C/ 00 SC 0	P 3	L 3	# 1	C/ 00 SC 0	P 12	L11	# 4
Maguire, Valerie	The Siemon C	ompany		Maguire, Valerie	The Siemor	n Company	
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Editorial	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Editoria
For consistency with t the term is used befor	he title of the document, replace re Ethernet.	ce "single pair"	with "single-pair" when	For consistency wi the term is used be	th the title of the document, rep efore Ethernet.	lace "single pair" v	with "single-pair" when
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Replace "Single Pair"	with "Single-Pair"			Replace "Single Pa	air" with "Single-Pair"		
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W			Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC	Response Status W		
C/ 00 SC 0	P10	L 34	# [2]	C/FM SC FM	P1	L11	# 5
Maguire, Valerie	The Siemon C	company		Dawe, Piers	Nvidia		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Editorial	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ
separately to that proj	with "Single-Pair" Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE. gested. Comment on 802.3dd ect.	title will need to		SuggestedRemedy Change "Amendm Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC	ent:" to Amendment 2:" <i>Response Status</i> W EPT.		
C/ 00 SC 0	P 10	L 39	# 3				
Maguire, Valerie	The Siemon C	company					
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Editorial				
For consistency with t	he title of the document, replace re Ethernet.	ce "single pair"	with "single-pair" when				
the term is used befor							
the term is used befor SuggestedRemedy	with "Single-Pair"						
	with "Single-Pair" Response Status W						

C/ FM	SC F	м	P 1	L 29	# 6	C/ FM	SC	FM	P1	L 30	# 7	
Dawe, Pi	ers		Nvidia			Dawe, Pie	ers		Nvidia			
Commen	t Type	ER	Comment Status	0	PAR scope	Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status D		PAR	scope
	ction 7, "N ar at all.	MAC Me	rge sublayer" appears	54 times and "MAC N	Merge function" does not		It can'		d TSSI support PHYs while o ways round. The floor supp			
Suggeste	edRemedy	/										
			terminology; change "I	MAC Merge function"	to "MAC Merge	Suggeste		•				
	yer" in thr	•	es.						words than "support". The to on and the Time Synchroniza			`
Proposed	l Respons	se	Response Status	N					Single-Pair Ethernet point to			3
			IN PRINCIPLE.			Simila	arly in th	ne abstra	ct on page 3.			
Char	ige "MAC	Merge f	unction" to "MAC Merg	e sublayer" in the Ab	stract on page 3.				2.3de on page 10 could be:			
Leav	e it as "M/	AC Merc	e function" on pages 1	and 10. to align with	the PAR Scope in 5.2b.		HYS CON ace (TS		with the MAC Merge function	and the Time Sy	nchronization Serv	rice
					·				stract and the description be	very similar?		
			is the terminology use			Proposed	Respor	nse	Response Status W			
			ifference was discusse		ndment on page 1 and in written, and the	,	,	REJECT	,			
					specify that function in.				vith the commenter.			
					ile the abstract defines				igned with the scope of the P			the
	specificat			it was changed) and	I therefore the change to				ecification, which aligns with t tion text in the frontmatter is			
Subia	iyei is app	Jophale	there.				0 0	•	subsequent amendments all			
						C/ FM	SC	FM	P3	L 4	# 8	
						Dawe, Pie	ers		Nvidia			
						Comment	Type	Е	Comment Status D			ΕZ
						802.3		_				
						Suggeste	dReme	dy				

802.3de Proposed Response

> PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add "802.3de™ " to keyword list.

Comment ID 8

Response Status W

(802.3cg should remain because this amendment relates to PHYs added by 802.3cg)

C/FM SC FM	P10	L 39	# 9	C/ 90 SC 90.1	P13	L 8	# 12
Dawe, Piers	Nvidia			Dawe, Piers	Nvidia		
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Alignment	Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Editoria
IEEE Std 802.3-2018					r the reader. There are now		
SuggestedRemedy					ted to memorise them. There	e is only one PH	Y type in Clause 147.
IEEE Std 802.3-202x				SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Change "as well as Cla See other comments o	ause 147 PHYs" to "as well a n the same text.	s for 10BASE-T	1S (see Clause 147)".
PROPOSED ACCEPT	l.			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
C/FM SC FM	P12	L3	# 10	PROPOSED ACCEPT			
Dawe, Piers	Nvidia			Accomodated by comn Response to comment			
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		EZ	(This might be better re	eversed:		
Amendment X					r 10BASE-T1S (see Clause 1 peration only, and for other F		
SuggestedRemedy				·		,,	· ·
As it says in page 10:	Amendment 2			C/ 90 SC 90.1	P 13	L 8	# 13
Proposed Response	Response Status W			Dawe, Piers	Nvidia		
PROPOSED ACCEPT				Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Editoria
				As the standard order i date?)	s slow to fast, and "as well a	s" implies some	kind of priority (in
C/FM SC FM	P 12	L 48	# 11	,			
Dawe, Piers	Nvidia			SuggestedRemedy			
Comment Type E	Comment Status D		Frontmatter	This might be better re The TSSI is defined for	versed: r 10BASE-T1S (see Clause 1	147) in the point-	to-point full-duplex and
	EE P802.3bk are ancient his				peration only, and for other F		
	it would help the reviewers an endment projects running in p			Proposed Response	Response Status W		
SuggestedRemedy		saranor word gr	011.	PROPOSED ACCEPT			
	802.3bj and IEEE P802.3bk"	to the correct lis	t of other IEEE 802.3				
amendment projects r	unning in parallel that modify	the same text a	nd tables "IEEE				
	rere none, delete "(e.g., IEEE	P802.3bj and IE	EE P802.3bk)".)				
Change "modified" to Proposed Response							
PROPOSED REJECT	Response Status W						
	ith the commenter. 802.3bj a	and 802.3bk are	given purely as an				

The CRG disagrees with the commenter. 802.3bj and 802.3bk are given purely as an example, and the reader gets the point - they are amendments with adjacent (or nearadjacent) designations running at the same time.

CI 99	SC	99.1	P 14	L 9	# 14	C/ 99	SC 99.1	F	°14	L 8	# 15
Dawe, Pie	ers		Nvidia			Dawe, Pier	s	Nvie	dia		
Comment	t Type	TR	Comment Status D		Half-Duplex	Comment 7	Туре Т	Comment Statu	ıs D		Editoria
not be	elieve is	the intent	C Merge to half-duplex PHYs tion and is outside the scope	of the PAR (5.2	2.b says "10 Mb/s Single			kt in 99.1 made sense d s and a single PHY" do			k, "a point-to-point link
Pair E	Ethernet	point to p	point PHYs"). TR because ou	itside the scope	e of the PAR.	Suggested	Remedy				
Suggeste	edRemed	dy				See su	ggestion in	another comment on th	ne same te	ext	
Unde	elete "full	-duplex" h	nere where it applies to 100 N	1b/s or higher, c	or change the PAR.	Proposed F	Response	Response Statu	s W		
Proposed	d Respor	nse	Response Status W					EPT IN PRINCIPLE.	•		
-			IN PRINCIPLE.			-		onse does not provide s	ufficient de	etail to make a d	change.
Resp ACCE Repla	oonse to EPT IN F ace the f	d by comm comment PRINCIPL irst senter e text), to	: 39 is: .E. nce of 99.1 (with appropriate :	change marks a	and change instruction	Respor ACCEF Replac	nse to comr PT IN PRIN	CIPLE. entence of 99.1 (with ap	opropriate	change marks a	and change instruction
a pair applic (Clau	r of MAC cable to ise 147)	s and a s full-duple PHYs and	an optional MAC Merge subla single PHY operating on a poi x operation with 10BASE-T1L d all PHYs 100 Mb/s and abo n with the 10BASE-T1S (Claus	nt-to-point link. . (Clause 146) a ve. It is also ap	The clause is and 10BASE-T1S oplicable to half-duplex	a pair c applica	of MACs an Ible to full-d	fies an optional MAC M d a single PHY operatin uplex operation with 10 s and all PHYs 100 Mb/	ng on a poi BASE-T1L	int-to-point link. _ (Clause 146) a	ind 10BASE-T1S

10BASE-T1S PHY in multidrop mode is not specified."

