

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P12 L20 # I-1

Lewis, Jon Dell EMC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket
 IEEE Std 802.3ch has been published.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "IEEE Std 802.3ch™-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3ch™-2020"

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P12 L38 # I-2

Lewis, Jon Dell EMC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket
 IEEE Std 802.3cr is currently ahead of P802.3cu in the publication order but is missing from the list of ammendments.

SuggestedRemedy
 Add "IEEE Std 802.3cr™-20xx
 This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Annex J. This amendment replaces references to the IEC 60950 series of standards (including IEC 60950-1 "Information technology equipment—Safety—Part 1: General requirements") with appropriate references to the IEC 62368 "Audio/video, information and communication technology equipment" series and makes appropriate changes to the standard corresponding to the new references."

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve using the response to comment i-16

CI **FM** SC **FM** P12 L22 # I-3

Lewis, Jon Dell EMC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket
 Amendment number is missing

SuggestedRemedy
 Add "Amendment 8 --" where "--" is an em-dash

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

IEEE Std 802.3ch™-2020 has been assigned Amendment 8.

Changing the beginning of the description of IEEE Std 802.3ch™-2020 from:
 "This amendment includes changes to ..."
 to:
 "Amendment 8—This amendment includes changes to .."

CI **FM** SC **FM** P12 L28 # I-4

Lewis, Jon Dell EMC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket
 Amendment number is missing

SuggestedRemedy
 Add "Amendment 9 --" where "--" is an em-dash

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

IEEE Std 802.3ca™-2020 has been assigned Amendment 9.

Changing the beginning of the description of IEEE Std 802.3ca™-2020 from:
 "This amendment includes changes to ..."
 to:
 "Amendment 9—This amendment includes changes to .."

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0 P12 L20 # I-5

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

802.3ch has published.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "802.3ch-20xx" with, "802.3cg-2020" and insert "Amendment 8—" before "This amendment..." on line 22

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve using the response to comment i-3

CI 00 SC 0 P12 L28 # I-6

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

Missing some template text.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "Amendment 9—" before "This amendment..."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P1 L10 # I-7

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

I think Mr. Law has assigned this project an amendment number.

SuggestedRemedy

Amendment 11

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This project has been assigned Amendment 11.

Change:
"Draft Standard for Ethernet
Amendment:"
to:
"Draft Standard for Ethernet
Amendment 11:"

CI FM SC FM P1 L30 # I-8

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

IEEE Std 802.3ch-2020 is now published. P802.3cr has been assigned amendment number 10.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "IEEE Std 802.3ch-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3ch-2020". Add "IEEE Std 802.3cr-20xx" to the end of the list and appropriately move the "and".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P3 L5 # I-9

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

Per the 802.3 list of terms, "Energy-Efficient Ethernet" should be hyphenated.

SuggestedRemedy

"Energy-Efficient Ethernet". Also fix on p. 63, lines 38 and 47.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P1 L31 # I-10

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

PHY is not the acronym for Physical Layer, it is the acronym for Physical Layer Device.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "(PHY)".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI FM SC FM P3 L1 # I-11
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket
 PHY is not the acronym for Physical Layer, it is the acronym for Physical Layer Device.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "(PHY)".
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P12 L20 # I-12
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket
 This amendment is no published.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "IEEE Std 802.3ch-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3ch-2020".
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P12 L22 # I-13
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket
 This amendment has a number.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "Amendment 8 --".
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P12 L26 # I-14
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status R bucket
 Until published, the reference year should be incomplete.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "2020" to "20xx".
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.

Based on the email below from David Law, "IEEE Std 802.3ca" has been published, and therefore the correct reference is "IEEE Std 802.3ca-2020".

