Closing Chief Editor's Report
P802.3cg draft 3.3

Valerie Maguire

IEEE P802.3cg, Chief Editor

September 9, 2019 – Indianapolis, IN

Draft 3.3 Comment Review Summary

- 33 comments reviewed and responded to

- Move to grant the Task Force editors license to editorially conform the comment responses to RevCom guidelines and instruct the Task Force editors to generate draft 3.4 from draft 3.3 and the closed comments, with editorial license granted to update PICS as needed, and conduct a 15-day SA Recirculation ballot (MOTION)

Timeline: Draft 3.4 15-day SA Recirc Ballot

- Announcement of the electronic IEEE 802.3 Working Group second Standards Association recirculation ballot on IEEE P802.3cg (IEEE 802.3cg) Draft Standard for Ethernet Amendment: Physical Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of Conductors anticipated by Friday, SEPTEMBER 13th

- Ballot anticipated to close no later than Sunday, SEPTEMBER 29th 11:59PM EDT

- Comment database with proposed resolutions ready for circulation by Wednesday, OCTOBER 2nd

The Comment Process

- Comment instructions will be provided by the Working Group Chair

- Be sure to use the most UP TO DATE comment tools

- Annexes at the end of this report contain reference information on:

  - What do the Editors do?

  - Submitting Baseline Proposals

  - The Comment Process

  - Submitting Comments – Task Force Review

  - Style Guidelines

Questions?

Thank you!

Valerie Maguire

valerie_maguire@siemon.com

Annex: What do the Editors do?

- Editors' responsibilities:
    - Consolidate all approved baselines into the draft
    - Ensure style and format of the draft is consistent with the official IEEE Style Manual (current version: 2014)
    - Make sure text is grammatically correct
- Editors DO NOT:
    - Create text of draft based on bullets from PowerPoint presentations
    - Fill in missing technical details from baselines (any TBDs from baselines will be included in the draft as well)
    - Rewrite or develop text based on proposals

Annex: Submitting Baseline Proposals

- Provide Editors with complete baseline materials
  - Editable files in Word or FrameMaker formats shall including all the necessary text, figures, drawings, code, etc.
  - Text formats: Word (.doc(x)), FrameMaker 10 (.fm or .mif)
  - Table data: Excel .xml(x))
  - Drawings / figures: FrameMaker 10 (.fm or .mif) or Visio (.vsd) for simple content copying
- Include all descriptive text
- Ensure that there are no missing technical features or technical conflicts between baselines

Annex: Comment Process

- Comments are the formal way to make corrections and changes to the draft

- "Chad's General Rules" to make comments easier to read (thus easier to resolve):

  - DO copy the text you are commenting against and paste into the comment. This helps immensely if you have a typo in the page or line number.

  - DO cover only one topic per comment. File multiple comments for multiple concepts in the same page/line.

  - DO NOT make a comment and leave the suggested remedy empty. If you know it is a problem, you have an idea of the answer. Share this with the group.

  - DO make crisp comments, minimize 'stream of consciousness' style of writing. Present the facts and the solution."

Annex: Comment Process, cont.

- Please don't give holf sentences or assume the editor knows what you mean in all but the simplest circumstances

    - For example, instead of saying "fix the typo above", you should say, "change 'holf sentences' to 'half sentences' on line x of page y".

- DO NOT use revision markings (e.g., strikethroughs and hyphens) to show changes when using the "comment entry spreadsheet" tool – these marks do not transfer to the Access database

Annex: Submitting Comments – TF Review

- Here is a useful helpful overview of the comment tool:
  http://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/nov14/diab_01_0512.pdf

  - Note that the "R" designation really doesn't have much meaning in task force review, only to underscore how important you think the comment is

- See "Chad's Rules for Making Comments" for some common sense tips:
  http://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/nov14/Rules%20for%20making%20comments.txt

Annex: Style Guidelines

- Clause 18.2 "Amendments and corrigenda" of the 2014 IEEE-SA Style Manual provides explicit instructions on how to change the text in an existing base standard or an existing amendment

- Refer to Maguire_3cg_02_0717.pdf for editing examples