IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 12 SC 12.10.1 L13 CI 23 P35 L15 P30 # 1 SC 23.5.1.1 # 2 Cadence Design Systems Marris, Arthur Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems Comment Type Т Comment Status A F7 Comment Type T Comment Status A Should the word "isolation" be included? Safety information is in J.2 not J.1 SuggestedRemedy SugaestedRemedy Change "Electrical requirements are in J.1" to "Electrical isolation requirements are Either change the reference to J.2 or change to say isolation requirements are specified in specified in J.1" J.1. Same issue in 32.6.1.1 and similar issue in 38.7.1 (where text refers to isolation rather than general safety) Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Resolved by Comment 6: Resolution to Comment 6 is: The J.2 is correct, however, the sentence needs to clearly call out isolation requirements and not safety requirements. ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE Page 35 line 15 change: Page 30 line 12 Add: "Safety information may be found in J.1." "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval." "Electrical isolation requirements are in J.1." Page 30 line 13 change the sentence to the following: Page 35 line 38 change: "NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for "Safety information may be found in J.2." this clause. Since ____ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1." "Safety information is in J.2." C/ 149 SC 149.9.1 P119 L16 # 3 Robert Bosch, Ethernovia Carlson, Steven Comment Status A Comment Type T P802.3ch and P802.3cr are now aligned and the Editor's Note is no longer needed. SuggestedRemedy Remove Editor's Note at line 16: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to SA ballot)-Clause 149 was added by IEEE P802.3ch which is currently in Standards Association ballot and is expected to be completed prior to this draft. Comments are invited to bring in approved text of IEEE P802.3ch and modify to align with the purposes of this draft.

Response

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Response Status C

CI 9	SC 9.1.3.1	P 28	L15	# 4	C/ 12	SC 12.10.1	1	P 30	L13	# 6		
Grow, Robert RMG Consulting						Grow, Robert RMG Consulting						
Comme	nt Type ER	Comment Status A	Comment Type ER Comment Status A									
It would be more helpful to the reader to add a date to the NOTE.						As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the electrical						
Sugges	edRemedy				•	ements senten	ice.					
		e instruction: Editor"s Note (SuggestedRemedy								
Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit sentence to read: "Since 202x, electrical isolation"						Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of						
Respon	se	Response Status W			approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since 202x, electrical requirements"							
ACC	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				Response)	Response Sta	atus W				
Add	Editor's Note at Pa	age 28 Line 11.			ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.							
"Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."						Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1.						
Change Page 28 line 12 to the following: "NOTE—Since 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."					Page 30 line 12 Add: "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."							
C/ 10	SC 10.8.3	P 29	L13	# 5		_		•				
Grow, Robert RMG Consulting						Page 30 line 13 change the sentence to the following: "NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for						
Comment Type ER Comment Status A						this clause. Since 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."						
	t reads, a reader m iirements sentence	ight think the September 20°	1 date applies t	o the electrical								
Sugges	edRemedy											
Pub app	lication editor shou	e instruction: Editor"s Note (Id edit "Since 202x" in lit second sentence to read:	n below NOTE w	ith month and year of								
Respon	se	Response Status W										
ACC	CEPT IN PRINCIPL	.E.										

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1.

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Change Page 29 line 13 to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for
this clause. Since _____ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Page 29 line 12: Add

