IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/FM SC FM	P1	L	# 447		C/ FM	SC FM	P11	L10	# 660
Carlson, Steve	HSD, Bosch,	Ethernovia			Murty, Rama	ana	Broadcom		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D			EZ	Comment Ty	rpe E	Comment Status D		E.
The FrameMaker ten	nplate has been updated to Ver	rsion 5.1 by Pete	e Anslow.		Text in A	mendment 3			
SuggestedRemedy					SuggestedRe	emedy			
	to Ver. 5.1 per Anslow rg/3/tools/framemaker/index.ht	ml					on (PHY) in 802.3db. Add a co	omma after "two	o" on line 11.
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF	Response Status W					, SED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
C/ FM SC FM	P 7	L17	# 372		Copy the	e official text fo	or 802.3db.		
Grow, Robert	RMG Conslut		" <u>512</u>		C/ FM	SC FM	P11	L10	# 396
Comment Type E	Comment Status D	ling		EZ	Wienckowsk	i, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
					Comment Ty	rpe E	Comment Status D		E
WG ballot group is no						بالمام محتفظت			the correct abbreviation
,							doesn't match D3.2 of P802.3 Layer device". Also, two oxfo		
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group						ans "Physical			
SuggestedRemedy	o. Response Status W				as it mea <i>SuggestedR</i> e Change: and 400	ans "Physical e <i>medy</i> Physical Lay Gb/s over one		rd commas are anagement para	missing. ameters for 100, 200
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP CI FM SC FM	o. Response Status W PT. P 11	L3	# [<u>395</u>		as it mea SuggestedRo Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy	ans "Physical emedy Physical Laye Gb/s over one J. sical Layer sp	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for	missing. ameters for 100, 200 I on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie	o. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto		# 395		as it mea SuggestedRo Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy	ans "Physical emedy Physical Laye Gb/s over one sical Layer sp , two, and fou	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for	missing. ameters for 100, 200 I on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	o. Response Status W PT. P 11	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy over one Proposed Re	ans "Physical emedy Physical Laye Gb/s over one sical Layer sp , two, and fou	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ir pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for	missing. ameters for 100, 200 I on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for PN	o. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto Comment Status D	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy over one Proposed Re	ans "Physical emedy Physical Lay Gb/s over one sical Layer sp the, two, and fou esponse	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ir pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for	missing. ameters for 100, 200 I on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for PN SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Me	P. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto Comment Status D MA is physical medium attachm edia Attachment (PMA)	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy over one Proposed Re PROPOS	ans "Physical emedy Physical Lay Gb/s over one sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer Sp SED ACCEPT SC FM	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ir pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W F.	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	missing. ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s optical signaling.
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for PM SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Medium	n. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto Comment Status D MA is physical medium attachm edia Attachment (PMA) n Attachment (PMA)	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy: over one Proposed Re PROPOS	ans "Physical emedy Physical Layer Gb/s over one sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp SED ACCEPT SC FM i, Natalie	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ir pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W T. <i>P</i> 11	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	missing. ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s optical signaling.
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for PN SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Medium Proposed Response	n. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto Comment Status D MA is physical medium attachm edia Attachment (PMA) n Attachment (PMA) Response Status W	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy over one Proposed Re PROPOS C/ FM Wienckowsk Comment Ty	ans "Physical emedy Physical Layer Gb/s over one sical Layer sp two, and fou esponse SED ACCEPT SC FM i, Natalie pe E	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management in pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W T. <i>P</i> 11 General Moto	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	missing. ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s optical signaling. # <u>397</u>
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for PM SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Medium	n. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto Comment Status D MA is physical medium attachm edia Attachment (PMA) n Attachment (PMA) Response Status W	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy over one Proposed Re PROPOS C/ FM Wienckowsk Comment Ty	ans "Physical emedy Physical Layer Gb/s over one sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp scal Scal Layer sp scal Scal Scal Scal Scal Scal Scal Scal S	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ir pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W T. <i>P</i> 11 General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> D	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	missing. ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s optical signaling. # <u>397</u>
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for PN SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Medium Proposed Response	n. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto Comment Status D MA is physical medium attachm edia Attachment (PMA) n Attachment (PMA) Response Status W	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy: over one Proposed Re PROPOS CI FM Wienckowsk Comment Ty The deso	ans "Physical emedy Physical Lay Gb/s over one sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp sical Layer sp scal Layer sp scal Layer Sp SED ACCEPT SC FM i, Natalie pe E cription of de c emedy Single Pair	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ir pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W T. <i>P</i> 11 General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> D	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	missing. ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s optical signaling. # <u>397</u>
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot group Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for PN SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Me To: Physical Medium Proposed Response	n. Response Status W PT. P11 General Moto Comment Status D MA is physical medium attachm edia Attachment (PMA) n Attachment (PMA) Response Status W	ors		EZ	as it mea SuggestedRe Change: and 400 signaling To: Phy: over one Proposed Re PROPOS C/ FM Wienckowsk Comment Ty The deso SuggestedRe Change:	ans "Physical emedy Physical Lay Gb/s over one sical Layer sp sical Sc sical Sc sica	Layer device". Also, two oxfo er (PHY) specifications and m e, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ir pairs of multimode fiber bas <i>Response Status</i> W T. <i>P</i> 11 General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> D	rd commas are anagement para ode fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	missing. ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb/s optical signaling. # <u>397</u>

C/ FM	SC FM	P11	L 30	# 398	CI 00	SC O	P 0	L 0	# 455
Wienckow	vski, Natalie	General Motor	S		D'Ambro	sia, John	Futurewei, L	IS Subsidiary of	Huawei
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			EZ Commen	t Type E	Comment Status D		E
The de	escription of cx c	doesn't match D3.0 of P802.3c	х.		The	erms master/sla	ave should be avoided.		
Suggested	dRemedy				Suggeste	edRemedy			
		l receive path delays			Cons	ult with IEEE S	A for acceptable terms and rep	blaced	
		ive path data delays			Proposed	d Response	Response Status W		
,	<i>Response</i> POSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			PRO	POSED REJEC	CT.		
C/ FM	SC FM	Р 20	L 48	# 449			d already in TF review under co K was inserted in Clause 165.	omment #293 ag	ainst D1.3, where
Carlson, S	Steve	HSD, Bosch, E	Ethernovia		C/ 1	SC 1.4.128	Ba P 21	L8	# 373
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			EZ Grow. Ro		RMG Conslu	-	" 010
		ly out of date. Example projects	s are a decade	old: (e.g., IEEE	Commen		Comment Status A	in ig	
P802.3 Suggested	.3bj and IEEE P8	U2.3DK)				51	is not full duplex, though it ma	v include full du	olex links. Similarly, an
	.3cz) ' <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			desc		ould not be replicated. 1.4.14 etwork"; but 1.4.82 10GBASE- cating an error).		
	OSED ACCELL	•			Suggeste	edRemedy			
C/ 00 Brown. Ma	SC 0	Р 0 Huawei	L 0	# 346		802.3 Physical 802.3	Layer specification for a 25 G	b/s Ethernet link	using a single twisted-
Comment		Comment Status D			EZ Respons	е	Response Status W		
COMMENT		I instructions throughout this d	raft. These are	a mess and rather	ACC	EPT IN PRINCI	PLE.		
Many e	al to comment on				<u>.</u>				
Many e painful	ul to comment on				Char	ige			
Many e painful Suggested Please and co	ul to comment on <i>dRemedy</i> e review all edito ommon style. Co	one by one. brial instructions and ensure that bnsult editorial instructions para	agraph on page	istent with the rules 20 line 33 and consu	IEEE	0	Layer specification for a 25 G	b/s Ethernet link	using a single twisted
Many e painful Suggested Please and co 802.3b	ul to comment on <i>dRemedy</i> e review all edito ommon style. Co	one by one. brial instructions and ensure that onsult editorial instructions para , for examples. Most have been	agraph on page	istent with the rules 20 line 33 and consu	IEEE	802.3 Physical	Layer specification for a 25 G	b/s Ethernet link	using a single twisted
Many e painful S <i>uggested</i> Please and co 802.3b likely s	ul to comment on <i>dRemedy</i> e review all edito ommon style. Co bs, 802.3ck, etc.	one by one. brial instructions and ensure that onsult editorial instructions para , for examples. Most have been	agraph on page	istent with the rules 20 line 33 and consu	IEEE ult pair o t To	802.3 Physical copper cable.			
Many e painful Suggested Please and co 802.3b likely s Proposed I	Il to comment on dRemedy e review all edito ommon style. Co bs, 802.3ck, etc. several have not	none by one. prial instructions and ensure that ponsult editorial instructions para , for examples. Most have been <i>Response Status</i> W	agraph on page	istent with the rules 20 line 33 and consu	IEEE It pair (t To IEEE	802.3 Physical copper cable.	Layer specification for a 25 G Layer specification for a 25 G		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 1 SC **1.4.128a** Page 2 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:05 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 1 SC 1.4.407 P21 L11	# 343		C/ 1 SC 1.4.473 P21 L17 # 475
Brown, Matt Huawei			Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Type E Comment Status D		EZ	Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Editorial instruction is superfluous as changes are evident by	the change marking.		If we are going to change 'twisted pair' to 'conductor pair' here, we need to also change the
SuggestedRemedy			same change in the matching definition of PoDL PD.
Change to "Change 1.4.407 as follows:"			SuggestedRemedy
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.			Add 1.4.472 PoDL PD to the draft, changing "twisted" to "conductor" as shown: 1.4.472 PoDL PD: A Powered Device that is intended to receive power from a link section consisting of a single twistedconductor pair. (See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 104.)
C/1 SC 1.4.473 P21 L16	3 # 383		Proposed Response Response Status W
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste			PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Comment Type E Comment Status D		EZ	
No editing intruction for 1.4.473			C/ 1 SC 105.3 P37 L25 # 369
SuggestedRemedy			Grow, Robert RMG Consluting
Add "Change 1.4.473 as follows:"			Comment Type TR Comment Status A
Proposed Response Response Status W			If 25GBASE-T1 deserves its own protocol stack in Figure 105-1, then it should describe those sublayers in the relevant 105.3.x subclauses. I missed this and should have voted
PROPOSED ACCEPT.			no on advancement to WG ballot as the draft is not technically complete. I should have seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness.
PROPOSED ACCEPT. 	# 344		
CI 1 SC 1.4.473 P21 L17	7 # <u>344</u>		seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing
C/ 1 SC 1.4.473 P21 L17	# <u>344</u>	EZ	seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy
Cl 1 SC 1.4.473 P21 L17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction.	7 # <u>344</u>	EZ	seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the
Cl 1 SC 1.4.473 P21 L17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction.			seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the remaining subclauses.
Cl 1 SC 1.4.473 P 21 L 17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction. SuggestedRemedy Add editorial instruction here and in various other locations in			seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the remaining subclauses. Response Response Status W
Cl 1 SC 1.4.473 P 21 L 17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction. SuggestedRemedy Add editorial instruction here and in various other locations in Proposed Response Response Status W			seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the remaining subclauses. Response Response Status W ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
CI 1 SC 1.4.473 P 21 L 17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction. SuggestedRemedy Add editorial instruction here and in various other locations in Proposed Response Response Status W			seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the remaining subclauses. Response Response Status W ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove 105.3.1 through 105.3.5
Cl 1 SC 1.4.473 P 21 L 17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction. SuggestedRemedy Add editorial instruction here and in various other locations in Proposed Response Response Status W			seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the remaining subclauses. Response Response Status W ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove 105.3.1 through 105.3.5 C/ 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P15 L15 # 399
CI 1 SC 1.4.473 P 21 L 17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction. SuggestedRemedy Add editorial instruction here and in various other locations in Proposed Response Response Status W			seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the remaining subclauses. Response Response Status W ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove 105.3.1 through 105.3.5 C/ 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P15 L15 Wienckowski, Natalie
Cl 1 SC 1.4.473 P 21 L 17 Brown, Matt Huawei Comment Type ER Comment Status D No editorial instruction. SuggestedRemedy Add editorial instruction here and in various other locations in Proposed Response Response Status W			seen these titles with no associated changes as an indication of incompleteness. SuggestedRemedy The technical experts in the TF are much better qualified than I am to provide the missing text for the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack relevant sections. Delete the subclause titles not relevant to the 25GBASE-T1 protocol stack. Include editorial instructions for each of the remaining subclauses. Response Response Status W ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove 105.3.1 through 105.3.5 C/ 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P15 L15 # 399 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Comment Type E Comment Status D E2 The PHY type needs to be moved right and then there should be space before the

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/generalC/30Page 3 of 78COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejectedRESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawnSC 30.3.2.1.28/22/2022 10:57:05 AMSORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, lineSORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 30 SC 30.3.2.	1.3 P15	L 21	# 400	C/ 45	SC 45.3	P 28	L1	# 334	
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Mot	tors		Maguire,	Valerie	Copperopol	is		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D			Z Commen	t Type E	Comment Status D			ΕZ
51	s to be moved right and then th	nere should be sp	ace before the	The I	PICS subclau	se for clause 45 is 45.5.			
description.				Suggeste	edRemedy				
SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GI	BASE-T1 Clause 165 25 Gb/s	PAM4" to match	802.3-2022 spacing.		ace, "45.3" wi rdingly.	h "45.5" and re-number subseq	uent subclauses	in this clause	
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Proposed	d Response	Response Status W			
PROPOSED ACCEP	PT.			PRO	POSED ACC	EPT.			
C/ 30 SC 30.5.1.	1.2 P15	L 35	# 401	C/ 45	SC 45.3	P 28	L 2	# 335	
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Mot	tors		Maguire,	Valerie	Copperopol	is		
••••••	Comment Status D			Z Commen	t Type E	Comment Status D			ΕZ
Comment Type E									
The PHY type needs	s to be moved right and then th	nere should be sp			face is capital	zed when appearing after "MDI	O" (see clause 4	5 header).	
The PHY type needs description.		nere should be sp		Inter	face is capital	zed when appearing after "MDI	O" (see clause 4	5 header).	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GI	to be moved right and then the SASE-T1 Single balanced pair		pace before the	Interf Suggeste Repla	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou	zed when appearing after "MDI tput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest)	,	,	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GI Clause 165" to matc	s to be moved right and then th BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing.		pace before the	Interf Suggeste Repla need	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou	Itput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp	,	,	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GI	s to be moved right and then th BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. <i>Response Status</i> W		pace before the	Inter Suggeste Repla need Proposed	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main	ntput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest) Response Status W	,	,	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GI Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. <i>Response Status</i> W	of conductors Pl	ace before the	Inter Suggeste Repla need Proposed	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response	itput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest) <i>Response Status</i> W EPT.	,	,	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GF Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF Cl 30 SC 30.6.1.	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. <i>Response Status</i> W PT. 1.5 <i>P</i> 15	of conductors PH	pace before the	Inter Suggeste Repla need Proposed PRO	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response POSED ACC SC 45.2 .	itput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest) <i>Response Status</i> W EPT.	L 7) Interface" (this may	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GI Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF C/ 30 SC 30.6.1. Wienckowski, Natalie	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. <i>Response Status</i> W PT. 1.5 <i>P</i> 15 General Mot	of conductors PH	HY as specified in	Interf Suggeste Replaneed Proposed PRO CI 45 Grow, Ro Commen	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response POSED ACC SC 45.2 .	tput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest) <i>Response Status</i> W EPT. 1 P23	L 7) Interface" (this may	EZ
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GE Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF Cl 30 SC 30.6.1. Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. Response Status W PT. 1.5 P15 General Mot Comment Status D	L49	HY as specified in	Interf Suggeste Replaneed Proposed PRO Cl 45 Grow, Ro Commen Z I find	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response POSED ACC SC 45.2. obert t Type E no changes o	Itput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest) Response Status W EPT. 1 P23 RMG Consl Comment Status D or inserts in the partial content c	L 7 uting opied from P802) Interface" (this may # <u>374</u> 2.3/D3.2. (Nor an editor	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GE Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF Cl 30 SC 30.6.1. Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. <i>Response Status</i> W PT. 1.5 <i>P</i> 15 General Mot	L49	HY as specified in	Interf Suggeste Replaneed Proposed PRO C/ 45 Grow, Ro Commen Z I find note	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response POSED ACC SC 45.2. obert t Type E no changes o	ttput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest) Response Status W EPT. 1 P23 RMG Consl Comment Status D	L 7 uting opied from P802) Interface" (this may # <u>374</u> 2.3/D3.2. (Nor an editor	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GF Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF Cl 30 SC 30.6.1. Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The PHY type needs	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. Response Status W PT. 1.5 P15 General Mot Comment Status D	L49	HY as specified in	Interf Suggeste Replaneed Proposed PRO Cl 45 Grow, Ro Commen I find note publi	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response POSED ACC SC 45.2. obert t Type E no changes o explaining wh	Itput (MDIO) interface" with "Inp enance rquest) Response Status W EPT. 1 P23 RMG Consl Comment Status D or inserts in the partial content c	L 7 uting opied from P802) Interface" (this may # <u>374</u> 2.3/D3.2. (Nor an editor	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GE Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF Cl 30 SC 30.6.1. Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. Response Status W PT. 1.5 P15 General Mot Comment Status D	L 49 L ors	HY as specified in # 402 wace before the	Interf Suggeste Replaneed Proposed PRO Cl 45 Grow, Ro Commen I find note publi Suggeste	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response POSED ACC SC 45.2. obert t Type E no changes o explaining wh cation.)	Atput (MDIO) interface" with "Inplemance rquest) Response Status W EPT. 1 P23 RMG Consi Comment Status D or inserts in the partial content c y the content is in the draft and	L 7 uting opied from P802) Interface" (this may # <u>374</u> 2.3/D3.2. (Nor an editor	
The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "25GE Clause 165" to matc Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF Cl 30 SC 30.6.1. Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The PHY type needs description. SuggestedRemedy	s to be moved right and then the BASE-T1 Single balanced pair h 802.3-2022 spacing. <i>Response Status</i> W PT. 1.5 <i>P</i> 15 General Mot <i>Comment Status</i> D s to be moved right and then the space of the status	L 49 L ors	HY as specified in # 402 wace before the	Interf Suggeste Replaneed Proposed PRO Cl 45 Grow, Ro Commen I find note publi Suggeste Delet	edRemedy ace, "Input/Ou to be a main d Response POSED ACC SC 45.2. obert t Type E no changes of explaining wh cation.) edRemedy	Atput (MDIO) interface" with "Inplemance rquest) Response Status W EPT. 1 P23 RMG Consi Comment Status D or inserts in the partial content c y the content is in the draft and	L 7 uting opied from P802) Interface" (this may # <u>374</u> 2.3/D3.2. (Nor an editor	

C/ **45** SC **45.2.1**

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 45	SC 45.2.1	P 23	L 7	# 504	C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.7.4	P23	L 34	# 375	
Huber, Tł	homas	Nokia			Grow, Robert	:	RMG Consluting	I		
Comment	t Type E	Comment Status D		EZ	Comment Typ	be E	Comment Status D			ΕZ
		45-3 and the text that introd	duces it are inclu	ded here, since there is	Inserted t	ext should be	underlined.			
	hange being made.				SuggestedRe	medy				
00	edRemedy				Underline	e line 34.				
Remo	ove everything betw	veen the heading 45.2.1 an	d the heading 45	5.2.1.7	Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status W			
Proposed	l Response	Response Status W			PROPOS	SED ACCEPT	,			
PRO	POSED ACCEPT.									
C/ 45	SC 45.2.1	P 23	L8	# 386		SC 45.2.1.7.		L 51	# 376]
Marris, A		Cadence Des	-		Grow, Robert		RMG Consluting	1		
Comment		Comment Status D	Sight Oysterns	EZ	Comment Typ		Comment Status D			EZ
	51	ded if there are no changes	:7		Inserted t	ext should be	underlined.			
•	edRemedy				SuggestedRe	emedy				
00	te Table 45–3				Underline	e line 51.				
		D			Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status W			
,	l Response	Response Status W			PROPOS	ED ACCEPT				
PRUI	POSED ACCEPT.				C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.16	P 24	L3	# 404	
C/ 45	SC 45.2.1	P 23	L 9	# 476	Wienckowski		General Motors	-•		
Zimmerm	nan, George	CME Consult	ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	Comment Typ		Comment Status D			ΕZ
Comment	t Type E	Comment Status D		EZ	51	w row is bein				L2
		ble 45-3 or 45.2.1, and text		•	SuggestedRe					
	are not shown. Th dard and also conta	ese should not be in the dra	aft, as they do ne	ot match the base	00	insert new ro	MC			
	dRemedy				0	t new row	wo			
00	,	ot the section header) and	Table 45-3 from	the draft	Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status W			
					PROPOS	ED ACCEPT				
	d Response	Response Status W								
PROP	POSED ACCEPT.									

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.16

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.214	P 24	L 30	# 403	C/ 45 SC 45.2.1	.244	P 25	L19	# 387
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	rs		Marris, Arthur		Cadence Des	sign Systems	
Comment Type E Co	omment Status D		EZ	Comment Type E	Commen	nt Status D		E
The editorial instruction does	n't reference the new ro	ow added.		Table number shou	d be 45-206			
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy				
Change: Change the identifi	ed row in Table 45-178	as follows (uncl	hanged rows not	Change "Table 45-	179" to "Table 4	15–206". Similar i	issue for Table 4	5-207 on page 26
shown): To: Change the identified ro changed row as follows (unc			v immediately below the	Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	,	e Status W		
Proposed Response Res	sponse Status W			C/ 45 SC 45.2.1	.244.1	P 25	L 43	# 653
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				McClellan, Brett		Marvell		
C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.214.2	P 25	L11	# 377	Comment Type E	Commen	nt Status D		E.
Grow, Robert	RMG Consluti	ing		missing references	to Clause 165			
Comment Type TR Co	omment Status R	0		SuggestedRemedy				
couldn't find a PICS item cor	responding to this existi	ing shall.	ged bit behavior, I	described in 149.3.2	mon interleaving 2.2.15. This is c		the link partner v	ia Infofields as
SuggestedRemedy Delete the shall, or add PICS		-	.	described in 149.3.2 specified in 149.4.2 to "Reed-Solomon i	2.2.15. This is c .4.5." nterleaving is 2.2.15 for MultiC the link partner and 165.4.2.4	GBASE-T1 and a via Infofields as 1.5 for 25GBASE	, and 165.3.2.2.15 specified in 149.	for 25GBASE-T1. This
SuggestedRemedy Delete the shall, or add PICS Response Res	S item for the specified the sponse Status W Clause 45 have respect not have a PICS in IEEE	tive PICS. Since Std 802.3-202	e this is an existing 22, I would prefer to	described in 149.3.2 specified in 149.4.2 to "Reed-Solomon i described in 149.3.2 is communicated to MultiGBASE-T1 and	2.2.15. This is c .4.5." nterleaving is 2.2.15 for MultiO the link partner and 165.4.2.4 rection on page <i>Response</i>	GBASE-T1 and a via Infofields as 1.5 for 25GBASE	, and 165.3.2.2.15 specified in 149.	for 25GBASE-T1. This
SuggestedRemedy Delete the shall, or add PICS Response Res REJECT. Not all SHALL statements in SHALL statement and does make no changes that would	S item for the specified the sponse Status W Clause 45 have respect not have a PICS in IEEI	behavior. tive PICS. Since E Std 802.3-202 jects and PHYs	e this is an existing 22, I would prefer to	described in 149.3.2 specified in 149.4.2 to "Reed-Solomon i described in 149.3.2 is communicated to MultiGBASE-T1 and make the same corn Proposed Response	2.2.15. This is c .4.5." nterleaving is 2.2.15 for MultiO the link partner d and 165.4.2.4 rection on page <i>Response</i> PT.	BASE-T1 and a via Infofields as 5 for 25GBASE- 26 lin 26	, and 165.3.2.2.15 specified in 149.	for 25GBASE-T1. This
SuggestedRemedy Delete the shall, or add PICS Response Res REJECT. Not all SHALL statements in SHALL statement and does make no changes that would Cl 45	S item for the specified to sponse Status W Clause 45 have respect not have a PICS in IEEE I / could affect other pro	tive PICS. Since Std 802.3-202	e this is an existing 22, I would prefer to	described in 149.3.2 specified in 149.4.2 to "Reed-Solomon i described in 149.3.2 is communicated to MultiGBASE-T1 and make the same corn Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	2.2.15. This is c .4.5." nterleaving is 2.2.15 for MultiO the link partner d and 165.4.2.4 rection on page <i>Response</i> PT.	BASE-T1 and a via Infofields as 1.5 for 25GBASE 26 lin 26 a Status W	and 165.3.2.2.15 specified in 149. -T1."	for 25GBASE-T1. This 4.2.4.5 for
SuggestedRemedy Delete the shall, or add PICS Response Res REJECT. Not all SHALL statements in SHALL statement and does make no changes that would CI 45 SC 45.2.1.244 McClellan, Brett	S item for the specified to sponse Status W Clause 45 have respect not have a PICS in IEEE // could affect other pro- P25 Marvell omment Status D	behavior. tive PICS. Since E Std 802.3-202 jects and PHYs	e this is an existing 22, I would prefer to	described in 149.3.2 specified in 149.4.2 to "Reed-Solomon i described in 149.3.2 is communicated to MultiGBASE-T1 and make the same com Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Table number does	2.2.15. This is c .4.5." Interleaving is 2.2.15 for MultiO the link partner d and 165.4.2.4 rection on page <i>Response</i> PT. .245	BASE-T1 and a via Infofields as 1.5 for 25GBASE- 26 lin 26 be Status W P26 Marvell of Status D	and 165.3.2.2.15 specified in 149. -T1."	for 25GBASE-T1. This 4.2.4.5 for
SuggestedRemedy Delete the shall, or add PICS Response Res REJECT. Not all SHALL statements in SHALL statement and does make no changes that would CI 45 SC 45.2.1.244 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Co	S item for the specified to sponse Status W Clause 45 have respect not have a PICS in IEEE I / could affect other pro P25 Marvell omment Status D the editor instruction	behavior. tive PICS. Since E Std 802.3-202 jects and PHYs	e this is an existing 22, I would prefer to # [654	described in 149.3.2 specified in 149.4.2 to "Reed-Solomon i described in 149.3.2 is communicated to MultiGBASE-T1 and make the same corr Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE Cl 45 SC 45.2.1 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E	2.2.15. This is c .4.5." nterleaving is 2.2.15 for MultiQ the link partner d and 165.4.2.4 rection on page <i>Response</i> PT. .245 <i>Commen</i> n't match the ec	BASE-T1 and a via Infofields as 1.5 for 25GBASE- 26 lin 26 be Status W P26 Marvell of Status D	and 165.3.2.2.15 specified in 149. -T1."	for 25GBASE-T1. This 4.2.4.5 for # <u>655</u>

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.245 Page 6 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:05 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.245	P 26	L 1	# 378		C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.2	246	P 26	L 35	# 388	
Grow, Rol	bert	RMG Conslu	uting			Marris, Ar	thur		Cadence De	sign Systems		
Comment	Type E	Comment Status D			EZ	Comment	Type E	Comment S	status D			ΕZ
Table	number error, it is	Table 45-207 in P802.3/D	3.2.			Why is	s 45.2.1.246 inc	cluded if nothing	has been cha	inged?		
Suggestee	dRemedy					Suggestee	dRemedy					
Correc	ct table number pe	r comment.				Delete	9 45.2.1.246					
,	Response POSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W				,	Response POSED ACCEP	<i>Response</i> S T.	tatus W			
C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.245	.1 P 26	L 29	# 379		C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.2	246	P 26	L35	# 478	
Grow, Rol	bert	RMG Conslu	uting			Zimmerma	an, George		CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cisc	co, CommScope,	Marve
Comment	Type E	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment	Type E	Comment S	Status D			ΕZ
	find it in the style ded by an "Oxford	manual, but I believe the p ' comma.	preference is that	"and" should be				PICS in clause 4 editing instruction		the draft - i.e., se	ction 45.3 (or	
Suggested	dRemedy					Suggested	dRemedy					
"L=2,	L=4, and L=8" (ret	aining underscore and stril	kethrough).			Delete	e 45.3 and subc	lauses, including	headers, fro	m the draft		
Proposed	Response	Response Status W				Proposed	Response	Response S	tatus W			
PROF	POSED ACCEPT.					PROF	POSED ACCEP	Т.				
C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.246	P 26	L 35	# 492		C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.2	246	P 26	L 35	# 380	
Huber, Th	iomas	Nokia				Grow, Rol	bert		RMG Conslu	iting		
Comment	Type E	Comment Status D			EZ	Comment	Type E	Comment S	status D			ΕZ
Subcla ameno		nd its 4 subclauses do not	appear to be cha	anged by this				. (Nor editorial n prior to publicati		why the content	is in the draft and	d that
Suggested	dRemedy					Suggested	dRemedy					
Remo	ve 45.2.1.246 and	its subclauses				Delete	e page 26, line 3	35 through page	27, line 43			
•	Response POSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W					Response POSED ACCEP	Response S	tatus W			

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.246

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.246	P 26	L 35	# 516	CI 45 S	SC 45.2.1.2	46.1	P 26	L 43	# 600	
Ran, Adee		Cisco			McClellan, Bre	ett		Marvell			
Comment T	ype E (Comment Status D		EZ	Comment Type	e E	Commer	nt Status D			ΕZ
There is its subc		tion nor any indication of	changes in the	text in 45.2.1.246 and	missing re	eferences to	Clause 165				
					SuggestedRen	nedy					
SuggestedF Remove	,	n 45.2.1.246.4 from the d	raft.			ransmitter t d Table149		erations defined b	by bits 1.2313.15	:13, are described	d in
Proposed R	0	esponse Status W			to "Transm	nitter test m	ode operatior			re described in 14 1 for 25GBASE-T	
	JSED ACCEPT.				Proposed Res	I · · · ·		e Status W			
CI 45	SC 45.2.1.246	P 26	L 35	# 604	PROPOSE	ED ACCEP	Т.				
McClellan, I		Marvell			C/ 45 S	SC 45.2.1.2	46.2	P 26	L 51	# 601	
Comment T	51	Comment Status D		EZ	McClellan, Bre	ett		Marvell			
		(including table 45-181) the table number should l		I to the base 802.3-	Comment Type	e E	Commer	nt Status D			ΕZ
SuggestedF	•				missing re	eferences to	Clause 165				
00	,	.2.1.246 or at least chang	e Table 45-181	to Table 45-208	SuggestedRen	nedy					
Proposed R PROPC	Response R	esponse Status W			to "149.3.2				20 25GBASE-T1.	"	
C/ 45	SC 45.2.1.246	P 26	L 35	# 477	Proposed Res	ponse	Response	e Status W			
Zimmermar				co, CommScope, Marve	PROPOSE	ED ACCEP	т.				
Comment T		Comment Status D	ng/Ai E Op, Ois	EZ	C/ 45 S	SC 45.2.1.2	46.4	P 27	L 42	# 602	
There a	ire no edits to Section	on 45.2.1.246 (or subclau	ses) in the draft	and no editing	McClellan, Bre	ett		Marvell			
instructi					Comment Type		Commer	nt Status D			ΕZ
SuggestedF	•				missing re	eferences to	Clause 165				
Delete 4		clauses, including header	s, from the draft		SuggestedRen	nedy					
	Response R	esponse Status W						5.2.3.2 for more i			
Proposed R							10 - 0 0 0 10				
,	SED ACCEPT.				to "See 14 Proposed Res	,	49.5.2.3.2, 16	5.5.2.3.1 and 16	65.5.2.3.2 for mo	re information."	

