Approved IEEE 802.3cx Improved PTP Timestamping Accuracy (ITSA) Task Force Meeting Minutes

November 24, 2021, Virtual Meeting

- Minutes prepared by Silvana Rodrigues and Steve Gorshe

Agenda and General Information Presentation by Steve Gorshe, ITSA Task Force Chair

- Steve Gorshe, meeting and task force chair, begins presenting the Agenda and General Information slides
- Since this was a virtual meeting, the attendees were not asked to introduce themselves with their affiliations. Instead, the Chair asked them to identify their affiliation in their WebEx user names or in the chat window.
- **Agenda** – Chair presents the agenda for the meeting and asked if anyone had comments, additions or objections for the meeting agenda per slide 2 of the following presentation: Agenda and General Information.
- **Task Force Decorum** - Chair reviewed slide and noted that there should be no recording or photography without permission. Chair asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting – none responded.
- **Goals for Meeting** – Chair presented the goals with no comment from attendees
- **Big Ticket Items** – Chair presented the Big-Ticket items aligned to goals with no comments from attendees
- **Reflector and Web** – Chair presented the Task Force reflector and web information. All in attendance were invited to subscribe for Task Force communications and updates.
- **Task Force Private Area** – Chair reminded members of the Task Force Private Area, presented the URL to that private area and presented both the Username and Password to gain access to the URL. Chair also noted that the general IEEE 802.3 Username and Password can be used to access the URL.
- **Ground Rules** – Chair review the meeting ground rules based on IEEE 802.3 Rules.
- **Attendance** – Attendees were reminded of the IEEE 802.3 attendance procedures and asked to follow the link to those procedure for further information. There is no IMAT tool was used for this meeting, and the Chair will use Webex to register the attendance.
- **Non-payment of meeting registration fees** – Chair noted that meeting registration fees are required in order to participate in any session during an IEEE 802 plenary, including IEEE 802.3 Task Force meetings. This is a reminder for the March Plenary meeting. See slide 10 of the agenda deck Agenda and General Information for a detailed explanation.
- **IEEE Structure and Important Bylaws & Rules** – Chair reviewed the IEEE SA structure including a review of how 802.3 WG and the Task Force is located within the structure. The important bylaws and rules were pointed out for all to refer as needed or of interest.
- **IEEE 's Patent Policy and IEEE WG Meeting Guidelines (Slides 13-17 or IEEE SA Slides 0-4)** – All 5 IEEE SA slides were presented with the Chair highlighting that
  1. IEEE's patent policy is described in Clause 6 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws where they can be referred to and that the IEEE SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator may be contacted with further questions

2. Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged
3. There may be Essential Patent Claims of which IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither IEEE, the WG, nor the WG Chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.
4. Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE of the identity of each holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents

- The Chair provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of this standard.
    - No such claims were bought to the Chair's attention.
- **IEEE Copyright Policy (slides 18-20)** – The chair also reminded attendees of the IEEE copyright policy.
  - **Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings (slides 21-23)** – Chair reviewed the slides
  - **Overview of IEEE 802.3 Standard Process (5 slides)** – Chair reviewed the standards process slides. Chair highlighted that the ITSA group had completed the Study Group Phase and moved into the Task Force Review Phase on slide 2 of 5 of the Process slides.
  - **Liaisons and Communications** – Chair noted that there are no incoming liaisons for this meeting.
  - **Action Items** – There were none to review for this meeting.
  - **Task Force Approved Project Documents** – Task Force project documents remain unchanged and links to the documents were provided.
  - **Task Force Objectives** – Chair restated the adopted Task Force objectives.
  - **Task Force Timelines (slides 33) –** Chair reviewed the timelines
  - **Agenda (Slide 34) –** Chair presents the agenda for the day
  - Chair put forward a motion for the Task Force to approve the agenda:

Motion #1: Approve the agenda of the current meeting:

- Requires >50% (Procedural)
- Moved by :   Marek Hajduczenia   Seconded by: Jeff Slavick
- PASSES with no objections received
- Meeting agenda posted here:
- https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21int/agenda_3cx_a_1121_2.pdf

  - **Previous Meeting Minutes** - Meeting minutes held on November 10, 2021 (virtual call) are here:
    https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21/Unconfirmed_Meeting_Minutes_ITSA_802d3cx_1121r1.pdf
  Chair asked if any attendee had any comment regarding the November 10, 2021 Meeting Minutes. None were received

https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21/Unconfirmed_Meeting_Minutes_ITSA_802d3cx_1121r1.pdf
- Requires >50% (Procedural)
- Moved by: Marek Hajduczenia   Seconded by: Jeff Slavick
- PASSES with no objections received

Approved meeting minutes from November 10, 2021 are officially here:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21/Approved_Meeting_Minutes_ITSA_802d3cx_1121.pdf

- **Presentations** – In addition to this presentation (Agenda and General Information), there are two items on the agenda: Solutions for Comments 135 and 177 (also 137 and 181), and continued review of D2.0 comments (Chief Editor comments on draft D1.2). Chair introduced the agenda items and asked the Chief Editor to start comment resolution.