-----Original Message-----
 From: Law, David <dlaw@HPE.COM>
 Sent: Thursday, June 25, 2020 8:14 AM
 To: STDS-802-3-EDITORS@LISTSERV.IEEE.ORG
 Subject: [802.3_EDITORS] IEEE 802.3 amendment order

Dear all,

I wanted to let you all know that I've update the amendment order in the document <<https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mCLQWGYuqZJB4W6H7jGEH-fbgpc-ifl4ja3DhOPyJsY/edit#gid=0>> based on current project status as shown below. This is based on conditional approval for IEEE P802.3cu to proceed to Standards Association ballot, IEEE P802.3cp, IEEE P802.3ct and IEEE P802.3cv entering initial Working Group ballot, and my estimate of where these and other projects are.

Best regards,
 David

Amendment 8: IEEE Std 802.3ch-2020 Approved Amendment 9: IEEE Std 802.3ca-2020 Approved Amendment 10: IEEE Std 802.3cr-20xx Draft D3.0 Amendment 11: IEEE Std 802.3cu-20xx Draft D2.2 Amendment 12: IEEE Std 802.3cp-20xx Draft D2.0 Amendment 13: IEEE Std 802.3ct-20xx Draft D2.0 Amendment 14: IEEE Std 802.3cv-20xx Draft D2.0 Amendment 15: IEEE Std 802.3cs-20xx Draft D1.0 Amendment 16: IEEE Std 802.3ck-20xx Draft D1.2 Amendment 17: IEEE Std 802.3cw-20xx

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P12 L28 # I-15
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket
 This amendment has a number.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "Amendment 9 --".
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P12 L37 # I-16
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket
 Because this draft references Annex J2 (151.9.1), IEEE Std 802.3cr needs to precede this project in amendment number because it adds the Annex. And, P802.3cr has been assigned Amendment 10.
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3crTM-20xx Amendment 10 -- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Annex J. This amendment replaces references to the IEC 60950 series of standards (including IEC 60950-1 "Information technology equipment—Safety—Part 1: General requirements") with appropriate references to the IEC 62368 "Audio/video, information and communication technology equipment" series and makes appropriate changes to the standard corresponding to the new references This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Annex J. This amendment replaces references to the IEC 60950 series of standards (including IEC 60950-1 "Information technology equipment—Safety—Part 1: General requirements") with appropriate references to the IEC 62368 "Audio/video, information and communication technology equipment" series and makes appropriate changes to the standard corresponding to the new references.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **140** SC **140.8.1** P52 L38 # I-17
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **A** bucket (updated 0922)
 This subclause has no text.?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the heading.?
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl **140** SC **140.6.1** P42 L32 # I-23
 Dudek, Michael Marvell
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket (updated 0924)
 It does not say at what point the figure and text should be inserted.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "at the end of section 140.6.1"
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement the suggested remedy with editorial license.
 There are several instances in Clause 140 where the editing instructions could be improved. Review all editing instructions in Clause 140 and update if necessary with editorial license.

Cl **140** SC **140.6.2** P43 L32 # I-24
 Dudek, Michael Marvell
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** bucket (updated 0924)
 It does not say at what point the figure and text should be inserted.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "at the end of section 140.6.2"
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement the suggested remedy with editorial license.
 There are several instances in Clause 140 where the editing instructions could be improved. Review all editing instructions in Clause 140 and update if necessary with editorial license.

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 140 SC 140.6.2 P44 L18 # I-25
 Dudek, Michael Marvell
 Comment Type T Comment Status R bucket
 There is an erroneous footnote reference "e" on the receiver sensitivity row. (These aren't test conditions).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the footnote reference
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 It's not an "e" but a "c" with a strikethrough.

Cl 140 SC 140.6.3 P46 L32 # I-26
 Dudek, Michael Marvell
 Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)
 It does not say at what point the figure and text should be inserted.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "at the end of section 140.6.3"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement the suggested remedy with editorial license.
 There are several instances in Clause 140 where the editing instructions could be improved. Review all editing instructions in Clause 140 and update if necessary with editorial license.

