## IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

| C/ 00  | SC 0                       | P <b>10</b>   | L <b>30</b>      | # 26                  | C/ 10  | SC 10.8.3   | P <b>29</b>   | L13          | # 5                                     |  |  |
|--|----------------------------|---|------------------|-----------------------|--|---|---|--------------|---|--|--|
| Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company  |                            |   |                  |                       | Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  |   |   |              |   |  |  |
| Commen   | t Type E                   | Comment Status D  |                  |                       | Comment  | Type ER   | Comment Status D  |              |   |  |  |
| amer   | ndments". Consid           | endment to 802.3, so it's not<br>ler with other related Maguire | comment. Note:   | this comment was also | As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence. |   |   |              |   |  |  |
|  | J                          | .3cv (please coordinate resolu                                  | ution with TG Cr | air).                 | SuggestedRemedy  |   |   |              |   |  |  |
| 00   | edRemedy                   |   |                  |                       | Insert   | following Change  | e instruction: Editor"s Note (to                          | be removed p | prior to publication):                  |  |  |
|  | te, "and its amend         | dments,"  |                  |                       |  |   | ald edit "Since 202x" in dit second sentence to read: "\$ |              | with month and year of 202x, electrical |  |  |
| '  | d Response                 | Response Status W   |                  |                       |  | ements"   | an occord contenies to read.                              | 511100       | , ZOZX, GIGOTIIOAI                      |  |  |
| PRO  | POSED ACCEPT               | Г.  |                  |                       | Proposed   | Response  | Response Status W   |              |   |  |  |
| C/ 00  | SC 0                       | P11   | L <b>3</b>       | # 25                  | PROF   | POSED ACCEPT  |   |              |   |  |  |
| Maguire,   | Valerie                    | The Siemon  | Company          |                       | C/ 12  | SC 12.10.1  | P <b>30</b>   | L13          | # 6                                     |  |  |
| Commen   | t Type <b>E</b>            | Comment Status D  |                  |                       | Grow, Ro   | bert  | RMG Consulti  | ng           |   |  |  |
|  |                            | ndments," is not used when d                                    |                  |                       | Comment Type ER Comment Status D   |   |   |              |   |  |  |
| 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr. Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair).  |                            |   |                  |                       |  | As it reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.   |   |              |   |  |  |
|  | edRemedy                   |   |                  |                       | Suggeste   |   |   |              |   |  |  |
| Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could add "and its amendments" to the 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments".  Proposed Response Response Status W  PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. |                            |   |                  |                       |  | Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of |   |              |   |  |  |
|  |                            |   |                  |                       |  | approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since 202x, electrical requirements"   |   |              |   |  |  |
|  |                            |   |                  |                       |  | Response  | Response Status W   |              |   |  |  |
| TFTE   |                            | 700   | 145              | ш                     |  |   |   |              | u [-                                    |  |  |
| C/ 9   | SC 9.1.3.1                 | P <b>28</b>   | L15              | # 4                   | C/ <b>12</b>   | SC 12.10.1  | P <b>30</b>   | L13          | # 1                                     |  |  |
| Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  |                            |   |                  |                       |  | rthur   | Cadence Desi  | gn Systems   |   |  |  |
| Comment Type ER Comment Status D   |                            |   |                  |                       |  | Comment Type T Comment Status D   |   |              |   |  |  |
| It wo  | uld be more helpf          | ful to the reader to add a date                                 | to the NOTE.     |                       | Shou   | ld the word "isola  | tion" be included?  |              |   |  |  |
| SuggestedRemedy  |                            |   |                  |                       |  | SuggestedRemedy   |   |              |   |  |  |
| Publi  | cation editor shou         | ge instruction: Editor"s Note (i                                | n below NOTE w   | ith month and year of | Change "Electrical requirements are in J.1" to "Electrical isolation requirements are specified in J.1"    |   |   |              |   |  |  |
| approval. At line 15, edit sentence to read: "Since 202x, electrical isolation"  Proposed Response Response Status W   |                            |   |                  |                       |  | Response  | Response Status W   |              |   |  |  |
| •  | a Response<br>POSED ACCEPT | Response Status <b>W</b>  |                  |                       | PROF   | POSED ACCEPT  | •   |              |   |  |  |

