

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 99 SC P7 L3 # 1

Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

Change P802.3xx to P802.3cr

SuggestedRemedy

Change P802.3xx to P802.3cr on pages 7 and 9

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P7 L4 # 3

Yseboodt, Lennart Signify

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"The following individuals were officers and members of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group at the beginning of the IEEE P802.3xx Working Group ballot."

SuggestedRemedy

P802.3xx ==> P802.3cr

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 145 SC 145 P100 L1 # 4

Yseboodt, Lennart Signify

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction "Insert new Clause 145 after Clause 130 (Clause 131 to Clause 144 are reserved for future amendments);" does not belong here (it is copied from 802.3bt.)

SuggestedRemedy

Remove editing instruction.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI J SC J P107 L8 # 5

Yseboodt, Lennart Signify

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction "Insert Annex J at the end of the lettered Annexes." I believe needs to come before the title of the Annex (first line).

SuggestedRemedy

Move editing instruction to line 1.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC P L # 7

Stassar, Peter Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The frontpage states: "Draft D2.0 is prepared for Task Force review.". This should be "Working Group ballot" and specifically "Draft D2.1 is prepared for Working Group ballot recirculation"

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the relevant sentence to "Draft D2.1 is prepared for Working Group ballot recirculation"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of 150

CI FM SC FM P1 L22 # 10

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

IEEE802.3cn was approved in 2019.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "802.3cn-20xx" to "802.3cn-2019", also on P10 L49.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of 21, 11

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L22 # 11

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ

IEEE802.3cg was approved in 2019.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "802.3cg-20xx" to "802.3cg-2019" also on P11 L1.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of 21, 10

CI **FM** SC **FM** P23 L7 # 12

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ

According to the SA Editors, the "IMPORTANT NOTICE" is not needed and can be deleted.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete lines 7 through 18.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L22 # 21

Zimmerman, CME Consulting/ADI, APL Group, BMW, Cisco, Comm

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ

802.3cn and 802.3cg are approved as of 2019

SuggestedRemedy

Change 802.3cn-20xx and 802.3cg-20xx to 802.3cn-2019 and 802.3cg-2019, respectively (also at page 10 line 48 and 11 line 1)

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Combined fix for 10, 11 and 21

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L25 # 22

Zimmerman, CME Consulting/ADI, APL Group, BMW, Cisco, Comm

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ

draft is for (initial) working group ballot, not task force review - of course after this change it won't be for initial working group ballot anymore

SuggestedRemedy

Change "task force review" to "working group ballot recirculation"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of 150

CI 15 SC 15 P33 L9 # 31

Ran, Adeee Intel

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ

Editorial instruction should include removing the row for item IR2

SuggestedRemedy

Change instruction to
"Change row IR1 and delete row IR2 in the table, as follows

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 60 SC 60.10.1 P56 L8 # 37

Ran, Adeee Intel

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ

Missing space in editorial instruction before "as"

SuggestedRemedy

Add space

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 145 SC 145.4.1 P100 L20 # 40

Ran, Adeel Intel

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

The words "conform to" are new, but are not marked as such.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline these words.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI J SC J.1 P107 L18 # 42

Ran, Adeel Intel

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

The Greek letter mu (or micro symbol) should be used as the prefix. (3 times)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "us" (with Latin u) to "<greek mu>s" 3 times.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI J SC J.3.2 P108 L20 # 44

Ran, Adeel Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Font size too large for "IEC 62368-1:2018"

SuggestedRemedy

Set to 9 points (as in surrounding text)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 23 SC 23.5.1.1 P34 L13 # 46

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add the following NOTE at the beginning of 23.5.1.1:" with, "Change text in 23.5.1.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 23 SC 23.9.1 P34 L36 # 47

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add the following NOTE at the beginning of 23.9.1:" with, "Change text in 23.9.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 27 SC 27.5.1 P37 L12 # 48

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The permitted editing instructions are change, delete, insert, and replace (see line 22 of page 23). Change marks are not shown with the insert instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add the following NOTE at the beginning of 27.5.1:" with, "Insert the following NOTE at the beginning of 27.5.1:" and delete underline from added text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Add the following NOTE at the beginning of 27.5.1:" with, "Change the following NOTE at the beginning of 27.5.1:" and keep the underline on the text to be consistent with additional comments from this commenter.