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.246.4

C/ 45 SC 45.2.24	6 P 26	L 35	# 407		C/ 45	SC 45.3	P 28	L1	# 517
Vienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	ors			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type T	Comment Status D			EZ	Comment T	Type E	Comment Status D		E
Unchanged register d	lefinitions don't need to be inclu	uded in the spec.					struction nor any indication of		
SuggestedRemedy					the PIC		content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho	out any changes)	but omits the rest of
Remove this Subclau standard.	se and 45.2.1.246.x as no cha	nges have been ma	ade from the bas	se	Suggested	Remedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status W				If there	e are no change	s to the PICS, remove 45.3 f	rom the draft.	
PROPOSED ACCEP	,				Proposed F	Response	Response Status W		
	1.				PROP	OSED ACCEP	IN PRINCIPLE.		
C/ 45 SC 45.3	P 28	<i>L</i> 1	# 607		Pomov	ve 45.3 from the	draft		
VcClellan, Brett	Marvell								
Comment Type E	Comment Status D			ΕZ	C/ 45	SC 45.3	P 28	L1	# 493
I see no differences b	etween this subclause and the	e base 802.3-2022			Huber, Tho		Nokia		
SuggestedRemedy					Comment 1	Tvpe E	Comment Status D		E
						51			
	se 45.3 if no changes are mad	le to this subclause	•		Subcla	use 45.3 (and i	ts subclauses) are shown in t		
remove all of subclau	se 45.3 if no changes are mad Response Status W	le to this subclause	•		Subcla	use 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub	ts subclauses) are shown in t lished 802.3, and in any case		
remove all of subclau	Response Status W	le to this subclause			Subcla clause	ause 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022.			
remove all of subclau Proposed Response	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE.	le to this subclause			Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested	ause 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. <i>Remedy</i>			
remove all of subclau Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3				Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested	use 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. <i>Remedy</i> ve subclause 45	lished 802.3, and in any case		
remove all of subclau Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau Cl 45 SC 45.3	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3	le to this subclause	# 605		Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested Remov Proposed F	use 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. <i>Remedy</i> ve subclause 45	lished 802.3, and in any case 5.4 and its subclauses <i>Response Status</i> W		
remove all of subclau Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau C/ 45 SC 45.3 AcClellan, Brett	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3 P28 Marvell			FZ	Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested Remov Proposed F PROPO	vuse 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. <i>Remedy</i> ve subclause 45 <i>Response</i> OSED ACCEP	lished 802.3, and in any case 5.4 and its subclauses <i>Response Status</i> W F.	e there are no ch	anges compared to
remove all of subclau Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau Cl 45 SC 45.3 AcClellan, Brett Comment Type E	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3	<i>L</i> 1		EZ	Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested Remov Proposed F PROPO CI 45	Ause 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. IRemedy ve subclause 45 Response OSED ACCEP SC 45.3	lished 802.3, and in any case 5.4 and its subclauses <i>Response Status</i> W F. <i>P</i> 28	e there are no cha	
remove all of subclau Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Clause 45 PICs in the	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3 P28 Marvell Comment Status D	<i>L</i> 1		EZ	Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested Remov Proposed F PROPO CI 45 Maguire, V	Ause 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. Remedy ve subclause 45 Response OSED ACCEP SC 45.3 'alerie	lished 802.3, and in any case 5.4 and its subclauses <i>Response Status</i> W F. <i>P</i> 28 Copperopoli	e there are no cha	anges compared to # <u>336</u>
remove all of subclau Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau 2/ 45 SC 45.3 AcClellan, Brett Comment Type E Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3 P28 Marvell Comment Status D e 802.3-2022 base standard is	<i>L</i> 1		EZ	Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested Remov Proposed F PROPO CI 45 Maguire, V Comment T	Ause 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. Remedy ve subclause 45 Response OSED ACCEP SC 45.3 Valerie Type E	lished 802.3, and in any case 5.4 and its subclauses <i>Response Status</i> W 7. <i>P</i> 28 Copperopolis <i>Comment Status</i> D	e there are no ch L6	anges compared to # <u>336</u>
remove all of subclau proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau 2/ 45 SC 45.3 AcClellan, Brett comment Type E Clause 45 PICs in the suggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3 P28 Marvell Comment Status D e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses	<i>L</i> 1		EZ	Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested Remov Proposed F PROPO Cl 45 Maguire, V Comment T Interface	Ause 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. Remedy ve subclause 45 Response OSED ACCEP SC 45.3 Valerie Type E ce is capitalized	lished 802.3, and in any case 5.4 and its subclauses <i>Response Status</i> W F. <i>P</i> 28 Copperopoli	e there are no ch L6	anges compared to # <u>336</u>
remove all of subclau roposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP Remove all of subclau // 45 SC 45.3 AcClellan, Brett comment Type E Clause 45 PICs in the uggestedRemedy	Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. use 45.3 P28 Marvell Comment Status D e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses Response Status W	<i>L</i> 1		EZ	Subcla clause 802.3-2 Suggested Remov Proposed F PROPO Cl 45 Maguire, V Comment T Interfac Suggested	Ause 45.3 (and i 45.5 in the pub 2022. Remedy ve subclause 45 Response OSED ACCEP SC 45.3 Valerie Type E ce is capitalized Remedy ce, "MDIO interf	lished 802.3, and in any case 5.4 and its subclauses <i>Response Status</i> W 7. <i>P</i> 28 Copperopolis <i>Comment Status</i> D	L 6 L 6 s)" (see clause 45	# <u>336</u> # beader).

C/ **45** SC **45.3**

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 45 SC 45.3.2.2	P 28	L 36	# 606		CI 78	SC 78.3	P 30	L 43	# 479
McClellan, Brett	Marvell				Zimmerm	an, George	CME C	onsulting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Type E Comm	ent Status D			ΕZ	Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status	۱.	
IEEE Std 802.3-2022 is the new	base document						or 25GBASE-T1 shall be		
SuggestedRemedy							o problems. First, the ac ining is, but not the adver		
change multiple references to IE	EE Std 802.3-202x	to IEEE Std 802.	3-2022				d say 165.4.2.4 because		
Proposed Response Respon	nse Status W						is that this is a duplicate and OAMen indicate EE		
PROPOSED ACCEPT.							Y shall indicate the suppo		
C/ 78 SC 78.1.4	P 30	L 8	# 345				ding capability bits."		
		L o	# 345				e also problems with the e	entries for 2.5G/5G/1	UGBASE-11
Brown, Matt	Huawei				Suggested	-	and a subscription of a subscription of		
Comment Type E Comm Editorial instruction not correct. I	ent Status D	rtad pat abapaad		ΕZ	Chang 165.4		ertised" to "is advertised	on P30 L43, and ch	ange 165.4.2.4.10 to
		neu not changed.			Response	•	Response Status	•	
SuggestedRemedy Change "unchanged rows not sh	own" to "como row	s not shown"			ACCE				
Same for 78.2.	own to some low	S HOL SHOWIT .			C/ 78	SC 78.3	P30	L 43	# 518
Proposed Response Respon	nse Status W							L 43	# 518
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINC	SIPLE.				Ran, Ade		Cisco Comment Status		EZ
Leave the instructions as they a	e but underline ne	wly inserted rows			Comment	51	on here is "insert", so the		
·		•					referable to unclude the		
C/ 78 SC 78.2	P 30	L 22	# 608		Suggested	dRemedy			
McClellan, Brett	Marvell				Includ	le the whole par	ragraph and use the "cha	nge" editorial instruc	tion.
51	ent Status D	Table 70.0	- the second state of the second	ΕZ	Proposed	Response	Response Status V	v	
25GBASE-T1 should appear bef baseline	ore 25GBASE-1 In	Table 78-2, per p	attern set in the		PROF	POSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.		
SuggestedRemedy					Chang	ge the text form	at and remove underline.		
change editor instruction to: Inse 78–2	rt a row for 25GBA	SE-T1 before 250	BASE-T in Table	•	C/ 78	SC 78.3	P30	L 49	# 480
	nse Status W				Zimmerm	an, George	CME C	onsulting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Marve
PROPOSED ACCEPT.					Comment		Comment Status	o 11	EZ
						• •	end of the sentence to b	e edited.	
					Suggestee	dRemedy			
					Add a	period after "A	uto-Negotiation"		
					Proposed	Response	Response Status V	v	
					i ropooou	Response		v	

Page 10 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:05 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 78 SC 78.3	P 30	L 49	# 609	CI 78	SC 78.5	P 31	L 2	# 610
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			McClellan	Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type E missing period	Comment Status D		EZ	Comment the 80		Comment Status D document uses 'link partner' n	ot 'Link Partner'	I
SuggestedRemedy change to: Auto-N	legotiation.			Suggested chang	-	to 'link partner' in every occur	rence	
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC	Response Status W			Proposed PROP	Response OSED ACCEP ⁻	Response Status W		
CI 78 SC 78.5	P 30	L 54	# 481	C/ 78	SC 78.5	P 31	L 5	# 494
Zimmerman, George	CME Consul	lting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	Huber, Th	omas	Nokia		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ	Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		L
The change made	to this paragraph is already in th	ne base standard	802.3-2022. "Case-3 of	The ch	anges indicate	d for the text of the 10th parag	graph are already	present in 802.3-2022
	ItiGBASE-T1 set is the same as Y in the MultiGBASE-T1 set is the			Suggested	lRemedy			
active." so the edi					ve the editing in aragraph.	struction to modify the 10th p	aragraph.and ass	sociated text of the
SuggestedRemedy				Proposed	0.1	Response Status W		
L1 through 7 for the	ruction "Modify the 10th paragraphe edit to the text. Retain header				OSED ACCEP	,		
L1 through 7 for the to Table	ne edit to the text. Retain header					,	L5	# 611
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response	ne edit to the text. Retain header Response Status W			PROP	OSED ACCEP	<i>.</i> Т.	L 5	# [611
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC	ne edit to the text. Retain header Response Status W EPT.	for 78.5 and edit	ing instruction and edit	PROP C/ 78	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett	т. Р 31	L 5	# [<u>611</u>
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC	ne edit to the text. Retain header Response Status W EPT.			PROP Cl 78 McClellan Comment	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E	T. P 31 Marvell		
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee	ne edit to the text. Retain header Response Status W EPT. P 31 Cisco	for 78.5 and edit	ting instruction and edit	PROP Cl 78 McClellan Comment	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of	T. P 31 Marvell Comment Status D		
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T	ne edit to the text. Retain header Response Status W SEPT. P 31 Cisco Comment Status D	L 1	ting instruction and edit # <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i>	PROP CI 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of IRemedy	T. P 31 Marvell Comment Status D		
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T	ne edit to the text. Retain header Response Status W EPT. P 31 Cisco	L 1	ting instruction and edit # <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i>	PROP CI 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of Remedy e the editor inst	T. P 31 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> D document uses 'link partner' n		
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC Cl 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T The editorial instru- However, the text	Response Status W Response Status W EEPT. P31 Cisco Comment Status D uction says "Modify the 10th parag	L 1 L 1 Lgraph of 78.5 as	ting instruction and edit # <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i> follows:"	PROP CI 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested remov Proposed	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of Remedy e the editor inst	T. P 31 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> D document uses 'link partner' n ruction and text <i>Response Status</i> W		
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC Cl 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T The editorial instru- However, the text	ne edit to the text. Retain header Response Status W EEPT. P31 Cisco Comment Status D uction says "Modify the 10th para	L 1 L 1 Lgraph of 78.5 as	ting instruction and edit # <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i> follows:"	PROP Cl 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested remov Proposed PROP	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of Remedy e the editor inst Response OSED REJECT	T. P31 Marvell Comment Status D document uses 'link partner' n ruction and text Response Status W T.	ot 'Link Partner'	
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T The editorial instru- However, the text but from the seven The tenth paragra	Response Status W Response Status W EEPT. P31 Cisco Comment Status D uction says "Modify the 10th parag	L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1	# <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i> follows:" resses MultiGBASE-T1) re final two sentences in	PROP Cl 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested remov Proposed PROP	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of Remedy e the editor inst Response OSED REJECT	T. P 31 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> D document uses 'link partner' n ruction and text <i>Response Status</i> W	ot 'Link Partner'	
L1 through 7 for th to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC Cl 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T The editorial instru- However, the text but from the seven The tenth paragra this amendment (f	Response Status W Response Status W EEPT. P31 Cisco Comment Status D Juction says "Modify the 10th para in the draft is not the tenth parag nth paragraph (which addresses of ph in the 802.3-2022 standard al	L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1 L 1	# <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i> follows:" resses MultiGBASE-T1) re final two sentences in	PROP Cl 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested remov Proposed PROP	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of Remedy e the editor inst Response OSED REJECT	T. P31 Marvell Comment Status D document uses 'link partner' n ruction and text Response Status W T.	ot 'Link Partner'	
L1 through 7 for the to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC Cl 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T The editorial instru- However, the text but from the seven The tenth paragra this amendment (fr required. SuggestedRemedy	Response Status W Response Status W EEPT. P31 Cisco Comment Status D Juction says "Modify the 10th para in the draft is not the tenth parag nth paragraph (which addresses of ph in the 802.3-2022 standard al	L1 L1 L1 Margraph of 78.5 as graph (which addr MultiGBASE-T). ready includes th 1); it seems that r	# <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i> follows:" resses MultiGBASE-T1) re final two sentences in	PROP Cl 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested remov Proposed PROP	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of Remedy e the editor inst Response OSED REJECT	T. P31 Marvell Comment Status D document uses 'link partner' n ruction and text Response Status W T.	ot 'Link Partner'	
L1 through 7 for the to Table Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC Cl 78 SC 78.5 Ran, Adee Comment Type T The editorial instru- However, the text but from the seven The tenth paragra this amendment (fr required. SuggestedRemedy	Response Status W Response Status W EEPT. P31 Cisco Comment Status D uction says "Modify the 10th para in the draft is not the tenth parag nth paragraph (which addresses is ph in the 802.3-2022 standard al they are defined for 10GBASE-T rial instruciotn and the change to Response Status W	L1 L1 L1 Margraph of 78.5 as graph (which addr MultiGBASE-T). ready includes th 1); it seems that r	# <u>519</u> <i>EZ</i> follows:" resses MultiGBASE-T1) re final two sentences in	PROP Cl 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested remov Proposed PROP	OSED ACCEP SC 78.5 Brett Type E 2.3-2022 base of Remedy e the editor inst Response OSED REJECT	T. P31 Marvell Comment Status D document uses 'link partner' n ruction and text Response Status W T.	ot 'Link Partner'	

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 78 SC 78.5 Page 11 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

C/ 78 SC 78.5	P 31	L 9	# 520	(CI 78	SC 78.5	P 3	1	L 22	# 521
Ran, Adee	Cisco			F	Ran, Adee		Cisco			
Comment Type E	Comment Status D			EZ (Comment 7		Comment Status			
"Summary of the LF not Table 78-3.	PI timing parameters for support	ed PHYs or inte	rfaces" is Table 78-4,				ble 78-3 are given with the two integer digits,			
SuggestedRemedy Change the number	r in the editorial instruction and t	he table heading	g to 78-4.				git indicates that this le			
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	Response Status W PT.				resoluti	on) with a sing	the table (in 802.3-20 le exception of 25GBA	SE-T which	has three (1	ns resolution). In all
C/ 78 SC 78.5	P 31	L 9	# 482			except 2.5GBA above 100).	SE-T1 the number of s	significant d	igits is up to 4	4 (2.5GBASE-T1 has
Zimmerman, George Comment Type E	Comment Status D	ting/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Ma	arve <i>EZ</i>	It seem resoluti		to specify and imprac	tical to mea	asure LPI timi	ng delays with a 10 ps
	raft is 78-4 in 802.3-2022			S	Suggestedl	Remedy				
SuggestedRemedy Renumber table 78-	-3 as 78-4 in both editing instruc	tion and title					s to four digits of signit bers above 10). Omit	· ·		ligits for numbers ess it is strictly required.
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	Response Status W PT.			F	Response ACCEF	РТ.	Response Status	С		
C/ 78 SC 78.5	P 31	L14	# 612		CI 78	SC 78.6	P3:		L1	# 614
McClellan, Brett	Marvell				McClellan,		Marve			
Comment Type E the 802.3-2022 base	Comment Status D e document shows this as Table	e 78-4		EZ (Comment 7 I see no		Comment Status etween this subclause	-	se 802.3-2022	<i>EZ</i> 2
SuggestedRemedy change Table 78-3 t	to Table 78-4 on lines 9 and 14			S	Suggestedl remove	-	se 78.6 if no changes a	are made to	this subclaus	se
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	Response Status W			F	Proposed F PROPC	Response DSED ACCEP1	Response Status	w		
				Ċ	CI 78	SC 78.6	P3:	2	L1	# 483
				2	Zimmerma	n, George	CME	Consulting/	APL Gp, Cisc	co, CommScope, Marve
				(Comment 7 There a	51	Comment Status to clause 78 PICS in			EZ
				S	S <i>uggestedl</i> Delete		auses (P32 L1 - P33 L	.35)		
				F	Proposed F PROPC	Response DSED ACCEP1	Response Status	W		
	uired ER/editorial required GR /dispatched A/accepted R/reje					11/unsatisfied	Z/withdrawn	C/ 78 SC 78.6		Page 12 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SC 78.6 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 78 SC 78	.6	P 32	L 1	# 522	C/ 98	SC 98.5.1	P 34	L 8	# 524
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Ran, Ade	e	Cisco		
Comment Type	E Comme	ent Status D			EZ Commen	t Type E	Comment Status D		
There is no edite	orial instruction no	or any indication o	of changes in the	text in 78.6 (PICS).			and new text is indicated with	underline. There	fore, the instruction
SuggestedRemedy							ate (see page 20).		
If there are no c	nanges to the PIC	CS, remove 78.6 f	rom the draft.			dRemedy			
Proposed Response	Respon	se Status W				0	instruction to "Change the tex	t in 98.5.1 as foll	lows".
PROPOSED AC	CEPT.					l Response	Response Status W		
				# 405	PRO	POSED ACCER	PT IN PRINCIPLE.		
CI78 SC 78	.6	P 32	L1	# 495	Remo	ove text page 3	4, lines 10-21, and change for	mat of the newly	inserted line by
Huber, Thomas	-	Nokia				ving the underli	ne.	-	-
Comment Type		ent Status D			EZ C/ 98B	SC 98B.4	P147	L 31	# 630
				places in 78.6.2.2 an pring those, the conte		n, Brett	Marvell		
is the same as 8		,	0 / 0	0 /	Commen	t Type E	Comment Status D		
SuggestedRemedy					unne	cessary line add	ded		
Remove subclar	use 78.6 (and its s	subclauses)			Suaaeste	dRemedy			
Proposed Response	Respon	se Status W			00	e extra line '-'			
PROPOSED AC	CEPT.				Proposed	l Response	Response Status W		
CI 78 SC 78	.6	P 32	L 6	# 613		POSED ACCER	1		
McClellan, Brett		Marvell			C/ 104	SC 104	P35	L 1	# 473
Comment Type	E Comme	ent Status D			EZ Zimmern	nan, George	CME Consi	ulting/API Gp Ci	sco, CommScope, Ma
multiple reference	ce to 78.5 in this s	subclause do not i	match 802.3-202	2	Commen		Comment Status A	, ang, a 2 op, or	
SuggestedRemedy						21	ectives, the project is to suppo	ort clause 104 ov	er appropriate media.
change all occu	rences of 78.5 to	78.4 in subclause	÷78.6		Claus	se 104 is not pre	esent in the draft, and the curr	rent types do not	support 25GBASE-T1
Proposed Response	Respon:	se Status W					to use the same parameters	as 10GBASE-11	
PROPOSED AC	CEPT IN PRINCI	IPLE.				dRemedy			
Subclause 78.6	was not modifed i	in P802.3cy and v	will be removed.		chan are c PSE	ge the final sent ompatible with 2 and Type F PD	104.1.3 PoDL system types t tence of the second paragraph 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, a are compatible with 2.5GBAS " (editor to put in strikeouts, t	h from "A Type F and 10GBASE-T [:] SE-T1, 5GBASE-	FPSE and Type F PD 1 PHYs." to "A Type F T1, 10GBASE-T1, and
					,	change externa	al references to Clause 104 (ir	n 1.4.473 and 1.4	.472 (if added)) to cros
					Telefe	ences.			
					Response		Response Status C		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/generalC/104Page 13 of 78COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejectedRESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawnSC 1048/22/2022 10:57:06 AMSORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC	105	P35	L1	# 381	C/ 105	SC 105.1.1	P 34	L 6	# 523
Grow, Robert		RMG Consluti	ng		Ran, Adee	e	Cisco		
this project of	currently tar	Comment Status D 7) currently specifies include geted to be Amendment 9, be nanges in P802.3/D2.2.			Suggested	ial instruction is	Comment Status D missing for 105.1.1		EZ
	xt from P80	2.3cz/D2.2. Individual comm	ents will be m	ade on items noticed.	Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
Proposed Respo PROPOSED		Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.			See c	omment #408 fo	r 105.1.1		
Align Clause	e 105 with c	hanges done in IEEE P802.3	cz D2.2		C/ 105	SC 105.1.1	P 35	L 4	# 382
Cl 105 SC Murty, Ramana Comment Type Blank page SuggestedReme Remove blan Proposed Respo	nk page.	P 39 Broadcom Comment Status D	L1	# [<u>663</u> EZ	Suggested Chang Proposed	Type E ng editorial instru dRemedy ge first paragraph Response	RMG Consluti Comment Status D Inction. In (as modified by P802.3cz/D2 Response Status W	0	EZ, 105.1.1
PROPOSED	ACCEPT.	·			See c	omment #408			
C/ 105 SC	: 105.1	P 35	L 7	# 384	C/ 105	SC 105.1.1	P 35	L 7	# 408
Marris, Arthur		Cadence Desi	gn Systems		Wienckow	/ski, Natalie	General Motor	rs	
Comment Type Missing editi	0	Comment Status D ons		EZ		51	Comment Status D IEEE Std 802.3cz removed the	e list of PHYs s	<i>EZ, 105.1.1</i> to no change is needed
SuggestedReme Add editing i not an editor	instructions	for 105.1.1 and 105.1.3. Cor	rect editing ins	truction for 105.7. It is	Suggested Delete	Remedy 105.1.1.			
Proposed Respo PROPOSED		Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.			Proposed PROF	Response POSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
See comme	nt #408 for	105.1.1							
Add editing i editorial note		for 105.1.3. Correct editing in	nstruction for 1	05.7. It is not an					

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 105 SC 105.1.1 Page 14 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC	105.1.1	P 35	L 7	# 360	C/ 105	SC 10	05.1.1	P 35	L12	# 347
Grow, Robert		RMG Conslut	ing		Brown, Mat	t		Huawei		
Comment Type	ER	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.1	Comment T	ype	ER	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.2
P802.3cz (Ar	mendment	currently specifies remova	al of the list in th	nis paragraph.	Instruct	ion is no	ot consis	tent with proper form.		
SuggestedReme	edy				SuggestedF	Remedy				
		2.3cz/D2.2 or work with P80 nat keep reappearing in Std 8		ee on a common	Figure i	nstructio	ons shou		0	
Proposed Respo	onse	Response Status W			"Replac Then ei		e 131-1 (adding stack for 25GBA	SE-T1 and addir	ng NOTE 2) as follows:"
PROPOSED	ACCEPT I	N PRINCIPLE.			"Insert r	new bull		hown:" and remove the and include whole list,		inderlined
See commer	nt #408				Proposed R			Response Status W		
C/ 105 SC	: 105.1.1	P 35	L 10	# 496		•		IN PRINCIPLE.		
Huber, Thomas Comment Type	Е	Nokia Comment Status D		EZ. 105.1.1	Change	es relativ	e to sug	gested remedy in >><<		
Missing an e				LL , 100.111	Break ir	nto two i	nstructio	ons, one for text and one	e for figure.	
SuggestedReme	•						ons shou		-	
	, uy				"Replac	e Figure	e >>105∘	<-1 (>>as modified by	2802.3cz/D3.2<<	adding stack for
00	na instructio	on to modify the first paragra	ph of 105 1 1 as	shown	25GBA	SF-T1 a	nd addir	ng NOTE 2) as follows:"	002.002/20.2	
Add an editir	•	on to modify the first paragra	ph of 105.1.1 as	s shown.	25GBA	SE-T1 a	nd addir	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren		-
Add an editir Proposed Respo	onse	on to modify the first paragra _l <i>Response Status</i> W N PRINCIPLE.	ph of 105.1.1 as	s shown.	25GBA	SE-T1 a	nd addir new bull	ng NOTE 2) as follows:"		-
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED	onse D ACCEPT I	Response Status W	ph of 105.1.1 as	s shown.	25GBA Then >>	SE-T1 a >"Insert	nd addir new bull	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren	nove the underlin	e<<
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer	onse DACCEPT I nt #408	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE.			25GBA Then >: C/ 105	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10	nd addir new bull	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P35	nove the underlin	e<<
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer Cl 105 SC	onse D ACCEPT I	Response Status W	ph of 105.1.1 as <i>L</i> 10	s shown. # <u>525</u>	25GBA Then >: C/ 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 Type ange of t	nd addir new bull 05.1.1 E the text i	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco	L 12	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.2
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer C/ 105 SC Ran, Adee	onse DACCEPT I nt #408	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35			25GBA Then >> C/ 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 ype ange of t e for read	nd addir new bull 05.1.1 E the text i ders with	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclution to the base d	L 12	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.2
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer C/ 105 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type Although it is	ACCEPT I ACCEPT I 1 105.1.1 E s preceded I	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35 Cisco	L 10	# <u>525</u> EZ, 105.1.1	25GBA Then >: Cl 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure Also, "L	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 Type ange of t e for read	nd addir new bull 05.1.1 E the text i ders with	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclu	L 12	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.2
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer C/ 105 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type	ACCEPT I ACCEPT I 1 105.1.1 E s preceded I	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35 Cisco Comment Status D	L 10	# <u>525</u> EZ, 105.1.1	25GBA Then >: Cl 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure Also, "L SuggestedF	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 ype ange of t e for read Jpdate F Remedy	nd addir new bull 95.1.1 E the text i ders with "igure 13	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclu nout going to the base d 11-1" - should be 105-1.	nove the underlin	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ, 105.1.2</i> nd makes the new text
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer Cl 105 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type Although it is keeps growir	ACCEPT I nt #408 105.1.1 E s preceded I ng.	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35 Cisco Comment Status D	L 10	# <u>525</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.1 s examples, the list	25GBA Then >: Cl 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure Also, "L SuggestedF Separat	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 ype ange of t e for read Jpdate F Remedy te into tv	nd addir new bull 5.1.1 E the text i ders with figure 13 vo instru	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclu nout going to the base d 11-1" - should be 105-1.	L 12 L 12 Ide the context ar ocument.	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ, 105.1.2</i> and makes the new text e it to Figure 105-1), the
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer Cl 105 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type Although it is keeps growir The list of Phreferenced.	ACCEPT I nt #408 105.1.1 E s preceded I ng. HYs has no	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35 Cisco Comment Status D by "such as" which suggests	L 10	# <u>525</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.1 s examples, the list	25GBA Then >: C/ 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure Also, "L SuggestedF Separat second Include	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 ype ange of t of rread Jpdate F Remedy te into tw to the te the full I	nd addir new bull 5.1.1 E the text i ders with figure 13 vo instru ext - eith	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclu nout going to the base d 11-1" - should be 105-1.	L 12 L 12 Ide the context an ocument. gure (and change n or the list of exc	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ, 105.1.2</i> and makes the new text e it to Figure 105-1), the exeptions.
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer Cl 105 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type Although it is keeps growir The list of Ph referenced. SuggestedReme	ACCEPT I nt #408 105.1.1 E s preceded I ng. HYs has no edy	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35 Cisco Comment Status D by "such as" which suggests	L 10	# <u>525</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.1 s examples, the list	25GBA Then >: Cl 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure Also, "L SuggestedF Separat second Include exceptio	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 ype ange of t e for read Jpdate F Remedy te into tv to the te the full I ons".	nd addir new bull 95.1.1 E the text i ders with figure 13 vo instru ext - eith list of ex	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclu nout going to the base d 11-1" - should be 105-1. ctions, the first for the fi er the second paragraph ceptions or use "insert a	L 12 L 12 Ide the context an ocument. gure (and change n or the list of exc	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ, 105.1.2</i> and makes the new text e it to Figure 105-1), the ceptions.
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer Cl 105 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type Although it is keeps growir The list of Phreferenced. SuggestedReme Delete the lis Proposed Respo	ACCEPT I ACCEPT I ant #408 105.1.1 E s preceded I ng. HYs has no edy st of PHYs a onse	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35 Cisco Comment Status D by "such as" which suggests merit here. Table 105–1 cor and refer to Table 105–1 inst Response Status W	L 10	# <u>525</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.1 s examples, the list	25GBA Then >: C/ 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure Also, "L SuggestedF Separat second Include exceptio Proposed R	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 ype ange of t ange of t ange of t of read Jpdate F Remedy te into tw to the te the full I ons". Response	nd addir new bull 5.1.1 E the text i ders with rigure 13 vo instru ext - eith list of ex	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclu nout going to the base d 11-1" - should be 105-1. ctions, the first for the fi er the second paragraph	L 12 L 12 Ide the context an ocument. gure (and change n or the list of exc	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ, 105.1.2</i> and makes the new text e it to Figure 105-1), the exeptions.
Add an editir Proposed Respo PROPOSED See commer Cl 105 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type Although it is keeps growir The list of Phreferenced. SuggestedReme Delete the lis Proposed Respo	ACCEPT I ACCEPT I ant #408 105.1.1 E s preceded I ng. HYs has no edy st of PHYs a onse	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. P35 Cisco Comment Status D by "such as" which suggests merit here. Table 105–1 cor	L 10	# <u>525</u> <i>EZ</i> , 105.1.1 s examples, the list	25GBA Then >: Cl 105 Ran, Adee Comment T The cha obscure Also, "L SuggestedF Separat second Include exceptio Proposed R PROPC	SE-T1 a >"Insert SC 10 ype ange of t ange of t ange of t of read Jpdate F Remedy te into tw to the te the full I ons". Response	nd addir new bull 5.1.1 E the text i ders with rigure 13 vo instru ext - eith list of ex e CCEPT I	ng NOTE 2) as follows:" et e as shown:" and ren P 35 Cisco Comment Status D n 105.1.2 does not inclu nout going to the base d 11-1" - should be 105-1. ctions, the first for the fi er the second paragraph ceptions or use "insert a Response Status W	L 12 L 12 Ide the context an ocument. gure (and change n or the list of exc	e<< # <u>526</u> <i>EZ, 105.1.2</i> and makes the new text e it to Figure 105-1), the exeptions.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 105 SC 105.1.1 Page 15 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

