

P802.3ch

Voting and Commenting – WG ballot

Natalie Wienckowski, General Motors

Steve Carlson, High Speed Design, Inc.; Bosch; Marvell

May, 2019

IEEE P802.3ch

WG ballot

- During WG ballot, members of the IEEE 802.3 WG who are voting members at the start of the ballot comprise the WG ballot group
 - The ballot group is fixed—new voters are not added to the group
 - The ballot is run by the IEEE 802.3 WG Chair
- Voting will determine the progress of the draft standard
- Votes are tied to comments
- Commenting is similar to TF, but the rules are tighter
- The draft is reviewed, revised and recirculated with the goal of no new disapprove votes and no comments

How you get the ballot

- 802.3 Reflector

- You will receive this email if you have attended an 802.3 meeting in the last 2 years
- You must respond following the instructions in the email
 - Specific subject line
 - Ballot Deadline
 - Comment format
 - Content of email – if 802.3 voter
 - Send to stds-802-3-ballot@ieee.org
 - Sent without any “Confidentiality” notice
- Failure to follow instructions may result in the loss of your ballot. This may also lead to the loss of your voting rights.

HOW TO CAST YOUR BALLOT

To assure your ballot is counted, please:

1) Send your ballot to: stds-802-3-ballot@ieee.org Doesn't change

2) Paste the following line into the subject field:

IEEE P802.3cq Power over Ethernet over 2 Pairs (Maintenance #13) D2.0 ballot
Unique to working group and draft stage.

This can be done with this link [mailto:stds-802-3-ballot@ieee.org?subject=IEEE%20P802.3cq Power over Ethernet over 2 Pairs \(Maintenance #13\) D2.0 ballot](mailto:stds-802-3-ballot@ieee.org?subject=IEEE%20P802.3cq%20Power%20over%20Ethernet%20over%202%20Pairs%20(Maintenance%20%2313)%20D2.0%20ballot)

3) Paste into the message body and complete the ballot form below:

-----CUT AND PASTE TEXT BELOW THIS LINE ONLY PLEASE-----

IEEE P802.3cq Power over Ethernet over 2 Pairs (Maintenance #13) D2.0 ballot
Unique to working group and draft stage.

Your Name: _____

___ APPROVE ALL WITHOUT COMMENT

___ APPROVE ALL WITH COMMENTS on SOME
(All comments are non-binding)

___ DISAPPROVE
(Some or all comments are binding; a voter must submit specific comments for remedy)

___ ABSTAIN, Lack of Expertise

___ ABSTAIN, Lack of Time

-----end ballot form-----

Voting options for IEEE802.3 Voters

___ APPROVE ALL WITHOUT COMMENT – You have no comments and are voting yes on the draft.

___ APPROVE ALL WITH COMMENTS on SOME – You are voting yes on the draft and have submitted comments but none are required.

(All comments are non-binding)

___ DISAPPROVE – You are voting NO on the draft and have submitted comments and at least one comment is required. You cannot vote DISAPPROVE without submitting any comments.

(Some or all comments are binding; a voter must submit specific comments for remedy)

___ ABSTAIN, Lack of Expertise – Still counts as a vote.. This increases the percentage of abstain votes and could negatively impact the ballot.

___ ABSTAIN, Lack of Time – Does not count as a vote and could cause you to lose your voting status. This does count as a vote which increases the percentage of abstain votes and could negatively impact the ballot.

WG ballot rules

- Response Rate ($> 50\%$ required)
- Abstain Rate ($< 30\%$ required)
- Approval Rate ($\geq 75\%$ required)

How to Comment

- Use the [comment tool](#)
- Use the [comment spreadsheet](#)
- Check each time to make sure you have the latest version!
- [Additional commenting information.](#)

802.3 Draft Comment Form

Comment Number:

Clause:

Please use "FM" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft.

Subclause:

If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment.

Page: Line:

Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: E ER T TR
E(ditorial) E(ditorial) R(equired) T(echnical) T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form

First name	Surname	Affiliation

Click on column headers for help

Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied

Comment file naming instructions

- Include your name (first, last, initials, etc.) in your filename, at least 3 characters. A unique file name is needed from each submitter. Don't use just your first or last name if it is common, e.g. John or Smith.
- If you have additional comments after you submit a comment file, even if it is before the comment deadline, put your new comments in a new file. Use the same file name as before with _v2 (or appropriate #) added at the end of the file name.
- 1st comment file - 802d3ch_D1p1_comments_NAW
- 2nd comment file - 802d3ch_D1p1_comments_NAW_v2
- 3rd comment file - 802d3ch_D1p1_comments_NAW_v3
- Etc.

Vote Timing

- The ballot end date will be in the email announcing the ballot and will be 23:59 AOE on that date.
- You are requested to send your comments in a separate email than your vote.
- The time of your ballot is when you sent the email, not when it is received.
- Do not wait for the last minute! If you have technical issues that cause your ballot to be late, it's still late!

