This project is targeted as an amendment to the ongoing revision of P802.3. See parallel projects for examples of front matter and notes appropriate for an amendment to 802.3-20xx.

Suggested Remedy
Replace front matter Introduction (page 9) with Front Matter from P802.3/D2.0. Replace references to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 with IEEE Std 802.3-20xx, and edit page 1 line 28 paragraph accordingly.

Response
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Insert Editor's note at P1 L27:
"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to Working Group ballot) - the Task Force review draft and front matter represent alignment to IEEE 802.3-2018. Editor to replace front matter and check alignment of remaining text to the IEEE P802.3da draft of the IEEE 802.3 revision either prior to presubmission of IEEE P802.3da to working group ballot or at the time the IEEE 802.3 revision is approved at SA ballot, whichever comes first."

Drafts should be copyrighted with correct year.

Suggested Remedy
Replace 202x with 2021 (assuming next draft is released this year), and place corresponding year in the draft footer.

Response
ACCEPT.

Reach is not specified for other BASE-T PHYs.

Suggested Remedy
Delete "medium up to at least TBD m reach".
Delete related editor's note

Response
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete "up to at least TBD m reach"
Delete related editor's note.

Drafts should be copyrighted with correct year.

Suggested Remedy
Remove paragraph from note.

Response
ACCEPT.
IEEE P802.3da D0.51 10 Mb/s SPMD Enhancement 3rd Task Force review comments

CI 148  SC 148.4.7.5  P31  L9  # 31
Jones, Peter  Cisco
Comment Type  T  Comment Status  D-PLCA
Transition from DISABLED to WAIT_BEADCON in D-PLCA Control State Diagram should not be a UCT.

Suggested Remedy
Add (plca_en + dplca_en) as transition condition

Response  Response Status  C
REJECT.
The open ended arc (plca_reset + !dplca_en + !plca_en) into DISABLED keeps the state diagram locked in the disabled state whenever either of these conditions is not true (or if reset is asserted).

CI 148  SC 148.4.7.6  P32  L19  # 32
Jones, Peter  Cisco
Comment Type  T  Comment Status  D-PLCA
DPLCA

dplca_new_age not defined in D-PLCA Control State Diagram.

Suggested Remedy
Add dplca_new_age to 148.4.7.2 Variables.

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Insert the following prior to dplca_txop_claim (P29 L32)
dplca_new_age
Internal variable used to synchronize the D-PLCA Control State Diagram with the D-PLCA Aging State Diagram so that changes in the node ID allocation occur at the end of a cycle of transmit opportunities.

Values: TRUE or FALSE

CI 148  SC 148.4.7.6  P32  L26  # 32
Jones, Peter  Cisco
Comment Type  T  Comment Status  D-PLCA
D-PLCA

Typo in D-PLCA Aging State Diagram TXOP_END action: SOFT_AGAIN_CYCLES

Suggested Remedy
Change SOFT_AGAIN_CYCLES to SOFT_AGING_CYCLES

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT.

CI 168  SC 168  P35  L32  # 40
Grow, Robert  RMG Consulting
Comment Type  T  Comment Status  LATE
The acronym PHY is not appropriate for Physical Layer [*10BASE-T1M Physical Layer (PHY)]. Because Physical Layer device and Physical Layer entity identical definitions of the same Physical Layer sublayers, recommend going with Physical Layer device as is the case in Figure 168-1.

Suggested Remedy
10BASE-T1M Physical Layer device (PHY)

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement commenter's proposed remedy and add editor's note at P35 L29 (before text), "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to Working Group ballot) - the use of the acronym PHY is aligned with the expected resolution of comments in the IEEE Std 802.3 revision; Alignment should be checked prior to 802.3da entering WG ballot."

CI 168  SC 168.4  P53  L18  # 26
Jones, Peter  Cisco
Comment Type  E  Comment Status  A
Typo in clause name

Suggested Remedy
Change iysical to Physical

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected  RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line
Pa 53
Li 18
Page 2 of 5
9/22/2021 10:24:00 AM
IEEE P802.3da D0.51 10 Mb/s SPMD Enhancement 3rd Task Force review comments

Comment Type: T
Comment Status: A
Link Monitor

PCS_STATUS and LINK MONITOR are not used/needed.

Suggested Remedy:
Delete "PCS_STATUS and LINK MONITOR", associated editors note, clause 168.4.4 (Link Monitor function) and any other material related to these two functions.

Response: ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete:
P35L21: delete item 1 relating to pcs_status in the editor's note, and remove number from item 2.
P39L32: 168.2.6 PCS_STATUS indication and subclauses
P40L46: PCS_STATUS.indication from Fig 168-3
P53L25: LINK MONITOR and PCS_STATUS.indication from Fig 168-10, and editors note at L48
P56L1: 168.4.4 Link Monitor function (all text, figures, notes and subclauses) through P57L3
P69L34: PICS item PMA4

Comment Type: TR
Comment Status: R
EMC

As we consider more devices connected to the link and longer length as in cg, the requirements have to be improved. This was an outcome of the interoperability discussion of 09-08.