05.1.2	P 35	L11	# 361	C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P 35	L12	# 409
	RMG Conslutin	g		Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motors		
ER	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.2	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.2
				Change to an editorial	nstruction for Figure 131-1 only	and refer to	o IEEE Std 802.3cz.
point at ap	propriate documents (e.g.,	P802.3cz) and u	ise correct editing	SuggestedRemedy			
,							
				,	, 6 ,	which add	
		2) with the below	which adds a	, ,	,		
				Can an ent #2.47			
	,			See comment #347			
#317				C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P 35	L 16	# 411
				Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motors		
05.1.2	P 35	L12	# 357	Comment Type E	Comment Status D	_ .	EZ, 105.1.2
		ies			e text and put the text before the	e Figure.	
_			EZ, 105.1.2	SuggestedRemedy			
instruction:				Change 105.1.2 adding _e) The MDI as specifi Proposed Response	a new bullet e) as shown below ed in Clause165 for 25GBASE-T <i>Response Status</i> W		ingle-lane data path
e F	esponse Status W			See comment #347			
CCEPT IN I	PRINCIPLE.				0	1	"
#347						L 27	# 362
05 4 0	Dar	140	# 407		-		
U 5.1.2	P 35 Nokia	L 12	# 497				EZ, 25GBASE-T1 PCS
E	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.2	SuggestedRemedy			
truction refe	rs to figure 131-1 instead o	of 105-1		25GBASE-T1 PCS			
				Duanasa d Daamanaa	Response Status W		
,				Proposed Response	Response Status W		
				PROPOSED ACCEPT	1		
	ction should point at app instruction b re 105-1 (as for 25GBAS se R CCEPT IN F #347 05.1.2 E (onstructions for g instructions for g instructions for CCEPT IN F Se R CCEPT IN F #347 05.1.2	RMG Conslutin ER Comment Status D ction should follow the subclause title lip point at appropriate documents (e.g., ///////////////////////////////////	RMG Consluting ER Comment Status D ction should follow the subclause title line. Editorial insometiat appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and u.g. A instruction below subclause title. Instruction at this locate 105-1 (as modified by P802.3cz/D3.2) with the below for 25GBASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2." W Se Response Status W CCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. #347 05.1.2 P 35 L 12 Dell Technologies E Comment Status D nstructions for 105.1.2 it indicates that Figure 131-1 is the figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding stack for 25GBASE T1 anding stack for 25GBASE T1 anding stack for 25G	Image: Provide the status of the subclause title line. Editorial instruction should be point at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing opint at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing of the subclause title. Instruction at this location should be the subclause title. Instruction at this location should be the subclause title instructions status W . See Response Status W . OS1.2 P35 L12 # 357 Dell Technologies EZ, 105.1.2 Fe Comment Status D EZ, 105.1.2 Instructions for 105.1.2 it indicates that Figure 131-1 is being modified. P35 L12 # 347 See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See Response Status W . See	RMG ConslutingWienckowski, NatalieERComment Status DEZ, 105.1.2ction should follow the subclause title line. Editorial instruction should be point at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editing /Wienckowski, Natalie//Comment Type EChange to an editorial in SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing edit by IEEE Std 802.3cz/23//Instruction below subclause title. Instruction at this location should be re 105-1 (as modified by P802.3cz/D3.2) with the below which adds a for 25GBASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2."Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPTseeResponse Status W CCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.See comment #34705.1.2P35L 12# 357Dell TechnologiesEZ, 105.1.2Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial note for th SuggestedRemedy x_means underline ">g instructions for 105.1.2 it indicates that Figure 131-1 is being modified. / g instructions to read: "Change 105.1.2 adding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown	RMG ConslutingWienckowski, NatalieGeneral MotorsERComment Status DEZ, 105.1.2Comment TypeEComment Status DChange to an editorial instruction for Figure 131-1 onlyy point at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3cz) and use correct editingVienckowski, NatalieGeneral Motorsyinstruction below subclause title. Instruction at this location should be to 25GBASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2.*Delet the existing editorial note and add the following: by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202x) with the figure found below, PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.#347EComment Status DSC 105.1.2P35bell TechnologiesEZ, 105.1.2P35L12# 357bell TechnologiesEZ, 105.1.2P35Vienckowski, NatalieGeneral Motorsyreasponse Status WSee comment #347Cl 105SC 105.1.2P35yinstructions for 105.1.2 it indicates that Figure 131-1 is being modified. figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 adding stack for 25GBASE T1 and adding NOTE 2 as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1 2 diding a new bullet e as shown Figure	RMG Consluting Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors ER Comment Status D EZ, 105.1.2 ction should follow the subclause title line. Editorial instruction should be point at appropriate documents (e.g., P802.3c2) and use correct editing Comment Type E Comment Type E Comment Type E Comment Status D instruction below subclause title. Instruction at this location should be to 105 (as modified by P802.3c2/D3.2) with the below which adds a for 25GBASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2." Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #347 65.1.2 P 35 L 12 # 357 Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 P 35 L 16 visitructions for 105.1.2 it indicates that Figure 131-1 is being modified. Vienckowski, Natalie General Motors visitructions for 105.1.2 it indicates that Figure 131-1 is being modified. Vienckowski, Natalie General Motors visitructions to read: "Change 105.1.2 adding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1.2 adding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1.2 adding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1.2 adding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1.2 adding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1.2 adding a new bullet e as shown Figure 105-1.2 P 35 L 12 Yies Comment #347 CCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #347 Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 P 35 L 27

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 105 SC 105.1.2 Page 16 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P 35	L 27	# 615	C/ 105 SC 105.	1.2 P 35	L37	# 453
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			D'Ambrosia, John	Future	wei, US Subsidiary of	Huawei
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ, 25GBASE-T1 PCS	Comment Type TR	Comment Status	A	
the PCS in the 25GBA SuggestedRemedy insert '25GBASE-T1' b Proposed Response	SE-T1 stack should be identi efore PCS <i>Response Status</i> W	ified similar to th	e pre-existing stacks	noticed additionall sublayer under the seem to indicate the	mented the stacks in Figs 7 y that these diagrams treat e PCS, while in 165-1 it is on hat FEC is a TX PCS functi s is somewhat difficult to fig	FEC differently. In 10 ombined with the PCS on and there is no suc	05-1 FEC is in a S. Clause 165.3.2.2.2
PROPOSED ACCEPT	,			SuggestedRemedy			
See comment #452				25GBASE-T1 PCS	s understanding the draft co S/FEC/PMA. As noted prev d to match the stack in Fig	iously, the stack of 25	
C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P 35	L 27	# 456	Response	Response Status	N	
He, Xiang	Huawei			ACCEPT IN PRIN	CIPLE.		
Comment Type E (Figure 105-1) For 250	Comment Status D GBASE-T1, FEC is part of PC	CS functions, so	<i>EZ, 25GBASE-T1 PCS</i> it is better not to list	Figure 105-1 will b	e modified to match the sta	ack in Figure 165-1.	
FEC as a separate sul two examples.	player in this figure. Please re	efer to 25GBASE	E-T or 10GBASE-T1 as	C/ 105 SC 105.	1.2 P35	L37	# 452
SuggestedRemedy				D'Ambrosia, John	Future	wei, US Subsidiary of	Huawei
•• •	e the "PCS" box as "25GBAS e the FEC box.	SE-T1 PCS" (pre	ferred) or "64B/65B RS-	Comment Type TR The stack for 25G	Comment Status I BASE-T1 in Fig 105-1does		EZ shown in Fig 165-1.
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			SuggestedRemedy Modify the stack o	f 25GBASE-T1 in Fig 105-1	I to match the stack ir	n Fig 165-1.
See comment #362 +	remove the FEC box			Proposed Response	Response Status N EPT IN PRINCIPLE.	N	
Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 McClellan, Brett	P 35 Marvell	L 28	# 616		EPT IN PRINCIPLE.	o match Figure 165-1	
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ	C/ 105 SC 105.	1.2 P35	L 45	# 363
••	SE-T1 stack is not a separate	e entity from the	PCS	Grow, Robert		Consluting	
SuggestedRemedy delete 'FEC' and inser	'RS-FEC' before PCS			Comment Type ER		-	EZ, Figure 105-1
Proposed Response	Response Status W			SuggestedRemedy			
PROPOSED ACCEPT See comment #452	IN PRINCIPLE.			Use Figure 105-1 could be inserted	from P802.3cz/D2.2 as bas to the left of the BASE-AU s	stack. Stack widths w	
3ee comment #432				Proposed Response	nmodate 4 different stacks.		
				FIDDUSEU RESDONSE	Response Status	<i>AN</i>	

Page 17 of 78

8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn C/ 105 SC 105.1.2 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Proposed Responses	i IEEE	P802.3cy D2	2.0 10G+ Auto Task Fo	rce Initial Working Grou	p ballot comments		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P35	L 45	# 410	C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P35	L 50	# 617
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	s		McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type T Need to change Figure	Comment Status D 105-1 to also include 25GBA	SE-AU.	EZ, Figure 105-1	Comment Type E this subclause is miss	Comment Status D sing editor's instructions for sub	blclause 105.1.3	<i>EZ, 105.1.3</i> and Table 105-1
SuggestedRemedy	nclude 4 PHYS, similar to 12		25GBASE-AU stack	SuggestedRemedy add editor's instruction Proposed Response	n as needed Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				PROPOSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P 35	L 47	# 364	See comment #365			
Grow, Robert	RMG Consluti	าต		C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 35	L 51	# 412
Comment Type ER	Comment Status D	-9	EZ, 105.1.2	Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	rs	
Insert second editorial in			<u> </u>	Comment Type E Add editorial instruction	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.3
SuggestedRemedy Insert new item at botto				SuggestedRemedy	aph for 25GBASE-T1 after the	new paragraph	inserted by IEEE Std
Proposed Response	Response Status W			802.3cz-202x.		non paragraph	
PROPOSED ACCEPT I	N PRINCIPLE.			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W		
See comment #347	P 35	L13	# 358	See comment #365			
Lewis, Jon	P 33 Dell Technolog		# 330				
Comment Type E	Comment Status D	JIES	EZ, 105.1.3	C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 35	L 51	# 413
	needed for Table 105-1?		LZ, 100.1.3	Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	rs	
SuggestedRemedy				Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.3
Please add the appropri	iate editing instructions			SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status W			,	ragraph on 25GBASE-T.		
PROPOSED ACCEPT I	N PRINCIPLE.			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
See comment #365				PROPOSED ACCEP	,		
				See comment #365			

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Page 18 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 35	L 51	# 365	C/ 105	SC 105.1.3	P 36	L6	# 484
Grow, Robert	RMG Conslut	ing		Zimmerma	n, George	CME C	onsulting/APL Gp, 0	Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Type ER	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.3	Comment T	Гуре Е	Comment Status	D	EZ, 105.1.
Missing editorial instru 105.1.3.	ction. Unchanged text is incl	uded in draft wit	hout including alll of		s no correspor 3 is not shown.	iding editing instruction	for this edit to 105.1	.3 and the full text of
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
	2 through page 36, line 4. Ed are paragraph inserted by P80		"Insert new third	Insert r	new fourth para	n at P35 L49 (by header graph to 105.1.3 as sho	ýwn:	
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			Remov Replac	e underline fro e "Physical La	ragraph beginning "25G m new paragraph at P3 yer devices at 25Gb/s	6 L6 - P36 L10 " on P36 L11 with ne	ew editing instruction,
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 35	L 52	# 527			d of Table 105-1 as show		s not shown)
Ran, Adee	Cisco	-02		Proposed F	•	Response Status	N	
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.1.3	PROP	OSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.		
Editorial instruction is i		ne in the base st	,		mment #365			
SuggestedRemedy				C/ 105	SC 105.1.3	P 36	L 6	# 414
,	ction and bring in the missing	two paragraphs	5.	Wienckows Comment	,	Genera Comment Status	al Motors D	E
Alternatively, use "Inse	ert the following paragraph aft	er the third para	graph of 105.1.3".	Underli	ne is not need	ed with an "insert" instru	iction.	
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Suggested	Remedy			
PROPOSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			Remov	e underlining f	rom new text.		
See comment #365				Proposed F PROP	Response DSED ACCEP	Response Status N	N	
				C/ 105	SC 105.1.3	P36	L 7	# 528
				Ran, Adee		Cisco		
				Comment T "for tra		Comment Status A		
				The pre	eceding paragr	aph for 25GBASE-T has	s "for data communi	cation at 25 Gb/s" instead.
				Suggested Use "fo	-	nication at 25 Gb/s" as i	n the previous parac	graph.
				Response		Response Status		
				ACCEF	РТ.			

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Page 19 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 36	L 9	# 618	C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P36	L13	# 415
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
Comment Type E description should conf	Comment Status D orm to existing baseline text		EZ	Comment Type E Add editorial instructio	Comment Status D		EZ, Table 105-1
SuggestedRemedy change 'Physical Codin Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	g Sublayers' to 'physical cod Response Status W	ing sublayer'		modified by IEEE Std	BASE-T1 before the row for 802.3cz-202x) as follows (un ow, a row needs to be added <i>Response Status</i> W	changed rows no	ot shown):
Line number was fixed.				PROPOSED ACCEPT			
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Grow, Robert	P 36 RMG Conslut	L 12	# 366	C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Zimmerman, George	P36	L 21	# 485 sco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Type ER Missing editorial instruct	Comment Status D		EZ, Table 105-1	Comment Type E	Comment Status D on on description will make t	0 17	EZ
SuggestedRemedy Insert new row into Tab	le 105-1 for 25GBASE-T1 af	er 25GBASE-T:		SuggestedRemedy suppress hyphenation	on "single balanced pair of c	onductors"	
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
See comment #415				C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 36	L 50	# 498
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 36	L 13	# 529	Huber, Thomas	Nokia		
Ran, Adee <i>Comment Type</i> E	Cisco Comment Status D		EZ, Table 105-1	Comment Type E Missing an editing inst	Comment Status D ruction		EZ, Table 105-1
Editorial instruction is m	nissing for Table 105-1.			SuggestedRemedy	ion to insert a new paragraph	after the 3rd pa	ragraph as shown and
SuggestedRemedy Add an appropriate inst	ruction			modify Table 105-1 as		raiter the old pa	lagraph as shown and
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
See comment #415				See comment #415			

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

P 37	L1	# 619	C/ 105 SC 105.2	P 37	L 2	# 416
Marvell			Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	rs	
	Iclause 105.2 and	<i>EZ, Table 105-2</i> Table 105-2	Comment Type E Add editorial instruction	Comment Status D		EZ, Table 105-2
			SuggestedRemedy			
eded						
					by IEEE Std 8	02.3cz-202x) as follows
INCIPLE.			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
			PROPOSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.		
P 37	L1	# 499	See comment #367			
Nokia			C/ 105 SC 105.2	P37	L 2	# 417
		EZ, Table 105-2	Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	rs	
to modify Table 105-2			Comment Type E	Comment Status D		E
			Need to have merged	rows before and after new row	that is in the m	hiddle of the table.
nsert a new row at the	end of Table 105-2	as shown.	SuagestedRemedv			
			Change the row befor	5		es. Add a row after
			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W		
P 37	L 2	# 367		D 97	12	# 520
RMG Consluti	ng				L 3	# 530
mment Status D		EZ, Table 105-2	,			
						EZ, Table 105-2
				missing for Table 105-2.		
			SuggestedRemedy Add an appropriate in:	struction.		
ise 114 and clause 166						
ise 114 and clause 166 ponse Status W			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	,		
	Marvell mment Status D for's instructions for sub- eded sponse Status W INCIPLE. P37 Nokia mment Status D to modify Table 105-2 nsert a new row at the of sponse Status W INCIPLE. P37 RMG Consluti mment Status D	Marvell mment Status D tor's instructions for subIclause 105.2 and eded sponse Status W INCIPLE. P37 L1 Nokia mment Status D to modify Table 105-2 Insert a new row at the end of Table 105-2 sponse Status W INCIPLE. P37 L2 RMG Consluting mment Status D	Marvell mment Status \mathbf{D} EZ, Table 105-2 tor's instructions for sublclause 105.2 and Table 105-2 eded sponse Status \mathbf{W} INCIPLE. $\begin{array}{c} P37 & L1 & \# 499 \\ Nokia \\ mment Status \mathbf{D} & EZ, Table 105-2 \\ to modify Table 105-2 \\ msert a new row at the end of Table 105-2 as shown. \\ sponse Status \mathbf{W} \\ INCIPLE. \\ \hline P37 & L2 & \# 367 \\ \hline RMG Consluting \\ \end{array}$	MarvellWienckowski, Nataliemment Status \mathbf{D} EZ, Table 105-2adedsponse Status \mathbf{W} Insert a row for for 250columns for Clause 98(unchanged rows not sponse Status \mathbf{W} INCIPLE.P37L1# 499NokiaEZ, Table 105-2See comment #367NokiaEZ, Table 105-2Cl 105SC 105.2mment Status \mathbf{D} EZ, Table 105-2Wienckowski, NatalieNokiaComment Type \mathbf{E} Nether the sponsensert a new row at the end of Table 105-2 as shown.SuggestedRemedyChange the row befor25GBASE-T1 that is rProposed ResponsePROPOSED ACCEPP37L2# 367Cl 105SC 105.2RMG ConslutingEZ, Table 105-2Ran, AdeeComment Type \mathbf{E} Ran, AdeeComment Type \mathbf{E} Editorial instruction isCl 105SC 105.2Ran, AdeeComment Type \mathbf{E} Comment Status \mathbf{D} EZ, Table 105-2Ran, AdeeRoment Status \mathbf{D} EZ, Table 105-2Ran, AdeeComment Type \mathbf{E} Editorial instruction isRoment Status \mathbf{D} EZ, Table 105-2Ran, AdeeRoment Status \mathbf{D} EZ, Table 105-2Ran, AdeeRan, AdeeRan, AdeeRan, AdeeRan, AdeeRoment Roman Status \mathbf{D} Ran, AdeeRan, AdeeRoment Roman StatusRan, AdeeRan, AdeeRan, AdeeRoment Roman StatusRan, Adee	Marvell Wienckowski, Natalie General Moto mment Status D EZ, Table 105-2 Add editorial instruction. beded SuggestedRemedy Insert a row for for 25GBASE-T1 before the row for 2 columns for Clause 98 and Clause 165 (as modified (unchanged rows not shown): INCIPLE. P37 L1 # 499 Nokia D EZ, Table 105-2 Nokia D EZ, Table 105-2 Nokia C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 Vienckowski, Natalie General Moto Comment Type E Comment 367 C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 Wienckowski, Natalie General Moto Comment Type E Comment Status D INCIPLE. EZ, Table 105-2 See comment #367 Vienckowski, Natalie General Moto Comment Type INCIPLE. Yea Comment Type P37 L2 # 367 INCIPLE. See consument #367 C/ 105 P37 L2 # 367 RMG Consluting EZ, Table 105-2 P37 Ran, Adee Cisco Comment Type <td< td=""><td>Marvell Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors mment Status D EZ, Table 105-2 or's instructions for sublclause 105.2 and Table 105-2 Ad editorial instruction. seded gonse Status W INCIPLE. Nokia See comment #367 P37 L1 499 Nokia D EZ, Table 105-2 Nokia D EZ, Table 105-2 io modify Table 105-2 Cl 105 SC 105.2 Noponse Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #367 Cl 105 SC 105.2 Vienckowski, Natalie General Motors Comment Type E Comment Status M PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #367 Vienckowski, Natalie General Motors Comment Type INCIPLE. Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors INCIPLE. P37 L2 #367 INCIPLE. See Comment #367 Cl 105 SC 105.2 P37 L3 RMG Consluting M PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 105 SC 105.2 P37 L3 <t< td=""></t<></td></td<>	Marvell Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors mment Status D EZ, Table 105-2 or's instructions for sublclause 105.2 and Table 105-2 Ad editorial instruction. seded gonse Status W INCIPLE. Nokia See comment #367 P37 L1 499 Nokia D EZ, Table 105-2 Nokia D EZ, Table 105-2 io modify Table 105-2 Cl 105 SC 105.2 Noponse Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #367 Cl 105 SC 105.2 Vienckowski, Natalie General Motors Comment Type E Comment Status M PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #367 Vienckowski, Natalie General Motors Comment Type INCIPLE. Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors INCIPLE. P37 L2 #367 INCIPLE. See Comment #367 Cl 105 SC 105.2 P37 L3 RMG Consluting M PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 105 SC 105.2 P37 L3 <t< td=""></t<>

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.2	P 37	L3	# 487	C/ 105	SC 105.2	P3	7 L6	# 451
Zimmerman, George	CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Marve	D'Ambrosi	a, John	Futur	ewei, US Subsidi	ary of Huawei
				Clause Clause	105-2 appears 78 EEE option 106 mandator	Comment Status incomplete - nal support not indicate y use of RS and 25GM is PMD, not PCS / PM	ed /II not indicated	Table 105-2
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	IRemedy			
immediately below ro PCS/PMA at the righ Add underline to Nor	n, "Change Table 105-2 addir ow for 25GBASE-T, and adding t hand side as shown (unchan nenclature entry for "25GBASE lowing new row for 25GBASE	g new column fo ged rows not sh E-T1"	or 25GBASE-T1	Clause Clause	e 78 EEE - Opti e 106 - Mandato		0	
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Response		Response Status	w	
PROPOSED ACCEP	PT IN PRINCIPLE.			ACCE	PT IN PRINCIF	•		
See comment #367 C/ 105 SC 105.2	P 37	L 6	# 348	Clause Clause	GBASE-T1 ent 9 78 EEE - Opti 9 106 RS - Man 9 106 25GMII -	datory	the following:	
Brown, Matt Comment Type E Table too wide.	Huawei Comment Status D		EZ	Chang	e title of 165 co	· olumn to "25GBASE-T		"
SuggestedRemedy Reduce table with by Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF	adjust column widths. Response Status W			C/ 105 Ran, Adee Comment In Tab		P3 Cisco Comment Status)	# <u>531</u> Table 105-2
The Editor will attem	pt to reduce the size of the tab wo, separating fiber and coppe		not work, the Editor will			e 165 should be labele ed "O", RS and 25GMI		
C/ 105 SC 105.2 Grow, Robert	P 37 RMG Conslu	L 6 uting	# 368	Severa active		s are included in this d	raft and the head	ing numbers should be made
	Comment Status D e table from P802.3cz should I	be used as base	EZ 9.	The co Suggested		narrowed to make the	table fit within the	margins.
SuggestedRemedy Include clause 166 c	olumn from P802.3cz/D2.2.			_	mment	Deserves Office	•	
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF	Response Status W			Response ACCE	PT IN PRINCIF	Response Status PLE.	L	
				See co	omment #451			
	ired ER/editorial required GR		ed T/technical E/editorial G/g NSE STATUS: O/open W/wr			7/with drawn	C/ 105 SC 105.2	Page 22 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SC 105.2 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 105	SC 105.2	P37	L11	# 462	C/ 105 SC 105.2	P 37	L 20	# 620
Lusted, Ken	nt	Intel Corporat	ion		McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Ty Table 10 PMD". that PMI 44-1 in I pair PM	ype TR 05-2 entry "250 This name is m D is not used a IEEE Std 802.3 A" which is inco Remedy the column titl	Comment Status A GBASE-T1" has a column for (hisleading because Clause 165 3-2022 (page 1716) provides a onsistent with the existing text e from "25GBASE-T1 PMD" to Response Status W P37	Clause 165 den 5 contains a PC on page 40. Fu a column name in 3cy D2.0 Ta	CS and a PMA. Note arthermore, the Table of "RS-FE PCS and 1- ble 105-2.	Comment Type TR missing EEE, RS, 2 SuggestedRemedy insert 'O' in the EEI Response ACCEPT. Cl 105 SC 105.2 Lusted, Kent Comment Type TR	Comment Status A 25GMII in table E column, 'M' in RS, and 'O' in 2 Response Status C P37 Intel Corpor Comment Status A	L 20 ation	Table 105-2 # <u>463</u> Table 105-2
SuggestedR change	ype E SE-T1 has a P0 Remedy	Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> A CS/PMA not a PMD PMA in the 165 column		Table 105-2	should be an optior referenced in Cl 16 SuggestedRemedy	25GBASE-T1" does not include hal implemenation for the Physic 5.1.2 (p40, line 37) te box for 25GMII with "O" for O <i>Response Status</i> W	cal Layer type. N	
Response ACCEP [.]	T IN PRINCIPI	Response Status C _E.			C/ 105 SC 105.2	P37	L 20	# 461
See con	nment #451				Lusted, Kent	Intel Corpor		
Cl 105 Zimmerman Comment Ty "25GBA	ype T	P 37 CME Consulti <i>Comment Status</i> A 25GBASE-T1 is a PCS/PMA		# 486 sco, CommScope, Marve <i>Table 105-2</i>	RS. The RS is nec parallel format of th SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status A 25GBASE-T1" does not include essary because the RS adapts the PCS service interface.	the bit serial prot	
SuggestedR Change		PMD" to "25GBASE-T1 PCS	/PMA"		Response	Response Status W	atory	
Response ACCEP	т.	Response Status C			ACCEPT.			

C/ 105 SC 105.2 Page 23 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.3	P37	L 24	# 454		C/ 105	SC 105.3		P37	L 26	# 349	
D'Ambrosia, John	Futurewei, US	Subsidiary of H	uawei		Brown, Mat	t		Huawei			
Comment Type ER Subclauses 105.3.1 thr	Comment Status D ough 105.3.5 are listed with	no changes. Is t	his the intent?	EZ	Comment 7 No cha		Comment 3 3.1 through 105.3				EZ
SuggestedRemedy Delete subclauses 105	.3.1 through 105.3.5				Suggestedl Delete		r 105.3.1 through '	105.3.5.			
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.				Proposed F PROPC	'	Response S EPT IN PRINCIPLI				
See comment #625 and	d #626. Delete 105.3.1 and 1	05.3.5.			See co	mment #625	5 and #626. Delete	e 105.3.1 and 1	105.3.5.		
C/ 105 SC 105.3	P37	L 25	# 532		C/ 105	SC 105.3	,	P 37	L 26	# 488	
Ran, Adee Comment Type E Why are all the subclau	Cisco Comment Status D ise headings listed?			ΕZ	Zimmerma Comment 1 Header	ype E	Comment S 1 through 105.3.5	Status D		co, CommScope, N	Marve <i>EZ</i>
The new inserted text s SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnecessa	hould not be underlined. ary ones before 105.3.6				Proposed F	headers 105 Response	5.3.1 through 105.3 <i>Response S</i> EPT IN PRINCIPLI	Status W	aight to 105.3.6.		
Remove the underline f Proposed Response	ormat. Response Status W				See co	mment #625	5 and #626. Delete	e 105.3.1 and 1	105.3.5.		
PROPOSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.				C/ 105	SC 105.3		P37	L 26	# 622	
See comment #625 and	d #626. Delete 105.3.1 and 1	05.3.5.			McClellan,			Marvell			
C/ 105 SC 105.3	P 37	L 26	# 385		<i>Comment 1</i> it isn't r		Comment Solution hea		.1 through 105.3	.5	ΕZ
Marris, Arthur Comment Type E	Cadence Des Comment Status D	ign Systems		ΕZ	Suggestedl delete	-	lers for 105.3.1 th	ough 105.3.5			
Unneeded subiciause h SuggestedRemedy Delete 105.3.1 to 105.3	Ū				Proposed F PROPC		Response S EPT IN PRINCIPLI				
Proposed Response	Response Status W				See co	mment #625	5 and #626. Delete	e 105.3.1 and 1	105.3.5.		

