 N: 1 A: 0**
- **Motion Passes**

Motion #8

- Adjourn the meeting.
- M: Bob Voss
- S: Bruce Nordman
- Approved by voice without opposition
(Procedural > 50%)
- Motion Passes

Straw Polls

Straw Poll #1

I support rejecting comment 120 with the response:

"Commenter fails to show a compatibility problem.

Commenter is incorrect - use of reserved codes preserves compatibility, as has been successfully done in previous projects.

See

http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/Jan2019/Tutorial_cg_0119_final.pdf slide 34."

Y: 13 N: 0 A: 3

Straw Poll #2

I support the resolution to comment 114 as REJECT, with the explanation:

Commenter provides insufficient remedy.

A name of a mode is needed, but commenter provides "half-duplex shared medium" to substitute for "multidrop mode", which seems to indicate the medium itself.

If the commenter actually meant "half-duplex shared medium mode" instead of "multidrop mode" then the existing name is more appropriate as the proposal is liable to cause understanding issues with its length.

Y: 13 N: 0 A: 4

Straw Poll #3

- (Chicago rules, except "none of the above" is exclusive of other choices):
- Options:
 - A: Reject, comment out of scope, draft is correct, and reflects content of clause 147.
 - B: Replace "10BASE-T1L(S) does not define an AUI." with "10BASE-T1L(S) follows an integrated PCS and PMA architecture, and therefore does not support an AUI (See Figure 1-1)."
 - C: Delete "10BASE-T1L(S) does not define an AUI."
- I support resolving this comment with:
- A: 2 B: 15 C: 0 None of the Above: 0

Straw Poll #5

- I support the following response to comment 128:
- REJECT.
- The ballot resolution committee believes that the commenter is incorrect in asserting PLCA is a new media access control layer overriding the CSMA/CD MAC. PLCA architecturally fits at the reconciliation sublayer and performs functions allocated to the physical layer. It requires the CSMA/CD MAC for media access control.
- See
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/Jan2019/Tutorial_cg_0119_final.pdf and
http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/brandt_020619_3cg_01_adhoc.pdf for discussion.
- Y: 14 N: 1 A: 2

Thank You!