Comment Timing

- The deadline for sending comments, and associated presentations, is the same as the ballot deadline.
- These are sent in a separate email with a unique subject line.
- The time of your comment submission is when you sent the email, not when it is received.
- Do not wait for the last minute! If you have technical issues that cause your comments to be late, they're still late!

2. Send your comments to: stds-802-3-ballot@ieee.org and paste into the subject line:

Unique to working group and draft stage.

IEEE P802.3cq Power over Ethernet over 2 Pairs (Maintenance #13) D2.0 comments

This can be done with this link <<mailto:stds-802-3-ballot@ieee.org?subject=IEEE%20P802.3cq%2>

Vote and Comments Received after Deadline

- Your ballot won't count---counts as a non-returned ballot
- TR and ER comments are converted to T and E comments
- Late comments will be marked as 'late' in the comment report and will only be considered by the TF if, based on a vote if necessary, there is no objection to do so.
- Do not wait for the last minute! If you have technical issues that cause your ballot to be late, it's still late!
- NOTE: If your Suggested Remedy mentions a file that is not sent prior to the deadline, your ballot is then “late” as all supporting material was not sent prior to the deadline.

Required Comments

- Required comments can only be submitted by 802.3 voters
 - Assuming our request to go to WG ballot is approved, the list of voters can be found [here](#).
- Meaning of required comments
 - Disapprove vote on draft standard
 - Commenter will be asked to approve the resolution of **each** comment marked required
 - Treated the same as comments that are not required when resolving
- **Does not guarantee the comment will be implemented as suggested. The Task Force must agree to make the change.**

Comment Types

➤ Editorial or “E”

- Fixing issues of grammar, spelling, punctuation, and style
- Does not change the intent of the draft standard
 - Example 1: Change spelling of “wavelngth” to “wavelength”
 - Example 2: Change resistance from “1 k ± 5%” to “1 kΩ ± 5%”

➤ “Technical” or “T”

- Makes a change in the intent (requirements) of the draft standard
- Changes to parameters, values, tables, or figures that alter their meaning or substance
 - Example 1: Changes to functions or variables in state diagrams
 - Example 2: Change from “1 kW ± 5%” to “2 kW ± 5%”
 - Example 3: Adding/removing a “shall”

Buckets

- EZ Bucket
 - Comments the Editor has determined are likely not controversial or are obvious
 - May be designated as any comment type by the commenter
 - Can be removed by sending an email to the reflector, prior to the deadline indicated in the email announcing the bucket, with a request to remove it from the bucket for discussion by the Task Force
 - A reason is not required, but is helpful
 - We will have a single bucket and will not have a separate “Editorial” bucket

Submitting Late Comments

- Start with an empty comment file or database. The editor won't edit the file to remove comments already submitted to prevent duplicate comments.
- Complete all necessary information for your comments: First name, Surname, Affiliation for the file; and Category (Editorial or Technical), Sub-Clause, Page, Line, Comment, and Proposed change for each comment.
- Check the published comment list to see if someone has already submitted a comment for your issue. If they have, don't submit another comment. If you don't agree with the "proposed response" you can bring this up during the discussion of that comment. Late comments can't be put into the "EZ" bucket. This means we have to look at them individually even if they are a duplicate comment to add a missing space.

Comment withdraw instructions during WG balloting

- Prior to comment deadline
 - Send an email to the editor and TF Chair with the comment to be withdrawn, provide the subclause, page, and line number you used in your comment file.
 - If comments were created in Excel, also include the Excel line number in your file.
- After comment deadline
 - Find your comment in the published comment list (available the first working day after the comment deadline).
 - Send an email to the reflector requesting that comment #xx be withdrawn. Copy the editor and TF Chair.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Do
 - Comment on any Technical or Editorial error you find.
- Don't
 - Assume someone else will find the error and comment on it.

We had a total of 4 commenters for D0p5. All found at least one typo that no other commenter found.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Do
 - Provide late comments if you see that something was missed.
- Don't
 - Put them in the main Excel table loaded to our website to submit them.



When you do this, the editor has to create a new file with only your comments and put them in the correct format. They're not going to do this so they'll be sent back to you!

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J
1	Comment	CommenterName	CommenterCo	Clause	Subclause	Page	Line	Comment	Comment	SuggestedRemedy
2	57			149	149.4.2.1	54	10	E	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"
3	58			150	150.4.2.2	102	10	E	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"



	A	B	C	D	E	F	G
Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form							
1							
2	First name	Surname			Affiliation		
3				Broadcom			
4	Click on column headers for help						
5	Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied
6	Editorial	54	149.4.2.1	10	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"	
7	Editorial	102	150.4.2.2	10	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"	

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Do
 - Provide presentations that explain your comments.
- Don't
 - Put generic statements in the implementation details like, “add a sentence to make the frequency “xxxxx MHz”.

When you do this, your comment will receive the response “proposed reject”. You will then have an opportunity at the upcoming meeting to explain your comment to the group.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Do
 - Keep your editor happy by writing clear, concise comments with clear and complete instructions for what you want done!
- Don't
 - Upset your editor by creating more work!

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Do
 - Complete all cells/boxes.
- Don't
 - Include only partial Information.

See examples of issues on next slides!