C/ 105 SC 105.3

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.3 P37 L 40 # 623	Cl 105 SC 105.3.4 P37 L33 # 626	
AcClellan, Brett Marvell	McClellan, Brett Marvell	
Comment Type ER Comment Status A	Comment Type E Comment Status A	
this text is unnecessary and redundant	add a description of the 10GBASE-T1 PMA	
SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy	
delete 'Clause 98 Auto-Negotiation may be used by 25GBASE-T1 PHYs. Auto-Negotiation is performed upon link startup through the use of half-duplex differential Manchester encoding.'	insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PMA specified in Clause 165. TThe PMA provid full duplex communications over a single balanced pair of conductors." add editor instructions as needed	es for
Response Response Status C	Response Response Status C	
ACCEPT.	ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	
C/ 105 SC 105.3.2 P 37 L 28 # 625 McClellan, Brett Marvell	Changes per text with change of "Tthe" to "The". Use the following editorial note: "In new paragraph at the end of 105.3.4 as follows:"	sert a
Comment Type E Comment Status A	Page line was adjusted.	
add a description of the 10GBASE-T1 PCS	C/ 105 SC 105.3.6 P37 L40 # 350	
	Brown, Matt Huawei	
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and	Brown, Matt Huawei <i>Comment Type</i> ER <i>Comment Status</i> D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required.	EZ
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding	Comment Type ER Comment Status D	Eź
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required.	EZ
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy Remove underline.	EZ
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy Remove underline.	Eź
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed Response Response Status C	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy Remove underline. Proposed Response Response Status W	EZ
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS-FEC code blocks and PAM4	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Remove underline. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 105 SC 105.3.6 P 37 L 40 # 489	
performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS-FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Remove underline. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. CI 105 SC 105.3.6 P 37 L 40 # 489	
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed <i>Response Response Status</i> C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS-FEC code blocks and PAM4	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy Remove underline. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 105 SC 105.3.6 P 37 L 40 # [489] Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScop	e, Marve Ez clause cond
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Resp</i>	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy Remove underline. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 105 SC 105.3.6 P 37 L 40 # [489] Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScop Comment Type E Comment Status D Style of text about 25GBASE-T1 does not fit the style of the surrounding text in this (note that clause 126 where 802.3ch edited had a very different style). Also, the set statement "is optional" is unnecessary, as the text already says AN "may be used".	e, Marve Ez clause cond
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed <i>Response</i> <i>Response Status</i> C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS-FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII."	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy Remove underline. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 105 SC 105.3.6 P 37 L 40 # 489 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScop Comment Type E Comment Status D Style of text about 25GBASE-T1 does not fit the style of the surrounding text in this (note that clause 126 where 802.3ch edited had a very different style). Also, the sec statement "is optional" is unnecessary, as the text already says AN "may be used". text can be rephrased in the same style as the rest of the clause and much simpler.	e, Marve Ez clause cond The
insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS_FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII." add editor instructions as needed <i>Response</i> <i>Response</i> <i>Response Status</i> C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert "25GBASE-T1 PHYs use the PCS specified in Clause 165. The 25GBASE-T1 PCS performs encoding of data from the 25GMII to 64B/65B RS-FEC code blocks and PAM4 modulation and transfers the symbols to the PMA and performs error correction and decoding of PAM4 symbols from the PMA and transfers the decoded data to the 25GMII."	Comment Type ER Comment Status D When using "insert" instruction, no underline required. SuggestedRemedy Remove underline. Remove underline. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. P37 L40 # [489] Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScop Comment Type E Comment Status D Style of text about 25GBASE-T1 does not fit the style of the surrounding text in this (note that clause 126 where 802.3ch edited had a very different style). Also, the set statement "is optional" is unnecessary, as the text already says AN "may be used". text can be rephrased in the same style as the rest of the clause and much simpler. SuggestedRemedy Change editing instruction to "Insert new paragraph at the end of 105.3.6 as follows Replace 2 paragraph edit at P37 L40-43 with:	e, Marve Ez clause cond The

Page 25 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	D 27	1 45	# 004		SC 405 5	D 27	1 40	# 400
C/ 105 SC 105.5	P 37	L 45	# 624	C/ 105	SC 105.5	P37	L 49	# <u>490</u>
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			Zimmerma	, 0		ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve
Comment Type E this subclause is miss SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status D sing editor's instructions for su	blclause 105.5 a	<i>EZ, Table 105-3</i> nd Table 105-3	Comment Editing have re		Comment Status D ncorrect, position of edit need he edit.	s to be after 25G	<i>EZ, Table 105-</i> BASE-T, which would
add editor's instruction	n as needed			Suggested	Remedy			
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W			insertir rows n	ng new rows for ot shown):"	ite: Change 105.7 as shown be r 25GBASE-T1 after rows for 2 changed row in the table.		
See comment #370				Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
C/ 105 SC 105.5	P 37	L 46	# 351	PROP	OSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.		
Brown, Matt	Huawei			See co	omment #370			
Comment Type ER Editorial instruction co	Comment Status D omplete wrong. This is not and	d editorial note.	EZ, Table 105-3	C/ 105	SC 105.5	P37	L 49	# 370
SuggestedRemedy	1 0			Grow, Rob	ert	RMG Conslu	ıting	
	"Insert new row at the end of	Table 105-3 as f	allows "	Comment	Type ER	Comment Status D		EZ, Table 105
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W			I am n	ow calling "illun	uction for 105.5. I think this ta ninati sort order", though there sert after 25GBASE-T as far a	e appear to be so	me violations of that
See comment #370				Suggested Insert	,	105-3 for 25GBASE-T1 after 2	25GBASE-T.	
C/ 105 SC 105.5 Grow, Robert	P 37 RMG Conslu	L 49 ting	# 371	Proposed PROP	Response OSED ACCEP	Response Status W		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D ial note should be deleted as v	well as the BICS	EZ	C/ 105	SC 105.5	P37	L 49	# 418
			Subciause.	Wienckow	ski, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
SuggestedRemedy Delete note and subcl	ause 105.7 from the draft.			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		EZ, Table 105-
Proposed Response	Response Status W				al insturction is	not correct.		
PROPOSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.			Suggested			(
There is a tracked cha	ange on page/line 38/22. Move	e editorial instruc	tion to proper location.		105-3 (as modi	Editorial Note with: Insert a new fied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202		
				Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
				PROP	OSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.		
				See co	omment #370			

Page 26 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 S	SC 105.5	P 37	L 49	# 533	C/ 105 SC 105	5.5 P38	L1	# 359
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Lewis, Jon	Dell Teo	chnologies	
Comment Typ	be E	Comment Status D		EZ, Table 105-3	Comment Type E	Comment Status)	EZ, Table 105-
The editor	rial note seem	ns to be an instruction, and to	point to the wro	ng place.	Are editing instru	ctions needed for Table 105-	3?	
SuggestedRei	medy				SuggestedRemedy			
Change "E below".	Editorial Note	: Change 105.7 as shown be	ow" to "Change	Table 105-3 as shown		ppropriate editing instructions		
Proposed Res	,	Response Status W			Proposed Response PROPOSED AC	Response Status V	v	
	ment #370	IN PRINCIPLE.			See comment #3	370		
	SC 105.5	P37	L 49	# 356	C/ 105 SC 105		L 6	# 419
Lewis, Jon		Dell Technolo	-		Wienckowski, Natali			_
Comment Typ		Comment Status D ated from 105.7.	3	EZ	Comment Type E	Comment Status)	E
SuggestedRei					SuggestedRemedy	w with aligned		
If possible	e, please try to	o move the Editorial Note clos	ser to 105.7		Merge cells in ro			
Proposed Res PROPOS	sponse ED ACCEPT.	Response Status W			Proposed Response PROPOSED AC	Response Status V CEPT.	v	
C/ 105	SC 105.5	P 37	L 50	# 500				
Huber, Thoma	as	Nokia						
<i>Comment Typ</i> The "edito		Comment Status D build be replaced with an editir	ng instruction to	<i>EZ, Table 105-3</i> modify Table 105-3				
SuggestedRei Add an ed		ion to insert new rows at the e	end of Table 105	-3 as shown.				
Proposed Res PROPOSI	-	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.						
See comn	ment #370							

C/ 105 SC 105.5

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105	SC 105.5	P 38	L 7	# 534
Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Ty	/pe T	Comment Status A		Table 105-3, L

It is unclear what the expressions "L=1" etc. mean in this table.

In the table in the base document, the "Notes" column includes references to the subclause within the PHY clause that specifies this delay. In this case, it should be "See 165.10"

Looking at 165.10, there are different maximum delay specifications depending on the "Interleave" parameter. Interleaving (or "L") is negotiated between the link partners and may be different in either direction, so is unknown in advance for a given device.

The purpose of this table (per the text preceding it: "network planners and administrators conform to constraints regarding the cable topology and concatenation of devices... Table 105–3 contains the values of maximum sublayer delay (sum of transmit and receive delays at one end of the link".

Therefore it seems adequate to list here only the maximum delay of the PHY, which happens with L=8. The text in 165.10 can include further details about how the delay can be lower in some cases.

SuggestedRemedy

Use only one row for "25GBASE-T1 PHY", with the data for L=8, and point to 165.10 in the "Notes" column, consistent with the other rows.

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Comment was re-classified as T

Change L=1 to "no interleave, see 165.10" Change L=2 to "2x interleave, see 165.10" Change L=4 to "4x interleave, see 165.10" Change L=8 to "8x interleave, see 165.10"

This change brings the table closer to format of table 44-2 for T1 PMDs.

C/ 105 Se	C 105.5	P 38	L 8	# 627
McClellan, Bret	t	Marvell		
Comment Type	ER	Comment Status A		Table 105-3, L

L' isn't defined anywhere in Clause 105 and makes the note confusing. Follow the example for 10GBASE-T1 in Clause 44

SuggestedRemedy

break the 25GBASE-T box into 4 lines with these labels: '25GBASE-T1 no interleave', '25GBASE-T1 2x interleave', '25GBASE-T1 4x interleave', '25GBASE-T1 8x interleave'. Replace the 'L=' notes in each row with 'See 165.10'

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #534	
------------------	--

C/ 105	SC 105.5	P 38	L16	# 628
McClellar	n, Brett	Marvell		
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		EZ
missir	ng note d from ba	ase standard		

SuggestedRemedy

insert "dCumulative round-trip delay contributed by up to four PMA stages in a PHY."

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED REJECT.

Note is not currently in use in snippet of Table 105-3 used in the draft

C/ 105	SC	105.7	P 38	L 18	# 501
Huber, Tho	mas		Nokia		
Comment T	ype	Е	Comment Status D		EZ, 105.7
Missing	an eo	diting in:	struction to modify clause 105.7		

SuggestedRemedy

Add an editing instruction to modify the first paragraph of 105.7 as shown.

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #491

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	C/ 105	Pa
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn	SC 105.7	8/2
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line		

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 105 SC 105.7	P 38	L 19	# 491	C/ 105 SC 105.7	P 38	L 45	# 629
Zimmerman, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		<i>EZ,</i> 105.7	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		<i>EZ</i> , 105.7
There is no subclause 1	105.7 in the base standard, a	ind no edits to it	in this draft.	this subclause is missi	ing editor's instructions for su	bclause 105.7	
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Delete subclause 105.7	7, P38 L19-25			add editor's instruction	as needed		
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
C/ 105 SC 105.7	P 38	L 20	# 535	See comment #491			
Ran, Adee	Cisco			C/ 105 SC 105.7	P 39	L1	# 420
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ	Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
Editorial instruction is m	nissing.			Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ
SuggestedRemedy							
Add an appropriate inst	truction.			SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status W			remove blank page			
PROPOSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
See comment #491				PROPOSED ACCEPT	• •		
C/ 105 SC 105.7	P 38	L 20	# 352	C/ 149B SC 149B	P 148	L15	# 631
Brown, Matt	Huawei			McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type ER	Comment Status D		EZ	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ
Missing editorial instruc	ction.				1' may be too general here if	new PHYs are lat	er specified that don't
SuggestedRemedy				conform to this subclar	use		
Add editorial instruction	1.			SuggestedRemedy	Γ1' with 'Clause 149 and Clau		
Proposed Response	Response Status W			•		se loo	
PROPOSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
See comment #491							

C/ 149B SC 149B Page 29 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	SC 165.1	P 40	L 10	# 393
Akin, Sam	i	VW AG		
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		EZ
		e paragraph, we have ' a A) sublayers'. The 'sublaye		
Suggested	Remedy			
We sh sublay		ell as the 25GBASE-T1 Pr	nysical Medium A	ttachment (PMA)
Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
PROP	OSED ACCEPT.			
C/ 165	SC 165.1	P 40	L14	# 536
Ran, Adee)	Cisco		
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		EZ, PHYs
		SE-T1 PHYs" seems to be		
three of	different PHYs. But	BASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T there only one PHY is spe	cified, and is late	
		l paragraph "a 25GBASE-		
Simila	rly in two other inst	ances in this paragraph, a	nd also in the firs	st sentence in 165.1.2
and m	aybe elsewhere.			
Other	artifacts of this inh	eritance seem to exist, e.g	. in 165.1.3 "The	25GBASE-T1 PHY
each c	norato" should be	"The 25GBASE-T1 PHY o	noratos"	
		"The 25GBASE-T1 PHY o	perates".	
Suggested Chang	<i>IRemedy</i> le "PHYs" to "PHY	and change plural to sing		y in this paragraph and
Suggested Chang	<i>IRemedy</i> le "PHYs" to "PHY here where approp	and change plural to sing		y in this paragraph and
Suggested Chang elsewf Proposed	<i>IRemedy</i> le "PHYs" to "PHY here where approp	' and change plural to sing riate. <i>Response Status</i> W		y in this paragraph and
Suggested Chang elsewh Proposed PROP	Remedy le "PHYs" to "PHY here where approp Response OSED ACCEPT IN	' and change plural to sing riate. <i>Response Status</i> W		y in this paragraph and
Suggested Chang elsewh Proposed PROP	Remedy IRemedy e "PHYs" to "PHY here where approp Response	' and change plural to sing riate. <i>Response Status</i> W		y in this paragraph and
Suggested Chang elsewh Proposed PROP	Remedy le "PHYs" to "PHY here where approp Response OSED ACCEPT IN	' and change plural to sing riate. <i>Response Status</i> W		y in this paragraph and
Suggested Chang elsewh Proposed PROP	Remedy le "PHYs" to "PHY here where approp Response OSED ACCEPT IN	' and change plural to sing riate. <i>Response Status</i> W		y in this paragraph and
Suggested Chang elsewh Proposed PROP	Remedy le "PHYs" to "PHY here where approp Response OSED ACCEPT IN	' and change plural to sing riate. <i>Response Status</i> W		y in this paragraph and

C/ 165 SC	165.1	P 40	L14	# 511
Grow, Robert		RMG Conslutin	g	
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D		EZ, PHYs

Though similar problems exist in many clauses in 802.3, I think in many cases using plural "PHYs" in this clause is wrong. There is one 25GBASE-T1 PHY specification and most of the time text is addressing the 25GBASE-T1 PHY specification, not multiple instances of a 25GBASE-T1 interface on a networked device, or various 25GBASE-T1 PHY implementations. Grammar problems left after deleting 50 Gb/s and 100 Gb/s highlight this, for example on line 17, "the 25GBASE-T1 PHYs" where "the" and "PHYs" would have been appropriate for a list of multiple rates, but is not for a single rate.

SuggestedRemedy

Search on "PHYs" and correct grammar as appropriate (e.g., "the 25GBASE-T1 PHY" or "a 25GBASE-T1 PHY", etc.) Including: p.41, l. 25; p, 42, l, 6; p. 95, l. 37; p. 109, l. 28, 29; p. 161, l. 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 165	SC 165.1	P40) L 23	# 664
Zimmerman,	George	CME	Consulting/APL Gp	, Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Ty	pe E	Comment Status	D	EZ

Clause 78 is in the draft - should be an active cross-ref, not external.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Clause 78" to an active cross reference and remove external tag.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 165	SC 165.1.1	P 40	L 24	# 422
Wienckow	vski, Natalie	General Motors		
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		EZ
Claus	e 78 is in the draf	t.		
Suggested	dRemedy			
	ge "Clause 78" to on P42L5	black and make it a hyperlink.		

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.1.1	P 40	L 27	# 389		C/ 165 S	C 165.1.2	P 40	L37	# 421	
Marris, Arthur	Cadence Des	sign Systems			Wienckowski, I	Natalie	General Motor	ſS		
Comment Type E Inconsistent capilization	Comment Status D n of "this Clause"			EZ	Comment Type Clause 98	E is in the draft	Comment Status D			EZ
consitant Proposed Response	tion of clause on line 21 and Response Status W	l 28. Choose a sty	yle for this and ma	ake it	Also on P4	lause 98" to 1L42, P41L4 P141L28, P3	black and make it a hyperlink 6, P41L52, P49L5, P96L46, 7L40, P37L43 <i>Response Status</i> W		.40, P117L44, P13	31L6,
PROPOSED ACCEPT.					, ,	ED ACCEPT.	,			
Cl 165 SC 165.1.2 McClellan, Brett	P 40 Marvell	L 35	# 636		C/ 165 S	C 165.1.2	P 40	L 37	# 390	
Comment Type E	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Marris, Arthur Comment Type	E	Cadence Desi Comment Status D	gn Systems		ΕZ
indicate that Auto-Nego SuggestedRemedv	otiation is optional				Clause 98					
SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before	Auto-Negotiation Response Status W				SuggestedRem Make Clau Scrub the c	se 98 a cross document an	s reference. Also page 41 line d make Clause 45, Clause 78 her than an external.			ne 5.
SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 165 SC 165.1.2	Auto-Negotiation Response Status W P40	L 37	# 665		SuggestedRem Make Clau Scrub the o reference t Proposed Resp	se 98 a cross document an houghout rat	d make Clause 45, Člause 78 her than an external. <i>Response Status</i> W			ne 5.
SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 165 SC 165.1.2 Zimmerman, George Comment Type E	Auto-Negotiation Response Status W P 40 CME Consult Comment Status D	ting/APL Gp, Cisc	co, CommScope,	Marve EZ	SuggestedRem Make Claus Scrub the or reference t Proposed Resp PROPOSE	se 98 a cross document an houghout rat	d make Clause 45, Člause 78 her than an external. <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P</i> 41	3 and Clause 98		ine 5.
SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 165 SC 165.1.2 Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Clause 98 is in the draf	Auto-Negotiation Response Status W P 40 CME Consult	ting/APL Gp, Cisc	co, CommScope,		SuggestedRen Make Clau Scrub the oreference t Proposed Resp PROPOSE C/ 165 S Grow, Robert	se 98 a cross document an houghout rat conse ED ACCEPT. C 165.1.3	d make Clause 45, Člause 78 her than an external. <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P</i> 41 RMG Consluti	3 and Clause 98	# <u>512</u>	
SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 165 SC 165.1.2 Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Clause 98 is in the draf SuggestedRemedy	Auto-Negotiation Response Status W P 40 CME Consult Comment Status D	ting/APL Gp, Cisc s-ref, not external.	co, CommScope,		SuggestedRem Make Clau Scrub the or reference t Proposed Resp PROPOSE C/ 165 S Grow, Robert Comment Type	se 98 a cross document an houghout rat conse D ACCEPT. C 165.1.3	d make Clause 45, Člause 78 her than an external. <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P</i> 41	3 and Clause 98	# 512 multi-pa	
SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 165 SC 165.1.2 Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Clause 98 is in the draf SuggestedRemedy Change "Clause 98" to	Auto-Negotiation <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P</i> 40 CME Consult <i>Comment Status</i> D ft - should be an active cross an active cross reference ar <i>Response Status</i> W	ting/APL Gp, Cisc s-ref, not external.	co, CommScope,		SuggestedRen Make Clau Scrub the or reference t Proposed Resp PROPOSE Cl 165 S Grow, Robert Comment Type Grammar p SuggestedRen A 25GBAS balanced p	se 98 a cross document an houghout rat ponse ED ACCEPT. C 165.1.3 E E problem and hedy E-T1 PHY of pair of conduct	d make Clause 45, Člause 78 her than an external. <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P</i> 41 <i>RMG Conslutin</i> <i>Comment Status</i> D other aritifacts left after deleti perates using full-duplex components with an effective rate of 2	3 and Clause 98 <i>L</i> 30 ng 50 Gb/s and munications ove	# <u>512</u> <i>multi-pa</i> 100 Gb/s. er one, shielded	
SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 165 SC 165.1.2 Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Clause 98 is in the draf SuggestedRemedy Change "Clause 98" to Proposed Response	Auto-Negotiation <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P</i> 40 CME Consult <i>Comment Status</i> D ft - should be an active cross an active cross reference ar <i>Response Status</i> W	ting/APL Gp, Cisc s-ref, not external.	co, CommScope,		SuggestedRem Make Claus Scrub the or reference to Proposed Resp PROPOSE Cl 165 S Grow, Robert Comment Type Grammar p SuggestedRem A 25GBAS balanced p meeting the Proposed Resp	se 98 a cross document an houghout rat ponse ED ACCEPT. C 165.1.3 E E problem and nedy E-T1 PHY op air of conduc e requirement ponse	d make Clause 45, Člause 78 her than an external. <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P</i> 41 <i>RMG Conslutin</i> <i>Comment Status</i> D other aritifacts left after deleti perates using full-duplex components with an effective rate of 2	3 and Clause 98 <i>L</i> 30 ng 50 Gb/s and munications ove	# <u>512</u> <i>multi-pa</i> 100 Gb/s. er one, shielded	

C/ 165 SC 165.1.3

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC ·	165.1.3	Р	41	L 30	# 448
Carlson, S	Carlson, Steve		HSI	D, Bosch,		
		Comment Statu	s D	multi-pair, E		
Leftov	er refere	ence to tv	vo and four pairs: "	over one,	two, or four shie	lded"
Suggested	Remed	У У				
Delete	"two or	four" fro	m the sentence			
Proposed	Respon	se	Response Status	s W		
PROP	OSED	ACCEPT.				
C/ 165	SC ·	165.1.3	Р	41	L 30	# 394
Akin, Sam	i		VW	AG		
Comment	Туре	ER	Comment Statu	s D		multi-pair, E
full-du	plex cor ective ra	nmunicat ite of 25 (or four sł '. Followi	nielded balanced ng the changes	
should		ent as edi	torial, I am not fully			0 0 1
should	comme		torial, I am not fully			0 0 1
should of this Suggested We sh over o directi	comme IRemed ould ha ne shiel on simu	y ve "The 2 ded bala	SGBASE-T1 PHY nced pair of conduct y while meeting the	sure if thi each oper ctors with	s is editorial or t ates using full-d an effective rate	echnical. uplex communications of 25 Gb/s in each
should of this Suggested We sh over o directi	comme IRemed ould ha ne shiel on simu otive er	y ve "The 2 ded bala Itaneousl wironmer	SGBASE-T1 PHY nced pair of conduct y while meeting the	sure if thi each oper ctors with e requirem	s is editorial or t ates using full-d an effective rate	echnical. uplex communications of 25 Gb/s in each

See comments #391 ar	1d #448
----------------------	---------

C/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P 41	L 30	# 391
Marris, Ar	thur	Cadence De	sign Systems	
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		multi-pair, EZ

Change "each operate" to "operates"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "each operate using full-duplex communications over one, two, or four shielded balanced pair of conductors" to "operates using full-duplex communications over a shielded balanced pair of conductors"

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	P 41	L 30	# 666
Zimmerman, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve
Comment Type T	Comment Status D		multi-pair, EZ

"The 25GBASE-T1 PHY each operate...over one, two, or four shielded... on each pair..." didn't get cleaned up when we deleted the 2 and 4 lane 50GBASE-T2 and 100GBASE-T4

SuggestedRemedy

change the first sentence of the first paragraph of 165.1.3 to:"The 25GBASE-T1 PHY operates using full-duplex communications over a single shielded balanced pair of conductors with an effective rate of 25 Gb/s in each direction simultaneously while meeting the requirements (EMC, temperature, etc.) of automotive environments."

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comments #391 and #448

C/ 165 S	C 165.1.3	P 41	L 30	# 537
Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D		multi-pair, EZ

"using full-duplex communications over one, two, or four shielded balanced pair of conductors with an effective rate of 25 Gb/s on each pair in each direction simultaneously"

I thought this is a single pair PHY at 25 Gb/s total?

SuggestedRemedy

Rewrite as necessary

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comments #391 and #448

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Vienckowsk									
	ki, Natalie	General Motor	S		Huber, Tho	mas	Nokia		
omment Ty		Comment Status D		multi-pair, EZ	Comment		Comment Status D		multi-pair, EZ
Only 1 p	air of conductor	rs is used.					ect was changed to being only		
uggestedRe	emedy						e referring to operation at 50 C rate of 25G on each pair.	50/S OF 100 GD/S	s by allowing for 2 of 4
		E-T1 PHY each operate using lanced pair of conductors with			Suggested		•		
		multaneously	in an enective ra	le of 25 GD/S off each	Chang	-			
		PHY operates using full-duple					ded balanced pair of conducto	ors with an effec	tive rate of 25 Gb/s on
	d pair of conduct	ctors with an effective rate of	25 Gb/s in each	direction	to	an in each direc	ction simultaneously"		
roposed Re		Response Status W					d pair of conductors with an ef	fective rate of 2	5 Gb/s in each
, PROPO	SED ACCEPT I	•				n simultaneous			
S		4 4440			Proposed I	•	Response Status W		
	nments #391 ar				TROP				
/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P 41	L 31	# 466	See co	mments #391 a	and #448		
u, Mike		Broadcom			C/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P 41	L 35	# 637
omment Ty		Comment Status D		multi-pair, EZ	McClellan,	Brett	Marvell		
	•	over one cable only.			Comment	Гуре Е	Comment Status D		EZ
uggestedRe	•				rates' i	s redundant to I	MBd and incorrectly plural		
Change		nmunications over one shield	led balanced pa	ir of conductors with an	Suggested	Remedy			
		s in each direction simultaned			delete	rates'			
roposed Re	esponse	Response Status W			Proposed I	Response	Response Status W		
PROPOS	SED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			PROP	OSED ACCEPT			
See com	nments #391 ar	nd #448			C/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P 41	L35	# 423
					Wienckows	ski, Natalie	General Moto	rs	
					Comment	Гуре Е	Comment Status D		EZ
					gramm	ar			
					Suggested	Remedy			
						e: at 14 062.5 I a 14 062.5 MBo			
					Proposed I	Response	Response Status W		
					PROP	OSED ACCEPT			
				T/technical E/editorial G			C/ 16		Page 33 of 78

C/ 165 SC 165	.1.3	P 41	L 35	# 514	C/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P 41	L 37	# 538
Grow, Robert		RMG Conslu	iting		Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type E	Com	ment Status D			EZ Comment 7	уре т	Comment Status A		
There is only one	Baud rate list	ed, "rates" should be	e singular.				RS-FEC, the concept of BEF		
SuggestedRemedy						rame is discar han the 1e-12	ded, all bits are replaced wit	h error bits, so th	e BER can be much
"at a 14.0625 GB	d rate."				Tigher				
Proposed Response	Respo	onse Status W					is PHY is defined by the rfe		
PROPOSED AC							C was not used. The methor (FLR). The FLR equivalent of		
7 165 SC 165	4.0	P 41	L 35	# 513	92.1).		, , ,		· ·
	.1.3			# 513	The su	agested remed	y uses FLR. Alternatively, "r	performance" or c	other terms can be used
Grow, Robert	Com	RMG Conslu	iting			, but not simply			
Comment Type E		ment Status R use GBd for Baud r	rato (o.g. Clauso	20 Clause 48 for	Suggested	Remedy			
				ar MHz specifications.			a bit error ratio (BER) of less		
SuggestedRemedy					a frame 10^–12		R) equivalent to a bit error ra	atio (BER) of less	than or equal to
p. 41, l. 35 - 14.0	625 GBd				Response		Response Status C		
p. 42, l. 17 - 14.0					ACCEF	ΥT.			
p. 44, l. 5 - 14.06 p. 151, l. 4 - 14.0									
p. 50, l. 21 - 14.0	625 MHz				C/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P 42	L 6	# 667
p. 107, l. 38 - 0.8 p. 113, l. 37 - 14.		Z			Zimmerma	n, George	CME Const	ulting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Mar
p. 144, l. 34 - 14					Comment 7	51	Comment Status A		
Response	Respo	onse Status C					a mechanism by which 250 Iring periods of low link utiliz		
REJECT.					someth		lot of time discussing - nar		
		otential editorial prot of) and does not alig		nonbreaking space, b	out Suggested				
				Clauses (113 and 126	••	-	each direction of the link" t	o the end of the s	sentence.
/ 165 SC 165	.1.3	P 41	L 36	# 638	Response		Response Status C		
/IcClellan, Brett		Marvell			ACCEF	ΥТ.			
Comment Type T	R Comi	ment Status A							
TX_D, TX_EN ar error.	d TX_ER are r	not 25GMII signals.	Note that Clause	149 has the same					
SuggestedRemedy									
change '25GMII "	X_D, TX_EN,	and TX_ER' to '250	GMII TXD and TX	(C'					
change Leenin									
Response	Respo	onse Status C							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.1.3 Page 34 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

-	•		•			0 1				
C/ 165	SC 165.1.3.1	P 42	L 28	# 539	C/ 165	SC 165.1.3.3	3 P44	L 22	# 424	
Ran, Adee	e	Cisco			Wienckow	/ski, Natalie	General Mot	ors		
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status A		L	Comment	Type E	Comment Status D			E
		se specifies what happens "			78.3 is	s in the draft.				
mode	, but does not say	y anything about the receive	e direction in norr	nal mode.	Suggestee	Remedy				
		r L is used as part of the sp			Chang	ge "78.3" to black	c and make it a hyperlink.			
setting PAM2	s requested in ea training mode Inf	3.2.2 (PCS Transmit functio ach direction of transmissior ofield exchange". This mea	n may be differen ns L can be diffe	t signaled during the rent in the receive and	•	Response OSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			
		should be noted here (any point simultaneous values of L).		on should be used to	C/ 165	SC 165.1.6	P 45	L 32	# 540	
Δ rofo	rence to the defin	ition and content of the info	field (in 165 4 2 4	5) would also be	Ran, Adee	e	Cisco			
helpfu			noid (in 100.4.2.4		Comment	Type E	Comment Status R			
S <i>uggested</i> Rewrit	<i>Remedy</i> e as necessary				165.3	7.1 which also li	I here are mainly for state dia sts state diagram convention more helpful to the reader.			•
Response		Response Status C			Suggested	Remedy				
ACCE	PT IN PRINCIPLI	Ε.				-	is subclause to 165.3.7.1, m	erging as necess	ary.	
Chang	je				Response REJE		Response Status C			
"A nur	nber, L, of these"				REJE	61.				
to					No ch	anges needed. T	state diagram conventions, w The current structure mimics			
"A nur	mber, L (see 165.	3.2.2.15), of these"			802.3	2022				
C/ 165	SC 165.1.3.1	P 42	L35	# 340						
Gorshe, S	teve	Microchip Te	chnology							
Comment	Type ER	Comment Status A								
that th	e FEC symbol siz	936, 846, 2^10)" appears to ze is 2^10 = 1024 bits. It ap pit symbol size of KR-4 and	pears that it shou	uld be "RS-FEC (936,						
Suggested	Remedy									
If the o	comment is corre	ct, this should be changed to	o RS-FEC (936,	846, 10)						
Response		Response Status W								
ACCE	PT IN PRINCIPLI	E.								
=====										
replac	e "(936,846,2^10))" with "(936,846) over GF(2	^10)"							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 165 SC 165.1.6 Page 35 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

