<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>SC FM</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>#</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grow, Robert**

**Comment Type**: E

To someone not active on the project, content of Clauses 155 and 156 look like they may be based on other clauses.

**Suggested Remedy**

Editor's might want to look at changes made during the revision to clauses on which Clauses 155 and 156 are based to look for other style changes. Examples I searched on and commented include capitalization of register, elimination of must, misuse of "PHY", but I am less sure of how correcting misuse of "comprise" and "comprising" and "implementer" were handled in P802.3.

**Response**

Ensure correct usage of words "comprise", "comprising" and "implementer" based on usage in P802.3 D3.2. See response to comment 7.

**Comment Status**: A

**Response Status**: C

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>SC FM</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>#</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grow, Robert**

**Comment Type**: ER

Misuse of acronym PHY (see P802.3/D3.2, 1.5.

**Suggested Remedy**

Delete "(PHY)"

Response **Response Status**: C

Ensure correct usage of words "comprise", "comprising" and "implementer" based on usage in P802.3 D3.2. See response to comment 7.

**Comment Status**: A

**Response Status**: C

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>SC FM</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>#</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grow, Robert**

**Comment Type**: E

This will be an amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x as stated on the cover page.

**Suggested Remedy**

Replace "2018" with "200x"

Response **Response Status**: C

Ensure correct usage of words "comprise", "comprising" and "implementer" based on usage in P802.3 D3.2. See response to comment 7.

**Comment Status**: A

**Response Status**: C

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl</th>
<th>FM</th>
<th>SC FM</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>#</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grow, Robert**

**Comment Type**: E

Capitalization of forward error correction in P802.3 was made consistent, this capitalization is not consistent with that used in P802.3/D3.2.

**Suggested Remedy**

"forward error correction"

Response **Response Status**: C

Review the entire draft and ensure all references are to IEEE Std 802.3-202x, not IEEE Std 802.3-2018.

**Response**

Review the entire draft and ensure all references are to IEEE Std 802.3-202x, not IEEE Std 802.3-2018.

**Response Status**: C

---

**TYPE**: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general

**COMMENT STATUS**: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected  RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn

**SORT ORDER**: Clause, Subclause, page, line

**Page 1 of 7**
### Comment 1

**Comment Type:** ER  
**Comment Status:** A  

Some information in this copyright block has been updated.

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Replace the IEEE-SA front matter with that found in a current template.

**Response:**  
Accept in principle.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 2

**Comment Type:** E  
**Comment Status:** A  

IEEE page numbering style has changed. No more Roman numeral front matter numbering.

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Delete the second paragraph of the note.

**Response:**  
Accept.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 3

**Comment Type:** ER  
**Comment Status:** A  

This isn't the current IEEE-SA mandated front matter.

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Replace the IEEE-SA front matter with that found in a current template.

**Response:**  
Accept in principle.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 4

**Comment Type:** E  
**Comment Status:** A  

Typo.

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Replace "04" with "104".

**Response:**  
Accept.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 5

**Comment Type:** E  
**Comment Status:** A  

Not the current P802.3/D3.0 self description.

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Update with the current P802.3/D3.0 self description (D3.0 or later as appropriate.)

**Response:**  
Accept in principle.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 6

**Comment Type:** ER  
**Comment Status:** A  

This is not the current FM Introduction (e.g., first paragraph and Section Nine have been modified at a minimum.

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Get current Introduction from P802.3/D3.2.

**Response:**  
Accept in principle.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 7

**Comment Type:** ER  
**Comment Status:** A  

Modify introduction to match introduction in IEEE 802.3 P802.3/D3.2

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Modify introduction to match introduction in IEEE 802.3 P802.3/D3.2.

**Response:**  
Accept.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 8

**Comment Type:** E  
**Comment Status:** A  

Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Response:**  
Accept.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 9

**Comment Type:** ER  
**Comment Status:** A  

Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Response:**  
Accept in principle.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 10

**Comment Type:** E  
**Comment Status:** A  

Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Response:**  
Accept in principle.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 11

**Comment Type:** ER  
**Comment Status:** A  

Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Response:**  
Accept in principle.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 12

**Comment Type:** E  
**Comment Status:** A  

Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Response:**  
Accept.

