Comment Type E Comment Status A 802.3cb is the first amendments to 80.2.3c is it's not changing "IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and its amendments" Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair). Suggested/Remedy Delete, "and its amendments," Response Response Status C ACCEPT. The Siemon Company Comment Type E Comment Status A The text, "and its amendments," Is not used when describing 802.3bt, 802.3cd,								
Comment Type	# 4							
amendments". Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair). SuggestedRemedy Delete, "and its amendments," Response Response Status C ACCEPT. CI 00 SC 0 P11 L3 # 25 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company Comment Type E Comment Status A The text, "and its amendments," is not used when describing 802.3ct, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, and 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments." SuggestedRemedy Delete "and its amendments," if from page 11 line 3. CI 9 SC 9 P28 L5 # 28 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3. SuggestedRemedy Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL" Response Response Status C								
SuggestedRemedy Delete, "and its amendments," Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Cl 00 SC 0 P11 L3 # 25 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company Comment Type E Comment Status A The text, "and its amendments," is not used when describing 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr. Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair). SuggestedRemedy Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could add "and its amendments" to the 802.3ct, 802.3cd, 802.3cr, 802.3cr ext, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments". Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3. Cl 9 SC 9 P28 L5 # 28 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A LATE Sub-clause 9.9 is missing between Clause 9 and sub-clause 9.9.3. SuggestedRemedy Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL" Response Response Status C	E.							
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add Editor's Note at Page 28 Line 11. "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed agroval." Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed agroval." Add Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed agroval." Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed agroval." Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval." Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval." Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval." Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval." Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication ed to removed prior to publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publi	TE with month and year of							
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company Comment Type E Comment Status A The text, "and its amendments," is not used when describing 802.3bt, 802.3cd,								
802.3cm, and 802.3cr. Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cr. (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair). SuggestedRemedy Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could add "and its amendments" to the 802.3ct, 802.3cd, 802.3cd, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments". Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3. CI 9 SC 9 P28 L5 # 28 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A LATE Sub-clause 9.9 is missing between Clause 9 and sub-clause 9.9.3. SuggestedRemedy Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL" Response Response Status C								
Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could add "and its amendments" to the 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cn, and 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments". Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3. CI 9 SC 9 P28 L5 # 28 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies requirements sentence. SuggestedRemedy Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since requirements" Response Response Status A As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies requirements sentence. SuggestedRemedy Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since requirements" Response Response Status W ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1. Page 29 line 12: Add "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor's note (to be removed prior to publi	# 15							
Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3. CI 9 SC 9 P28 L5 # 28 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A LATE Sub-clause 9.9 is missing between Clause 9 and sub-clause 9.9.3. SuggestedRemedy Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL" Response Response Status C Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since requirements" Response Response Status W ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1. Page 29 line 12: Add "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."								
Comment Type	TE with month and year of							
SuggestedRemedy Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL" Response Response Status Page 29 line 12: Add "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication edi 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."								
Response Response Status C	editor should edit "Since							
"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no lor	Change Page 29 line 13 to the following: "NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **29**

Page 1 of 7

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 12	SC 12.10.1	P 30	L13	# 1		C/ 12	SC 12.10	0.1	P 30	L13	# 6	
Marris, Ar	thur	Cadence Des	ign Systems	<u>-</u>		Grow, Rob	pert		RMG Consulti	ng	<u></u>	
Comment	<i>Type</i> T	Comment Status A			EZ	Comment	Type ER	1	Comment Status A			
Shou	ld the word "isolati	ion" be included?							ight think the September 2003	3 date applies to	the electrical	
Suggeste	dRemedy					•	ements sent	ence.	•			
Chan	ge "Electrical requ	uirements are in J.1" to "Elec	trical isolation re	quirements are		Suggested	•					
speci	fied in J.1"								instruction: Editor"s Note (to d edit "Since 202x" in			
Response	e	Response Status C							it second sentence to read: "S			ai Ui
ACCE	EPT IN PRINCIPL	E.				requir	ements"					
Reso	lved by Comment	6:				Response	•		Response Status W			
	lution to Commen					ACCE	PT IN PRIN	CIPLI	E.			
ACCE	EPT IN PRINCIPL	E				Modifi	ed suggeste	d ren	nedy to additionally resolve co	omment #1.		
Page	30 line 12 Add:					Page	30 line 12 Ad	dd:				
"Edito		moved prior to publication): NOTE with month and year o		r should edit "Sinc	e	"Edito	,		moved prior to publication): F NOTE with month and year of		r should edit "Sir	nce
_		e the sentence to the followin	•						the sentence to the following			
		ber 2003, maintenance char 202x, electrical isolation req		•	d for			•	ber 2003, maintenance chan 202x, electrical isolation requ		•	red for

