Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **13**   *L* **43**   # R2-1

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**
   Isolation misspelled

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove one of the eyes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Page 31 line 8:
   Add editing instruction prior to 14.3.1.1 "Replace title of subclause 14.3.1.1 as follows"
   Replace title of 14.3.1.1 with "Electrical isolation"

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **13**   *L* **51**   # R2-2

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
   Isolation misspelled

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove one of the eyes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Page 31 line 48:
   Add editing instruction prior to 14.10.4.5.11 "Replace title of subclause 14.10.4.5.11 as follows"
   Replace title of 14.10.4.5.11 with "Electrical isolation"

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **14**   *L* **48**   # R2-3

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
   Isolation misspelled

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove one of the eyes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Page 40 line 6:
   Add editing instruction prior to 33.4.1 "Replace title of subclause 33.4.1 as follows"
   Replace title of 33.4.1 with "Electrical isolation"

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **15**   *L* **22**   # R2-4

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
   Isolation misspelled

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove one of the eyes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Page 45 line 8:
   Add editing instruction prior to 40.6.1.1 "Replace title of subclause 40.6.1.1 as follows"
   Replace title of 40.6.1.1 with "Electrical isolation"

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **16**   *L* **10**   # R2-5

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
   Isolation misspelled

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove one of the eyes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Page 53 line 6:
   Add editing instruction prior to 55.5.1 "Replace title of subclause 55.5.1 as follows"
   Replace title of 55.5.1 with "Electrical isolation"

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **20**   *L* **23**   # R2-6

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**
   Isolation misspelled

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove one of the eyes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Page 94 line 6:
   Add editing instruction prior to 113.5.1 "Replace title of subclause 113.5.1 as follows"
   Replace title of 113.5.1 with "Electrical isolation"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **R2-6**   Page 1 of 3
10/21/2020 10:37:40 PM

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **20**   *L* **49**   # R2-7

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**

Isolation misspelled

SuggestedRemedy

Remove one of the eyes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 98 line 6:
Add editing instruction prior to 126.5.1 "Replace title of subclause 126.5.1 as follows"
Replace title of 126.5.1 with "Electrical isolation"

Cl **14**   *SC* **14.3.1.1**   *P* **31**   *L* **9**   # R2-8

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Change as shown in COMPARE version does not match change shown in CLEAN version.
COMPARE version shows edit as whole word changes. CLEAN version shows edit as a
character change.

SuggestedRemedy

Consistently use whole word edits in both documents.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will be professionally edited prior to publication. Comments should also be created based
on the clean version of the draft which is correct.

Cl **14**   *SC* **14.10.4.5.11**   *P* **31**   *L* **49**   # R2-9

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Change as shown in COMPARE version does not match change shown in CLEAN version.
COMPARE version shows edit as whole word changes. CLEAN version shows edit as a
character change.

SuggestedRemedy

Consistently use whole word edits in both documents.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will be professionally edited prior to publication. Comments should also be created based
on the clean version of the draft which is correct.

Cl **15**   *SC* **15.3.4**   *P* **33**   *L* **11**   # R2-10

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

FOR DISCUSSION IN TF: Note that this is a media spec. whereas all (?) others are
equipment specs. Note that there is an MDI to MDI for MAU isolation requirement with no
specs. It would be a MAU spec if it said "socket" instead of "plug."

SuggestedRemedy

Just want to make sure we are doing the right thing here, lumping eqpt. Specs & media
specs together.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

TFTD

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.4.1**   *P* **40**   *L* **7**   # R2-11

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Change as shown in COMPARE version does not match change shown in CLEAN version.
COMPARE version shows edit as both whole word change and letter chang and shows
wrong sub-clause number. CLEAN version shows edit as a character change.

SuggestedRemedy

Consistently use whole word edits in both documents.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will be professionally edited prior to publication. Comments should also be created based
on the clean version of the draft which is correct.

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.4.1**   *P* **40**   *L* **17**   # R2-12

Thompson, Geoffrey   GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**

This text does not meet the project goal of consolidating the isolation test specs in a
normative annex.

SuggestedRemedy

Move spec portion of the text to Annex so both (all 3?) PoE specs can point to the same text

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

TFTD

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **R2-12**   Page 2 of 3
10/21/2020 10:37:40 PM

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.8.3.4**　　　　*P* **41**　　　*L* **14**　　　# R2-13

Thompson, Geoffrey　　　　　　GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **D**

Tests in table do not point to currents tests in 33.4.1 (which should be moved.

SuggestedRemedy

Make PICS consistent with body text in 33.4.1

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 41 line 14: Change Value/Comment field of EL1 to:
"Conforms to J.1 with electrical strength test c) details as specified in 33.4.1"

Page 114 line 5: bring in PICS EL1 to EL4 from 145.7.3.3 from IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018
Add editing instruction "Change PICS Item EL2, delete PICS Items EL3 and EL4, renumber
remaining rows in the table in 145.7.3.3 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
Change Value/Comment for PICS EL2 to "Conforms to J.1 with electrical strength test c)
details as specified in 145.4.1"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **R2-13**

Page 3 of 3
10/21/2020 10:37:40 PM