C/ 23	SC 23.5.1.1	P 35	L13	# 7	Cl 27	SC :	27.5.1	P 38	L12	# 9			
Grow, Robe	ert	RMG Consul	ing		Grow, Rob	pert		RMG Cons	ulting				
Comment 7	ype ER Co.	mment Status A			Comment	Туре	ER	Comment Status A					
senten	ce. It also isn't clear w	hy the note talks abou		the safety information tion" when the	As it r sente		reader m	ight think the September 2	011 date applies	to the safety information			
	use is "Isolation require	ement".			Suggested	dRemed	ly						
Publica approva	ollowing Change instru tion editor should edit al. At line 15, edit seco	"Since 202x" i	n below NOTE w	ith month and year of	Public	ation ed	litor shou	e instruction: Editor"s Note Id edit "Since 202x" lit second sentence to reac	in below NOTE	with month and year of			
_ •	ments"	2			Response	•		Response Status W					
Response		ponse Status W			ACCE	PT IN P	RINCIPL	E.					
Page 3 "Editor'	PT IN PRINCIPLE. 5 line 14 add Editor's Note (to be removed 202x" in below NOTE	d prior to publication):		r should edit "Since		r"s Note	to be re	ditor's Note: moved prior to publication; NOTE with month and yea		tor should edit "Since			
"NOTE	5 lin 15 change line to —Since September 20 use. Since 202x,	003, maintenance cha		er being considered for J.1."	"NŎT this cl	E—Sinc ause. Si	e Septenince	e line to the following: nber 2011, maintenance ch _ 202x, safety information i	s in J.2."				
C/ 23	SC 23.9.1	P 35	L38	# 8	Cl 32		32.6.1.1	P 39	L15	# 10			
Grow, Robe	ert	RMG Consul	ina		Grow, Rob			RMG Cons	uiting				
Comment 7		mment Status A	. 3		Comment	,,	ER	Comment Status A ight think the September 2	002 data applica	to the cofety information			
	ads, a reader might thi		03 date applies to	the safety information	sentei	nce. It a	also isn't (clear why the note talks ab requirement".					
Suggestedl	Remedy				Suggested	dRemed	ly						
Publica	ollowing Change instru tion editor should edit al. At line 38, edit seco	"Since 202x" i	n below NOTE w		Public appro	ation ed	litor shou ne 15, ec	e instruction: Editor"s Note ld edit "Since 202x" lit second sentence to reac	in below NOTE	with month and year of			
Response	Res	ponse Status W			Response)		Response Status W					
ACCEF	PT.				ACCE	PT IN P	RINCIPL	.E.					
						Page 39 line 14 add Editor's Note: "Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."							
					"NOT	E—Sinc	e Septen	e line to the following: nber 2003, maintenance ch 202x, safety information i		ger being considered for			

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID 10

Page 3 of 7 3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM

CI 32	SC 32.10.1	P 39	L 37	# 11	C/ 96	SC 96.9.1	P 84	L 9	# 13			
Grow, Robert RMG Consulting		Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company										
Comment Type ER Comment Status A					Comment	Type E	Comment Status A					
As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.						With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".						
SuggestedRemedy						SuggestedRemedy						
Public	cation editor sho	ge instruction: Editor"s Note (t uld edit "Since 202x" ir dit second sentence to read: "	n below NOTE v	vith month and year of	Alterna		ction to "Replace all text in 96.9 make the editing instruction "D					
"					Response		Response Status C					
Response		Response Status W			ACCE	PT IN PRINCIP	LE.					
ACCE	EPT IN PRINCIP	LE.			Chana	a aditina inatuu	otion to "Doloto all tout in OC O	1 and Incort tha	following tout "			
Page	39 line 36 add E	ditor's Note:			Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."							
	or"s Note (to be r	emoved prior to publication):		or should edit "Since	Cl 97	SC 97.9.1	P 86	L 9	# 14			
	_ 202x" in below	NOTE with month and year o	of approval."		Wienckow	ski, Natalie	General Motor	s Company	-			
		ge line to the following:			Comment	Type E	Comment Status A					
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since 202x, safety information is in J.2."					With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".							
C/ 41	SC 41.4.1	P 48	L13	# 12	Suggested	dRemedy						
Grow, Rol	pert	RMG Consult	ina				ction to "Replace all text in 96.9					
Comment		Comment Status A	3			atively you can i ng text."	make the editing instruction "D	elete all text in 9	97.9.1 and Insert the			
		night think the September 201	1 date applies t	to the electrical	Response	_	Response Status C					
requir	ements sentenc	e.			•	PT IN PRINCIP	•					
Suggeste	dRemedy											
Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of						Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."						
		dit second sentence to read: "			C/ 149	SC 149	P 119	<i>L</i> 1	# 15			
"	2, 2			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	Wienckow	ski, Natalie	General Motor	s Company				
Response Response Status W						Type T	Comment Status A	. ,				
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.						The text in 149 is identical to P802.3ch D3.2. As P802.3ch will be published prior to						
Page 48 line 12 add Editor's Note: "Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since						P802.3cr and P802.3cr is not making any changes to this, this Clause is not needed in cr.						
						lRemedy						
		n below NOTE with month and year of approval."				Delete Clause 149 and all subclauses from P802.3cr.						
Page	48 line 13 chanc	ge line to the following:			Response		Response Status C					
"NŎT		mber 2011, maintenance char _ 202x, safety information is i		ger being considered for	ACCE	PT.	•					

