Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　　# 1

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

With P802.3/D3.2 at RevCom, it is appropriate to update the cw draft for consistency with IEEE Std 802.3-202x. The draft is currently inconsistent, in some places recognizing that it will not be an amdendment to the 2018 revision, and in many places assuming it will be an amendment to the 2018 revision.

SuggestedRemedy

Multiple comments have been submitted but time does not allow this commenter to review all at this time. Editors should update draft for consistency with P802.3/D3.2 as the base document and include the current six amendments assigned numbers (as recognized in front matter), and any other amendments expected to be approved prior to this project.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　　# 2

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

To someone not active on the project, content of Clauses 155 and 156 look like they may be based on other clauses.

SuggestedRemedy

Editor's might want to look at changes made during the revision to clauses on which Clauses 155 and 156 are based to look for other style changes. Examples I searched on and commented include capitalization of register, elimination of must, misuse of "PHY", but I am less sure of how correcting misuse of "comprise" and "comprising" and "implementer" were handled in P802.3.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P* **1**　　　*L* **27**　　　# 3

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Misuse of acronym PHY (see P802.3/D3.2, 1.5.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "(PHY)"

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 4

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

This will be an amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x as stated on the cover page.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "2018" with "200x"

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **5**　　　# 5

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Capltalization of forward error correction in P802.3 was made consistent, this capitalization is not consistent with that used in P802.3/D3.2.

SuggestedRemedy

"forward error correction"

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **51**　　　# 10

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Some information in this copyright block has been updated.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the IEEE-SA front matter with that found in a current template.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P* **3**　　　*L* **7**　　　# 8

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

IEEE page numbering style has changes no more Roman numeral front matter numbering.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the second paragraph of the note.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **FM**
SC **FM**

Page 1 of 4
5/5/2022 10:19:33 AM

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **3**　　　*L* **21**　　　# 9

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

This isn't the current IEEE SA mandated front matter.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the IEEE-SA front matter with that found in a current template.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **9**　　　*L* **15**　　　# 11

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

This is not the current FM Introduction (e.g., first paragraph and Section Nine have been modified at a minimum.

SuggestedRemedy

Get current Introduction from P802.3/D3.2.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **10**　　　*L* **45**　　　# 12

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Typo.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "04" with "104".

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **11**　　　*L* **27**　　　# 13

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Not the current P802.3/D3.0 self description.

SuggestedRemedy

Update with the current P802.3de self description (D3.0 or later as appropriate.)

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **11**　　　*L* **33**　　　# 14

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Will cw really be Amendment 7? There are three projects targeting June 2023 RevCom ahead of cw. While I have no issue with writing your amendment as if it will be #7 for now, I would not put a number here just now.

SuggestedRemedy

Amendment x, Amendment ?, or similar.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **1**　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　　*P* **21**　　　*L* **6**　　　# 15

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Update insert point.

SuggestedRemedy

"Insert the following two new definitions after 1.4.144a "400GBASE-VR4" (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3db-202x):"

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.5.1.1.2**　　　　*P* **12**　　　*L* **22**　　　# 16

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Update insert point.

SuggestedRemedy

",,,after 400GBASE-VR4 (inserted by IEEE Std 802.3db-202x)…"

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status*　**O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **30**
SC **30.5.1.1.2**

Page 2 of 4
5/5/2022 10:19:33 AM

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2**　　　　　　*P* **23**　　*L* **3**　　　　# 6

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Base text error.

SuggestedRemedy

P802.3/D3.2 has this "MIDO Interface registers"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **78**　　*SC* **78.1.4**　　　　　*P* **29**　　*L* **8**　　　　# 17

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Though I have some experience in 802.3, I do not have the knowledge of PHY type details
to provide with confidence where this insert should be. The rules chosen in the resolution
of P802.3/D3.0, comment #i-52 are:
1. Increasing speed.
2. Increasing reach (maximum supported distance over the medium).
3. Decreasing number of lanes
The following supplemental rules address are included to address special cases 4. PHY
"family designations, by convention, are assigned a reach of 0
5. "Copper" PHYs precede "Fiber" PHYs (all else being equal)
6. Alphanumeric sort (all else being equal)

SuggestedRemedy

Using these rules, and consider the 6 400GBASE inserts being done by P802.3db to
determine the correct insert point. (I don't think the insert points in P802.3db/D3.0 follow
these rules.)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **116**　　*SC* **116**　　　　　　*P* **28**　　*L*　　　　　# 19

Issenhuth, Tom　　　　　　　　Huawei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Page numbering for clause 116 is incorrect

SuggestedRemedy

Correct the page numbering in clause 116 to align with the rest of the document

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **116**　　*SC* **116.1.2**　　　　*P* **31**　　*L* **8**　　　　# 18

Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**

P802.3db/D3.0 modifies this list inserting a new item and re-lettering the last item to be "I)".

SuggestedRemedy

Change "i} in the editing instruction (also adding a reference to IEEE Std 802.3db-202x)
making the new item "j)". Review clause to assure all P802.3db changes are incorporated
in instructions and base text that is being modified.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **116**　　*SC* **116.1.4**　　　　*P* **28**　　*L* **3**　　　　# 20

Issenhuth, Tom　　　　　　　　Huawei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Insertion point states as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cu-20xx. This document is an
amendment to P802.3/D3.2 which includes all modifications from 802.3cu so this reference
is no longer valid.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove reference to P802.3cu. Review entire document and remove any references to
amendments included in P802.3/D3.2 and update references as required for amendments
to P802.3/D3.2.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **116**　　*SC* **116.1.4**　　　　*P* **28**　　*L* **6**　　　　# 21

Issenhuth, Tom　　　　　　　　Huawei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**

Table 116-4 was changed to 116-5 in P802.3/D3.2. There may be other instances of Table
or subclause numbering changing with P802.3/D3.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Change Table 116-4 to Table 116-5. Review the entire document and change Table or
subclause numbering to align with P802.3 D3.2.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **116**
SC **116.1.4**

Page 3 of 4
5/5/2022 10:19:33 AM

Cl **155** *SC* **155.2.5.6**   *P* **47**   *L* **1**   # 7

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**

 Use of the word "must" is deprecated.

SuggestedRemedy

 Rewrite to "shall" or other choice of grammar. Also p. 73, l. 43; p. 75, l. 41, 42; p. 85, l. 34; p. 91, l. 35; and p. 94, l. 26.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **155** *SC* **155.5.2.1**   *P* **61**   *L* **14**   # 23

Sluyski, Mike   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**

 faw_valid is TBD

SuggestedRemedy

 replace TBD with "8 symbols in a single frame"

 Validation methodology to be provided

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **156** *SC* **156.9.1**   *P* **86**   *L* **35**   # 22

Issenhuth, Tom   Huawei

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

 In Table 156-10 pattern description is stated as "Scrambled idle encoded by SC-FEC". 400GBASE-ZR uses CFEC not SC-FEC

SuggestedRemedy

 Change pattern description to read "Scrambled idle encoded by CFEC"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **156**   Page 4 of 4
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **156.9.1**   5/5/2022 10:19:33 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line