*Cl* **1**　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　*P* **18**　　*L* **15**　　　# 1

Jones, Chad　　　　　　　　　　Cisco
*Comment Type* **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　*General*

"up to 50 m reach". Clearly we have not settled on this length. I know there is a note just after that says inclusion of reach is TBD. Lentgh should also be TBD.

*SuggestedRemedy*

change "up to 50 m reach" to "up to TBD m reach"

*Response*　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

---

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.2.5**　　　　*P* **20**　　*L*　　　　# 10

Beruto, Piergiorgio　　　　　　　Canova Tech S.r.l.
*Comment Type* **T**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　*D-PLCA*

Clause 30 Attribute for D-PLCA management "SOFT_AGING_CYCLES" is needed.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Append the following to Table 30-11:
"aDPLCASoftAgingCycles | ATTRIBUTE | GET-SET"

Add new sub-clause of 30.16.1.1 "aDPLCASoftAgingCycles" with content: "
ATTRIBUTE
APPROPRIATE SYNTAX:
INTEGER
BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:
Controls the aging time in BEACON cycles of D-PLCA SOFT claims as defined by the SOFT_AGING_CYCLES variable in Clause 148.4.7.2.;"

At page 32, in the SOFT_AGING_CYCLES description, substitute "This variable maps on the TBD attribute in Clause 30.x"

with:

"This variable maps on the aDPLCASoftAgingCycles attribute in Clause [#ref to new subclause in 30.16.1.1]"

*Response*　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

---

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.2.5**　　　　*P* **20**　　*L*　　　　# 9

Beruto, Piergiorgio　　　　　　　Canova Tech S.r.l.
*Comment Type* **T**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　*D-PLCA*

Clause 30 Attribute for D-PLCA management "HARD_AGING_CYCLES" is needed.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Append the following to Table 30-11:
"aDPLCAHardAgingCycles | ATTRIBUTE | GET-SET"

Add new sub-clause of 30.16.1.1 "aDPLCAHardAgingCycles" with content: "
ATTRIBUTE
APPROPRIATE SYNTAX:
INTEGER
BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:
Controls the aging time in BEACON cycles of D-PLCA HARD claims as defined by the HARD_AGING_CYCLES variable in Clause 148.4.7.2.;"

At page 32, in the HARD_AGING_CYCLES description, substitute "This variable maps on the TBD attribute in Clause 30.x"

with:

"This variable maps on the aDPLCAHardAgingCycles attribute in Clause [#ref to new subclause in 30.16.1.1]"

*Response*　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general　　　　*Pa* **20**　　　　Page 1 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn　　　*Li*　　　　6/16/2021  9:11:01 AM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.2.5**　　　　*P* **20**　　*L*　　　# 8

Beruto, Piergiorgio　　　　　　Canova Tech S.r.l.

*Comment Type*　**T**　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　　　*D-PLCA*

Clause 30 Attribute for D-PLCA management "coordinator_role_allowed" is needed.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Append the following to Table 30-11:
"aDPLCACoordinatorRoleAllowed | ATTRIBUTE | GET-SET"

Add new sub-clause of 30.16.1.1 "aDPLCACoordinatorRoleAllowed" with content: "
ATTRIBUTE
APPROPRIATE SYNTAX:
An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries:
disabled
enabled
BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:
Controls whether the D-PLCA enabled node is allowed to take the coordinator role,
mapping to the coordinator_role_allowed variable defined in Clause 148.4.7.2.;"

At page 31, in the coordinator_role_allowed description, substitute "This variable maps on the TBD attribute in Clause 30.x"

with:

"This variable maps on the aDPLCACoordinatorRoleAllowed attribute in Clause [#ref to new subclause in 30.16.1.1]"

*Response*　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Append the following to Table 30-11:
"aDPLCACoordinatorRoleAllowed | ATTRIBUTE | GET-SET"

Add new sub-clause of 30.16.1.1 "aDPLCACoordinatorRoleAllowed" with content: "
ATTRIBUTE
APPROPRIATE SYNTAX:
BOOLEAN
BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:
Controls whether the D-PLCA enabled node is allowed to take the coordinator role,
mapping to the coordinator_role_allowed variable defined in Clause 148.4.7.2. ;"

At page 31, in the coordinator_role_allowed description, substitute "This variable maps on the TBD attribute in Clause 30.x"

with:

---

"This variable maps on the aDPLCACoordinatorRoleAllowed attribute in Clause [#ref to new subclause in 30.16.1.1]"

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.2.5**　　　　*P* **20**　　*L*　　　# 7

Beruto, Piergiorgio　　　　　　Canova Tech S.r.l.