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID 15

Page 4 of 7 3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM

C/ 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L14 C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L17 # 16 # 19 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company General Motors Company Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough. The editor's note is no longer needed. SuggestedRemedy SugaestedRemedy Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1" Delete Editor's Note. To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1" Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT. Duplicate of #17 SC 146.9.1 C/ 146 P116 L19 # 17 SC 147.10.1 P118 / 12 C/ 147 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A ΕZ Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 The editor's note is no longer needed. There is new text that is not underlined. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Delete Editor's Note. Underline: "the general safety requirements in" Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT. C/ 147 P118 SC 147.10.1 L12 # 18 C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L13 # 21 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company EΖ Comment Type E Comment Status A Comment Type E Comment Status A ΕZ Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough. There is new text that is not underlined. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1" To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1" Underline: ",as appropriate" Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 147 P118 C/ 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L14 # 22 SC 147.10.1 / 11 # 24 CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek Zimmerman, George Zimmerman, George Comment Type T Comment Status D Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 As written, this would bring in all the port isolation tests. The change to clause 147 seems 147.10.1 needs editing instruction (I understand an other commenter has dealt with more appropriate here, incorporating just the general safety requirements in J.2. strikeout & underline) SugaestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Change "shall conform to J.2" to "shall conform to the general safety requirements in J.2". Add new editing instruction at P118 L11 (after header for 147.10.1) "Change text of Change PICS item ES1 (page 117) feature to read the same. 147.10.1 as shown:" Proposed Response Response Status Z Response Response Status C REJECT. ACCEPT. This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter. C/ 00 SC 0 P11 **L3** The Siemon Company Maguire, Valerie C/ 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L12 # 23 Comment Type E Comment Status A The text, "and its amendments," is not used when describing 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek 802.3cg, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr. Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this Comment Type E Comment Status A EΖ comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair). Editing instruction for the PICS has been used for 146.9.1, and the editing instruction for SuggestedRemedy 146.9.1 is missing, along with strikeout and underline in 146.9.1 Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could SuggestedRemedy add "and its amendments" to the 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and Move editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments". (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to P117 L10, under 146,11,4,6 header Response Response Status C Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:" Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. 1." Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3. Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. C/ 00 SC 0 P10 L30 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company Page 116 Line 12 delete editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to Comment Type E Comment Status A 802.3cb is the first amendment to 802.3, so it's not changing "IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and its Page 117 Line 10, add editing instruction: "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in amendments". Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also 146.11.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair). SuggestedRemedy Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:" Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-Delete. "and its amendments." 1,"

Response

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID 26

Response Status C

Page 6 of 7 3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM

CIJSC J.1 P**123** L18 # 27 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company Comment Type E Comment Status A It seems as though a definite article ("The") is not needed here. Start the clause with, "Electrical isolation shall..." SuggestedRemedy Delete the underlined word "The". extend the strikeout under the word "This" to the next empty space, add an "E" in underline immediately before the start of the word "electrical", add a strikeout to the "e" in "electrical". Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change line as follows: "The electrical isolation..." to "Electrical isolation..." CI 9 SC 9 P28 L**5** Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A LATE Sub-clause 9.9 is missing between Clause 9 and sub-clause 9.9.3. SuggestedRemedy Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL" Response Response Status C ACCEPT. SC 112.11 C/ 112 P93 L5 Wienckowski. Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A IATE Sub-clause 112.11.4 is missing between sub-clause 112.11 and sub-clause 112.11.4.5. SuggestedRemedy Before 112.11.4.5 add "112.11.4 PICS proforma tables for Physical Medium Dependent (PMD) sublayer and medium, type 25GBASE-SR" Response Response Status C ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID