

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 150 SC 150 P119 L1 # 22

Anslow, Pete

Self

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"P802.3cm" should be "IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "P802.3cm" to "IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020"

Proposed Response

Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI J SC J.3 P122 L1 # 23

Anslow, Pete

Self

Comment Type E Comment Status D

The PICS proforma in J.3 is not formatted correctly.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the title of J.3 to "Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) proforma for Annex J, Electrical isolation and general safety"
 Apply the following footnote to the end of this title: "Copyright release for PICS proformas: Users of this standard may freely reproduce the PICS proforma in this subclause so that it can be used for its intended purpose and may further publish the completed PICS."
 Insert before the existing J.3.1 sections for:
 J.3.1 Introduction
 J.3.2 Identification
 J.3.2.1 Implementation identification
 J.3.2.2 Protocol summary
 as per the PICS in the 802.3 FrameMaker template

Proposed Response

Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P1 L23 # 24

Anslow, Pete

Self

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

IEEE Std 802.3cq-2020 and IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020 are now published.

SuggestedRemedy

Change all instances of "IEEE Std 802.3cq-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3cq-2020"
 Change all instances of "IEEE Std 802.3cm-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020"

Proposed Response

Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P11 L23 # 25

Anslow, Pete

Self

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In ""Information technology equipment - Safety - Part 1:" the two instances of " - " (space hyphen space) should be em dashes.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Information technology equipment - Safety - Part 1:" to "Information technology equipment<em dash>Safety<em dash>Part 1:"

Proposed Response

Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.8.6.11 P27 L8 # 26

Anslow, Pete

Self

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction is specific to item 2, but the whole table is shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
 Change the editing instruction to "Change the table in 8.8.6.11 as follows:"
 or:
 Change the editing instruction to "Change Item 2 in the table in 8.8.6.11 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
 Replace the row for Item 1 with a row containing only an ellipsis
 Replace the rows for Items 3 and 4 with a row containing only an ellipsis

Proposed Response

Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change the editing instruction to "Change the table in 8.8.6.11 as follows:"

CI 104 SC 104.8.1 P90 L9 # 27

Anslow, Pete

Self

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The deleted text in this paragraph is not shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Show the deleted text in strikethrough font.

Proposed Response

Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add strikethrough text "IEC 60950-1" after "J.2" in the first sentence.

Add strikethrough text "IEC 60950-1" after "2018" in the second sentence.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L23 # 28
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ
802.3cq-2020 and 802.3cm-2020 have been published
SuggestedRemedy
Change "802.3cq-20XX and 802.3cm-20XX" tp "802.3cq-2020 and 802.3cm-2020" throught the document
Proposed Response Response Status **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **32** SC **32.6.1.1** P39 L22 # 29
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
Safety information is in J.2 not J.1
SuggestedRemedy
Change J.1 to J.2
Proposed Response Response Status **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
OBE by Comment 66
Text is incorrect but the Annex section is correct as this section is about Electrical Isolation.
Proposed response for Comment 66 is:
PROPOSED ACCEPT
Suggested Remedy for Comment 66 is:
"Change "safety information is in J.1" to "electrical isolation requirements are"."

CI **38** SC **38.7.1** P43 L12 # 30
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D**
This subclause is about safety
SuggestedRemedy
Change text to "All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to the general safety requirements as specified in J.2."
Proposed Response Response Status **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **38** SC **38.12.4.1** P44 L21 # 31
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
This subclause is about safety
SuggestedRemedy
Change feature name to "General safety"
Proposed Response Response Status **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **146** SC **146.11.4.6** P117 L16 # 32
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
Change feature name to "General safety" make comment "Conforms to J.2"
SuggestedRemedy
Change feature name to "General safety" make comment "Conforms to J.2"
Proposed Response Response Status **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **8** SC **8.8.6.8** P26 L15 # 33
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D**
Isolation is specified in J.1 not J.2
SuggestedRemedy
Change J.2 to J.1
Proposed Response Response Status **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P11 L6 # **34**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**

IEEE Std 802.3ca will be approved prior to cr.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "IEEE Std 802.3ca™-20xx
Amendment y—This amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPONs) to multiple channels of 25 Gb/s providing both symmetric and asymmetric operation for the following data rates (downstream/upstream): 25/10 Gb/s, 25/25 Gb/s, 50/10 Gb/s, 50/25 Gb/s, and 50/50 Gb/s. This amendment specifies the 25 Gb/s EPON Multi-Channel Reconciliation Sublayer (MCRS), 25GBASE-Nx25G-EPON PHYSical Coding Sublayers (PCSs), Physical Media Attachments (PMAs), and Physical Medium Dependent sublayers (PMDs) that support both symmetric and asymmetric data rates while maintaining backward compatibility with already deployed 10 Gb/s EPON equipment. The EPON operation is defined for distances of at least 20 km, and for a split ratio of at least 1:32."

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **25** SC **25.6.4.2** P37 L10 # **35**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** **EZ**

Incomplete Editors instrucion.