**Response Status:** C

---

### Comment 13

**Comment Type:** E  
**Comment Status:** A  

Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Suggested Remedy:**  
Modify front matter to match front matter in Version 5.0 of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group FrameMaker template

**Response:**  
Accept.

**Response Status:** C
IEEE P802.3cw D1.5 400 Gb/s over DWDM systems 6th Task Force review comments

Comment Type: ER  Comment Status: A  bucket
Will cw really be Amendment 7? There are three projects targeting June 2023 RevCom ahead of cw. While I have no issue with writing your amendment as if it will be #7 for now, I would not put a number here just now.

Suggested Remedy
Amendment x, Amendment ?, or similar.

Response
Response Status: C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "Amendment 7" to "Amendment x"

Comment Type: ER  Comment Status: A
Update insert point.

Suggested Remedy
"Insert the following two new definitions after 1.4.144a "400GBASE-VR4" (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3db-202x):"

Response
Response Status: C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change insertion point to "after 400GBASE-SR16 as follows:"

With editorial license

Comment Type: ER  Comment Status: A
Insert the following two new definitions after 1.4.144a "400GBASE-VR4" (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3db-202x):"

Response
Response Status: C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Modify to read "Insert the following two new definitions after 1.4.144a "400GBASE-VR4" (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3db-202x):" and modify 400GBASE-Z location to 1.4.144b and 400GBASE-ZR location to 1.4.144c.

With editorial license.

Comment Type: ER  Comment Status: A
Update insert point.

Suggested Remedy
"...after 400GBASE-VR4 (inserted by IEEE Std 802.3db-202x)..."

Response
Response Status: C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change insertion point to "after 400GBASE-SR16 as follows:"

With editorial license

Comment Type: ER  Comment Status: A
Base text error.

Suggested Remedy
P802.3/D3.2 has this "MDIO Interface registers"

Response
Response Status: C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Mistake in suggested remedy referring to "MDIO Interface registers". Issue was the capitization of "Registers". Change to "MDIO Interface registers"
IEEE P802.3cw D1.5 400 Gb/s over DWDM systems 6th Task Force review comments

Comment Type  ER  Comment Status  A

Though I have some experience in 802.3, I do not have the knowledge of PHY type details to provide with confidence where this insert should be. The rules chosen in the resolution of P802.3/D3.0, comment #i-52 are:
1. Increasing speed.
2. Increasing reach (maximum supported distance over the medium).
3. Decreasing number of lanes
The following supplemental rules address are included to address special cases 4. PHY "family designations, by convention, are assigned a reach of 0
5. "Copper" PHYs precede "Fiber" PHYs (all else being equal)
6. Alphanumeric sort (all else being equal)

SuggestedRemedy
Using these rules, and consider the 6 400GBASE inserts being done by P802.3db to determine the correct insert point. (I don't think the insert points in P802.3db/D3.0 follow these rules.)

Response
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change insertion point from "Insert new rows for 400GBASE-ZR in Table 78–1 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cu-20xx and IEEE Std 802.3ct-20xx) with 400GBASE-ZR after 400GBASE-LR4-6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" to "Insert new row for 400GBASE-ZR at end of Table 78–1:"

With editorial license

Comment Type  E  Comment Status  A

Page numbering for clause 116 is incorrect

SuggestedRemedy
Correct the page numbering in clause 116 to align with the rest of the document

Response
ACCEPT.

Comment Type  E  Comment Status  A

Insertion point states as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cu-20xx. This document is an amendment to P802.3/D3.2 which includes all modifications from 802.3cu so this reference is no longer valid.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove reference to P802.3cu. Review entire document and remove any references to amendments included in P802.3/D3.2 and update references as required for amendments to P802.3/D3.2.

Response
ACCEPT.
Comment Type: E  Comment Status: A

Table 116-4 was changed to 116-5 in P802.3/D3.2. There may be other instances of Table or subclause numbering changing with P802.3/D3.2.

Suggested Remedy:
Change Table 116-4 to Table 116-5. Review the entire document and change Table or subclause numbering to align with P802.3 D3.2.

Response  Response Status: C
ACCEPT.

Comment Type: ER  Comment Status: A

Use of the word "must" is deprecated.