ΕZ

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.2.2	P 47	L 6	# 541	C/ 165 SC	165.2.2.	3.3 <i>P</i> 50	L 4	# 668
Ran, Adee	00 103.2.2	Cisco	20	<i>π</i> <u>541</u>	Zimmerman, Geo			-	sco, CommScope, Marv
Comment T	vpe T	Comment Status R		1		E	Comment Status D		E
The valu training encodin Since al	ue of L and the c - which is a PM/ g. Il information exc	choice of precoding are requ A function. These values ha chage from the PMA to the l	ve to be passed PCS is defined i	to the PCS for correct in terms of service	Incorrect reference. "Upon receipt of this primitive the PMA transmits on the MDI the signals corresponding to the indicated symbols processed to conform to 149.5.2." The reference points to the transmitter electrical specifications for 2.5G/5G/10GBASE-T1 (Clause 149). The electrical specifications for 25GBASE-T1 have different timing and are specified in 165.5.3 SuggestedRemedy				
The of F		dication could be expanded	t to to include th	ase values but l	Change external reference of 149.5.2 to an active cross-reference to 165.5.3				
suspect	it may not be st	raightforward, since the exists starts, but the values of L a	sting content (m	aster or slave) is	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.				
SuggestedF	•	ibad in the commont in the	tout and figura			165.2.2.		L38	# 669
•	minuve as desci	ibed in the comment, in the	e text and ligures	s as necessary.					
Response	.	Response Status C			Zimmerman, Geo	0		iting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Marv
REJEC	1.				Comment Type	E	Comment Status D		E
No specific changes were proposed.					The allowed values of pcs_data_mode are missing. (this happens in other clauses, but is done correctly in clause 113). From the state diagram, it is clear that the allowed values are TRUE and FALSE.				
C/ 165	SC 165.2.2.3.		L3	# 656	SuggestedRemed	lv			
Wu, Peter		Marvell				-	the end of 165.2.2.9.1:		
Comment T Upon re the indic	eceipt of this prin	Comment Status D nitive the PMA transmits on rocessed to conform to 149	the MDI the signed the MDI the signed the MDI the signed the second seco	EZ nals corresponding to ,", hard to read		in state	parameter can take on one o PCS_Data (see Figure 165- state PCS_Data (see Figure	-27)	o values of the form:
SuggestedRemedy					Proposed Respor	ise	Response Status W		
		itive, the PMA transmits or ocessed to conform to 149		gnals corresponding to	PROPOSED	ACCEPT	T.		
Proposed R PROPC	esponse SED ACCEPT.	Response Status W							
C/ 165	SC 165.2.2.3.	3 P 50	L 4	# 603					
McClellan, I	Brett	Marvell							
Comment T	ype E et reference	Comment Status D		EZ					
SuggestedF	Remedy 149.5.2 to 165.5	.3							
change									

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.2.2.9.1

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

-									
C/ 165	SC 165.3.2	P 54	L 28	# 670	C/ 165	SC 165.3.2	P 58	L11	# 467
Zimmerma	in, George	CME Consultir	ng/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marve	Tu, Mike		Broadcom		
Comment 7	Туре Т	Comment Status A			Comment	Type TR	Comment Status D		
		ne PCS Reset function and tw			The co	ontrol codes for N	JultiGBASE-T1 is defined in	Table 149-2, no	ot Table 149-1.
		e PCS operating functions are om clause to clause, but isn't			Suggested	Remedy			
		auses add a 3rd function to th			Chang	e all references	to table of control code from	Table 149-1 to	Table 149-2, including
4. ´				Ŭ		below:			-
Suggested	Remedy					e 58, line 11, Fig e 59, line 10, Fig			
		prises one PCS Reset function				e 61, line 10, 1 k			
		functions. " to ""The PCS co				e 61, line 19.			
	nuitaneous and a	synchronous operating functi	ons, and the P	CS DAM function."		e 70, line 2. e 70, line 3.			
Response		Response Status C				e 79, line 25.			
ACCEF	J.					e 79, line 26.			
C/ 165	SC 165.3.2	P 55	L 29	# 657		e 80, line 9. ge 80, line 11.			
Wu, Peter		Marvell				ge 132, line 43.			
Comment	Tvpe E	Comment Status D		EZ	Proposed I	Response	Response Status W		
	51	be added to the note			PROP	OSED ACCEPT	•		
Suggested	Remedy				C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	L 2	# 671
		nd tx_lpi_active are only requ			Zimmerma	an. George	CME Consu	ltina/APL Gp. Ci	sco, CommScope, Mar
0	ed to "NOTE—a apability"	lert_detect, rx_lpi_active and	tx_lpi_active a	re only required for the	Comment		Comment Status A	J	
Proposed F	,	Response Status W					Figure 165–16 and Figure 1	65–17 are used	to indicate states and
'	OSED ACCEPT.						transmit process state diagr		
	OULD ADDEN 1.				the EE	E capability." is	a duplicate 'shall' with the p 5-17. It also does not have	evious requirem	ent to conform to
					duplica			a rico entry, co	Similing that it is
					Suggested	lRemedv			
					00	,	reported" to "that are reporte	d"	
					Response		Response Status C		
						PT IN PRINCIPL	-		
					, COL				
					01		date PICS as needed.		

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2

-	•					•				
C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	L13	# 542	C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	6 L 2 0)	# 543
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Ran, Adee	I.	Cisco			
Comment 7	ype T	Comment Status R		L	Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status	Α		
The ter	m L is used in th	e text here without explana	tion of what it den	otes.	"The s	ymbol period, T,	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps'	1		
One ha determ		bottom of this subclause to	understand what	L means and how it is			ry friendly for the read ter it is found that the			
Suggestedl	Remedy				The ra	tio evaluates to ⁻	71 + 1/9 ps, and this r	number can be us	ed instead si	nce it is
		introduce the concept of intenning of this subclause, bef	0.	nition of L and how it is		sed as ratio any				
Response REJEC	т	Response Status C					the nominal period, w ut I assume it is per 1		1 frequency de	viation (which
NEUE0					Suggested	Remedy				
No spe	cific changes we	ere proposed			Chang "71.11		matted using equation	editor to format	the common fr	raction. Or use
					Add "n	ominal".				
					Response		Response Status	с		
					ACCE	PT IN PRINCIPL	-E.			
					term "s origina	symbol period" is l) specify the tra g spec in 165.5.3	bol period" it creates s used elsewhere in th nsmit clock frequency 3.6. Optionally, you c	ne PCS text. Add / in 2 places. A be	litionally, this te	ext (and the eferences the
					to:	ymbol period, T, symbol period, T	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps. , is one period of the t		frequency, spe	ecified in
					C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P56	6 L 2 0)	# 724
					Jonsson, F	Ragnar	Marve	ell		
					<i>Comment</i> The no	51	<i>Comment Status</i> 4.0625 ps" can be cor		,	post-deadline, EZ ous.
					Suggested	Remedy				
					Chang	e "1000 / 14.062	25 ps" to "(1000 / 14.0	625) ps"		
					Proposed PROP	Response OSED ACCEPT	Response Status	w		
					See co	omment #543				
		d ER/editorial required GR patched A/accepted R/reje			0	U/unsatisfied	Z/withdrawn	C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2		Page 38 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:0

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line SC 165.3.2.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	L 37	# 672	C/ 165
Zimmerma	n, George	CME Consu	Ilting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	Wu, Peter
Comment 7	Гуре Е	Comment Status D		EZ	Comment
		tion shall use a 65B coding			What
		t represent data or control the PAM4 signalling. A 6			Suggested
		ded incorrect phrase does			After r
Suggested	Remedy				transm mode
	", at each symbo				of the
Also, u	pdate PICS PCT	7 Feature text (P132 L38)	deleting the same	text	Proposed
Proposed F		Response Status W			PROP
PROPO	OSED ACCEPT.				Chana
C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	L 41	# 341	Chang
Gorshe, St	eve	Microchip T	echnology		After r
Comment 7		Comment Status R	07		transm mode
Here a	nd other places, t	he term "9360-bit (936, 84	6) RS-FEC frame	s" is used. This	of the
		or at least inconsistent wit word. An FEC frame cons			C/ 165
Suggested	•				Ran, Adee
00		e 9360-bit block is referre	d to as an FEC "fr	ame" the term should	Comment
	nged to FEC "coo				Both "
Response		Response Status W			Note t
REJEC	CT.				10-bit
	oposed text is inc es needed.	onsistent with the terminol	ogy alignment per	comment #710. No	65B is own.
					Suggested
					Use "6
					Response

C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 57	L 2	# 658
Wu, Peter		Marvel	I	
Comment Typ	pe E	Comment Status	D	EZ

does "RS" mean here? Reconciliation SUblayer or Reed-Soloman Frames

edRemedy

reaching the normal mode of operation, EEE-capable PHYs may enter the LPI mit mode under the control of the RS via the 25GMII-> "After reaching the normal e of operation, EEE-capable PHYs may enter the LPI transmit mode under the control e Reconciliation sublayer via the 25GMII."

d Response Response Status W

POSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

nged capitalization of "sublayer"

reaching the normal mode of operation, EEE-capable PHYs may enter the LPI mit mode under the control of the RS via the 25GMII-> "After reaching the normal e of operation, EEE-capable PHYs may enter the LPI transmit mode under the control e Reconciliation Sublayer via the 25GMII."

C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2.1	P 57	7	L 35	#	544
Ran, Adee		Cisco				
Comment Ty	pe E	Comment Status	Α			

"65-bit" and "65B" used in the text; is there a difference?

that the RS-FEC encoding is not related to the PCS's 65-bit blocks, since due to the t OAM its block size is not an integer mutiple of 65.

is used as part of the 64B/65B encoding scheme name but should not be used on its

dRemedy

"65-bit" consistently, and remove the "65B" label from the RS-FEC name.

е Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #673

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.1

Page 39 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

McClellan, Brett Marvell Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Marve Comment Type E Comment Status A 165.32.2.4 165.32.2.1 McGlellan, Brett Suggested/Remedy move header after Figure 156-6 to be contiguous with subclause text With the exception of deleting a table to reference clause 149. It seems that 165.32.2.12 are identical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. Suggest referencing clause 149 for the whole thing. In the suggested remedy I have been careful to use shalls' and are based on whether there is a requirement to reference in the PICS. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Delete 165.3.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.12. Replace with: ''165.2.2.4 block structure The 65-bit block structure specified in 149.3.2.24 is used by 25GBASE-T1, with the block format shown in Figure 149-8. 165.2.2.5 Contored cases McCordered sets The mapping of control characters is used to map the 25GMII and 25GBASE-T1 PCS is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.6. McGreed sets The use of offdered sets is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.7. McGreed sets The use offdered of the MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.7. McGreed sets 165.2.2.8 Control characters shall be as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.7. McGreed sets 165.2.2.8 Contored sets 165.2.2.8 Contored casets	Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ Comment Type E Comment Status A 165.3.2.2.4 - 165.3.2.4 - 165.3.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.2.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 10 - 10.0 - 165.3.2 - 1	C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.3	P 57	L 51	# 640		C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	2.4	P 59	L 44	# 673
header disconnected from subclause text SuggestedRemedy move header after Figure 156-6 to be contiguous with subclause text Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. With the exception of deleting a table to reference clause 149, It seems that 165.3.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.12 are identical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.12. Replace with: "165.2.2.4 block structure PICS. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.12. Replace with: "165.2.2.4 block structure specified in 149.3.2.2.4 is used by 25GBASE-T1, with the block format shown in Figure 149-8. 165.2.2.5 Control codes The 65-bit block structure specified in 149.3.2.2.5 and shown in Table 149-2. All 25GMII and 25GBASE-T1 PVS is as pecified for MultiGBASE-T1 PVFs in 149.3.2.2.6. 165.2.2.6 Ordered sets The use of Ordered sets is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PVFs in 149.3.2.2.7. 165.2.2.8 LPI (LI) Low Power Idle control characters shall be as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PVFs in 149.3.2.2.7. 165.2.2.8 LPI (LI) Low Power Idle control characters are as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PVFs in 149.3.2.2.9. 165.2.2.9 Start (IS) Start control characters are as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PVFs in 149.3.2.2.9. 165.2.2.8 Start (IS)	header disconnected from subclause text Suggested/Remedy move header after Figure 156-6 to be contiguous with subclause text Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. With the exception of deleting a table to reference clause 149. It is earns that 165.3.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.12 are identical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. Suggested/Remedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are identical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. Suggested/Remedy Delete 165.3.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.12. Replace with: "165.2.2.4 Block structure The 65-bit block structure The 65-bit block structure The 65-bit block structure The 65-bit block structure 149. It seems that 165.3.2.2.4 It suggested/Remedy label to reference in the PICS. Suggested/Remedy Delete 165.3.2.2.5 Control characters is used to map the 25GMII and 25GBASE-T1 PCS is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.5 and shown in Table 149-2. All 25GMII control characters is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.6. 165.2.2.5 Control code sets The mapping of control characters is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.7. 165.2.2.3 LPI (/U) Idle control characters shall be as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.7. 165.2.2.3 LPI (/U) Low Power Idle control characters shall be as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.1. 165.2.2.3 LPI (/U) Control characters are as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.1. 165.2.2.3 LPI (/U) Combrated (IC) Combrated (I	McClellan, Brett	Marvell				Zimmerma	an, George		CME Consult	ting/APL Gp, C	Cisco, CommScope, Marve
SuggestedRemedy move header after Figure 156-6 to be contiguous with subclause text Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. PROPOSED ACCEPT. PROPOSED ACCEPT. Belete 165.3.2.2.12 are identical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. Suggest referencing clause 149 for the whole thing. In the suggested remedy I have been careful to use 'shalls' and 'are' based on whether there is a requirement to reference in the PICS. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12. Replace with: "165.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.12. Replace with: "165.2.2.4 through 165.3.2.2.14 is used by 25GBASE-T1, with the block format shown in Figure 149-8. 165.2.2.5 Control characters is used to map the 25GMII and 25GBASE-T1 PCS is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.6 and shown in Table 149-2. All 25GMII control code values that do not appear in the table shall not be transmitted and shall be trated as an error if received. 165.2.2.8 (PIU) Idle control characters shall be as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.7. 165.2.2.9 LPI (LI/) Low Power I die control characters shall be as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.9. 165.2.2.9 Statt (S/) Statt control characters are as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.9. 165.2.2.10 Terminate (T7) Terminate control characters are as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.9. 165.2.2.10 Terminate other and the state of the MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.9. 165.2.2.10 Terminate of (T0)	SuggestedRemedy through 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to clause 149. This is as it should be, but is redundant. SuggestedRemedy Delete 165.3.2.2.12 are idemical to as a proceine in the 150.2.2.12. Replace with: ''165.2.2.5 Control code The mapping of control characters is used to map the 25GMII and 25GBASE-T1 PCS is as a specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.5. The use of Ordered sets is as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.6. 165.2.2.7 (offer 167.100000000000000000000000000000000000	Comment Type E	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment	Type E	Comment	Status A		165.3.2.2.4 - 165.3.2.2.12
	Error characters are as specified for MultiGBASE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.12. See R_BLOCK_TYPE and T_BLOCK_TYPE function definitions in 165.3.7.2.4 for further information." Response Response Status C	Comment Type E header disconnected from SuggestedRemedy move header after Figure Proposed Response	Comment Status D a subclause text 156-6 to be contiguous wi	th subclause text		EZ	Comment With th throug Sugge carefu PICS. Suggested "165.2. The 65 format 165.2. The 05 format 165.2. The us 165.2. Idle co 165.2. Low P 149.3. 165.2. Start co 165.2. Termir 165.2.	<i>Type</i> E he exception of the 165.3.2.2.12 and the 165.3.2.2.12 and the 165.3.2.2.12 and the 165.3.2.2.12 and the 165.3.2.2.14 three terms of the 165.3.2.2.4 three terms of terms	deleting a table are identical to lause 149 for th and 'are' based ough 165.3.2.2 ture ture specified ir e 149-8. es ol characters is SE-T1 PHYs in at do not appea eceived. s ets is as specifi s shall be as sp ol characters sh s are as specifi (/T/) racters are as specifi (/C/)	Status A e to reference of clause 149. The whole thing. I on whether the .12. Replace w in 149.3.2.24 is used to map the in in 149.3.2.2.6 ar in the table s red for the Mult ecified for Multi specified for MultiGE specified for MultiGE	clause 149, It s his is as it sho . In the sugge ere is a require with: used by 25GE he 25GMII and 5 and shown ir shall not be tra iGBASE-T1 PH tiGBASE-T1 PHY: ultiGBASE-T1	165.3.2.2.4 - 165.3.2.2.12 seems that 165.3.2.2.4 uld be, but is redundant. sted remedy I have been ement to reference in the BASE-T1, with the block d 25GBASE-T1 PCS is as a Table 149-2. All 25GMII insmitted and shall be HYs in 149.3.2.2.6. HYs in 149.3.2.2.7. BASE-T1 PHYs in s in 149.3.2.2.9. PHYs in 149.3.2.2.10.

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.4

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2	2.2.4	P 59	L 45	# 426	C/ 165	SC 165.3	2.2.5	P 61	L 10	# 639
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Moto	ors		McClellan,	Brett		Marvell		
Comment Type T	Comment	Status A		165.3.2.2.4 - 165.3.2.2.12	Comment	Туре Е	Comn	nent Status D		EZ, Table 149-
The Block structure	s identical to the	e MultiGBASE-	T1 Block Strue	cture in Clause 49.	incorre	ect reference	to Table 149	-1, should be Table	149-2	
SuggestedRemedy					Suggested	lRemedy				
149.3.2.2.4 with the	used by 25GBAS format as shown her data characte	SE-T1 is the Mu in Figure 149- ers or control ch	ItiGBASE-T1 8. The chara naracters and	block structure defined in cters in the 65-bit block in , when transferred across cordingly.	11, als lines 9 If an a	o change pag and 11. Upo	ge 59 line 10 late associat nment to cre	, page 70 lines 2 ar ed PICs.	nd 3, page 79 line	o change page 58 line os 25 and 26, page 80 then these references
Response	Response	Status C			Proposed	Response	Respo	nse Status W		
ACCEPT IN PRINCI	PLE.				PROP	OSED ACCE	PT.			
See comment #673					C/ 165	SC 165.3	2.2.5	P 61	L10	# 643
C/ 165 SC 165.3.2	2.2.5	P 60	L 48	# 641	McClellan,	Brett		Marvell		
VcClellan, Brett		Marvell			Comment	Type ER	Comn	nent Status A		
Comment Type E header disconnected SuggestedRemedy insert page break	Comment I from subclause			EZ	contro BASE contro BASE	l code', '2.5G -T1 l code', and '2	/5G/10G 2.5G/5G/10G		, the column hea	dings are 'XGMII
Proposed Response	Response	Status W			Suggested	IRemedy				
PROPOSED ACCEF	РТ.							and label as Table nce to Table 165-2		ne column headers as
C/ 165 SC 165.3.2	2.2.5	P 61	L10	# 425	Response		0	nse Status C		
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Moto	ors		•	PT IN PRINC				
Comment Type T	Comment	Status D		EZ, Table 149-1		-				
The MultiGBASE-T1	Control Codes a	are in Table 149	9-2, not Table	149-1.	See co	omment #673				
SuggestedRemedy Change: Table 149- To: Table 149-2 Also on P61L19, P13 P80L9, P80L11, P13	32L43, P137L6,	P58L11, P59L1	1, P70L2, P7	0L3, P79L25, P79L26,						
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF	Response S PT.	Status W								

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5	P 61	L10	# 642	C/ 165	SC	165.3.2.2	.18	P 65	L 51	# 674
AcClellan, Brett	Marvell			Zimmerma	an, Geo	orge		CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, C	Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Type T	Comment Status A		165.3.2.2.4 - 165.3.2.2.12	Comment	Туре	Е	Comm	ent Status A	1	165.3.2.2.18 - 165.3.2.2.21
missing statement on add	itional control codes							65.3.2.2.21 are ider		
SuggestedRemedy								apability since this a hbers are different i		
insert 'All 25GMII control of be transmitted and shall b			ble shall not	Suggested	Reme	dy				
Response	Response Status C			Replac	ce 165.	.3.2.2.18 tl	nrough 16	5.3.2.2.21 each as	follows:	
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.						PCS scrai		specified in 149.3.2	2.2.18.	
0				165.3.	2.2.19	Gray map	ping for P	AM4 encoding		
See comment #673				The Po	CS trar	nsmit proc 149.3.2.2.1	əss shall ı o	map pairs of bits to	Gray-coded P	AM4 symbols as
V 165 SC 165.3.2.2.14	P 62	L 39	# 503			Selectable		r		
luber, Thomas	Nokia					•	ess shall	precode the Gray-c	oded PAM4 sy	ymbols as specified in
Comment Type E	Comment Status A			149.3. 165.3.	-	PAM4 end	odina			
Awkward grammar in the	sentence			The P	CS trar			encode each preco	der output syn	nbol as specified in
uggestedRemedy				149.3.						
Change:				Response				nse Status C		
The RS-FEC encoding tak 10-bit OAM_field, and sha				ACCE	PT IN I	PRINCIPL	E.			
To:	ii generale lite 90 10-bil p	anty symbols	(900 bits total).	Chang	jes as j	proposed -	+ update F	PICS.		
The RS-FEC encoding tak				C/ 165	SC	165.3.2.2	22	P67	L34	# 725
10-bit OAM_field, and ger		/ symdois (900) dits total).	Jonsson, F				Marvell	2.34	# 125
•	Response Status C			Comment	0	т	Comm	ent Status A		post-deadline, sleep signal
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.						-		d of 16 RS frames		post-deadime, sleep signal
The proposed response re	moves the 'shall' for the I	RS encoding		•	0		compose			
Change:				Suggested		•	laman fra	mes" to "sixteen Re	ad Colomon f	from oo "
The RS-FEC encoding tak	es the 8460-bit vector, co	onsisting of tx_	group130x65B, and the	-	-	il Reeu-30			20-30101110111	liames
10-bit OAM_field, and sha	Il generate the 90 10-bit p	parity symbols	(900 bits total).	Response			Respor	nse Status C		
To:	all generate the 90 10-bit	parity symbols	(900 bits total) using the	ACCE	PI.					
The RS-FFC encoding sh				Comm	nent typ	be change	d to non-F	R due to post-deadli	ne status.	
The RS-FEC encoding sh 8460-bit vector, consisting symbols.	of tx_group rooxood and									
8460-bit vector, consisting	or K_group rookood and									

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.22 Page 42 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell Comment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, sleep signal Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames SuggestedRemedy change "eight RS-FEC frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC frames" Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Comment Type T Comment Status R L1 tis not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7. The channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implemented. SuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165–7. Add content similar to 165.3.2.2.2.0 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding used for each precoder option (eq., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1))) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoder gragarph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped" to	3 # 715
Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames Suggested/Remedy change 'eight RS-FEC frames' to 'sixteen RS-FEC frames'' Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status. C/I 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 Response Cisco Comment Type T Comment Status R Comment Type T Comment Status R It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. The separation (not trivial) has to be implemented. Suggested/Remedy Change 16 to 32 Response at the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. The separation (not trivial) has to be implemented. Suggested/Remedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165-7. Add content similar to 165.3.2.2.20 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding use for each precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in selected Precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in selected Precoder option (ese -new subclause), are demapped". Response Response Status C In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3. change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped". to 'The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected	
change *eight RS-FEC frames* to *sixteen RS-FEC frames* SuggestedRemedy Change *eight RS-FEC frames* Change 16 to 32 Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status. C C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 # 545 C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 # 545 Comment Type T Comment Status R Comment Status R Comment Status R It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165-7. Comment status 165-7. P69 L 1 The channel description in the precoder option (not trivial) has to be implemented SuggestedRemedy Change: and subject To: and is subject SuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder min Figure 165-7. Response Response Status W Add content similar to 165.3.2.3.2.0 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding used for each precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways. N PROPOSED ACCEPT. In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected Precoder operation (see <new are="" demapped".<="" subclauses),="" td=""></new>	post-deadline, partial frame re each PHY frame has 8 RS-
Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status. Response Response Status C CI 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P 68 L 37 # 545 See comment #710 Comment Type T Comment Status Response See comment #710 Comment Type T Comment Status Response See comment #710 Comment Type T Comment Status Response See comment #710 Comment Type T Comment Status Response See comment #710 Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status C It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors SuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165-7. Response Response Status W Add content similar to 165.3.2.3. (c)(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 to 14 +01.1 to a be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways. In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped" to 'The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected Precoder operation (see <new are="" demapped".<="" subclause-),="" td=""> Comment Type T Comment Status A Sleep signal should be composed of 16 S rames</new>	
ACCEPT. Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status. CI 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 # 545 Comment type T Comment Status R Cisco Comment Type T Comment Status R It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165-7. Comment Type T Comment Status R C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P69 L1 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Comment Type E Comment Status D General Motors SuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165-7. Med content similar to 165.3.2.3 (c)(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways. Marvell Comment Type T Comment Type T Comment Status M In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected Precoder operation (see <new are="" demapped".<="" subclause),="" td=""> Ci 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P69 L2 Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell Comment Type T Comment Type T Comment Status A Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames Response Response Status C Response Status C SuggestedRemedy Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames"</new>	
Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 # 545 Ran, Adee Cisco Comment Type T Comment Status R It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7. Comment Type E Comment Status D The channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implemented SuggestedRemedy Change: and subject Comment Status D SuggestedRemedy Add on the selected precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways. NePOPOSED ACCEPT. Comment Status W In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped". Gomment Type T Comment Status A Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy Camment Status A Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy Camment Type T Comment Status A In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped". SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Sup	
Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 # 545 Ran, Adee Cisco Comment Type T Comment Status R It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding is a separate function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding is a separate function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding is a separate function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implemented Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P 69 L1 SuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165–7. Mich content similar to 165.3.2.2.00 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding used for each precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways. Nervell In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped". Response Response Status C Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames Suggeste	
Rah, Adee Clsoo Comment Type T Comment Status R It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7. C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P 69 L1 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors SuggestedRemedy Grammar SuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165–7. Chaope: and subject To: and is subject Add content similar to 165.3.2.2.20 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding used for each precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways. PROPOSED ACCEPT. In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped". Marvell Response Response Status C Response Response Status C REJECT. The proposed text edges on the Rx implementation (one of many possible). The separation SuggestedRemedy Comment Type Response Status C	
It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7. The channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implemented SuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165–7. Add content similar to 165.3.2.2.20 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding used for each precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways. In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped" to "The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected Precoder operation (see <new subclause="">), are demapped". Response Response Status C REJECT. The proposed text edges on the Rx implementation (one of many possible). The separation</new>	S.
Detecting is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7.Comment Type E grammarThe channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implementedSuggestedRemedy Change: and subject To: and is subjectSuggestedRemedy Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165–7.SuggestedRemedy Change: and subjectSuggestedRemedy Change: and subject To: and is subjectAdd content similar to 165.3.2.2.20 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding used for each precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be mentioned that this decoding may be implemented in several ways.PROPOSED ACCEPT.In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped" to "The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected Precoder operation (see <new subclause="">), are demapped".PagestedRemedy Change: and subject To: and is subjectResponse REJECT. The proposed text edges on the Rx implementation (one of many possible). The separationComment Type T Comment Status A Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames" SuggestedRemedy change "eight RS-FEC frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC frames" Response Response Status C</new>	7 # 427
In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped" to "The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected Precoder operation (see <new subclause="">), are demapped". Response Response Status C REJECT. The proposed text edges on the Rx implementation (one of many possible). The separation Marvell Comment Type T SuggestedRemedy change "eight RS-FEC frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC frames" Response Response Status C C</new>	E2 22 # 727
In the second paragraph of 165.3.2.3, change "The received PAM4 symbols are demapped" to "The received PAM4 symbols, after decoding the selected Precoder operation (see <new subclause="">), are demapped". Response Response Status C REJECT. The proposed text edges on the Rx implementation (one of many possible). The separation Response Response Status C Response Response Status C</new>	ζ # <u>121</u>
REJECT. change "eight RS-FEC frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC frames" The proposed text edges on the Rx implementation (one of many possible). The separation <i>Response Response Status</i> C	post-deadline, partial frame
The proposed text edges on the Rx implementation (one of many possible). The separation Response Response Response C	
The proposed text edges on the text implementation (the of many possible). The separation	
See comment #710	
Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline statu	S.

