

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 189 SC 189.3 P112 L26 # 1 [REDACTED]
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Insert space between value and unit
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "30V" with "30 V" and "50V" with "50 V"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P23 L37 # 2 [REDACTED]
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The general style for Definitions in 802.3-2022 is to reference the uppermost Clause number (no precedent for a specific subclause reference).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace, "(see IEEE Std 802.3, 188.9)" with "(see IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 188)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.17.1.1.3 P29 L14 # 3 [REDACTED]
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 A combination of things infers plurality
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "MPD(s)" with "MPDs"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 189 SC 189.3 P112 L11 # 4 [REDACTED]
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 MPD types is a broad topic, so "discussion of" would be grammatically preferred.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "for further discussion on MPD types" with "for further discussion of MPD types"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 189 SC 189.5.4 P130 L40 # 5 [REDACTED]
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 A comma always follows "i.e."
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "i.e." with "i.e.,"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.17.1.1.3 P29 L17 # 7 [REDACTED]
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 189.5.1 refers to MPD types
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace, "MPD Class(s)" with "MPD type(s)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 79 SC 79.3 P43 L3 # 8 [REDACTED]
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The last row in Table 79-1 that's being revised was for "9 to 255"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change Editing Instruction from, "Change the row for subtypes 10 to 255" to "Change the row for subtypes 9 to 255"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P62 L37 # 9

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Shrinks is more commonly associated with making something physically smaller as opposed to reducing the number of things

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "also shrinks" with "also reduces"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

(Editor's note: The Suggested Remedy includes a space before "shrinks" that should not be removed.)

Replace "also shrinks" with "also reduces"

CI 188 SC 188.9.1.2 P137 L # 13

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"e.g.," examples should be contained within parenthesis.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace ", e.g., NFPA70– the National Electrical Code® (NEC®) relevant to the maximum class supported." with " (e.g., NFPA70– the National Electrical Code® (NEC®) relevant to the maximum class supported)."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 189 SC 189.7.8 P138 L13 # 16

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting and Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Category" is not capitalized in the ANSI/TIA-568 series of Standards unless it appears at the start of a sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "TIA Category" with "TIA category"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 79 SC 79.3 P43 L8 # 18

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There seem to be two sets of editing instrucionts, one that adds subtype 9 and changes the "Reserved" row and a secon that adds rows 9-12 and updates the "Reserved" field. If both editing instructions are followed then we will end up with 2 rows for subtype 9.

SuggestedRemedy

remove the first set of editing instructions, but leave the second

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

There are two instructions (one change and one insert) for the table as follows:

- 1) The numbering for the reserved row needs to be changed (comment #12 corrects the instruction - it should read, "Change the row for subtypes 9 to 255 in Table 79–1") , and
- 2) a new subtype row (9) for the PLCA TLV) needs to be inserted

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.2 P63 L15 # 19

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

COR should be CRS (2 locations)

SuggestedRemedy

change "COR" to "CRS" on page 63 lines 15 and 16

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 188 SC 188.4.2.7 P80 L16 # 23

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

The "COMMIT" state is not setting tx_sym so based on the current state machine, COMMIT will never be transmitted (instead SILENCE will continue during the commit cycle)

SuggestedRemedy

Add "tx_sym <= COMMIT" in the COMMIT state

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 30 **SC 30.17.1.1.10** **P30** **L32** # **26**

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,Onsemi,Sor

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**

typo - "MEASUREMENT" (not "MEASURMENT", missing the E before the M). This occurs twice.

SuggestedRemedy

Change MEASURMENT to MEASUREMENT at P30 L32 & P33 L17 (30.17.2.1.11)

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 **SC 30.17.1.1.7** **P30** **L3** # **27**

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,Onsemi,Sor

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**

typo "Capabilities" should be "Capabilities" (missing the "i" between the l and the t) this occurs 6 times.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Capabilities" to "Capabilities" at P30 L3, P30 L14, P30 L25, P32 L39, P32 L50, P33 L10.

