Cl **9** *SC* **9.9.3.1** *P* **27** *L* **14** # 129

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**

I recognize the dilemma with depricated clauses, but disagree with what I assume was the decision on how to deal with doing maintenance to a deprecated clause that we indicate "maintenance changes are not longer being considered". Perhaps the standard NOTE should refer to "mIntenance change requests" rather than maintenance changes. The insertion of a pointer to the new Annex J is a change, so as long as a change is being done, do it completely. Inserting the pointer to Annex J and retaining the isolation requirements is confusing and opens the possibility for two different sets of safety specifications.

SuggestedRemedy

Either strike out the text as is done for non-deprecated clauses or change the NOTE to strongly indicate that superceding text is in Annex J (e.g., Safety information that supercedes the safety instructions in this subclause." If accepted, similar changes will need to be made to other deprecated clauses in this draft (separate comments pointing to this one are entered per RevCom conventions).

Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

Cl **10** *SC* **10.8.1** *P* **28** *L* **16** # 130

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, The inclusion of safety instructions and a pointer to safety instructions present the possibility of conflicting directions to an implementer.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

Cl **12** *SC* **12.10.1** *P* **29** *L* **16** # 131

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, if a change to the words of the inserted NOTE are chosen as the best solution, then this inserted NOTE also needs to be changed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

Cl **23** *SC* **23.5.1.1** *P* **34** *L* **15** # 132

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, The inclusion of safety instructions and a pointer to safety instructions present the possibility of conflicting directions to an implementer.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **23**
SC **23.5.1.1**

Page 1 of 3
2/19/2020 10:27:31 AM

Cl **23**　　　*SC* **23.9.1**　　　　　*P* **34**　　　*L* **38**　　　# `133`

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, if a change to the words of the inserted NOTE are chosen as the best solution, then this inserted NOTE also needs to be changed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

Cl **27**　　　*SC* **27.5.1.**　　　　　*P* **37**　　　*L* **12**　　　# `134`

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, if a change to the words of the inserted NOTE are chosen as the best solution, then this inserted NOTE also needs to be changed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

Cl **32**　　　*SC* **32.6.1.1**　　　　　*P* **38**　　　*L* **15**　　　# `135`

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, The inclusion of safety instructions and a pointer to safety instructions present the possibility of conflicting directions to an implementer.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

Cl **32**　　　*SC* **32.10.1**　　　　　*P* **38**　　　*L* **37**　　　# `136`

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, if a change to the words of the inserted NOTE are chosen as the best solution, then this inserted NOTE also needs to be changed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **32**
SC **32.10.1**

Page 2 of 3
2/19/2020 10:27:31 AM

Cl **41**   *SC* **41.4.1**   *P* **46**   *L* **12**   # 137

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Per my (Grow) comment on 9.9.3.1, if a change to the words of the inserted NOTE are chosen as the best solution, then this inserted NOTE also needs to be changed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change (or not) consistent with 9.9.3.1.

Response   *Response Status*   **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A NOTE is informative by definition (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.4.3), and therefore, addition of a NOTE is not considered a maintenance change to the clause. The pointer to Annex J is thought to be helpful to anyone that might still need to use the clause.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **41**
SC **41.4.1**

Page 3 of 3
2/19/2020 10:27:31 AM