Comment ID 15

point-to-point operation with the 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHY, but operation with the

10BASE-T1S PHY in multidrop mode is not specified."

C/ 99	SC	99.1	P 14	L 9	# 16	C/ 99 S	C 99.1	
Dawe, Pie	ers		Nvidia			Dawe, Piers		
Commen	t Type	Е	Comment Status D		Half-Duplex	Comment Type	TR	Cor
As th	e standa	ard order	r is slow to fast, short to long, an	d "as well as	" implies some kind of	As for Clau	se 90, nee	d to mal

priority (in date?)...

SuggestedRemedy

This might be better reversed:

This clause specifies an optional MAC Merge sublayer for use on a point-to-point link with 10BASE-T1S (see Clause 147) or 10BASE-T1L (see Clause 146) PHYs, or PHYs operating at 100 Mb/s or higher, and a pair of full-duplex MACs for each PHY.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The proposed rewording could be introduces confusion as to whether point-to-point, clause 147 PHYs with a pair of half-duplex MACs are included (they are).

Accomodated by comment 39:

Response to comment 39 is:

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace the first sentence of 99.1 (with appropriate change marks and change instruction from the base text), to read:

"This clause specifies an optional MAC Merge sublayer for use on a point-to-point link with a pair of MACs and a single PHY operating on a point-to-point link. The clause is applicable to full-duplex operation with 10BASE-T1L (Clause 146) and 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHYs and all PHYs 100 Mb/s and above. It is also applicable to half-duplex point-to-point operation with the 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHY, but operation with the 10BASE-T1S PHY in multidrop mode is not specified."

CI 99	SC 99.1	P14	L 10	# 17
Dawe, Pi	ers	Nvidia		
Commen	t Type TR	Comment Status D		Half-Duplex

As for Clause 90, need to make clear which modes of 10BASE-T1S can and can't use MAC Merge (according to the scope of the project in the PAR, only the point to point modes can). The draft text is too brief, and may be ambiguous.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a sentence "The MAC Merge sublayer is optional with 10BASE-T1S in full-duplex pointto-point and half-duplex point-to-point modes, and not applicable with 10BASE-T1S halfduplex shared-medium mode (referred to as multidrop mode); or make this clear and unambiguous another way; or change the PAR.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Accomodated by comment 39: Response to comment 39 is: ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace the first sentence of 99.1 (with appl

Replace the first sentence of 99.1 (with appropriate change marks and change instruction from the base text), to read:

"This clause specifies an optional MAC Merge sublayer for use on a point-to-point link with a pair of MACs and a single PHY operating on a point-to-point link. The clause is applicable to full-duplex operation with 10BASE-T1L (Clause 146) and 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHYs and all phys 100 Mb/s and above. It is also applicable to half-duplex point-to-point operation with the 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHY, but operation with the 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHY, but operation with the 10BASE-T1S PHY in multidrop mode is not specified."

C/ FM	SC	FM	P3	L1	# 18	1
Wienckow	ski, Nat	alie	General Motors			-
Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status D		EZ	Ζ
poor v	vording					

SuggestedRemedy

Change: This amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x to specify additions to To: This amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specifies additions to

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 90	SC 90.4.1.1	P13	L 27	# 19	C/ FM	SC FM	P10	L 39	# 21
Wienckov	wski, Natalie	General Motor	s		Zimmerma	an, George	CME Consulti	ng/ADI, APL G	o, Cisco, CommScope,
	<i>t Type</i> E ge to match 802.3	Comment Status D cx D2.1 text		Figure NOTE		<i>Type</i> E ges to IEEE St	Comment Status D d 802.3-2018" should be "chang	ges to IEEE Std	Alignment 802.3"
Char Inder 10BA imple To: I Inter	Dendent Interfaces ASE-T1L, 10BASE ementations NOTE 1—In this fig faces for implement	this figure, the xMII is used as for implementations of -T1S, and 100 Mb/s and abor gure, the xMII is used as a ge tations of r example: for 10 Mb/s and 1	ve. For example	: for 100 Mb/s ne Media Independent	Proposed PROF Accor	e "-2018" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEF	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. nment #9, response to commer x"	nt #9 is ACCEP	Т
	d Response	Response Status W			C/ FM	SC FM	P4	L 8	# 22
,	POSED ACCEPT	,			Zimmerma	an, George	CME Consulti	ng/ADI, APL G	o, Cisco, CommScope,
Acco Resp	modated by commonse to comment	nent #31	's note. and ed	t to change the NOTE.)			Comment Status D as exception to IEEE style which	n is obsolete.	EZ
Cl 99 Wienckov Commen chan	SC 99.1 wski, Natalie <i>t Type</i> E	P14 General Motor Comment Status D cx D2.1 text in NOTE1 in 90.	L 15 s	# 20 Figure NOTE	proces the fro numbo restar conse	ss is the number ont matter. Inste- ers, with the dr ting at 1 with A ecutively with	ead of the front matter being lov	ver case Romai	n numeral page
Char To: Proposed	nge: 10BASE-T1L	, 10BASE-T1S, and 100 Mb/s e. For example: for 10 Mb/s a Response Status W	and above. Fo and 100 Mb/s	or example: for 100 Mb/s	PROF Resol	ved by comme	Response Status W PT IN PRINCIPLE. nt 43, Response to comment 43 graph of the note.)	3 is ACCEPT	
Acco	modated by comm	nent #36			C/ FM	SC FM	P 9	L17	# 23
	oonse to comment hove the second e	#36 is ACCEPT: ditorial instruction in 99.1 and	the paragraph	following it.)	Zimmerma	an, George	CME Consulti	ng/ADI, APL G	o, Cisco, CommScope,
(note and a	- this aligns with t	he text of 802.3dc D3.0. P80 en made to bring 802.3cx in a	2.3cx_D2p1 fol	lows this amendment,	"Ether Suggested Repla with c (includ Proposed	<i>dRemedy</i> ce "Ethernet at	Response Status W	works: Carrier s	sense multiple access