CI 9 SC 9.9.3.1 P27 L10 # 49

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add NOTE at the beginning of 9.9.3.1:" with, "Change text in 9.9.3.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 10 SC 10.8.1 P28 L12 # 50

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add NOTE at the beginning of 10.8.1:" with, "Change text in 10.8.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 12 SC 12.10.1 P29 L12 # 51

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add NOTE at the beginning of 12.10.1:" with, "Change text in 12.10.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 14 SC 14.10.4.5.11 P31 L1 # 52

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"item" should be "Items" (plural and capitalized). "IR1a" should become "IR1" in table now, I think.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change Item IR1a and remove item IR1b and IR2 in the table in 14.10.4.5.11 as follows:" with "Change Item IR1a and remove Items IR1b and IR2 in the table in 14.10.4.5.11 as follows:": Replace "IR1a" with "IR1" in the first row of the table (show change marks).

Proposed Response Response Status W

CI 32 SC 32.6.1.1 P38 L13 # 53

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add the following NOTE at the beginning of 32.6.1.1:" with, "Change text in 32.6.1.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 32 SC 32.10.1 P38 L35 # 54

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add the following NOTE at the beginning of 32.10.1:" with, "Change text in 32.10.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.8.6.8 P25 L25 # 55

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Use "as follows" instead of "as shown". "Item" should be capitalized. Instruction could be written more clearly.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change Item 1 and remove item 2 in the table in 8.8.6.8, renumbering remaining PICS as shown:" with, "Change Item 1, remove Item 2, and renumber PICS in the table in 8.8.6.8 as shown:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Change Item 1 and remove item 2 in the table in 8.8.6.8, renumbering remaining PICS as shown:" with, "Change Item 1, remove Item 2 as shown:" (removed the renumbering of PICS which current IEEE editors have requested for ammendments)

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 33 SC 33.7.1 P39 L36 # 56

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change text in 33.7.1 and insert footnote as follows:" with, "Change text in 33.7.1 to add footnote as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 33.8.3.4 P40 L10 # 57

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table" used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. Use "as follows" instead of "as shown". Typo in "unchanged row" clarification (should be "not shown" instead of "not changed"). Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change Table in 33.8.3.4 as shown (unchanged rows not changed):" with, "Change the table in 33.8.3.4 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 33.8.3.9 P40 L37 # 58

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table" used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. Use "as follows" instead of "as shown". Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change Table in 33.8.3.9 as shown (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change the table in 33.8.3.9 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 38 SC 38.7.1 P41 L10 # 59

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Missing space. Text seems a size too large.

SuggestedRemedy

Verify that text is formatted as "Editing Instruction". Replace, "38.7.1as" with "38.7.1 as".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 38 SC 38.12.4 P42 L7 # 60

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Text seems a size too large.

SuggestedRemedy

Verify that header text is formatted as "H3.1.1.1".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 38 SC 38.12.4.1 P42 L13 # 61

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Text seems a size too large.

SuggestedRemedy

Verify that header text is formatted as "H4.1.1.1.1".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 38 SC 38.12.4.1 P42 L15 # 62

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table" used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. Use "as follows" instead of "as are shown". Text seems a size too large. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Verify that text is formatted as "Editing Instruction". Replace, "Change Table in 38.12.4.1 as shown (unchanged rows are not shown):" with, "Change the table in 38.12.4.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 40 SC 40.12.10 P45 L3 # 64

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table" used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. Use "as follows" instead of "as shown".

