

IEEE P802.3da D2.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 189 SC 189.6.1 P153 L10 # 115

Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG

Comment Type TR Comment Status R TCI

Equation 189-1 causes issues with sections 188.8 and 188.9. For high unit loads greater than 11, the channel return loss specified in 188.8 cannot be met because the MPI RL limit is more lenient than the channel RL limit. For lower unit loads, it is assumed that the channel return loss will also not be met and therefore needs to be verified. For unit loads greater than 3, the return loss limit, in conjunction with the TCI insertion loss, is not passive, contradicting the concept of making the return loss dependent on the unit load in order to reduce implementation effort. The limit line at frequencies above 26.5 MHz is stricter than the TCI return loss, impacting technical feasibility. In summary, the introduction of 189.6.1 and its dependency on the Unit Load Concept affects multiple sections in 188.8 and 188.9 and will require significant effort to resolve and align the affected requirements.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a note: Impairments to sections 188.8 and 188.9 have been identified. Adaptations to sections 188.8, 188.9, and 189.6.1 might be necessary to maintain consistency and technical feasibility.

Response Response Status W

REJECT.
Commenter offers insufficient information for a remedy.

Note: Chair to charter an ad hoc to review return loss as well as TCI requirements for carrying power. Ad hoc to report by July - in preparation for comments to initial SA ballot.