Suggested Remedy:
Rewrite to "shall" or other choice of grammar. Also p. 73, l. 43; p. 75, l. 41, 42; p. 85, l. 34; p. 91, l. 35; and p. 94, l. 26.

Response  Response Status: C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace "must" with "shall" or similar language used in P802.3/D3.2 throughout the document.

With editorial license.

Comment Type: TR  Comment Status: A

In Table 156-6 Error Vector magnitude (max) is TBD

Suggested Remedy:
Replace TBD with 12

Response  Response Status: C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace "TBD" with "12"
IEEE P802.3cw D1.5 400 Gb/s over DWDM systems 6th Task Force review comments

Cl 156 SC 156.8 P 85 L 28 # 33
Lewis, David Lumentum

Comment Type TR Comment Status A
Because the channel passband min & max characteristics are specified as black link characteristics in Table 156-8, it is not necessary to have a separate table specifying adjacent channel isolation.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove the parameter from Table 156-8 and delete Table 156-9. Remove the test pattern line for adjacent channel isolation from Table 156-11. Remove the parameter definition at 156.9.29.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Retain existing adjacent channel isolation parameter, associated tables, table entries and definition.
Replace TBDs in table 156-9 with values on slide 8 of maniloff_3cw_01_220523.pdf.

Cl 156 SC 156.8 P 85 L 30 # 25
Sluyski, Mike Cisco Systems

Comment Type T Comment Status A
Interferometric crosstalk at TP3 (max) in Table 156-8

SuggestedRemedy
Remove parameter from table. Remove note (d). ADM applications can be considered Out-of-Scope for this specification.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Retain parameter and note. Use of ADMs are not excluded as long as the end to end link requirements are met. See Note 1 in 156.6.
Change "TBD" to "-35".

Cl 156 SC 156.8 P 85 L 30 # 25
Issenhuth, Tom Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status A
In Table 156-10 pattern description is stated as "Scrambled idle encoded by SC-FEC".
400GBASE-ZR uses CFEC not SC-FEC

SuggestedRemedy
Change pattern description to read "Scrambled idle encoded by CFEC"

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 156 SC 156.9.1 P 86 L 35 # 22

Sluyski, Mike Cisco Systems

Comment Type T Comment Status A
The I-Q amplitude imbalance (mean) is TBD

SuggestedRemedy
Add definition: The I-Q amplitude imbalance (mean) is the center value between the proportional amplitude difference of the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change definition from "The I-Q amplitude imbalance (mean) is TBD" to "The I-Q amplitude imbalance (mean) is the center value between the proportional amplitude difference of the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal."

Cl 156 SC 156.9.13 P 90 L 35 # 26

Sluyski, Mike Cisco Systems

Comment Type T Comment Status A
The I-Q phase error (max) is TBD

SuggestedRemedy
Add definition: The I-Q phase error (max) is the largest proportional phase difference of the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal. Measured relative to LO.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change definition from "The I-Q phase error (max) is TBD" to "The I-Q phase error (max) is the largest proportional phase difference of the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal. Measured relative to local oscillator."
Comment Type: T  Comment Status: A
The I-Q phase error (min) is TBD

SuggestedRemedy
Add definition: The I-Q phase error (min) is the largest negative proportional phase difference of the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal. Measured relative to LO

Response
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

LATE COMMENT
Change definition from "The I-Q phase error (min) is TBD" to "The I-Q phase error (min) is the largest negative proportional phase difference of the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal. Measured relative to local oscillator."

---

Comment Type: T  Comment Status: A
The I-Q quadrature skew (max) is TBD

SuggestedRemedy
Add definition: The I-Q quadrature skew (max) is the maximum relative skew between the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal.

Response
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

LATE COMMENT
Change definition from "The I-Q quadrature skew is TBD" to "The I-Q quadrature skew (max) is the maximum relative skew between the in-phase component I and quadrature component Q of the signal."

---

Comment Type: T  Comment Status: A
FIR filter is defined with TBD TBD taps

SuggestedRemedy
Suggest to use Equalizer definition used in OMA to determine EVM of Rahn_3cw-01a_220223

Response
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "The signal is equalized using an FIR filter with TBD TBD taps" to "The signal is equalized using an FIR filter with 15 real taps."