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 **SC 148.4.4.6** **P56** **L6** # **29**

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,Onsemi,Sor

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**

typo "TRASNSMIT"

SuggestedRemedy

change "TRASNSMIT" to "TRANSMIT"

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accommodated by comment #82.

change 'TRASNSMIT' to 'TRANSMIT'

Cl 148 **SC 148.4.7.2** **P63** **L14** # **30**

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,Onsemi,Sor

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**

typo - "COR" should be "CRS". (2 instances)

SuggestedRemedy

change "COR" and "The MII signal COR." to "CRS" and "The MII signal CRS."

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accommodated by comment #19.

change "COR" to "CRS" on page 63 lines 15 and 16

Cl 189 **SC 189.1.2** **P110** **L42** # **33**

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,Onsemi,Sor

Comment Type T **Comment Status D** **EZ**

We only have one pair, so why do we say "over the same pairs as data"?

SuggestedRemedy

P110 L42 change "pairs as the data" to "pair as the data" and "dedicated pairs" to "dedicated pair"

P110 L44 Change "When power is provided over the same pairs as data" to "When power is provided over the same pair as data"

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

(Editor's note: Need an 'a' before "dedicated pair". Incorporate text proposed in comment #59.)

P110 L42 change "pairs as the data" to "pair as the data" and "dedicated pairs" to "a dedicated pair"

P110 L44 Change "When power is provided over the same pairs as data" to "When power and data are carried on the same pair"

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

CI 189 SC 189.4.4.2 P114 L44 # 34 [REDACTED]
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,Onsemi,Sor
Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
state names should be all caps (4 instances), also , high state name is incorrect (3 instances)
SuggestedRemedy
change "most recent discover_high or discover_low" state to most recent
"DISCOVERY_HIGH_MARK or DISCOVERY_LOW state" (P114 L44, 48, and 51)
Change "later discovery_low" to "later DISCOVERY_LOW" (P115 L2
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 189 SC 189.4.5 P120 L19 # 38 [REDACTED]
Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
paragraph justification has left this line with HUGE spaces. Please fix.
SuggestedRemedy
Fix spacing of paragraph.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 189 SC 189.4.5 P120 L27 # 39 [REDACTED]
Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Need the oxford comma after DISCOVERY_LOWx, other wise the sentence can be read to
say that all the discovery events are DISCOVERY_LOWx and DISCOVER_HIGH_MARKx.
SuggestedRemedy
please add comma
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 189 SC 189.5.4 P129 L50 # 44 [REDACTED]
Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"...MPI enters the V[MPD_mark] specification as defined in Table 189-7..."
not sure how we 'enter a specification', I think we meant 'enter the range'.
SuggestedRemedy
replace 'specification' with 'range'
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P62 L26 # 50 [REDACTED]
Jones, Peter Cisco Systems
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Align text with state diagram terminology
SuggestedRemedy
Replace "switches" with "transitions"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P62 L28 # 51 [REDACTED]
Jones, Peter Cisco Systems
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Align text with state diagram terminology
SuggestedRemedy
Replace "switching " with "transitioning"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P62 L34 # 52 [REDACTED]
Jones, Peter Cisco Systems
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Align text with state diagram terminology
SuggestedRemedy
Replace "will switch" with "transitions"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P62 L39 # 53

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Align text with state diagram terminology

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "will switch" with "transitions"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P62 L48 # 54

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Align text with state diagram terminology

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "switch" with " transition"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P63 L1 # 55

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Align text with state diagram terminology

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "will switch" with "transition"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 189 SC 189.1.2 P110 L42 # 58

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

Clean up text to remove references to multiple pairs.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "the power may be provided over the same pairs as the data or over dedicated pairs with power only" with "the power may be provided over the same pair as the data or over a dedicated pair with power only."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accommodated by comment #33.

P110 L42 change "pairs as the data" to "pair as the data" and "dedicated pairs" to "a dedicated pair"

P110 L44 Change "When power is provided over the same pairs as data" to "When power and data are carried on the same pair"

CI 189 SC 189.1.2 P110 L44 # 59

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

Clean up text to remove references to multiple pairs.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "When the power is provided over the same pairs as data" with "When power and data are carried on the same pair"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accommodated by comment #33.

