

IEEE P802.3da D2.1 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 148 **SC 148.4.4.6** **P58** **L50** # **67**

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **R** *Editorial*

The exit transitions from NEXT_TX_OPPORTUNITY to B does a greater than or equal to compare to plca_node_count and it looks like the exit to G does a less than or equal to comparison. If so then which branch are you supposed to take if curlD is equal to plca_node_count.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the transition to G to be just a less than compare to plca_node_count.

Response **Response Status** **W**

REJECT.

No change to draft. The Commenter appears to have misread the use of < and underline (to indicate inserted text) as a less than or equal to sign on the exit condition to branch G.

Cl 148 **SC 148.4.4.6** **P58** **L35** # **68**

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **R** *PLCA*

In the BURST state there is no "stop append_commit_timer" So if you re-etner BURST state won't the append_commit_timer_done be true? Which means you'd enter ABORT instead of waiting out the burst_timer if you have max_bc > 0.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "stop append_commit_timer" before the IF statement in BURST state of Figure 148-4, part b

Response **Response Status** **W**

REJECT.

The suggesting re-entry doesn't happen after append_commit_timer is started. Looping occurs if BURST exits to "F", going to TRANSMIT, which then comes back to BURST, which only happens when max_bc > 0. (in this case BURST/TRANSMIT loop until either the burst count (bc) is >= max_bc, in which case it moves on, to the next TO, or the burst_timer is complete and TX_EN has dropped. append_commit_timer isn't started in this loop. append_commit_timer is only started when max_bc is = 0, and in this case, burst_timer is not started, so BURST waits until append_commit_timer is done before exiting to ABORT. Note that max_bc is not changed in the state diagram (it maps to a management attribute - and if these are changed, then it is likely plca needs a reset).

Cl 188 **SC 188.4.2.7** **P81** **L9** # **70**

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **A** *Editorial*

"not_done" is not a timer property, just "_done"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "xmit_max_timer_not_done" to "!xmit_max_timer_done" in the ESD -> GOOD_ESD and DATA -> DATA transitions in Figure 188-5 part b

Response **Response Status** **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

(Editor's note: No change to Suggested Remedy, but Commenter may wish to submit a Maintenance request to also make this change to Figure 147-5.)

Change "xmit_max_timer_not_done" to "!xmit_max_timer_done" in the ESD -> GOOD_ESD and DATA -> DATA transitions in Figure 188-5 part b

Cl 188 **SC 188.12.4.1** **P105** **L35** # **73**

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **A** *PCS*

There should be PICS for the unjab_timer

SuggestedRemedy

Add a PICS for the unjab_timer point to 188.4.2.9 with a Status of O and Yes / NA options

Response **Response Status** **W**

ACCEPT.