*Comment Type*　**T**　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　　　*D-PLCA*

Clause 30 Attribute for D-PLCA management "dplca_en" is needed.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Append the following to Table 30-11:
"aDPLCAAdminState | ATTRIBUTE | GET"
"acDPLCAAdminControl | ACTION |"

Add sub-clause of 30.16.1.1 "aDPLCAAdminState" with content: "
ATTRIBUTE
APPROPRIATE SYNTAX:
An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries:
disabled
enabled
BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:
A read-only value that indicates whether the dynamic node ID allocation method for the
PLCA Reconciliation Sublayer (D-PLCA) is enabled. When D-PLCA is enabled, plca node
IDs are dynamically assigned as defined in Clause 148.4.7.;"

Add new sub-clause of 30.16.1.1 "acDPLCAAdminControl" with content:
"ACTION
APPROPRIATE SYNTAX:
An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries:
disabled
enabled

BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:
This action provides a means to alter aDPLCAAdminState. Setting acDPLCAAdminControl to the
disabled state sets the variable dplca_en to FALSE and disables the PLCA functionality specified
in Clause 148.4.7. Setting acDPLCAAdminControl to the enabled state sets the variable dplca_en to
TRUE in Figure 148–5, and Figure 148–6.;"

*Response*　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT.

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general　　　　*Pa* **20**　　　Page 2 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn　　*Li*　　6/16/2021  9:11:01 AM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

*Cl* **148**　　*SC* **148.2**　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L*　　　　# 11

Beruto, Piergiorgio　　　　　　Canova Tech S.r.l.

*Comment Type*　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　　　　*EZ*

We should define what the D-PLCA acronym stands for on its first occurrence

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace the first occurrence of "D-PLCA" with "Dynamic PLCA (D-PLCA)"

*Response*　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT.

---

*Cl* **148**　　*SC* **148.2**　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L*　　　　# 5

Beruto, Piergiorgio　　　　　　Canova Tech S.r.l.

*Comment Type*　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　　　*D-PLCA*

We should specify that when D-PLCA is used, the uniqueness of PLCA node ID is not an issue.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "Proper operation of the Clause 148 functionality assumes that
the assigned node ID is unique in the local collision domain."

To:

"When not using D-PLCA, proper operation of the Clause 148 functionality assumes that
the assigned node ID is unique in the local collision domain."

*Response*　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT.

---

*Cl* **148**　　*SC* **148.2**　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **7**　　# 2

Jones, Chad　　　　　　　　Cisco

*Comment Type*　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　　　*D-PLCA*

no line numbers on pages 26-38! Line 7 is a guess.
"Node ID may be allocated by optional D-PLCA control state diagram in 148.4.7.6." missing
a 'the' in the sentence but need to reform the sentence to keep it unambiguous.

*SuggestedRemedy*

change "Node ID may be allocated by optional D-PLCA control state diagram in 148.4.7.6."
to "Node ID may be optionally allocated by the D-PLCA control state diagram in 148.4.7.6."

*Response*　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(commenter's suggested remedy altered to also allow the editorial fixing of the line
numbers noted in comment)

Fix Frame source to get line numbers on pages 26-38 (Clause 148)

change "Node ID may be allocated by optional D-PLCA control state diagram in 148.4.7.6."
to "Node ID may be optionally allocated by the D-PLCA control state diagram in 148.4.7.6."

---

*Cl* **148**　　*SC* **148.4.4.2**　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **20**　　# 3

Jones, Chad　　　　　　　　Cisco

*Comment Type*　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　　　*D-PLCA*

"Notifies the D-PLCA state diagrams that the transmit opportunity indicated by the
dplca_txo- p_id variable is over." this took me more than one read to parse. "is over" is the
problem, has expired better?

*SuggestedRemedy*

change "Notifies the D-PLCA state diagrams that the transmit opportunity indicated by the
dplca_txo- p_id variable is over." to "Notifies the D-PLCA state diagrams that the transmit
opportunity indicated by the dplca_txo- p_id variable has expired."

*Response*　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(Commenter's suggested remedy altered to also fix the hyphenation of the variable name)

Change dplca_txop_id to be non-breaking and review other variables for same.

change "Notifies the D-PLCA state diagrams that the transmit opportunity indicated by the
dplca_txop_id variable is over." to "Notifies the D-PLCA state diagrams that the transmit
opportunity indicated by the dplca_txop_id variable has expired."

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general　　　　*Pa* **26**　　　Page 3 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn　　*Li* **20**　　　6/16/2021  9:11:01 AM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

*Cl* **148**　　　*SC* **148.4.7.1**　　　　　*P* **31**　　　　*L*　　　　# 6

Beruto, Piergiorgio　　　　　　　Canova Tech S.r.l.