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.3 Page 43 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:06 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.4 P69 L33	# 728	C/ 165	SC 165.3.5	P 71	L 28	# 710
Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell		Jonsson, Rag	nar	Marvell		
Comment Type T Comment Status A	post-deadline, sleep signal	Comment Typ	be T	Comment Status A	po	st-deadline, partial frame
Wake signal should be composed of 16 RS frames				sistent with L=8 super frame. rect definition of 16 partial PH		
SuggestedRemedy				es per PHY frame, where ea		
change "eight RS-Frames" to "sixteen RS-Frames"		SuggestedRe	medy			
Response Response Status C ACCEPT.				o use 32 partial PHY frames that assumes 16 partial PHY		
Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status.		Response		Response Status C		
	# 075	ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPL	.E.		
	# 675	Commen	t type change	d to non-R due to post-deadl	ine status.	
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp Comment Type E Comment Status A	o, Cisco, CommScope, Marve 165.3.3 - 165.3.4	Implemer	nt changes pe	r		
Similarly, 165.3.3 through 165.3.4 are identical to clause 149	100.0.0 - 100.0.4	https://wv		g/3/cy/public/aug22/jonsson_	_tu_zimmerman_	_3cy_01_08_22_22.pdf,
SuggestedRemedy		C/ 165	SC 165.3.5	P 71	L 43	# 712
Replace 165.3.3 and 165.3.4 as follows: 165.3.3 Test-pattern generators		Jonsson, Rag		Marvell	243	<i>π</i> [1] Ζ
The test-pattern generator mode shall operate as specified in 1	49.3.3.		•	Comment Status A		at departies and the form
165.3.4 Side-stream scrambler polynomials The PCS Transmit function shall employ side-stream scramblin	ng as specified in 149.3.4.	Comment Typ There sho FEC fram	ould be 32 pa	rtial PHY frames per PHY fra		st-deadline, partial fram PHY frame has 8 RS-
Response Response Status C		SuggestedRe	medv			
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.		••	5 to 31 and 1	6 to 32nd		
Changes as proposed + update PICS		Response		Response Status C		
C/ 165 SC 165.3.5 P71 L 23	# 711	ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPL	•		
Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell		See com	ment #710			
Comment Type T Comment Status A	post-deadline, partial frame	000 0011				
There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where FEC frames.	each PHY frame has 8 RS-	Commen	t type change	d to non-R due to post-deadl	ine status.	
SuggestedRemedy						
Change 16 to 32						
Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.						
0						
See comment #710						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 165 SC 165.3.5 Page 44 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.5	P 71	L 44	# 713	C/ 165	SC 165.3.5	P 71	L 44	# 652
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			McClellan,	Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type T There should be 32 pa FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy change 450 to 1170 in	Comment Status A artial PHY frames per PHY fra		artial frame, 450 to 1170 PHY frame has 8 RS-	Suggestedi change	HY frame is 1/4 Re <i>medy</i> • "Each partial P	Comment Status A th of an RSFEC frame then it HY frame is 450 bits long, be ame is 1170 symbols long, be	ginning at S	Sn where (n mod 450) = 0."
Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPI See comment #710	Response Status C LE.				PT IN PRINCIPL mment #710	Response Status C E.		
Comment type change	ed to non-R due to post-dead	ine status.		C/ 165	SC 165.3.5	P 71	L 48	# 714
Cl 165 SC 165.3.5 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type T	P 71 General Moto Comment Status A		# 428 450 to 1170	Jonsson, R <i>Comment 1</i> There s FEC fra	<i>Type</i> T should be 32 pa	Marvell Comment Status A rtial PHY frames per PHY fran	me, where e	post-deadline, partial frame each PHY frame has 8 RS-
SuggestedRemedy Change: Each partial To: Each partial PHY Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPI	as updated, but the text is stil PHY frame is 450 bits long, b frame is 1170 bits long, begir <i>Response Status</i> C LE.	eginning at Sn v	<i>r</i> here (n mod 450) = 0.	Response ACCEF See co	e 17550 to 3627 PT IN PRINCIPL mment #710			0.
See comment #710						d to non-R due to post-deadli		
SuggestedRemedy Change the sentence t	ne is 1170 bits long, beginnin <i>Response Status</i> W		# 469 450 to 1170 mod 1170) = 0."	Suggestedi change Response ACCEF	Fype T signal should be Remedy e "eight RS-FEC	P72 Marvell Comment Status A composed of 16 RS frames frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC Response Status C		# <u>729</u> post-deadline, sleep signa
See comment #710				Commo	ent type change	d to non-R due to post-deadli	ne status.	

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn C/ 165 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

SC 165.3.6

Page 45 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P 72	L 22	# 732
Jonsson, R	agnar	Marvell		
Comment 7	Гуре E	Comment Status D		post-deadline, EZ

The description in lines 22-24 is easily misunderstood to imply a sequence of signals, as opposed to two parts of the signal.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "The first part of this cycle is known as the quiet period and lasts for a time lpi_quiet_time. The quiet period is defined in 165.3.6.2. The second part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_refresh_time." to "The one part of this cycle is known as the quiet period and lasts for a time lpi_quiet_time. The quiet period is defined in 165.3.6.2. The another part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_quiet_time. The quiet period is defined in 165.3.6.2. The another part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_quiet_time. The quiet period is defined in 165.3.6.2. The another part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_refresh_time."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Minor editorial changes relative to suggested remedy.

Change "The first part of this cycle is known as the quiet period and lasts for a time lpi_quiet_time. The quiet period is defined in 165.3.6.2. The second part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_refresh_time." to "The one part of this cycle is known as the quiet period and lasts for a time lpi_quiet_time. The quiet period is defined in 165.3.6.2. The other part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_quiet_time. The quiet period and lasts for a time lpi_refresh_time." to "The one part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_refresh_time." The quiet period is defined in 165.3.6.2. The other part of this cycle is known as the refresh period and lasts for a time lpi_refresh_time."

C/ 165	SC	165.3.6	P 72	L 28	# 733
Jonsson, I	Ragnar		Marvell		
Comment	Туре	т	Comment Status D		post-deadline, EZ
lpi_off:	set no	longer exist	s and has been replaced wi	th master and s	lave specific versions

SuggestedRemedy

replace "lpi_offset" with "lpi_master_offset, lpi_slave_offset

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status.

C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P 72	L 29	# 689
Jonsson, Ra	gnar	Marvell		
Comment Ty	pe T	Comment Status A		post-deadline

lpi_offset has been replaced with master and slave version. The values are incorrect, and it is also error prone to restate a value already defined in table 165-3.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "lpi_offset is a fixed value equal to lpi_qr_time / 2 + 4 (52 RS-FEC frame periods)." OR replace it with "The values for these timing parameters are given in Table 165-03."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Remove "lpi_offset is a fixed value equal to lpi_qr_time / 2 + 4 (52 RS-FEC frame periods)."

Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status.

C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P 73	L 10	# 690
Jonsson, Ra	gnar	Marvell		
Comment Ty	pe E	Comment Status D		post-deadline, EZ

The location of the slave refresh signal is incorrect or misleading in the Figure 165-13. It should be at location 42, not 43 (see Table 165-3)

SuggestedRemedy

Redraw location of slave refresh signal at location 42

Proposed Response	Response Status	w	
PROPOSED ACCEPT.			

C/ 165	SC 165.	3.6	P 73	L 28	# 691
Jonsson, I	Ragnar	Ν	/larvell		
Comment	Type E	Comment St	atus D		post-deadline, EZ

The location of the slave refresh signal is incorrect or misleading in the Figure 165-14. It should be at location 42, not 43 (see Table 165-3)

SuggestedRemedy

Redraw location of slave refresh signal at location 42

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.6.1	P 74	L15	# 716	C/ 165 SC 165.3.7	P 75	L 5	# 644
lonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type T	Comment Status A	pos	st-deadline, partial frame	Comment Type E	Comment Status A		
There should be 32 parti FEC frames.	al PHY frames per PHY fra	me, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-	diagrams is identical	ons listed below it seems that to clause 149. This is as it sh	ould be, but is re	
SuggestedRemedy Change "PHY frame" to	"RS-FEC frame" in lines 15	and 16.		referencing clause 14 Exceptions: 1.rfer_timer definition	19 for most of the text and figu	ires	
Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE See comment #710	Response Status C			2.Eigure 165–20–EE 3.A definition for varia related comment to r 4.Use of 25GMII inste	E transmit state diagram whe able rfer_test_lf was added, bu emove it.	it is never used in	
Comment type changed	to non-R due to post-deadli	ne status.		SuggestedRemedy			
2/ 165 SC 165.3.6.1 Graba, Jim Comment Type E Typo SuggestedRemedy Change " starting a fra Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	P 74 Broadcom <i>Comment Status</i> D ume 92" to " starting at fra <i>Response Status</i> W	L 18 me 92"	# <u>507</u> EZ	"The PCS state diagr 25GMII replaces XGI Replace the text of 10 "The PCS state diagr 25GMII replaces XGI Reference to 149.4.4 Replace the text of 10 "The PCS timers are XGMII and the follow rfer_timer Timer that is triggerer rfer_timer_done = TR Replace the text of 11 "The PCS functions a XGMII and the follow Reference to 149.3.2 Replace the text of 10 "The PCS counters a In 165.3.7.3 delete F	65.3.7.22 Variables with: am variables are as defined in VII and the following modificant .1 is replace by 165.4.4.1." 65.3.7.2.3 Timers with: as defined in 149.3.7.2.3 with ing modified definitions: and every 12.5 μ s ±1%. When the UE." 65.3.7.2.4 Functions with: are as defined in 149.3.7.2.4 v	n 149.3.7.2.3 with tions: the exception the timer reaches with the exception , Figure 165–18	h the exception that hat 25GMII replaces s its terminal count, on that 25GMII replaces and Figure 165–19 and
				Response ACCEPT IN PRINCI	Response Status C PLE.		
				Changes per comme follows:	nt except for rfer_timer definit	ion, which needs	s to be changed as
				rfer_timer Timer that is triggere rfer_timer_done = TR	d every 32.5 μs ±1%. When th	ne timer reaches	its terminal count,

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.3.7.2	1 <i>P</i> 75	L 41	# 546	C/ 165	SC 16	5.3.7.2.2	P 77	L 6	# 505
Ran, Adee	e	Cisco			Martino, K	jersti		Inneos		
Comment	Type E	Comment Status A			Comment	Туре Е	E Comn	nent Status A		
obscu	re. Wherever it is	FER_CNT_LIMIT" is longer t s used in the text or in idagra	ms, it would be e	asier for the reader to		e explicit te her definit		at lpi_refresh_deteo	ct is a boolean va	ariable for consistency
		per 16 was used instead (the having a constant is question		eady used in some	Suggested "Boole	,	e that is set TRI	JE when"		
Simila	rly for RFRX_CN	IT_LIMIT (88).			Response			nse Status C		
Suggested	Remedy				•	PT IN PRI	•			
	ce instances of F d delete the cons	RFER_CNT_LIMIT with 16, a stant definitions.	nd instances of F	RFRX_CNT_LIMIT with	See co	omment #6	644			
Response		Response Status C			C/ 165	SC 16	5.3.7.2.3	P 78	L 8	# 470
ACCE	PT IN PRINCIPL	.E.			Tu, Mike			Broadcom		
See co	omment #644				Comment	Туре Т	R Comn	nent Status A		
	<i>Type</i> E list on this page	.2 P76 Microchip Te Comment Status D supposed to be in strictly alp	5,	# 342 <i>EZ</i> If so, rf_valid should	16 FE FEC e rfer_tir	C errors w rrors within ner long e	ithin one rfer_tin n 31.25 usec, or nough to ~98 FI	ner interval. In 802	.3ch 10GBASE-T nes. For 802.3cy	e is set when there are 11 this translate to 16 y, we should keep the CASE-T1 as well.
be mo					See tu	3cv 01	08 16 2022 ndf	for additional deta	ails	
Suggested		order is intended on this page	and the next ne	an it chould be	Suggested	_ ,	00_10_2022.pdi		ano.	
cleane		inder is interided on this page	and the next pa	ye, it should be	00	,	ine 8, change "1	2.5 us" to "32.5 us	".	
PROP	Response OSED ACCEPT the order of the v	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. ariable definitions alphabetic	ally.		2. On "45.2.3 When detect zero, b FEC e	page 27, li 3.87.2 PCS read as a ng 16 or n bit 3.2324.9 rrored bloo	ine 44, add the f S high RFER (3. one, bit 3.2324. nore RS-FEC er 9 indicates that cks within one ff	ollowing: 2324.9) 9 indicates that the rored blocks within the MultiGBASE-T	e MultiGBASE-T1 none rfer_timer ir 1 PCS is detectir 8it 3.2324.9 is a n	PCS receiver is nterval. When read as a ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of
					Response ACCE	PT.	Respo	nse Status C		

C/ 165 SC 165.3.7.2.3

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.3.7.2.3	P 78	L 16	# 730	C/ 165	SC	165.3.8	P87	L1	# 645
Jonsson, R		Marvell		100	McClellan,			Marvell		
Comment T Sleep s	<i>Type</i> T ignal should be co	Comment Status A mposed of 16 RS frames		post-deadline, sleep signal	Comment It appe referen	<i>Type</i> ears that nce to 2	25GMII. TH	Comment Status A PCS management is identica his is as it should be, but is re		
S <i>uggestedF</i> change		me" to "sixteen RS-FEC fr	ame"		clause Suggested		r the entire	text.		
Response ACCEP		Response Status C			Replac	e all te	,	.8 with "PCS management is GMII."	defined in 14	9.3.8 with the exception
Comme	ent type changed to	o non-R due to post-deadlin	ne status.		Response ACCE	PT.		Response Status C		
C/ 165	SC 165.3.7.2.6	P 80 Broadcom	L 37	# 509	C/ 165	SC	165.3.8.1	P 87	L 7	# 547
Graba, Jim Co <i>mment T</i>	vpe TR	Comment Status A			Ran, Adee			Cisco		
		eliable Wake frames.			Comment	Туре	т	Comment Status A		165.3.
uggestedF					It seen	ns that	only few o	f the status variables defined	in 54.2.1 are	listed here.
Add to t	2	cription: "If the optional EEI VAKE frames."	E is suppor	ed, RX_FRAME shall be				the LPI variables seem unnerveyed over the 25GMII.	cessary, since	the LPI real-time status
Response ACCEP	PT IN PRINCIPLE.	Response Status C			The sta listed.	atus of	training pa	rameters would be important	t for managem	ent, but they are not
Per con	nment + add a nev	v PICS entry for the added	requiremer	t.				re not listed; management in		
See http informa		org/3/cy/public/aug22/grab	a_3cy_01_0	0816.pdf for background	Suggested	Remed	dy	and precoding request to the	•	
2/ 165	SC 165.3.7.3	P84	L 37	# 506	Expen	d the m	nanagemer	nt interface section per the co	omment, and f	urther as necessary.
/artino, Kie		Inneos			Response			Response Status C		
Comment T		Comment Status A			ACCE	PT IN F	PRINCIPLE			
	165-18 is missing t		the transiti	on to R_TYPE(rx_coded) =	See co	mmen	t #645			
SuggestedF Add das	R <i>emedy</i> shed line									
Response ACCEP		Response Status C								

C/ 165 SC 165.3.8.1

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.8	.3 P 87	L 45	# 548	C/ 165	SC 165.3.9.4.1	P 88	L 48	# 549
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type T	Comment Status A			Comment Typ	De E	Comment Status A		
part of the PCS mana mappings.	opback function should be liste agement, which typically only I smit function) currently does n	ists control variab	les and register	not. Ther two addit diagrams	e is no state diag onal variables. I defined elsewhe	of this subclause is comp gram in this subclause, or assume these variable d ere. conventions" subclause.	nly references to c	ther subclauses, and
SuggestedRemedy	,			SuggestedRe	medv			
	(PCS Transmit function) that	describes the effe	ect of loopback mode.	00	bclause 165.3.9	.4.1.		
			·	Response		Response Status C		
	165.3.8.3 and add a control v	ariable for loopba	ck mode instead.	•	IN PRINCIPLE.			
Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIF See comment #645	Response Status C PLE.			about pre	cedence is not n	ust reference 149.3.9.4.x nade, this subclause is n conflict. However, it can	ecessary. Withou	
Cl 165 SC 165.3.9. Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type T	1 P 88 Marvell Comment Status A artial PHY frames per PHY fra		# 717	Change: "is compo to: "specifie	osed of" s directly and by	reference"		
FEC frames.	alliai FIII IIailles pei FIII IIa	anie, where each		C/ 165	SC 165.3.9.4.3	P 89	L15	# 718
SuggestedRemedy				Jonsson, Rag	gnar	Marvell		
Change "PHY frame"	to "RS-FEC frame".			Comment Ty	be T	Comment Status A	pos	st-deadline, partial frame
Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIF	Response Status C PLE.			FEC fram	ies.	I PHY frames per PHY fr	ame, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-
See comment #710				SuggestedRe "Change	<i>medy</i> PHY frame" to "I	RS-FEC frame".		
Comment type chang	ed to non-R due to post-dead	line status.		Response		Response Status C		
C 165 SC 165.3.9	.2.1 <i>P</i> 88	L 34	# 508	ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.			
Graba, Jim	Broadcom	-01		See com	ment #710			
Comment Type TR	Comment Status A e unreliable during the beginni	ng of Wake		Commen	t type changed to	o non-R due to post-deac	lline status.	
SuggestedRemedy	pp 5-6 in graba_3cy_01_0816	0						
	Response Status C							
Response								

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.3.9.4.3 Page 50 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 S	C 165.4.2.2	P 91	L 30	# 337		C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.3	P 92	L10	# 646
Maguire, Valeri	e	Copperopolis				McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type Interface is		Comment Status D hen appearing after "MDIO" (se	ee clause 45	5 header).	EZ	Comment Type E incorrect reference for	Comment Status D the 802.3-2022 base		Ε
SuggestedRem Replace, "N	•	e" with "MDIO Interface"				SuggestedRemedy change 45.2.1.193.7 to	45.2.1.243.7		
Proposed Resp PROPOSE	oonse D ACCEPT.	Response Status W				Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
C/ 165 S	C 165.4.2.2	P 91	L 31	# 429		C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.3	P 92	L 31	# 431
Wienckowski, I	Vatalie	General Motors				Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	rs	
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		E
45.2.1.7.4 i	s in the draft.					Incorrect reference. 48	5.2.1.193.7 doesn't exist in 80	2.3-2022.	
SuggestedRem	ledy					SuggestedRemedy			
Change "45 Also P138L		lack and make it a hyperlink.				Change :45.2.1.193.7"	to "45.2.1.243.7".		
		Desmana Chatura INI				Proposed Response	Response Status W		
Proposed Resp PROPOSE	D ACCEPT.	Response Status W				PROPOSED ACCEPT			
C/ 165 S	C 165.4.2.3	P 92	L 9	# 338		C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4		L 20	# 719
Maguire, Valeri	e	Copperopolis				Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type		Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment Type T	Comment Status A	•	st-deadline, partial fram
		hen appearing after "MDIO" (s	ee clause 45	5 header).		FEC frames.	rtial PHY frames per PHY fra	me, where each	PHY frame has 6 KS-
SuggestedRem	iedy					SuggestedRemedy			
Replace, "N	MDIO interface	e" with "MDIO Interface"				Change "16th" to "32nd	d", 17550 to 36270, and 1764	45 to 36365	
Proposed Resp PROPOSE	oonse D ACCEPT.	Response Status W				Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPL	Response Status C E.		
C/ 165 S	C 165.4.2.3	P 92	L10	# 430		See comment #710			
Wienckowski, I	Natalie	General Motors				Comment type change	d to non-R due to post-deadli	no status	
Comment Type 45.2.1.7.5 i	E s in the draft.	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment type change		ne status.	
SuggestedRem Change "4		lack and make it a hyperlink.							
Proposed Resp	oonse D ACCEPT.	Response Status W							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4 Page 51 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.2 P93 L1 # 550	Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.5 P93 L 49 # 552
Ran, Adee Cisco	Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ	Comment Type E Comment Status D
Unnecessary capitalization in "Frame Delimiter", espeically in the text where "start" is not capitalized.	"When <condition" "if".<="" "then"="" "then".="" after="" be="" by="" followed="" is="" not="" should="" td="" used=""></condition">
SuggestedRemedy	Also in 165.4.2.4.6 and 165.4.2.4.7.
Change to "frame delimiter" in heading and text.	SuggestedRemedy
Proposed Response Response Status W	Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If"
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
X 165 SC 165.4.2.4.2 P 93 L 3 # 551 Ran, Adee Cisco	Delete "then" in these 3 places
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ	C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 647
Here "Octet x" (x=1 to 3) but in subsequent subclauses it is "Octx" (x=4 and above).	McClellan, Brett Marvell
uggestedRemedy	Comment Type TR Comment Status A
uggestedRemedy Change to be consistent, one way or another.	"DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC
Change to be consistent, one way or another.	"DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary."
Change to be consistent, one way or another.	"DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32.
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	"DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency.	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency.	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary."
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. / 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L 9 # 720	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. / 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L9 # 720 posson, Ragnar Marvell comment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary."
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. / 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L9 # 720 onsson, Ragnar Marvell	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P 93 L 9 # 720 ponsson, Ragnar Marvell pomment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames.	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P 93 L 9 # 720 posson, Ragnar Marvell pomment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames.	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Changes per text + update PICS
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L9 # 720 ponsson, Ragnar Marvell pomment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames. uggestedRemedy Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Changes per text + update PICS C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L51 # 471
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L9 # 720 onsson, Ragnar Marvell omment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames. uggestedRemedy Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11	 "DataSWPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSWPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Changes per text + update PICS C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L 51 # 471 Tu, Mike Broadcom
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L9 # 720 onsson, Ragnar Marvell omment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames. uggestedRemedy Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11 esponse Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Changes per text + update PICS Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L51 # 471 Tu, Mike Broadcom Comment Type TR Comment Status A
Change to be consistent, one way or another. PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. T 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L9 # 720 onsson, Ragnar Marvell comment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11 Pesponse Response Status C	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Changes per text + update PICS Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L51 # 471 Tu, Mike Broadcom Comment Type TR Comment Status A The DataSwPFC24 should be a multiple of 32, not 16.
Change to be consistent, one way or another. roposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "Octet" for consistency. 7/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3 P93 L9 # 720 onsson, Ragnar Marvell comment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames. uggestedRemedy Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11 response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See comment #710	 "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Changes per text + update PICS C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L51 # 471 Tu, Mike Broadcom Comment Type TR Comment Status A The DataSwPFC24 should be a multiple of 32, not 16. SuggestedRemedy Change this sentence to: "When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 52 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L 51 # 721	C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P96 L5 # 553
onsson, Ragnar Marvell	Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, partial frame	Comment Type T Comment Status A
There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames.	Some values in Table 165-9 are given as expressions. It is unclear why these specific expressions are used, and the values are not easier to understand this way. Also, they look
uggestedRemedy	like ranges on first reading.
Change 16 to 32.	Also in Table 165-10.
Response Response Status C	SuggestedRemedy
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Change the expressions to what they evaluate to. Add explanation in the text if necessary.
See comment #710	Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status.	Change the expressions to what they evaluate to.
C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P95 L 50 # 686	
Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza Marvel	Note that values change per comment #692/#693
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ	C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P96 L5 # 687
the definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section	Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza Marvel
SuggestedRemedy	Comment Type T Comment Status A 40ms to 30n
move these lines from line 30-32 of clause 165.4.4.1 to line 50 of clause 165.4.2.4.10 : " In	The 40ms for half-duplex is too long.
the TRAINING state, whenever SLAVE operating in loop timing locks the MASTER timing reference, it sets timing_lock_OK=1."	SuggestedRemedy
Proposed Response Response Status W	change 40ms to 30ms
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Response Response Status C
	ACCEPT.
	Vote statistics from DVL (Motion #1): YES: 11 NO: 1 ABSTAIN: 2

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Proposed Responses

C/ 165 SC 165.4.	2.4.10 <i>P</i>	96 L 5	# 692	C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.4	.10 <i>P</i> 96	L18	# 688
Jonsson, Ragnar	Mar	vell		Razavi Ma	ijomard, Seid Alir	eza Marvel		
Comment Type T The 40ms mandato	Comment Status ry half-duplex transmis	r-	oost-deadline, 40ms to 30ms uld be changed to 30ms.	Comment The 40	<i>Type</i> T)ms for half-duple	Comment Status A ex is too long.		40ms to 30ms
SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r	ns			Suggested chang	<i>Remedy</i> e 40ms to 30ms			
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status	S C		Response ACCE		Response Status C		
Vote statistics from YES: 11	nged to non-R due to p DVL (Motion #1):	ost-deadline status.		Vote s YES: ⁻ NO: 1 ABST		L (Motion #1):		
NO: 1 ABSTAIN: 2				C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.6	P 96	L 53	# 554
SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Response ACCEPT.	Mar <i>Comment Status</i> ry half-duplex transmis ns <i>Response Status</i> nged to non-R due to p	s A p sion is too long. It sho s C	# <u>693</u> bost-deadline, 40ms to 30ms uld be changed to 30ms.	It is pr "signa The fr Suggested Chang the SE Consid Response ACCE Chang	Type T requency of the S obably the nomin " (which we typic equency can be w <i>Remedy</i> e "The frequency END_S signal is". der changing "sig	nal" to "pattern". <i>Response Status</i> C E. / of the SEND_S signal s	nominal frequency on 165.5.3.6.	minal signaling rate of
				Update	e PICS as neede	d.		

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.6

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.6.	I P98	L 21	# 432		C/ 165	SC 165.4.3.1	P101	L33	# 433
Wienckowsk	ki, Natalie	General Motors				Wienckows	ki, Natalie	General Motors		
Comment Ty	vpe E	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment T	ype E	Comment Status D		E
98.5.1 is	in the draft					typo				
SuggestedRe	emedy					SuggestedF	Remedy			
	"98.5.1" to blac 3L24, P98L27	k and make it a hyperlink.						ng or quietre fresh signalling, quiet refresh signalling,		
Proposed Re PROPOS	esponse SED ACCEPT.	Response Status W				Proposed R PROPC	esponse SED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
C/ 165	SC 165.4.3	P 101	L15	# 555		C/ 165	SC 165.4.3.1	P101	L 33	# 648
Ran, Adee		Cisco				McClellan,	Brett	Marvell		
Comment Ty	vpe T	Comment Status R				Comment T	ype E	Comment Status D		E
165.4.3 a	and its subclaus	ses are gratuitous content and	a burden for	readers.		typo				
		to by any other subclause, and hich includes normative require				SuggestedF change	Re <i>medy</i> 'quietre' to 'qui	et'		
165.4.3.2 subclaus		tive requirements and is also n	ot referred to	by any other		Proposed R PROPC	esponse DSED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
SuggestedRe	emedy					C/ 165	SC 165.4.3.1	P101	L 34	# 694
00		ubclauses, or move the conten	t to an inform	native annex.		Jonsson, R	agnar	Marvell		
	vely, if there is s ation) it should b	something to write about the M	DI (e.g. mecł	nanical connnector		Comment T Misspel	ype E ling of "refresh	Comment Status D		post-deadline, E
Response		Response Status C				SuggestedF	Remedy			
REJECT	г.					Change	e "quietre fresh	signalling" to "quiet refresh sign	alling"	
		es explanation of how MDI enco nd, there is not enough materia				Proposed R PROPC	esponse SED ACCEPT	Response Status W		

C/ 165 SC 165.4.3.1

C/ 165 SC	C 165.4.3.1	P 108	L 35	# 599		C/ 165	SC	165.4.5	P 106	L 23	# 659
Jonsson, Ragna	ar	Marvell				Wu, Peter			Marvell		
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment 7	Гуре	Е	Comment Status D		E
		comment resolution for c		ote is probably		_mGig ⁻	T1 sho	uld be rep	laced with_25GigT1		
		le text for the note is sugg	ested.			Suggestedl	Remea	ly			
SuggestedRem									ink_control and link_status ar		
		suggested text for the note t 150 ns following a transit							1, respectively, by the Auto-N onal Auto-Negotiation functio		
Proposed Resp		Response Status W	·			variable	és link_	_control a	nd link_status are designated	as link_cont	trol_25GigT1 and
PROPOSE	D REJECT.								espectively, by the Auto-Nego onal Auto-Negotiation functio		
This is a co	ny of comment	#333 against D1.3. That	comment was r	ejected there is no	`	Proposed F	,	•	Response Status W		
	osition of the T				,	PROPO	DSED	ACCEPT.	,		
C/ 165 SC	C 165.4.4.1	P 103	L 29	# 685		C/ 165	SC	165.5	P107	L1	# 556
Razavi Majoma	rd, Seid Alireza	a Marvel				Ran, Adee			Cisco		
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment 7	ype	Е	Comment Status R		PMA definition structur
timing-lock_	_OK is not mer	tioned in the state diagrar	n			Should	n't PM	A electrica	al specifications be under the	PMA main s	ubclause (165.4)?
SuggestedRem	edy					Suggestedl	Remea	ly			
	rom clause 165 page 95, line 5	5.4.4.1 should be moved to	o clause 165.4.2	2.4.10 startup		Consid	er mov	ing the hi	erarchy of 165.5 to become 1	65.4.6.	
Proposed Resp		s Response Status W				Response			Response Status C		
	D ACCEPT.					REJEC	т.				
						The cu	rrent C	lause 165	structure follows closely the	structure us	ed for other BASE-T/T1
C/ 165 SC	C 165.4.4.1	P 103	L 30	# 649				E Std 80			
McClellan, Bret		Marvell									
Comment Type	-	Comment Status D			ΕZ						
0-	_	but never used as a state	machine variat	ble							
SuggestedRem	,										
	ition for timing										
Dropood Doop	onse F	Response Status W									
Proposed Resp	D ACCEPT.										