C/FM SC FM	P9	L19	# 24	C/ FM	SC FM	P9	L 40	# 27
Zimmerman, George	CME C	Consulting/ADI, APL G	p, Cisco, CommScope,	Zimmerma	an, George	CME	Consulting/ADI, A	PL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,
Comment Type E	Comment Status	D	Alignment	Comment	Type E	Comment Status	D	Alignment
	C protocol was added t align with intro text in 802.	3dc D3.0		Sectio 802.3-		nex 33A - there is no A	nnex 33E, this wa	is an error in the intro to
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	dRemedy			
Replace "was add protocol were add	ded" with "and the ability to	use an Ethertype to sp	pecify the MAC client			to "Annex 33A"		
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC	Response Status	w		,	Response POSED ACCEP	Response Status T.	W	
C/ FM SC FM		L 24	# [05	C/ FM	SC FM	P10) L13	# 28
	-		# 25	Zimmerma	an, George	CME	Consulting/ADI, A	PL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,
Zimmerman, George		0	p, Cisco, CommScope,	Comment	Type E	Comment Status	D	Alignment
Comment Type E		-	Alignment	"as we	ell the 40 Gb/s"	should be "as well as 4	0 Gb/s" to align w	vith 802.3dc D3.0
Trademark symbo ballot	ols on 802.3z, 802.3ae, and	802.3ba is also likely	to get a TM in SA	Suggested				
ballot	ols on 802.3z, 802.3ae, and	802.3ba is also likely	to get a TM in SA	Chang	ge "as well the"	to "as well as"		
ballot SuggestedRemedy	ols on 802.3z, 802.3ae, and o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802		to get a TM in SA	Chang		to "as well as" Response Status	w	
ballot SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to		.3ba	to get a TM in SA	Chang Proposed	ge "as well the"	Response Status	w	
ballot… SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to	o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802 <i>Response Status</i>	.3ba	to get a TM in SA	Chang Proposed	ge "as well the" <i>Response</i>	Response Status		5 # <u>29 </u>
ballot SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC	o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802 <i>Response Status</i>	.3ba		Chang Proposed PROP C/ FM	ge "as well the" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP	Response Status T. P10) L25	; # <mark>29</mark> PL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,
ballot SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI FM SC FM	o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802 <i>Response Status</i> CEPT. <i>P</i> 9	.3ba w <i>L</i> 36	# 26	Chang Proposed PROP C/ FM Zimmerma	ge "as well the" Response POSED ACCEP SC FM	Response Status T. P10	D L 25 Consulting/ADI, A	
ballot SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI FM SC FM Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Section 1 ends at	o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802 <i>Response Status</i> CEPT. <i>P</i> 9	.3ba W L 36 Consulting/ADI, APL G D	# [<u>26</u> p, Cisco, CommScope, <i>Alignment</i>	Chang Proposed PROP C/ FM Zimmerma Comment The in clause	ge "as well the" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP SC FM an, George <i>Type</i> E htroductory text a 126. This has	Response Status T. P10 CME Comment Status for section eight reflect	D <i>L</i> 25 Consulting/ADI, A D s IEEE Std 802.3- in 802.3dc D3.0,	PL Gp, Cisco, CommScope,
ballot SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI FM SC FM Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Section 1 ends at 802.3dc D3.0	o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802 <i>Response Status</i> CEPT. P 9 CME C <i>Comment Status</i>	.3ba W L 36 Consulting/ADI, APL G D	# [<u>26</u> p, Cisco, CommScope, <i>Alignment</i>	Chang Proposed PROP C/ FM Zimmerma Comment The in clause	ge "as well the" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP SC FM an, George <i>Type</i> E troductory text = 2 126. This has 0, as well as a s	Response Status T. P10 CME 0 Comment Status for section eight reflect substantially changed	D <i>L</i> 25 Consulting/ADI, A D s IEEE Std 802.3- in 802.3dc D3.0,	PL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Alignment -2018 which only went to
ballot SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI FM SC FM Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Section 1 ends at 802.3dc D3.0	o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802 <i>Response Status</i> CEPT. <i>P</i> 9 CME C <i>Comment Status</i> t Annex K in 802.3dc D3.0.	.3ba W L 36 Consulting/ADI, APL G D	# [<u>26</u> p, Cisco, CommScope, <i>Alignment</i>	Chang Proposed PROP CI FM Zimmerma Comment The in clause to 140 Suggested Replac	ge "as well the" Response POSED ACCEP SC FM an, George Type E stroductory text = a 126. This has b, as well as a s dRemedy ce "Section Eig	Response Status T. P10 CME 0 Comment Status for section eight reflect s substantially changed ection 9 for clauses thr	D L 25 Consulting/ADI, A D s IEEE Std 802.3- in 802.3dc D3.0, ough 160. - - 29) with text from -	PL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Alignment -2018 which only went to which includes new clauses m IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 for
ballot SuggestedRemedy Add TM symbol to Proposed Response PROPOSED ACC CI FM SC FM Zimmerman, George Comment Type E Section 1 ends at 802.3dc D3.0 SuggestedRemedy	o 802.3z, 802.3ae, and 802 <i>Response Status</i> CEPT. <i>P</i> 9 CME C <i>Comment Status</i> t Annex K in 802.3dc D3.0.	.3ba W Consulting/ADI, APL G D Annex H should be Ai	# [<u>26</u> p, Cisco, CommScope, <i>Alignment</i>	Chang Proposed PROP C/ FM Zimmerma Comment The in clause to 140 Suggested Repla Sectio	ge "as well the" Response POSED ACCEP SC FM an, George Type E stroductory text = a 126. This has b, as well as a s dRemedy ce "Section Eig	Response Status T. P10 CME 0 Comment Status for section eight reflect substantially changed ection 9 for clauses thr ht" paragraph (lines 25	L 25 Consulting/ADI, A D s IEEE Std 802.3- in 802.3dc D3.0, ough 160. - 29) with text froi E P802.3dc D3.0	PL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Alignment -2018 which only went to which includes new clauses m IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 for

Comment Type E Comment Status D The editing instruction could be written more compactly to be resistant to any change lEEE 802.3dc ballot since only the first sentence is changed SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Change editing instruction to "Change the first sentence of the second paragraph of as follows (unchanged sentences not shown):" Delete second and subsequent senter from line 9 through 13. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 90 SC 90.4.1 P13 L16 # [31] Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommS	could be written more compactly to be resistant to any changes in nce only the first sentence is changed tion to "Change the first sentence of the second paragraph of 90.1 sentences not shown):" Delete second and subsequent sentences <i>Response Status</i> W	Cl 90	SC 90	P13	L 6	# 30
The editing instruction could be written more compactly to be resistant to any change IEEE 802.3dc ballot since only the first sentence is changed SuggestedRemedy Change editing instruction to "Change the first sentence of the second paragraph of as follows (unchanged sentences not shown):" Delete second and subsequent senter from line 9 through 13. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 90 SC 90.4.1 P13 L16 # 31 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommSi Comment Type E Comment Status D Figure IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 includes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so the no need to make that here. D Figure	could be written more compactly to be resistant to any changes in nce only the first sentence is changed tion to "Change the first sentence of the second paragraph of 90.1 sentences not shown):" Delete second and subsequent sentences <i>Response Status</i> W	Zimmerm	an, George	CME Consult	ting/ADI, APL Gp	, Cisco, CommScope
IEEE 802.3dc ballot since only the first sentence is changed SuggestedRemedy Change editing instruction to "Change the first sentence of the second paragraph of s as follows (unchanged sentences not shown):" Delete second and subsequent sente from line 9 through 13. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. C/ 90 SC 90.4.1 P13 L16 # 31 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommS Comment Type E Comment Status D Figure IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 includes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so the no need to make that here.	nce only the first sentence is changed tion to "Change the first sentence of the second paragraph of 90.1 I sentences not shown):" Delete second and subsequent sentences <i>Response Status</i> W <i>P13 L16</i> # <u>31</u> CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, <i>Comment Status</i> D <i>Figure NOTE</i> Includes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so there is here. Huding 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, editor's note, and edit to change the NOTE. <i>Response Status</i> W	Comment	Type E	Comment Status D		Edito
Change editing instruction to "Change the first sentence of the second paragraph of the second	I sentences not shown):" Delete second and subsequent sentences Response Status W P13 L16 # 31 CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Comment Status D Figure NOTE ncludes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so there is here. cluding 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, editor's note, and edit to change the NOTE. Response Status W					ant to any changes in
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Cl 90 SC 90.4.1 P13 L16 # 31 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommSi Comment Type E Comment Status D Figure IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 includes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so the no need to make that here.	P13 L16 # <u>31</u> CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, <i>Comment Status</i> D Figure NOTE ncludes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so there is here. cluding 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, editor's note, and edit to change the NOTE. <i>Response Status</i> W	Chan as fol	ge editing instruction	d sentences not shown):" Del		
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommS Comment Type E Comment Status D Figure IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 includes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so the no need to make that here.	CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, <i>Comment Status</i> D <i>Figure NOTE</i> ncludes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so there is here. cluding 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, editor's note, and edit to change the NOTE. <i>Response Status</i> W	•	•			
Comment Type E Comment Status D Figure IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 includes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so the no need to make that here.	Comment Status D Figure NOTE ncludes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so there is here.	C/ 90	SC 90.4.1	P13	L16	# 31
IEEE P802.3dc D3.0 includes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so the no need to make that here.	ncludes the edit to add 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S, so there is here.	Zimmerm	an, George	CME Consult	ting/ADI, APL Gp	, Cisco, CommScope
SuggestedRemedy	Response Status W	IEEE	P802.3dc D3.0 i	ncludes the edit to add 10BA	SE-T1L and 10B	0
Delete lines 16-29, including 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, editor's note, and edit to change the N		Suggosto	dRemedv			to obcome the NOTE
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.		00		luding 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, edito	r's note, and edit	to change the NOTE.
		Delete Proposed	e lines 16-29, ind <i>Response</i>	Response Status W	r's note, and edit	to change the NOTE.
		Delete Proposed	e lines 16-29, ind <i>Response</i>	Response Status W	r's note, and edit	to change the NOTE.

CI 99	SC 99.1	P 14	L 9	# 32
Zimmerman,	George	CME Consultin	ng/ADI, APL Gp	o, Cisco, CommScope,
Comment Ty	rpe E	Comment Status D		Half-Duplex

unneeded comma between "10BASE-T1L" and "and Clause 147"

SuggestedRemedy

change "Clause 146 10BASE-T1L, and Clause 147 10BASE-T1S PHYs" to "Clause 146 10BASE-T1L and Clause 147 10BASE-T1S PHYs"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Accomodated by comment 39: Response to comment 39 is: ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace the first sentence of 99.1 (with appropriate change marks and change instruction from the base text), to read:

"This clause specifies an optional MAC Merge sublayer for use on a point-to-point link with a pair of MACs and a single PHY operating on a point-to-point link. The clause is applicable to full-duplex operation with 10BASE-T1L (Clause 146) and 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHYs and all PHYs 100 Mb/s and above. It is also applicable to half-duplex point-to-point operation with the 10BASE-T1S (Clause 147) PHY, but operation with the 10BASE-T1S PHY in multidrop mode is not specified."

C/ 99	SC	99.1	P 14	L11	# 33
Zimmerma	n, Geo	rge	CME Consulti	ng/ADI, APL G	p, Cisco, CommScope,
Comment 7	Гуре	Е	Comment Status D		Figure NOTE
Change	e to No	ote on F	igure 99-1 is made in IEEE P80	02.3dc D3.0, nc	need to make it here.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete lines 11-16, including editing instruction and change to note.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Accomodated by comment #36 Response to comment #36 is ACCEPT: (Remove the second editorial instruction in 99.1 and the paragraph following it.)

CI 99	SC 99.4.5	P14	L 25	# 34	
Zimmerma	an, George	CME Consult	ing/ADI, APL Gp	, Cisco, CommSco	pe,
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status D			PICS
Two n	new requirements	s (shalls) are added (one in 9	9.4.5, one in 99.4	.6), which need Pl	Cs
Suggeste	dRemedy				
		al specifications PICS table t	o draft, inserting	new PICS items, w	ith
	g instruction and new rows for PI	Inserts: CS items MM11a and MM13a	a as shown (unch	anged rows not she	own):
			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	5	,
"MM1 Featu	,	ocessing PLS_SIGNAL.indica	ation Section = 9	945 Value/Comm	hent
		cation is received, indication			
to the Status	pMAC.				
	ort = Yes []"				
"MM1)				
		er processing PLS_SIGNAL.i LS_SIGNAL.indication is rec			
		LO_OIONAL.IIIuication is rec	erveu, indication		
SIGN	AL_STATUS is s	ent to the eMAC.			
Status	s = M	ent to the eMAC.			
Status Suppo	s = M ort = Yes []"				
Status Suppo Proposed	s = M ort = Yes []" <i>Response</i>	Response Status W			
Status Suppo Proposed	s = M ort = Yes []"	Response Status W			
Status Suppo Proposed	s = M ort = Yes []" <i>Response</i>	Response Status W	L 2 7	# 35	
Status Suppo Proposed PROF	s = M port = Yes []" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEPT SC 90.4.1.1	Response Status W	L 27	# <u>35</u>	
Status Suppo Proposed PROF	s = M prt = Yes []" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEPT SC 90.4.1.1 e	Response Status W	L 27	# <u>35</u> Figure 1	NOTE
Status Suppo Proposed PROF C/ 90 Ran, Adee Comment As of	s = M port = Yes []" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEPT <i>SC</i> 90.4.1.1 e <i>Type</i> T	Response Status W P13 Cisco Comment Status D ote 1 in Figure 90-1 has the e		Figure N	
Status Suppo Proposed PROF Cl 90 Ran, Adee Comment As of needs	s = M port = Yes []" <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEPT <i>SC</i> 90.4.1.1 e <i>Type</i> T 802.3dc D2.3, N	Response Status W P13 Cisco Comment Status D ote 1 in Figure 90-1 has the e		Figure N	
Status Suppo Proposed PROF Cl 90 Ran, Adee Comment As of needs Suggestee	s = M port = Yes []" Response POSED ACCEPT SC 90.4.1.1 e Type T 802.3dc D2.3, No s no amendment. dRemedy pove the content of	Response Status W P13 Cisco Comment Status D ote 1 in Figure 90-1 has the e	effiective text in th	<i>Figure I</i> nis draft. Therefore	it
Status Suppo Proposed PROF Cl 90 Ran, Adee Comment As of needs Suggested Remo instrue	s = M port = Yes []" Response POSED ACCEPT SC 90.4.1.1 e Type T 802.3dc D2.3, No s no amendment. dRemedy pove the content of	Response Status W P13 Cisco Comment Status D ote 1 in Figure 90-1 has the e	effiective text in th	<i>Figure I</i> nis draft. Therefore	it
Status Suppo Proposed PROF Cl 90 Ran, Adee Comment As of needs Suggested Remo instruct Proposed PROF	s = M port = Yes []" Response POSED ACCEPT SC 90.4.1.1 e Type T 802.3dc D2.3, N s no amendment. dRemedy ove the content of ction.	Response Status W P13 Cisco Comment Status D ote 1 in Figure 90-1 has the e f 90.4.1 and its subclauses, in Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.	effiective text in th	<i>Figure I</i> nis draft. Therefore	it
Status Suppo Proposed PROF Cl 90 Ran, Adee Comment As of needs Suggested Remo instrue Proposed PROF Accor Respo	s = M port = Yes []" Response POSED ACCEPT SC 90.4.1.1 e Type T 802.3dc D2.3, N s no amendment. dRemedy we the content of ction. Response POSED ACCEPT modated by commonse to comment	Response Status W P13 Cisco Comment Status D ote 1 in Figure 90-1 has the e f 90.4.1 and its subclauses, in Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.	effiective text in the editor	Figure I nis draft. Therefore or's note and editori	it

	SC 99.1		P14	L12	# 36
Ran, Ade	е		Cisco		
Comment	t Туре т	Comm	ent Status D		Figure NOTE
	802.3dc D2.3 s no amendme		jure 99-1 has the o	effiective text in th	is draft. Therefore it
00	dRemedy	d editorial inst	ruction in 99.1 and	d the paragraph fo	llowing it.
Proposed	l Response	Respor	nse Status W		-
PROF	POSED ACCE				
C/ 90	SC 90.4.:	3.1.1	P13	L 39	# 37
Slavick, J	eff		Broadcom		
Comment	t Type TR	Comm	ent Status D		Half-Duplex
	sentence is de s not defining			nc Client will see	for half-duplex PHYs.
00	dRemedy NOTE" before	e the sentence	e beginning with "V	Vhen using the ha	lf-duplex"
Proposed	l Response	Respor	nse Status W	Ũ	
•	POSED ACCE				
				L 28	
CI 90	SC 90.4.1	1.1	P13	L 20	# 38
		1.1	P 13 Xilinx	L 20	# 38
Nicholl, S	hawn			L 20	# 38 Figure NOTE
Nicholl, S Comment The N	hawn t <i>Type E</i> NOTE does no	Comm ot provide the	Xilinx	ewly-added 10 Mb	Figure NOTE
Nicholl, S Comment The N NOTE	hawn t <i>Type E</i> NOTE does no	Comm ot provide the	Xilinx nent Status D mapping for the ne	ewly-added 10 Mb	Figure NOTE
Nicholl, S Comment The N NOTE Suggeste Propo NOTE Interfa	hawn t <i>Type</i> E NOTE does no E is inconsiste <i>dRemedy</i> pse to replace E—In this figu aces for imple	Comm of provide the ent with latest with: re, the xMII is ementations of	Xilinx nent Status D mapping for the ne P802.3cx_D2p1 de used as a generic	ewly-added 10 Mb raft. term for the Medi ve. For example: f	Figure NOTE /s rates. Also, the a Independent or 10 Mb/s and 100
Nicholl, S Comment The N NOTE Suggeste Propo NOTE Interfa Mb/s	hawn t <i>Type</i> E NOTE does no E is inconsiste <i>dRemedy</i> pse to replace E—In this figu aces for imple	Comm of provide the ent with latest with: re, the xMII is ementations of ons this interfa	Xilinx nent Status D mapping for the ne P802.3cx_D2p1 de used as a generic 10 Mb/s and abov	ewly-added 10 Mb raft. term for the Medi ve. For example: f	<i>Figure NOTE</i> /s rates. Also, the a Independent or 10 Mb/s and 100

(Delete lines 16-29, including 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, editor's note, and edit to change the NOTE.) (note - this aligns with the text of 802.3dc D3.0. P802.3cx_D2p1 follows this amendment, and a comment has been made to bring 802.3cx in alignment with 802.3dc and this proposed response)