Chief Editor comments on draft D2.0, Marek Hajduczenia (Editor), Charter Communications

- The editor started the comment resolution per https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21/802d3cx_D2_0_proposed_partial.pdf
- Comment 222 and 224 were discussed, the commenters were not presented
- Chair stated that an offline discussion took place regarding these comments. The resolution is to reject the comment for now, and the commenters will bring a contribution at the January meeting to address the concerns regarding the Draft Objective of this project.
- Regarding comment 239, Richard Tse presented a proposal for using "packet timing point" instead of "message timestamp point"
- It was noted that these are all delay measurements information that can be used for any application that needs delay measurement, there is no timing information sending across the interface, and therefore a more generic term can be used.
- It was noted that the mechanism provided in clause 90 is to allow the measurement of the link delay, not the delay of the PHY. The delay for FEC and multi-PCS lane distribution functions as described in clause 90 is not actually the delay of the PHY, it is a mechanism to allow the measurement of the link delay by combining the transmit and the receive path.
- It was noted that this is generic. The registers represent delay measurements. For multilane, some adjustments need to take place, and fundamentally this will work with any protocol, it does not need to be with a time sync protocol, or timing sync packets. The PHY is not aware of the type of the packet.
- David Law suggested a straw poll
- The chair put forward the following straw poll

Poll #1:

For the term "message timestamp point" in D2.0, do you prefer
("Chicago Rules" were used)

A. Use "Packet timing point"
B. Use "Packet transit event"
C. Use "Data delay measurement point"
D. No preference
E. Need more information/discussion

Results: A-3, B-4, C-7, D-1

- Based on the straw poll results, it was agreed to use "data delay measurement point"
- Comment 247 – it was agreed to keep the same terminology as agreed by the straw poll and use "data delay measurement point"
- Comment 177 – Richard Tse presented the contribution "Solutions for Comments 135 and 177 (also 137 and 181)" per https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21int/proposed_res_for_comments_135_177_137_181.pdf. There was no objection to adopting these proposed resolutions.
- David Law suggest to have "NOTE 6" in the gRS section. It was decided to insert NOTE 6 at the end of 90.7, and once the new draft is available, then it could be decided whether it should be moved.
- All comments have been discussed and resolved, except the comments in the "bucket list". Chair put forward the following motion:

Motion #3: To accept the proposed responses to D2.0 items in the bucket list, as posted in 802d3cx_D2_0_proposed_partial.

- Requires >75% (Technical)
- Moved by: Marek Hajduczenia   Seconded by: Xiang He
- PASSES with no objections received

- The approved responses to all P802.3cx D2.0 comments were posted after the meeting here: https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21int/802d3cx_D2_0_approved.pdf

- Chair put forward the following motion:

Motion #4: To authorize the editor to produce D2.1 on the basis of D2.0 closed comments and proceed to WG recirculation ballot

- Requires >75% (Technical)
- Moved by: Jeff Slavick   Seconded by: David Law
- PASSES with no objections received

FUTURE MEETINGS
- The next IEEE 802.3 interim meeting is scheduled to be in January 2022, and it will be virtual.

New Business
- There was no new business

Adjourn

- TF Chair announced that the meeting having completed the agenda, the meeting was adjourned.

Attendance

IEEE 802.3cx Improving PTP Timestamping Accuracy TF IEEE 802.3cx Virtual TF interim meeting, November 24, 2021				Nov. 24th					
By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.									
Last Name	First Name	Employer	Affiliations	Wed.					
Armstrong	Greg	Renesas	Renesas	x					
Gorshe	Steve	Microchip	Microchip	x					
Gustlin	Mark	Cisco	Cisco	x					
Hajduczenia	Marek	Charter	Charter	x					
He	Xiang	Huawei	Huawei	x					
Huber	Tom	Nokia	Nokia	x					
Law	David	HPE	HPE	x					
Lv	Jingfei	Huawei	Huawei	x					
McKeown	Shane	Calnex	Calnex	x					
Orlando	Christian	IEEE SA	IEEE SA	x					
Parkholm	Ulf	Ericsson	Ericsson	x					
Rodrigues	Silvana	Huawei	Huawei	x					
Santulli	Jennifer	IEEE SA	IEEE SA	x					
Slavick	Jeff	Broadcom	Broadcom	x					
Trowbridge	Steve	Nokia	Nokia	x					
Tse	Richard	Microchip	Microchip	x					