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl 12 SC 12.10.1 Page 1 of 5 3/13/2020 1:49:18 PM

## IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

| CI <b>23</b>  | SC 23.5.1.1   | P <b>35</b>   | L13                 | # 7                     | CI 23  | SC 23.9.1  | P <b>35</b>  | L38               | # 8                      |  |  |  |
|---|---|---|---------------------|-------------------------|--|--|--|-------------------|--------------------------|--|--|--|
| Grow, Robert RMG Consulting   |   |   |                     |                         | Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  |  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| Comment Type ER Comment Status D  |   |   |                     |                         |  | Comment Type ER Comment Status D   |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| sente   |   | hink the September 200<br>why the note talks abou<br>irement"               |                     |                         | sente  | nce.   | night think the September 200  | 3 date applies to | o the safety information |  |  |  |
|   | dRemedy   | TOTTOTIC .  |                     |                         | SuggestedRemedy  |  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| Inser<br>Publi<br>appro   | t following Change inst                             | ruction: Editor"s Note (t<br>it "Since 202x" ir<br>cond sentence to read: " | n below NOTE w      | ith month and year of   | Public<br>appro<br>"   | ation editor shou  | e instruction: Editor"s Note (to<br>ald edit "Since 202x" in<br>dit second sentence to read: ":<br>Response Status W | below NOTE w      | ith month and year of    |  |  |  |
| Proposed  | l Response Re                                       | esponse Status W  |                     |                         | •  | POSED ACCEPT   | •  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| PRO   | POSED ACCEPT.                                       | ,   |                     |                         |  | OOLD ACCEL I   | •  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
|   | 00.00.544   | D05   |                     | # 0                     | CI 27  | SC 27.5.1  | P38  | L12               | # 9                      |  |  |  |
| CI <b>23</b>  | SC 23.5.1,1   | P <b>35</b>   | L15                 | # 2                     | Grow, Ro   | bert   | RMG Consulti   | ng                |                          |  |  |  |
| Marris, A   |   | Cadence Des   | sign Systems        |                         | Comment  | Type ER  | Comment Status D   |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| Commen  | ,,  | Comment Status D  |                     |                         |  |  | night think the September 201  | 1 date applies to | o the safety information |  |  |  |
|   | y information is in J.2 r                           | not J.1   |                     |                         | sente  |  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| Suggeste  | dRemedy   |   |                     |                         | Suggeste   | ,  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| J.1. S  |   | to J.2 or change to say and similar issue in 38.7                           |                     |                         | Public   | ation editor shou  | e instruction: Editor"s Note (to<br>ald edit "Since 202x" in<br>dit second sentence to read: "                       | below NOTE w      | ith month and year of    |  |  |  |
| Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.   |   |   |                     |                         |  | Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.   |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
|   | i.2 is correct, nowever,<br>not safety requirements | the sentence needs to a   | clearly call out is | olation requirements    | C/ 32  | SC 32.6.1.1  | P <b>39</b>  | L15               | # 10                     |  |  |  |
|   |   |   |                     |                         | Grow, Ro   | bert   | RMG Consulti   | na                |                          |  |  |  |
| Chan  |   | 2003 maintenance char   | naes are no long    | er heing considered for | Comment Type ER Comment Status D   |  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| "NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Safety information may be found in J.1." to: "NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for |   |   |                     |                         |  | As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement". |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
| this clause. Electrical isolation information may be found in J.1."   |   |   |                     |                         | SuggestedRemedy  Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since 202x, isolaton requirements" |  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
|   |   |   |                     |                         |  |  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
|   |   |   |                     |                         | PROF   | OSED ACCEPT  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |
|   |   |   |                     |                         |  |  |  |                   |                          |  |  |  |