SuggestedRemedy

Change " Change Table as follows:" to "Change Table as follows (unchanged rows not shown):

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **25** SC **25.6.4.2** P37 L15 # **36**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** **EZ**

Need a row to show the unchanged rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a row under the heading row of the table. "Stradle" the columns in the row. Add an elipses (...) in the row.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **38** SC **38.7.1** P43 L12 # **37**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**

General safety requirements are in J.2, not isolation.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "isolation" to "general safety"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved with Comment 30.

Resolution to Comment 30 is:
PROPOSED ACCEPT

Suggested Remedy from Comment 30 is:

"Change text to "All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to the general safety requirements as specified in J.2.""

CI **38** SC **38.12.4.1** P44 L21 # **38**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Electrical Isolation" to "General safety"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **42** SC **42.12.10** P47 L10 # **39**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** **EZ**

Need a row to show the unchanged rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a row under the last row in the table. "Stradle" the columns in the row. Add an elipses (...) in the row.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 53 SC 53.15.4.5 P52 L14 # 40

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Need a row to show the unchanged rows before the changed row.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a row under the heading row of the table. "Stradle" the columns in the row. Add an elipses (...) in the row.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 58 SC 58.8.1 P55 L12 # 41

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 59 SC 59.8.1 P57 L12 # 42

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 60 SC 60.10.1 P59 L12 # 43

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 75 SC 75.8.1 P66 L11 # 44

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 80 SC 80.4.10 P68 L11 # 45

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 84 SC 84.11.4.5 P69 L19 # 46

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

An unchanged row is shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "ES2" row.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 86 SC 86.9.1 P70 L11 # 47

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 87 SC 87.9.1 P72 L11 # 48

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 88 SC 88.9.1 P74 L11 # 49

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 89 SC 89.8.1 P76 L11 # 50

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 95 SC 95.9.1 P82 L11 # 51

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 96 SC 96.11.4.9 P85 L10 # 52

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Incorrect Editor's instruction. The PICS Item is now being deleted so the remaining items need to be renumbered.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the Editor's instruction to: Delete row for ES1 (renumber subsequent rows appropriately) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 97 SC 97.11.13 P87 L7 # 53

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Needs to also include the instruction to renumber.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the Editor's instruction to: Delete row for ES1 (renumber subsequent rows appropriately) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 100 SC 100.5.1 P88 L11 # 54

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 104 SC 104.8.1 P90 L10 # 55
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Deleted text is not shown in strikethrough.
SuggestedRemedy
Before J.2, add this text in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1". Add this same text in strikethrough before Annex Q.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.9.4.8 P91 L19 # 56
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Deleted text is not shown in strikethrough.
SuggestedRemedy
Before Annex Q, add this text in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1".
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 112 SC 112.8.1 P92 L11 # 57
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Added text is not underlined.
SuggestedRemedy
Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 112 SC 112.8.1 P94 L31 # 58
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Added text is not underlined.
SuggestedRemedy
Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 126 SC 126.9.1 P98 L31 # 59
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Added text is not underlined.
SuggestedRemedy
Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 128 SC 128.9.1 P100 L11 # 60
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Added text is not underlined.
SuggestedRemedy
Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 130 SC 130.9.1 P102 L12 # 61
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Added text is not underlined and removed text is not shown in strikethrough.
SuggestedRemedy
Underline "the general safety requirements in"
Also, after J.2 and before IEC, add the following text in strikethrough "applicable sections (including isolation requirements) of"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 145 SC 145.6.1 P114 L7 # 62
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Removed text is not shown in strikethrough.
SuggestedRemedy
Before (or after) J.2 add in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1 or IEC 62368-1".
Before Annex Q add in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1 or".
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 130 SC 130 P102 L1 # 63
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Needs a note to say how Clause 130 was added as it is not part of IEEE Std 802.3-2018.
SuggestedRemedy
Add before the start of the Clause "Clause 130 was added by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 128 SC 128 P100 L1 # 64
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Needs a note to say how Clause 128 was added as it is not part of IEEE Std 802.3-2018.
SuggestedRemedy
Add before the start of the Clause "Clause 128 was added by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 86A SC 86A.7.1 P127 L17 # 65
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Added text is not underlined.
SuggestedRemedy
Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.1 P39 L22 # 66
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D
typo - J.1 contains electrical isolation not safety
SuggestedRemedy
Change "safety information is in J.1" to "electrical isolation requirements are".
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl FM SC FM P1 L23 # 67
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
802.3cq was approved in 2020
SuggestedRemedy
Change "802.3cq-20xx" to "802.3cq-2020" also on P11 L6
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl FM SC FM P1 L23 # 68
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
802.3cm was approved in 2020
SuggestedRemedy
Change "802.3cm-20xx" to "802.3cm-2020" also on P11 L12
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

<i>CI</i> FM	<i>SC</i> FM	<i>P11</i>	<i>L6</i>	# 69
---------------------	---------------------	------------	-----------	-------------

Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motors Company
----------------------	------------------------

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

IEEE Std 802.3ch will be approved prior to cr.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "IEEE Std 802.3ch™-20xx

Amendment x—This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Clause 149 and Annex 149A, Annex 149B, and Annex 149C. This amendment adds physical layer specifications and management parameters for operation at 2.5 Gb/s, 5 Gb/s, and 10 Gb/s over a single balanced pair of conductors."

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.