C/ 165 SC 165.5

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC	165.5.1	P 107	L 5	# 557	C/ 165	SC 165.5.1		P 107	L 38	# 515
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Grow, Rob	ert		RMG Conslu	ting	
Comment Type	T Comm	nent Status R		PMA definition structure	Comment T	Гуре Е	Comment	Status D		
	are functional speci normal transmit fun			der 165.4.2.2 (they	IEEE S point.	Style Manual 16	3.3.2 also says	to use space s	eparators to the	right of the decima
SuggestedReme	edy				Suggested	Remedy				
Move 165.5.1	1 to become 165.4.	2.2.2.			If not c	hanged to 0.87	8 906 25 GHz,	should be 878	.906 25 MHz.	
Add a referer mode or trans		es to 165.4.2.2 (wh	ich currently only	y has normal operation	Proposed F PROP	Response DSED REJECT	Response S	Status W		
Response	Respo	nse Status C			This is	on IEEE 802 2	exception to th	o IEEE ctulo n	anual	
REJECT.									ements/words.h	ntml#numbers
	Clause 165 structur EE Std 802.3-2022		e structure used	for other BASE-T/T1	instead					lanual: Use spaces ands (e.g., 62 000,
C/ 165 SC	165.5.1	P 107	L 37	# 558	000, 50	1 4000).				
					Digita t	o the right of th	a decimal nain	+		
Ran, Adee		Cisco								
Comment Type	• • • • • • •	nent Status A	luce due noise ef		>>Do r		separators in th		right of the deci	mal point or include
Comment Type	shall provide acces	nent Status A	duced version of	the transmit symbol	>>Do r	not include any	separators in th		right of the deci	mal point or include # 559
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_	shall provide acces	nent Status A s to a frequency rec	duced version of	the transmit symbol	>>Do r trailing	not include any zeros in tables SC 165.5.1	separators in th	ne digits to the	-	•
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX "reduced vers	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u	nent Status A s to a frequency rec	duced version of	the transmit symbol	>>Do r trailing C/ 165	ot include any zeros in tables SC 165.5.1	separators in th	P 108 Cisco	-	•
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers	shall provide acces TCLK_879"	nent Status A s to a frequency rec	duced version of	the transmit symbol	>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment T</i> "Test n	ot include any zeros in tables SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en	separators in the or in text.<<	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi	L8 t error ratio of th	# <u>559</u> ne link including the
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u	nent Status A s to a frequency rec nclear. 90625 MHz"			>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment T</i> "Test n FEC er	ot include any zeros in tables SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en	Comment con in text.<<	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi	L8 t error ratio of th	# 559
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_" "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque	nent Status A s to a frequency rec nclear. 90625 MHz"			>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment T</i> "Test n FEC er connec	SC 165.5.1 SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en ncoder/decoder sting two PHYs'	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog	L8 t error ratio of th front ends of the	# <u>559</u> he link including the e PHY, and a cable
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not SuggestedRement Change to "the PHY sha with divisor 1	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque edy all provide access to 16, referred to as T>	nent Status A s to a frequency rec inclear. 90625 MHz" ncy. And this is and o a frequency-divide	d exact value wit		>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment T</i> "Test n FEC er connec The de the RS	SC 165.5.1 SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en ncoder/decoder ting two PHYs' scription in the -FEC block error	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog his paragraph i ot the BER; ea	L 8 t error ratio of th front ends of the mplies that what	# <u>559</u> ne link including the
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not SuggestedRement Change to "the PHY sha with divisor 1 878.90625 M	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque edy all provide access to 16, referred to as T> //Hz".	nent Status A s to a frequency rec nclear. 90625 MHz" ncy. And this is and c a frequency-divide (_TCLK_879. The r	d exact value wit	h no tolerance. transmit symbol clock,	>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment T</i> "Test n FEC er connec The de the RS once, r Also, w	SC 165.5.1 SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en node 7 is for en noder/decoder ting two PHYs' scription in the -FEC block error not as the numb	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and remainder of th or ratio (rfer), no per of nonzero b g such a test, h	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog his paragraph i ot the BER; ea oits. ere are typicall	L 8 t error ratio of th front ends of the mplies that what ch errored block y two PHYs invo	# <u>559</u> the link including the e PHY, and a cable t is actually measur k is counted as an e
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not SuggestedRement Change to "the PHY sha with divisor 1 878.90625 M Response	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque edy all provide access to 16, referred to as T> //Hz". <i>Respo</i>	nent Status A s to a frequency rec inclear. 90625 MHz" ncy. And this is and o a frequency-divide	d exact value wit	h no tolerance. transmit symbol clock,	>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment T</i> "Test n FEC er connec The de the RS once, r Also, w Althoug	SC 165.5.1 SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en noder/decoder ting two PHYs' scription in the -FEC block error not as the numb	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and remainder of th or ratio (rfer), no per of nonzero h g such a test, h le is defined for	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog his paragraph i ot the BER; ea oits. ere are typicall r a transmitter i	L 8 t error ratio of th front ends of the mplies that what ch errored block y two PHYs invo	# <u>559</u> he link including the e PHY, and a cable t is actually measur c is counted as an e
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not SuggestedRement Change to "the PHY sha with divisor 1 878.90625 M	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque edy all provide access to 16, referred to as T> //Hz". <i>Respo</i>	nent Status A s to a frequency rec nclear. 90625 MHz" ncy. And this is and c a frequency-divide (_TCLK_879. The r	d exact value wit	h no tolerance. transmit symbol clock,	>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment T</i> "Test n FEC er connec The de the RS once, r Also, w Althoug measu	SC 165.5.1 SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en ncoder/decoder ting two PHYs' scription in the -FEC block error not as the numb then performing the test mod red in a receive	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and remainder of th or ratio (rfer), no per of nonzero b g such a test, h	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog his paragraph i ot the BER; ea oits. ere are typicall r a transmitter i	L 8 t error ratio of th front ends of the mplies that what ch errored block y two PHYs invo	# <u>559</u> the link including the e PHY, and a cable t is actually measur k is counted as an e
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not SuggestedRement Change to "the PHY sha with divisor 1 878.90625 M Response ACCEPT IN I	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque edy all provide access to 16, referred to as T> //Hz". <i>Respo</i> PRINCIPLE.	nent Status A s to a frequency rec nclear. 90625 MHz" ncy. And this is and b a frequency-divide < <u>TCLK_879</u> . The r nse Status C	d exact value wit	h no tolerance. transmit symbol clock,	>>Do r trailing <i>Cl</i> 165 Ran, Adee <i>Comment</i> T "Test n FEC er connec The de the RS once, r Also, w Althoug measu	SC 165.5.1 SC 165.5.1 Type T node 7 is for en ncoder/decoder scription in the -FEC block error not as the numb when performing the test mod red in a receive Remedy	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and r remainder of th or ratio (rfer), no per of nonzero h g such a test, h le is defined for er of the other F	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog his paragraph i ot the BER; ea oits. ere are typicall r a transmitter i	L 8 t error ratio of th front ends of the mplies that what ch errored block y two PHYs invo	# <u>559</u> the link including the e PHY, and a cable t is actually measur k is counted as an e
Comment Type " the PHY s clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not SuggestedRement Change to "the PHY shawith divisor 1 878.90625 M Response ACCEPT IN 1	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque edy all provide access to 16, referred to as T> //Hz". <i>Respo</i>	nent Status A s to a frequency rec nclear. 90625 MHz" ncy. And this is and b a frequency-divide < <u>TCLK_879</u> . The r nse Status C	d exact value wit	h no tolerance. transmit symbol clock,	>>Do r trailing Cl 165 Ran, Adee Comment T "Test n FEC er connec The de the RS once, r Also, w Althoug measu Suggested Chang "Test n in a lini	scription in the test mod red in a receive <i>Remedy</i> to be tween two N	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and r remainder of th or ratio (rfer), no per of nonzero l g such a test, h le is defined for er of the other F entence to abling measure	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog his paragraph i ot the BER; ea bits. ere are typicall a transmitter i PHY. ement of the R g RS-FEC enco	L8 t error ratio of th front ends of the mplies that what ch errored block y two PHYs invo n one PHY, the S-FEC block erro	# <u>559</u> the link including the e PHY, and a cable t is actually measur k is counted as an e
clock or TX_ "reduced vers "TX_TCLK_8 A clock is not SuggestedRement Change to "the PHY sha with divisor 1 878.90625 M Response ACCEPT IN I	shall provide access TCLK_879" rsion" and "or" are u 879 is equal to 878. ot equal to its freque edy all provide access to 16, referred to as T> //Hz". <i>Respo</i> PRINCIPLE.	nent Status A s to a frequency rec nclear. 90625 MHz" ncy. And this is and b a frequency-divide < <u>TCLK_879</u> . The r nse Status C	d exact value wit	h no tolerance. transmit symbol clock,	>>Do r trailing Cl 165 Ran, Adee Comment T "Test n FEC er connec The de the RS once, r Also, w Althoug measu Suggested Chang "Test n in a lini	scription in the test mod red in a receive <i>Remedy</i> to be tween two N	<i>Comment</i> abling measure , transmit and r remainder of th or ratio (rfer), no per of nonzero b g such a test, h le is defined for er of the other F entence to abling measure PHYs, including	P 108 P 108 Cisco Status A ement of the bi receive analog his paragraph i ot the BER; ea oits. ere are typicall e a transmitter i PHY. ement of the R g RS-FEC encreance acting the PHYS	L8 t error ratio of th front ends of the mplies that what ch errored block y two PHYs invo n one PHY, the S-FEC block erro	# <u>559</u> he link including the e PHY, and a cable t is actually measur k is counted as an e olved, not just one. rfer can only be

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn C/ 165 SC 165.5.1 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 57 of 78

8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165	5.5.1.1 P108	L 14	# 560	C/ 165	SC 165.5.1.1	P 109	L3	# 562
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
comment Type T	Comment Status A			Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status A		
The figures seem measurement ins	n to show test setups of transmitte struments. These are not test fixtu	rs or receivers, wit res - which are so	th external metimes part of test	Why is	a balun required	for measuring transmitter	jitter?	
has specified tes	xample Figure 97B–2, Figure 97B t fixtures in 165.5.5.			one; if a		165-30 seems sufficient, a use a single-ended scope ent setup.		
I found the uses perpetuated.	of "test fixture" in this context in cla	ause 149, but this	error should not be	Suggested	-	d add " and iittar" to the titl	a of figure 16E 20	
uggestedRemedy					figure 153-32 an	d add " and jitter" to the title	e of figure 165-30.	
Change the subc figure titles.	lause title to "Test setups" and ch	ange "fixture" to "s	setup" in the text and	Response ACCEF	PT IN PRINCIPL	Response Status C E.		
Response ACCEPT IN PRII	Response Status C			Delete	Figure 165-32 a	nd add " and jitter" to the tit	le of Figure 165-3	0.
	- 			C/ 165	SC 165.5.1.1	P 109	L11	# 354
in the text and fig	clause title to "Test configurations"	and change "fixtu	re" to "configuration"	Fischer, Pe	eter	BKS Kabel-	Service AG	
0	,			Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status A		
/ 165 SC 165	5.5.1.1 P108	L18	# 561	Output	of the balun sho	uld be specified		
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Suggested	Remedy			
Comment Type E				Define	output impedand	e for the balun in relation to	o the digital scope	e/ capturing device
	nication only" - unclear. As oppose	ed to what?		Response		Response Status C		
uggestedRemedy				ACCEF	PT IN PRINCIPL	E.		
Either clarify wha	at it means, or delete this phrase.			0				
Response	Response Status C			See co	mment #562			
REJECT.				C/ 165	SC 165.5.1.1	P 109	L 19	# 355
This statement ir	nplies data channel only, not the c	ontrol channel		Fischer, Pe	eter	BKS Kabel-	Service AG	
				<i>Comment 7</i> Output	<i>Type</i> T of the balun sho	Comment Status R uld be specified		
				Suaaested	Remedv			
				Suggestedl Define	-	e for the balun in relation to	o the Spectrum ar	nalyser
				Define	-		o the Spectrum ar	nalyser
				00	output impedanc	e for the balun in relation to Response Status C	o the Spectrum ar	nalyser

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.5.1.1 Page 58 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

		-			•				
C/ 165 SC 165.5.	2 P 109	L 41	# 434	C/ 165	SC 165.5.2	P115	L 26	# 437	
Vienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	5		Wienckow	ski, Natalie	General Motors			
Comment Type T	Comment Status A			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			Eź
As only 1 pair is use	ed, we don't need a subscript on t	he lines.		gramr	nar				
SuggestedRemedy				Suggestee	lRemedy				
In Figure 165-34, re and DL <n>.</n>	move subscript "i" from SL, S	L <n>, Signal <</n>	:p>, Signal <n>, DL,</n>		je: is used re used				
Response	Response Status C			Proposed	Response	Response Status W			
ACCEPT.				PROF	OSED ACCEPT.				
C/ 165 SC 165.5.	2 <i>P</i> 110	L1	# 695	C/ 165	SC 165.5.2	P 117	L 25	# 438	
onsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Wienckow	ski, Natalie	General Motors			
Comment Type T	Comment Status A	p	ost-deadline, source lane	Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			E
	is probably obsoleted, given that	802.3cy no loi	nger supports 50Gbps	Claus	e 45 is in the draf	t.			
and 100Gbps.				Suggestee	lRemedy				
uggestedRemedy				Chang	e "Clause 45" to	black and make it a hyperlink.			
Remove reference t	6			Proposed	Response	Response Status W			
Response	Response Status C			PROF	OSED ACCEPT.				
ACCEPT IN PRINC	IPLE.								
See comment #435									
C 165 SC 165.5.	2 P110	L 1	# 435						
Vienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	3							
Comment Type T	Comment Status A		source lane						
Remove refereces t	to the subscript "i" in the text.								
SuggestedRemedy									
negative sides of th lane (DL) signals Dl end's differential sig To: Note that the si sides of the transmi	the source lane (SL) signals SLi< e transmitter end's differential sig Li and DLi <n> are the positive gnal pair on lane i. Durce lane (SL) signals SL and tter end's differential signal pair a are the positive and negative side</n>	nal pair on lan and negative d SL <n> are th nd the destina</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver ne positive and negative tion lane (DL) signals						
Response	Response Status C								

Response

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.5.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.5.3	P 110	L	# 569		C/ 165	SC 1	65.5.3	P110	L 33	# 566
Ran, Adee		Cisco				Ran, Adee			Cisco		
Comment Ty	pe T	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment T	Гуре	т	Comment Status D		E
insertion time, and In high-sp among th high-loss easily ha addition t	loss of almos d no option or peed backplar ne important T channel can ndled by the a to placing unn	nsmitter operating above 14 30 dB at the Nyquist freques specification for transmitter and copper cable PHYs, x parameters; without spec create a large precursor ISI nalog front end, and can im ecessary equalization burde ement Tx equalization than	ency, has no spei equalization (pre- transition time an ifying them, a slov at the receiver in apact the linearity en on receivers (it	fication of transition -emphasis). Id Tx equalization an w transmitter over a put. Such ISI is not of receiver circuits, : is much cheaper in	e	subclau	use." connec Table 1 Remedy	tor is that 165-12. /	r has been included in the tra ? The MDI connector is not s <i>Response Status</i> W	·	ications defined in this
SuggestedRe	emedy							REJECT.			
		cification for transmitter ma o 80%, as in 130.7.1, or ma		time (a possible limi	t	No spe	cific ch	anges we	re proposed.		
example	of how this ca	cursor equalization function n be specified.	to the transmitter	; see 130.7.1.10 for	an	C/ 165 Jonsson, R	agnar	65.5.3	P 110 Marvell	L 34	# 696
Proposed Re PROPOS	SED REJECT.	Response Status W				<i>Comment T</i> The sin		E itence par	Comment Status D ragraph is not clear.		post-deadline, E
No speci	fic changes w	ere proposed at this time.				SuggestedF					
Ran, Adee Comment Ty		P110 Cisco Comment Status A all be AC-coupled"	L 26	# 565		Proposed R PROPC	Respon: DSED F	se REJECT.	tence paragraph OR amend Response Status W ne indicated text is unclear.	it such that its n	neaning becomes clear.
A transm and outp		y output, but this is a full-du	plex PHY so ther	e are no separate ir	iput	Cl 165 Ran, Adee	SC 1	65.5.3.2	P 110 Cisco	L 5	# 563
SuggestedRe Change t	-	ase to "The transmitter sha	II be AC-coupled'	,		Comment T		T on" - the	Comment Status D "D" in SNDR stands for disto	ortion.	E
Response ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPL	Response Status C E.				SuggestedF Delete	-				
Changes	per comment	. Update PICS as needed.				Proposed R PROPC	,		Response Status W		

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC

C/ 165 SC 165.5.3.2 Page 60 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.5.3.3	P 110	L 25	# 564		C/ 165	SC 165.5.3.6	P110	L37	# 567
Ran, Adee		Cisco				Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D			ΕZ	Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status D		EZ
"Time	Interval Error" - ca	pitalization is not needed.				Is there	e no specification	for the Tx clock frequency o	f the SLAVE PH	Y?
Also in	165.5.3.3.1 (line	36).						ort-term rate of variation of th		
S <i>uggested</i> Chang	<i>Remedy</i> e to lower case.							e should be specified - just a ely, the same maximum rate		or the MASTER (and
Proposed I	Response OSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W						state that when the master to that of the MASTER due		smit mode, the SLAVE
						Suggestedl	Remedy			
C/ 165	SC 165.5.3.4	P 112	L 25	# 459		Per cor	nment			
John Abbo	ott	Corning Incorp	orated			Proposed F	Response	Response Status W		
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D			ΕZ	PROPO	OSED REJECT.			
freque 25Gb/s	ncy limit "5" in eq s, since every othe	165-12 and 165-13 to clause uation 165-13 should scale a er limit in clause 165 is the 1 was used in clause 149 for 2	as one goes fro 49 limits x 2.5 (m 2.5 to 5 to 10 to	r	No cha	nges to text prop	osed.		
Suggested	Remedy									
scale "	5 MHz" in 165-13	if appropriate. Thank you!								
	Response	Response Status W								

C/ 165 SC 165.5.3.6

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	4.1 <i>P</i> 113	L 52	# 568	C/ 165	SC 165.5.4.2	P 114	L 30	# 510
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Sedarat, Ho	ossein	Ethernovia		
Comment Type T	Comment Status A			Comment T	ype TR	Comment Status A		
	after RS-FEC decoding (As st a "shall" on the receiver's inp		r comments), and			and bandwidth are taken fror aling bandwidth is 2.5x wide		and are not correct for
Also in 165.5.4.2.				SuggestedF	Remedy			
SuggestedRemedy						e 3500 MHz with 8750 MHz		
	-FEC frame error rate, with the	appropriate value			6 dBm/HZ (to n	naintain the same noise pow	er over the new t	oandwidth)
	ceived" to "are expected to be			Response	Ŧ	Response Status C		
Response	Response Status C			ACCEP	1.			
ACCEPT IN PRINC	IPLE.			C/ 165	SC 165.5.5	P114	L35	# 734
Page fixed to 113.				DiMinico, C	hristopher	MC Commur	nications	
Change from:				Comment T	ype T	Comment Status A		post-deadline
	oletion. This specification can l	oe verified by a frai G or greater than 2		fixture a		ore I suggest keeping the mir		consistent with
7.8 × 10^–9 for 800 Change to:		Ū.	220-octet IPG.	My com		2 for all test fixture specificat ess the test fixture minimum MDI RL max.		
Change to: Differential signals r within the specificati expected to be deco the 25GMII after link for 800 octet frames	received at the MDI that were t ions of 165.5.3 and have pass oded with a BER less than 10^ < reset completion. The frame s with minimum IPG or greater	ransmitted from a ed through a link s -12 after RS-FEC error ratio shall be	remote transmitter pecified in 165.7 are decoding, and sent to less than 7.8 × 10^–9	My com be addr <i>SuggestedF</i> In 165.5 MHz. In 165.5 frequen	ment is to addr essed with the <i>Remedy</i> 5.5.3.1 Insertion 5.5.3.2 Return lo cy range in this	ess the test fixture minimum MDI RL max. loss equation(165–17) and oss equation(165–20)change subclause line 10.	frequency. The (165–18) change min frequency t	max frequency should e min frequency to 1 to 1 MHz also include
Change to: Differential signals r within the specificati expected to be decc the 25GMII after link for 800 octet frames Update PICS	received at the MDI that were t ions of 165.5.3 and have pass oded with a BER less than 10^ < reset completion. The frame s with minimum IPG or greater	ransmitted from a led through a link s –12 after RS-FEC error ratio shall be than 220-octet IPC	remote transmitter pecified in 165.7 are decoding, and sent to less than 7.8 × 10^–9 3.	My com be addr <i>SuggestedF</i> In 165.5 MHz. In 165.5 frequen In 165.5	ment is to addr essed with the semedy 5.5.3.1 Insertion 5.5.3.2 Return lo cy range in this 5.5.3.3 Mode Co	ess the test fixture minimum MDI RL max. loss equation(165–17) and oss equation(165–20)change	frequency. The (165–18) change min frequency t change min frequ	max frequency should e min frequency to 1 to 1 MHz also include uency to 1 MHz.
Change to: Differential signals r within the specificati expected to be deco the 25GMII after link for 800 octet frames Update PICS C/ 165 SC 165.5.	received at the MDI that were t ions of 165.5.3 and have pass oded with a BER less than 10^ < reset completion. The frame s with minimum IPG or greater 4.2 P114	ransmitted from a ed through a link s -12 after RS-FEC error ratio shall be	remote transmitter pecified in 165.7 are decoding, and sent to less than 7.8 × 10^–9	My com be addr <i>SuggestedF</i> In 165.5 MHz. In 165.5 frequen In 165.5	ment is to addr essed with the semedy 5.5.3.1 Insertion 5.5.3.2 Return lo cy range in this 5.5.3.3 Mode Co	ess the test fixture minimum MDI RL max. loss equation(165–17) and oss equation(165–20)change subclause line 10. onversion equation(165–21)c	frequency. The (165–18) change min frequency t change min frequ	max frequency should e min frequency to 1 to 1 MHz also include uency to 1 MHz.
Change to: Differential signals r within the specificati expected to be decc the 25GMII after link for 800 octet frames Update PICS	received at the MDI that were t ions of 165.5.3 and have pass oded with a BER less than 10^ < reset completion. The frame s with minimum IPG or greater	ransmitted from a led through a link s –12 after RS-FEC error ratio shall be than 220-octet IPC	remote transmitter pecified in 165.7 are decoding, and sent to less than 7.8 × 10^–9 3.	My com be addr SuggestedF In 165.5 MHz. In 165.5 frequen In 165.5 Response	ment is to addr essed with the semedy 5.5.3.1 Insertion 5.5.3.2 Return lo cy range in this 5.5.3.3 Mode Co	ess the test fixture minimum MDI RL max. loss equation(165–17) and subclause line 10. onversion equation(165–21)ck k equation(165–22)change n <i>Response Status</i> C	frequency. The (165–18) change min frequency t change min frequ	max frequency should e min frequency to 1 to 1 MHz also include uency to 1 MHz.

Add an arrow between Differential directional coupler and Receiver and mark is as "<0.5m"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165	Page 62 of 78
SC 165.5.5	8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.5.5.1	P 114	L 50	# 723	C/ 165	SC 165.7	P 118	L 4	# 570
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		post-deadline, EZ	Comment T	ype T	Comment Status D		EZ
	meaning in multiplying with the litiplication in the coefficients					vs "single shielded balanced p d, balanced conductors".	air of conductors	s", the second says
SuggestedRemedy				Either u	se consistent	language, or say it once.		
5	0480, 0.51054 to 0.17018, a Id be made to equation (165-					that is shielded (not each con saying because it is "pair", no		also balanced.
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Also, th	e term "link se	gment" appears in the headin	g but not in the t	text.
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				SuggestedF	Remedy			
 C/ 165 SC 165.5.5.1	P115	L 3	# 436	Change	the text to			
	General Motor		# 430	25GBA	SE-T1 is desia	ned to operate over link segm	ents compring a	a shielded balanced pair
Wienckowski, Natalie	Comment Status D	5	EZ	of cond	uctors that me	et the requirements specified	in this subclaus	e. This link segment
Comment Type E awkward working			EZ	support	s an effective of	data rate of 25 Gb/s in each d	irection simultar	neously.
0				Change	"link segment	t pair" to "link segment" across	s the draft.	
	insertion loss of the TP2 or ⁻ tion loss at TP2 or TP3 of the		5	Proposed R PROPC	esponse ISED ACCEPT	Response Status W		
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Comme	nt type change	ed to T		
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.	1 P118	L18	# 698
C/ 165 SC 165.5.5.2	P115	L 32	# 697	Jonsson, R	agnar	Marvell		
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Comment T	•	Comment Status D		post-deadline, Ez
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		post-deadline, EZ			s inconsistent with other notat	ions for "f" in thi	1 1
	ntical to (165-15), apart from		tfref" instead of "htfref".	inconsis	stent with line 2	23 and the first use of "f" in eq	uation (165-23)	
It would simplify/clarify t	he spec to define only one "ti	ref" limit.		SuggestedF	Remedy			
SuggestedRemedy				Remove	e the subscripe	ot "MHz" from "f" in equation (165-23)	
	-16) and change "htfref" in ec	uation (165-15) to "tfref"	Proposed R	esponse	Response Status W		
Eliminate equation (165								

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.1

7 165	SC 165.7.1.1	P1	18	L18	# 571	
Ran, Adee		Cisco				
Comment 7	Гуре Е	Comment Status	D			EZ
	ation 165-23, f is o on; f_MHz is unde	defined "in MHz", so fined.	there is	s no need to have	e "MHz" in the	
Suggestedl	Remedy					
Changf	fe "f_MHz" to "f" i	n the equation.				
Proposed F PROP(Response DSED ACCEPT.	Response Status	w			
2/ 165	SC 165.7.1.1	P1	18	L 22	# 460	
John Abbo	tt	Corni	ng Inco	rporated		
comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status	R			10G
max fre 2.5 for	equency Fmax = 4 25Gb/s. Hence	5.7 in clause 165 to 4000*S (equation 14 clause 149 would le 0MHz., rather than	l9-17) ∖ ad one	where S=1 for 100 to think clause 16	Gb/s and S would S5 should have	d =
uggestedl	Remedy					
		in section 165.7.1.1 ead of 10,000 may				
Response		Response Status	с			
REJEC	T.	-				
		his change based c cutoff does provide				oling

C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.1	P118	L 27	# 572
Ran, Adee		Cisco		
0		0		

Comment Type Comment Status R т

"The insertion loss is illustrated in Figure 165-40"

Figure 165-40 does not illustrate an insertion loss of any link segment. It illustrates the limit imposed by equation 165-23.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the first sentence to "The insertion loss of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet Equation (165-23) as illustrated in Figure 165-40".

In the figure add a label "meets equation constraints" above the curve, and change the title to "Link segment insertion loss limit".

Delete the quoted sentence.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

The proposed change does not add clarity and creates a potential ambiguity with the new "shall" statement covering Figure 165-40.

C/ 165	SC ·	165.7.1.	P1	18	<i>L</i> Figure	# 593	
Stephan Sc	hreine	r	Rose	enberg	er Hochfrequenztechnik		
Comment T	уре	Е	Comment Status	D			EZ
X-Axes	Grid is	s very de	nse.				
SuggestedF	Remed	'y					
Using a	freque	ency ste	of 500 MHz for the	grid ins	stead of 250 MHz.		

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.1

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.2	P 119	L 3	# 573	C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3	.1 <i>P</i> 119	L 23	# 575	
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Ran, Adee	•	Cisco			
Comment Type T Con	nment Status R			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			ΕZ
The differential charateristic in it should appear before 165.7.		ly to the insertio	n loss specification, so		ize mismatch in " 165.7.1.3.1 and				
This statement does not need	a standalone subclau	use, it can be ac	lded to 165.7.1.	Suggested Correc	<i>Remedy</i> t the font size				
Also, the statement is repeate	d in 165.7.1.3.1.			Proposed	Response	Response Status W			
SuggestedRemedy					, OSED ACCEPT.	,			
Move the content of this subcl	ause to 165.7.1 and o	delete this subcl	ause heading.						
Delete the sentence "The refe 165.7.1.3.1.	rence impedance for	the return loss s	specification is 100 Ω " in	C/ 165 Stephan S	SC 165.7.1.3		L Figure Hochfrequenztechn	# <u>594</u> nik	
	anaa Statua			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			ΕZ
Response Resp REJECT.	oonse Status C			X-Axes the X-/	s grid starts at 1 I Axis Grid is very	MHz, which is different to the t dense.	igures before and a	after.Additionally,	
The TF believes the current or	ganization is more re	adable and eas	er to find given that it	Suggested	Remedy				
has its own subclause (same i 1000BASE-T). No changes to	n Clauses 149, 96, et			Start t of 250		at 0 MHz and use a frequent	cy step of 500 MHz	for the grid instea	ad
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3	P119	L 5	# 574	Proposed	Response	Response Status W			
Ran, Adee	Cisco			PROP	OSED ACCEPT.				
Comment Type E Con	nment Status R			C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3	.1 <i>P</i> 119	<i>L</i> Figure	# 595	
The term "Return loss" is strict	tly adequate for the co	ontent of 165.7.	1.3.1.	Stephan S		-	Hochfrequenztechn		
The other subclauses under 1 reflections as well as insertion	loss between them, s			Comment There		Comment Status D line at the 1 MHz position.			ΕZ
"Return loss". This hierarchy s	nouid be natteried.			Suggested	IRemedy				
SuggestedRemedy				Remo	ve the vertical blu	e line at the 1 MHz position.			
Delete the subclause heading loss".	or 165.7.1.3.1, mergi	ng its content in	to 165.7.1.3 Return	Proposed	Response OSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W			
Promote subclauses 165.7.1.3 through 165.7.1.6.	3.2 through 165.7.1.3.	4 in the hierarch	ny to become 165.7.1.4		OSED ACCELL.				
Response Resp	oonse Status C								
REJECT.									
The TF believes the current or has its own subclause (same i 1000BASE-T). No changes to	n Clauses 149, 96, et								

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.1 Page 65 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

ΕZ

ΕZ

ΕZ

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P120	L1	# 699	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.	2 P 120	L 6	# 392
Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell			Marris, Arthur	Cadence De	sign Systems	
Comment Type E Comment Status D the word "Noise" should not be captialized		post-deadline, EZ	Comment Type ER XXX	Comment Status D		EZ, Table 165-15
SuggestedRemedy Change "Noise" to "noise".			SuggestedRemedy Change name of "Table	165–15—XXX" to somethin	ng more meaningful	
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE.		
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P120	L 6	# 439	See comment #439			
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Comment Type E Comment Status D		EZ, Table 165-15	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3. Hidaka, Yasuo	-	L 6 conductor, Inc.	# 464
The table needs a title SuggestedRemedy Table 165-15-Echo Metrics Parameters			Comment Type E Missing caption of table SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status D 165-15.		EZ, Table 165-15
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.				h as "Parameters of echo m Response Status W	netrics."	
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P 120 Ran, Adee Cisco	L 6	# 579	PROPOSED ACCEPT	N PRINCIPLE.		
Comment Type E Comment Status D The title of Table 165-15 seems like a placeholder.		EZ, Table 165-15	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.	-	L 47	# 580
SuggestedRemedy Use an appropriate title.			Ran, Adee <i>Comment Type</i> T What is K in equation 19	Cisco Comment Status D		
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.			Table 165-15 has N but			
See comment #439			Correct if necessary.			
			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE.		
			Change to N			

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3.	2 <i>P</i> 121	L 9	# 581	C/ 165 SC	165.7.1.3.2	P 121	L 36	# 704		
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Jonsson, Ragnar		Marvell				
Comment 7	Гуре Е	Comment Status D		EZ	Comment Type	T Co	mment Status A		post-deadlir		
to be se	een, others (like	31, 165-33 may need some the subscript k in 165-31) a h the rest of the equations.			become too d	different to be de	e ETM algorithm, the R escribed in one sequer separate sections.		lculations have steps. Therefore, they		
Suggestedl	Remedy				SuggestedRemed	dy					
Improv	e if possible								ic (REM)" that includes		
Proposed F	,	Response Status W			steps 1 through 5. Create another sub-section titled "Calculating Echo Tail Metric (ETM)" containing steps 6 through 8.						
PROPO	OSED ACCEPT I	N PRINCIPLE.			Response	Res	sponse Status C				
	will attempt to incons at this time.	rease the equation size. The	ney were already	drawn as large	ACCEPT IN F	-					
C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3.	2 <i>P</i> 121	L13	# 582	Changes per	comment but us	se Level 5 heading ins	tead of Level 6.			
Ran, Adee		Cisco	L 13	# 382	Comment typ	be changed to no	on-R due to post-dead	ine status.			
Comment 7		Comment Status D		EZ	C/ 165 SC	165.7.1.3.2	P122	L 1	# 583		
	51	ould be formatted as in the	equation.		Ran, Adee	105.7.1.5.2	Cisco	21	# 303		
Also fo	r Pr in step 4				Comment Type	E Co	mment Status D				
Suggested	•						e tidying up. Some lette		to be seen. The Sigma		
		ot formats as necessary.			signs are too	small and unalig	gned with the rest of th	e equations.			
Proposed F		Response Status W					setting the span of the				
	DSED ACCEPT.						to this estimate. There ble does not require su				
					e.g. using the	e length of the ca	able and an approxima	te speed of light	in the medium, or		
C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3.	2 P 121	L13	# 700	using "group	delay" which is a	a readily available from	n measurements.			
Jonsson, R	0	Marvell			SuggestedRemed	dy					
Comment 7	51	Comment Status D		post-deadline, EZ	Tidy up the e	quation or replac	ce it with less prescript	tive text.			
the "n"	in "hn" should be	subscript			Proposed Respor		sponse Status W				
Suggestedl	,				PROPOSED	ACCEPT IN PR	RINCIPLE.				
0	e "n" in "hn" to su	bscript			Editor will atte	empt to increase	e the equation size. Th	ey were already	drawn as large		
Proposed F	Response DSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W			equations at t	this time.			0		

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2	P 122	L 21	# 701	C/ 165	SC	165.7.1.3.2	P 122	L 26	# 703
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Jonsson, F	Ragnar		Marvell		
Comment Type T	Comment Status A	ost-de	eadline, equation 165-38	Comment	Туре	т	Comment Status A		post-deadlin
The "RE_k" value in (165- is both misleading an conf echo response.				of the	ETM al	gorithm), so	o longer the same value wording in Step 8 need		be in previous version
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested		•			
Change "RE k" in (165-38) to "PF_k"				ge "asso ciated E		I. The ETM(m) is this R	EM evaluated at No	discard_etm." to
5 _ (Response Status C			Response			Response Status C		
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				ACCE					
See comment #584				C/ 165	SC	165.7.1.3.2	P 122	L 26	# 702
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2	P 122	L 24	# 584	Jonsson, F	Ragnar		Marvell		
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Comment	Туре	т	Comment Status A	ost-a	leadline, equation 165-38
Comment Type T	Comment Status A		Equation 165-38	The si	gnal "g	_n^m" is no	t defined anywhere.		
Missing value in the third of assume the value should	•		·	Suggested Add de		<i>ly</i> ı of "g_n^m'			
SuggestedRemedy				Response			Response Status C		
Add "0" for the third case.				ACCE	PT IN F	PRINCIPLE			
Response F ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Response Status C			See co	ommen	t #584			
Comment related to equat	ion 165 28 (nago 122 lin	22) Poplaco P	$E_{k(k)}$ with a part and	C/ 165	SC	165.7.1.3.3	P 122	L 29	# 586
add '0' as the third value -				Ran, Adee	e		Cisco		
https://www.ieee802.org/3/	/cy/public/jun22/802d3_T	FR_WGB_comm	ents_HosseinSedarat_	Comment		Е	Comment Status D		E
01a.pdf) 	P122	L 26	# 585			capitalizati ed in 165.7	on in "Residual Echo Me .1.3.2.	tric". Also, the acro	onym REM has already
Ran, Adee	Cisco	- 20	<i>"</i> 303	Suggestea	Remec	ły			
,	Comment Status A		equation 165-38	Remov	ve the u	unnecessar	y capitalization and dele	te "(REM)".	
Step 8 mentions "partial r		n't see where that	1	Proposed	•	ise ACCEPT.	Response Status W		
SuggestedRemedy					USLD	ACCLI I.			
Add a reference to where	g_n^m is defined, or defir	e it if it isn't.							
Response F ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Response Status C								
See comment #584									

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.3 Page 68 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.4 P122 L 45 # 587	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.4 P119 L24 # 577						
lan, Adee Cisco	Ran, Adee Cisco						
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ	Comment Type T Comment Status R						
Unnecessary capitalization in "Echo Tail Metric".	"The coupling attenuation is illustrated in Figure 165–42"						
Also, the acronym ETM should be defined where it is first used in text, which is in step 8 of 165.7.1.3.2.	Figure 165-42 does not illustrate a coupling of any link segment. It illustrates the limit imposed by equation 165-41.						
uggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy						
Remove the unnecessary capitalization and delete "(ETM)". In step 8 of 165.7.1.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is this REM" to "The echo tail metric (ETM) of segment m, ETM(m), is this REM".	Change "the 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation values determined by using Equation (165–41)" to "the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet the coupling attenuation of attenuation of attenuation segment shall meet the coupling attenuation segment shall meet						
roposed Response Response Status W	attenuation in Equation (165–41) as illustrated by Figure 165-42".						
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	In the figure add a label "meets equation constraints" below the curve, and change the t to "Link segment coupling attenuation limit".						
165 SC 165.7.1.3.4 P122 L 50 # 588							
an, Adee Cisco	Delete the quoted sentence.						
omment Type T Comment Status A	Response Response Status C						
The text is about ETM but the equation has REM(N_discard), and no ETM limit is defined.	REJECT.						
uggestedRemedy Correct as necessary.	The proposed change does not add clarity and creates a potential ambiguity with the new "shall" statement covering Figure 165-41.						
esponse Response Status C	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.4 P123 L6 # 440						
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors						
Comment related to Equation 165-40. Replace REM(N_disc) with ETM(m) - incorrect	Comment Type T Comment Status A						
reproduction in the draft (original at https://www.ieee802.org/3/cy/public/jun22/802d3_TFR_WGB_comments_HosseinSedarat_	Annex 165A does not define the Coupling and screening attenuation test methodology. A this is the same as it was for Clause 149, Annex 149A should be referenced.						
	SuggestedRemedy						
01a.pdf).							
υτά.ρατ).	Change: Annex 165A To: Annex 149A (This should be in green with no hyperlink.) Also P124L2						
υτα.ραι).	To: Annex 149A (This should be in green with no hyperlink.)						

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.4

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.6 P124 L 6 # 651
McClellan, Brett Marvell
Comment Type TR Comment Status A The max link delay should be scaled for 11 meters, vs the original 15 meters in 802.3cy
SuggestedRemedy change 94ns to 69ns
Response Response Status C ACCEPT.
C/ 165 SC 165.7.2 P124 L18 # 441
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type T Comment Status D Incorrect reference, 165C.5 doesn't exist.
SuggestedRemedy Change: 165C.5 To: 165A.5
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
C/ 165 SC 165.7.2 P124 L18 # 650
McClellan, Brett Marvell
Comment Type E Comment Status D I incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy change 165C.5 to 165A.5
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.

C/ 165 SC 165.7.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 10	5.7.2.1	P 124	L 25	# 442		C/ 165	SC 165.7.2.	1	P 125	L 1	# 589
Vienckowski, Nata	lie	General Moto	rs			Ran, Adee			Cisco		
		ment Status D			EZ	Comment 7	51		t Status R		
The frequency	ange used nee	ds to be changed.				"PSAN	EXT is illustrate	ed in Figure 1	65–43"		
SuggestedRemedy						Figure	165-43 does no	ot illustrate an	y PSA. It illustra	ites the limit imp	osed by equation 165-
		ss is derived using E ved using Equation (42.			-		
defined for Equ			97–23) Over the	inequency range		Also fo	r PSAACRF in	165.7.2.2.			
Proposed Respons	e Resp	onse Status 🛛 🛛 🖤									
PROPOSED A	CCEPT.						r MDI return los	ss in 165.8.2.1	l.		
	5.7.2.1	P124	1.25	# 474		Suggested	-		unain a duuain a F	·····	
			L 35	# 474	Maria	to	e snall meet tr	ie values dete	rminea using Ea	quation (165–42))
Zimmerman, Geor <u>(</u> Comment Type		CIVIE Consulti ment Status A	ng/APL Gp, CIS	co, CommScope,	Marve 9GHz	"shall n	neet Equation ((165–42) as ill	ustrated by Figu	ıre 165-43".	
The upper frequ	ency for ANEX	T and AFEXT should	be at least as h	high as with the lin				pel "meets equ	uation constrain	ts" below the cur	ve, and change the titl
segment upper						10 PSA	ANEXT limit".				
SuggestedRemedy						Delete	the quoted sen	ntence.			
0		L35 and P126 L6. (e	quations 165-42	2 and 165-43)		Apply s	similarly in 165.	7.2.2 and in 1	65.8.2.1, with a	oppropriate adju	stments.
Response	Resp	onse Status C				Response	2		Status C		
ACCEPT.						REJEC	CT.				
							oposed change statement cove			ites a potential a	mbiguity with the new
						C/ 165	SC 165.7.2.	2	P 125	L 36	# 443
						Wienckows	ski, Natalie		General Moto	ors	
						Comment 7	Туре Т	Commen	t Status D		
						The fre	equency range	used needs to	be changed.		
						Suggested	Remedy				
						To: Ťł		s derived usin	ved using Equat g Equation (97–		quency range defined
						Proposed F	Deenenee	Deenenee	Status W		
						Fioposeur	Response	Response	Status VV		

C/ 165 SC 165.7.2.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.3.1	P 119	L 24	# 576	C/ 165	SC 165.7.12	.1 P 124	L 36	# 706
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Jonsson, R	lagnar	Marvell		
Comment Type T	Comment Status R			Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status A		post-deadline, 9GH.
"The 25GBASE-T1 ret	urn loss is illustrated in Figure	∋ 165–41"		The PS	SANEXT should	be defined up to 9GHz		
Figure 165-41 does no imposed by equation 1	ot illustrate a return loss of any 65-24.	y link segment. It	illustrates the limit	Suggested Change	Remedy e "4000" to "900	00".		
SuggestedRemedy				Response		Response Status C		
Equation (165–24) at a	SE-T1 link segment pair shall all frequencies from 30 MHz to		determined by using	ACCEF				
to "the return loss of a 25	GBASE-T1 link segment			C/ 165	SC 165.7.12	.1 <i>P</i> 125	L 23	# 707
	65–24) as illustrated in Figure	e 165-44".		Jonsson, F	lagnar	Marvell		
	, .			Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status A		post-deadline, 9GH
In the figure add a lab to "Link segment return	el "meets equation constraint	s" below the curv	e, and change the title	The PS	SANEXT should	be defined up to 9GHz		
				Suggested	Remedy			
Delete the quoted sent	ience.			Expand	d Figure 165-43	from 4000MHz to 9000MHz	Ζ.	
Response	Response Status C			Response		Response Status C		
REJECT.				ACCEF	PT.			
The proposed change "shall" statement cove	does not add clarity and crea ring Figure 165-44.	ites a potential ar	nbiguity with the new	C/ 165	SC 165.7.12	.2 P126	L 6	# 708
C/ 165 SC 165.7.3.2		L 53	# 578	Jonsson, R	lagnar	Marvell		
	-	L 33	# 578	Comment T	51	Comment Status A		post-deadline, 9GH
Ran, Adee	Cisco Comment Status D		C 7	The PS	SAACRF should	be defined up to 9GHz		
Comment Type E Unnecessary capitaliza subclause text.	ation in "Echo Tail and Residu	ual Echo Metrics"	EZ . Also "Noise" in the	Suggested Change	<i>Remedy</i> e "4000" to "900	00".		
				Response		Response Status C		
RuggestedPomody	on conitalization			ACCE	PT.			
	ary capitalization.							
Remove the unnecess	Response Status W			C/ 165	SC 165.7.12	.2 P126	L31	# 709
Remove the unnecess	Response Status W					-	L 31	# 709
Remove the unnecess Proposed Response	Response Status W			Jonsson, R	lagnar	Marvell	L 3 1	
Remove the unnecess Proposed Response	Response Status W			Jonsson, R Comment	Ragnar Type T	-	L 31	# 709 post-deadline, 9GH
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Jonsson, R Comment T The PS Suggested	Ragnar <i>Type</i> T SAACRF should <i>Remedy</i>	Marvell Comment Status A		

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/
 165

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC
 165.7.12.2

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC
 165.7.12.2
 SC
 165.7.12.2

Page 72 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.8	.2.1	P 126	L 7	# 458	C/ 165	SC 165.8.2.1	P127	<i>L</i> Figure	# 598	·,
Brychta, Michal		Analog Devic	es		Stephan S	chreiner	Rosenberger	Hochfrequenztech	hnik	
Comment Type T	Commer	nt Status A		10G, 9 GHz	Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D			EZ
The MDI return loss					There	s a vertical blue	line at the 0 MHz position.			
subclause 165.7 us frequency range up	se frequency ran	ige up to 9000Ml 7 and 165 8 on th	Hz.May it be better	to unify the relevant	Suggested	Remedy				
why they should be			le same number, (Remov	e the vertical bl	ue line at the 1 MHz position.			
SuggestedRemedy					Proposed I	Response	Response Status W			
Use for relevant 16 up to 10000MHz.	5.7 and 165.8 s	pecifications freq	uency range eithe	r up to 9000MHz, or	PROP	OSED ACCEPT				
Response	Response	e Status C			C/ 165	SC 165.10	P 129	L 5	# 590	
ACCEPT IN PRINC	IPLE.				Ran, Adee		Cisco			
In 165.8 change 10					Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status R			1
							t maximum delay specificatio			
C/ 165 SC 165.8	.2.1	P 127	L 4	# 465			I (or "L") is negotiated betwee ion, so is unknown in advance			
Tu, Mike		Broadcom						-		
Comment Type TR	Commer	nt Status D					Ie (per the text preceding it: ' regarding the cable topology			rs
Equation 165-44 fo				PHY designs. Also	conion	n to constraints	regarding the cable topology	and concatenatio	n of devices .	
need to set the max	kimum frequenc	y to 9GHz instea	d of 10GHz.				nent "The sum of the transmi			
SuggestedRemedy							PHY shall not exceed the limit interleave in the transmit and			vant
See proposed limits	s in "vakilian_3c	y_01_08_16_20	22.pdf"				oth sides choose L=8; if it is l			vices
Proposed Response	Response	e Status W			are diff	erent, the const	raints can be tightened.			
PROPOSED ACCE	PT.				Theref	ore it seems add	equate to have a normative re	auirement only fo	r the maximum d	رمام
See https://www.iee	ee802.org/3/cy/p	oublic/aug22/vaki	lian_3cy_01_08_1	6_2022.pdf		PHY, which hap				Sidy
C/ 165 SC 165.8	.2.1	P 127	L Figure	# 597			xplain that the actual delay n of L, assuming this informat			
Stephan Schreiner		Rosenberger	Hochfrequenztech	nnik	Suggested				network manage	nont.
Comment Type E	Commer	nt Status D		EZ	00	2	ws in Table 165-16, leaving o	only the one with l	nterleave value o	fß
X-Axes Grid is very	dense.					move the "Interle		only the one with h		10,
SuggestedRemedy							- 1- (b			
Using a frequency	step of 500 MHz	z for the grid inste	ead of 250 MHz.			planatory text as	s in the comment.			
Proposed Response	Response	e Status W			Response	` _	Response Status C			
PROPOSED ACCE	PT.				REJEC	<i>.</i>				
							vay to set the interleaving dep nown in advance and the tab			

C/ 165 SC 165.10 Page 73 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.11.2.2	P130	L36	# 445		C/ 165 SC 165.11.4.1 P131 L39 # 592
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor		# 440		Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type E typo	Comment Status D	5		ΕZ	Comment Type T Comment Status D E Item G3 status should be "!AN:M".
SuggestedRemedy Change: IEEE Std 802. To: IEEE Std 802.3cy-2 Proposed Response					SuggestedRemedy Per comment Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
PROPOSED ACCEPT.		1.00	# 504		Cl 165 SC 165.11.4.2.5 P135 L 30 # 722
Cl 165 SC 165.11.2.2 Ran, Adee Comment Type E Incorrect amendment na SuggestedRemedy Change "ch-2020" to "cy Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Cisco Comment Status D ame.	L 36	# <u>591</u>	EZ	Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell Comment Type T Comment Status D post-deadling Alert happens at the fifth frame after 8 frame boundary. SuggestedRemedy post-deadling SuggestedRemedy Change "beginning of" to "fifth frame after". Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status. Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status.
	HSD, Bosch, F Comment Status D 3ch-2020,	L 44 Ethernovia	# 450	EZ	Cl 165 SC 165.11.4.2.6 P 136 L 6 # 731 Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell Comment Type T Comment Status A post-deadline, sleep sign Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames SuggestedRemedy change "eight RS-FEC frame" to "sixteen RS-FEC frame" Response Response Status C
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W				Response Response Status C ACCEPT. Comment type changed to non-R due to post-deadline status.

C/ 165 SC 165.11.4.2.6

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.11.4.2.8	P137	L1	# 446		C/ 165A SC 165A	P149	L1	# 444	
Wienckows	ki, Natalie	General Motor	S			Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	S		
Comment T	ype T Co	mment Status D			EZ	Comment Type E	Comment Status D			EZ
Table 1	49-1 has nothing to d	o with the OAM state dia	agrams.			There is no Annex 16	5B.			
SuggestedF	Remedy					SuggestedRemedy				
	:Table 149-1 ure 149-24					Change: Insert new A To: Insert new Annex	Annex 165A and Annex 165B as < 165A as follows:	s follows:		
Proposed R PROPC	esponse Res SED ACCEPT.	ponse Status W				Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W T.			
C/ 165	SC 165.11.4.2.8	P 137	L 6	# 468		C/ 165A SC 165A	P 149	L 43	# 632	
Tu, Mike		Broadcom				McClellan, Brett	Marvell			
Comment T	//**	<i>mment Status</i> D shown in Figure 149-24	4 and Figure 14	19-25.	EZ	Comment Type E HTF used without def	<i>Comment Status</i> D inition in this Annex			EZ
SuggestedF Change		nd Figure 149-25" to "Fi	gure 149-24 ar	nd Figure 149-25".		SuggestedRemedy replace 'HTF' with 'Ho	ost Test Fixture (HTF)'			
Proposed R PROPC	esponse Res SED ACCEPT.	ponse Status W				Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W			
C/ 165	SC 165.11.4.3.3	P 139	L 10	# 339		C/ 165A SC 165A.1	P149	L 30	# 406	
Maguire, Va	alerie	Copperopolis				Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	s		
Comment T	ype E Co	mment Status D			ΕZ	Comment Type T	Comment Status D			EZ
Interfact	•	appearing after "MDIO"	(see clause 45	5 header).			b/s up to 2 inline connectors for t, but the text on the link segme		5A-1 is not.	
00	e, "MDIO interface" wi	th "MDIO Interface"				SuggestedRemedy				
Proposed R	esponse Res	ponse Status W				Change: four in-line on To: two in-line conne				
•										
PROPC	SED ACCEPT.					Proposed Response	Response Status W			

C/ 165A SC 165A.1

-	-		-			
C/ 165A	SC 165A.1	P149	L 30	# 676	C/ 165A	SC 165A.2.1
Zimmermar	n, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cisc	o, CommScope, Marve	Zimmerma	n, George
Comment T	ype TR	Comment Status D			Comment 7	Type ER
		connectors in a clause 165 I proved in the label.	ink segment, the	figure says 4. Also,	the san	are 3 different wor ne thing. "recom
	e "SPE P-to-P lin	k segments four in-line conr 2 in-line connectors and up			loss" - i	mended printed c it appears that the nost-side PCB cor
Proposed R	•	Response Status W		Jinguny	Suggested	-
•	DSED ACCEPT.				recom	e "The recommen nended maximum
C/ 165A	SC 165A.1	P 149	L 32	# 678		I is" on line 16, e "The recommen
Zimmermar	n, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cisc	o, CommScope, Marve		ce length. The re
Comment T	ype T	Comment Status D	-			nended loss is ba ly change the wor
		"PHY ends" in the figure - the address of the second secon			lines 27	7, 28, and 30
Suggested	Remedv	Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEF				
Sugges	2	tted vertical lines on the very	/ left and right sic	les of the figure (the	C/ 165A	SC 165A.2.1
Proposed R	Response	Response Status W			Zimmerma	n. George
PROPC	, DSED ACCEPT I	•			Comment 7	
	the dotted verticate plane)	al lines on the very left and r	ight sides of the f	igure (the unlabeled	font siz	e problem in the f , and on page 15
	. ,				Suggested	Remedy
C/ 165A	SC 165A.1	P 149	L 33	# 677	Fix the	font size for "900
Zimmermar	n, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cisc	o, CommScope, Marve	Proposed F	Response
Comment T	ype TR	Comment Status D			PROPO	OSED ACCEPT.
		(there are many different te ed differently in the text of 16			C/ 165A	SC 165A.2.1
SuggestedF	Remedy				McClellan,	Brett
Change	e "Channel" to "T	P0 to TP5 Channel"			Comment 7	Туре Т
Proposed R	Response	Response Status W			the Hos	st PCB insertion l
PROPC	OSED ACCEPT.				Suggested	Remedy
						e <= to >=
					Proposed F	Response

C/ 165A	SC ACEA DA				
	SC 165A.2.1	P15	50	L16	# 679
Zimmermar	n, George	CME	Consulting/Al	PL Gp, (Cisco, CommScope, Marv
Comment T	ype ER	Comment Status	D		
the sam "recomr loss" - it	ne thing. "recom mended printed of t appears that th	mended maximum ir circuit board insert lo	nsertion loss t ss", and "rece ended maxim	for the H	re, but they appear to be lost PCB", ded maximum insertion rtion loss from TP0/TP5
SuggestedF	Remedy				
recomm the MDI Change mm trac recomm Similarly	nended maximur is" on line 16, "The recommen ce length. The re nended loss is ba	nded printed circuit b commended maxim ased on a 76.2 mm t	TP0/TP5 to t oard trace ins um insertion I race length, a	he host- sertion lo oss is" t und is"	side PCB connection of oss is based on a 76.2
Proposed R		Response Status	w		
	SED ACCEPT.	Response Status			
C/ 165A	SC 165A.2.1	P15	50	L 25	# 680
Zimmermar	n, George	CME	Consulting/Al	PL Gp, (Cisco, CommScope, Marv
		Comment Status	П		E
Comment T	ype E	Common Claudo	0		
font size		frequency span, and	-	od. Sar	ne problems on lines 25
font size	e problem in the and on page 15	frequency span, and	-	od. Sar	ne problems on lines 25
font size and 36, SuggestedF	e problem in the and on page 15 <i>Remedy</i>	frequency span, and	l missing peri		
font size and 36, SuggestedF	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900	frequency span, and 1 line 2.	I missing peri		
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period	I missing peri		
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900 Pesponse	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period	to the end of		
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R PROPC	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900 esponse DSED ACCEPT. SC 165A.2.1	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period <i>Response Status</i>	to the end of	the sen	tence. (3 instances)
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R PROPC	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900 response DSED ACCEPT. SC 165A.2.1 Brett	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period <i>Response Status</i> <i>P</i> 15	to the end of W	the sen	tence. (3 instances)
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R PROPC Cl 165A McClellan, f Comment T	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900 Response OSED ACCEPT. SC 165A.2.1 Brett type T	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period <i>Response Status</i> <i>P1</i> Marve	to the end of W 50	the sen	tence. (3 instances) # <u>633</u>
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R PROPC Cl 165A McClellan, f Comment T	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900 esponse DSED ACCEPT. SC 165A.2.1 Brett t PCB insertion	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period <i>Response Status</i> <i>P1t</i> Marve <i>Comment Status</i>	to the end of W 50	the sen	tence. (3 instances) # <u>633</u>
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R PROPC Cl 165A McClellan, F Comment T the Hos SuggestedF	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900 esponse DSED ACCEPT. SC 165A.2.1 Brett t PCB insertion	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period <i>Response Status</i> <i>P1t</i> Marve <i>Comment Status</i>	to the end of W 50	the sen	tence. (3 instances) # <u>633</u>
font size and 36, SuggestedF Fix the f Proposed R PROPC Cl 165A McClellan, F Comment T the Hos SuggestedF	e problem in the and on page 15 Remedy font size for "900 Posponse DSED ACCEPT. SC 165A.2.1 Brett type T t PCB insertion Remedy <= to >=	frequency span, and 1 line 2. 00" and add a period <i>Response Status</i> <i>P1t</i> Marve <i>Comment Status</i>	to the end of W 50 ell D er than the m	the sen	tence. (3 instances) # <u>633</u>

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 165A SC 165A.2.1 Page 76 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:07 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165A	SC 165A.4	P 151	L 19	# 682
Zimmerma	n, George	CME Cor	sulting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Marve
Comment 1	Type TR	Comment Status D		
		describe any 'Channel' r tion to MDI return loss (e		er describes the models 4.1).
Suggestedl	Remedy			
Change	e the title of 165A	A.4 to "Example models	for Tx/Rx function to	o MDI return loss"
Proposed F PROPC	Response DSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W		
C/ 165A	SC 165A.4	P 151	L 20	# 681
Zimmerma	n, George	CME Cor	sulting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Marve
Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status D		EZ, Figure 165A-3
Suggestedl delete ' Proposed F	"illustrated in Fig	ure 149C-2" and delete Response Status W	Figure 165A-3	
PROPO	OSED ACCEPT.			
C/ 165A	SC 165A.4	P 151	L 20	# 634
McClellan,	Brett	Marvell		
Comment 7 incorre	<i>Type</i> E ct reference	Comment Status D		EZ, Figure 165A-3
S <i>uggestedl</i> change		to 'Figure 165A-3'		
- · ·	Response	Response Status W		
	, DSED ACCEPT I	N PRINCIPLE.		
PROPO		N PRINCIPLE.		

C/ 165A	SC 165A.4	P1	51 L 41	# 635
McClellan,	Brett	Marve	ell	
Comment 7	Гуре Е	Comment Status	D	EZ
Elemer	nt column entries	s should use subscrip	ts	
Suggested	Remedy			
copy th	e subscript form	at from Table 149C-2	2, fix the micro sy	mbol in the Unit column
Proposed F	Response	Response Status	w	
PROP	OSED ACCEPT.			
C/ 165A	SC 165A.5	P1	52 L3	# 683
Zimmerma	n, George	CME	Consulting/APL G	p, Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Comment 7	Type ER	Comment Status	D	
We ren	noved the 'laning	g' but forgot it here.		
Suggested	Remedy			
		e 25GBASE-T1 lanes are implemented"	/PHYs are implen	nented" to "When multiple
Proposed F	Response	Response Status	w	
PROPO	OSED ACCEPT.			
C/ 165A	SC 165A.5	P1	52 L6	# 684
Zimmerma	n, George	CME	Consulting/APL G	p, Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Comment 7 we say	<i>Type</i> E 'specified' twice	Comment Status	D	EZ
	e "than that spec	cified for power sum a		sstalk specified in" to "than
Proposed F	•	Response Status		

C/ 165A SC 165A.5

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ Particip	s SC	Particip	ants	P 7	L11	# 353	
Fischer, P	eter		В	KS Kabel-S	ervice AG		
Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Sta	tus D			EZ
Till who	en will	be Valer	ie Maguire listed a	s Working (Group Treasurer?	•	
Suggested	Remed	dy					
			up Treasurer is ava icially ended.	ailable repla	ace with the correct	ct name, if not w	ait till
Proposed I	Respor	nse	Response Stat	us W			
PROP	OSED	ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.				
Apply	current	template	е.				
C/ TOC	SC	тос		P 13	L 1	# 661	
Murty, Rar	nana		B	roadcom			
Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Sta	tus D			EZ
It is go	od to a	add a hea	ading and provide a	a bookmark	to the page.		
Suggested Add th			ntents" and provide	a bookmai	rk to the page.		
Proposed I	Respor	nse	Response Stat	tus W			
•	•		T IN PRINCIPLE.				
Apply t	the late	est templ	ate				
C/ TOC		тос		P 13	L 10	# 662	
		100		roadcom	210	# 002	
Murty, Rar		Е	Comment Sta				FZ
Comment Add sp		-	ubclause number a				EZ
Suggested							
Per co		-					
Proposed	Respor	nse	Response Stat	us W			
Fioposeu							
	OSED	ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.				
PROP		ACCEP	-				

CI TOC SC TOC Page 78 of 78 8/22/2022 10:57:08 AM