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Select the comment type
- A commenter did not select this
 - Editor had to individually edit each comment to import them into the tool!

Comment Number:

Clause:

Please use "FM" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft.

Subclause:

If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment.

Page: Line:

Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: E ER OT OR

E(ditorial) E(ditorial) R(equired) T(echnical) T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form

First name	Surname	Affiliation				
Click on column headers for help						
Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied
Editorial						
Technical						

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Include Clause/Subclause
- In the Comment tool, if you have a comment on Subclause 149.3.2, put "149" in the Clause box and 149.3.2 in the Subclause box. Don't put only 3.2 in the Subclause box.
- A commenter left this blank
 - Editor had to go to each page to determine this then enter it in the database. Without this information it is difficult to find like comments. Also, the comments don't sort correctly.

Comment Number:

Clause: Subclause: Page: Line:

Please use "FM" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft. If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment. Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: E ER T TR
E(ditorial) E(ditorial) R(equired) T(echnical) T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form						
First name	Surname		Affiliation			
Click on column headers for help						
Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Include correct page/line#
- A commenter made up numbers (?)
 - Make sure numbers are from correct version. Your editor had to correct these! Without this information it is difficult to find like comments. Also, the comments don't sort correctly.

Comment Number:

Clause: Subclause: Page: Line:

Please use "FM" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft.

If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment.

Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: E ER T TR
E(ditorial) E(ditorial) R(equired) T(echnical) T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form						
First name		Surname		Affiliation		
Click on column headers for help						
Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Do
 - Write comments that are clear and concise.
- Don't
 - Include only partial Information or write ambiguous comments.

See examples of issues on next slides!

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Purpose of Comment Box
 - Explain what the issue is. This may be one word, e.g. “typo”, or may be a few sentences explaining what you think is wrong.
- Purpose of SuggestedRemedy Box
 - Clearly indicate the text you have an issue with and to what it should be changed. This may be a reference to a presentation. If this is the case, the presentation should be sent to the Chief Editor by the comment deadline to be used during creation of Responses to the comments.
 - The SuggestedRemedy should not be a question. This should be a statement of what you want changed.
 - The SuggestedRemedy should not include a justification for the change. This belongs in the Comment box.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- **Don't** put the incorrect text in the "Comment" box and the corrected text in the "SuggestedRemedy" box.
- Do put "typo (grammar, etc.)" in the "Comment" box and put your desired change in the "SuggestedRemedy" box
 - Change: incorrect text
 - To: correct text
- This makes it clear to all what you are asking to have changed and how.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy	
of1000 Mb/s	of 1000 Mb/s	Obvious
64B/65B PCS	RS-FEC PCS (consistency with 10GBASE-T1)	Not so obvious
typo	change "of1000" to "of 1000"	Excellent!

Commenting Do's and Don't

- **Don't** use the comment process to ask questions about why something is the way it is in the spec.
- **Do**
 - Send an email to the reflector with your question.
 - Send an email to someone who is more knowledgeable about the spec or whoever contributed the content to the spec and ask your question.
 - Create a contribution related to your question with information that supports your point of view.
 - Review the contributions that were provided in other meetings related to this topic.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
Does a reset time of 0.5sec make sense given that the link start-up time should be within 100ms	Does 0.5s make sense? I would have expected a maximum value of 50ms rather than 500ms.
"The data path of the MultiGBASE-T1 PMA, depending on type and temperature, may take many seconds to run at optimum error ratio after exiting from reset or lowpower mode."	Is that really acceptable? I would expect a more tightly defined start-up time, like 100ms

Commenting Do's and Don't

- **Don't** leave the SuggestedRemedy blank.
 - If you don't provide a SuggestedRemedy the Editor is not going to create one for you. Editor's don't read minds! These comments will be Rejected!
 - If you are pointing out an issue and there are multiple acceptable solutions, list the possible solutions that would satisfy you. The Task Force can then discuss the possible solutions and select one.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- **Don't** leave the Comment blank unless the SuggestedRemedy clearly indicates the issue and the solution.
 - The issue is clear in this case.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
	Remove 8 from the list of possible interleave options

- The issue is not clear in this case.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
	The PMA Transmit function in the PHY then sends an alert message to the link partner. The Alert signal is a low frequency PAM2 signal. The Alert signal is then followed by a number of Wake frames. After this short recovery time the normal operational mode is resumed.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- **Don't** describe multiple issues in a single comment.
 - Standards Association ballot rules prohibit this and this would be an automatic reject of your comment at that stage.
 - We don't want to get into bad commenting habits that have to be broken later.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- **Don't** include multiple comments in a single presentation.
 - Standards Association ballot rules prohibit this and this would be an automatic reject of your comments at that stage.
 - We don't want to get into bad commenting habits that have to be broken later.
- * If necessary, an individual comment submitted in myBallot may be supplemented by an electronic attachment (file). Such an attachment must relate to a single issue and to a specific line, paragraph, figure, or equation in the balloted draft so that the CRG can address the comment as a single issue.

* From RevCom1217guidelines.pdf

THANK YOU

Backup