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change Table in 40.12.10 as shown (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change the table in 40.12.10 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 41 SC 41.4.1 P46 L9 # 65

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Add NOTE at the beginning of 41.4.1:" with, "Change text in 41.4.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 52 SC 52.15.3.11 P48 L11 # 66

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table" used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. Use "as follows" instead of "as shown". "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 52.15.3.11 as shown (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 52.15.3.11 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 53 SC 53.15.4.5 P50 L7 # 67

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table" used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. Use "as follows" instead of "as shown". "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item OM43 in Table in 53.15.4.5 as shown (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item OM43 in the table in 53.15.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 55 SC 55.9.1 P51 L28 # 68

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Missing editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert, "Change text in 55.9.1 as follows:" after clause header.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 55 SC 55.12.9 P52 L23 # 70

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ENV1 in Table in 55.12.9 as shown (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ENV1 in the table in 55.12.9 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 55 SC 55.12.9 P53 L26 # 71

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 58.10.3.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 58.10.3.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 59 SC 59.10.3.6 P55 L10 # 72

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 59.10.3.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 59.10.3.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 60 SC 60.12.4.12 P56 L23 # 73

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 60.12.4.12 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 60.12.4.12 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 70 SC 70.10.4.5 P57 L24 # 74

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 70.10.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 70.10.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 71 SC 71.10.4.6 P59 L10 # 75

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 71.10.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 71.10.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 72 SC 72.9.1 P60 L9 # 76

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Missing space.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "72.9.1as" with "72.9.1 as".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 72 SC 72.10.4.7 P61 L10 # 77

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 72.10.4.7 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 72.10.4.7 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 75 SC 75.10.4.19 P63 L10 # 78

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 75.10.4.19 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 75.10.4.19 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 84 SC 84.11.4.5 P65 L10 # 79

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 84.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 84.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for ES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 86 SC 86.11.4.5 P67 L11 # 80

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Items SES2 and SES3 are unchanged rows. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item SES1 in Table in 86.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item SES1 in the table in 86.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for SES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content. Delete row SES3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 87 SC 87.13.4.6 P69 L11 # 81

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Items XLES2 and XLES3 are unchanged rows. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item XLES1 in Table in 87.13.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item XLES1 in the table in 87.13.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for XLES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content. Delete row XLES3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 88 SC 88.12.4.6 P71 L11 # 82

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Items CES2 and CES3 are unchanged rows. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item CES1 in Table in 88.12.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item CES1 in the table in 88.12.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for CES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content. Delete row CES3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 89 SC 89.11.4.5 P73 L10 # 83

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Items XLES2 and XLES3 are unchanged rows. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item XLES1 in Table in 87.13.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item XLES1 in the table in 87.13.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for XLES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content. Delete row XLES3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 89 SC 89.11.4.5 P73 L10 # 84

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Items XLES2 and XLES3 are unchanged rows. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item XLES1 in Table in 87.13.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item XLES1 in the table in 87.13.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for XLES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content. Delete row XLES3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 93 SC 93.11.4.5 P75 L10 # 85

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 93.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 93.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for ES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 94 SC 94.6.4.6 P77 L10 # 86

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Item ES2 is an unchanged row. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 94.6.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 94.6.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for ES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 95 SC 95.12.4.5 P79 L10 # 87

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Items CES2 and CES3 are unchanged rows. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item CES1 in Table in 95.12.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item CES1 in the table in 95.12.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for CES2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content. Delete row CES3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 96 SC 96.11.4.9 P81 L10 # 88

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 96.11.4.9 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 96.11.4.9 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 97 SC 97.11.13 P83 L8 # 89

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 97.11.13 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 97.11.13 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 100 SC 100.7.3.3 P85 L10 # 90

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 100.7.3.3 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 100.7.3.3 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.8.1 P86 L8 # 91

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Modify first paragraph in 104.8.1 as follows:" with, "Change the first paragraph in 104.8.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.9.4.8 P87 L10 # 92

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown. "item" should be "Items" (plural and capitalized). Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...). Should include table clause reference for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Modify PICS item ENV1 and ENV2 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Items ENV1 and ENV2 in the table in 104.9.4.8 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 112 SC 112.11.4.5 P89 L7 # 93

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item CES1 in Table in 112.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item CES1 in the table in 112.11.4.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 113 SC 113.12.6 P91 L7 # 94

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Items" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS items PME1 and PME2 in Table in 113.12.6 as follows (unchanged rows are not shown):" with, "Change PICS Items PME1 and PME2 in the table in 113.12.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Change PICS items PME1 and PME2 in Table in 113.12.6 as follows (unchanged rows are not shown):" with, "Change PICS Items PME1 and PME2 in the table in 113.12.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