*Comment Type* **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　*D-PLCA*

Overiview text for D-PLCA is needed

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace the only Editor's note with the content of the attached file
"802d3_TFR_WGB_beruto_dplca_overview.pdf"

*Response*　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Replace the only editor's note with the following:
"Implementations supporting the PLCA RS may optionally support D-PLCA as described in
this subclause. If the D-PLCA option is implemented, it shall comply with the state
diagrams in Figure 148-8 (D-PLCA Control State Diagram) and Figure 148-9 (D-PLCA
Aging State Diagram).
D-PLCA allows plug & play operation over statically configured PLCA, trading off some
latency and throughput due to an increased number of collisions.
D-PLCA allows nodes to start with a possibly non-unique PLCA node ID and autonomously
select a unique node ID at a later time. Additionally, D-PLCA defines a method to
designate a single node with ID = 0 (coordinator).
If enabled, D-PLCA constantly adapts the parameters aPLCANodeCount and
aPLCALocalNodeID to accommodate the current state of activity (transmit opportunities
claims) of the nodes on a mixing segment. When mixing D-PLCA capable nodes with
statically configured PLCA nodes, the D-PLCA capable nodes eventually select IDs outside
the space of the statically assigned ones. When D-PLCA is used, PHYs may detect
collisions until every node eventually selects a unique ID.
D-PLCA keeps track of claimed transmit opportunities, distinguishing between HARD
claims (with COMMIT requests), and SOFT claims (without explicit COMMITs). The aging
algorithm assigns two different aging times for HARD and SOFT claims to avoid the case
where non PLCA-enabled nodes may prevent D-PLCA from converging.
HARD_AGING_CYCLES and SOFT_AGING_CYCLES can be configured to optimize
convergence time and stability over time in different situations. It is recommended to keep
the value of HARD_AGING_CYCLES much greater than the value of
SOFT_AGING_CYCLES. This condition ensures both stability and interoperability with
statically configured PLCA nodes."

*Cl* **148**　　　*SC* **148.4.7.2**　　　　　*P* **32**　　　　*L* **2**　　# 4

Jones, Chad　　　　　　　Cisco

*Comment Type* **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　*EZ*

"Copy of txop_claim_table use by the D-PLCA..."
used not use.

*SuggestedRemedy*

change to "Copy of txop_claim_table used by the D-PLCA..."

*Response*　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general　　　*Pa* **32**　　　Page 4 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn　　*Li*  **2**　　　6/16/2021  9:11:01 AM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

*Cl* **148**          *SC* **148.5.3.7**          *P* **37**          *L* **16**          # 12

Zimmerman, George                    CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,

*Comment Type*   **T**          *Comment Status* **A**                              *D-PLCA*

Comment on behalf of Gergely Huszak, Kone: "148.5.3.7 D-PLCA" includes sentences D1 and D2 that say "Conforms to Figure 148-8" and "Conforms to Figure 148-9" (respectively) but these figures do not seem to be part of the draft. Is this intentional (= the yellow highlight is there for this?) or just a simple oversight/export problem?
Detail - (editor)
First, the figures that are intended to be referenced ARE in the draft (D-PLCA Control and D-PLCA Aging) – these are misnumbered where they occur (148-5 and 148-6 should be 148-8 and 148-9).  Second, the actual requirement ("conforms to") is missing from the text (should be in 148.4.7 – which has yet to be filled in – but at least the requirement should be there…) third, the editing instruction for 148.4.7 (top of page 31) mentions Figure 148-7 (the incorrect number as well, should be 148-8), but not the second figure, and finally, the PICS should be a cross-ref.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Number D-PLCA Control State Diagram as Figure 148-8 (page 34), and D-PLCA Aging State Diagram as Figure 148-9 (page 35)
On page 31, add sentence to 148.4.7.1 "If the D-PLCA option is implemented, it shall comply with the state diagrams in Figure 148-5 (D-PLCA Control State Diagram) and Figure 148-6 (D-PLCA Aging State Diagram)."
On page 29, Change Editing instruction at top of page from "Insert 148.4.7 following 148.4.6.5 (and Figure 148-7) as follows:" to "Insert 148.4.7 following 148.4.6.5 (and Figures 148-8 and 148-9) as follows:"
On page 37, In 148.5.3.7, Change text in PICS DP1 and DP2 for Figure 148-8 and Figure 148-9 to cross-references and remove highlighting.

*Response*                    *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(the missing 'shall; statement was accomodated by comment 6)

Number D-PLCA Control State Diagram as Figure 148-8 (page 34), and D-PLCA Aging State Diagram as Figure 148-9 (page 35)

On page 29, Change Editing instruction at top of page from "Insert 148.4.7 following 148.4.6.5 (and Figure 148-7) as follows:" to "Insert 148.4.7 following 148.4.6.5 (and Figures 148-8 and 148-9) as follows:"
On page 37, In 148.5.3.7, Change text in PICS DP1 and DP2 for Figure 148-8 and Figure 148-9 to cross-references and remove highlighting.

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general          *Pa* **37**          Page 5 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn          *Li*  **16**          6/16/2021  9:11:01 AM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line