IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

**Comment ID 169 SC 169.5 P108 L22 # 164**

Maguire, Valerie
Copperopolis; affl w/ CME Consulting

**Comment Type E** **Comment Status D** **EZ**

This condition is an event in time, not in location.

**SuggestedRemedy**
Replace "Where the MPD PI..." with "When the MPD PI..."

**Proposed Response**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment ID 148 SC 148.4.4.6 P43 L44 # 167**

Jones, Chad
Cisco Systems, Inc.

**Comment Type E** **Comment Status D** **EZ**

the transition from COMMIT to ABORT, the arrowhead does not touch the boundary of ABORT

**SuggestedRemedy**
make arrowhead for the transition from COMMIT to ABORT touch the boundary of ABORT.

**Proposed Response**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment ID 168 SC 168.6.6.3 P77 L29 # 171**

Jones, Chad
Cisco Systems, Inc.

**Comment Type E** **Comment Status D** **EZ**

rouge "0" and "180" floating in the drawing. Delete these.

**SuggestedRemedy**
Delete the "0" and "180" that seem to have no purpose in Fig 168-13

**Proposed Response**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE - see comment 255.

**Comment ID 168 SC 168.9.4 P85 L41 # 173**

Jones, Chad
Cisco Systems, Inc.

**Comment Type E** **Comment Status D** **EZ**

Table 168-4 allowed to span across pages. This table is not that big that it needs to span pages. Can we force it to stay together?

**SuggestedRemedy**
change table attributes to disallow spanning pages.

**Proposed Response**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment ID 168 SC 168.10.2.1 P86 L48 # 174**

Jones, Chad
Cisco Systems, Inc.

**Comment Type E** **Comment Status D** **EZ**

Text is awkwardly spaced, looks like spacing setting is set to "justify" instead of "align left". Also on page 87, line 5

**SuggestedRemedy**
change line spacing attributes to match the surrounding text, i.e. "align left" instead of "whole line justify".

**Proposed Response**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment ID 169 SC 169.4 P98 L42 # 179**

Jones, Chad
Cisco Systems, Inc.

**Comment Type E** **Comment Status D** **EZ**

item e), we added react in the last cycle. Reading again it should have been "react to".

**SuggestedRemedy**
Add "to" in item e): "To sense, react TO, and recover from..."

**Proposed Response**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add "to" in item e): "To sense, react to, and recover from..."
IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

**Comment ID 180**

Jones, Chad  
Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type: E  
Comment Status: D  
Response Status: W  

**Suggested Remedy**:  
PI should be MPI.

**Proposed Response**:  
replace PI with MPI.

**PROPOSED ACCEPT.**

**Comment ID 184**

Jones, Chad  
Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type: E  
Comment Status: D  
Response Status: W  

**Suggested Remedy**:  
delete "it" after MPSE and make \( V_{\text{Discovery}} \) match Table 169-3 item 2

**Proposed Response**:  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment ID 185**

Jones, Chad  
Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type: E  
Comment Status: D  
Response Status: W  

**Suggested Remedy**:  
either add to "...if overload_detected is TRUE, IF short_circuit_detected is TRUE, or if...”  
OR  
bulletize:  
full operating voltage shall be removed from the TCI for any of the following reasons:  
* in the absence of the MPD MPS  
* if overload_detected is TRUE  
* if short_circuit_detected is TRUE  
* if commanded to do so by a management entity.

**Proposed Response**:  
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

**Comment ID 188**

Jones, Chad  
Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type: E  
Comment Status: D  
Response Status: W  

**Suggested Remedy**:  
three things on this line:  
DISCOVERY_LOW again  
need "the" before discovery event current  
and need a comma after discovery event current

**Proposed Response**:  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Comment ID 210 Page 3 of 6 6/10/2024 8:38:10 AM

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

---

Cl: 169  SC: 169.5  P: 108  L: 22  #189

Jones, Chad  Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: D  EZ

"Where the MPD PI is not exposed" either this is MPD MPI (which we just said two words earlier) or this is MPI. I'd suggested the latter.

Suggested Remedy:

change MPD PI to MPI

Proposed Response  Response Status: W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl: 169  SC: 169.5.4  P: 116  L: 1  #192

Jones, Chad  Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: D  EZ

three things here:
need a comma after TRUE in the first paragraph.
Need a comma after FALSE in the second paragraph.
Two periods at the end of the second paragraph.

Suggested Remedy:

add comma after TRUE on line 1. add comma after FALSE on line 4. delete extra period at end of line 5.

Proposed Response  Response Status: W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl: 169  SC: 169.3  P: 98  L: 19  #230

Zimmerman, George  CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: D  EZ

The top row of Table 169-1 got messed up. The word contact should not be there, and System type should not be bold.