Suggested Remedy:
Add text from clause 146.7.1.4 and increase the values by 10dB. Use 10dB step for each E-level increase and add a table:
The differential to common mode conversion requirement applies to unshielded link segments and depends on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements of Table 146–5 shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 146–7, E1 or E2.
Implement the following formulas and a plateau at 50dB:
TCL E1: 60-20*log(f/10)
TCL E2: 70-20*log(f/10)
Additional information: This leads to 48dB@40MHz for E1 versus 50dB@40MHz for E2.
The graphs differ only from 31MHz upwards to a maximum of 2dB@40MHz.

Response: REJECT.
No change to draft at this time; however, technical presentation, analysis and justification has started to fill in the TBD value for mode conversion, as noted in the editor's note. More discussion is required.
(See Fischer_IEEE P802.3da Multidrop_09222021.pdf)
IEEE P802.3da D0.51 10 Mb/s SPMD Enhancement 3rd Task Force review comments

Cl 168 SC 168.7.3 P62 L32 #39
Fischer, Peter  BKS Kabel-Service AG

Comment Type TR  Comment Status A  EMC

These links are used in very noisy area. Therefore optional shielded links should be allowed. Add coupling attenuation and leave alien crosstalk for unshielded links.

Suggested Remedy

Use the text of 146.7.1.5 and add a similar table as table 146-6:
The coupling attenuation requirement applies to shielded link segments and depends on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements in Table 146–6 shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 146–7, E1, E2, or E3.
Additional information: As above for TCL also for AC the limit shall be increased as we consider more nodes and longer length. The following limits should be implemented:
AC E1: 66-20*\text{log}(f), Plateau 60dB
AC E2: 76-20*\text{log}(f), Plateau 70dB
AC E3: 86-20*\text{log}(f), Plateau 80dB
Change tables on page 72 accordingly.

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Insert new subclause for coupling attenuation (with TBD values) when shielded mixing segments are used, based on 146.7.1.5 (and referencing clause 146)
"The coupling attenuation requirement applies to shielded mixing segments and depends on the electromagnetic noise environment. The requirements in Table 168-x shall be met based on the local environment as described by the electromagnetic classifications given in Table 146–7, E1, E2, or E3."
Insert "Editor's note (to be removed prior to Working Group ballot): Contributions are encouraged to explore the ramifications of using shielded cabling on multidrop segments."

Insert table 168-x with requirements as TBD.

Recommend keeping alien crosstalk for all links. (shielded links have alien crosstalk as well, not measured by coupling attenuation)

Cl 168 SC 168.8.3 P62 L46 #41
Fischer, Peter  BKS Kabel-Service AG

Comment Type E  Comment Status A  Editorial

Typo

Suggested Remedy

Exchange 'DC' by 'dc'; See also table 168-3

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.8.3 P62 L47 #42
Fischer, Peter  BKS Kabel-Service AG

Comment Type TR  Comment Status R  MDI

The statement 'in either polarity, under all operating conditions indefinitely' means additional diode network increasing the cost and reduce the usable power. Plus and Minus must be defined by the MDI connectors by introducing a mechanical protection against incorrect insertion.

Suggested Remedy

Write: … applied across BI_DA+ and BI_DA– as defined in 168.8.1.

Response Response Status C
REJECT.

Polarity swap may also occur within the wiring. Defining the polarity at MDI only would be insufficient. The TF consensus is that polarity insensitivity is an important feature.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>MDI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
<td>168.8.3</td>
<td>TR</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>MDI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SuggestedRemedy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>There is not mentioned that the MDI connector shall be still operating after withdrawal and reinsertion under load to include hot plugging.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>REJECT.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl</td>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
<td>Mixing Segment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
<td>168.11.4.6</td>
<td>TR</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>MXS1: As there is only one pair at the MDI the word ‘any’ can be misleading.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SuggestedRemedy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Add a sentence: The MDI connectors shall be operating after No# of cycles of withdrawal and insertion cycles.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>REJECT.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl</td>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
<td>MDI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
<td>168.10</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Delay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SuggestedRemedy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Add a sentence: Measured between the pair of the MDI attachment points.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ACCEPT.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl</td>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
<td>MDI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
<td>168.11.4.7</td>
<td>TR</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>MDI2: Include hot plugging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SuggestedRemedy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Add number of operation cycles under load.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>REJECT.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Response**

- Fischer, Peter, BKS Kabel-Service AG

**Comment Type**: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general

**Comment Status**: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected

**Response Status**: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn