

# **P802.3dj D1.3**

## **Comment Resolution Agenda**

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

# Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.3 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
  - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

# Comment resolution

## Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”  
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: [https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24\\_05/brown\\_3dj\\_01\\_2405.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf)

# We are here...

560 comments received  
25 withdrawn  
251 in bucket #1  
67 bucket #1 pull requests  
0 closed on the floor  
233 closed  
327 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	1	0	0	1	0	3	3
1	1	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	2
116	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4
119	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
120B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
120F	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	2	2
169	0	0	3	0	0	2	1	4	5
171	0	0	0	0	0	6	4	2	6
174	0	0	1	0	0	1	1	1	2
174A	2	0	15	2	0	17	22	14	36
175	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	3	3
176	10	0	16	0	0	6	10	22	32
176B	1	0	0	0	0	2	1	2	3
176C	2	0	32	0	0	7	39	2	41
176D	0	0	6	0	0	19	25	0	25
177	10	0	23	14	0	32	19	60	79
178	1	0	4	0	0	6	8	3	11
178A	1	0	17	0	0	4	10	12	22
178B	3	0	3	0	0	13	9	10	19
179	3	0	10	1	0	20	32	2	34
179A	0	0	2	0	0	5	3	4	7
179B	2	0	20	2	0	16	36	4	40
179C	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
179D	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
180	3	0	4	7	0	21	20	15	35
180A	0	0	0	0	0	2	2	0	2
181	1	0	1	4	0	10	6	10	16
182	0	0	1	2	0	13	7	9	16
183	0	0	1	0	0	9	5	5	10
184	0	0	5	0	0	8	10	3	13
185	3	0	12	1	0	4	13	7	20
185A	0	0	2	0	0	5	6	1	7
186	2	0	9	0	0	3	7	7	14
187	4	0	12	3	0	15	25	9	34
45	0	0	2	1	0	1	0	4	4
73	2	0	1	1	0	4	4	4	8
73A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
Total	61	0	206	39	0	254	327	233	560

# Comment resolution sequence

Meeting Date	Topic
<del>Monday 20 Jan</del>	<del>Task Force all day opening business, common track comments bucket pulls due by noon; motion after PM break (start of PM2) electrical track comments (time permitting)</del>
Tuesday 21 Jan	Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track If necessary (at chair's discretion), tracks may run until 8PM
Wednesday 22 Jan	Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track AM2: joint optical/logic track
Thursday 23 Jan	Task Force all day liaisons discussion and motion to approve <del>possibly a 2nd bucket motion (decided no 2nd bucket)</del> common track comments remaining comments (time permitting) closing business

# Common #1 (task force, Monday)

DONE

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Management interface	Many	273
Reset variables	45, 177, 184, 178, 179	[2, <del>88</del> , 89, 90, brown_03]
PMA (other other sublayers) delay	176	[ <del>451</del> , 22, 222, 223, 224, 225, 226, shrihande_01]
Optical: Signal ok	180, 181, 182, 183	[ <del>227</del> , 228, 229, 230], 318
Optical: RR FFE taps	180, 181, 182, 183	[ <del>186</del> , 422, 187, 188, 189, 172, 174, 175, 176, 248, 249, 250, 251]
Optical: TDECQ general, AUI stress	180, 181, 182, 183	[ <del>240</del> , 241, 242, 243], ghiasi_01
Optical: SER and Q_t	180, 181, 182	[171, 173], 346
ILT: clock switch	178B	124, brown_03
ILT: introduction	178B	542
<p>Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted.</p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Common #2 (task force, Thursday)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Error ratio budget	174A	151, 435
KER	174A	150, he_3dj_01
KER for PHY	174A	376, 377
KER for xMII Extender	174A	130
KER stress	174A	167, brown_03
KER, all-lanes	174A	166, 384
KER, per-lane	174A	[180, 107, mi_01], 183
PHY TX KER	174A, 178-183	8, brown_04
ILT: State diagram	178B	[144, brown_03], 356
ILT: Management variables	178B	170
AN/ILT: time-out	73, 178B	131, 184, 543, 545, slawick_01, 544
Electrical/Logic: AN DME swing	73	547, simms_3dj_optx_02_250109
Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Electrical #1 (55)

Topic	178	179	176C	176D	178B
Steady-state voltage in ILT (5)	<b>137</b>	<u>138</u>	<b>139</b>	<b>140</b>	<b>136</b>
ILT presets and initialization (8)		<b>457, 513, 514, 515, 516 simms_01</b>		<b>425</b>	<b>125, 515</b>
Interference tolerance (13)	[557 dudek_01]	308, 386	445, [446 200 552 dudek_01] 447	[353 259 208], [354 209]	
R_peak (6)		[303 185 ran_02]		[350 351 ran_02], 206, 207	
AC coupling (4)	255, 256, 257	258			
Jitter (6)		[211 rysin_01] [306 calvin_01] 541		[219 220 rysin_01] 540	
Amplitude tolerance (4)	<b>426</b>	307		352, 396	
Jitter tolerance (4)			253	260, [261 262]	
SNDR (2)		538		<b>423</b>	
AC common-mode (1)			<b>440</b>		
Cable assembly reach (1)		310			
Differential pk-pk (1)				539	
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i> <b>Cyan highlight:</b> pulled from bucket #1					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area