Suggested Remedy:

Delete header "Contact" in first column (leaving header blank), Make first body row (System type) not bold.

Proposed Response  Response Status: W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

**Comment**  
**Comment Type** E  
**Comment Status** D  
**Comment ID** 231  
**Zimmerman, George**  
CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
**Figure 169-2 text is in the wrong font - should be sans-serif like other figures (Arial or similar - editor to check)**  
**Suggested Remedy**  
Change fonts in figure 169-2 to align with Figure 169-1.  
**Proposed Response**  
**Response Status** W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment**  
**Comment Type** T  
**Comment Status** D  
**Comment ID** 232  
**Zimmerman, George**  
CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
**I believe V_MPD is a variable, not a constant.**  
**Suggested Remedy**  
Delete V_MPD and definition at P109 L47-48  
**Proposed Response**  
**Response Status** W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment**  
**Comment Type** T  
**Comment Status** D  
**Comment ID** 234  
**Zimmerman, George**  
CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
**V_Mark_th, V_Off_MPD, V_Reset_th, V_type0_th, and V_type1_th are constants, they are listed in the constant section. They can’t also be variables.**  
**Suggested Remedy**  
Delete V_Mark_th, V_Off_MPD, V_Reset_th, V_type0_th, and V_type1_th from the variables section (along with their descriptions - (P110 L49-51 (V_MPD)...))  
**Proposed Response**  
**Response Status** W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment**  
**Comment Type** T  
**Comment Status** D  
**Comment ID** 235  
**Zimmerman, George**  
CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
**Nomenclature in state diagrams is "=" for an equality condition, not "+="**  
**Suggested Remedy**  
Replace == with = on output branches from PON_EVAL and PON_LOAD_ON in Figure 169-8 (8 instances)  
**Proposed Response**  
**Response Status** W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment**  
**Comment Type** T  
**Comment Status** D  
**Comment ID** 236  
**Zimmerman, George**  
CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
**V_type1_th should be have type1_th in subscript**  
**Suggested Remedy**  
Change V_type1_th to V_type1_th (subscript type1_th) on output branches of PON_EVAL and PON_LOAD_ON (6 instances)  
**Proposed Response**  
**Response Status** W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Comment**  
**Comment Type** T  
**Comment Status** D  
**Comment ID** 238  
**Zimmerman, George**  
CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
**V_TYPE0_TH and V_TYPE1_TH have case inconsistent with variables in state diagrams**  
**Suggested Remedy**  
Make V_TYPE0_TH and V_TYPE1_TH V_type0_th and V_type1_th as in state diagrams  
**Proposed Response**  
**Response Status** W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5 P117 L39 # 239
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
I_MPD_DISABLED has case inconsistent with other values
SuggestedRemedy
Change I_MPD_DISABLED to I_MPD_Disabled in Table 169-8 and 169.5.5.1 (P118 L2)
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P50 L2 # 282
Baggett, Tim Microchip
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Transition into DISABLED state has misspelled variable "ldplca_en" in second term. Term should refer to variable "dplca_en"
SuggestedRemedy
Change "plca_reset + !ldplca_en + !plca_en" to "plca_reset + !dplca_en + !plca_en"
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.2 P56 L12 # 254
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Units should have space.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "50m" to "50 m".
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
(note to editor - nonbreaking space)

Cl 168 SC 168.6.3 P77 L32 # 555
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Figure 168-13, 180 is misplaced from the BALUN.
SuggestedRemedy
Move "180" to just below "0".
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Sentence incorrectly refers to the "10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 148". Clause 148 is PLCA. The 10BASE-T1S reference should be to Clause 147.

When corrected, the sentence will still be awkwardly repetitive referring to the "10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 147 when the Clause 147 PHY is running half-duplex in multidrop mode". Delete repetition.

Finally, "operation ON the" is awkward and should probably be "operation OF the".

**Suggested Remedy**

Change: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation on the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 148 when the Clause 147 PHY is running half-duplex in multidrop mode."

To: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation of the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 147 when running half-duplex in multidrop mode."

**PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.**

Change: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation on the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 148 when the Clause 147 PHY is running half-duplex in multidrop mode."

To: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation of the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 147 when running half-duplex in multidrop mode."

---

Item TCI1 Feature says without PMA loading. This is in contradiction to e.g. 168.9.1 " PMA loads specified for the TCI are to be connected if the DTE is electrically disconnected from the TCI.". Similar for TCI3

**Suggested Remedy**

Remove TCI1 and TCI3 from table

**PROPOSED ACCEPT.**