Cl 140 SC 140.7.5a P50 L7 # I-27
 Dudek, Michael Marvell
 Comment Type T Comment Status A bucket (updated 0922)
 There is only one lane for these Phys
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "of each lane"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 In addition to 140.7.5a, the comment and suggested remedy also apply to 140.7.5b and 140.7.5c.
 In 140.7.5a:
 - Change the start of the second sentence from "The TECQ of each lane shall be within the limits ..." to "TECQ shall be within the limits ..."
 - Change the start of the third sentence from "The TECQ of each lane shall be measured ..." to "TECQ is measured ..."
 In 140.7.5b:
 Change the first paragraph from:
 "The transmitter over/under-shoot percentage of each lane shall be within the limits given in Table 140-6 if measured using a test pattern specified for transmitter over/under-shoot in Table 140-10"
 to:
 "The transmitter over/under-shoot percentage shall be within the limits given in Table 140-6 if measured using a test pattern specified for transmitter over/under-shoot in Table 140-10"
 In 140.7.5c:
 Change the first paragraph from:
 "The transmitter peak-to-peak power of each lane shall be within the limits given in Table 140-6 if measured using a test pattern specified for transmitter peak-to-peak power in Table 140-10"
 to:
 "The transmitter peak-to-peak power shall be within the limits given in Table 140-6 if measured using a test pattern specified for transmitter peak-to-peak power in Table

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 151 SC 151.7.3 P75 L21 # I-30

Dudek, Michael

Marvell

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

Footnotes "a" and "b" only differ by the name of the Phy. It would be better to combine them.

SuggestedRemedy

Make a single footnote referenced from the parameter column. Footnote to say "The channel insertion loss is calculated using the maximum distance specified in Table 151-6 and fiber attenuation of 0.5 dB/km plus an allocation for connection and splice loss given in 151.11.2.1"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 151 SC 151.3.2 P65 L36 # I-38

Lewis, David

Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

SuggestedRemedy

change "must be kept within limits" to "shall be kept within limits".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "must be kept within limits" to "are kept within limits"

CI 151 SC 151.10 P87 L42 # I-39

Lewis, David

Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0928)

The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

SuggestedRemedy

In footnote c, change must to shall.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In footnote c, change "must" to "is required to".

CI 151 SC 151.5.4 P68 L30 # I-40

Lewis, David

Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status R bucket (updated 0924)

The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

SuggestedRemedy

change "implementations must " to "implementations should"

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

The sentence uses "must" properly to describe an unavoidable consequence which is actually design guidance (it actually begins, "as an unavoidable consequence... implementations must...")

CI 140 SC 140.9 P54 L23 # I-41

Lewis, David

Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

SuggestedRemedy

In footnote c, change "system must tolerate" to "system shall tolerate"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In footnote c, change "system must tolerate" to "system is required to tolerate"

CI 151 SC 151.1 P63 L40 # I-42

Lewis, David

Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

SuggestedRemedy

In footnote a, change must to shall.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In footnote a, change "must behave" to "behaves".

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 140 SC 140.1 P37 L34 # I-43

Lewis, David Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

SuggestedRemedy

In footnote a, change must to shall.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In footnote a, change "must behave" to "behaves".

Cl 140 SC 140.6.1 P42 L28 # I-44

Lewis, David Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

SuggestedRemedy

In footnote b, change must to shall.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change footnote b to:

"For 100GBASE-DR1, the requirement on the OMAouter (min) applies even in the cases where TDECQ < 1.4 dB for an extinction ratio of >= 5 dB or where TDECQ < 1.1 dB for an extinction ratio of < 5 dB. "

Implement with editorial license (recognizing the fact that this change is modifying existing text).

Cl 151 SC 151.9.4 P86 L22 # I-45

Lewis, David Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

The use of will is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, will is only used in statements of fact

SuggestedRemedy

Change "will be met" to "are met"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 151 SC 151.4 P66 L51 # I-46

Lewis, David Lumentum Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

The use of will is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, will is only used in statements of fact

SuggestedRemedy

change "these test points will not typically be accessible" to "these test points are not typically accessible"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 140 SC 140.7.5 P49 L44 # I-49

Zhang, Bo Inphi Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status R bucket

This paragraph ended with and incomplete phrase, 'with the following exceptions:'

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest complete the exception if any or remove this phrase at the end of this paragraph in section 140.7.5 Transmitter and dispersion eye closure for PAM4 (TDECQ).