# Electrical #2 (48)

Topic	179	176C	176D	178A	179B
C2C TBDs (12)		[ <u>548</u> , 195, 438], [ <u>550</u> 197], [554, 202], 203, 559, 254, [ <u>555</u> , 204] heck_01			
C2C RL masks (5)		[ <u>439</u> 196 549], [ <u>443</u> 199] heck_01			
C2C ERL (7)		[205, 450, <u>556</u> ], 442, [198, 441, 551] heck_01			
C2C ITOL (4)		252, [ <u>553</u> 201 448 heck_01]			
C2C ILdd mask (1)		449			
COM general (7)	533			371, 372, 383, 536, 537, 511	
Partial channel model (8)	[ <u>393</u> 466 kocsis_01], [ <u>391</u> 392]		389, 390	[ <u>387</u> 388]	
Frequency range (4)				[47 mellitz_02], 535	529 <u>526</u>
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. <u>Cyan highlight</u> : pulled from bucket #1					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

# Electrical #3 (30)

Topic	179B
Test fixtures reference ILdd (5)	[357 358 379 211 ran_04], 528
Test fixtures TBDs (5)	210 [214 460 463 49 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures FOM_ILD (4)	[459 50 51 212 kocsis_02 mellitz_01]
Test fixtures RLdc (1)	[464 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures ICN (14)	[217 52 53 54 55 56 215 454 461 462 465 522 kocsis_02 mellitz_01 mammenga_01], 523, 524
Test fixtures COM (1)	[48 mellitz_01]
Bucket pulls	525, 526
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i> Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1	

# Optical track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
IMDD Tx optical parameter	181	342
PMD block diagram	180	316, 317
Test pattern	182	345
MDI	180,180A	[57, 326, 517, 8023dj_D1p3_comment_57_attachment]
Measurement method	180, 181, 182, 183	[236, 237, 238, 239, ghiasi_01]
Power budget	180 181 183	[231, 233], 320 232 [234, 235, ghiasi_02]
Fiber characteristics	180 187	324 61
Channel requirements	180 187	[323, 332], 334, 333 [62, 80]
Coherent Tx optical parameter	185 187	[397, 398, 190, maniloff_02], [474, kota_02] [58, 59], 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i> Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Optical track #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Coherent Rx optical parameter	185 187	[399, maniloff_02], 400 60, 70, 79, 104
Coherent Tx/Rx optical parameter	187	179
Link budget	185	178
Signal detect	187	103
Primitive	185, 187	[99, 100]
Test pattern	187	81, 105
ETCC	185 187 185A	102 63, 193 177, 359, [408, 82, maniloff_01], [475, kota_02], 521
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i> <b>Cyan highlight:</b> pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Optical track #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Editorial	180, 181, 182, 183	344, 325, 327, 329, 330, 335, 15, 343
Test pattern	180, 181, 182, 183	[111, 112, 113, 98]
Optical channel	185	101
Parameter name	185, 187	[157, 159]
PICS	185, 187	404, 407, 415, 416
TDECQ general, block method - Deferred from common session	180, 181, 182, 183	[244, 245, 246, 247, ghiasi_03]
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i> Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ER1 architecture	186	[36, 3], 39, 218, huber_3dj_01_2501
ER1 delay	186	[73, 23]
ER1 errors	186	191
ER1 frame alignment	186	158
LR1 Lane grouping	184	[156, bruckman_3dj_01_2501]
SM-PMA / InnerFEC skew	176, 177	[452, 26, 27]
Counter description format	176	[11, 394] (note: 11 is in the bucket)
Symbol demux block diagram	176 (may also apply to 177)	[420, nicholl_3dj_02_2501]
Management variables	177	300
Bucket pulls	171 176 177 184	153, [373, 374], 4 480, 86, 83, 18, 19, 12 486, 121, 495, 496, 301 375

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Logic track #2 (Wed. AM1)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding	177, 184 (182, 183, 185)	274, 295, 347, 487 (Adee)
State Diagrams	177	[297, 508], 494, 503 (Adee)
BCH counters	184	[32, 348], 349, 473 (Adee)

*Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*

**Cyan highlight:** pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Optical/Logic track #1 (Target for Wed, AM2)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
800GBASE-LR1 decoding	184	347
PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding	177, 184 (182, 183, 185)	275, brown_03
Alignment for interleaving	184	[472, 409, kota_3dj_01_2501]
Optical/Logic: xBASE-R Inner FEC test patterns	177 (maybe 176, 182, 183) 174A	[148, 9], [10, 128] he_3dj_01
Optical/Logic: 800GBASE-LR1 test patterns	184	149, he_3dj_01
ER1 error ratio (moved from common)	174A	[77, 194], 78
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i> <i>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation



# Buckets

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

[https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p3/8023dj\\_D1p3\\_comments\\_proposed\\_clause\\_bucket1.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p3/8023dj_D1p3_comments_proposed_clause_bucket1.pdf)

The following comments were pulled (so far) from bucket #1:

4, 12, 15, 18, 19, 83, 86, 98, 101, 107, 111, 112, 113, 121, 153, 155, 157, 159,  
164, 169, 170, 265, 266, 267, 270, 297, 301, 304, 309, 317, 318, 325, 327, 329,  
330, 335, 343, 344, 349, 373, 374, 375, 377, 404, 407, 415, 416, 424, 430, 431,  
434, 436, 467, 473, 477, 480, 486, 487, 494, 495, 496, 503, 508, 525, 526, 527,  
530

**DONE**

# Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):

20, 109, 110, 192, 269, 278, 302, 319, 360, 361, 362, 363, 364, 365, 366, 367,  
368, 369, 370, 385, 429, 453, 455, 458, 477