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **30**

Page 2 of 7 3/31/2020 11:05:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 23	SC 23.5.1.1	P 35	L13	# 7	CI 23	SC 23.5.1,1	P 35	L15	# 2						
sentenc	ype ER Cads, a reader might t	RMG Consult Comment Status A think the September 200 why the note talks about irement".	03 date applies t		Commer Safe Suggeste	Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems Comment Type T Comment Status A Safety information is in J.2 not J.1 SuggestedRemedy									
Publicat approva	ollowing Change inst ion editor should ed	ruction: Editor"s Note (lit "Since 202x" in cond sentence to read:	n below NOTE v		J.1. than <i>Respons</i>	Same issue in 32.6 general safety)	ence to J.2 or change to say 5.1.1 and similar issue in 38.7 Response Status C E.								
	T IN PRINCIPLE.	esponse Status W				J.2 is correct, how not safety requiren	ever, the sentence needs to conents.	clearly call out i	solation requirements						
"Editor":2 Page 35 "NOTE-	202x" in below NOT 5 lin 15 change line t —Since September :	ed prior to publication): E with month and year o	of approval." nges are no long	ger being considered for	"Safi to: "Elec Page "Safi to:	"Electrical isolation requirements are in J.1." Page 35 line 38 change: "Safety information may be found in J.2."									
					sent Suggeste Inse Publ	t Type ER reads, a reader mence. edRemedy t following Change cation editor shou oval. At line 38, ed	P35 RMG Consulti Comment Status A ight think the September 200 e instruction: Editor"s Note (to lid edit "Since 202x" in lit second sentence to read: " Response Status W	3 date applies o be removed p below NOTE v	prior to publication):						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **35**

Page 3 of 7 3/31/2020 11:05:06 AM

CI 27	SC 27.5.1	P 38	L12	#	9		CI 32	SC	32.10.1	P 39	L 37	# 11			
Grow, Rob	ert	RMG Consul	ting		<u>-</u>		Grow, Rob	ert		RMG Consulti	ng	<u></u>			
Comment 7	Type ER	Comment Status A					Comment	Туре	ER	Comment Status A					
As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the safety information sentence.							As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.								
Suggested	Remedy						Suggested	Remed	dy						
Publica	ation editor shou	e instruction: Editor"s Note (uld edit "Since 202x" i dit second sentence to read:	n below NOTE	vith mont	h and yea	r of	Public	ation e	ditor shou	e instruction: Editor"s Note (to ld edit "Since 202x" in lit second sentence to read: "s	below NOTE	with month and year of			
Response		Response Status W					Response			Response Status W					
	PT IN PRINCIPI	•					ACCE	PT IN F	PRINCIPL						
"Editor	202x" in below	emoved prior to publication): NOTE with month and year of		or should	d edit "Sinc	ce	"Edito	r"s Note 202x"	e (to be re in below	ditor's Note: emoved prior to publication): I NOTE with month and year of		ditor should edit "Since			
Page 38 line 13 change line to the following: "NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since 202x, safety information is in J.2."							Page 39 line 37 change line to the following: "NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since 202x, safety information is in J.2."								
Cl 32	SC 32.6.1.1	P 39	L15	#	10		C/ 41	SC	41.4.1	P 48	L13	# 12			
Grow, Rob	ert	RMG Consul	ting				Grow, Rob	ert		RMG Consulti	ng				
Comment 7	Type ER	Comment Status A					Comment	Туре	ER	Comment Status A					
As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement".							As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.								
		requirement.					Suggested		•						
SuggestedRemedy Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since 202x, isolaton								ation e	ditor shou	e instruction: Editor"s Note (to ld edit "Since 202x" in lit second sentence to read: ":	below NOTE	E with month and year of			
	ments"	D 0// W					Response			Response Status W					
Response	OT IN DOINGID	Response Status W					ACCE	PT IN I	PRINCIPL	E.					
Page 3				or should	d edit "Sinc	ce	"Edito	r"s Note 202x"	e (to be re in below	ditor's Note: emoved prior to publication): I NOTE with month and year of		ditor should edit "Since			
"NOTE	Since Septer	e line to the following: nber 2003, maintenance cha 202x, safety information is		ger being	considere	d for	"NŎTI	E—Sind	ce Septem	e line to the following: hber 2011, maintenance chan _ 202x, safety information is ir		onger being considered for			