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

This draft is amending Clause 140.

The editing instruction on p49, line 39 is changing the first paragraph of 140.7.5.

When using the "change" editing instruction, deleted text is identified with strikethrough, inserted text is identified by underlining and unchanged text is left as is. Text that is not being changed is not typically imported from the Clause being ammended.

The list of exceptions following the first paragraph of 140.7.5 are not being changed, and therefore there is no need to import them from Clause 140.

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 140 SC 140.6.1 P42 L32 # I-53

Ran, Adeo

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

Where are the new table and text inserted?

SuggestedRemedy

Add to the instruction "after Table 140-6" or wherever it is intended.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add to the instruction "after Table 140-6", with editorial license.

There are several instances in Clause 140 where the editing instructions could be improved. Review all editing instructions in Clause 140 and update if necessary with editorial license.

Cl 140 SC 140.6.2 P43 L38 # I-54

Ran, Adeo

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

Where are the new figure and text inserted?

In the next page, Table 140-7 is changed but there is no corresponding editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the instruction to "change" and include context to identify the location of the new text. Add "insert" instruction for the figure.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implement the suggested remedy with editorial license.

There are several instances in Clause 140 where the editing instructions could be improved. Review all editing instructions in Clause 140 and update if necessary with editorial license.

Cl 140 SC 140.6.3 P46 L43 # I-55

Ran, Adeo

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

Where are the new figures and text inserted?

SuggestedRemedy

Add to the instruction "after Table 140-8" or wherever it is intended.

Add the numbers of the new figures, 140-2c and 140-2d.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implement the suggested remedy with editorial license.

There are several instances in Clause 140 where the editing instructions could be improved. Review all editing instructions in Clause 140 and update if necessary with editorial license.

Cl 140 SC 140.7.9 P51 L26 # I-56

Ran, Adeo

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket (updated 0924)

Is Figure 140-5 a new figure, a replacement, or no change to existing figure 140-5?

SuggestedRemedy

If no change, separate the editorial instruction to two changes, before and after the figure.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implement the suggested remedy with editorial license.

There are several instances in Clause 140 where the editing instructions could be improved. Review all editing instructions in Clause 140 and update if necessary with editorial license.

Cl FM SC FM P12 L20 # I-58

Trowbridge, Stephen

Nokia

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

P802.3ch has been published

SuggestedRemedy

Change IEEE Std 802.3chTM-20xx to IEEE Std 802.3chTM-2020

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cu D3.0 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 140 SC 140.7.5a P50 L8 # I-72

Dawe, Piers J G Mellanox Technologies

Comment Type TR Comment Status A bucket

Never write "shall be measured" in 802.3; it's not a test spec. Use the standard form of words.

SuggestedRemedy

The TECQ of each lane shall be within the limits given in Table 140-6 for 100GBASE-FR1 and 100GBASE-LR1 if measured measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 140.7.5, except that the test fiber is not used. The test pattern specified for TECQ is given in Table 140-10. Similarly in 151.8.6.

Response Response Status U

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In 140.7.5a:
- In the last sentence change "shall be measured" to "if measured"

In 151.8.6:
- In the last sentence change "shall be measured" to "if measured"

Cl 151 SC 151.5.4 P68 L22 # I-83

Dawe, Piers J G Mellanox Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status A bucket

There is no average receive power, each lane (min) in Table 151-8 for 400GBASE-FR4 and 400GBASE-LR4-6. There's one for each.

SuggestedRemedy

Either delete "for 400GBASE-FR4 and 400GBASE-LR4-6" (as Table 140-4) or change "and" to "or" and modify Table 140-4.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In Table 151-4 delete the text "for 400GBASE-FR4 and 400GBASE-LR4-6"

This change makes the draft consistent with what was done previously in Table 140-4 and Table 139-4.

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L # I-92

Nicholl, Gary Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A bucket

Implement new FM template (Version 4.3)

SuggestedRemedy

Implement new FM template (Version 4.3), based the email from Pete Anslow to the 802.3_EDITORS reflector on 7/6/2020

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.