

EE P802.3da D0.3 10 Mb/s Single Pair Multidrop Segments Enhancement 2nd Task Force review comment

Cl 30 SC 30.16.1.1.8 P5 L53 # 22

Jones, Chad Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

this comment applies to 30.16.1.1.8 thru 11 the BEHAVIOR DEFINED AS field does not end in a period before the semi-colon. For example: Controls the aging time in BEACON cycles of D-PLCA SOFT claims as defined by the SOFT_AGING_CYCLES variable in 148.4.7.2;

SuggestedRemedy

add period at the end of the sentence: Controls the aging time in BEACON cycles of D-PLCA SOFT claims as defined by the SOFT_AGING_CYCLES variable in 148.4.7.2.; Make this change in four places on pages 5 and 6.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.16.1.1.11 P6 L31 # 21

Jones, Chad Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

"When D-PLCA is enabled, plca node IDs are..." plca needs capitalized?

SuggestedRemedy

change "When D-PLCA is enabled, plca node IDs are..." to: "When D-PLCA is enabled, PLCA node IDs are..."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to implement commenter's remedy and to check the overall document and correct other instances where PLCA is not capitalized

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P35 L23 # 28

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

Missing close paren in rightmost branch out of COORDINATOR. "(hard_claiming(0) +rx_cmd = BEACON"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "(hard_claiming(0) +rx_cmd = BEACON" to "(hard_claiming(0) +rx_cmd = BEACON)"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P35 L36 # 23

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial

"plca_node_count >255" SHOULD BE < 255 per beruto_3da_01_031721_dplca_baseline.pdf (and because the value can't be > 255)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "plca_node_count > 255" to "dplca_node_count < 255"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P35 L41 # 24

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

condition "dplca_txop_table_upd *(plca_status = OK) *(...)" is confusingly placed on page - should be clearly associated with recirculating state on FOLLOWER, but can be confused with unconditional output from INCREASE NODE COUNT

SuggestedRemedy

Reposition condition and reformat so it is clearly associated with loopback on FOLLOWER

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Make the suggested remedy and consider whether exit condition from INCREASE_NODE_COUNT is !dplca_new_age or Unconditional, in which case it needs to separate from REDUCE_NODE_COUNT exit

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.6 P36 L7 # 26

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,

Comment Type E Comment Status A Editorial

"clear_txop_table)txop_claim_table_new)" - first paren facing wrong way

SuggestedRemedy

change "clear_txop_table)txop_claim_table_new)" to: "clear_txop_table(txop_claim_table_new)"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

EE P802.3da D0.3 10 Mb/s Single Pair Multidrop Segments Enhancement 2nd Task Force review comment

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.6 P36 L41 # 27

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,

Comment Type T Comment Status A Editorial

States UPDATE_SOFT and UPDATE_HARD do not have outbound transitions

SuggestedRemedy

Add unconditional transitions from UPDATE_SOFT and UPDATE_HARD to NOTIFY as per page 20 of beruto_3da_01_031721_dplca_baseline.pdf

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.4 P34 L46 # 25

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,

Comment Type T Comment Status A Management

"the duration of this timer is defined by the TBD configuration parameter" - needs a clause 30 parameter to fill in.

SuggestedRemedy

Add clause 30 parameter "aDPLCAWaitBeaconTimer" as ATTRIBUTE GET-SET, in Table 30-11, and at 30.16.1.1.12 with APPROPRIATE SYNTAX: INTEGER and BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: Controls the time the D-PLCA state diagram waits for a node to indicate BEACON as defined by the wait_beacon_timer in 148.4.7.4.;"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implement commenter's suggested remedy, AND:

Add "Editor's note (to be removed prior to Working Group Ballot) - Comments are encouraged to determine value if not set, and whether it is preserved across reset, including loss of power (see, e.g., 30.12.1.1.1)."

Editor's implementation note - needed to add the name of the parameter to replace the TBD in clause 148 per the comment text (but not in the remedy)