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

C/ 99	SC 99.1	P 14	L 9	# 39	C/ FM	SC	FM	P10	L 30	# 41
licholl, Sł	hawn	Xilinx			Murty, Rar	mana		Broadcom		
comment	Type E	Comment Status D		Half-Duplex	Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status D		Alignme
The ir	ntroduction sent	ence is becoming somewhat a	wkward to read.		Add se	ection n	ine desc	ribing Clauses 141 - 160 per 8	02.3dc D3.0.	
uggeste	dRemedy				Suggested	dRemea	ly			
		to two sentences:			Per co	omment				
- Thi with a	is clause specifi	ies an optional MAC Merge sul and a single PHY. The single I	blayer for use on PHV shall be a C	a point-to-point link	Proposed	Respon	ise	Response Status W		
		e 147 10GBASE-T1S PHY, or			-			IN PRINCIPLE.		
roposed	Response	Response Status W						ment #29 t #29 is: ACCEPT		
-		T IN PRINCIPLE.			(Repla	ace "See	ction Eigl	ht" paragraph (lines 25 - 29) wi	th text from IE	EE P802.3dc D3.0 for
	the the first sent	tence of 99.1 (with appropriate	change marks a	and change instruction	Sectio	on Eight	and Sec	tion Nine (pg 26 of IEEE P802	.3dc D3.0 lines	s 26 through 43).)
nom		o Teau.			C/ FM	SC	FM	P3	L1	# 42
		s an optional MAC Merge suble			Grow, Rob	pert		RMG Consultir	ng	
		single PHY operating on a po lex operation with 10BASE-T1			Comment		Е	Comment Status D	5	E
(Claus	se 147) PHYs a	ind all PHYs 100 Mb/s and abo	ove. It is also ap	plicable to half-duplex	Awkwa	ard grar	nmar			
point-1 10BA	to-point operation	on with the 10BASE-T1S (Clau multidrop mode is not specifie	ise 147) PHY, bi ed."	ut operation with the	Suggested	dRemea	lv			
					•••		•			
					Chang	ge "Ihis	amenan	nent to IEEE Std 802.3-202X to	specity addition	ons to…" to "This
	SC 99.1	P 14	L14	# 40				nent to IEEE Std 802.3-202x to td 802.3-202x specfies additio		ons to" to "This
		P 14 Xilinx	L14	# 40		dment to	o IEEE S			ons to" to "This
licholl, Sh Comment	hawn <i>Type</i> E	Xilinx Comment Status D		Figure NOTE	ameno <i>Proposed</i> PROP	dment to <i>Resport</i> POSED	o IEEE S ose ACCEPT	td 802.3-202x specfies additio <i>Response Status</i> ₩ [−] IN PRINCIPLE.		ons to" to "This
Nicholl, Sh Comment The N	hawn <i>Type</i> E IOTE does not j	Xilinx Comment Status D provide the mapping for the ne	wly-added 10 Ml	Figure NOTE	ameno Proposed PROP Resolv	dment to <i>Resport</i> OSED ved by o	o IEEE S ose ACCEPT comment	td 802.3-202x specfies additio <i>Response Status</i> W IN PRINCIPLE. #18		ons to" to "This
licholl, Sh Comment The N NOTE	hawn <i>Type</i> E IOTE does not E is inconsistent	Xilinx Comment Status D	wly-added 10 Ml	Figure NOTE	ameno Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan	dment to Resport POSED ved by conse to o ge: Thi	o IEEE S ase ACCEPT comment comment s amend	td 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 t #18 is ACCEPT ment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x	ns to…". to specify addi	tions to
icholl, Sh comment The N NOTE uggested	hawn <i>Type</i> E NOTE does not j is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i>	Xilinx Comment Status D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr	wly-added 10 Ml	Figure NOTE	ameno Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan	dment to Resport POSED ved by conse to o ge: Thi	o IEEE S ase ACCEPT comment comment s amend	td 802.3-202x specfies additio <i>Response Status</i> W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 t #18 is ACCEPT	ns to…". to specify addi	tions to
licholl, Sh Comment The N NOTE Suggested Propo NOTE	hawn <i>Type</i> E IOTE does not is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i> pse to replace w E—In this figure	Xilinx Comment Status D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr with: , the xMII is used as a generic	wly-added 10 Ml aft. term for the Med	Figure NOTE b/s rates. Also, the dia Independent	ameno Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan	dment to Resport POSED ved by conse to o ge: Thi	o IEEE S ase ACCEPT comment comment s amend endment	td 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 t #18 is ACCEPT ment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x	ns to…". to specify addi	tions to
icholl, Sh comment The N NOTE uggested Propo NOTE Interfa	hawn <i>Type</i> E IOTE does not E is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i> pse to replace w E—In this figure aces for implem	Xilinx <i>Comment Status</i> D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr with: , the xMII is used as a generic pentations of 10 Mb/s and above	wly-added 10 Ml aft. term for the Med re. For example:	Figure NOTE b/s rates. Also, the dia Independent for 10 Mb/s and 100	ameno Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan To: Ti	dment to Respon POSED ved by conse to o ge: Thi his ame SC	o IEEE S ase ACCEPT comment comment s amend endment	itd 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 t #18 is ACCEPT ment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specif to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specif	ns to". to specify addi es additions to	tions to
Vicholl, Sh Comment The N NOTE Suggested Propo NOTE Interfa Mb/s i	hawn <i>Type</i> E NOTE does not p is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i> ose to replace w E—In this figure aces for implem implementation	Xilinx <i>Comment Status</i> D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr with: the xMII is used as a generic entations of 10 Mb/s and above s this interface is called MII; for	wly-added 10 Ml aft. term for the Med re. For example:	Figure NOTE b/s rates. Also, the dia Independent for 10 Mb/s and 100	amend Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan To: Ti C/ FM	dment to Respon- POSED ved by conse to o ge: Thi his ame SC pert	o IEEE S ase ACCEPT comment comment s amend endment	titd 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. # 18 # 18 is ACCEPT Iment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specific P4	ns to". to specify addi es additions to	tions to
licholl, Sh Comment The N NOTE Suggested Propo NOTE Interfa Mb/s i	hawn <i>Type</i> E NOTE does not p is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i> pose to replace w E—In this figure aces for implem implementation <i>Response</i>	Xilinx <i>Comment Status</i> D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr with: , the xMII is used as a generic lentations of 10 Mb/s and abov s this interface is called MII; fo <i>Response Status</i> W	wly-added 10 Ml aft. term for the Med re. For example:	Figure NOTE b/s rates. Also, the dia Independent for 10 Mb/s and 100	amend Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan To: Th C/ FM Grow, Rob Comment The IE	dment to Respon- POSED ved by c onse to o ge: Thi his ame SC pert Type EEE Sty	ACCEPT ACCEPT comment comment s amend endment FM	itd 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 #18 is ACCEPT ment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specific P4 RMG Consulting	ns to". to specify addi es additions to <i>L</i> 8	tions to >) # [<u>43</u> E
NOTE Suggested Propo NOTE Interfa Mb/s i Proposed PROF	hawn <i>Type</i> E NOTE does not p is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i> pose to replace w E—In this figure aces for implem implementation <i>Response</i>	Xilinx Comment Status D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr with: , the xMII is used as a generic rentations of 10 Mb/s and above s this interface is called MII; for Response Status W T IN PRINCIPLE.	wly-added 10 Ml aft. term for the Med re. For example:	Figure NOTE b/s rates. Also, the dia Independent for 10 Mb/s and 100	ament Proposed PROP Resolv Resolv (Chan To: Ti C/ FM Grow, Rob Comment The IE approp	dment to Respond POSED ved by co orge: Thi his ame SC pert Type EEE Sty priate.	ACCEPT comment comment s amend ndment FM E le Manua	itd 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 t #18 is ACCEPT ment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specific P4 RMG Consultin Comment Status D	ns to". to specify addi es additions to <i>L</i> 8	tions to >) # [<u>43</u> E
icholl, Sh comment The N NOTE uggested Propo NOTE Interfa Mb/s i roposed PROF Accor Respo	hawn <i>Type</i> E NOTE does not j is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i> use to replace w <i>aces for implem</i> implementation <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP modated by com-	Xilinx Comment Status D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr ith: , the xMII is used as a generic lentations of 10 Mb/s and abov s this interface is called MII; fo Response Status W IT IN PRINCIPLE. ment #36 nt #36 is ACCEPT:	ewly-added 10 Ml aft. term for the Meo re. For example: r 1 Gb/s implem	Figure NOTE b/s rates. Also, the dia Independent for 10 Mb/s and 100 entations	amend Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan To: Th C/ FM Grow, Rob Comment The IE approp Suggested	dment to Respon- POSED ved by o ge: Thi his ame SC pert Type EEE Sty priate. dRemed	b IEEE S ase ACCEPT comment comment s amend endment FM E le Manua	itd 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 t #18 is ACCEPT iment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specific P4 RMG Consultin Comment Status D al has changed and the second	ns to". to specify addi es additions to <i>L</i> 8	tions to >) # [<u>43</u> E
icholl, Sł omment The N NOTE uggestec Propo NOTE Interfa Mb/s i roposed PROF Accor Respo	hawn <i>Type</i> E NOTE does not j is inconsistent <i>dRemedy</i> use to replace w <i>aces for implem</i> implementation <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP modated by com-	Xilinx Comment Status D provide the mapping for the ne with latest P802.3cx_D2p1 dr with: , the xMII is used as a generic nentations of 10 Mb/s and above s this interface is called MII; for <i>Response Status</i> W T IN PRINCIPLE. ment #36	ewly-added 10 Ml aft. term for the Meo re. For example: r 1 Gb/s implem	Figure NOTE b/s rates. Also, the dia Independent for 10 Mb/s and 100 entations	amend Proposed PROP Resolv Respo (Chan To: Th C/ FM Grow, Rob Comment The IE approp Suggested	dment to Respon- POSED ved by o ge: Thi his ame SC pert Type EEE Sty priate. dRemed	b IEEE S ase ACCEPT comment comment s amend endment FM E le Manua	itd 802.3-202x specfies additio Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. #18 t #18 is ACCEPT ment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x specific P4 RMG Consultin Comment Status D	ns to". to specify addi es additions to <i>L</i> 8	tions to >) # [<u>43</u> E

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

C/ FM	SC FM	P 7	L 27	# 44	C/ 90 SC
Grow, Rol	pert	RMG Consu	lting		Grow, Robert
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status D		EZ	Comment Type
		ow known, please add it so W	G members can	review their listings.	The edited to (Maintenanc
Suggeste					SuggestedReme
	02.3 ballot grou				Delete lines
•	Response POSED ACCEP	Response Status W			previous dra P802.3 WG
		D -1			Proposed Respo
C/ FM	SC FM	P 9	L6	# 45	PROPOSED
Grow, Rol	pert	RMG Consu	lting		Accomodate
Comment		Comment Status D		Alignment	Response to (Delete lines
		ng in SA ballot meet the inten ? I think it does.	ded stability cond	ition in the second	C/ 90 SC
Suggeste	dRemedy				Grow, Robert
		nment and perhaps note any	changes to the d	raft revision will be	Comment Type
		on drafts become available.			The edited t
Proposed	Response	Response Status W			(Maintenand
-		T IN PRINCIPLE.		-4	SuggestedReme
		aft align with 802.3dc D3.0, co oduction text are aligned with			Delete lines
the 'A	lignment' topic.	Ũ	,		previous dra
Delete	e editor's note a	t lines 6 & 7.			now include
C/ 90	SC 90.4.1	P13	L 20	# 46	Proposed Respo
Grow, Rol	pert	RMG Consu	ltina		PROPOSED The text in 9
Comment		Comment Status D		Figure NOTE	commontor
The e	dited text is incl	uded in P802.3/D3.0 in respo		0	in 802.3/D3.
Suggeste	dRemedy				
previo		, optionally include an editor's deleted as the changes were 2.3/D3.0.			
Proposed	Response	Response Status W			
PROF	POSED ACCEP	T IN PRINCIPLE.			
	nodated by com				
		nt #31 is ACCEPT:	or's note and ad	t to change the NOTE)	
(Dele	le illies 10-29, ll	ncluding 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, edit	or s note, and edi	t to change the NOTE.)	