P110 L42 change "pairs as the data" to "pair as the data" and "dedicated pairs" to "a dedicated pair"

P110 L44 Change "When power is provided over the same pairs as data" to "When power and data are carried on the same pair"

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.6 P58 L50 # 66

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The exit transition from NEXT_TX_OPPORTUNITY to hop G appears to begin with a "local_nodeID! = 0) where there is a space between the ! and the = is trying to be a not equal check, but you use the crossed through = sign for the compare to 255.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the != to a crossed through equal sign

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P66 L49 # 69

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The SOFT_CLAIMING has an extra indent in the FOLLOWER re-entry branch of Figure 148-6

SuggestedRemedy

Align HARD and SOFT CLAIMING text

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.6 P67 L18 # 80

Baggett, Tim Microchip

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

The logic in the TXOP_END state is incorrectly indented making readability difficult.

SuggestedRemedy

Change text in TXOP_END state to:

```
IF dplca_txop_id = 0 THEN
  IF short_cnt = soft_aging_cycles THEN
    CLEAR_SOFT_CLAIMS(txop_claim_table)
    CLEAR_SOFT_CLAIMS(txop_claim_table_new)
    short_cnt <= 0
  ELSE
    short_cnt <= short_cnt + 1
  END
```

```
IF long_cnt = hard_aging_cycles THEN
  txop_claim_table <= txop_claim_table_new
  CLEAR_TXOP_TABLE(txop_claim_table_new)
  dplca_new_age <= TRUE
  long_cnt <= 0
ELSE
  long_cnt <= long_cnt + 1
END
END
```

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.6 P56 L6 # 82

McClellan, Brett Marvell

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

typo change 'TRASNSMIT' to 'TRANSMIT'

SuggestedRemedy

change 'TRASNSMIT' to 'TRANSMIT'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

CI 148 SC 148.4.4.2 P55 L 22 # 83

McClellan, Brett

Marvell

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

per remedy of comment 323 on D2.0, dplca_en should have values defined as follows:

Values:

TRUE: The D-PLCA function is enabled

FALSE: The D-PLCA function is disabled or not present

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Values: TRUE or FALSE" to

"Values:

TRUE: The D-PLCA function is enabled

FALSE: The D-PLCA function is disabled or not present"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 189 SC 189.4.6 P122 L 6 # 85

Paul, Michael

Analog Devices

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table 189-5 Should be titled MPSE output requirements

SuggestedRemedy

Change PSE to MPSE

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 189 SC 189.5.5 P131 L 35 # 86

Paul, Michael

Analog Devices

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

missing emdashes in 189-9 item 2

SuggestedRemedy

add missing emdashes in item 2 "Min" column

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

add missing Em dashes in item 2 "Min" column

Editor to perform a global replacement of En dash with Em dash in empty table cells.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P62 L 16 # 101

Law, David

HPE

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Suggest that '... as part of the nodeID assignment ...' should read '... as part of the local_nodeID assignment ...' to match the references to local_nodeID in the first sentence of this paragraph.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.2 P63 L 15 # 102

Law, David

HPE

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

A variable 'COR' is defined as the 'The MII signal COR.'. This should be 'CRS'.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the two instances of 'COR' to 'CRS'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accommodated by comment #19.

change "COR" to "CRS" on page 63 lines 15 and 16

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.3 P65 L 22 # 103

Law, David

HPE

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The second sentence of the first paragraph of the PICK_FREE_TXOP function description says, 'It returns any ID that ...'. Item (b) of the description then starts, 'it shall not return an ID greater ...'. The last sentence, however, says, '... the function will return the next TO immediately following the highest HARD claimed TO in the table ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the two instances of 'TO' to 'ID'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 188 SC 188.1.1 P71 L18 # 107

Law, David

HPE

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

A medium 'box' with a vertical left end usually signifies the end of the point-to-point media at the MDI. A shared media is signified by a vertical zig-zag at both ends (see IEEE std 802.3-2022 Figure 1-1).

SuggestedRemedy

Change the medium 'box' vertical left end to be a vertical zig-zag.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 188 SC 188.2 P72 L10 # 108

Law, David

HPE

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Suggest that '... PHY supports only shared media ...' should read '... PHY only supports shared media ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 188 SC 188.1.2 P71 L31 # 112

Schreiner, Stephan

Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Text passage contains the word "MDI" several times.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "MDI" to "TCI"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.