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **32** SC **32.6.1.1**  Page 2 of 5 3/13/2020 1:49:18 PM

| Cl 32   | SC 32.10.1                 | P <b>39</b>   | L37                 | # 11                  | Cl <b>97</b>   | SC 97.9.1   | P <b>86</b>  | L <b>9</b>                            | # 14                       |  |  |  |
|---|----------------------------|---|---------------------|-----------------------|--|---|--|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|--|--|--|
| Grow, Robert  |                            | RMG Consul  | ting                |                       | Wienckow   | /ski, Natalie   | General Moto   | rs Company                            |                            |  |  |  |
| Commer  | t Type ER                  | Comment Status D  |                     |                       | Comment  | Type <b>E</b>   | Comment Status D   |                                       | EZ                         |  |  |  |
| As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.   |                            |   |                     |                       |  | With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace". |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| Suggeste  | edRemedy                   |   |                     |                       | SuggestedRemedy  |   |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| Publ  | ication editor shou        | e instruction: Editor"s Note (<br>uld edit "Since 202x" i<br>dit second sentence to read: | n below NOTE w      | ith month and year of | Altern   |   | ction to "Replace all text in 96.<br>make the editing instruction "D                         |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| "   |                            |   |                     |                       | Proposed Response Response Status <b>W</b> PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. |   |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| •   | d Response<br>POSED ACCEPT | Response Status W   |                     |                       |  |   |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| C/ 41   | SC 41.4.1                  | P <b>48</b>   | L13                 | # 12                  | Chan   | ge editing instruc  | ction to "Replace all text in 96.  | 9.1 with the follo                    | wing text."                |  |  |  |
|   |                            |   |                     | # 12                  | C/ 146   | SC 146.9.1  | P116   | L12                                   | # 23                       |  |  |  |
| Grow, Ro  |                            | RMG Consul  Comment Status D  | ung                 |                       | Zimmerm  | an, George  | CME Cons/Al  | DI, Cisco, Comn                       | nScope, Marvell, SenTe     |  |  |  |
|   | ,,                         | night think the September 20  | 11 data applies t   | a the electrical      | Comment  | Type <b>E</b>   | Comment Status D   |                                       | EZ                         |  |  |  |
|   | rements sentence           | •   | i i date applies t  | o the electrical      |  |   | the PICS has been used for 1   |                                       | editing instruction for    |  |  |  |
| Suggeste  | edRemedy                   |   |                     |                       |  | •   | ong with strikeout and underlin  | e in 146.9.1                          |                            |  |  |  |
|   | -                          | e instruction: Editor"s Note (  | to be removed p     | rior to publication): | SuggestedRemedy  |   |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
|   |                            | uld edit "Since 202x" i<br>dit second sentence to read:                                   |                     |                       | (unch:<br>Add n  | anged rows not s<br>ew editing instru   | on "Change PICS Item ES1 in<br>shown):" on P116 L12 to P117<br>ction at P116 L12: "Change to | ' L10, under 146<br>ext in 146.9.1 as | 3.11.4.6 header<br>shown:" |  |  |  |
| Propose   | d Response                 | Response Status W   |                     |                       | Add te   | ext in strikeout, b   | etween (existing) "to " and (in  | serted) "J.2", "IE                    | :C 60950-1, IEC 62368-     |  |  |  |
| PRC   | POSED ACCEPT               | <del>.</del>  |                     |                       | Proposed   |   |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| C/ 96   | SC 96.9.1                  | P <b>84</b>   | L <b>9</b>          | # [13                 | •  | OSED ACCEPT   | Response Status <b>W</b>   |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| Wiencko   | wski, Natalie              | General Moto  | ors Company         |                       | C/ 146   | SC 146.9.1  | P116   | L14                                   | # 16                       |  |  |  |
| Commer  | t Type <b>E</b>            | Comment Status D  |                     | EZ                    | Wienckov   | /ski, Natalie   | General Moto   | rs Company                            | <u> </u>                   |  |  |  |
| With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace". |                            |   |                     |                       |  | Туре Е  | Comment Status D   |                                       | EZ                         |  |  |  |
| Suggeste  | edRemedy                   |   |                     |                       |  |   | being deleted by cr is shown in  | n strikethrough.                      |                            |  |  |  |
|   |                            | ction to "Replace all text in 96  |                     |                       | SuggestedRemedy  |   |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."   |                            |   |                     |                       |  | Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1" To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1"  |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| Proposed Response Response Status W   |                            |   |                     |                       |  | Response  | Response Status W  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.   |                            |   |                     |                       | PROF   | OSED ACCEPT   | Ī.   |                                       |                            |  |  |  |
| Char  | nae editina instruc        | tion to "Replace all text in 96   | .9.1 with the follo | owing text."          |  |   |  |                                       |                            |  |  |  |