CI 113 SC 113.12.10 P91 L22 # 95

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ENV1 in Table in 113.12.10 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ENV1 in the table in 113.12.10 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 122 SC 122.9.1 P92 L9 # 96

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Modify 122.9.1 as follows:" with, "Change 122.9.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 122 SC 122.10.4.8 P93 L10 # 97

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...). Should include table clause reference for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS entry ES1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 122.10.4.8 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 126 SC 126.12.5 P95 L8 # 98

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Items" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS items PME1 and PME2 in Table in 126.12.5 as follows (unchanged rows are not shown):" with, "Change PICS Items PME11 and PME2 in the table in 126.12.5 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 126 SC 126.12.9 P95 L23 # 99

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Items ENV2, ENV3, and ENV4 are unchanged rows. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ENV1 in Table in 126.12.9 as follows:" with, "Change PICS Item ENV1 in the table in 126.12.9 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Replace row for ENV2 with one merged row that contains ellipses (...) as content. Delete rows ENV3 and ENV4.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 128 SC 128.9.1 P96 L8 # 100

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Missing editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert, "Change text in 128.9.1 as follows:" after clause header.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 128 SC 128.10.4.5 P97 L10 # 101

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Should include table clause reference for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 as follows:" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 128.10.4.5 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 130 SC 130.9.1 P98 L9 # 102

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Modify 130.9.1 as follows:" with, "Change 130.9.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 130 SC 130.10.4.6 P99 L10 # 103

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be referenced and capitalized. Should include table clause reference for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICs entry ES1 as follows:" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 130.10.4.6 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 145 SC 145.4.1 P100 L10 # 104

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Modify 145.4.1 as follows:" with, "Change 145.4.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 145 SC 145.6.1 P101 L5 # 105

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editorial insert should be "change" if revision marks are shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Modify 145.6.1 as follows:" with, "Change 145.6.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 145 SC 145.7.3.7 P102 L9 # 106

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be capitalized. Unchanged rows should be represented by one merged row containing ellipses (...).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change PICS item ES1 in Table in 145.7.3.7 as follows (unchanged rows are not shown):" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.7.3.7 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):". Add one merged row that contains ellipses (...).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 83A SC 83A.7.7 P110 L10 # 107

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be referenced and capitalized. Should include PICS Item and table clause reference for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change Table in 83A.7.7 as follows:" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 83A.7.7 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 83B SC 83B.4.6 P112 L9 # 108

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table used as a reference in this way is not capitalized in other parts of the document. "Item" should be referenced and capitalized. Should include PICS Item and table clause reference for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Change Table in 83B.4.6 as follows:" with, "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 83B.4.6 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 86A SC 86A.8.4.4 P114 L20 # 110

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There is a typo in the PICS numbering in the source 802.3-2018 Standard.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "SES3" with, "SES2"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.0 Maintenance #14: Isolation Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 145 SC 145 P100 L1 # 142

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The confusing editorial instruction in IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018 doesn't belong in this document

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the editorial instruction

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of Comment 4

CI FM SC FM P1 L1 # 148

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

A friendly reminder that we have entered a new decade.

SuggestedRemedy

It is typical to change date on line 1, and on page header, but also remember to change copyright year on line 29 and p.2 I.46, and page footer. Also change year on p.8, I.1 from "201x" to "202x".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of 151

CI FM SC FM P8 L1 # 151

Thompson, Geoff GraCaSI S.A./Independent

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

It will never be 201X again.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "201X" to "202X"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of 148

CI 14 SC 14.3.1.1 P30 L13 # 154

Thompson, Geoff GraCaSI S.A./Independent

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

Text needs to pick up 802.3bt clause

SuggestedRemedy

Add reference to bt clause.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Modify sentence from:

"A MAU with a MDI that is a PI (see 33.1.3) shall meet the isolation requirements defined in 33.4.1."

To:

"A MAU with a MDI that is a PI (see 33.1.3) shall meet the isolation requirements defined in 33.4.1 or 145.4.1."

CI 14 SC 14.7 P30 L30 # 155

Thompson, Geoff GraCaSI S.A./Independent

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

Extra period in front of E in Environmental.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.