C/ 90	SC	90.4.1	P13	L 20	# 47
Grow, Rol	bert		RMG Consult	ting	
Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status D		Figure NOTE
			ded in P802.3/D3.0 in respor approved during P802.3 WG		ce request #1390.
Suggeste	dReme	dy			
previo	ous draf	ts to the n	ionally include an editor's not ote to Figure 99-1 were dele are now included in P802.3/I	ted as the chang	0
Proposed	Respo	nse	Response Status W		
Accor Resp	modated onse to te lines	d by comn comment	IN PRINCIPLE. nent #31 #31 is ACCEPT: cluding 90.4.1, 90.4.1.1, edito P14	or's note, and edi L 27	t to change the NOTE.) # [48
Grow, Rol	bert		RMG Consult	ting	
Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status D		Other
			ded in P802.3/D3.0 in respor approved during P802.3 WG		ce request #1344.
Suggeste	dReme	dy			
previo	ous draf		ionally include an editor's not eleted as the changes were 3/D3.0.		
Proposed	Respo	nse	Response Status W		
		REJECT.	e base standard does not inc	lude this change	. Perhaps the

The text in 99.4.6 in the base standard does not include this change. Perhaps the commenter was referring to the change in 99.1 to the note in Figure 99-1, which is included in 802.3/D3.0 and is covered by other comments.

	90.4.1.1	P13	L28	# 49	C/ Introdu SC Introduc	tion	P10	L 25	# 52
Healey, Adam		Broadcom Inc.			Kabra, Lokesh		Synopsys Inc	;	
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D		Figure NOTE	Comment Type ER	Commen	t Status D		Alignmei
		n amendment to the next re			Section 8 Description i	ncomplete			
the revision (II instruction is r		dc) includes the change to N	NOTE 1 in Figu	ire 90-1. This change	SuggestedRemedy				
SuggestedRemed	dy				Replace Section 8 des	cription with			
Remove chan	nge to NOTE	E 1 in Figure 90-1 and the a	ssociated edito	or's note.	Includes Clause 116 th				
Proposed Respon	nse	Response Status W			116 through Clause 12 and 400 Gb/s operatio				formation on 200 Gb/s
	d by comme comment #3		's note, and ec	lit to change the NOTE.)	Clause 125 includes g through Clause 130 ar specifications. Clause through Clause 140 ar	eneral inform nd associated 131 provides nd associated	ation on 2.5 Gb/ I annexes includ general informa I annexes includ	/s and 5 Gb/s op e 2.5 Gb/s and 5 ation on 50 Gb/s e 50 Gb/s Physi	beration. Clause 126 5 Gb/s Physical Layer operation. Clause 132 cal Layer specifications
C/ 99 SC 9	99.1	P 14	L15	# 50	and additional 100 Gb/ Proposed Response		e Status W	nysical Layer sp	decincations.
Healey, Adam		Broadcom Inc.			PROPOSED ACCEPT	,			
Comment Type	Е	Comment Status D		Figure NOTE	Accomodated by comr	-	LL.		
		dc) includes the change to N	NOTE in Figure	e 99-1. This change	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Fight and Sec	nt" paragraph tion Nine (pa	1 (lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2 3dc D3 0 lines	26 through 43)
instruction is r SuggestedRemed Remove the c Proposed Respon PROPOSED A Accomodated Response to c	redundant. dy change to N nse ACCEPT IN d by comme comment #3	OTE in Figure 99-1. <i>Response Status</i> W N PRINCIPLE. ant #36 36 is ACCEPT:	·	-	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Eight and Sec	nt" paragraph tion Nine (pg	(lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2.3dc D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)
instruction is r SuggestedRemed Remove the c Proposed Respon PROPOSED A Accomodated Response to c	redundant. dy change to N nse ACCEPT IN d by comme comment #3	OTE in Figure 99-1. <i>Response Status</i> W N PRINCIPLE. Int #36 36 is ACCEPT: torial instruction in 99.1 and	the paragraph	following it.)	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Eight and Sec	nt" paragraph tion Nine (pg	(lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2.3dc D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)
instruction is r SuggestedRemed Remove the c Proposed Respon PROPOSED A Accomodated Response to c	redundant. dy change to N nse ACCEPT IN d by comme comment #3 second edit	OTE in Figure 99-1. <i>Response Status</i> W N PRINCIPLE. ant #36 36 is ACCEPT:	·	-	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Eight and Sec	t" paragraph tion Nine (pg	(lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2.3dc D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)
instruction is r SuggestedRemed Remove the c Proposed Respon PROPOSED / Accomodated Response to c (Remove the s C/ Abstrac SC / Kabra, Lokesh	redundant. dy change to N nse ACCEPT IN d by comme comment #3 second edit	OTE in Figure 99-1. Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. Int #36 36 is ACCEPT: torial instruction in 99.1 and P3 Synopsys Inc	the paragraph	following it.)	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Eight and Sec	t" paragraph tion Nine (pg	(lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2.3dc D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)
instruction is r SuggestedRemed Remove the c Proposed Respon PROPOSED A Accomodated Response to c (Remove the s	redundant. dy change to N nse ACCEPT IN d by comme comment #3 second edit	OTE in Figure 99-1. <i>Response Status</i> W N PRINCIPLE. ant #36 36 is ACCEPT: torial instruction in 99.1 and <i>P</i> 3	the paragraph	following it.)	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Eight and Sec	nt" paragraph tion Nine (pg	(lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2.3dc D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)
instruction is r SuggestedRemed Remove the c Proposed Respon PROPOSED / Accomodated Response to c (Remove the s C/ Abstrac SC / Kabra, Lokesh	redundant. dy change to N nse ACCEPT IN d by comme comment #3 second edit Abstract E	OTE in Figure 99-1. Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. Int #36 36 is ACCEPT: torial instruction in 99.1 and P3 Synopsys Inc	the paragraph	following it.) # [<u>51</u>	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Eight and Sec	nt" paragraph tion Nine (pg	(lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2.3dc D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)
instruction is r SuggestedRemed Remove the c Proposed Respon PROPOSED A Accomodated Response to c (Remove the s C/ Abstrac SC A Kabra, Lokesh Comment Type	redundant. dy change to N nse ACCEPT IN d by comme comment #3 second edit Abstract E	OTE in Figure 99-1. Response Status W N PRINCIPLE. Int #36 36 is ACCEPT: torial instruction in 99.1 and P3 Synopsys Inc	the paragraph	following it.) # [<u>51</u>	(Replace "Section Eigh Section Eight and Sec	nt" paragraph tion Nine (pg	(lines 25 - 29) v 26 of IEEE P80	2.3dc D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Comment ID