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 146 SC 146.9.1 Page 3 of 5 3/13/2020 1:49:18 PM C/ 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L14 # 22 C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L12 # 18 Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTe Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type T Comment Status D Comment Type E Comment Status D ΕZ As written, this would bring in all the port isolation tests. The change to clause 147 seems Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough. more appropriate here, incorporating just the general safety requirements in J.2. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1" Change "shall conform to J.2" to "shall conform to the general safety requirements in J.2". To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1" Change PICS item ES1 (page 117) feature to read the same. Proposed Response Response Status W Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L12 # 20 C/ 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L19 Wienckowski. Natalie General Motors Company Wienckowski. Natalie General Motors Company EΖ Comment Type E Comment Status D ΕZ Comment Type E Comment Status D There is new text that is not underlined. The editor's note is no longer needed. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Underline: "the general safety requirements in" Delete Editor's Note. Proposed Response Response Status W Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L13 # 21 C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L11 # 24 Wienckowski. Natalie General Motors Company Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI. Cisco. CommScope. Marvell. SenTe EΖ Comment Type E Comment Status D Comment Type E Comment Status D EΖ There is new text that is not underlined. 147.10.1 needs editing instruction (I understand an other commenter has dealt with SuggestedRemedy strikeout & underline) Underline: ",as appropriate" SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status W Add new editing instruction at P118 L11 (after header for 147.10.1) "Change text of 147.10.1 as shown:" PROPOSED ACCEPT. Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L17 # 19

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editor's note is no longer needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Editor's Note.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149 P119 L1 # 15

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

The text in 149 is identical to P802.3ch D3.2. As P802.3ch will be published prior to

P802.3cr and P802.3cr is not making any changes to this, this Clause is not needed in cr. SuggestedRemedv

Comment Status D

Delete Clause 149 and all subclauses from P802.3cr.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 149 SC 149.9.1 P119 L16 # 3

Carlson, Steven Robert Bosch, Ethernovia

P802.3ch and P802.3cr are now aligned and the Editor's Note is no longer needed.

Comment Status D

SuggestedRemedy

Comment Type T

Duplicate of #17

Comment Type T

Remove Editor's Note at line 16:

Editor's Note (to be removed prior to SA ballot)—Clause 149 was added by IEEE P802.3ch which is currently in Standards Association ballot and is expected to be completed prior to this draft. Comments are invited to bring in approved text of IEEE P802.3ch and modify to align with the purposes of this draft.

Proposed Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE comment #15

Cl J SC J.1 P123 L18 # 27

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D

It seems as though a definite article ("The") is not needed here. Start the clause with, "Electrical isolation shall..."

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the underlined word "The", extend the strikeout under the word "This" to the next empty space, add an "E" in underline immediately before the start of the word "electrical", add a strikeout to the "e" in "electrical".

Proposed Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TFTD.

Comment against D2.1 changed "This" to "The". "This Electrical ... " has been used in the isolation for some time.