Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **31**   # 1

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

PHY is not the acronym for Physical Layer, it is the acronym for Physical Layer Device.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "(PHY)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **3**   *L* **1**   # 2

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

PHY is not the acronym for Physical Layer, it is the acronym for Physical Layer Device.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "(PHY)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **12**   *L* **22**   # 3

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

This amendment has a number.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "Amendment 8 --".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **12**   *L* **26**   # 4

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Until published, the reference year should be incomplete.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "2020" to "20xx".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **12**   *L* **28**   # 5

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

This amendment has a number.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "Amendment 9 --".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **5**

Page 1 of 5

7/3/2020 10:53:31 AM

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **12**   *L* **36**   # 6

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Because this draft references Annex J2 (151.9.1), IEEE Std 802.3cr needs to precede this project in amendment number because it adds the Annex.

SuggestedRemedy

Add: IEEE Std 802.3crTM-20xx IEEE Std 802.3crTM-20xx

Amendment 10 -- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Annex J. This amendment replaces references to the IEC 60950 series of standards (including IEC 60950-1 "Information technology equipment—Safety—Part 1: General requirements") with appropriate references to the IEC 62368 "Audio/video, information and communication technology equipment" series and makes appropriate changes to the standard corresponding to the new references This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Annex J. This amendment replaces references to the IEC 60950 series of standards (including IEC 60950-1 "Information technology equipment—Safety—Part 1: General requirements") with appropriate references to the IEC 62368 "Audio/video, information and communication technology equipment" series and makes appropriate changes to the standard corresponding to the new references.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **140**   *SC* **140.8.1**   *P* **52**   *L* **38**   # 7

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**

This subclause has no text. If this as a placeholder, it will not work. The current text of P802.3cr references Annex J2 which is being added by P802.3cr and therefore couldn't be referenced by P802.3cu unless P802.3cr is an earlier amendment. Also, P802.3cr is ahead of P802.3cu in balloting.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the heading.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **151**   *SC* **151.9.1**   *P* **85**   *L* **42**   # 8

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

This text differs from P802.3cr, 150.9.1.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace sentence with; "All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to J.2."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **10**   # 9

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

We now have 9 approved amendments and P802.3cr is in SA ballot. I believe this amendment could now be safely numbered as Amendment 11.

SuggestedRemedy

Conditional on Mr. Law assigning P802.3cr Amendment 10 and assigning this project Amendment 11, change "Amendment" to "Amendment 11:". If done, similarly change page 17, line 3.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **30**   # 10

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

This list omits IEEE Std 802.3ch-20xx, which is an approved draft and is also included in the introduction list of amendments.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert IEEE Std 802.3ch-20xx prior to IEEE Std 802.3ca. If amendment numbers 10 and 11 are assigned as suggested in coment on line 10, also edit to add IEEE Std 802.3cr as the last amendment in the list.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **10**

Page 2 of 5
7/3/2020 10:53:31 AM

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **30**   # 11

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

It is customary to not include the full year until a document is published.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "2020" to "20xx".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **30**   # 12

Grow, Bob   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

Because this draft references Annex J2 (151.9.1), IEEE Std 802.3cr needs to precede this project in amendment number because it adds the Annex.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "and IEEE Std 802.3cr-20xx" to end of list and remove the preceding "and".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.1.1.2**   *P* **19**   *L* **12**   # 13

Ran, Adee   Intel

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

According to the style manual (18.2.2):

"Change shall be used when text or tables are being modified; therefore, strikethrough (for deletions) and underscore (for insertions) should be indicated"
and
"Insert shall be used to add new text, equations, tables, or figures in the standard".

Here an existing subclause is being modified, not a new one inserted.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the instructions to "change" (3 times) and underline the new text.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **78**   *SC* **78.7.4**   *P* **24**   *L* **7**   # 14

Ran, Adee   Intel

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

According to the style manual (18.2.2):

"Change shall be used when text or tables are being modified; therefore, strikethrough (for deletions) and underscore (for insertions) should be indicated"
and
"Insert shall be used to add new text, equations, tables, or figures in the standard".

Here an existing table is being modified, not a new one inserted.

Also in the following places, page/subclause/Line:
25 80.1.4 14
26 80.4 42
32 116.1.3 18
33 116.4 38

SuggestedRemedy

Change the instruction to "change" and underline the new text. Apply in all listed places.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **14**

Page 3 of 5
7/3/2020 10:53:31 AM

Cl **140**   *SC* **140.1**   *P* **38**   *L* **1**   # 15

Ran, Adee   Intel

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

According to the style manual (18.2.2):

"Change shall be used when text or tables are being modified; therefore, strikethrough (for deletions) and underscore (for insertions) should be indicated"
and
"Insert shall be used to add new text, equations, tables, or figures in the standard".

Here a figure is being repalced and its title is changed (the "change" instruction can't be applied to a figure).

SuggestedRemedy

Change the instruction to "replace" the figure and "change" the title. Remove the underlines in the figure.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **140**   *SC* **140.6.1**   *P* **42**   *L* **32**   # 16

Ran, Adee   Intel

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Where are the new table and text inserted?

SuggestedRemedy

Add to the instruction "after Table 140–6" or wherever it is intended.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **140**   *SC* **140.6.2**   *P* **43**   *L* **38**   # 17

Ran, Adee   Intel

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Where are the new figure and text inserted?

In the next page, Table 140-7 is changed but there is no coresponding editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the instruction to "change" and include context to identify the location of the new text. Add "insert" instruction for the figure.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **140**   *SC* **140.6.3**   *P* **46**   *L* **43**   # 18

Ran, Adee   Intel

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Where are the new figures and text inserted?

SuggestedRemedy

Add to the instruction "after Table 140–8" or wherever it is intended.

Add the numbers of the new figures, 140-2c and 140-2d.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **140**   *SC* **140.7.9**   *P* **51**   *L* **26**   # 19

Ran, Adee   Intel

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Is Figure 140-5 a new figure, a replacement, or no change to existing figure 140-5?

SuggestedRemedy

If no change, separate the editorial instruction to two changes, before and after the figure.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **19**

Page 4 of 5
7/3/2020 10:53:31 AM

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **12**   *L* **20**   # 30

Maguire, Valerie   The Siemon Company

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

802.3ch has published.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "802.3ch-20xx" with, "802.3cg-2020" and insert "Amendment 8—" before "This amendment…" on line 22

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **12**   *L* **28**   # 31

Maguire, Valerie   The Siemon Company

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Missing some template text.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "Amendment 9—" before "This amendment…".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **31**

Page 5 of 5
7/3/2020 10:53:31 AM