C/ Introdu SC Introduction	P10	L 30	# 53	C/ 90	SC	90.1	P13	L 8	# 55	
Kabra, Lokesh	Synopsys Inc	;		Kabra, Lo	kesh		Synopsys Inc	c		
Comment Type ER Comn	nent Status D		Alignment	Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status D		Edit	torial
Section 9 Description missing				Better	r senten	ice constru	uct.			
SuggestedRemedy				Suggeste	dRemec	dy				
Add the following : Section Nine—Includes Clause 154A. Clause 141 through Claus				PHYs	" with		lefined for the full-duplex mo	•		7
asymmetric operation of Etherne Clause 145 and associated anne				Proposed	Respor	nse	Response Status W			
the structured wiring plant. Claus Physical layers for 10 Mb/s, 2.5 balanced pair of conductors. Cla specifications. Clause 153 and C systems. Clause 157 through Cl Physical Layer specifications.	se 146 through Clau Gb/s, 5 Gb/s, and 1 ause 150 and Claus Clause 154 specify	use 149 and asso 10 Gb/s operation e 151 add 400 G 100 Gb/s operatio	ociated annexes add over a single b/s Physical Layer on over DWDM	Accor Respo (This The T	modated onse to might be SSI is c	d by comm comment e better re defined for	#13 is ACCEPT			nd
Proposed Response Response	nse Status 🛛 🛛 🛛 🛛 🛛 🗤			C/ 90	SC	90.4.3.2.1	P13	L 42	# 56	_
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINC	CIPLE.			Kabra, Lo	kesh		Synopsys In	C		
Accomodated by comment #29 Response to comment #29 is: A	CCEPT			Comment	Туре	Е	Comment Status D		Half-Du	ıplex
(Replace "Section Eight" paragra				Note	about m	ultiple TS	_RX.indications for a packe	t in half-duplex m	ode missing	
Section Eight and Section Nine		2.30C D3.0 lines	26 through 43).)	Suggeste	dRemed	dy				
Cl Introdu SC Introduction Kabra, Lokesh	P10 Synopsys Inc	L 39	# 54	When	n using t	he half-du	raph in 90.4.3.2.1 as showr plex mode of operation, mu acket as a result of collision	Itiple TS_RX indi	cations may be	
··· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	nent Status D		Alignment	Proposed	Respor	nse	Response Status W			
Incorrect reference to 802.3 star SuggestedRemedy Replace "802.3-2018" with "802.	.3-202x"			Task Editor neede	Force to r's recoll ed.	Discuss lection wa	IN PRINCIPLE. s discussion during study gr		Ū	
Proposed Response Res	nse Status W CIPLE.						this would be a new note, ar ion primitive	nd the change wo	ould be:	

90.4.3.2.1 Semantics

Accomodated by comment #9, response to comment #9 is ACCEPT "IEEE Std 802.3-202x"

Insert a new final paragraph in 90.4.3.2.1 as shown: "NOTE - When using the half-duplex mode of operation, multiple TS_RX indications may be produced for a single packet as a result of collisions on the media.

-						-						
CI 99	SC 99.	1	P 14	L9	# 57	C/ 99	SC	99	P 14	L	# 58	
Kabra, Lo	kesh		Synopsys Inc			Kabra, Lo	kesh		Synopsys Inc			
Comment	tType E		Comment Status D		Half-Duplex	Comment	t Type	т	Comment Status D		Half-Duple>	
single		ating at	not look proper. The first p 100 Mb/s or higher" but the t tie up.			in Re P_RE	ceive P	rocessing	the effect of collisions & retra g state diagram; For example, f the incoming continuation fra	in Figure 99-6 agment is term	, in state inated due to collision	
Suggeste	dRemedy								RxDx), the state transitions to mits the continuation fragmer			
			ingle PHY operating at 100		as well as Clause 146		s intend					
	,		se 147 10BASE-T1S PHYs' Y operating at 100 Mb/s or I			Suggeste	dReme	dv				
			BASE-T1S PHY"	lighter, or a Clau	150 140 10DA3E-11L	00			b be updated for handling of c	ollisions/retran	smission of fragments in	
Proposed	l Response		Response Status W			half-c	duplex r	node			0	
,	pposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.						Proposed Response Response Status W					
-		-	-			-			T IN PRINCIPLE.			
	modated by					Task	Force	o Discus	8			
ACĊI Repla	onse to cor EPT IN PRI ace the first the base te	NCIPLE sentend	: ce of 99.1 (with appropriate	change marks	and change instruction	and r	ecollec	tion of dis	o reject this comment based o cussion during study group th sentations provided a remedy	at further chan	ges were not needed. It	
			n optional MAC Merge subl			C/ 99	SC	99	P14	L	# 59	
			ngle PHY operating on a po operation with 10BASE-T1			Kabra, Lo	kesh		Synopsys Inc			
(Ċlau	se 147) PH	Ys and	all phys 100 Mb/s and abov	ve. It is also ap	blicable to half-duplex	Comment	t Type	т	Comment Status D		Half-Duple>	
			with the 10BASE-T1S (Clau ultidrop mode is not specifie		ut operation with the	in Tra fragm = FAI	ansmit I nent, the LSE. In	Processin en Transr such a c	lisions/retransmission of fragn g. For example, if collision oc nit processing remains in PRE ase, express packet will remai fragment is compete after the	curs during tra EMPTABLE_ n in queue and	nsmission of preemptable TX state because pTxCplt d gets delayed until teh	
						Suggeste						
						Trans	smit Pro	ncessing	to be undated for handling of a	ollisions/retrar	semission of fragments in	

Transmit Processing to be updated for handling of collisions/retransmission of fragments in half-duplex mode

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Task Force to Discuss

Editor's inclination is to reject this comment based on lack of a sufficiently detailed remedy, and recollection of discussion during study group that further changes were not needed. It would be helpful if presentations provided a remedy - if one is needed.

Comment ID 59

CI 00	SC O	P3	L1	# 60		CI 99	SC 99.1	P 14	L 9	# 63
Jones, Pe	ter	Cisco				Hajduczer	nia, Marek	Charter Comr	munications	
Comment	Type E	Comment Status D			EZ	Comment	Type E	Comment Status D		
		bstract. The text says				Claus	e 146 and Claus	e 147 should be marked as e	xternal reference	s, i.e., Forest Green.
	mendment to II cations of	EEE Std 802.3-202x to specify	additions to and	appropriate		Suggeste	dRemedy omment			
Suggestee	•						Response			
Repla	ce "to specify" v	vith "specifies"					POSED ACCEP	Response Status W		
Proposed	Response	Response Status W				PROF	POSED ACCEP			
-		T IN PRINCIPLE.				CI 99	SC 99.4.5	P 14	L 25	# 64
	ved by commer	nt #18 is ACCEPT				Hajduczer	nia, Marek	Charter Comr	nunications	
(Chan	ge: This amen	dment to IEEE Std 802.3-202x				Comment	Type ER	Comment Status D		P
To: T 	SC 0	ro IEEE Std 802.3-202x speci	fies additions to				shall added, no F ame in line 33 o	PICS added / updated. n page 14		
		-		# 61		Suggeste	dRemedy			
•	nia, Marek	Charter Comr	nunications	<i></i>			omment			
Comment	•••	Comment Status D nt to 802.3dc, so I would assur			gnment	Proposed	Response	Response Status W		
revisio Proposed PROF Front	text of Introduct on of 802.3de <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP	ion, including text of all section <i>Response Status</i> W T IN PRINCIPLE. duction text are aligned with 8				Accor Respo (Add 9 editing Insert "MM1 Featu	nodated by com onse to commen 99.5.3.1 Function g instruction and new rows for PI 1a, ure = Receive pr	t #34 is ACCEPT: nal specifications PICS table t inserts: CS items MM11a and MM13a ocessing PLS_SIGNAL.indica	as shown (unchation, Section = 9	anged rows not show 9.4.5, Value/Comme
CI 90	SC 90.1	P13	L10	# 62			LS_SIGNAL.indi pMAC.	cation is received, indication v	with the same SIC	GNAL_STATUS is se
Hajduczer	ia, Marek	Charter Comr	nunications			Status	s = M			
Comment	Type ER	Comment Status D		Ali	gnment	Suppo "MM1	ort = Yes []"			
	ve the baseline is missing	text is NOT taken from 802.30	lc-D2.2. Entry fo	r "50GMII (Clause	9	Featu Value	ure = Express filt /Comment = If F	er processing PLS_SIGNAL.in LS_SIGNAL.indication is rece		
Suggested	dRemedy							sent to the eMAC.		
XGMI	l (Clause 46), 2	xMII should be as follows: "The 5GMII (Clause106), XLGMII (C II (Clause 117), and 400GMII	lause 81), CGM			Status Suppo	s = M ort = Yes []")			
	Response	Response Status W								
Proposed										