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **48**

Page 4 of 7

Li 13

3/31/2020 11:05:06 AM

Cl 96 SC 96.9.1 P84 L9 # 13
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A

With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text." Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Cl 97 SC 97.9.1 P86 L9 # 14

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A

With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text." Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."

C/ 112 SC 112.11 P93 L5 # 29

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A LATE

Sub-clause 112.11.4 is missing between sub-clause 112.11 and sub-clause 112.11.4.5.

SuggestedRemedy

Before 112.11.4.5 add "112.11.4 PICS proforma tables for Physical Medium Dependent (PMD) sublayer and medium, type 25GBASE-SR"

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 146 SC 146.9.1

P**116**

L12

23

Zimmerman, George CME Collection Comment Type E Comment Status A

CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Editing instruction for the PICS has been used for 146.9.1, and the editing instruction for 146.9.1 is missing, along with strikeout and underline in 146.9.1

SuggestedRemedy

Move editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to P117 L10, under 146.11.4.6 header Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:" Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1."

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 116 Line 12 delete editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to

Page 117 Line 10, add editing instruction: "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 146.11.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"

Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:" Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1,"

Cl 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L14 # 22

Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As written, this would bring in all the port isolation tests. The change to clause 147 seems more appropriate here, incorporating just the general safety requirements in J.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "shall conform to J.2" to "shall conform to the general safety requirements in J.2". Change PICS item ES1 (page 117) feature to read the same.

Proposed Response Status Z

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

C/ 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L14 # 16 C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L12 # 18 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Wienckowski, Natalie **General Motors Company** Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough. Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1" Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1" To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1" To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1" Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT. SC 147.10.1 SC 146.9.1 P116 P118 C/ 146 L19 # 17 C/ 147 L12 # Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 The editor's note is no longer needed. There is new text that is not underlined. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Delete Editor's Note. Underline: "the general safety requirements in" Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT. ACCEPT. SC 147.10.1 C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 C/ 147 P118 L11 # 24 L13 Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek Wienckowski. Natalie **General Motors Company** Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 Comment Type E Comment Status A EΖ 147.10.1 needs editing instruction (I understand an other commenter has dealt with There is new text that is not underlined. strikeout & underline) SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Underline: ",as appropriate" Add new editing instruction at P118 L11 (after header for 147.10.1) "Change text of Response Response Status C 147.10.1 as shown:" ACCEPT. Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L17 # 19 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company Comment Type E Comment Status A F7 The editor's note is no longer needed. SuggestedRemedy Delete Editor's Note. Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Duplicate of #17 C/ 149 SC 149 P119 **L1** # 15

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type T Comment Status A

The text in 149 is identical to P802.3ch D3.2. As P802.3ch will be published prior to P802.3cr and P802.3cr is not making any changes to this, this Clause is not needed in cr.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Clause 149 and all subclauses from P802.3cr.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Carlson, Steven Robert Bosch, Ethernovia

Comment Type T Comment Status A

P802.3ch and P802.3cr are now aligned and the Editor's Note is no longer needed.

P119

L16

SuggestedRemedy

C/ 149

Remove Editor's Note at line 16:

SC 149.9.1

Editor's Note (to be removed prior to SA ballot)—Clause 149 was added by IEEE P802.3ch which is currently in Standards Association ballot and is expected to be completed prior to this draft. Comments are invited to bring in approved text of IEEE P802.3ch and modify to align with the purposes of this draft.

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ J SC J.1 P123 L18

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A

It seems as though a definite article ("The") is not needed here. Start the clause with, "Electrical isolation shall..."

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the underlined word "The", extend the strikeout under the word "This" to the next empty space, add an "E" in underline immediately before the start of the word "electrical", add a strikeout to the "e" in "electrical".

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change line as follows: "The electrical isolation..." to

"Electrical isolation..."

27